# Discrete $Z_{4}$ symmetry in quantum gravity 

G.E. Volovik ${ }^{1,2}$<br>${ }^{1}$ Low Temperature Laboratory, Aalto University, P.O. Box 15100, FI-00076 Aalto, Finland<br>${ }^{2}$ Landau Institute for Theoretical Physics, acad. Semyonov av., 1a, 142432, Chernogolovka, Russia

(Dated: June 11, 2024)
We consider the discrete $Z_{4}$ symmetry $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$, which takes place in the scenario of quantum gravity where the gravitational tetrads emerge as the order parameter. Under this symmetry operation $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$, the emerging tetrads are multiplied by the imaginary unit, $\hat{\mathbf{i}} e_{\mu}^{a}=-i e_{\mu}^{a}$. The existence of such symmetry and the spontaneous breaking of this symmetry are also supported by the consideration of the symmetry breaking scheme in the topological superfluid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$. The order parameter ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ is the analogue of the tetrad field, but it has complex values. The $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry operation changes the phase of the complex order parameter by $\pi / 2$, which corresponds to the $Z_{4}$ discrete symmetry in quantum gravity. We also considered the alternative scenario of the breaking of this $Z_{4}$ symmetry, in which the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-operation changes sign of the scalar curvature, $\hat{\mathbf{i}} \mathcal{R}=-\mathcal{R}$, and thus the Einstein-Hilbert action violates the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry. In the alternative scenario of symmetry breaking, the gravitational coupling $K=1 / 16 \pi G$ plays the role of the order parameter, which changes sign under ì-transformation.

PACS numbers:

## Contents

I. Introduction ..... 2
II. Composite tetrads and $\hat{\mathrm{i}}$-symmetry ..... 3
III. Broken $\hat{\mathrm{i}}$-symmetry ..... 4
A. Metric and interval ..... 5
B. Gauge fields ..... 6
C. Fermions ..... 6
IV. Alternative broken symmetry ..... 6
A. Gauge field ..... 7
B. Scalar field ..... 7
C. Gravity ..... 7
V. Conclusion ..... 8
References ..... 9

## I. INTRODUCTION

The discrete symmetries, such as $P, T$ and $C$ symmetries, play important role in particle physics, in gravity and cosmology, ${ }^{11}$ and also in topological matter. ${ }^{2}$ We consider the discrete $Z_{4}$ symmetry $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$, which takes place in the Akama-Diakonov-Wetterich (ADW) scenario of quantum gravity. In this scenario, the gravitational tetrads emerge as the symmetry breaking order parameter - the vacuum expectation values of the bilinear combinations of the fermionic operators. ${ }^{3-9}$ Under this symmetry operation $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$, the tetrads are multiplied by the imaginary unit, $\hat{\mathbf{i}} e_{\mu}^{a}=-i e_{\mu}^{a}$. The similar symmetry breaking scenario characterizes the topological superfluid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$. But in ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$, the order parameter, which corresponds to tetrads in quantum gravity, is the complex matrix. The $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry operation changes the phase of this complex order parameter by $\pi / 2$, which corresponds to the $Z_{4}$ discrete symmetry in quantum gravity.

In Sec. [II] we consider the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry in the ADW scenario. The consequences of the
spontaneous breaking of $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry is discussed in Sec. III. The Sec. IV is devoted to the alternative scenario of the symmetry breaking, in which the scalar curvature is not invariant under the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-operation, $\hat{\mathbf{i}} \mathcal{R}=-\mathcal{R}$.

## II. COMPOSITE TETRADS AND î-SYMMETRY

In the Akama-Diakonov-Wetterich (ADW) approach, the gravitational tetrads appear as composite objects made of the more fundamental fields, the quantum fermionic fields. 3 - 9

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{E}_{\mu}^{a}=\frac{1}{2}\left(\Psi^{\dagger} \gamma^{a} \partial_{\mu} \Psi-\Psi^{\dagger} \overleftarrow{\partial_{\mu}} \gamma^{a} \Psi\right) \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

The original action does not depend on tetrads and metric and is described solely in terms of differential forms:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S=\frac{1}{24} e^{\alpha \beta \mu \nu} e_{a b c d} \int d^{4} x \hat{E}_{\alpha}^{a} \hat{E}_{\beta}^{b} \hat{E}_{\mu}^{c} \hat{E}_{\nu}^{d} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

This action is the operator analog of the cosmological term. It has high symmetry. It is symmetric under coordinate transformations $x^{\mu} \rightarrow \tilde{x}^{\mu}(x)$, and thus is also scale invariant. In addition, the action is symmetric under spin rotations, or under the corresponding gauge transformations when the spin connection is added to the gradients.

Here it is important that this action is also symmetric under the complex coordinate transformation $x^{\mu} \rightarrow i x^{\mu}(x)$. Lets us denote this symmetry as $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry. Under this symmetry operation the field operator $\hat{E}_{\mu}^{a}$ is multiplied by $-i$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} \hat{E}_{\mu}^{a}=-i \hat{E}_{\mu}^{a} \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

while the action (2)) remains invariant under $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-transformation.
The action may also contain the operator analog of the Einstein-Hilbert-Cartan term ${ }^{5}$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
e^{\alpha \beta \mu \nu} e_{a b c d} \int d^{4} x \hat{E}_{\alpha}^{a} \hat{E}_{\beta}^{b} \hat{F}_{\mu \nu}^{c d} . \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Here $\hat{F}_{\mu \nu}^{c d}$ is the operator of the Cartan curvature 2-form. As the 2-form, it changes sign under $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-transformation:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} \hat{F}_{\mu \nu}^{c d}=-\hat{F}_{\mu \nu}^{c d} \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

while the action (4) is $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant.

## III. BROKEN î-SYMMETRY

In this scenario of quantum gravity, the tetrads $e_{\mu}^{a}$ emerge as the vacuum expectation values of the bilinear fermionic 1 -form $\hat{E}_{\mu}^{a}$ as a result of the spontaneous symmetry breaking:

$$
\begin{equation*}
e_{\mu}^{a}=<\hat{E}_{\mu}^{a}> \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

This order parameter breaks the separate symmetries under orbital and spin transformations, but remains invariant under the combined rotations. On the level of the Lorentz symmetries the symmetry breaking scheme is $L_{L} \times L_{S} \rightarrow L_{J}$. Here $L_{L}$ is the group of Lorentz transformations in the coordinates space, $L_{S}$ is the group of Lorentz transformations in the spin space, and $L_{J}$ is the symmetry group of the order parameter, which is invariant under the combined Lorentz transformations $L_{J}$.

In addition, this order parameter breaks the discrete $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} e_{\mu}^{a}=-i e_{\mu}^{a} . \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

This is different from the scenario of the spontaneous breaking of the $P T$-symmetry proposed in Ref. ${ }^{10}$, where the special type of the $P T$-symmetry operation changes sign of all tetrads, $P T e_{\mu}^{a}=-e_{\mu}^{a}$. In connection to the transformation of tetrads, the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry is the discrete $Z_{4}$ symmetry, which corresponds to the square root of this $P T$-symmetry:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}}^{2} e_{\mu}^{a}=P T e_{\mu}^{a}=-e_{\mu}^{a} \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

Similar symmetry breaking mechanism of emergent gravity is known in condensed matter physics, where the effective gravitational vielbein also emerges as the bilinear fermionic 1 form ${ }^{11} 12$. This scenario takes place in the $p$-wave spin-triplet superfluid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$, where the corresponding relative symmetry breaking ${ }^{13}$ occurs between the spin and orbital rotations, $S O(3)_{L} \times S O(3)_{S} \rightarrow S O(3)_{J}$. This means that the symmetry under the relative rotations in spin and orbital spaces is broken, while the properties of ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ are isotropic.

In ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$, the $U(1)$ symmetry is also spontaneously broken. Under the $U(1)$ symmetry the tetrad (triad) is transformed according to $e_{\mu}^{a} \rightarrow e^{i \phi} e_{\mu}^{a}$. Then the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry operation in Eq. (7) corresponds in ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ to the global $U(1)$ transformation with the phase $\phi=-\pi / 2$. This also demonstrates that with respect to tetrads, the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry is the discrete $Z_{4}$-symmetry.

Note, that in our case the symmetry operation $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$ does not include the transformations of the fermionic and bosonic operators and the interchanges of the Dirac variables with their Hermitian conjugates.

## A. Metric and interval

In the broken symmetry state, the metric field emerges as the bilinear combination of the tetrad fields:

$$
\begin{equation*}
g_{\mu \nu}=\eta_{a b} e_{\mu}^{a} e_{\nu}^{b} \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

and thus in this quantum gravity the metric is the fermionic quartet. Under the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$ transformation the signature of the metric changes:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} g_{\mu \nu}=-g_{\mu \nu} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

As was suggested in Refs. ${ }^{14 / 15 \text {, the signature of the metric can be the dynamical variable }}$ $O_{a b}$, and $\eta_{a b}$ may emerge as the vacuum expectation value of the corresponding symmetry breaking phase transition, $\eta_{a b}=<O_{a b}>$. The breaking of $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry is the possible scenario of that.

Let us also mention the complexification of the Lorentz group in Refs. 16 and references therein. This scenario of emergence of gravity from the breaking of gauge symmetry is similar to the scenario with the so-called translational gauge fields in crystals, where the gravitational tetrads emerge from the elasticity tetrads describing the elasticity theory in crystals. ${ }^{18} 22$ In the elasticity theory, an arbitrarily deformed crystal structure is described as a system of the crystallographic surfaces of constant phase $X^{a}(x)=2 \pi n^{a}$, and the elasticity tetrads are $e_{\mu}^{a}=\partial_{\mu} X^{a}$. Note, that the elasticity tetrads change sign under the conventional $P T$ transformation of coordinates, and thus the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry is the square root of this $P T$ symmetry.

While the metric in Eq.(10) changes sign under the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-transformation, the interval remains $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant:

$$
\begin{equation*}
d s^{2}=g_{\mu \nu} d x^{\mu} d x^{\nu}, \quad \hat{\mathbf{i}} d s^{2}=d s^{2} \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

The classical action for massive particle, $S=M \int d s$, is also $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant. The quadratic action for the classical scalar field $\Phi$, which appears in the broken $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry state:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S=\int d^{4} x \sqrt{-g}\left(g^{\mu \nu} \nabla_{\mu} \Phi^{*} \nabla_{\nu} \Phi+M^{2}|\Phi|^{2}\right) \tag{12}
\end{equation*}
$$

is also $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant. This is because $\hat{\mathbf{i}} \nabla_{\mu}=-i \nabla_{\mu}, \hat{\mathbf{i}} g^{\mu \nu}=-g^{\mu \nu}$ and $\hat{\mathbf{i}} g=g$.

## B. Gauge fields

The gauge potential, as the 1-form field, transforms as:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} A_{\mu}=-i A_{\mu} . \tag{13}
\end{equation*}
$$

The zero-form action describing the interaction of a charged point particle with the $U(1)$ gauge field remains invariant under the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-transformation:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S=q \int d x^{\mu} A_{\mu}, \hat{\mathbf{i}} S=S \tag{14}
\end{equation*}
$$

On the other hand, the field strength, being the 2-form, changes sign:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} F_{\mu \nu}=-F_{\mu \nu}, \tag{15}
\end{equation*}
$$

while the quadratic action for the gauge field is $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant.

## C. Fermions

The action for the massive Dirac particles

$$
\begin{equation*}
S=\int d^{4} x e\left(i e_{a}^{\mu} \bar{\Psi} \gamma^{a} \nabla_{\mu} \Psi-M \bar{\Psi} \Psi\right) \tag{16}
\end{equation*}
$$

is also $\hat{i}$-invariant. This is because

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} e_{a}^{\mu}=i e_{a}^{\mu}, \hat{\mathbf{i}} \nabla_{\mu}=-i \nabla_{\mu}, \hat{\mathbf{i}} e=e \tag{17}
\end{equation*}
$$

## IV. ALTERNATIVE BROKEN SYMMETRY

It is interesting to consider the scenarios of quantum gravity with different schemes of breaking of $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry. An example, is the symmetry breaking in which the metric remains invariant:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} g_{\mu \nu}=g_{\mu \nu} \tag{18}
\end{equation*}
$$

## A. Gauge field

In this scenario of symmetry breaking, the Eq.(15) for the gauge field remains the same:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mathbf{i}} F_{\mu \nu}=-F_{\mu \nu} \tag{19}
\end{equation*}
$$

The quadratic action for the gauge field remains $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant, which actually follows from the scale invariance of this action.

## B. Scalar field

The action for the scalar field, which is invariant under $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-transformation, contains the 4 -th order gradient terms, such as

$$
\begin{equation*}
S=\int d^{4} x \sqrt{-g}\left(a_{4} g^{\mu \nu} g^{\alpha \beta} \nabla_{\mu} \nabla_{\nu} \Phi^{*} \nabla_{\alpha} \nabla_{\beta} \Phi+b_{4}\left(g^{\mu \nu} \nabla_{\mu} \Phi^{*} \nabla_{\nu} \Phi\right)^{2}\right) \tag{20}
\end{equation*}
$$

The 2-nd order gradient term, which violates the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry, may appear only in the state with broken $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry. The corresponding order parameter can be, for example, the following vacuum expectation value of the bosonic operators:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\lambda=<g^{\mu \nu} \nabla_{\mu} \Phi^{*} \nabla_{\nu} \Phi>, \hat{\mathbf{i}} \lambda=-\lambda \tag{21}
\end{equation*}
$$

This gives the following 2-nd order gradient term:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{2}=2 b_{4} \int d^{4} x \sqrt{-g} \lambda g^{\mu \nu} \nabla_{\mu} \Phi^{*} \nabla_{\nu} \Phi \tag{22}
\end{equation*}
$$

## C. Gravity

In the scenario of the broken symmetry in Sec. III, where the tetrads serve as the order parameter, the term in Eq. (4) is reduced to the conventional Einstein-Hilbert action $\sqrt{-g} K \mathcal{R}$. It is $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant, since $\hat{\mathbf{i}} \mathcal{R}=\mathcal{R}$.

In the alternative symmetry breaking scenario discussed here, the curvature $\mathcal{R}$ is not $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariant, since the transformation $x^{\mu} \rightarrow i x^{\mu}(x)$ is not compensated by the transformation of metric, and one obtains $\hat{\mathbf{i}} \mathcal{R}=-\mathcal{R}$. As a result, the Einstein-Hilbert action is not $\hat{\mathbf{i}}-$ invariant. The $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-invariance of the Einstein-Hilbert action is restored if the gravitational coupling changes sign under this transformation, $\hat{\mathbf{i}} K=-K$. This means that in this case
the gravitational coupling $K$ either serves as the order parameter of such symmetry breaking or is proportional to the order parameter $\lambda$ in Eq.(21), $K \propto \lambda$.

In this scenario, the scalar field is transformed to the ghost field under $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-operation, and massive particles transform to the tachyons with imaginary mass. In the same way, under $\hat{\mathrm{i}}$-operation the de Sitter state is transformed to the anti-de Sitter state. ${ }^{23}$ This is different from the time reversal operation, which transforms the expanding de Sitter state with the Hubble parameter $H>0$ to the contracting de Sitter with $H<0$.

## V. CONCLUSION

In topological superfluid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$, the symmetry breaking scheme includes $S O(3)_{L} \times$ $S O(3)_{S} \rightarrow S O(3)_{J}$. Here $S O(3)_{L}$ is the group of oribtal rotations; $S O(3)_{S}$ is the group of spin rotations, and $S O(3)_{J}$ is the group of combined rotations.

In the ADW scenario of quantum gravity there is the similar symmetry breaking scheme, but in the form of the Lorentz symmetries: $L_{L} \times L_{S} \rightarrow L_{J}$. Here $L_{L}=S(3,1)_{L}$ is the group of Lorentz transformations in the coordinates space, $L_{S}=S(3,1)_{S}$ is the group of Lorentz transformations in the spin space, and $L_{J}=S(3,1)_{J}$ is the symmetry group of the order parameter. The order parameter here is the tetrad field $e_{\mu}^{a}$, which is not invariant under separate Lorentz transformation, but is invariant under the combined Lorentz transformations $L_{J}$.

The difference between the ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ scenario and the ADW scenario of quantum gravity is not only in the different dimensions: we have 3 D space dimension in ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ and $(3+1)$ dimension of space time, and as a result, the order parameter in ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ represents the triad field instead of tetrads. There is another important difference: in ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ in addition to the broken relative symmetry the global $U(1)$ symmetry group is also broken. As a result the triads in ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ become complex. This suggests the possible consideration of the extended symmetry also in the ADW scenario. Indeed, one can see that the original fermionic action in the ADW theory is invariant under the coordinate transformation $x^{\mu} \rightarrow i x^{\mu}$, where $i$ is the imaginary unit. We call this additional symmetry the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry. This $Z_{4}$ symmetry is the discrete analogue of the $U(1)$ symmetry in the symmetric state of liquid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$.

We considered two different scenarios of the breaking of this $Z_{4}$ symmetry. In the ADW scenario, this $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-operation leads to the following transformation of the emerging tetrad fields:
$e_{\mu}^{a} \rightarrow-i e_{\mu}^{a}$. In the alternative scenario, the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-operation changes sign of the scalar curvature, $\mathcal{R} \rightarrow-\mathcal{R}$, and thus the Einstein-Hilbert action violates the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$-symmetry. This means that in the alternative scenario of symmetry breaking, the gravitational coupling $K=1 / 16 \pi G$ plays the role of the order parameter, with $K \rightarrow-K$ under the $\hat{\mathbf{i}}$ symmetry operation.
${ }^{1}$ Latham Boyle, Kieran Finn, and Neil Turok, CPT-Symmetric Universe, Phys. Rev. Lett. 121, 251301 - Published 20 December 2018
${ }^{2}$ Ching-Kai Chiu, Jeffrey C.Y. Teo, Andreas P. Schnyder, Shinsei Ryu, Classification of topological quantum matter with symmetries, Rev. Mod. Phys. 88, 035005 (2016).
${ }^{3}$ K. Akama, An Attempt at Pregeometry: Gravity with Composite Metric, Progress of Theoretical Physics, 60, 1900-1909 (1978).
${ }^{4}$ C. Wetterich, Gravity from spinors, Phys. Rev. D 70, 105004 (2004).
${ }^{5}$ D. Diakonov, Towards lattice-regularized Quantum Gravity, arXiv:1109.0091.
${ }^{6}$ A.A. Vladimirov and D. Diakonov, Diffeomorphism-invariant lattice actions, Physics of Particles and Nuclei 45, 800 (2014).

7 A.A. Vladimirov and D. Diakonov, Phase transitions in spinor quantum gravity on a lattice, Phys. Rev. D 86, 104019 (2012).

8 Y.N. Obukhov and F.W. Hehl, Extended Einstein-Cartan theory a la Diakonov: The field equations, Phys. Lett. B 713, 321-325 (2012).
${ }^{9}$ Alessio Maiezza and Fabrizio Nesti, Parity from gauge symmetry, Eur. Phys. J. C 82, 491 (2022).
${ }^{10}$ S.N. Vergeles, Phase transition near the Big Bang in the lattice theory of gravity and some cosmological considerations, arXiv:2301.01692 [gr-qc].
${ }^{11}$ G.E. Volovik, Superfluid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}-\mathrm{B}$ and gravity, Physica B 162, 222-230 (1990).
${ }^{12}$ G.E. Volovik, Combined Lorentz symmetry: lessons from superfluid ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$, J. Low Temp. Phys. 206, 1-15 (2022), arXiv:2011.06466.

13 A.J. Leggett, NMR lineshifts and spontaneously broken spin-orbit symmetry. I. General concepts, J. Phys. C 6, 3187 (1973).
${ }^{14}$ S. Bondarenko and M. A. Zubkov, Riemann-Cartan Gravity with Dynamical Signature, JETP Lett. 116, 54-60, (2022).

15 S. Bondarenko, Dynamical Signature: Complex Manifolds, Gauge Fields and Non-Flat Tangent Space, Universe 8, 497 (2022).
${ }^{16}$ Mehraveh Nikjoo and Tom Zlosnik, Hamiltonian formulation of gravity as a spontaneouslybroken gauge theory of the Lorentz group, Class. Quantum Grav. 41, 045005 (2024).
${ }^{17}$ Priidik Gallagher, Tomi S. Koivisto, W. Ostwaldi, Luca Marzola, Ludovic Varrin and Tom Zlosnik, Consistent first-order action functional for gauge theories, Phys. Rev. D 109, L061503 (2024).

18 I.E. Dzyaloshinskii, and G.E. Volovick, Poisson brackets in condensed matter, Ann. Phys. 125 67-97 (1980).
19 J. Nissinen and G.E. Volovik, Elasticity tetrads, mixed axial-gravitational anomalies, and (3+1)d quantum Hall effect, Physical Review Research 1, 023007 (2019), arXiv:1812.03175,
20 J. Nissinen and G.E. Volovik, Tetrads in solids: from elasticity theory to topological quantum Hall systems and Weyl fermions, ZhETF 154, 1051-1056 (2018), JETP 127, 948-957 (2018), arXiv:1803.09234.
${ }^{21}$ F.R. Klinkhamer and G.E. Volovik, Tetrads and $q$-theory, Pis'ma ZhETF 109, 369-370 (2019), JETP Lett. 109, 364-367 (2019), arXiv:1812.07046.
22 Jinmin Yi, Xuzhe Ying, Lei Gioia and A.A. Burkov, Topological order in interacting semimetals, Phys. Rev. B 107, 115147 (2023).
${ }^{23}$ G.E. Volovik, Thermodynamics and decay of de Sitter vacuum, submitted to Symmetry, 2024, DOI: 10.20944/preprints202405.1882.v1

