

# Odd-frequency Two Particle Bose-Einstein Condensate

A.V. Balatsky<sup>1,2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>NORDITA, KTH Royal Institute of Technology and Stockholm University, Roslagstullsbacken 23 106 91 Stockholm, Sweden

<sup>2</sup>Institute for Materials Science, Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA

(Dated: June 9, 2021)

We introduce the concept of the *odd-frequency* Bose Einstein Condensate (BEC), characterized by the odd frequency/time two-boson expectation value. To illustrate the concept of odd frequency BEC we present simple classification of pair boson condensates that explicitly permits this state. We point qualitative differences of odd-frequency BEC with conventional BEC and introduce the order parameter and wave function for the odd-frequency BEC.

*Introduction* Bose-Einstein condensate (BEC) is defined as a state where ground state attains the macroscopic finite expectation value of a single particle boson field  $b_a(\mathbf{r})$  [1–3]. The general case scenario so far has been described as

$$\langle b_a(\mathbf{r}) \rangle = b_0 \neq 0 \quad (1)$$

for a boson annihilation operator of state  $a$ , that can be encompassing both spin, orbital index, band or flavor. For simplicity we will assume  $a, b = 1, 2$  being orbital labels. From this basic definition the macroscopic expectation value of a single particle density matrix follows as well  $\langle b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r})b_b(\mathbf{r}') \rangle = |b_0|^2$  as  $|\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}'| \rightarrow \infty$ . At no point in this discussion one needs to invoke the time dependence of operators and of expectation values. The condensate means the steady  $b_0$  and hence time is an irrelevant variable. Numerous experiments with He4 and with cold atoms firmly establishes the phenomenon of BEC with macroscopic expectation value of a single boson field [4–6].

There are cases when single particle expectation value is zero yet there is a nontrivial order in the system. Typical example would be spin nematic, e.g. [7–11]. Classification of magnetically ordered states starts with the single spin expectations

$$\langle \mathbf{S}(\mathbf{r}) \rangle \neq 0 \quad (2)$$

. If the single spin expectations are zero this does not mean that the state is paramagnetic as nematic order is still possible. The order parameter for the magnetic nematic is a two spin correlator

$$\langle \mathbf{S}(\mathbf{r}) \rangle = 0, \langle S^i(\mathbf{r})S^j(\mathbf{r}') \rangle = Q^{ij}(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}') = Q(n^i n^j - 1/3\delta_{ij}) \quad (3)$$

with nontrivial spin structure captured by nematic vector  $\mathbf{n}$  is still possible. Moreover if one is allowed to keep track of time dependence in two spin correlator one can have even and odd-time magnetic correlations present in the spin system. The former corresponds to the conventional spin nematic state. Later ones was shown to be related to the chiral spin states [12]. Similarly one classifies possible symmetries of the BEC by exploring higher order correlations even in cases when the single boson expectation is trivially zero  $b_0 = 0$ .

Purpose of this paper is to introduce a class of BECs that is qualitatively different from the conventional BEC and involves nontrivial, i.e. *odd in time* correlations, we call it odd frequency two particle BEC. It also can be viewed as an odd frequency BEC nematic. We also will use interchangeably the term odd-frequency BEC, having in mind Matsubara representation the odd in time and odd frequency orders are identical. To make the claim we have to broaden the discussion by explicitly considering i) two boson condensate similar to the spin nematic case and ii) we need to keep track of time dependence of  $b_a(\mathbf{r}, \tau)$ . [13]. We consider

$$D_{ab}(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}'|\tau - \tau') = \langle T_\tau b_a(\mathbf{r}, \tau)b_b(\mathbf{r}', \tau') \rangle \quad (4)$$

where  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r}, \tau)$  is a function of relative coordinate and time for a translationally invariant and equilibrium states assumed here.  $T_\tau$  stands for Matsubara time ordering. It is possible to have a nontrivial BEC with  $b_0 = 0$ . Namely when two boson condensation occurs one would have

$$\langle b_a(\mathbf{r}, \tau = 0) \rangle = 0, D_{ab}(\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}'|\tau - \tau') \neq 0 \quad (5)$$

with  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r}|\tau)$  being the "nematic" version of the boson order. The notion that the zero time expectation value is zero would correctly imply that there is no single particle condensate yet it would be wrong to infer that there is no condensate. One can have a condensate of a higher order based on the fact that  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r}, \tau)$  is a nontrivial function. This function can be short ranged function of  $\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}'$  yet have finite value as a function of center of mass coordinate  $1/2(\mathbf{r} + \mathbf{r}')$ . One naturally would conclude that there is a long range order of pairs of bosons. Global  $U(1)$  gauge symmetry is explicitly broken in the state with finite  $D_{ab}$  and it describes the macroscopically coherent state:

$$b_a \rightarrow \exp(i\theta)b_a; D_{ab} \rightarrow \exp(2i\theta)D_{ab}. \quad (6)$$

The anomalous function  $D_{ab}$  can be either an *even* or an *odd* function of  $\tau$  [14]. If it is an *even* function of time we can consider its value at  $\tau = 0$  as an order parameter and we find that it corresponds to a straightforward two boson condensate. Example of this condensate would be a BEC formed of two particle molecules. If  $D_{ab}$  is an *odd* function of time  $\tau$  then we are looking at the state that has clearly broken symmetry yet has no simple equal

time correlator so we can not use as equal time correlator an order parameter as  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r}|\tau=0) = 0$ . One has to define the order parameter of this coherent state differently. Thus we point the existence of the class of two boson condensates that are bosonic analog of odd-frequency superconducting condensate. [15, 16] Symmetry proof of existence of the class of odd frequency boson nematic or two boson BEC is the main result of this paper.

*Classification* We start with classification of symmetry of boson condensates. Define orbital permutation operator  $O$  as  $OD_{ab} = D_{ba}$ . Bose statistics determines that simultaneous permutation of time ( T reversal) , coordinate inversion (P) and permutation of orbitals should leave  $D$  invariant  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau) = D_{ba}(-\mathbf{r},-\tau)$  [12]. We can write it simply as

$$PTOD_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau) = D_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau) \quad (7)$$

shorthand as  $PTO = +1$ . Thus we can define the table of all possible parities with respect to discrete symmetries discussed here:

	P	T	O
even- $\omega$	+	+	+
even- $\omega$	-	+	-
odd- $\omega$	-	-	+
odd- $\omega$	+	-	-

Table 1. Description of separate discrete properties of each of the operations P,T,O. The pair of states labeled odd- $\omega$  are the odd frequency states that satisfy basic condition  $PTO = 1$ .

There are therefore multiple condensates one can observe. For the even- $\omega$  condensates we have states that will have only even frequency harmonics and they can be represented by equal time correlators that are nonzero. They are what we call even frequency states. For example one can develop an P even T even and diagonal in orbital index order that would correspond to a on-site two boson condensate. This case, while interesting on its own, is not the focus of our discussion.

The alternative possible state that follows from this table is the odd- $\omega$  states that are also allowed. We will focus now on these so called odd-frequency states.

#### Odd-frequency two boson BEC

There is no restriction on the function  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r}|\tau)$  other than the symmetry of the condensed state. The odd-time BEC also implies that this function is odd in (Matsubara) frequency:  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau)$  can be expanded in Fourier harmonics and one can see that only odd-frequency harmonics will contribute. The detailed form of  $D_{ab}$  will be set by interactions. For simplicity consider the linear term  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau) = d_{ab}(\mathbf{r})\tau$  at small  $\tau$ . Then the *first* nontrivial expectation function at  $\tau = 0$  is the derivative

$$\partial_\tau \langle b_a(\mathbf{r},\tau)b_b(0,0) \rangle|_{\tau=0} = \partial_\tau D_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau)|_{\tau=0} = d_{ab}(\mathbf{r}). \quad (8)$$

$d_{ab}(\mathbf{r})$  shall be used as an *order parameter* for the *odd frequency* or *odd time* two particle BEC. We retain band

(species, flavor) index  $a, b = 1, 2$  explicitly. Qualitatively same results follow for a single boson species when one can ignore  $a$  dependence.

The function  $D_{ab}(\mathbf{r},\tau)$  that is odd in time is a more complicated object than  $d_{ab}(\mathbf{r})$  as it contains other information aside from its derivative at zero time. Yet this simple order parameter does capture the odd nature of the condensate and is a minimal statement one can make about the order parameter. The situation here is similar to the Ginzburg-Landau (GL) order parameter vs the full microscopic theory with the frequency dependence of the anomalous functions. In the GL sense one simply is dealing with the constant order parameter and ignores time/frequency dependence, i.e. retardation.

*Example* To evaluate the time derivative on  $b$  one needs to take a commutator with the Hamiltonian. We introduce a specific model to illustrate that our definition of the order parameter corresponds to composite condensate. We present few examples of how the odd frequency condensate and related order parameter would appear in microscopic theory. The example is meant to illustrate the consistency of definitions and not meant to be a definitive microscopic theory of composite BEC that still needs to be developed.

i) Holstein coupling of  $b$  to the classical field  $x$ :

$$H = \sum_{a,\mathbf{r}} \omega_0 b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r})b_a(\mathbf{r}) + g_a(b_a(\mathbf{r}) + b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r}))x(\mathbf{r}) + kx(\mathbf{r})^2/2 + mx^2(\mathbf{r})/2. \quad (9)$$

For the displacement  $x$  we assume that the equilibrium position is at  $\langle x \rangle_{g_a=0} = 0$ , evaluated for the nonperturbed Hamiltonian of dispersive interactions. Both  $b_a$  and  $x$  are fields that depend on coordinate  $\mathbf{r}$ . We have

$$\partial_\tau \langle b_a(\mathbf{r},\tau)b_b(0,0) \rangle|_{\tau=0} = d_{ab}(\mathbf{r}) \propto g_a \langle x(\mathbf{r},0)b_b(0,0) \rangle_{\tau=0}. \quad (10)$$

where we used equations of motion  $\partial_\tau b_a \sim \omega_0 b_a + g_a x$ . The *composite* condensate of  $\langle x b_a \rangle$ , while neither  $x$  nor  $b$  itself are ordered,  $\langle x \rangle = \langle b_a \rangle = 0$  is the order parameter of odd-frequency BEC in  $\langle b_a b_b \rangle$ .

For completeness, we also discuss the wave function for this odd frequency condensate. As in the case for odd frequency superconductors one might ask the question about the wave function that describes the condensate [17, 18]. In the steady state the wave function would contain no time dependence even for odd frequency condensate. We use the order parameter for odd frequency two particle BEC:  $d_{ab}(\mathbf{r}) = g_a \langle x(\mathbf{r})b_a(\mathbf{r}) \rangle$ . The natural choice is the polaron like wave function that describes the coherent state with macroscopic condensation of composite boson  $\partial_\tau b_a(\mathbf{r},\tau) \hat{x}(\mathbf{r})$ . It takes the form

$$|\Psi\rangle \sim \exp\left[\sum_{a,\mathbf{r}} (\lambda_a(\mathbf{r})b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r})\hat{x}(\mathbf{r}) - \hat{x}^2(\mathbf{r})/2\sigma)\right]|0\rangle \quad (11)$$

The first term generates the coherent states of the  $x b_a(\mathbf{r})$  and second term is introduced to keep the expectation

value  $\langle x(\mathbf{r}) \rangle$  finite;  $\lambda_a$  and  $\sigma$  are the variational parameters that would determine conditions for the formation of such composite condensate. Direct evaluation shows  $\langle \Psi | b_a(\mathbf{r}) x(\mathbf{r}) | \Psi \rangle \sim \lambda_a(\mathbf{r}) \langle 0 | x(\mathbf{r}) | 0 \rangle$ , where  $\lambda_a(\mathbf{r})$  being the condensate wave function (explicit position dependence would be a consequence of the external confining potential. Thus we verify that odd-frequency two particle BEC is related to conventional composite BEC  $\langle x b_a \rangle$ .

Using these wave functions we can prove that the composite condensate and odd frequency BEC forms a class, orthogonal to conventional BECs with same quantum numbers of the condensates. The wave function of conventional BEC is  $|\Psi_0\rangle \sim \exp[\sum_{\mathbf{r}} \nu_a(\mathbf{r}) b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r})] |0\rangle$ . By direct inspection one finds that  $\langle \Psi_0 | \Psi \rangle = 0$ ; conventional single boson BEC is orthogonal to the state in Eq.(11), as long as  $\langle \Psi | x(\mathbf{r}) | \Psi \rangle = 0$ . This example supports the view that proposed *odd frequency* BEC is a novel kind of Bose condensate  $\langle x b_a \rangle$  and without need to have a single boson condensate.

So far the claims we made are a consequence of the symmetries. The logic to proceed would be same as in conventional BEC: functions  $\lambda_a(\mathbf{r})$  can be obtained from solving microscopic theory using Eq.(11) as a variational wave function. Any model with nonzero  $\lambda_a$  in the ground state would support composite BEC as a ground state phenomenon. More precise statements will be made once we have a detailed microscopic model that generates the composite condensate.

ii) two layer BEC. Consider the case where the band index  $a, b$  representing the layer index that bosons can occupy. The Hamiltonian is:

$$H = \sum_{a,b,\mathbf{k}} \varepsilon_a(\mathbf{k}) b_{a,\mathbf{k}}^\dagger b_{a,\mathbf{k}} + \sum_{a,b,\mathbf{r}} V_{ab} n_a(\mathbf{r}) n_b(\mathbf{r}) + t(b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r}) b_b(\mathbf{r}) + h.c.) \quad (12)$$

with boson boson interaction  $V_{ab}$  and interlayer tunneling  $t$ . Now, assuming there is no conventional BEC in each layer:  $\langle b_a \rangle = 0$ , consider the case of odd-frequency intralayer BEC. Then the nonzero two particle correlation is diagonal in layer index and odd in time  $D_{aa}(\mathbf{r}|\tau)$ , as in Eq(8). Assuming linear term in  $\tau = 0$  suffice we get (keeping only relevant terms):

$$\partial_\tau b_a(\mathbf{r}, \tau) \sim t b_b(\mathbf{r}, \tau) \quad (13)$$

and the order parameter of the odd frequency in layer BEC is

$$d_{aa}(\mathbf{r}) \sim t \langle b_a(\mathbf{r}) b_b(\mathbf{r}) \rangle. \quad (14)$$

The odd-frequency *intralayer* two particle BEC is equivalent to the interlayer two particle even frequency BEC. The wave function corresponding to the odd-frequency BEC in this case will be a simple coherent state or paired bosons on both layers  $\Psi \sim \exp(\lambda \sum_{\mathbf{r}} b_a^\dagger(\mathbf{r}) b_b^\dagger(\mathbf{r}))$ . This example demonstrates the consistency of the formalism of odd frequency two particle BEC and relates its order parameter to conventional two boson condensate. The

situation here resembles the case of multiband superconductors where direct interband hybridization induces the odd-frequency superconducting component [20], for a review see [21]. Here the interlayer tunneling  $t$  also plays the role of interband hybridization and allows nonzero odd-frequency BEC.

We comment on the feasibility to realize this odd frequency two boson BEC. The composite nature of the condensate in case of odd frequency BEC makes it difficult to realize. The fact that there is a multiparticle condensate would mean restrictions additional constraints on the phase space that need to be satisfied. One finds it is difficult to create odd frequency two boson condensate or, equivalent, composite bose condensate without creating single particle condensate. One natural route to the creation of composite condensate would be BEC proximity effects. In the presence of the media that possess extra low energy excitations the conventional BEC that will tunnel will get dressed by these low energy excitations and will develop odd frequency component. Interlayer coupling is one such example. We are in the process of developing this model. Another obvious next step is the search for microscopic models that allow the formation of odd-frequency BEC in cold atoms BEC with multiple bosonic species. The tunability of interactions and ability to create multiple species with tunable interactions would make this these systems a promising candidate for odd frequency pair BEC realization. At present we do not have a model that supports two bosong BEC as a ground state. We therefore have to limit ourselves here to the purely symmetry discussion and leave questions of a microscopic model for a separate discussion.

*Conclusion* We point the existence of a new class of two boson condensate that is an odd-frequency BEC or odd-frequency nematic BEC. This new class of boson nematic condensate adds to the growing list of other odd-frequency states like odd frequency superconductors [15] and odd-frequency spin nematic [12]. Various odd-frequency states point to the existence of whole parallel realm of largely unexplored odd-frequency many body ordered states in addition to conventional even-frequency states. Promising candidate models that could support odd-frequency BEC nematic would be proximate structures where interband or interlayer hybridization and tunneling induced this novel condensate. Investigation of realistic microscopic models would further elucidate the conditions for existence and nature of of odd-frequency BEC.

*Acknowledgements* Discussions with E. Abrahams, R. Barnett, A. Black-Schaffer Y. Kedem, F. Mancarella are gratefully acknowledged. Work at NORDITA was supported by VR 621-2012-2983 and ERC-DM-321031. Work at Los Alamos was supported by the Office of Basic Energy Sciences. Los Alamos National Laboratory, an affirmative action equal opportunity employer, is operated by Los Alamos National Security, LLC, for the National Nuclear Security Administration of the U.S. Department of Energy under contract DE-AC52-06NA25396.

- 
- [1] Bose, S. N. "Plancks Gesetz und Lichtquantenhy-  
pothese". Zeitschrift für Physik **26**, 178, (1924).  
doi:10.1007/BF01327326.
- [2] Einstein, A. "Quantentheorie des einatomigen idealen  
Gases". Sitzungsberichte der Preussischen Akademie der  
Wissenschaften **1**, 3.(1925).
- [3] Landau, L. D. "The theory of Superfluidity of Helium 111".  
J. Phys. USSR **5**, 71, (1941). L. Landau . "Theory of the  
Superfluidity of Helium II". Physical Review **60** (4), 356  
(1941). doi:10.1103/PhysRev.60.356.
- [4] M.H. Anderson, J.R. Ensher, M.R. Matthews, C.E. Wie-  
man, and E.A. Cornell, "Observation of Bose Einstein  
Condensation in a Dilute Atomic Vapor". Science **269**  
(5221), 198, (1995). doi:10.1126/science.269.5221.198.
- [5] C. C. Bradley, C. A. Sackett, J. J. Tollett, and  
R. G. Hulet, "Evidence of Bose Einstein Conden-  
sation in an Atomic Gas with Attractive Interac-  
tions". Physical Review Letters **75** (9), 1687 (1995).  
doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.75.1687.
- [6] K.B. Davis, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. **75** (1995) 3969.
- [7] A.F. Andreev and I.A. Grishchuk, Sov. Phys. JETP **60**,  
267 (1984) [Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz. **87**, 467 (1984)].
- [8] A. V. Chubukov, Phys. Rev. **B 44**, 4693 (1991).
- [9] L. Gorkov and A. Sokol, JETP Lett, **52**, 504, (1990).
- [10] D. Podolsky and E. Demler, New J. Phys, **7**, 59, (2005).
- [11] T. Momoi et al, Phys. Rev. Lett., **108**, 057206, (2012).
- [12] A.V. Balatsky and E. Abrahams, Phys. Rev. Lett. **74**,  
1004, (1995).
- [13] The Matsubara time  $\tau$  is defined on a finite range  $0 \leq$   
 $\tau \leq \beta$ ,  $\beta = 1/T$ . The Bose statistics dictates that  $b_a(\mathbf{r}, \tau)$   
is a periodic function of  $\tau \rightarrow \tau + \beta$ .
- [14] Simple inspection shows that being odd in  $\tau$  and periodic  
in  $\beta$  does pose some constraints on the possible functions  
but there are functions that satisfy both, e.g.  $f(\tau) =$   
 $\sin(2\pi\tau/\beta)$ .
- [15] Berezinskii V. L. JETP Lett. **20** 287, (1974).
- [16] Balatsky A and Abrahams E, Phys. Rev. **B 45**, 13125,  
(1992).
- [17] Abrahams E, Balatsky A, Scalapino D J and Schrieffer J  
R, Phys. Rev. **B 52** 1271, (1995).
- [18] Hari P Dahal et al, Wave function for odd-frequency su-  
perconductors, New J. Phys. **11** 065005, (2009).
- [19] We allow for spatially inhomogeneous condensate as is  
the case in the cold atom traps.
- [20] Annica M. Black-Schaffer and Alexander V. Balatsky,  
"Odd-frequency superconducting pairing in multiband  
superconductors", Phys. Rev. **B 88**, 104514 (2013).
- [21] Yukio Tanaka, Masatoshi Sato, and Naoto Nagaosa,  
"Symmetry and Topology in Superconductors - Odd-  
Frequency Pairing and Edge States," J. Phys. Soc. Jpn.  
**81**, 011013 (2012)