

Kolmogorov widths of the class W_1^1

Yuri Malykhin

February 11, 2025

Abstract

We prove that $d_n(W_1^1, L_q) \asymp n^{-1/2} \log n$, $2 < q < \infty$. This completes the study of orders of decay of Kolmogorov widths for the classical case of the univariate Sobolev classes of integer smoothness.

Introduction. Recall that the Kolmogorov n -width of a set K in a normed space X is defined as the error of the best approximation of K by n -dimensional subspaces in X :

$$d_n(K, X) := \inf_{\substack{Q_n \subset X \\ \dim Q_n \leq n}} \sup_{x \in K} \inf_{y \in Q_n} \|x - y\|_X.$$

This notion was introduced by Kolmogorov in [Kol36]. He considered the Sobolev class W_2^r on the segment $[0, 1]$ and expressed $d_n(W_2^r, L_2)$ in terms of the spectrum of an appropriate differential operator.

The orders of the decay for the widths $d_n(W_p^r[0, 1], L_q[0, 1])$ were studied in 1960s and 1970s (Kolmogorov, Stechkin, Tikhomirov, Ismagilov, Kashin, Gluskin, and others — see Chs.13,14 in [LGM]). The major breakthrough in this problem was made by Kashin [Kas77] who settled the case $q > \max\{2, p\}$; this paper also contains historical references. So, sharp order estimates were obtained for almost all of the parameters $r \in \mathbb{N}$, $1 \leq p, q \leq \infty$.

Only the following case was left open: $r = p = 1$, $2 < q < \infty$. The class $W_1^1 := W_1^1[0, 1]$ consists of absolutely continuous functions f such that $\int_0^1 |f'(x)| dx \leq 1$. Kulanin [Kul83] proved the following bounds:

$$n^{-1/2} \log^{1/2-\varepsilon} n \lesssim d_n(W_1^1, L_q) \lesssim n^{-1/2} \log n, \quad (1)$$

for any fixed $\varepsilon > 0$ ($A \lesssim B$ means $A = O(B)$; we write $A \asymp B$ if $A \lesssim B$ and $A \gtrsim B$); hence, the order of the width contains a logarithmic term. Belinsky [Bel84] proved that the upper bound is sharp if we consider only subspaces generated by n arbitrary harmonics: $d_n^T(W_1^1, L_q) \asymp n^{-1/2} \log n$.

Later, in [KMR18] the ε in (1) was removed, but the logarithmic gap remained. The author studied the closely related case of Besov classes $B_{1,\theta}^1$ and obtained sharp estimates for their widths [Mal21]. Unfortunately, this result did not give better bounds for W_1^1 . In this paper we finally remove the logarithmic gap.

Theorem. *For any $q \in (2, \infty)$ there exist quantities $c_1(q), c_2(q) > 0$, such that for all $n \geq 2$ the inequality holds*

$$c_1(q)n^{-1/2} \log n \leq d_n(W_1^1[0, 1], L_q[0, 1]) \leq c_2(q)n^{-1/2} \log n.$$

In the proof we use standard dyadic decomposition (4), (5) as in [Kul83]. The drawback of his method was that all dyadic levels were considered independently. Here we control them simultaneously, using the specially tailored duality and averaging (7), (8), (11) in a similar vein as Gluskin [Gls81]. See also recent papers [Mal24, MR25] on the average widths.

Consider the “step” functions χ_t that are defined as $\chi_t(x) := 1, 0 \leq x < t$ and $\chi_t(x) := -1, t \leq x \leq 1$.

Lemma. *Let $q \in (2, \infty)$, $\gamma > 1/q$. There exists $\delta = \delta(q, \gamma) > 0$, such that for any sufficiently large n and any family of functions $\{\eta_t(\cdot)\}_{0 \leq t \leq 1}$ that lie in some n -dimensional subspace of $L_q[0, 1]$, at least one of the following inequalities holds:*

$$\left(\int_0^1 \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_2}^2 dt \right)^{1/2} \geq \delta n^{-1/2} \log n, \quad (2)$$

$$\left(\int_0^1 \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_q}^q dt \right)^{1/q} \geq n^{-\gamma}. \quad (3)$$

Now the proof of Theorem is almost immediate.

Proof. The upper bound is well-known, see [Kul83]. Let us prove the lower bound. Fix any $\gamma \in (1/q, 1/2)$ and obtain the corresponding δ from Lemma. Suppose that $d_n(W_1^1, L_q) < (\delta/2)n^{-1/2} \log n$. Functions χ_t lie in the closure (in L_q) of $2W_1^1$; therefore, there exists a subspace Q_n and functions $\eta_t \in Q_n$,

such that $\sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_q} < \delta n^{-1/2} \log n$. Then (2) is clearly violated and hence

$$\sup_t \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_q} \geq \left(\int_0^1 \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_q}^q dt \right)^{1/q} \geq n^{-\gamma}.$$

This contradicts our assumption for large n (since $\gamma < 1/2$) and establishes the lower bound on the width. \square

Proof of Lemma. Suppose that (2) is violated (we will choose δ later), let us prove (3). Denote by $c_{k,j}(f)$ the coefficients of the expansion of the function f in the L_∞ -normalized Haar system $\{h_{k,j}\}$:

$$c_{k,j}(f) := 2^k \int_0^1 f(x) h_{k,j}(x) dx = 2^k \left(\int_{\frac{j-1}{2^k}}^{\frac{j-1/2}{2^k}} f(x) dx - \int_{\frac{j-1/2}{2^k}}^{\frac{j}{2^k}} f(x) dx \right). \quad (4)$$

Let $P_k f := \sum_{j=1}^{2^k} c_{k,j}(f) h_{k,j}$ be the k -th dyadic pack of the Fourier–Haar series of f .

Fix some numbers $k_0 < k_1$ (see (9)) and consider the vector space

$$\mathcal{T} := \{x = (x_{k,j}) : k_0 \leq k \leq k_1, j = 1, \dots, 2^k\}$$

with weights $w(k, j) = 2^{-k}$. In this weighted space the scalar product and the ℓ_p -norms are defined:

$$\langle x, y \rangle_w := \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} 2^{-k} \sum_{j=1}^{2^k} x_{k,j} y_{k,j}, \quad \|x\|_{p,w} := \left(\sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} 2^{-k} \sum_{j=1}^{2^k} |x_{k,j}|^p \right)^{1/p}.$$

We will use that $\langle x, y \rangle_w \leq \|x\|_{p,w} \|y\|_{p',w}$.

Well-known Marcinkiewicz–Paley theorem gives (note that $q > 2$):

$$\begin{aligned} \|f\|_{L_q}^q &\asymp \left\| \left(\int_0^1 f(x) dx \right)^2 + \sum_{k \geq 0} P_k^2 f \right\|_{L_q}^{1/2} \Big\|_{L_q}^q \geq \sum_{k \geq 0} \|P_k f\|_{L_q}^q \geq \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} \|P_k f\|_{L_q}^q, \\ \|f\|_{L_q}^q &\gtrsim \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} 2^{-k} \sum_{j=1}^{2^k} |c_{k,j}(f)|^q = \|c_{k,j}(f)\|_{q,w}^q. \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

We also use the simple inequality

$$\|f\|_{L_2}^2 \geq \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} \|P_k f\|_{L_2}^2 = \|c_{k,j}(f)\|_{2,w}^2. \quad (6)$$

Define

$$X_{k,j}(t) := c_{k,j}(\chi_t), \quad H_{k,j}(t) := c_{k,j}(\eta_t).$$

We shall consider X, H as the collection of functions of a variable $t \in [0, 1]$ and at the same time as the parametrized family of vectors $X(t), H(t) \in \mathcal{T}$. It is rather obvious that $X_{0,1}(t) = 1 - |2t - 1|$; other functions are also piecewise-linear and may be expressed as $X_{k,j}(t) = X_{0,1}(2^k t - (j - 1))$ for $t \in [(j - 1)2^{-k}, j2^{-k}]$ and $X_{k,j}(t) = 0$ outside this interval.

Vectors $H(t)$ lie in some n -dimensional subspace $V_n \subset \mathcal{T}$ for all t , because η_t lie in a n -dimensional subspace and the map $f \mapsto (c_{k,j}(f))$ is linear.

Let $Z_{k,j}(t)$ be some functions. One can use the duality and the Holder inequality and obtain:

$$\begin{aligned} \int_0^1 \langle X(t) - H(t), Z(t) \rangle_w dt &\leq \int_0^1 \|X(t) - H(t)\|_{q,w} \cdot \|Z(t)\|_{q',w} dt \leq \\ &\leq \left(\int_0^1 \|X(t) - H(t)\|_{q,w}^q dt \right)^{1/q} \left(\int_0^1 \|Z(t)\|_{q',w}^{q'} dt \right)^{1/q'}. \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

Therefore, using (5), we have

$$\left(\int_0^1 \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_q^q dt \right)^{1/q} \gtrsim \left(\int_0^1 \|X(t) - H(t)\|_{q,w}^q dt \right)^{1/q} \geq \frac{I_1 - I_2}{I_3^{1/q'}}, \quad (8)$$

where $I_1 := \int_0^1 \langle X(t), Z(t) \rangle_w dt$, $I_2 := \int_0^1 \langle H(t), Z(t) \rangle_w dt$, $I_3 := \int_0^1 \|Z(t)\|_{q',w}^{q'} dt$.

Now let us make our construction specific in order to estimate I_1, I_2, I_3 :

$$k_0 := \lfloor \log_2 n \rfloor, \quad k_1 := \lfloor \gamma q \log_2 n \rfloor, \quad (9)$$

$$Z_{k,j}(t) := \begin{cases} 2^k a (X_{k,j}(t) - 1/2), & x \in [(j - 1)2^{-k}, j2^{-k}], \\ 0, & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

where $a := \sqrt{12}$.

Note that $\int_0^1 Z_{k,j}(t) dt = 0$ and $\int_0^1 (t - t_0)Z_{k,j}(t) dt = 0$ for any t_0 (it is enough to consider t_0 in the middle of the support of $Z_{k,j}$). Let us prove that

$$\int_0^1 Z_{k,j}(t)Z_{k',j'}(t) dt = 0, \quad \int_0^1 Z_{k,j}(t)^2 dt = 2^k, \quad (10)$$

for all $(k, j) \neq (k', j')$. First we check the orthogonality. If $k = k'$, the supports of functions do not intersect. If $k < k'$ and the supports intersect, then on the support of the function $Z_{k',j'}$ the function $Z_{k,j}$ is linear and the integral of their product is zero. Moreover,

$$\int_0^1 Z_{k,j}^2(t) dt = 2^{2k} a^2 \int_{\frac{j-1}{2^k}}^{\frac{j}{2^k}} (X_{k,j}(t) - 1/2)^2 dt = 2^k a^2 \int_0^1 (X_{0,1}(t) - 1/2)^2 dt = 2^k.$$

Proceed to the quantities I_1, I_2, I_3 . First we compute I_1 :

$$\int_0^1 X_{k,j}(t)Z_{k,j}(t) dt = 2^k a \int_{\frac{j-1}{2^k}}^{\frac{j}{2^k}} (X_{k,j}(t) - 1/2)^2 dt = a \int_0^1 (X_{0,1}(t) - 1/2)^2 dt = 1/a,$$

$$I_1 = \int_0^1 \langle X(t), Z(t) \rangle_w dt = \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} 2^{-k} \sum_{j=1}^{2^k} \int_0^1 X_{k,j}(t)Z_{k,j}(t) dt = (k_1 - k_0 + 1)/a.$$

Equalities (10) imply that Z is isotropic in \mathcal{T} , that is $\int_0^1 \langle v, Z(t) \rangle_w^2 dt = \langle v, v \rangle_w^2$ for any $v \in \mathcal{T}$. Let Π_{V_n} be the orthoprojector in \mathcal{T} on the subspace V_n (that contains vectors $H(t)$). Due to the isotropy we have (where v_1, \dots, v_n is an orthonormal basis of V_n):

$$\int_0^1 \|\Pi_{V_n} Z(t)\|_{2,w}^2 dt = \int_0^1 \sum_{m=1}^n \langle v_m, Z(t) \rangle_w^2 dt = n. \quad (11)$$

This allows us to estimate I_2 :

$$\begin{aligned} I_2 &= \int_0^1 \langle H(t), Z(t) \rangle_w dt = \int_0^1 \langle H(t), \Pi_{V_n} Z(t) \rangle_w dt \leq \\ &\leq \left(\int_0^1 \|H(t)\|_{2,w}^2 dt \right)^{1/2} \left(\int_0^1 \|\Pi_{V_n} Z(t)\|_{2,w}^2 dt \right)^{1/2} = n^{1/2} \left(\int_0^1 \|H(t)\|_{2,w}^2 dt \right)^{1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

The inequality (6) gives:

$$\|H(t)\|_{2,w}^2 \leq 2\|X(t)\|_{2,w}^2 + 2\|X(t) - H(t)\|_{2,w}^2 \leq 2\|X(t)\|_{2,w}^2 + 2\|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_2}^2.$$

The first term is bounded for all t : $\|X(t)\|_{2,w}^2 \leq \sum_{k \geq k_0} 2^{-k} \leq 2^{1-k_0} \leq 4/n$.
The second term is bounded in average, since (2) is violated, so

$$\int_0^1 \|H(t)\|_{2,w}^2 dt \lesssim n^{-1} + \int_0^1 \|\chi_t - \eta_t\|_{L_2}^2 dt \lesssim \delta^2 n^{-1} \log^2 n.$$

Hence, $I_2 \lesssim \delta \log n$ for large n . Finally,

$$\begin{aligned} I_3 &= \int_0^1 \|Z(t)\|_{q',w}^{q'} dt = \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} 2^{-k} \sum_{j=1}^{2^k} 2^{kq'} a^{q'} \int_{\frac{j-1}{2^k}}^{\frac{j}{2^k}} |X_{k,j}(t) - 1/2|^{q'} dt \lesssim \\ &\lesssim \sum_{k=k_0}^{k_1} 2^{k(q'-1)} \asymp 2^{k_1(q'-1)}. \end{aligned}$$

So, $I_3^{1/q'} \lesssim 2^{k_1(q'-1)/q'} = 2^{k_1/q} \leq n^\gamma$.

The numerator in (8) is at least $(k_1 - k_0 + 1)/a - C\delta \log n \geq ((\gamma q - 1)/a - C\delta) \log n \gtrsim \log n$, is δ is small enough. The denominator is $\lesssim n^\gamma$. Q.E.D.

Acknowledgements. Author thanks K.S. Ryutin for fruitful discussions.

References

- [Bel84] E.S. Belinskii, “Approximation of periodic functions by a ‘floating’ system of exponentials, and trigonometric widths” (in Russian), *Studies on the Theory of Functions of Many Real Variables*, (1984), 10–24.
- [Gls81] E.D. Gluskin, “On some finite-dimensional problems of the theory of widths” (in Russian), *Vestn. Leningrad. Univ.*, **13** (1981), 5–10.
- [Kas77] B.S. Kashin, “Diameters of some finite-dimensional sets and classes of smooth functions”, *Math. USSR-Izv.*, **11**:2 (1977), 317–333.
- [KMR18] B.S. Kashin, Yu.V. Malykhin, K.S. Ryutin, “Kolmogorov Width and Approximate Rank”, *Proc. Steklov Inst. Math.*, **303** (2018), 140–153.

- [Kol36] A.N. Kolmogorov, “On the best approximation of functions of a given class”, *Selected Works of A.N. Kolmogorov. Volume 1. Mathematics and Mechanics*. Translated from: Ueber die beste Annäherung von Funktionen einer gegebenen Funktionenklasse. — *Ann.Math.*, 1936, vol.37, p.107–110.
- [Kul83] E.D. Kulanin, “On the diameters of a class of functions of bounded variation in the space $L_q(0, 1)$, $2 < q < \infty$ ”, *Russian Mathematical Surveys*, **38**:5 (1983), 146–147.
- [LGM] G.G. Lorentz, M. Golitschek, Y. Makovoz, *Constructive approximation: Advanced problems*. Berlin: Springer, 1996.
- [Mal21] Yu.V. Malykhin, “Kolmogorov Widths of the Besov Classes $B_{1,\theta}^1$ and Products of Octahedra”, *Proc. Steklov Inst. Math.*, **312** (2021), 215–225.
- [Mal24] Yu.V. Malykhin, “Widths and rigidity”, *Sb. Math.*, **215**:4 (2024), 543–571.
- [MR25] Yu.V. Malykhin, K.S. Ryutin, “Widths and rigidity of unconditional sets and random vectors”, *Izv.RAN*, in press.