

Instability of three dimensional conformally dressed black hole

Cristián Martínez*

*Centro de Estudios Científicos de Santiago,
Casilla 16443, Santiago 9, Chile.*

(June 28, 2021)

The three dimensional black hole solution of Einstein equations with negative cosmological constant coupled to a conformal scalar field is proved to be unstable against linear circularly symmetric perturbations.

From the discovery of a black hole in three dimensions [1], considerable work has been devoted to seek other black hole solutions including matter fields coupled to gravity in those dimensions [2–5]. An interesting case is the black-hole spacetime obtained by coupling conformally a massless scalar field [6], that is, a solution of the field equations which arises of extremizing the action

$$I = \int d^3x \sqrt{-g} \left[\frac{R + 2l^{-2}}{2\kappa} - \frac{1}{2} g^{\mu\nu} \nabla_\mu \Psi \nabla_\nu \Psi - \frac{1}{16} R \Psi^2 \right], \quad (1)$$

where $-l^{-2}$ is the cosmological constant, κ is the gravitational constant, and Ψ is a massless conformal scalar field.

The black-hole solution and scalar field are given by

$$ds^2 = - \left[\frac{(2r + r_+)^2 (r - r_+)}{4r l^2} \right] dt^2 + \left[\frac{(2r + r_+)^2 (r - r_+)}{4r l^2} \right]^{-1} dr^2 + r^2 d\theta^2 \quad (2)$$

and

$$\Psi(r) = \sqrt{\frac{8r_+}{\kappa(2r + r_+)}} \quad (3)$$

respectively.

This metric is circularly symmetric, static and asymptotically anti-de Sitter. The scalar field is regular everywhere. The thermodynamics and geometric properties of this black hole can be found in [6].

The action (1) without cosmological constant in four dimensions (also including electromagnetism), was previously considered by Bocharova, Bronnikov and Melnikov [7] and Bekenstein [8,9]. The uncharged BBMB black hole solution looks like the extreme Reissner-Nordström metric and the scalar field is unbounded at horizon. This solution was shown to be unstable under monopole perturbations in [10].

The aim of this paper is to show the instability of three dimensional conformally dressed black hole against linear circularly symmetric perturbations.

We consider the perturbed circularly symmetric metric

$$ds^2 = -e^{2U(t,r)} F(t,r) dt^2 + F^{-1}(t,r) dr^2 + r^2 d\theta^2, \quad (4)$$

where

$$F(t,r) = F_0(r) + f(t,r), \quad \text{with} \quad F_0(r) = \frac{(2r + r_+)^2 (r - 2r_+)}{4r l^2}, \quad (5)$$

and

$$\Psi(t,r) = \Psi_0(r) + \psi(t,r), \quad \text{with} \quad \Psi_0(r) = \sqrt{\frac{8r_+}{(2r + r_+)}} \quad (6)$$

where the constant κ has been absorbed by a redefinition of scalar field.

*Electronic address: martinez@cecs.cl

Linearizing the Einstein equations with respect to f , U and ψ we obtain the following equations

$$0 = \frac{r_+}{r(2r+r_+)^2}f + \frac{1}{(2r+r_+)}f' - \frac{r_+F_0}{r(2r+r_+)}U' + A_\psi\psi + \frac{r_+^2(2r+r_+)^2}{8l^2r^3\Psi_0}\psi' - \frac{l^2\Psi_0}{2(2r^2-r_+r-r_+^2)}\ddot{\psi}, \quad (7)$$

$$0 = \frac{r_+}{r(2r+r_+)^2}f + \frac{1}{(2r+r_+)}f' + \frac{F_0}{r}U' + B_\psi\psi + \frac{\Psi_0(2r+r_+)^2(12r^2-10r_+r+r_+^2)}{64l^2r^3}\psi' + \frac{(2r+r_+)F_0\Psi_0}{8r}\psi'', \quad (8)$$

$$0 = -\frac{r_+(r+r_+)}{r^2(2r+r_+)^2}f + \frac{1}{2F_0^2}\ddot{f} + \frac{3(8r^3+r_+^3)}{8l^2r^2}U' + F_0U'' + C_\psi\psi + \frac{r_+F_0\Psi_0}{8r^2}\psi', \quad (9)$$

$$0 = -\frac{(r+r_+)}{r(2r+r_+)}\dot{f} + \frac{\psi_0(2r+r_+)^2(2r^2-4r_+r-r_+^2)}{8l^2r^3}\dot{\psi} + \frac{F_0\Psi_0(2r+r_+)}{8l^2r^2}\dot{\psi}', \quad (10)$$

with

$$A_\psi = \frac{2r+r_+}{8l^2r^3} \left[\frac{(4r-r_+)r_+}{\Psi_0} - \frac{8r^3+r_+^3}{8r} \right],$$

$$B_\psi = \frac{2r+r_+}{8l^2r^3} \left[\frac{(14r^2-4r_+r-r_+^2)r_+}{(2r+r_+)\Psi_0} - \frac{8r^3+r_+^3}{8r} \right],$$

$$C_\psi = \frac{2r+r_+}{4l^2r^3} \left[-\frac{(4r^2+r_+r+r_+^2)r_+}{(2r+r_+)\Psi_0} - \frac{4r^3-r_+^3}{8r} \right].$$

The scalar equation yields

$$-\frac{1}{F_0}\ddot{\psi} + \frac{1}{r}[rF_0\psi']' + \frac{3}{4}l^{-2}\psi + \frac{1}{r}[rf\Psi_0]' + F_0\Psi_0'U' = 0. \quad (11)$$

We will now put the above equation in term of ψ and its derivatives only. We observe that Eq. (10) is trivially integrable respect to time. The arbitrary function of r that arises from the integration is set equal zero by imposing that f vanishes if ψ also does. This yields the following expression for f

$$f = \frac{(2r+r_+)^2\Psi_0}{64l^2r^2(r+r_+)} [(2r+r_+)(2r^2-4r_+r-r_+^2)\psi + 8l^2r^2F_0\psi']. \quad (12)$$

From the difference of (7) and (8) we obtain

$$U' = -\frac{\Psi_0}{16(r+r_+)} \left[3\psi + 6(2r+r_+)\psi' + (2r+r_+)^2(\psi'' + \frac{1}{F_0^2}\ddot{\psi}) \right]. \quad (13)$$

Replacing (13) and (12) in (11) the equations system is decoupled and the equation for scalar field perturbation is

$$-\frac{1}{F_0}\ddot{\psi} + F_0\psi'' + \frac{(2r+r_+)(6r^3+4r_+r^2-5r_+^2r+r_+^3)}{4l^2r^2(r+r_+)}\psi' + \frac{3r^4+4r_+r^3-3r_+^2r^2-r_+^4}{4l^2r^3(r+r_+)}\psi = 0. \quad (14)$$

We proceed now to look for solution of form

$$\psi(t, r) = \chi(r) \exp(\sigma t), \quad \sigma \text{ real}, \quad (15)$$

where $\chi(r)$ has the character of a physical perturbation, i.e., χ be a continuous bounded function. Hence, for $\sigma > 0$ the system is unstable (also being necessary to study the metric perturbations). Changing the radial coordinate by $x \equiv 2(r - r_+)/r_+$, (14) becomes a differential equation for χ

$$\chi'' + P(x)\chi' + (Q(x) - \alpha^2 R(x))\chi = 0, \quad (16)$$

with

$$P(x) = \frac{(3x+4)(x^2+6x+6)}{x(x+2)(x+3)(x+4)}, \quad (17)$$

$$Q(x) = \frac{3x^4 + 32x^3 + 108x^2 + 144x + 48}{4x(x+2)^2(x+3)^2(x+4)}, \quad (18)$$

$$R(x) = \left[\frac{(x+2)}{x(x+3)^2} \right]^2, \quad \alpha = \frac{2l^2}{r_+} \sigma. \quad (19)$$

The above equation can be put into a Sturm-Liouville form,

$$(p(x)\chi')' + p(x)(Q(x) - \alpha^2 R(x))\chi = 0, \quad (20)$$

where the integrating factor is

$$p(x) = \exp \left\{ \int P dx \right\} = \frac{x(x+3)^5}{(x+2)(x+4)^2}. \quad (21)$$

Finally, we can turn (20) into a Schrödinger-type equation, with the change of variables proposed by Liouville:

$$\eta = (p^2 R)^{1/4} \chi, \quad z = \int R^{1/2}(x) dx. \quad (22)$$

Thus, the scalar perturbation equation takes the familiar aspect of a Schrödinger equation with a one-dimensional potential

$$\left\{ -\frac{d^2}{dz^2} + V(z) \right\} \eta = -\alpha^2 \eta, \quad (23)$$

where the potential $V(z)$ is

$$V(z) = (p^2 R)^{-1/4} \frac{d^2}{dz^2} (p^2 R)^{1/4} - \frac{Q}{R}. \quad (24)$$

Replacing the expressions for p , R y Q in (22) and (24) the relations between η and χ , and z and x are obtained

$$\eta(z(x)) = \frac{(x+3)^{3/2}}{x+4} \chi(x), \quad (25)$$

$$z = \frac{1}{3(x+3)} - \frac{2}{9} \log \left| \frac{x}{x+3} \right|, \quad (26)$$

and the potential is

$$V(z(x)) = \frac{x(x+3)^2}{(x+2)^4(x+4)^2} (5x^3 + 36x^2 + 96x + 96). \quad (27)$$

We will now study the properties of the differential equation (23) in the half-line $x \geq 0$, that is, $r \geq r_+$.

First, we note from (25) that the Liouville transformation does not add singularities in the definition of η . Moreover, the change of variable (26) is a one-to-one map between the half-line $x \geq 0$ and $z \geq 0$, where spatial infinity is mapped to $z = 0$ and the horizon ($x = 0$) to $z = \infty$.

In the outer region to the horizon, $z \geq 0$, the potential $V(z)$ behaves as a positive, concave, monotonically decreasing function, which has its maximum at $z = 0$ ($V(z=0) = 5$) and goes to zero if $z \rightarrow \infty$. Although we have a positive definite potential, it is possible to find negative eigenvalues since we only consider the half-line.

In order to study the behavior of the solution in the neighborhood of $x = 0$, we consider Eq. (16). This is a Fuchsian equation since its two singularities, $x = 0$ and $x = \infty$, are regular singular points. Applying Frobenius method, we conclude that, around $x = 0$, the linearly independent solutions take the form

$$\chi_{\pm}(x) = x^{\pm \frac{2\alpha}{9}} u_{\pm}(x), \quad (28)$$

where u_{\pm} are analytic functions. We observe that χ_+ is the regular solution and vanishes at $x = 0$ (assuming α positive). This implies that $\eta = 0$ at $z = \infty$.

The behavior of the solution at $x = \infty$ is analyzed by replacing $x = 1/w$. Then Eq. (16) takes the asymptotic form

$$\frac{d^2\chi}{dw^2} - \frac{1}{w} \frac{d\chi}{dw} + \frac{3}{4w^2}\chi = 0. \quad (29)$$

The roots of the associated indicial equation are $1/2$ y $3/2$. Thus χ is asymptotically given by

$$\chi(x) \sim x^{-\frac{1}{2}}. \quad (30)$$

We note that the perturbation χ has the same asymptotic form as the starting solution Ψ_0 . Replacing (30) into (25), we observe that $\eta(z = 0) \equiv \eta_0$ is a constant. It is easy to see that there are no bounded solutions if $\eta_0 = 0$. To see that, assume $\eta_0 = 0$ y $\eta'(0) > 0$. From (23), we note that $\eta'(z)$ is an increasing function and η diverges. If $\eta'(0) < 0$, η diverges to negative values. In the same way, it is straightforward to show that the bounded solutions of (23) cannot have zeros since η and its second derivative has the same sign.

Using the results of [11] it is possible to establish that there exist bounded solutions to (23) with the boundary conditions $\eta(0) \neq 0$ and $\eta(\infty) = 0$. Now, we turn over to the metric perturbations.

From (12) it is inferred that

$$f(r_+) = \left(\frac{3}{2}\right)^{7/2} \frac{r_+^2}{4l^2} \psi(r_+), \quad (31)$$

and therefore, f vanishes at horizon.

The asymptotic behavior of f is

$$f \sim x^{3/2}[\psi + 2x\psi'], \quad (x \rightarrow \infty), \quad (32)$$

and given that $\psi \sim (x^{-1/2} + \text{const. } x^{-3/2}) \exp(\sigma t)$, then,

$$f \sim [\text{const.} + O(x^{-1})] \exp(\sigma t). \quad (33)$$

We see that spatial dependence of f acts modifying the coefficients associated to r^0 and r^{-1} of F_0 , that is, only modifies the position of the horizon. It is a sensible initial perturbation.

The only remaining point is to deal the U perturbation. From (13), we obtain

$$U' \sim \frac{\text{const.}}{r^3}, \quad \text{that is, } U \sim \frac{\text{const.}}{r^2}. \quad (34)$$

Therefore, U modifies the mass asymptotically. Near the horizon,

$$U' = x^{\frac{2\alpha}{9}-1} + \left(\frac{4\alpha}{9} - 1\right)x^{\frac{2}{9}(\alpha-9)}. \quad (35)$$

Thus, $U' = 0$ at the horizon if $\alpha > 9$, or equivalently, $\sigma > 9r_+/2l^2$, which proves the instability of the solution.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Useful discussions with J. Zanelli are gratefully acknowledged. This work was supported in part by Grant No. 3970004/97 of FONDECYT (Chile). The institutional support to the Centro de Estudios Científicos de Santiago provided of a group of Chilean private companies (BUSINESS DESIGN ASSOCIATES, CGE, CMPC, CODELCO, COPEC, CHILGENER, MINERA COLLAHUASI, MINERA LA ESCONDIDA, NOVAGAS, XEROX CHILE) is also recognized.

- [1] M. Bañados, C. Teitelboim and J. Zanelli, Phys. Rev. Lett. **69**, 1849 (1992); M. Bañados, C. Teitelboim, M. Henneaux and J. Zanelli, Phys. Rev. **D48**, 1506 (1993).
- [2] K. C. K. Chan and R. B. Mann, Phys. Rev. **D50**, 6385 (1994); erratum, **D52**, 2600 (1995).
- [3] K. C. K. Chan and R. B. Mann, Phys. Lett. **B371**,199 (1996).
- [4] P. M. Sá, A. Kleber and J. P. S. Lemos, Class. Quant. Grav. **13**, 125 (1996).
- [5] K. C. K. Chan, Phys. Rev. **D55**, 3564 (1997).
- [6] C. Martínez and J. Zanelli, Phys. Rev. **D54**, 3830 (1996).
- [7] N. Bocharova, K. Bronnikov and V. Melnikov, Vestn. Mosk. Univ. Fiz. Astron. **6**, 706 (1970).
- [8] J. D. Bekenstein, Ann. Phys. (N.Y.) **82**, 535 (1974).
- [9] J. D. Bekenstein, Ann. Phys. (N.Y.) **91**, 75 (1975).
- [10] K. A. Bronnikov and Y. N. Kireyev, Phys. Lett. **A67**, 95 (1978).
- [11] E. Hille, *Lectures on Ordinary Differential Equations*, Addison-Wesley (1969), p 445.