

## STRUCTURE OF TOTAL SUBSPACES OF DUAL BANACH SPACES

M.I. OSTROVSKII

I. Let  $X$  be a Banach space,  $X^*$  its dual. The unit ball and the unit sphere of  $X$  are denoted by  $B(X)$  and  $S(X)$  respectively. Let us recall some definitions.

A subspace  $M$  of  $X^*$  is said to be *total* if for every  $0 \neq x \in X$  there is an  $f \in M$  such that  $f(x) \neq 0$ . A subspace  $M \subset X^*$  is said to be *norming* if for some  $c > 0$  we have

$$(\forall x \in X) \left( \sup_{f \in S(M)} |f(x)| \geq c \|x\| \right).$$

Let  $M$  be a subspace of  $X^*$ . The set of all limits of weak\* convergent sequences from  $M$  is called its *weak\* sequential closure* and is denoted by  $M_{(1)}$ . It is clear that  $M_{(1)}$  is a linear subspace of  $X^*$ . But  $M_{(1)}$  need not be closed and, consequently, need not be weak\* closed. Corresponding example has been given by S. Mazurkiewicz. This was a reason to S. Banach to introduce [1, pp. 208, 213] weak\* sequential closures (S. Banach used the term "derive faible") of other orders, including transfinite ones. For ordinal  $\alpha$  the *weak\* sequential closure of order  $\alpha$*  of a subspace  $M \subset X^*$  is the set

$$M_{(\alpha)} = \bigcup_{\beta < \alpha} (M_{(\beta)})_{(1)}.$$

For a chain of weak\* sequential closures we have

$$M_{(1)} \subset M_{(2)} \subset \dots \subset M_{(\alpha)} \subset M_{(\alpha+1)} \subset \dots$$

If we have  $M_{(\alpha)} = M_{(\alpha+1)}$  then all subsequent closures coincide with  $M_{(\alpha)}$ . The least ordinal  $\alpha$  for which  $M_{(\alpha)} = M_{(\alpha+1)}$  is called the *order* of the subspace  $M$ .

The study of total subspaces with infinite orders turns out to be important in the theory of topological vector spaces [4],[9], subspaces of order 2 turns out to be useful in the theory of improperly posed problems [11]. So the problem of description of total subspaces of prescribed order arises in a natural way. The purpose of the present paper is to investigate the following version of this problem. Let a separable Banach space  $X$  and an ordinal  $\alpha$  are given. For what Banach spaces  $Y$  there exists an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  such that  $T(Y)$  is a total subspace of order  $\alpha$  in  $X^*$ ?

Let us say few words about terminology and notation. The term "operator" means a bounded linear operator. For a subset  $A$  of a Banach space  $X$   $\text{lin}(A)$  and

$\text{cl}(A)$  are, respectively, the linear span of  $A$  and the closure of  $A$  in the strong topology. For a subset  $A$  of a dual Banach space  $X^*$   $w^*$ - $\text{cl}(A)$  and  $A^\top$  are, respectively, the closure of  $A$  in the weak\* topology and the set  $\{x \in X : (\forall x^* \in A)(x^*(x) = 0)\}$ . The direct sum of spaces  $X$  and  $Y$  is denoted by  $X \oplus Y$ . We hope that our terminology and notation are standard and self-explanatory. Our sources for Banach space basic concepts and results are [7],[8], [14].

Now we shall list known results about weak\* sequential closures which will be used in this paper. Let  $X$  be a separable Banach space.

1. Subspace  $M \subset X^*$  satisfies the equality  $M_{(1)} = X^*$  if and only if  $M$  is norming [1, p. 213].

2. If the Banach space  $X$  is quasireflexive then [14, p. 78] every total subspace  $M$  of  $X^*$  is norming and hence we have  $M_{(1)} = X^*$ .

3. For any subspace  $M \subset X^*$  we have [1, p. 124]:

$$(M = M_{(1)}) \Rightarrow (M = w^* - \text{cl}(M)).$$

4. The order of any subspace of  $X^*$  is a countable [14, p. 50] non-limit [6] ordinal.

5. If the Banach space  $X$  is a nonquasireflexive then for any countable ordinal  $\alpha$  the space  $X^*$  contains a total subspace of order  $\alpha + 1$ , [10].

II. Let us consider the problem stated in the paragraph I. The case when  $X$  is reflexive is trivial. If  $X$  is quasireflexive then by statement 2 from I the order of any total subspace of  $X^*$  is 0 or 1. It is easy to see that in this case the set of isomorphic types of total subspaces of order 1 coincides with the set of isomorphic types of closed subspaces of  $X^*$  with codimension between 1 and  $\dim(X^{**}/X)$ . The question whether this subspaces are isomorphic to  $X^*$  is the version of well-known problem. We shall not consider this question.

If the space  $Y$  is such that  $Y^*$  does not contain closed norming subspaces of infinite codimension and  $Y$  is isomorphic to a total subspace of  $X^*$  then by [12, Theorem 3.1]  $Y$  is isomorphic to a norming subspace of  $X^*$  and hence  $X$  is isomorphic to a subspace of finite codimension of  $Y^*$ . On the other hand it is easy to see that if the space  $Y$  is nonquasireflexive and  $X$  is isomorphic to a finite-codimensional subspace of  $Y^*$  then  $Y$  is isomorphic to a total (and even norming) subspace of  $X^*$ . Therefore if  $Y$  is nonquasireflexive space such that  $Y^*$  doesn't contain closed norming subspaces of infinite codimension then the operator  $T$  from the problem posed in the first paragraph may be found only for  $\alpha = 0$  or  $\alpha = 1$  and if and only if  $X$  is isomorphic to  $Y^*$  or to finite-codimensional subspace of  $Y^*$  respectively.

For quasireflexive space all that we say above remains true. The only additional condition is that  $X$  must be isomorphic to a subspace of  $Y^*$  with codimension no greater than  $\dim(Y^{**}/Y)$ . Therefore it is natural to consider only the following particular cases of the problem from the first paragraph.

Let  $X$  be a nonquasireflexive separable Banach space. Let  $Y$  be a Banach space isomorphic to a subspace of  $X^*$  and such that  $Y^*$  contains closed norming subspaces of infinite codimension. Let  $\alpha$  be a countable ordinal.

**Question 1.** Does there exist an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  for which the subspace  $T(Y)$  is total?

**Question 2.** For what countable ordinals does there exist an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  such that  $(T(Y))_{(1)} = (T(Y))_{(1)} = Y^*$ ?

At first we shall show that in general the answer to the question 1 is negative. After this (in the third paragraph) we shall find additional condition under which the answer onto the question 1 is positive and consider question 2.

**Theorem 1.** *There exist a separable Banach space  $X$  and a separable subspace  $Y \subset X^*$  such that  $Y^*$  contains closed norming subspaces of infinite codimension but  $Y$  is not isomorphic to a total subspace of  $X^*$ .*

We need space constructed in [2]. Let  $1 < p < 2$ . Let us denote by  $X_n (n = 0, 1, 2, \dots)$  a subspace of  $l_p$  consisting of the vectors whose coordinates are equal to zero beginning with  $(n + 1)$ -th. The space  $J(l_p)$  is the completion of the space of all finitely non-zero sequences  $\{x_n\}_{n=0}^\infty (x_n \in X_n)$  under the norm

$$\|\{x_n\}_{n=0}^\infty\|_J = \sup \left( \sum_{k=1}^{m-1} \|x_{p(k+1)} - x_{p(k)}\|^2 + \|x_{p(m)}\|^2 \right)^{1/2},$$

where the sup is over all increasing integer sequences  $\{p(i)\}_{i=1}^m$  with  $p(1) \geq 0$ .

We shall use the following result about the spaces  $J(l_p), 1 < p < 2$ .

**Theorem 2.** [13]

- A. *The space  $(J(l_p))^{**}$  can be represented as a direct sum  $Z \oplus l_p$ , where  $Z$  is the canonical image of  $J(l_p)$  in its second dual.*
- B. *Every weakly null bounded away from 0 sequence in  $J(l_p)$  contains a subsequence equivalent to the orthonormal basis of  $l_2$ .*

Let us pass to the proof of theorem 1. Let  $X = l_q \oplus (J(l_p))^*$ , where  $1/q = 1 - 1/p$ . Let  $Y$  be a canonical image of  $J(l_p)$  in  $X^*$ . Theorem 2.A implies immediately that  $Y^*$  contains closed separable norming subspaces of infinite codimension (e.g. the annihilator in  $Y^*$  of the direct summand isomorphic to  $l_p$  in  $Y^{**}$ ). It remains to check that  $Y$  is not isomorphic to any total subspace of  $X^*$ . In order to do this we need the following variation on the theme of Pitt's result [8, p. 76].

**Lemma 1.** *Every operator  $R : J(l_p) \rightarrow l_p (1 < p < 2)$  is compact.*

*Proof.* Assume that  $\text{cl}(R(B(J(l_p))))$  is a non-compact set. Then there is a sequence  $\{y_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  in  $B(J(l_p))$  so that

$$(\exists \delta > 0)(\forall i, j \in \mathbb{N}, i \neq j)(\|Ry_i - Ry_j\| \geq \delta).$$

Since  $(J(l_p))^*$  is separable then we can find a weakly Cauchy subsequence  $\{y_{i(n)}\}_{n=1}^\infty$  in  $\{y_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$ . For a sequence  $z_n = y_{i(2n)} - y_{i(2n-1)}$  ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ) we have

$$(\forall n \in \mathbb{N})(\|Rz_n\| \geq \delta); \tag{1}$$

$$w - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} z_n = 0. \tag{2}$$

By theorem 2.B we can select in  $\{z_n\}_{n=1}^\infty$  a subsequence  $\{z_{n(k)}\}_{k=1}^\infty$  equivalent to the orthonormal basis of  $l_2$ . By (1), (2) and well-known results [8, p. 7, 53] the sequence  $\{Rz_{n(k)}\}_{k=1}^\infty$  contains a subsequence equivalent to the unit vector basis of  $l_1$ . Since  $p < 2$  we arrived at a contradiction. The lemma is proved.

Let  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  be arbitrary isomorphic embedding. We have  $X^* = l_p \oplus (J(l_p))^{**} = l_p \oplus J(l_p) \oplus l_p$ . Let us denote by  $P_1, P_2$  and  $P_3$  the projections corresponding to this decomposition. We have  $T = P_1T + P_2T + P_3T$ . The operators  $P_1T$  and  $P_3T$  are compact by Lemma 1. Hence the kernel of  $P_2T$  is finite-dimensional. Let us represent the space  $Y$  as a direct sum  $\ker P_2T \oplus Y_1$ . The compactness of operators  $P_1T$  and  $P_3T$  implies that the restriction of  $P_2T$  to  $Y_1$  is an isomorphism. We shall denote it by  $R$ . The subspace  $R(Y_1) \subset \{0\} \oplus J(l_p) \oplus \{0\}$  will be denoted by  $M$ . Subspace  $T(Y_1) \subset X^*$  can be represented in the following form:

$$T(Y_1) = \{(P_1TR^{-1}m, m, P_3TR^{-1}m) : m \in M\} \subset l_p \oplus J(l_p) \oplus l_p.$$

It is clear that in order to finish the proof of Theorem 1 it is sufficient to prove that weak\* closure of  $T(Y)$  in  $X^*$  does not coincide with  $X^*$ . Since the linear span of the union of weak\* closed and finite-dimensional subspaces is weak\* closed then it is sufficient to prove that  $w^*\text{-cl}(T(Y_1))$  is of infinite codimension in  $X^*$ .

Since  $M \subset \{0\} \oplus J(l_p) \oplus \{0\}$  then every operator  $Q : M \rightarrow X^*$  is continuous if we endow both spaces with the topology  $\sigma(X^*, X)$ . Let us introduce operator  $Q : M \rightarrow X^*$  defined in the following way:

$$Q(0, m, 0) = (P_1TR^{-1}m, m, P_3TR^{-1}m).$$

It follows from what we have said above that  $Q$  is an isomorphic embedding. It is easy to see that  $Q$  has (unique)  $\sigma(X^*, X)$ -continuous extension onto the subspace  $w^*\text{-cl}(M) \subset X^*$ . Let us denote this extension by  $Q_e$ . It is easy to check that  $Q_e$  can be represented as a sum of the identity operator (on  $w^*\text{-cl}(M)$ ) and a compact operator. Therefore the kernel of  $Q_e$  is finite-dimensional and the restriction of  $Q_e$  to any weak\* closed complement of  $\ker Q_e$  in  $w^*\text{-cl}(M)$  is a  $\sigma(X^*, X)$ -continuous isomorphism. Therefore by the Krein–Smulian theorem the image of  $Q_e$  is weak\* closed. Since  $Q(M) = T(Y_1)$  then we obtain  $w^*\text{-cl}(T(Y_1)) \subset \text{im} Q_e$ . On the other hand since  $P_1Q$  is a compact operator and  $w^*\text{-cl}(M)$  is contained in  $\{0\} \oplus J(l_p) \oplus l_p$  then  $P_1Q_e$  is also compact. Therefore  $\text{im} Q_e$  and hence also  $w^*\text{-cl}(T(Y_1))$  is of infinite codimension in  $X^*$ . The theorem is proved.

III. In this part of the paper additional condition under which answer onto Question 1 become affirmative is pointed out. We shall also consider Question 2.

Let  $X$  be a Banach space. Let  $Y$  be a subspace of  $X^*$ . Every element of  $X$  may be considered in a natural way as a linear functional on  $Y$ . So there is a natural mapping of  $X$  into  $Y^*$ . We shall denote this mapping by  $H_Y$ .

### Theorem 3.

- A. *Let  $X$  be a separable Banach space. Let  $Y$  be a subspace of  $Y^*$  such that  $H_Y(X)$  is of infinite codimension in  $Y^*$ . Then there exists an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  the image of which is total and, moreover, we have  $(T(Y))_{(2)} = X^*$ .*
- B. *If additionally the subspace  $Y^\top \subset X$  is infinite-dimensional then the operator  $T$  can be chosen in such a way that  $(T(Y))_{(1)} \neq (T(Y))_{(2)} = X^*$ .*
- C. *If additionally the subspace  $Y^\top \subset X$  is nonquasireflexive then for every countable ordinal  $\alpha$  there exists an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  such that  $(T(Y))_{(1)} \neq (T(Y))_{(2)} = X^*$ .*

*Remark.* Condition of the part A of Theorem 3 are satisfied if the image of  $H_Y$  is non-closed.

*Proof of Theorem 3.* Using the arguments from the proof of Proposition 3.5 of [12] we can prove the following result.

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $X$  be a Banach space. Let  $Y$  be a subspace of  $X^*$  such that  $H_Y(X)$  is non-closed. Then there exists an isomorphic embedding  $E : Y \rightarrow X^*$  such that  $\text{cl}(E^*(X))$  is of infinite codimension in  $Y^*$  and  $(E(Y))^\top \supset Y^\top$ .*

By this lemma we may restrict ourselves to the case when  $\text{cl}(H_Y(X))$  is of infinite codimension in  $Y^*$ . By separability of  $X$  and remark from [3, p. 358] there exists a weak\* null basic sequence  $\{u_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  in  $Y$  such that for certain bounded sequence  $\{v_k^{**}\}_{k=1}^\infty \subset X^{**}$  and certain partition  $\{I_k\}_{k=1}^\infty$  of the positive integers into pairwise disjoint infinite subsets we have

$$v_k^{**}(u_i^*) = \begin{cases} 1, & \text{if } i \in I_k; \\ 0, & \text{if } i \notin I_k. \end{cases}$$

At first we shall prove parts A and B of Theorem 3. Let  $\{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty$  be a normalized sequence spanning a norming subspace of  $X^*$ . Let us introduce the operator  $T : X^* \rightarrow X^*$  given by

$$T(x^*) = x^* + \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} 4^{-k} v_k^{**}(x^*) x_k^* / \|v_k^{**}\|. \quad (3)$$

It is easy to see that for every  $x^* \in X^*$  we have

$$(2/3)\|x^*\| \leq \|T(x^*)\| \leq (4/3)\|x^*\|. \quad (4)$$

Therefore  $T$  is an isomorphism. Let us show that  $(T(Y))_{(2)} = X^*$ . For  $i \in I_k$  we have  $T(u_i^*) = u_i^* + 4^{-k} x_k^* / \|v_k^{**}\|$ . Since the sequence  $\{u_i^*\}_{i=1}^\infty$  is weak\* null we obtain that  $x_k^* \in (T(Y))_{(1)}$ . Since vectors  $\{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty$  span a norming subspace in  $X^*$  it follows that  $(T(Y))_{(2)} = X^*$ . Part A is proved.

In order to prove part B we have to prove that in the case when  $Y^\top \subset X$  is infinite-dimensional the subspace  $T(Y) \subset X^*$  is nonnorming. Let  $y \in Y$  and  $z \in (\cap_{k=1}^n \ker x_k^*) \cap Y^\top$ . Then

$$(Ty)(z) = \sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} 4^{-k} v_k^{**}(y) x_k^*(z) / \|v_k^{**}\|.$$

Therefore  $|(Ty)(z)| \leq (4^{-n}/3) \|y\| \|z\|$ . By (4) we have

$$|(Ty)(z)| \leq (4^{-n}/2) \|Ty\| \|z\|.$$

Hence subspace  $T(Y) \subset X^*$  is nonnorming. Part B is proved.

Let us turn to the proof of part C. Since the space  $Y^\top$  is nonquasireflexive then by result 5 from the first part of the present paper there exists a subspace  $M$  of  $(Y^\top)^*$  such that

$$M \subset M \subset (Y^\top)^*$$

if ordinal  $\alpha$  is infinite and such that

$$M_{(\alpha-1)} \neq M_{(\alpha)} = (Y^\top)^*$$

if ordinal  $\alpha \geq 1$  is finite. Let  $N$  be the set of all bounded extensions of functionals from  $M$  onto the whole  $X$ . It is proved in [10] that

$$N_{(\alpha)} \neq N_{(\alpha+1)} = X^* \quad (N_{(\alpha-1)} \neq N_{(\alpha)} = X^*).$$

By separability of  $X$  there exists a normalized sequence  $\{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty$  such that  $x_k^* \in N(k \in \mathbb{N})$  and for  $L = \text{lin}(\{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty)$  we have  $L_{(\alpha)} \neq L_{(\alpha+1)} = X^*$  if  $\alpha$  is infinite and  $L_{(\alpha-1)} \neq L_{(\alpha)} = X^*$  if  $\alpha$  is finite.

Let us introduce operator  $T : X^* \rightarrow X^*$  by equality (3). This operator satisfies inequality (4) and hence is an isomorphism. Let us show that the subspace  $(T(Y)) \subset X^*$  satisfy the condition

$$(T(Y))_{(\alpha)} \neq (T(Y))_{(\alpha+1)} = X^*.$$

At first let us show that

$$(T(Y))_{(1)} \subset \text{cl}(\text{lin}(Y_{(1)} \cup \{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty)).$$

Let  $z \in (T(Y))_{(1)}$  and let the sequence  $\{z_i\}_{i=1}^\infty \subset T(Y)$  be such that  $z = w^* - \lim_{i \rightarrow \infty} z_i$ . We have  $z_i = T(y_i)$  for certain vectors  $y_i \in Y$ . Since  $T$  is an isomorphism then the sequence  $\{y_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  is bounded. We may consider without loss of generality that this sequence is weak\* convergent. Operator  $T$  is a sum of identical and compact operators. Denote the second one by  $K$ . We may assume without loss of generality that the sequence  $\{K(y_i)\}_{i=1}^\infty$  is strongly convergent. It is clear that its limit belongs to  $\text{cl}(\text{lin}(\{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty))$ . Hence,  $z \in \text{cl}(\text{lin}(Y_{(1)} \cup \{x_k^*\}_{k=1}^\infty))$ . Therefore restrictions of functionals from  $(T(Y))_{(1)}$  to the subspace  $(Y^\top) \subset X$  belong to  $M$ . This implies that  $(T(Y))_{(\alpha)} \subset N_{(\alpha-1)}$  in the case when ordinal  $\alpha$  is finite, and  $(T(Y))_{(\alpha)} \subset N_{(\alpha)}$  in the case when ordinal  $\alpha$  is infinite. In both cases we have  $(T(Y))_{(\alpha)} \neq X^*$ .

Using the same arguments as in the proof of part A we can show that  $x_k^* \in (T(Y))_{(1)}$ . Therefore  $L \subset (T(Y))_{(1)}$ . Hence  $(T(Y))_{(\alpha+1)} = X^*$  both when  $\alpha$  is finite and when  $\alpha$  is infinite. The proof of Theorem 3 is complete.

*Remarks.*

1. Let  $\alpha \geq 2$  be a non-limit ordinal. By arguments which were used in the proofs of Theorem 3 and Theorem 3.1 of [12] it follows that Banach space  $Y$  is isomorphic to a subspace of order  $\alpha$  in the dual of some separable Banach space if and only if the space  $Y^*$  contains closed separable norming subspace of infinite codimension.
2. If spaces  $X$  and  $Y$  satisfy the conditions of the part A of Theorem 3 and  $X$  is isomorphic to a direct sum  $X \oplus Z$  for some infinite-dimensional (non-quasireflexive) Banach space  $Z$ , then there exists an isomorphic embedding  $Q : Y \rightarrow X^*$  the image of which satisfies the conditions of the part B (C) of Theorem 3.
3. If  $X$  is a separable Banach space,  $Y$  is a subspace of  $X^*$  and  $Y^*$  is non-separable then  $X$  and  $Y$  satisfy the conditions of part A of Theorem 3. By

[7, p. 147, 213] it is the case if  $X$  is a separable  $\mathcal{L}_\infty$ -space (in the sense of Lindenstrauss - Pełczyński) and  $Y$  is nonreflexive subspace of  $X^*$ .

4. Let  $X = C(K)$  where  $K$  is a metrizable compact. It follows from well-known properties of the spaces of continuous functions (see [7]) and Remarks 2 and 3 that for any nonreflexive subspace  $Y \subset X^*$  and every countable ordinal  $\alpha \geq 1$  there exists an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  such that  $(T(Y))_{(\alpha)} \neq (T(Y))_{(\alpha+1)} = X^*$ . It is easy to see immediately that the same is true for  $\alpha = 0$ .

**Theorem 4.** *Let  $X = l_1 \oplus Z$ , where  $Z$  is a separable Banach space. Then for any countable ordinal  $\alpha \geq 1$  and any Banach space  $Y$  the dual of which contains closed separable norming subspaces of infinite codimension there exists an isomorphic embedding  $T : Y \rightarrow X^*$  such that  $(T(Y))_{(\alpha)} \neq (T(Y))_{(\alpha+1)} = X^*$ . Conversely, the dual of any total subspace  $Y \subset X^*$  contains closed separable norming subspaces of infinite codimension.*

*Proof.* Let  $a, b > 0$ . Recall that a subset  $A \subset X^*$  is said to be  $(a, b)$ -norming if the following conditions are satisfied:

$$(\forall x \in X)(\sup\{|x^*(x)| : x^* \in A\} \geq a\|x\|);$$

$$\sup\{\|x^*\| : x^* \in A\} \leq b.$$

Let Banach spaces  $X$  and  $Y$  be such that there exists an operator  $R : X \rightarrow Y^*$  for which the set  $R(B(X))$  is  $(a, b)$ -norming subset of  $Y^*$  for some  $a > 0$  and  $b < +\infty$ , and subspace  $R(X)$  is of infinite codimension in  $Y^*$ . It is easy to see that in this case the restriction of  $R^*$  to the subspace  $Y \subset Y^{**}$  is an isomorphic embedding, and  $X$  and  $R^*(Y) \subset X^*$  satisfy the conditions of part A of Theorem 3. By the quotient-universality of  $l_1$ [8, p. 108] all what is said above is valid for  $X = l_1 \oplus Z$  and any Banach space  $Y$ , the dual of which contains closed separable norming subspaces of infinite codimension. Using Remark 2 and part C of Theorem 3 we obtain the proof of the first part of Theorem 4.

Let us turn to the proof of the second part. If subspace  $Y \subset X^*$  is nonseparable then subspace  $\text{cl}(H_Y(X)) \subset Y^*$  is a closed separable norming subspace of infinite codimension.

Turn to the case when  $Y$  is separable. If subspace  $Y$  is not norming then repeating arguments from the proof of Proposition 3.5 of [12] we find in  $Y^*$  closed separable norming subspace of infinite codimension.

If subspace  $Y$  is norming then we finish the proof with the use of the following generalization of Lemma 1 of [5].

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $Y$  be a separable Banach space, whose dual contains a subspace isomorphic to  $l_1$ . Then  $Y^*$  contains norming subspace of infinite codimension isomorphic to  $l_1$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $\{f_i^*\}_{i=1}^\infty$  be a sequence in  $Y^*$  which is equivalent to the unit vector basis of  $l_1$ . The space  $Y$  is separable and so there exists a weak\* convergent subsequence  $\{f_{i(n)}^*\}_{n=1}^\infty$ . Then the sequence  $g_n^* = f_{i(2n)}^* - f_{i(2n-1)}^*$  ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ) is a weak\* null sequence which is equivalent to the unit vector basis of  $l_1$ . Let  $0 < c, C < \infty$  be such that

$$(\forall \{a_i\}_{i=1}^\infty \subset \mathbb{R})(c \sum |a_i| \leq \|\sum a_i g_i^*\| \leq C \sum |a_i|)$$

Let  $\{y_i\}_{i=1}^{\infty}$  be dense in  $S(Y)$ . For every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  we choose a functional  $h_i^* \in S(Y^*)$  such that  $h_i^*(y_i) = 1$ . Let  $\{m(i)\}_{i=1}^{\infty}$  be an increasing sequence of even positive integers satisfying the condition:

$$(\forall i \in \mathbb{N})(|g_{m(i)}^*(y_i)| < c/4).$$

It is clear that the sequence  $z_i^* = (c/2)h_i^* + g_{m(i)}^*$  ( $i \in \mathbb{N}$ ) is equivalent to the unit vector basis of  $l_1$ . Let  $L = \text{cl}(\text{lin}\{z_i^*\}_{i=1}^{\infty})$ . It remains to prove that  $L$  is a norming subspace of infinite codimension of  $Y^*$ . We have  $\|z_i^*\| \leq C + (c/2)$  and  $|z_i^*(y_i)| > (c/2)|h_i^*(y_i)| - |g_{m(i)}^*(y_i)| > c/4$ . Since  $\{y_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a dense subset of  $S(Y)$  then  $L$  is a norming subspace of  $Y^*$ . We shall show that

$$\text{lin}(\{g_{2k-1}^*\}_{k=1}^{\infty}) \cap L = \{0\},$$

from which it follows that  $L$  is of infinite codimension in  $Y^*$ . Let us suppose that sequences  $\{b_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$  and  $\{a_i\}_{i=1}^{\infty}$  from  $l_1$  satisfy the equality

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} b_k g_{2k-1}^* + \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} a_i g_{m(i)}^* = (c/2) \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} a_i h_i^*.$$

The norm of the right-hand side of this equality is not greater than  $(c/2) \sum |a_i|$ , and the norm of the left-hand side is not less than  $c(\sum |b_k| + \sum |a_i|)$ . Hence all  $a_i$  and all  $b_k$  are equal to 0. This completes the proof of the lemma.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] S. Banach., *Théorie des opérations linéaires*, Monografie Matematyczne, Warszawa, 1932.
- [2] S.F.Bellenot, *The J-sum of Banach spaces*, J. Funct. Anal. **48** (1982), 95–106.
- [3] W.J.Davis and W.B.Johnson, *Basic sequences and norming subspaces in non-quasi-reflexive Banach spaces*, Israel J. Math. **14** (1973), 353–367.
- [4] S.Dierolf and V.B.Moscatelli, *A note on quojections*, Functiones et approximatio **17** (1987), 131–138.
- [5] L.V.Gladun, *On Banach spaces the conjugates of which contain norming nonquasibasic subspaces*, Siberian Math. J. **28** (1987), 220–223.
- [6] B.V.Godun, *On weak\* derived sets of sets of linear functionals*, Mat. Zametki **23** (1978), 607–616. (Russian)
- [7] J. Lindenstrauss and L. Tzafriri, *Classical Banach spaces*, Lecture Notes in Mathematics 338, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1973.
- [8] J. Lindenstrauss and L. Tzafriri, *Classical Banach spaces I, Sequence spaces*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1977.
- [9] G.Metafune and V.B.Moscatelli, *Quojections and prequojections*, Advances in the Theory of Fréchet spaces (T.Terzioğlu, eds.), Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, 1989, pp. 235–254.
- [10] M.I.Ostrovskii, *w\*-derived sets of transfinite order of subspaces of dual Banach spaces*, Dokl. Akad. Nauk Ukrain. SSR **1987**, no. 10, 9–12. (Russian, Ukrainian)
- [11] ———, *On the problem of regularizability of the superpositions of inverse linear operators*, Teor. Funktsii, Funktsion. Anal. i Prilozhen. **55** (1991), 96–100 (Russian); English transl. in J. Soviet Math. **59** (1992), 652–655.
- [12] ———, *Total subspaces in dual Banach spaces which are not norming over any infinite-dimensional subspace*, Studia Math. **105** (1993), no. 1, 37–49.
- [13] ———, *Subspaces containing biorthogonal functionals of bases of different types*, Teor. Funktsii, Funktsional. Anal. i Prilozhen. **57** (1992), 115–127. (Russian)
- [14] Yu.I.Petunin and A.N.Plichko, *The theory of characteristic of subspaces and its applications*, “Vyshcha Shkola”, Kiev, 1980. (Russian)