Violation of the Third Law of Thermodynamics by Black Holes, Riemann Zeta Function and Bose Gas in Negative Dimensions

Irina Aref'eva and Igor Volovich

Steklov Mathematical Institute, Russian Academy of Sciences, Gubkina str. 8, 119991, Moscow, Russia

E-mail: arefeva@mi-ras.ru, volovich@mi-ras.ru

ABSTRACT: Black holes violate the third law of thermodynamics in its standard formulation. Schwarzschild black hole entropy is inverse proportional to the square of the temperature $S = 1/(16\pi T^2)$ and tends to infinity rather than zero when the temperature goes to zero. We search for quantum statistical models with such exotic thermodynamic behaviour. It is shown that the Schwarzschild black hole in D = 4spacetime dimensions corresponds to a Bose gas in a space with d = -4 negative spatial dimensions. The Riemann zeta function is used to define the entropy of the Bose gas in negative dimension. The correspondence between black holes in higher dimensions and de Sitter spacetime with Bose gases is considered.

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Schwarzschild Black Hole in $D = 4$ and Bose Gas in $d = -4$	2
3	Higher Dimensional Black Holes and Bose Gas	4
4	De Sitter and Bose Gas	7
5	Discussion	8

1 Introduction

There is a remarkable analogy between the laws of thermodynamics and the laws of black hole mechanics [1-5]. However, there is a problem with the third law of thermodynamics.

According to the standard formulation of the third law, the entropy S should tend to zero as the temperature T goes to zero. This law is satisfied by most models of statistical mechanics [6]. The entropy of Schwarzschild black hole is inverse proportional to the square of the temperature $S = 1/(16\pi T^2)$ and tends to infinity rather than zero when the temperature goes to zero. Therefore, a microscopic model of black hole entropy cannot be an ordinary quantum system obeying the third law of thermodynamics.

The third law of thermodynamics is also violated for the Reissner-Nordstrom, Kerr, Kerr-Newman and some other black hole solutions. It is violated not only in the standard Planck's formulation discussed above but also in the Nernst formulation. The temperature of extremal black holes is equal to zero, but its entropy depend on the parameters of the black holes, meanwhile, according to the Nernst formulation of the third law, the entropy values at zero temperature should be a universal constant.

The third law of the black hole mechanics is formulated as unattainability of the state with the surface gravity equal to zero [1, 7-11]. A possible violation of this formulation is discussed recently [12].

The problem with the microscopic origin of the Bekenstein-Hawking entropy [2, 3] for black holes is that black holes do not satisfy the third law of thermodynamics in

its standard formulation. Therefore, such exotic thermodynamics behaviour of black hole cannot be obtained by using ordinary quantum statistical mechanics models which obey the third law. In this paper we show that the entropy of the Schwarzschild black hole

$$S_{BH} = \frac{\beta^2}{16\pi G}, \qquad \beta = 1/T \tag{1.1}$$

(G is the Newton constant) corresponds to the Bose gas in d = -4 negative spatial dimensions. This conclusion is obtained by using properties of the Riemann zeta function. The entropy of the Bose gas in d-dimensional space, d = 1, 2, 3, ... is

$$S_{BG} = \frac{L^d}{2^d \pi^{\frac{d}{2}} \beta^{\frac{d}{2}} \lambda^{\frac{d}{2}}} \left(\frac{d}{2} + 1\right) \zeta\left(\frac{d}{2} + 1\right), \tag{1.2}$$

where λ is a positive constant and ζ is the Riemann zeta function [13], see Sect.2 for details. The expression (1.2) admits an analytical continuation to the complex d. We have the equality $S_{BH} = S_{BG}$ if d = -4 and $\lambda^2 = 3L^4/(64\pi^3 G)$. Therefore, the entropy of the 4-dimensional Schwarzschild black hole coincides with the entropy of the Bose gas in d = -4 spacial dimensions. The extension of this result to the D-dimensional Schwarzschild black hole is considered in Sect.3. The Bose gas interpretation of the de Sitter entropy is discussed in Sect.4.

The problem of the microscopic origin of the Bekenstein-Hawking black hole entropy [2, 3] has attracted enormous attention since the discovery of this entropy. D-0 branes interpretation has been suggested by Strominger and Vafa [14]. 't Hooft proposed to relate black hole entropy with the entropy of thermally excited quantum fields in the vicinity of the horizon [15]. Note also the recent searches (see [16, 17] and references therein) for internal geometries that provide the entropy of a black hole. As was mentioned in [18] this resembles an old Wheeler's consideration of the black hole interior as "bag of gold" [19]. The quantum model corresponding to black hole in spacetime with topology $AdS_2 \times S^8$ considered recently by Maldacena [20] satisfies the third law.

2 Schwarzschild Black Hole in D = 4 and Bose Gas in d = -4

The metric of the Schwarzschild black hole in D = 4 spacetime is

$$ds^{2} = -\left(1 - \frac{r_{h}}{r}\right)dt^{2} + \frac{dr^{2}}{1 - \frac{r_{h}}{r}} + r^{2}d\omega_{2}^{2},$$
(2.1)

where $d\omega_2^2$ is the metric on 2-dimensional unit sphere, $r_h = 2M$, M is the mass of the black hole. The Hawking temperature of Schwarzschild black hole in D=4 is

$$T = \frac{1}{8\pi GM},\tag{2.2}$$

where M is the mass of the black hole. The Bekenstein-Hawking entropy and the free energy are

$$S = \frac{1}{16\pi GT^2},\tag{2.3}$$

$$F_{BH} = \frac{\beta}{16\pi G}.$$
(2.4)

The entropy goes to infinity as $T \to 0$ and we see a violation of the third law in Planck's formulation.

Now consider the non-relativistic Bose gas in d-spatial dimensions [6, 21] with the grand potential

$$F_{BG} = \frac{1}{\beta} \sum_{\substack{k_i = 2\pi n_i/L \\ i = 1, \dots d \\ n_i = 1, 2, \dots}} \ln\left(1 - e^{\beta(\mu - \lambda \vec{k}^2)}\right), \quad \vec{k}^2 = \sum_{i=1,\dots,d} k_i^2, \quad \lambda > 0$$
(2.5)

in the box of the volume L^d and the chemical potential μ .

The continuum version for large L is

$$F_{BG}(\beta) = \frac{L^d}{(2\pi)^d \beta} \int \ln\left(1 - e^{\beta(\mu - \lambda \vec{k}^2)}\right) d^d k.$$
(2.6)

In what follows we take $\mu = 0$. Using spherical coordinates and integrating over spherical angles in (2.6), we get

$$F_{BG} = \frac{\Omega_{d-1}}{\beta} \left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^d \int_0^\infty \ln\left(1 - e^{-\beta \lambda k^2}\right) k^{d-1} dk, \qquad (2.7)$$

where $\Omega_{d-1} = \frac{2\pi^{d/2}}{\Gamma(d/2)}$. Making the change of variables $\beta \lambda k^2 = x$ and using the representation

$$\int_0^\infty \ln(1 - e^{-x}) x^{s-1} dx = -\Gamma(s) \zeta(s+1),$$
 (2.8)

valued for $\Re s > 1$, we get

$$F_{BG} = -\frac{L^d}{2^d \pi^{\frac{d}{2}} \beta^{\frac{d}{2}+1} \lambda^{\frac{d}{2}}} \zeta\left(\frac{d}{2}+1\right).$$
(2.9)

The expression (2.9) is obtained for $\Re d > 2$, however $\zeta(s)$ can be analytically extended to the hole complex plane as a meromorphic function with the only simple pole at s = 1. So we can use the formula (2.9) for complex d. The entropy is

$$S_{BG} = \frac{L^d}{2^d \pi^{\frac{d}{2}} \beta^{\frac{d}{2}} \lambda^{\frac{d}{2}}} \left(\frac{d}{2} + 1\right) \zeta \left(\frac{d}{2} + 1\right).$$
(2.10)

Equalizing (2.9) and the free energy of the 4-dimensional Schwarzschild black hole (2.4)

$$F_{BH}(\beta) = F_{BG}(\beta), \qquad (2.11)$$

we get

$$-\frac{L^d}{2^d \pi^{\frac{d}{2}} \beta^{\frac{d}{2}+1} \lambda^{\frac{d}{2}}} \zeta\left(\frac{d}{2}+1\right) = \frac{\beta}{16\pi G}.$$
(2.12)

To fulfill this relation we have to assume

$$d = -4 \tag{2.13}$$

$$\lambda^2 = -\frac{L^4}{256\,\pi^3\zeta(-1)\,G}.\tag{2.14}$$

Taking into account that $\zeta(-1) = -1/12$, we get

$$\frac{\lambda^2}{L^4} = \frac{3}{64\,\pi^3\,G},\tag{2.15}$$

therefore, we obtain that the thermodynamics of the 4-dimensional Schwarzschild black hole is equivalent to the thermodynamics of the Bose gas in d = -4 spacial dimensions. We understand the thermodynamics of the Bose gas in *negative* spacial dimensions in the sense of the analytical continuation of the right hand site of (2.9).

3 Higher Dimensional Black Holes and Bose Gas

Let us recall that for *D*-dimensional Schwarzschild black hole, $D \ge 4$,

$$ds^{2} = -\left(1 - \frac{r_{h}^{D-3}}{r^{D-3}}\right)dt^{2} + \frac{dr^{2}}{1 - \frac{r_{h}^{D-3}}{r^{D-3}}} + r^{2}d\omega_{D-2}^{2},$$
(3.1)

Hawking temperature $T = 1/\beta$ is

$$T = \frac{D-3}{4\pi r_h},\tag{3.2}$$

where r_h is the radius of the horizon. The entropy and the free energy are

$$S_{BH} = \frac{1}{4G_D} \left(\frac{D-3}{4\pi} \frac{1}{T} \right)^{D-2} \Omega_{D-2}, \qquad (3.3)$$

$$F_{BH} = \frac{(D-3)^{D-3}}{4G_D(4\pi)^{D-2}} \beta^{D-3} \Omega_{D-2}$$
(3.4)

where G_D is the Newton constant in D-dimensional spacetime. Entropy S goes to ∞ , when $T \to 0$, and we obtain a violation of the third law in Planck's formulation again.

The free energy of the perfect gas of quasi-particles with energy $\varepsilon(\vec{k})$ is given by [21]

$$F(\beta) = \frac{1}{\beta} \sum_{\vec{k}} \ln\left(1 - e^{-\beta \varepsilon(\vec{k})}\right), \tag{3.5}$$

where $\beta > 0$ is the inverse temperature and $\vec{k} = \{k_1, ..., k_d\}$ sums over all one particle states of the system in d-spatial dimension. Let us consider the free energy (3.5) with

$$\varepsilon_{\alpha}(\vec{k}) = \lambda \left(\vec{k}^2\right)^{\alpha/2},\tag{3.6}$$

 λ is a positive dimensional constant.

In the continuum version we start from

$$F_{BG} = \frac{\Omega_{d-1}}{\beta} \left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^d \int_0^\infty \ln\left(1 - e^{-\lambda\beta k^\alpha}\right) k^{d-1} dk.$$
(3.7)

Making the change of variables $\lambda\beta k^{\alpha} = x$ and using representation (2.8) we get

$$F_{BG} = -\left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^d \frac{2\pi^{d/2}}{d\Gamma(d/2)} \left(\frac{1}{\beta}\right)^{\frac{d}{\alpha}+1} \left(\frac{1}{\lambda}\right)^{\frac{d}{\alpha}} \Gamma\left(\frac{d}{\alpha}+1\right) \zeta\left(\frac{d}{\alpha}+1\right).$$
(3.8)

Supposing that this free energy is equivalent to the D-dim dimensional Schwarzschild free energy we get

$$-\frac{1}{d}\left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^{d}\frac{2\pi^{d/2}}{\Gamma(d/2)}\left(\frac{1}{\beta}\right)^{\frac{d}{\alpha}+1}\left(\frac{1}{\lambda}\right)^{\frac{d}{\alpha}}\Gamma\left(\frac{d}{\alpha}+1\right)\zeta\left(\frac{d}{\alpha}+1\right) = \frac{(D-3)^{D-3}}{4G_{D}(4\pi)^{D-2}}\beta^{D-3}\frac{2\pi^{\frac{D-1}{2}}}{\Gamma(\frac{D-1}{2})}.$$
(3.9)

To equalize the powers of β in both sizes of (3.9) we take

$$d = -(D-2)\alpha, \tag{3.10}$$

and we get

$$F_{BG} = -\left(\frac{2}{L}\right)^{(D-2)\alpha} \frac{\pi^{\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2}}}{\Gamma(1-\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2})} \beta^{D-1} \lambda^{D-2} \Gamma(3-D) \zeta(3-D).$$
(3.11)

Here and below we understand D as D + 0. Using the functional relation

$$\Gamma(3-D)\zeta(3-D) = \frac{\zeta(D-2)}{2^{D-2}\pi^{D-3}\sin(\frac{\pi(D-2)}{2})},$$
(3.12)

we obtain necessary and sufficient conditions for the existence of $0 < \lambda < \infty$ solving equation (3.9)

$$0 < -\Gamma\left(1 - \frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2}\right) \sin\left(\frac{\pi(D-2)}{2}\right) < \infty.$$
(3.13)

Since D is a natural number, $\sin(\frac{\pi(D-2)}{2})$ takes three values:

$$\sin\left(\frac{\pi(D-2)}{2}\right) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{for } D = 4k+3, \quad k = 1, 2, 3, \dots \\ 0 & \text{for } D = 2k, \quad k = 2, 3, 4, \dots \\ -1 & \text{for } D = 4k+1, \quad k = 1, 2, 3, \dots \end{cases}$$
(3.14)

Let us consider three cases (3.14) separately.

• For D = 2k one has to assume, that the zeros of the sine must be compensated by the poles of the gamma function, so we get

$$1 - \frac{(2k-2)\alpha}{2} = -p, \quad p = 0, 1, 2, ...,$$
(3.15)

and

$$\alpha = \frac{(p+1)}{k-1}, \quad \text{where} \quad p = 0, 1, 2, ..., \quad k = 2, 3, 4, ...$$
(3.16)

Using the functional relation

$$\Gamma\left(\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2}\right)\Gamma\left(1-\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2}\right) = \frac{\pi}{\sin(\pi\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2})}$$
(3.17)

we rewrite conditions (3.13) as

$$0 < -\frac{\pi \sin\left(\frac{\pi(D-2)}{2}\right)}{\Gamma\left(\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2}\right)\sin\left(\pi\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2}\right)} < \infty.$$
(3.18)

For positive α the necessary and sufficient conditions (3.18) becomes

$$0 < -\frac{\sin(\frac{\pi(D-2)}{2})}{\sin(\pi\frac{(D-2)\alpha}{2})} < \infty.$$
(3.19)

For D = 2k and α as in (3.16) the ratio of sines in (3.19) becomes equal to $(-1)^{k-p-1}$, and we get

$$p = k + 2l + 1, \quad l = 0, 1, 2.$$
 (3.20)

Therefore our solution in this case is

$$D = 2k, \quad \alpha = \frac{(k+2l)}{k-1}.$$
 (3.21)

• For D = 4k + 1, since $\sin(\pi(4k - 1)/2) = -1$, to have (3.13) we must require

$$0 < \Gamma\left(1 - \frac{(4k-1)\alpha}{2}\right) < \infty.$$
(3.22)

- For $\alpha < 0$ the inequalities (3.22) are satisfied.

- For $\alpha > 0$ the inequalities (3.22) are satisfied only for

$$\frac{4r}{4k-1} < \alpha < \frac{2(2r+1)}{4k-1}.$$
(3.23)

• For D = 4k + 3, since $\sin(\pi(4k - 1)/2) = 1$, to have (3.13) we must require

$$0 < -\Gamma\left(1 - \frac{(4k-1)\alpha}{2}\right) < \infty.$$
(3.24)

- For $\alpha < 0$ the inequalities (3.24) are not satisfied.
- For $\alpha > 0$ the inequalities (3.24) only holds for

$$\frac{2(2r+1)}{4k+1} < \alpha < \frac{4(r+1)}{4k+1}.$$
(3.25)

To summarize, we get the following 4 series of solutions

D		d	α
D = 4k + 1,	k = 1, 2, 3	$d = (4k - 1) \alpha $	$\alpha = -1, -2, 3, \dots$
D = 4k + 1,	k = 1, 2, 3	$d = -(4k - 1)\alpha$	$\frac{4r}{4k-1} < \alpha < \frac{2(2r+1)}{4k-1}, r = 0, 1, 2, \dots$
D = 4k + 3,	k = 1, 2, 3	$d = -(4k+1)\alpha$	$\frac{2(2r+1)}{4k+1} < \alpha < \frac{4(r+1)}{4k+1}, r = 0, 1, 2$
D = 2k,	k = 2, 3, 4	$d = -2(k-1)\alpha$	$\alpha = \frac{k+2n}{k-1}, n = 0, 1, 2,$

Table 1.

4 De Sitter and Bose Gas

Let us remind that temperature, entropy and the free energy (density ?) of the dS spacetime,

$$ds^{2} = -\left(1 - \frac{r^{2}}{\ell^{2}}\right)dt^{2} + \left(1 - \frac{r^{2}}{\ell^{2}}\right)^{-1}dr^{2} + r^{2}d\omega_{D-2}^{2},$$
(4.1)

are

$$T = \frac{1}{2\pi\ell},\tag{4.2}$$

$$S_{dS} = \frac{1}{4G_N} \ell^{D-2} \Omega_{D-2} = \frac{\beta^{D-2}}{4G_D (2\pi)^{D-2}} \Omega_{D-2}, \qquad (4.3)$$

$$F_{dS} = \frac{\beta^{D-3}}{4G_D(2\pi)^{D-2}(D-3)}\Omega_{D-2},$$
(4.4)

where $D \geq 3$.

Note that

$$F_{dS}(\beta) = a(D)F_{BH}(\beta), \qquad (4.5)$$

where

$$a(D) = \frac{2^{D-2}}{(D-3)^{D-2}}.$$
(4.6)

Therefore, the equation $F_{BG} = F_{dS}$ is reduced to equation $F_{BG} = a(D)F_{BH}$. Since $0 < a(D) < \infty$ we obtain the same solutions for D, d and α as presented in Table 1.

5 Discussion

In this note we have shown that the thermodynamics of Schwarzschild black holes and de Sitter spacetime is equivalent to the thermodynamics of a Bose gas in spaces of negative dimensions.

- Equivalence is established using an analytic extension of the Riemann zeta function representation for the entropy of the Bose gas. We expect a similar correspondence holding for other black hole solutions and models of quantum statistics
- Life in negative dimensions seems to be more than just a fantasy. Some mathematically well-defined formulas allow for this exciting possibility. The Newton/Coulomb potential in d-dimensional space looks like $1/r^{d-2}$ and vanishes at large distances for d > 2. If d is negative, the potential grows at infinity and provides the confinement of matter in a trap, similarly to the de Sitter spacetime.
- Note that the functional relation for the Riemann zeta function connects negative and positive dimensions d. Many properties of the Riemann zeta function, including the functional relations, also hold for Dirichlet and more general L-functions. Partition functions of the bosonic string can be expressed in terms of the L-functions of a motive [22, 23]. Further generalizations are considered in the Langlands program discussed in [24, 25]. In [25] quantization of the Riemann zeta function is considered. In [26] the zeta function string model has been proposed. Negative dimensions in a different context are discussed in [27, 28]. Negative dimensions [29] in the spirit of non-integer dimensions [30] are used for loop integrals.
- We have discussed the correspondence between the black holes entropy in positive dimensions and Bose gas in negative dimensions. However, one can also consider a correspondence between the spacetime of negative dimensions and Bose gas in positive dimensions. Writing the relation (3.10) in the form $D = 2 d/\alpha$ and taking d and α positive, we get a negative dimensional spacetime D consistent with (3.9).

In conclusion, there is an interesting equivalence between the entropy of Schwarzschild black holes and the entropy of a Bose gas, given in the Table 1. We see that either the dimension of the nonrelativistic Bose gas is negative, or we are dealing with a Bose gas with a nonstandard kinetic term. It would be interesting to find a similar correspondence for other black holes or branes.

Acknowlegments

We would like to thank D. Ageev, V. Berezin, V. Frolov, M. Khramtsov, K. Rannu, P. Slepov, A. Teretenkov, A. Trushechkin and V. Zagrebnov for fruitful discussions. This work is supported by the Russian Science Foundation (project 19-11-00320, V.A. Steklov Mathematical Institute).

References

- B.Bardeen, B.Carter and S.W.Hawking, The four laws of black hole mechanics, Commun. Math. Phys. 31, 161 (1973).
- [2] J. D. Bekenstein, "Black holes and entropy," Phys. Rev. D 7 (Apr, 1973) 2333–2346.
- [3] S. W. Hawking, "Particle Creation by Black Holes," Commun. Math. Phys. 43 (1975) 199–220. [Erratum: Commun.Math.Phys. 46, 206 (1976)]
- [4] V. Frolov and I. Novikov, Black hole physics: basic concepts and new developments (Vol. 96) (2012), Springer Science, Business Media.
- [5] R.M. Wald, General Relativity, University of Chicago Press (1984).
- [6] L. D. Landau, E. M. Lifshitz Statistical Physics: Volume 5. Elsevier, 2013. v. 5.
- [7] W.Israel, Third Law of Black-Hole Dynamics. A Formulation and Proof, Phys. Rev. Lett. 57, 397 (1986).
- [8] R.Wald, "Nernst theorem" and black hole thermodynamics, Phys. Rev. D56, 6467 (1997);
- [9] I. Rácz, "Does the third law of black hole thermodynamics really have a serious failure?." Classical and Quantum Gravity 17.20 (2000): 4353.
- [10] F. Belgiorno and M. Martellini, "Black holes and the third law of thermodynamics," Int. J. Mod. Phys. D 13, 739-770 (2004) [arXiv:gr-qc/0210026 [gr-qc]].
- [11] W. F. Wreszinski and E. Abdalla, "A Precise formulation of the third law of thermodynamics with applications to statistical physics and black holes," [arXiv:0710.4918 [math-ph]].
- [12] C. Kehle and R. Unger, "Gravitational collapse to extremal black holes and the third law of black hole thermodynamics," [arXiv:2211.15742 [gr-qc]].
- [13] A. A. Karatsuba and S. M. Voronin. "The Riemann Zeta-Function" (de Gruyter, Berlin (1992).
- [14] A. Strominger and C. Vafa, "Microscopic origin of the Bekenstein-Hawking entropy," Phys. Lett. B 379 (1996) 99–104, arXiv:hep-th/9601029.
- [15] G. 't Hooft, "On the Quantum Structure of a Black Hole," Nucl. Phys. B 256, 727-745 (1985)

- [16] J. Chakravarty, "Overcounting of interior excitations: A resolution to the bags of gold paradox in AdS," JHEP 02, 027 (2021) [arXiv:2010.03575 [hep-th]].
- [17] V. Balasubramanian, A. Lawrence, J. M. Magan and M. Sasieta, "Microscopic origin of the entropy of black holes in general relativity," [arXiv:2212.02447 [hep-th]].
- [18] A. Almheiri, T. Hartman, J. Maldacena, E. Shaghoulian, and A. Tajdini, "The entropy of Hawking radiation," Rev. Mod. Phys. 93 no. 3, (2021) 035002, arXiv:2006.06872 [hep-th].
- [19] J. Wheeler, "Relativity, groups and topology," edited by B. S. DeWitt and C. M. DeWitt. Gordon and Breach, New York, 1964.
- [20] J. Maldacena, "A simple quantum system that describes a black hole," [arXiv:2303.11534 [hep-th]].
- [21] V.A. Zagrebnov and J.-B. Bru. "The Bogoliubov model of weakly imperfect Bose gas." Physics Reports 350.5-6 (2001) 291-434.
- [22] I. V. Volovich, "D-branes, black holes and SU (∞) gauge theory." arXiv preprint hep-th/9608137 (1996): 41-48.
- [23] I. V. Volovich, "From p-adic strings to étale strings", Proc. Steklov Inst. Math., 203 (1995), 37–42
- [24] S. Gukov and E. Witten, Gauge Theory, Ramification, And The Geometric Langlands Program, Communications in Number Theory and Physics, Vol. 1, p.1-236 (2007), hep-th/0612073;
- [25] I. Y. Aref'eva and I. V. Volovich, "Quantization of the Riemann Zeta Function and Cosmology," Int. J. Geom. Meth. Mod. Phys. 4, 881-895 (2007)
 [arXiv:hep-th/0701284 [hep-th]].
- [26] B. Dragovich, "Zeta strings," [arXiv:hep-th/0703008 [hep-th]].
- [27] Yuri Manin, "The notion of dimension in geometry and algebra." Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society 43.2 (2006), 139-161.
- [28] V. P. Maslov, "Negative dimension in general and asymptotic topology." arXiv math/0612543 (2006).
- [29] C. Anastasiou, E. W. N. Glover and C. Oleari, "Scalar one loop integrals using the negative dimension approach," Nucl. Phys. B 572, 307-360 (2000) [arXiv:hep-ph/9907494 [hep-ph]].
- [30] G. 't Hooft and M. J. G. Veltman, "Regularization and Renormalization of Gauge Fields," Nucl. Phys. B 44, 189-213 (1972) doi:10.1016/0550-3213(72)90279-9