

A SHORT PROOF THAT MINIMAL SETS OF PLANAR ORDINARY DIFFERENTIAL EQUATIONS ARE TRIVIAL

IDO BRIGHT

ABSTRACT. We present a short proof, relying on the divergence theorem, verifying that minimal sets in the plane are trivial.

1. INTRODUCTION

We consider the ordinary differential equation in the plane defined by

$$(1.1) \quad \frac{d\mathbf{x}}{dt} = \mathbf{f}(\mathbf{x}),$$

where $\mathbf{f} : \mathbb{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^2$ is a locally Lipschitz function. (Although, we only use uniqueness with respect to initial conditions of (1.1) and the continuity of \mathbf{f} .)

A minimal set is a nonempty closed invariant set, which is minimal with respect inclusions. A trivial minimal set is a set that is the image of either a stationary solution or a periodic solution.

We present a new short proof of the following well known result.

Theorem 1. *Any minimal set of (1.1) either corresponds to a stationary solution or to the image of a periodic solution, namely, all minimal sets are trivial.*

The text-book proof of this theorem relies on the Poincaré–Bendixson theorem, and employs dynamical arguments. The proof presented in this paper relies on a different argument, relying on a property of the velocity of Jordan curves. This idea was introduced in [1] and further developed in [2, 3].

2. PROOF OF MAIN RESULT

In the proof of the main result we use the following notation. The 2-dimensional euclidean space is denoted by \mathbb{R}^2 , and the norm of a vector $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^2$ is denoted by $|\mathbf{y}|$. The open ball in \mathbb{R}^2 , centered at \mathbf{y} with radius r , is denoted by $B(\mathbf{y}, r)$. The closure of an open set $O \subset \mathbb{R}^2$ is denoted by \bar{O} , its boundary by ∂O , and its exterior normal and tangent vector at the point $\mathbf{y} \in \partial O$ are denoted by $\mathbf{N}_{\partial O}(\mathbf{y})$ and $\mathbf{T}_{\partial O}(\mathbf{y})$, respectively.

We shall use the following results that are well known in the smooth case.

Lemma 2. *Let $O \subset \mathbb{R}^2$ be a bounded open set with rectifiable boundary. Then*

$$\mathbf{v} = \int_{\partial O} \mathbf{N}_{\partial O}(\mathbf{y}) \, d\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{0} \in \mathbb{R}^2.$$

Proof. Assume in contradiction that $\mathbf{v} \neq \mathbf{0}$, and set $\mathbf{g} : \mathbb{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^2$ by $\mathbf{g} \equiv \frac{\mathbf{v}}{|\mathbf{v}|}$. The divergence theorem for sets of finite perimeter (see, e.g., [4]) implies that

$$|\mathbf{v}| = \frac{\mathbf{v}}{|\mathbf{v}|} \cdot \mathbf{v} = \left| \int_{\partial O} \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{y}) \mathbf{N}_{\partial O}(\mathbf{y}) \, d\mathbf{y} \right| = \left| \int_O \nabla \cdot \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{y}) \, d\mathbf{y} \right| = 0,$$

in contradiction. □

The following lemma appears in [5].

Lemma 3. *Suppose $I \subset \mathbb{R}$ is a bounded interval and $g : I \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is a Lipschitz function. Then for almost every $r \in \mathbb{R}$ the set $g^{-1}(r) = \{t \in I \mid g(t) = r\}$ is finite.*

To prove the main theorem, let us now fix a minimal set $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^2$ and a solution $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ of (1.1), defined on $[0, \infty)$, with trajectory contained in Ω .

We shall also use the following well known fact.

Lemma 4. *For every $\mathbf{y}_0 \in \Omega$ and $\delta > 0$ there exists $t > s$ such that $|\mathbf{x}^*(t) - \mathbf{y}_0| < \delta$.*

Proof. Otherwise, suppose that the lemma does not hold for some \mathbf{y}_0, δ and s . Then the curve $\mathbf{y}^*(t) = \mathbf{x}^*(s+t)$ is a solution of (1.1) with trajectory contained in $\Omega \setminus B(\mathbf{y}_0, \delta)$ for a suitable $\delta > 0$, in contradiction to the minimality of Ω . \square

If Ω is not a singleton we choose $D > 0$ such that $\Omega \setminus B(\mathbf{x}^*(0), 3D) \neq \emptyset$ and apply the following construction:

Construction 5. *Set $\delta_0 = D$ and t_0 as the first time point where $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ meets $\partial B(\mathbf{x}^*(0), \delta_0)$. For $i = 1, 2, \dots$ do the following:*

- (1) *Choose $\delta_i < \delta_{i-1}/2$ small enough, such that $|\mathbf{x}^*(0) - \mathbf{x}^*(t)| > \delta_i$ for all $t \in [t_0, t_{i-1}]$.*
- (2) *Set t_i as the first time point after t_0 where the curve $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ meets $\partial B(\mathbf{x}^*(0), \delta_i)$. (Here we use Lemma 4).*
- (3) *Starting from $\mathbf{x}^*(t_i)$ follow the line connecting it to $\mathbf{x}^*(0)$, until first meeting a point in $\mathbf{x}^*([0, t_0])$. Let $\mathbf{x}^*(s_i)$ be this point.*
- (4) *Let γ_i be the parametrized Jordan curve obtained by following the curve $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ in the interval $[s_i, t_i]$ and then the line connecting its endpoints, with velocity of norm 1.*

Lemma 6. *If $t_i \rightarrow t^*$ then $\mathbf{x}^*(0) = \mathbf{x}^*(t^*)$, and $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ is a periodic solution with image Ω .*

Proof. According to our construction $|\mathbf{x}^*(0) - \mathbf{x}^*(t_i)| = \delta_i < 2^{-i}D$ for every i . Hence, by continuity $\mathbf{x}^*(t^*) = \mathbf{x}^*(0)$, and $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ is periodic. By the minimality of Ω , the image of $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$ is Ω . \square

Proof of Theorem 1. Clearly, Ω is a singleton if and only if it contains a point $\mathbf{y} \in \Omega$ such that $\mathbf{f}(\mathbf{y}) = \mathbf{0}$. In this case and when the condition of Lemma 6 holds, we are done. Thus, we assume that \mathbf{f} does not vanish in Ω and that $t_i \rightarrow \infty$.

Fix $\mathbf{y}_0 \in \Omega$ such that $|\mathbf{y}_0 - \mathbf{x}^*(0)| > 2D$. Using Lemma 3 we fix an arbitrary small ball $B = B(\mathbf{y}_0, r_0)$, such that $r_0 < D$, and that $\{0 \leq t \leq s \mid |\mathbf{x}^*(t) - \mathbf{y}_0| = r_0\}$ is finite for every $s > 0$. Note that this implies that for every i the Jordan curve γ_i intersects ∂B at a finite number of points, and that the portion of γ_i in B corresponds to the trajectory $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$.

For every i we denote the interior of γ_i by O_i , and, using the identity

$$\partial(O_i \cap B) \subset (\partial O_i \cap B) \cup (O_i \cap \partial B) \cup (\partial O_i \cap \partial B),$$

we obtain, by Lemma 2, that

$$\mathbf{0} = \int_{\partial(O_i \cap B)} \mathbf{N}_{\partial(O_i \cap B)}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y} = \int_{\partial O_i \cap B} \mathbf{N}_{\partial O_i}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y} - \int_{O_i \cap \partial B} \mathbf{N}_{\partial B}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y},$$

since $\partial O_i \cap \partial B$ has zero measure. This bounds

$$(2.1) \quad \left| \int_{\partial O_i \cap B} \mathbf{N}_{\partial O_i}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y} \right| = \left| \int_{O_i \cap \partial B} \mathbf{N}_{\partial B}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y} \right| \leq \left| \int_{O_i \cap \partial B} |\mathbf{N}_{\partial B}(\mathbf{y})| d\mathbf{y} \right| \leq 2\pi r_0.$$

For each i the set $\partial O_i \cap B$ contains a finite number of arcs, and applying a change of variable it is easy to see that

$$\int_{\partial O_i \cap B} \mathbf{N}_{\partial O_i}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y} = P_i \int_{\partial O_i \cap B} \mathbf{T}_{\partial O_i}(\mathbf{y}) d\mathbf{y} = P_i \int_{\{t \leq t_i \mid \mathbf{x}^*(t) \in B\}} \frac{d}{dt} \mathbf{x}^*(t) dt,$$

where $\mathbf{T}_{\partial O_i}$ is chosen to agree with the direction of γ_i , and P_i is a $\frac{\pi}{2}$ -rotation matrix. Here we use the fact that the portion of γ_i in B corresponds to the original trajectory $\mathbf{x}^*(\cdot)$.

Combined with (2.1) we conclude that for every i

$$\left| \int_{\{t \leq t_i \mid \mathbf{x}^*(t) \in B\}} \mathbf{f}(\mathbf{x}^*(t)) dt \right| \leq 2\pi r_0.$$

The minimality of Ω and Lemma 4 implies that the set $\{t \mid \mathbf{x}^*(t) \in B\}$ has infinite measure. This implies that $\mathbf{0}$ is contained in the convex hull of $\{\mathbf{f}(\mathbf{y}) \mid \mathbf{y} \in \bar{B}\}$. The radius r_0 can be chosen arbitrary small, thus, the continuity of \mathbf{f} implies that $\mathbf{f}(\mathbf{y}_0) = \mathbf{0}$, in contradiction.

REFERENCES

- [1] Z. Artsein and I. Bright. Periodic optimization suffices for infinite horizon planar optimal control. *SIAM Journal on Control and Optimization*, 48:4963–4986, 2010.
- [2] I. Bright. A reduction of topological infinite-horizon optimization to periodic optimization in a class of compact 2-manifolds. *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications*, 394(1):84 – 101, 2012.
- [3] I. Bright and J.M. Lee. Bounds for flux integrals over regular domains. *Submitted*.
- [4] W.F. Pfeffer. *The Divergence Theorem and the Sets of Finite Perimeter*, volume 303. CRC Press, 2012.
- [5] J.C. Wells. A note on a corollary of sard’s theorem. *Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society*, 48(2):513–514, 1975.

□

DEPARTMENT OF APPLIED MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF WASHINGTON.