Electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk through Green's theorem

Alina E. Sagaydak¹ and Zurab K. Silagadze^{1,2}

¹ Novosibirsk State University, 630 090, Novosibirsk, Russia
 ² Budker Institute of Nuclear Physics, 630 090, Novosibirsk, Russia

E-mail: a.sagaidak@g.nsu.ru

E-mail: silagadze@inp.nsk.su

Abstract. All existing derivations of the electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk are technically rather involved. In an old and now almost forgotten publication, Duffin and McWhirter proposed a method for calculating the electrostatic potentials of planar bodies by a skillful application of Green's theorem. It is shown that this method significantly simplifies the problem of calculating the electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk and makes it an almost trivial task. *Keywords*: Electrostatic potential; Uniformly charged disk; Green's theorem.

1. Introduction

Calculating the electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk (or its gravitational analogue) is a classic problem, and there are a variety of ways to solve this problem [1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10]. However, all existing solution methods are quite complex from a technical point of view, which perhaps explains why this interesting electrostatic problem is not reflected in introductory textbooks on classical electrodynamics.

When the observation point is in the plane of the disk, in [4, 5] the electrostatic potential was calculated by skillful use of Green's theorem [11, 12]

$$\iint_{D} \left(\frac{\partial Q}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial P}{\partial y} \right) dx dy = \oint_{\partial D} \left(P dx + Q dy \right).$$
(1)

This neat trick replaces the double integral over the surface of the disk with a line integral over the boundary of the disk and really makes calculating the electrostatic potential much easier. However, it cannot be extended in the form in which it is used in [5] to observation points located outside the plane of the disk.

It is well known that Green's theorem (1) is equivalent to the two-dimensional divergence theorem [11, 12]

$$\iint_{D} \left(\frac{\partial A_x}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial A_y}{\partial y} \right) dx dy = \oint_{\partial D} \mathbf{A} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dl.$$
(2)

Indeed, it is clear from Fig.1 that $\mathbf{n} dl = dy\mathbf{i} - dx\mathbf{j}$, and if we choose $\mathbf{A} = (Q, -P)$ it is easy to see that (2) transforms into (1).



Figure 1. A planar region *D* bounded by a closed curve ∂D , the tangent vector $d\mathbf{l}$ and the outer normal vector $\mathbf{n} dl$ at a given point.

Although (1) and (2) are equivalent, Duffin and McWhirter [13] showed that the divergence theorem (2) is more useful and suggestive when used in electrostatic problems for planar charged bodies (they attribute the origin of the idea to Collie [14]). Crucial observation of [13] is that, if we take a two-variable scalar function (z considered as a parameter)

$$\psi(x,y) = r - |z| \ln (r + |z|), \quad r = \sqrt{(x - X)^2 + (y - Y)^2 + z^2},$$
 (3)

then

$$\frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial y^2} = \frac{r(r+|z|) - (x-X)^2}{r(r+|z|)^2} + \frac{r(r+|z|) - (y-Y)^2}{r(r+|z|)^2} = \frac{1}{r}.$$
 (4)

Therefore, taking

$$\mathbf{A} = \nabla \psi = \left(\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x}, \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial y}\right),\tag{5}$$

in (2), we find that the electrostatic potential created by a uniformly charged planar region D with a surface charge density σ at the observation point (X, Y, z) is given by

$$\phi(X,Y,z) = \frac{\sigma}{4\pi\epsilon_0} \iint_D \frac{dxdy}{r} = \frac{\sigma}{4\pi\epsilon_0} \oint_{\partial D} \nabla \psi \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dl. \tag{6}$$

Note that the absolute value for z in (3) is needed to avoid logarithmic singularity when z < 0, x = X, y = Y.

2. Calculation of the electrostatic potential

Let point P in Fig.2 be the projection onto the disk of the point at which we want to find the electrostatic potential (observation point). The coordinate axes can be selected

so that $P = (X, Y) = (\eta R, 0)$, R being the disk radius and $\eta \ge 0$. In view of the axial symmetry of the problem, to characterize the integration point on the disk, we choose polar coordinates $x = \rho \cos \alpha$, $y = \rho \sin \alpha$. Then $r = \sqrt{(\eta R)^2 - 2\eta R \rho \cos \alpha + \rho^2 + z^2}$ and

$$\mathbf{n} \cdot \nabla \psi|_{\rho=R} = \left. \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial \rho} \right|_{\rho=R} = \frac{1 - \eta \cos \alpha}{\sqrt{1 + \eta^2 - 2\eta \cos \alpha + z^2/R^2} + |z|/R}.$$
(7)



Figure 2. If P is projection of the observation point to the disk plane, D_1 and D_2 subdomains of the disk contribute equally to the electrostatic potential.

From the symmetry it is clear that the D_1 and D_2 halves of the disk make equal contributions to the potential (see Fig.2). In a line integral, the linear segments of D_1 and D_2 go in opposite directions, so their contributions cancel each other (alternatively, the symmetry argument can be applied to the line integral itself, stating that the two halves of the circle contribute equally). Therefore, since $dl = Rd\alpha$,

$$\phi(\eta R, z) = \frac{\sigma R}{2\pi\epsilon_0} \int_0^{\pi} \frac{1 - \eta \cos\alpha}{\sqrt{1 + \eta^2 - 2\eta \cos\alpha + z^2/R^2} + |z|/R} d\alpha = \frac{\sigma R}{2\pi\epsilon_0} \left[I_1 - \frac{|z|}{R} I_2 \right], \quad (8)$$

where

$$I_1 = \int_0^\pi \frac{(1 - \eta \cos \alpha)\sqrt{1 + \eta^2 - 2\eta \cos \alpha + z^2/R^2}}{1 + \eta^2 - 2\eta \cos \alpha} d\alpha,$$
(9)

and

$$I_{2} = \int_{0}^{\pi} \frac{1 - \eta \cos \alpha}{1 + \eta^{2} - 2\eta \cos \alpha} d\alpha.$$
 (10)

The integral I_2 can be calculated by a standard substitution $t = \tan \frac{\alpha}{2}$ which gives

$$I_2 = 2\int_0^\infty \frac{1-\eta+(1+\eta)t^2}{(1+t^2)[(1-\eta)^2+(1+\eta)^2t^2]}dt = \int_0^\infty \left[\frac{1}{1+t^2} + \frac{1+\eta}{1-\eta}\frac{1}{1+\left(\frac{1+\eta}{1-\eta}t\right)^2}\right]dt.$$
 (11)

In the second integral, we make a substitution $s = \frac{1+\eta}{|1-\eta|}t$, where the absolute value is needed to have limits $(0, \infty)$ in s. Finally,

$$I_2 = \frac{\pi}{2} \left[1 + \frac{|1 - \eta|}{1 - \eta} \right] = \pi \theta (1 - \eta),$$
(12)

where $\theta(x) = \begin{cases} 1, x > 0, \\ 0, x < 0. \end{cases}$ is the Heaviside step function. Let $\alpha = \pi - 2\varphi$. Then (9) can be rewritten in the following way

$$I_1 = 2 \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \frac{(1+\eta - 2\eta \sin^2 \varphi) \sqrt{(1+\eta)^2 + z^2/R^2 - 4\eta \sin^2 \varphi}}{(1+\eta)^2 - 4\eta \sin^2 \varphi} \, d\varphi \tag{13}$$

Denoting temporarily $A = (1 + \eta)^2 + z^2/R^2 - 4\eta \sin^2 \varphi$, we have

$$1 + \eta - 2\eta \sin^2 \varphi = \frac{1}{2} \left[1 - \eta^2 + A - z^2 / R^2 \right], \tag{14}$$

and

$$I_1 = \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \frac{[1 - \eta^2 + A - z^2/R^2]A}{[A - z^2/R^2]\sqrt{A}} d\varphi.$$
 (15)

But

$$\frac{\left[1-\eta^2+A-z^2/R^2\right]A}{A-z^2/R^2} = A + (1-\eta^2)\frac{A}{A-z^2/R^2} = A + 1-\eta^2 + z^2/R^2\frac{1-\eta^2}{A-z^2/R^2}.$$
 (16)

Therefore, $I_1 = J_1 + J_2 + J_3$, where

$$J_{1} = \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \sqrt{A} \, d\varphi = \sqrt{(1+\eta)^{2} + z^{2}/R^{2}} \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \sqrt{1 - k^{2} \sin^{2} \varphi} \, d\varphi,$$
$$J_{2} = (1-\eta^{2}) \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \frac{d\varphi}{\sqrt{A}} = \frac{1-\eta^{2}}{\sqrt{(1+\eta)^{2} + z^{2}/R^{2}}} \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \frac{d\varphi}{\sqrt{1 - k^{2} \sin^{2} \varphi}},$$
(17)

with

$$k^{2} = \frac{4\eta}{(1+\eta)^{2} + z^{2}/R^{2}},$$
(18)

and

$$J_{3} = \frac{z^{2}}{R^{2}}(1-\eta^{2})\int_{0}^{\pi/2} \frac{d\varphi}{\sqrt{A}\left(A-z^{2}/R^{2}\right)} = \frac{1-\eta}{1+\eta}\frac{z^{2}/R^{2}}{\sqrt{(1+\eta)^{2}+z^{2}/R^{2}}}\int_{0}^{\pi/2} \frac{d\varphi}{(1-n^{2}\sin^{2}\varphi)\sqrt{1-k^{2}\sin^{2}\varphi}},$$
(19)

Electrostatic potential of a disk

with

$$n^2 = \frac{4\eta}{(1+\eta)^2}.$$
 (20)

From the definitions of complete elliptic integrals of the first, second and third types [15] it is clear that the final expression for the electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk, valid for all observation points, takes the form

$$\phi(\eta R, z) = \frac{\sigma R}{2\pi\epsilon_0} \left[\frac{1 - \eta^2}{\sqrt{(1+\eta)^2 + z^2/R^2}} K(k) + \sqrt{(1+\eta)^2 + z^2/R^2} E(k) + \frac{1 - \eta}{1+\eta} \frac{z^2/R^2}{\sqrt{(1+\eta)^2 + z^2/R^2}} \Pi(n^2, k) - \pi \theta(1-\eta) \frac{|z|}{R} \right].$$
(21)

Because of the presence of the θ -function, when calculating the electric field from (21), care must be taken not to get a spurious δ -function singularity [16].

3. Concluding remarks

If z = 0, then

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\frac{x-X}{r} + \frac{\partial}{\partial y}\frac{y-Y}{r} = \frac{1}{r},$$
(22)

and we can use Green's theorem (1) to get

$$\phi(X,Y,z) = \frac{\sigma}{4\pi\epsilon_0} \iint_D \frac{dxdy}{r} = \frac{\sigma}{4\pi\epsilon_0} \oint_{\partial D} \frac{(x-X)dy - (y-Y)dx}{r}.$$
 (23)

Using this formula, Kondratyev in [4, 5] considered a number of electrostatic problems, including uniformly charged circular and elliptical disks. Many other interesting results on potential theory with and without the constraint z = 0 can also be found in [4, 5].

The use of Green's theorem for planar electrostatic problems in the form proposed in [13] makes calculating the electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk in terms of complete elliptic integrals an almost trivial task.

The reason for this simplification is that the method fully exploits the cylindrical symmetry of the problem. If this symmetry is broken, such as in the case of an elliptical disk, the calculations will not be as simple.

The electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged elliptical disk was found in [4, 5]. Of course, it will be interesting to reproduce this result using Green's theorem in the form (2).

A drawback of the method under consideration is that its application is limited only to the case of uniform charge density.

Nevertheless, we hope that students will benefit from this approach and that this interesting problem will finally find its place in introductory classical electrodynamics textbooks.

References

- [1] Cayley A 1874 On the potential of the ellipse and the circle Proc. Lond. Math. Soc. s1-6 38-58 URL https://doi.org/10.1112/plms/s1-6.1.38
- [2] Durand E 1953 Électrostatique. Vol. I. Les distributions (Masson et Cie)
- [3] Duboshin G N 1961 The theory of attraction (Fizmatlit) (in Russian)
- [4] Kondratyev B P 2003 Theory of potential and equilibrium figures (Publishing House "RHD") (in Russian)
- [5] Kondratyev B P 2007 Potential theory: new methods and problems with solutions (Mir) (in Russian)
- [6] Krogh F T, Ng E W and Snyder W V 1982 The gravitational field of a disk Celestial Mech. 26 395-405 URL https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01230419
- [7] Lass H and Blitzer L 1983 The gravitational potential due to uniform disks and rings Celestial Mech. 30 225-228 URL https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01232189
- [8] Conway J T 2000 Analytical solutions for the Newtonian gravitational field induced by matter within axisymmetric boundaries Mon. Not. Roy. Astron. Soc. 316 540-554 URL https: //doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-8711.2000.03523.x
- Bochko V and Silagadze Z K 2020 On the electrostatic potential and electric field of a uniformly charged disk *Eur. J. Phys.* 41 045201 URL https://dx.doi.org/10.1088/1361-6404/ab87aa
- [10] Ciftja O and Hysi I 2011 The electrostatic potential of a uniformly charged disk as the source of novel mathematical identities Appl. Math. Lett. 24 1919-1923 URL https://www. sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0893965911002564
- [11] Riley K F, Hobson M P and Bence S J 2006 Mathematical Methods for Physics and Engineering: A Comprehensive Guide 3rd ed (Cambridge University Press) URL https://doi.org/10.1017/ CB09780511810763
- [12] Stewart J 2016 Calculus: Early Transcendentals 8th ed (Cengage Learning)
- [13] Duffin R and McWhirter J 1983 A formula for the potential of a polygon with varying charge density J. Franklin Inst. 316 451-466 URL https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/ article/pii/0016003283900923
- [14] Collie C J 1976 Magnetic fields and potentials of linearly varying current or magnetization in a plane-bounded region Proc. Computing Conference on the Computation of Magnetic Fields (Oxford) pp 86–95
- [15] Byrd P and Friedman M 1971 Handbook of Elliptic Integrals for Engineers and Scientists Grundlehren der mathematischen Wissenschaften (Springer) URL https://doi.org/10.1007/ 978-3-642-65138-0
- [16] Martín-Luna P, Gimeno B and Esperante D 2023 Comment on 'on the electrostatic potential and electric field of a uniformly charged disk' Eur. J. Phys. 44 068003 URL https://dx.doi.org/ 10.1088/1361-6404/acf81c