A sym m etry of jets, lobe length and spectral index in quasars

J.D ennett-Thorpe,¹? A.H.Bridle,² P.A.G.Scheuer,¹ R.A.Laing ³ and J.P.Leahy ⁴

¹ M ullard Radio A stronom y O bservatory, C avendish Laboratory, M adingley Road, C am bridge C B 3 OH E

 2 N ational Radio A stronom y O bservatory, 520 E dgem ont Road, C harbttesville VA 22903-2475, U SA

³ RoyalG menwich Observatory, M adingley Road, Cambridge CB3 0EZ

⁴ Nu eld Radio A stronom y Observatories, Jodrell Bank, Maccles eld, Cheshire SK 11 9D L

R eceived

ABSTRACT

The less depolarized lobe of a radio source is generally the lobe containing the jet (Laing-G arrington correlation) but the less depolarized lobe is also generally that with the atter radio spectrum (Liu-Pooley correlation). Both e ects are strong; taken together they would imply a correlation between jet side and lobe spectral index, i.e. between an orientation-dependent feature and one which is intrinsic. We test this prediction using detailed spectral in aging of a sample of quasars with well-de ned jets and investigate whether the result can be reconciled with the standard interpretation of one-sided jets in terms of relativistic aberration. Our central nding is that the spectrum of high surface brightness regions is indeed atter on the jet side, but that the spectrum of low surface brightness regions is atter on the side with the longer lobe. We discuss possible causes for these correlations and favour explanations in terms of relativistic bulk motion in the high surface brightness regions and di erential synchrotron ageing in the extended lobe material.

Keywords: galaxies: jets { quasars: general { radio continuum : general

1 IN TRODUCTION

1.1 The problem

Laing, Garrington and colleagues (Garrington et al. 1988; Laing 1988) showed that the lobe of a powerful radio source containing the jet is alm ost invariably less depolarized than its counterpart on the opposite side of the nucleus; 39 out of the 47 sources in Tables 3 to 6 of Garrington, Conway & Leahy (1991) obey the Laing{Garrington rule (only 4 sources de nitely show the reverse e ect). These 47 sources all have FRII morphologies (Fanaro & Riley 1974) and m ost are quasars, although a few radio galaxies are included. Very few FR II sources have detectable jets on both sides of the nucleus, and we will use the term \the jet" to refer to the brighter (in alm ost all cases the only) such feature. The most widely accepted explanation of the Laing (Garrington e ect is that jets are intrinsically two-sided and relativistic: the nearer one appears brighter as a result of D oppler beam ing and radiation from its lobe passes through less of the depolarizing medium around the source (Laing 1988; Garrington & Conway 1991). Thus the Laing{Garrington e ect is explained as a consequence of orientation.

Liu & Pooley (1991) found that there is also a strong correlation between depolarization and lobe spectral index: the lobe with the atter spectrum is the less depolarized. Their original sample contained a majority of sources without detectable jets, but 33 of the 47 sources with strong jets in Tables 3 to 6 of G arrington et al. also obey the Liu {Pooley rule.

Taken together these two strong correlations in ply that the lobe spectrum is atter on the jet side of a source. A coording to the standard model of an extragalactic radio source the lobe material is almost static relative to the host galaxy and therefore any motion of the lobe material is inadequate to account for signi cant di erences between the lobe spectra as an orientation-related e ect. Thus the two correlations together constitute a prim a facie case against the standard model of D oppler-boosted' relativistic jets.

The most plausible defence is that intrinsic and orientation e ects both operate:

(i) The Laing-Garrington sample includes only sources with detected (and, in most cases, prom inent) jets. The majority are identi ed with quasars, which tend to have much

[?] jdt@ sintra.cc.fc.ul.pt

brighter jets than radio galaxies of the same total power. By contrast, the Liu-Pooley sample was not selected on jet em ission, and consists chie y of powerful radio galaxies. A coording to 'uni ed theories' of radio galaxies and quasars (Scheuer 1987; Barthel 1989), all of the sources form part of the same population, being classi ed as quasars if their jet axes are closer than 50 to the line of sight, otherwise as radio galaxies. Faraday rotation and depolarization increase with the amount of ionized gas and magnetic eld along the line of sight to the em itting region, and di erences between the two lobes will result either from orientation or from intrinsic asymmetries in the surrounding material. Differences between the path lengths to the two lobes will be much larger for the quasars, and we might expect orientation e ects to dom inate. For the radio galaxies, on the other hand, path-length di erences should be small, and intrinsic e ects will be relatively more im portant.

(ii) For radio galaxies without strong jets, the shorter lobe is also the more depolarized, but this e ect is barely signi cant in quasars (Laing 1993), despite the fact that the nearer lobe should appear longer as a result of di erential light-travel e ects (Ryle & Longair 1967). The shorter lobe in radio galaxies is also associated with brighter lineem itting gas (M cC arthy et al. 1991), and this cannot be an orientation e ect. W e therefore require an intrinsic m echanism which relates lobe length, spectral index and depolarization, and which dom inates in radio galaxies, together with an orientation-dependent m echanism which relates jet sidedness, spectral index and depolarization for quasars.

(iii) The most plausible explanation for a correlation between spectral index and jet sidedness is that the emission from a lobe might include signi cant contributions from the jet or an associated hotspot, both with atter spectra than the surrounding material (Garrington et al. 1991; Tribble 1992). It is widely believed that the ow velocity of hotspot material is a substantial (though ill-de ned) fraction of the speed of light (B landford et al. 1984; Bridle & Perley 1984) and therefore that signi cant D oppler beam ing should occur in hotspots.

If uni ed m odels are correct, then the intrinsic m echanism postulated for radio galaxies m ust also operate in quasars, in competition with orientation e ects. Evidently what is needed is the direct observation of the spectral indices of the lobes of radio sources with jets, with enough resolution to discrim inate clearly between lobe, jet and hotspot. In this paper we report detailed com parisons of the spectral index distributions in a sm all sample of quasars; a prelim inary account based on the sources analysed at that time was given at the M t. Strom lo sym posium of 1993 (B ridle et al. 1994b). (N ote, how ever, that F ig. 1 of that paper is incorrectly drawn: som e sources have jet and counter-jet side labels reversed.)

1.2 Previous work

G arrington et al. (1991) m apped 47 quasars with jets, at 1.4 and 5 G H z, and found that in 37 out of 47 the side of the source with the jet had the atter spectrum (see table 3 of that paper). These observations, then, show the direct correlation which challenges the standard m odel of D oppler-boosted' jets. How ever, as the authors them selves

state, the im ages do not have enough angular resolution to perm it further investigation of the causes of the correlation; in particular, in most cases they do not adequately resolve the hotspots from the relatively low-brightness lobes to allow the spectral index of the lobes to be measured reliably.

Barthel et al. (1988) and Lonsdale et al. (1993) m ade im ages of over 100 quasars, m any of which were observed at both 5 and 15 G H z and also have clearly detected jets. So far as we know, these have not been investigated from the point of view of the present paper, and it is not clear that these data will lend them selves to measuring the distribution of spectral index in low-brightness regions.

Lonsdale and Morison (1983) nd spectral asym metries in the hotspots of four powerful radio sources. In two of these sources jets have now been detected (3C 268.4 and 3C 249.1; the latter is also in our sam ple); in these sources the hotspot spectrum is atter on the jet side. In the other two sources the atter spectrum is found in the more com pact com ponent, which is preferentially found on the jet side (Laing 1989; Bridle et al. 1994a).

Throughout this paper, we de no the spectral index in the sense $\mbox{ ux density / frequency}$.

2 OBSERVATIONS

2.1 The sam ple

Because we wish to explore spectral index distributions, we are restricted to a sm all sam ple of sources which are bright enough to be m apped in detail. W e therefore started with the 12 guasars of which Bridle et al. (1994a, hereafter BHLBL) had already m ade detailed 5 G H z im ages, plus 3C 47 (Fernini et al. 1991) which satis es the same selection criteria and for which 5 GHz data of sim ilar quality were available. The BHLBL sam ple was a subset of the 19 brightest quasars with angular size greater than 10 arcsec in the 3CR catalogue, the only further selection being for reasons of scheduling. Of these 13 quasars, we selected those with prominent onesided jets and fairly standard appearance; thus we excluded 3C 68.1 (am biguous jet sidedness), 3C 215 (jets on both sides of the core, and 90 distortion between sm allest and largest scales) and 3C 9 (because there is little of the source that can be described unequivocally as 'lobe' rather than 'jet').

2.2 Observing program m e

In order to derive spectral-index m aps, we m ade new observations at 1.4 and 1.7 GHz with MERLIN and the National R adio A stronom y Observatory (NRAO) VLA, and extracted additional data from the VLA archive. The $1.4\{1.7 \text{ GHz observations}$ were designed to provide as m uch overlap as possible in uv coverage with the 5 GHz observations of BHLBL. M ost sources were just observed with the VLA in the A con-

guration, but 3C 208 and 3C 432 are only 14.6 and 14.8 arcsec in extent, respectively, so that even the VLA A array does not provide enough angular resolution; for these, MERLIN observations were obtained and combined with the VLA data. Observations of 3C 351 at 1417.5 MHz in A array poorly covered the uv plane, and undersam pled the large scale structure. For this reason the data were combined with

Table 1.0 bserving schedule

Source	0 bærving date	D uration	A rray	Frequency (MHz)
3C 47 3C 175 3C 204 3C 208	1992 D ec 7 1986 Jul 12 1992 O ct 31 1982 M ar 1 1981 Feb 24 1994 A ug 14	399m 36m 89m 18m 19m 14h	VLA-A VLA-B VLA-A VLA-A VLA-A MERLIN	1664.9, 1635.1 1652.4 1417.5, 1467.5 1417.5 1464.9 1420.0, 1658.8
3C 263 3C 249.1 3C 334 3C 336 3C 351	1992 O ct 31 1982 M ar 1 1992 O ct 31 1992 O ct 31 1982 M ar 11 1982 M ar 11 1982 M ay 30 1987 N ov 25 1987 D cc 2	89m 38m 138m 47m 12m 26m 23m 6m	VLA-A VLA-A VLA-A VLA-A VLA-A VLA-B VLA-B	1417.5, 1467.5 1417.5, 1467.5 1417.5, 1467.5 1417.5, 1467.5 1417.5 1417.5 1452.4,1502.4 1452.4,1502.4
3C 432	1992 N ov 1 1994 A ug 1	90m 14h	VLA-A MERLIN	1464.9, 1514.9 1420.0, 1658.8

B array observations. Table 1 shows a sum m ary of the low erfrequency observations.

The VLA data were reduced and calibrated using the NRAO A PS package. Initial editing and calibration of MER-LIN data was performed using the OLAF package at Jodrell Bank, before being transferred to A PS for self-calibration and in aging. Where possible only phase self-calibration was used. In a few cases with signi cant amplitude errors (for example when combining VLA and MERLIN data; see below) amplitude self-calibration was used with a long integration interval.

In order to maxim ise the uv coverage of the sparse MERLIN array, multi-frequency synthesis in aging was used (C onway et al. 1990). The data from the two frequencies were rst corrected in total ux for the spectral index of the source and then combined to form a single data set. The spectral index correction was calculated using the com pact com ponents from the 5 G H z and one of the 1.4 or 1.7 G H z in ages. The dom inant spectral errors will come from bright com pact com ponents (hotspots, core), yielding an error of

I 0 =200 near the hotspots, where I is the peak surface brightness and ⁰ is the residual spectral index, i.e. the difference between the spectral index assumed for the purposes of correction and the true spectral index of the com pact feature (Conway et al. 1990). The spectral errors will be below the level due to therm alnoise and dynam ic range lim itations if the residual spectral index of the com pact com ponent is < 0.15. The residual spectral index is less than 0.15 near the hotspots; and in both sources im aged by this m ethod, there is no lobe em ission near the core, where larger errors m ight occur. Our in ages are therefore limited by 'reconstruction errors', not spectral errors and thus we are con dent in using these in ages for the purposes of spectral index analysis. The MERLIN data were combined with the VLA data with weights proportional to the inverse expected rm s noises on a single integration point. The combined data were then further calibrated, including a few passes of am plitude selfcalibration.

Im ages at all frequencies were made using the APS

CLEAN algorithms APCLN and MX. All images were CLEANed to the noise level to ensure that all signi cant emission, especially in the low brightness regions, was restored with the same e ective resolution by CLEAN.

2.3 The 1.4 GHz im ages

The images are shown in Fig.1. The contours are those used to divide the sources up into zones for the spectral index comparisons (see below): the lowest solid contour is at 3 and the others are evenly spaced in log (surface brightness).

Table 2 shows the imaging parameters used and the total ux density in the images to the 3 contour on the 1.4/1.7 GHz im age. The single dish total ux densities used were the 1400, 2695 and 5000 M H z ux densities of Laing & Peacock (1980), interpolated to the observing frequency. OurL-band in age of 3C 334 apparently contains only 87 per cent of the single dish ux density, but the latter contains a contribution from another source of 114m Jy 4.4 arcm in from 3C 334 itself (as noted by BHLBL). Precisely how much that source contributed depends on details of how the single dish m easurements were analyzed to allow for nite size, but it seems likely that most of the ux of the confusing source was included. Our im age then contains 92 per cent of the corrected single-dish ux density. It is seen from Table 2 that we have a good representation of the total source ux density in all our other im ages. 3C 351 has been im aged at a lower resolution than the other sources in order to show the extended region of low surface brightness preceding the N hotspots as this region was poorly represented at higher resolution.

2.4 The com parison between 1.4 G H z and 5 G H z im ages

As stated in the Introduction, we wish to compare the spectra of the lobes on the jet and counterjet sides, taking care to distinguish between lobes, hotspots and jets. Nevertheless we begin by noting that, when we compare the entire contents of the lobes, as in G arrington et al.(1991), the correlation found by these authors also appears in our data. Table 3 shows that in 7 cases out of 10 the jet side has the atter spectrum, in two there is no signi cant di erence and in one the jet side has the steeper spectrum. Thus the spectra of our sam ple are not atypical.

As soon as we try to compare the spectra of lobes (excluding jets and hotspots) a fundam ental com plication becom es obvious: there is no such thing as 'the spectral index of the lobe'. The spectrum steepens progressively (though usually not very regularly) from the neighbourhood of the hotspot towards the middle of the source (a trend generally attributed to synchrotron losses). Som e schem e must be invented for comparing like with like on the two sides. One m ight consider com paring spectral indices at the sam e fractional distance from the core to the end of the lobe (or to the hotspot); that is not particularly satisfactory in practice as the lobes are often m orphologically very di erent, they m ay have protrusions and the hotspots are often recessed from the end of the lobe. The scheme we have adopted is to com pare regions with the sam e surface brightness. That brings certain complications with it (see e.g. Section 4.2) but other



F igure 1. The 1.4/1.7 G H z im ages of the sam ple. The contours are those used to divide the sources into surface brightness regions and the dotted lines enclose the core and jet regions excluded from the spectral index calculations

	Ғ₩ НМ	noise (Jy/bm)	1. contour factor	4/1.7 G H z total ux density (Jy)	% single dish ux density	noise (Jy/bm)	4.86 G H z total ux density (Jy)	% single dish ux density
3C 47	1.45 x 1.13	48	1.96	3.36	93	35	1,22	111
3C 175	1.30	151	2.01	2.53	105	38	0.67	100
3C 204	1.15	199	1.91	1.19	89	61	0.32	93
3C 208	0.35	250	1.92	2.16	104	25	0.56	102
3C 249.1	1.20	242	1.87	2.33	104	32	0.81	101
3C 263	1.10	197	2.20	3.15	103	57	1.11	105
3C 334	1.30	73	1.80	1.83	87	36	0.63	106
3C 336	1.25	187	2.00	2.63	99	38	0.82	115
3C 351	3.00	222	3.49	3.13	90	105	1.18	96
3C 432	0.37	234	1.76	1.46	104	19	0.37	114

Table 3. Total lobe spectral indices, determ ined from the ratio of ux densities inside the 3 contour on the 1.4/1.7 GHz im age and the identical region in the 5 GHz im age. Cores have been excluded.

Table 2. Im age param eters

Source	js	cjs
3C 47	0.85	0.94
3C 175	1.07	1.15
3C 204	1.14	1.19
3C 208	1.14	1.25
3C 249.1	0.86	0.96
3C 263	0.96	0.88
3C 334	0.99	1.00
3C 336	0.96	0.98
3C 351	0.78	0.88
3C 432	1.05	1.28

(js) refers to jet side; (cjs) to counter-jet side.

schem es that we considered were much less satisfactory, and the adopted schem e at least has the merit of leading to an interesting result (Section 3). The analysis therefore proceeds as follow s:

(i) M ake 5 G H z and 1.4/1.7 G H z in ages at the sam e angular resolution, using as near as possible the sam e uv coverage; the authors of BHLBL kindly m ade the calibrated 5 G H z visibilities available. C orrect the im ages for any zerolevel o sets using estimates of the m ean o -source level.

(ii) Cut out the region of the jet and the core; the excluded regions are indicated in Fig.1.

(iii) Subdivide the resulting in ages into regions within fairly narrow ranges of surface brightness at 1.4 or 1.7 G H z. The ranges of surface brightness were chosen as follows: the low est contour was set at three times the m s noise level on the 1.4 or 1.7 G H z in age, and the in age was divided into logarithm ically equally spaced contours. Each source was divided into about 10 zones; the precise number depends on the dynam ic range and was chosen so that each zone contains a su ciently large number of beam s to ensure that the spectral error introduced by the therm al noise is small, and so that the zone is generally wider than a beam . The



F igure 2. Subdivision of $3C\,175$ into surface brightness zones. The contours are spaced as for the spectral index calculations on the 1.4 GHz im age and the grey scale represents the spectral index between 1.4 and 5.0 GHz. The dotted line again shows the excluded jet and core region. Contours : -.465, .465, .931, 1.865, 7.479, 14.96, 30.00, 60.08, 120.3, 241.0 m Jy/beam .G rey scale: 0.6 (w hite) { 2.5 (black)

contours shown in Fig.1 are the contours dividing the zones. Fig.2 shows the same contours for 3C175, but with a grey scale of spectral index superposed. This demonstrates that surface brightness and spectral index are roughly correlated.

(iv) C om pute the spectral index for each surface brightness range on each side of the source from the ratio of the total ux densities in that surface brightness range at 5 G H z and 1.4/1.7 G H z. Every e ortwasmade to remove any small zero-level o sets from the images but note that the di erences between the spectra on the two sides of a source, at the same surface brightness, are in any case insensitive to such errors, and are una ected by inaccuracies in the ux scale.



F igure 3. P lots of 1.4/1.7 to 5.0 G H z spectral index versus surface brightness for the jet and the counter-jet side of each source in the sam ple. C ounter-jet side: dotted lines. Jet side: continuous lines.

3 RESULTS

Fig. 3 shows the spectral indices for both sides of each source plotted against surface brightness. In each diagram the length of a horizontal line shows the range of surface brightness spanned by the zone. The vertical lines indicate the form al errors due to the noise levels in the im ages at both frequencies.

The system atic errors in spectral index are less well determ ined. Sm all errors in the reconstruction algorithm s were investigated by making in ages by a maximum entropy'algorithm (VTESS), or by using di errent parameters in the CLEAN algorithms. These tests typically indicated an uncertainty comparable to the errors due to the noise in the regions of highest surface brightness, increasing to 0:1 0:3 in the region of lowest surface brightness. In all cases how – ever, the e ect was, as expected, the same for both the jet side and counter-jet side, thus not a ecting our conclusions.

W ith the single exception of 3C 263, the plots show that the high surface brightness regions have atter spectra on the jet side. The spectral di erences in the low-brightness regions show no obvious pattern in these plots alone, but we noticed that 3C 263, the one source which breaks the rule at high surface brightness, is strikingly asymmetric. This led to the discovery that the spectral index di erence in the low brightness regions correlates strongly with the length of the lobe: the longer lobe has the atter spectrum . The extent to which our data support these assertions is illustrated in Fig. 4. In this gure the lobe length ratio has been calculated using the distance from the core to the furthest 3 contour. (U sing the de nition of distance from the core, through the hotspot to the furthest 3 contour 3C 249.1 has a ratio of jet-side to counterjet-side lengths of 0.6, but the gures for all other sources are only slightly changed, and no other sources show a change in the sense of the asymmetry.)

Fig. 4a shows that for all sources, except 3C 263, the jet side spectra in the highest surface brightness regions of the source are consistently atter than their counterparts on the counter-jet side (i.e. they fall below the dotted line). As some of the sources have a substantial peak brightness asymmetry the highest bins are often found only on one side. To create properly paired highest bins we adopted the following procedure: on both sides we summed all the ux above the lower surface brightness bound of the top bin on the side with the lower peak surface brightness. As can be seen from inspection of Fig. 3, because of the magnitude of the di erences, other sensible ways of pairing the bins would have left the conclusions unchanged. 3C 351 has a large peak surface brightness asymmetry, and only four paired surface brightness bins. For this source we have included only the two highest surface brightness bins in Fig. 4.

Fig. 4b shows a strong dependence of the spectral asym m etry in low-brightness regions, not on jet side, but on length of lobe. This is evident from the fact that nearly all the points lie in the second and fourth quadrants of the diagram. Thus when the jet side is longer (right of dotted line), the jet side has a atter spectrum (below dotted line), but when it is shorter it has a steeper spectrum. The atter spectrum is found on the longer side in all sources except 3C 47.

The probability that at least 9 out of 10 sources have atter spectra on the jet side by pure chance is 1%. (For



F igure 4. The spectral indices of low and high surface brightness regions related to jet side and lobe length. F igs. 4a and 4b show spectral index di erences between the jet and counter-jet lobes of each source for the highest and low est three surface brightness bins, respectively. The spectral indices of the jet and counter-jet lobes are j and cj, respectively, and their lengths are L_j and L_{cj} .

a two-tailed distribution, i.e. either 9/10 or 1/10, the probability is 2%.) The form all statistical signing cance is not great, but we note that in the one exception, 3C 263, the jetted lobe is very much shorter than the unjetted lobe, so the factors related to lobe length m ay well dominate in this source. If we exclude 3C 263, the probability for 9/9 sources is 0.2% (0.4% 2-tailed). The probability that 8 out of 9 sources follow the lobe-length relation of Figure 4 (b) by pure chance is 2% (4% 2-tailed). These probabilities follow directly from the binom ial distribution.

For completeness, we also note that the Laing-Garrington e ect for our sample is found in 7/10 of our sources: the exceptions are two sources showing very little asym m etry (3C 263 and 3C 249.1) and one (3C 204) apparently showing the reverse e ect (although the source is almost completely depolarized by 1.5 G H z so m easurem ent of the asym m etry is di cult).

8 J.Dennett-Thorpe et al.

4 IN TERPRETATION

In this section we discuss various attem pts to explain the two correlations presented in the previous section, and elim inate as m any as we can.

4.1 Jet side and in bright regions

The hotspot on the approaching (jet) side m ay m ake a larger contribution to the spectral index of the high-brightness regions than its counterpart in the receding lobe as a result of D oppler beam ing (e.g. Tribble 1992); this is perhaps the simplest model for a sytematically atter spectrum on the jet side. However, the simplest models of this type fail to explain the present observations, in which regions of the sam e surface brightness were com pared. (This applies to all models based on di erent ratios of at-and steep-spectrum power-law components, regardless of how di erence in ratio is achieved.) Consider a model with a steep spectrum background of uniform surface brightness on which are superposed at-spectrum hot-spots of di erent intensities (and shapes) on the two sides: points with the sam e suface brightness will then have the sam e spectrum . (This is true regardless of angular resolution.) C ertain m ore com plicated m odels m ay produce the desired e ect; for exam ple, a background symmetric about the nucleus, peaking under similar-sized hot-spots, would produce a atter spectrum at the brighter hot-spot when com paring regions of equal surface brightness. However, modifying the symmetry and shape of the background distribution, or the relative sizes of the hotspot will not generally give the sam e result.

A nother way to obtain a spectral index asym m etry in a relativistically-expanding source would be to postulate that the intrinsic spectrum is curved and that the asymmetry is produced by the Doppler shift. If the spectral index increases with frequency, and the approaching lobe is seen at a signi cantly lower em itted frequency, an asymmetry of the right sense could be produced. This mechanism could operate in smaller regions with signi cant ow velocities such as hotspots. A calculation using theoretical 'single burst' spectra with injection spectral index of 0.5 shows that a velocity of 0:3c at 30 to the line of sight (and correspondingly sm aller speeds at sm aller angles) is enough to cause the observed e ect, if the relativistic component dom inates the hotspot spectrum , and the curvature is due to synchroton ageing of an initial power-law electron population. The less curved 'continuous in jection' spectra require som ew hat higher speeds to explain the correlation. Observational evidence for curved hotspot spectra at high resolution com es from Cygnus A (Carilli et al. 1991), but adequate resolution over a large frequency range is available for few other sources (M eisenheim er et al. 1989), and in particular for none of our sam ple.

We have tested the hypothesis that the spectral dierences between high-brightness regions are due to high ow velocities in the hotspots in two ways, as follows:

(i) Table 4 lists the ux densities of the hotspots in our sample.Wepresent two sets of hotspot ux densities, that of BHLBL (obtained by a well-de ned, though arbitrary set of rules de ning a hotspot) and our own estimates (for which the hotspots were chosen subjectively). In most cases our estimate of total hotspot ux density is close to that of

Table 4.5GHz	ux densities	s of hotspots i	n m Jy.
--------------	--------------	-----------------	---------

Source	S_j^{tot}	Stot	S_j^{tot}	S_{cj}^{tot}	S_j^{peak}	S_{cj}^{peak}
BHLBL				oure	estim ates	
3C 47	268	-	257	-	198	25
3C 175	64	152	62	138	25	65
3C 204	61	42	60	40	43	30
3C 208	28	203	36	198	21	139
3C 249.1	86	188	80	120	48	18
3C 263	528	21	500	23	330	13
3C 334	20	-	18	-	6	3
3C 336	95	254	95	280	50	40
3C 351	201	-	202	5	156	1
3C 432	105	6	103	280	73	34

BHLBL, but in a few cases there is obvious disagreem ent, as on the counter-jet side of 3C 432 where di erent features have been chosen in the two cases. In the majority of the sources there is a good case for asserting that the jet-side hotspot is the brighter of the two, but there are striking exceptions | 3C 175, 3C 208, 3C 336 | whichever set of hotspot criteria is used. In such sources the atter spectrum on the jet side obviously cannot be blam ed on a greater at spectrum contribution from the hotspot. Thus, although relativistic ux{boosting of a at{spectrum hotspot in a steeper spec-

trum lobe could potentially account for the e ect, it clearly cannot do so in all cases. The inclusion of two sets of ux density estimates emphasizes that these conclusions are robust and insensitive to details of hotspot de nitions.

(ii) The two e ects of high ow velocity (the D oppler effect shifting a curved spectrum in frequency and the relativistic ux-boosting of the approaching ow) may be thought of as increasing the proportion of at-spectrum component in the jet-side hotspot. Even if the fast ow is con ned to the hotspot, it m ight be suspected that, at the resolution used for the spectrul-index analysis, beam sm earing could spread a atter spectrum from the hotspot to adjacent regions of som ewhat low er surface brightness.

To test the possibility that the e ect is solely due to a single com pact hotspot, we used the three sources in which the spectral index di erence j cj reverses between high-and low-surface-brightness regions (3C 204, 3C 334 and 3C 336). If the above suspicion were well-founded, arti cial spectral steepening of the jet-side hotspot spectrum alone should rem ove the correlation between jet side and at spectrum . The jet-side hotspot was modelled using the 2D Gaussian to the high resolution in age of the hotspot at 5 G H z m ade by BHLBL.This tted hotspot was convolved down to the resolution of our spectral analysis. This model was then used to remove 5 G H z ux progressively from the site of the high resolution t to the hotspot. Even when the amount of ux subtracted from the hotspot was large enough to produce a spectrum of the com pact com ponent which was steeper than that on the counter-jet side, there still rem ained a region of interm ediate brightness which was largely una ected by the changes to the hotspot, and which retained its atter spectrum .Fig. 5 shows the results for a typical source (3C 334). Thus it is clear that \contam ination" of the interm ediate surface brightness regions by an insu ciently resolved at



F igure 5. The e ects of removing a at spectrum component from the jet-side hotspot in 3C 334. The symbols indicate results after subtraction of 5 G H z ux. H orizontal binning bars are om itted for clarity; the ux subtracted is indicated in m Jy in the legend. As progressively more ux is subtracted from the jet side hotspot, its spectrum necessarily becomes progressively steeper, but the intermediate surface brightness regions on the jet side still have atter spectra.

spectrum hotspot is not enough on its own to account for the observations.

W e conclude that, if relativistic motion is responsible for the spectral index asymmetry, then the fast forward ow is not conned to a single compact hotspot. W hat regions, then, might take part in this forward motion? It is well known that many sources have double or even multiple hotspots (3C 351 is a striking example, and in the present sample 3C 175, 3C 334, 3C 336 and 3C 432 show double hotspots at higher resolution), but that by itself does not explain why there should be fast forward motion in both. One possibility is that the point of impact of the jet on the shocked intergalactic medium is recessed (i.e. not at the extreme end of the lobe) and fast ow continues beyond the initial hotspot, as the images of 3C 204, 3C 334 and 3C 336 might indicate (Fig. 1). Inspection of the spectral index image for 3C 334 shows that a ridge with relatively

at spectrum indeed extends along the ridge of high surface brightness beyond the hotspot (Fig. 6b). At higher resolution (BHLBL), the hotspot of 3C 336 (single in our im ages) divides into two compact bright features. These coincide with two atter-spectrum regions in Fig. 6c. 3C 208 also has a recessed hotspot on the jet side, but in that case the attest spectra occur on the hotspot and on a region extending northward from it (Fig. 6a), at about the same distance from the quasar. This suggests that the jet has split before reaching the hotspot, or perhaps that one of the at-spectrum regions represents an earlier hotspot, now detached from the jet but still being fed with high-speed material, as in the num erical simulations of Cox, Gull & Scheuer (1991). It is also possible that projection e ects have transform ed a gentle bend in the ow into a sharp (> 90) change of direction, but that would im ply a very sm all angle of source axis to line of sight, and a correspondingly large true aspect ratio for the source. Like 3C 334 and 3C 336, 3C 47 and 3C 175 show relatively at spectra along high surface bright-



a.

b.

c.

F igure 6.D etail of jet side lobes of 3C 208, 3C 334 and 3C 336. G rey scale representations of spectral index are superposed on total intensity contours.

ness ridges extending out of the jet-side hotspots, but in these sources the ow seems to turn through a (projected) right angle at the hotspot. Perhaps these ows have more in common with what is going on in 3C 208 than with ows in 3C 334 and 3C 336.

Num erical simulations of radio em ission from hotspots generated by relativistic jets have so far been restricted to the axisym metric case. K om issarov & Falle (1996) nd that the brightness distribution of the approaching hotspot is dom inated by the conical term ination shock, whilst the em ission from the receding hotspot com es mainly from the high-pressure part of the back ow, and is therefore limbbrightened. High-resolution non-relativistic simulations of N orm an (1996), suggest that there is a region of supersonic turbulence near the leading edge of the source (extending $4\{5 \text{ lobe radii in these simulations})$ in which the jet is violently de ected. The jet can therefore im pinge obliquely on the contact discontinuity to produce a de ected or wall jet (W illiam s & Gull 1985; W ilson 1989; C ox, Gull & Scheuer 1991; Norm an & Balsara 1992). These de ected ows are morphologically very similar to the at-spectrum features observed in sources such as 3C 334. A key feature of these simulations, from our point of view, is that they lead to oblique shocks and therefore to relatively large forward velocities, so that signi cant beam ing can occur over much of the post-shock ow, especially when the hotspot is recessed.

The simulations also indicate that the observations of the approaching and receding hotspots may well be dom inated by di erent parts of the ow, and might then have di erent spectra. Observationally, the more di use appearance of the counterjet-side hotspots also supports this idea.

4.2 The length of the lobe and in lower brightness regions

The expansion velocities of the low-brightness regions are unlikely to exceed a few percent of c (Scheuer 1995), so it is di cult to see how beam ing e ects could account for largescale spectral asym metries, even if the intrinsic spectra are curved. Two obvious possible causes of the correlation of the continuum radio spectra with the size of the radio lobe are synchrotron loss and adiabatic expansion. We consider these in turn below.

(i) Synchrotron losses

O ther things being equal, the break frequency due to synchrotron loss varies as B³ (B = m agnetic ux density). The equipartition estimate of B varies as (linear size)⁶⁼⁷, for given radio power. If, on the other hand, the m agnetic

eld in the larger lobe is sim ply a hom ologously expanded copy of that in the sm aller lobe, then B / (linear size)². In either case, the break frequency depends sensitively on linear size, and this dependence would produce a higher break frequency (and hence a atter spectrum over a xed frequency interval) in the larger lobe, i.e. a correlation in the sense that is observed. The theoretical predictions are m ore com plicated if we com pare regions of equal surface brightness in the two lobes, but in essence the result remains the same.

B lundell and A lexander (1994) pursued this line of argument to explain the correlation between jet side and atter spectrum. They argued that the near (jet) side is observed at a later stage of development (owing to light travel time e ects), and is therefore the larger. W hile we cannot accept that part of their hypothesis, because the longer lobe is on the counter-jet side in 5 of our 10 sources, the strong dependence of synchrotron loss on linear size remains a plausible explanation for spectral asymmetries in low-brightness regions.

(ii) A diabatic losses.

The observation of spectral index gradients in the lobes indicates that individual regions have spectra steepening with frequency, possibly because of synchrotron losses (this need not con ict with a fairly straight spectrum for the whole source as many sources are dominated by radiation from hotspots where very little synchrotron loss has occurred at frequencies less than 10 GHz). We now ask how di erent am ounts of expansion in the two lobes, acting on these curved spectra, might a ect the di erences between their observed spectral indices.

To isolate the e ects of expansion, consider a simple

m odel: two lobes were identical initially; then one expanded adiabatically by a linear factor R which is a little greater than 1. The magnetic eld in the larger lobe becomes R² of the eld in the corresponding bit of the smaller lobe, and the electron energy distribution is shifted downwards (electron energy / R¹), with the result that the entire spectrum is shifted downwards in frequency by a factor R⁴. Thus we should expect the larger lobe to have a spectrum that is steeper over the same frequency range. This is the reverse of the correlation observed in Fig. 4. C loser consideration (below) m odi es that conclusion, for we m ust rem ember that we com pare regions of equal surface brightness on the two sides.

Suppose that a certain region of the smaller lobe has spectral index and surface brightness S = .The corresponding region in the larger lobe has spectral index

$$^{0} = + 4 \log R \frac{d}{d (\log)}$$

and surface brightness given by

 $\log (S =)^0 = \log (S =) 4 (1 +) \log R$:

Therefore a region of surface brightness $S=\$, in the larger lobe, is expected to have spectral index

$${}^{00} = {}^{0} + 4(1 +) \log R \frac{d}{d(\log S =)}$$
$$= + 4 \log R \frac{d}{d(\log)} + (1 +) \frac{d}{d(\log S =)}$$
(1)

The last term is negative: brighter patches of source have atter spectra. Thus we expect the larger lobe to have a atter spectrum for regions of equal surface brightness if

$$(1 +) \frac{d}{d (\log S =)} > \frac{d}{d (\log)}$$

If we assume that the spectral gradient along the source is due to synchrotron losses we can evaluate the importance of adiabatic loss as an explanation for the observed correlation. We can calculate $\frac{d}{d(\log g)}$ as a function of from the synchrotron spectrum of a given theoretical electron energy distribution. The results are shown in Fig. 7, which shows the results for two values of in jection index for the case of a sharp energy cut-o. A nother energy distribution of interest, that with no pitch (angle scattering of the electrons (K ardashev 1962), follows the above case closely, until approaches $\frac{4}{3}$ in jection + 1, which is the maximum spectral index possible in this model, so that $\frac{d}{d(\log g)}$! 0: $\frac{d}{d(\log g = g)}$ has to be estim ated directly from our observations, as it involves the whole histories of synchrotron losses in di erent parts of the source.

The results are illustrated in Fig. 7.0 ne point is plotted for each source. The value of is taken as the mean of the three lowest surface brightness bins in the larger lobe. Errors in are taken as the di erence between the maximum and mean values of in the lowest three bins.

The points need to fall above the line for adiabatic expansion to explain the observed correlation. It can be seen that this is indeed the case for most of the sources and two reasonable models of $\frac{d}{d(\log q)}$. We conclude that adiabatic expansion may contribute to the observed correlation.

It seems desirable to check the prediction that the larger



Figure 7. Calculated values of $\frac{d}{d(\log j)}$ and observed values of $(+ 1)j - \log(S =)j$ plotted on the same scale. The lines are $\frac{d}{d(\log j)}$ calculated for energy spectra with a sharp energy cut{o, and injection spectral indices of 0.5 (dotted line) and 0.75 (solid line). One observed point, from the longer lobe, is plotted for each source.

lobe as a whole has the steeper spectrum, but it is not clear how to do so. The di culty is to identify which material is potentially a ected by orientation-dependent e ects. We have shown that such e ects are not restricted to easilyidenti able regions such as hot-spots, and therefore that setting an intensity threshold will not unam biguously separate them.

5 CONCLUSIONS

In a sample often high-powered radio quasars we have found the following correlations:

(i) In regions of high surface brightness the radio spectrum is atter on the jet side (9/10)

(ii) In regions of low surface brightness the radio spectrum is atter on the long side (8/9)

If jet sidedness is a manifestation of relativistic ow, as is commonly believed, then the strong correlation (9/10 sources) found here between the spectral index of the hotspot and the jet side indicates that the spectral di erence between the two sides is also a relativistic e ect. W e have also demonstrated that the correlation of atter spectrum with jet side is not con ned to the hotspot. N evertheless, the correlation is presum ably an orientation-dependent phenom enon, and we conclude that forward motion at a signi cant fraction of c also occurs in regions less conspicuous than that norm ally selected as 'the hotspot'.

We have argued that the observed correlation cannot result from a at-spectrum component whose contribution to the hotspot is enhanced by forward beam ing. D oppler frequency shifting of a curved hotspot spectrum m ight be able to explain the correlation. This would require ow speeds in excess of 0.3c. A further possibility is that we are view ing di erent physical parts of the ow on the two sides as a result of D oppler enhancem ent and suppression of the post-shock ow. The correlation of lobe length and radio spectrum has yet to be fully understood. One sim ple explanation is that it is due to di erences in synchrotron losses in lobes of di erent volum es. E xpansion losses m ay also play a role. The spectral asym m etry in the low surface brightness regions can be interpreted as an environm ental e ect due to the surrounding am bient gas containing the lobes. In this context, we note that the one source (3C 263) which disobeys the high surface brightness correlation also shows surprisingly little depolarization asym m etry. This and the fact that the jet side is on ly

half the length of the counter-jet side indicates that the source may be con ned by a denser medium on the jet side. In this case it may be that environmental elects produce the spectral-index and depolarization behaviour. Hall et al. (1995) indeed not evidence for an X {ray em itting clum p associated with the short lobe of this source.

A similar study of a sample of nearby radio galaxies (in which environmental e ects are expected to dominate) is now under way.

ACKNOW LEDGEMENTS

JDT, RAL and PAGS would like to thank the NRAO for hospitality. JDT thanks the British taxpayers for their assistance in the form of a PPARC studentship. The NRAO is a facility of the National Science Foundation, operated under cooperative agreement by Associated Universities, Inc. MERLIN is a national facility operated by the University of Manchester on behalf of PPARC.

REFERENCES

- BarthelP D ., 1989, ApJ, 336, 606
- Barthel PD., Miley GK., Schilizzi R.T., Lonsdale C., 1988, A&AS, 73, 515
- Blandford M C., Begelm an R D., Rees M. J., 1984, Rev. M od. Phys., 56, 255
- Blundell K . M ., A lexander P ., 1994, M N R A S, 267, 241
- Bridle A.H., Perley R.A., 1984, ARA & A, 22, 319
- Bridle A H., Hough D H., Lonsdale C J., Burns JO., Laing R A., 1994a, AJ, 108, 766 (BHLBL)
- Bridle A. H., Laing R. A., Scheuer P. A. G., Tumer S., 1994b, in Bicknell G. V., Dopita M. A., Quinn P.J., eds., The First Strom lo Symposium: The Physics of Active Galaxies, A SP conference series Vol. 54, Astr. Soc. Paci c, San Francisco, p. 187
- CarilliC.L., Perley R.A., Dreher J.W., Leahy J.P., 1991, ApJ, 383, 554
- Conway JE., ComwellT J., W ilkinson PN., 1990, MNRAS, 246, 490
- Cox C.I., GullSF., Scheuer PAG., 1991, MNRAS, 252, 558
- Fanaro B.L., Riley J.M., 1974, MNRAS, 167, 31P
- Femini I., Leahy J.P.Bums J.O., Basart J.P., 1991, ApJ, 381, 63
- G arrington S.T., Leahy J.P., Conway R.G., Laing R.A., 1988. Nat, 331, 147
- Garrington S.T., Conway R.G., 1991, MNRAS, 250, 198
- Garrington S.T., Conway R.G., Leahy J.P. 1991, MNRAS, 250, 171
- Hall P B , E llingson E , G reen R F , Yee H K C , 1995, A J, 110, 513
- Kardashev N.S., 1962, Ast. Zh., 39, 393
- Kom issarov S.S., Falle S.A.E.G., 1996, in Hardee, P.E., Bridle,

A H. & Zensus, JA., eds., Energy Transport in Radio Galaxies and Quasars, ASP conference series Vol. 100, Astr. Soc. Paci c, San Francisco, p. 327

- Laing R.A., 1988, Nat, 331, 149
- Laing R.A., Peacock J.A., 1980, MNRAS, 190, 903
- Laing R.A., 1989, in Meisenheimer K. & Roser H.-J. eds., Hot-Spots in Extragalactic Radio Sources, Lecture Notes on Physics 327, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, p.95
- Laing R A ,1993, in Burgarella, D ,Livio, M .& O'D ea, C P ,eds., A strophysical Jets, Space Telescope Science Institute Sym posium Series 6, C am bridge U niversity P ress, C am bridge, p.95

Liu R., Pooley G.G., 1991, MNRAS, 249, 343

- Lonsdale C.J., Morison I., 1983, MNRAS, 203, 833
- Lonsdale C., Barthel P.D., Miley G.K., 1993, A&AS, 105, 91
- M cCarthy P.J., van Breugel W J.M., Kapahi V.K., 1991, A.p.J, 371, 478
- M eisenheim er K ., Roser H .-J., H iltner P R ., Yates M G ., Longair M S., Chini R ., Perley R A ., 1989, A & A , 219, 63
- Norm an M.L., 1996, in Hardee, P.E., Bridle, A.H. & Zensus, J.A., eds., Energy Transport in Radio Galaxies and Quasars, ASP conference series Vol. 100, Astr. Soc. Pacic, San Francisco, p. 319
- Norm an M.L., Balsara D.S., 1992, in Roser H.-J.& Meisenheimer K., eds., Jets in Extragalactic Radio Sources, Lecture Notes on Physics 421, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, p. 229
- Ryle M, Longair M., 1967, MNRAS, 123, 436
- Scheuer P A G , 1987, in Zensus, J A . & Pearson, T J.eds., Superlum inalR adio Sources, C am bridge U niversity P ress, C am bridge, p.104
- Scheuer P A .G ., 1995, M N R A S, 277, 331
- Tribble P., 1992, MNRAS, 256, 281
- W illiam s, A.G., Gull, S.F., 1985, Nat, 313, 34
- W ilson M J., 1989, in Meisenheimer K. & Roser H.-J. eds., Hot-Spots in Extragalactic Radio Sources, Lecture Notes on Physics 327, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, p. 215