

Less than continuum many translates of a compact nullset may cover any infinite profinite group

Miklós Abért

November 5, 2018

Abstract

We show that it is consistent with the axioms of set theory that every infinite profinite group G possesses a closed subset X of Haar measure zero such that less than continuum many translates of X cover G . This answers a question of Elekes and Tóth and by their work settles the problem for all infinite compact topological groups.

Let G be a profinite group and let μ be a left Haar measure on G . If $X \subseteq G$ is a measurable subset of measure zero, then trivially countably many G -translates of X can not cover G . Thus the continuum-hypothesis (CH) implies that one needs at least continuum many translates of X to do this. However, it turns out that if we do not assume CH, then, consistently with the axioms of set theory, the world may be different.

Theorem 1 *It is consistent with the axioms of set theory that for every infinite profinite group G there exists a closed subset $X \subseteq G$ of Haar-measure 0 such that less than continuum many G -translates of X cover G .*

Note that our proof is not constructive in the sense that it uses a probabilistic argument.

Theorem 1 answers a question of Elekes and Tóth [5, Question 3.10]. The first result of this type is due to Elekes and Steprans [4] who proved the analogue of Theorem 1 for the real line. For the background of covering the real line with less than continuum many nullsets see [2]. Recently Elekes and

Tóth [5] proved the theorem in the realm of real Lie groups, locally compact Abelian groups and also showed that Theorem 1 would imply the result for arbitrary infinite compact topological groups. So now this is settled.

In turn, Darji and T. Keleti [3] proved that if X is a compact subset of the reals with packing dimension less than 1 then one needs continuum many translates of X to cover the real line. Let (N_i) be a strictly descending chain of open normal subgroups in G . Then (N_i) naturally gives rise to a dimension function; for a subset $X \subseteq G$ let

$$\dim_{(N_i)}(X) = \liminf_i \frac{\log |XN_i/N_i|}{\log |G/N_i|}$$

See [1] for an introduction on this dimension notion. This suggests the following.

Question 2 *Let G be an infinite profinite group and let $X \subseteq G$ be a compact subset such that $\dim X < 1$ with respect to some strictly descending chain of open normal subgroups of G . Is it true that one needs at least continuum many translates of X to cover G ?*

Let G be a group. We say that a subset $Y \subseteq G$ can be translated into $X \subseteq G$ if there exists $g \in G$ such that $gY \subseteq X$.

Let G be a profinite group and let N_0, N_1, \dots be open normal subgroups of G . Let $f : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ be a function. We say that a subset $X \subseteq G$ is f -thin with respect to (N_i) , if

$$|XN_i/N_i| \leq f(i) \quad (i \in \mathbb{N}).$$

The proof of Theorem 1 relies on the following result which is purely group theoretical.

Theorem 3 *Let G be an infinite profinite group. Let $f(0) = 1$ and $f(n) = n$ ($n > 0$). Then there exists a descending chain of open normal subgroups in $G = N_0 > N_1 > N_2 > \dots$ and a closed subset $X \subseteq G$ of measure zero such that every subset of G that is f -thin with respect to (N_i) can be translated into X .*

We prove this theorem after a series of results on finite groups.

Theorem 4 *Let G be a finite group of size n and let*

$$k < \frac{n - \log 2}{\log n}$$

be a natural number. Then for all integers l with

$$2(k \log n + \log 2)^{\frac{1}{k}} n^{1 - \frac{1}{k}} < l \leq n$$

there exist subsets $X_1, \dots, X_k \subseteq G$ of size l such that for every $g_1, \dots, g_k \in G$ the intersection $\cap_i X_i g_i$ is non-empty.

Proof. We can trivially assume $n \geq 3$ and $k \geq 2$.

Let

$$p = \left(\frac{k \log n + \log 2}{n} \right)^{\frac{1}{k}}.$$

The assumption on k implies $p < 1$. By a random subset of G we mean a subset which is produced by choosing each element of G independently with probability p . Let X_1, X_2, \dots, X_k be independent random subsets of G . We will show that with positive probability these subsets satisfy the theorem.

Fix $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_k \in G$. Then the subsets $X_1 g_1, X_2 g_2, \dots, X_k g_k$ are also independent random subsets of G . Thus for all $x \in X$ the probability

$$P(x \in \bigcap_{i=1}^k X_i g_i) = \prod_{i=1}^k P(x \in X_i g_i) = p^k$$

Also, the events

$$(x \in \bigcap_{i=1}^k X_i g_i) \quad (x \in G)$$

are independent, so we have

$$P\left(\bigcap_{i=1}^k X_i g_i = \emptyset\right) = P(\text{for all } x \in G \text{ we have } x \notin \bigcap_{i=1}^k X_i g_i) = (1 - p^k)^n$$

Summing up these bad probabilities for the possible $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_k \in G$ we get

$$P = P(\text{there exists } g_1, \dots, g_k \in G \text{ with } \bigcap_{i=1}^k X_i g_i = \emptyset) \leq n^k (1 - p^k)^n$$

and using

$$-\log(1 - p^k) > p^k = \frac{k \log n + \log 2}{n}$$

we get

$$P \leq n^k (1 - p^k)^n < \frac{1}{2}$$

We also want to control the sizes of the X_i from above. For each $1 \leq i \leq k$ the size $|X_i|$ equals the sum of independent variables which take 1 with probability p and 0 with probability $1 - p$. Thus the expected value is

$$E(|X_i|) = pn = \frac{1}{2} n^{1-\frac{1}{k}} (k-1) \log n$$

and the standard deviance is

$$s = SD(|X_i|) = \sqrt{p(1-p)n} < \sqrt{pn}$$

Now using Chernoff's inequality

$$P(|X_i| > as) \leq 2 \exp(-a^2/4)$$

for $a = 2pn/s$ we obtain

$$Q_i = P(|X_i| > 2pn) \leq 2 \exp\left(-\frac{p^2 n^2}{s^2}\right) < 2 \exp(-pn)$$

Using $n \geq 3$ and $k \geq 2$ we get

$$k < \frac{n - \log 2}{\log n} < \frac{n^2}{4}$$

which implies

$$p = \left(\frac{k \log n + \log 2}{n}\right)^{\frac{1}{k}} > \frac{2 \log n}{n} > \frac{\log 4k}{n}$$

yielding

$$Q_i < 2 \exp(-pn) < 2 \exp(-\log 4k) = \frac{1}{2k}$$

Adding up, we obtain

$$P + \sum_{i=1}^k Q_i < 1$$

which implies that with positive probability for all $1 \leq i \leq k$ we have

$$|X_i| \leq 2pn = 2(k \log n + \log 2)^{\frac{1}{k}} n^{1-\frac{1}{k}}$$

and for all $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_k \in G$ we have

$$\bigcap_{i=1}^k X_i g_i \neq \emptyset.$$

In particular, these events happen for at least one value of X_1, X_2, \dots, X_k . If necessary, we can enlarge the X_i to have size l , keeping the intersection condition untouched. The theorem is proved. \square

Let k be a natural number. We say that a subset $X \subseteq G$ is k -covering in G if every subset $Y \subseteq G$ of size k can be translated into X .

Lemma 5 *Let G be a finite group of size n and let k be a natural number. If*

$$(4k)^k (k \log n + \log 2) < n$$

then there exists a k -covering subset $X \subseteq G$ of size $|X| \leq n/2$.

Proof. The inequality implies

$$2(k \log n + \log 2)^{\frac{1}{k}} n^{1-\frac{1}{k}} < \frac{n}{2k}$$

Since the assumptions of Theorem 4 hold, there exist subsets $X_1, X_2, \dots, X_k \subseteq G$ of size at most $n/2k$ satisfying the conclusion. Let $X = \cup_i X_i$. Then we have $|X| \leq n/2$.

Let $Y \subseteq G$ be an arbitrary subset of size k . Let us list the elements of Y as y_1, y_2, \dots, y_k and let

$$K = \bigcap_i X_i y_i^{-1}.$$

By Theorem 4 K is non-empty. Let $g \in K$. Now for $1 \leq i \leq k$ we have

$$g y_i \in X_i y_i^{-1} y_i = X_i$$

implying

$$gY \subseteq \cup_i X_i = X.$$

So X is a k -covering subset of G . \square

The following extension lemma is the key to pass from finite to profinite groups.

Lemma 6 *Let G be a finite group, let $\varphi : G \rightarrow H$ be an epimorphism with kernel N of size n and let $X \subseteq H$ be a subset in H . Assume that*

$$(4k)^k (k \log n + \log 2) < n$$

Then there exists a subset $X' \subseteq G$ such that

- 1) $\varphi(X') = X$;
- 2) $|X'| \leq n |X| / 2$;
- 3) *Every subset $Y \subseteq G$ of size at most $k + 1$ for which $\varphi(Y)$ can be translated into X can be translated into X' .*

Proof. Let $\tilde{X} \subseteq G$ such that $\varphi(\tilde{X}) = X$ and $|\tilde{X}| = |X|$. Lemma 5 implies that there exists a $k + 1$ -covering subset $L \subseteq N$ of size $|L| \leq n/2$. Let $X' = L\tilde{X}$. Then 1) and 2) trivially hold and we only have to check 3).

Let $Y \subseteq G$ be a subset with for which $\varphi(Y)$ can be translated into X . This means that there exists $h \in H$ such that $h\varphi(Y) \subseteq X$. Let $g \in G$ such that $\varphi(g) = h$. Then we have $\varphi(gY) = h\varphi(Y) \subseteq X$, implying $gY \subseteq N\tilde{X}$. Let us list the elements of \tilde{X} as x_1, x_2, \dots, x_t with $t = |X|$. Using this notation, there exist subsets $Y_1, Y_2, \dots, Y_t \subseteq N$ such that

$$gY = \bigcup_{i=1}^t Y_i x_i.$$

Let $Y' = \cup_i Y_i \subseteq N$. Then $|Y'| \leq |Y| = k + 1$, so there exists an element $u \in N$ such that $uY' \subseteq L$. Now

$$ugY = \bigcup_{i=1}^t uY_i x_i \subseteq \bigcup_{i=1}^t Lx_i = L\tilde{X} = X'$$

and so Y can be translated into X' . \square

Proof of Theorem 3. Since G is infinite, there exists a descending chain of open normal subgroups $G = N_0 > N_1 > N_2 > \dots$. Let $n_i = |N_i/N_{i+1}|$. By passing to a suitable subchain we can also assume that for all $i > 0$ we have

$$(4i)^i (i \log n_{i-1} + \log 2) < n_{i-1}$$

Let $G_i = G/N_i$ and let $\varphi_i : G \rightarrow G_i$ denote the quotient map.

We claim that there exist subsets $X_i \in G_i$ such that for all $i \in \mathbb{N}$ the following hold:

1. $\varphi_i(X_{i+1}N_{i+1}) \subseteq X_i$;
2. $|X_i| \leq |G_i|/2^i$;
3. If $Y \subseteq G$ is an f -thin subset with respect to (N_i) then $\varphi_i(Y)$ can be translated into X_i in G_i .

We prove our claims by induction on i . For $i = 0$ we set $X_i = G_i = \{1\}$ and everything holds trivially.

Assume that we already constructed X_i as above. Let $\varphi : G_{i+1} \rightarrow G_i$ be defined by $\varphi(g) = \varphi_i(gN_i)$ and let $H = G_i$. Then setting $X = X_i$ and $G = G_{i+1}$ we can use Lemma 6. Let $X_{i+1} = X'$ obtained from the lemma. Now 1) follows immediately from 1) of Lemma 6. By 2) of Lemma 6 and using induction we have

$$|X_{i+1}| \leq |X_i| |\ker \varphi| / 2 \leq |G_i| |\ker \varphi| / 2^{i+1} = |G_{i+1}| / 2^{i+1}$$

so 2) also holds. Finally, if $Y \subseteq G$ is an f -thin subset with respect to (N_i) then $\varphi_i(Y) \subseteq G_i$ can be translated into X_i by induction. Since $Y \subseteq G$ is f -thin, we have

$$|\varphi_{i+1}(YN_{i+1})| \leq i + 1$$

and so 3) of Lemma 6 holds for $\varphi_{i+1}(Y)$. It follows that $\varphi_{i+1}(Y)$ can be translated into X_{i+1} in G_{i+1} what we claimed in 3). So all the claims hold.

Now let

$$X = \bigcap_i X_i N_i \subseteq G.$$

Since all the $X_i N_i$ are open and closed, X is closed. Also, if μ stands for the normalised Haar measure on G then using 2) we have

$$\mu(X) \leq \mu(X_i N_i) = \frac{|X_i|}{|G_i|} \leq \frac{1}{2^i} \quad (i \in \mathbb{N})$$

which implies $\mu(X) = 0$.

Let $Y \subseteq G$ be an f -thin subset of G with respect to (N_i) . For $i \in \mathbb{N}$ let

$$T_i = \{g \in G \mid \varphi_i(gY) \subseteq X_i\}.$$

Then 3) tells us that the T_i are non-empty. Also the T_i are unions of N_i -cosets, so they are open and closed. On the other hand, if $g \in T_{i+1}$ then $\varphi_{i+1}(gY) \subseteq X_{i+1}$ and so, using 1) we have

$$\varphi_i(gY) = \varphi_i(\varphi_{i+1}(gY)N_{i+1}) \subseteq \varphi_i(X_{i+1}N_{i+1}) \subseteq X_i$$

which implies $g \in T_i$. That is, we have $T_{i+1} \subseteq T_i$ ($i \in \mathbb{N}$). Now by the compactness of G the T_i have non-empty intersection. Let $g \in \bigcap_i T_i$.

From $\varphi_i(gY) \subseteq X_i$ we have $gY \subseteq X_i N_i$. Thus $gY \subseteq \bigcap_i X_i N_i = X$ and so Y can be translated into X . \square

We are ready to prove Theorem 1.

Proof of Theorem 1. Let $f(0) = 1$ and $f(n) = n$ ($n > 0$). Applying Theorem 3 to G we get a descending chain of open normal subgroups in $G = N_0 > N_1 > N_2 > \dots$ and a closed subset $X \subseteq G$ of measure zero such that every subset of G that is f -thin with respect to (N_i) can be translated into X . For $i \in \mathbb{N}$ let $G_i = G/N_i$ and let $\varphi_i : G \rightarrow G_i$ denote the quotient map.

Let $P = \prod_i G_i$ and let $\varphi : G \rightarrow P$ be defined by

$$\varphi(g) = (\varphi_0(g), \varphi_1(g), \dots, \varphi_n(g), \dots)$$

Then P is a profinite group endowed with the product topology, φ is continuous and since G is compact, $A = \varphi(G)$ is a closed subgroup of P .

Following the notation in [5] we call a subset $S = \prod_i S_i \subseteq \prod_i G_i = P$ an f -slalom if $|S_i| \leq f(i)$ ($i \in \mathbb{N}$). It is consistent with the axioms of set theory (see [2]) that there exists a cardinality $\kappa < 2^\omega$ such that we can cover P by κ f -slaloms. Let L_j ($j \in J$) be a set of f -slaloms such that $\bigcup_{j \in J} L_j = P$. Here J is an index set of cardinality κ . For $j \in J$ let $M_j = A \cap L_j$ and let $Y_j = \varphi^{-1}(M_j)$. Then $A = \bigcup_{j \in J} M_j$ and so $G = \bigcup_{j \in J} Y_j$.

Now for all $j \in J$ the subset Y_j is f -thin with respect to (N_i) since $\varphi(Y_j) = M_j \subseteq L_j$. So by Theorem 3 there exists $g_j \in G$ such that $g_j Y_j \subseteq X$, that is, $Y_j \subseteq g_j^{-1} X$. But then

$$\bigcup_{j \in J} g_j^{-1} X \supseteq \bigcup_{j \in J} Y_j = G$$

and so we covered G by $\kappa < 2^\omega$ translates of X . \square

Remark. For a finite group G of size n and a natural number k let $\text{cov}(G, k)$ denote the size of a minimal k -covering subset of G . Using Theorem 4 and the proof of Lemma 5 we get

$$\text{cov}(G, k) \leq 2k (k \log n + \log 2)^{\frac{1}{k}} n^{1 - \frac{1}{k}}$$

On the other hand, it is easy to show that if X is a k -covering subset of G then for all $g_1, g_2, \dots, g_k \in G$ we have $\bigcap_i X_i g_i \neq \emptyset$. We claim that this implies $|X| \geq n^{1-\frac{1}{k}}$. Indeed, if A and B are subsets of G , then it is easy to see that the expected value of $|A \cap Bg| = |A||B|/n$ where g is a uniform random element of G . So with the notation $g_1 = 1$ and $l = |X|$ there exists $g_2 \in G$ such that $|Xg_1 \cap Xg_2| < l^2/n$. Similarly, we can find $g_3 \in G$ such that $|Xg_1 \cap Xg_2 \cap Xg_3| < l^3/n^2$. Using induction, we can find $g_4, \dots, g_k \in G$ such that $|\bigcap_i X_i g_i| < l^n/k^{n-1}$. Now if $|X| < n^{1-\frac{1}{k}}$ then $|\bigcap_i X_i g_i| < 1$ that is, it is empty. This shows that our claim holds and that

$$n^{1-\frac{1}{k}} \leq \text{cov}(G, k)$$

It would be interesting to see whether the extra $2k(k \log n + \log 2)^{\frac{1}{k}}$ in the upper estimate is really needed. For the case $k = 2$ the question is equivalent to finding the smallest subset X of G with $XX^{-1} = G$. This has been settled in [6] (see also [7]). It follows that

$$\text{cov}(G, 2) = O(\sqrt{n})$$

so this suggests that at least the $\log n$ factor in $\text{cov}(G, k)$ could be omitted. Note, however, that elementary counting arguments only give $\text{cov}(G, 2) = O(\sqrt{n \log n})$ and the asymptotically sharp estimate $O(\sqrt{n})$ relies on the Classification of Finite Simple Groups.

Acknowledgement. The author is grateful to M. Elekes for telling him about the problem leading to this paper and for helpful discussions.

References

- [1] Y. Barnea and A. Shalev, Hausdorff dimension, pro- p groups, and Kac-Moody algebras, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* 349 (1997), no. 12, 5073–5091.
- [2] T. Bartoszyński and H. Judah, *Set theory, On the structure of the real line*. A K Peters, Ltd., Wellesley, MA, 1995.
- [3] U. B. Darji and T. Keleti, Covering \mathbb{R} with translates of a compact set, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* 131 (2003), no. 8, 2598–2596

- [4] M. Elekes and J. Steprans, Less than continuum many translates of a compact nullset may cover the real line, *Fund. Math.* 181 (2004), no. 1, 89-96.
- [5] M. Elekes and Á. Tóth, Covering locally compact groups by less than continuum many translates of a compact nullset, *Fund. Math.* 193 (2007), 243-257.
- [6] L. Finkelstein, D. Kleitman and T. Leighton, Applying the classification theorem for finite simple groups to minimize pin count in uniform permutation architectures, *VLSI algorithms and architectures (Corfu, 1988)*, 247–256, *Lecture Notes in Comput. Sci.*, 319, Springer, New York, 1988.
- [7] G. Kozma and A. Lev, Bases and decomposition numbers of finite groups, *Arch. Math. (Basel)* 58 (1992), no. 5, 417–424.