

# Reply to "Comment on 'Piezonuclear decay of thorium' [Phys. Lett. A 373 (2009) 1956]" by L. Kowalski

Fabio Cardone <sup>1</sup>, Roberto Mignani <sup>2,3,\*</sup>, Andrea Petrucci <sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Istituto per lo Studio dei Materiali Nanostrutturati (ISMN - CNR)  
Via dei Taurini - 00185 Roma, Italy

<sup>2</sup>Dipartimento di Fisica E. Amaldi, Università degli Studi Roma Tre  
Via della Vasca Navale, 84 - 00146 Roma, Italy

<sup>3</sup>INFN Sezione di Roma Tre, Italy

\* Corresponding author: mignani@fis.uniroma3.it

## Abstract

In a paper appearing in this issue of Physics Letters A, Kowalski raises some critical comments on the experiment [F. Cardone, R. Mignani, A. Petrucci, Phys. Lett. A 373 (2009) 1956] that we carried out by cavitating a solution of thorium-228. The experiment highlighted the anomalous decay of thorium, thus confirming the results previously obtained by Urutskoev et al. by explosion of titanium foils in solutions. In this Letter, we reply to these comments. We agree with Kowalski that critical comments are one of the key factors of the process to improve the quality of experiments and the interpretation of results. However we do hope that these comments together with the details provided in the replies will promote further and better experiments which are certainly worth performing in order to shed a brighter light on this issue, as Kowalski himself suggests in his comment.

## 1 Reply to comments

In the article 'Comments on "Piezonuclear decay of thorium"' appeared on this same issue of Physics Letters A [1] Kowalski puts forward some remarks and suggestions about our work on the possible effects of cavitation on Thorium-228 [2]. The author highlights what he thinks are the possible shortcomings of the paper [2] and gives us the chance to provide some more clarifications. We will follow his manuscript and try to give an

answer or more details as we encounter his remarks. However, first of all we want to complain about the fact that, after reading a few times the text of the comment, it looks like that the author completely ignored our reply [3] to the comment by Ericsson et al. [4] where he would have found out more information and suggestions that would have helped him in interpreting the results in a more comprehensive way. In the introduction the author mentions the fact that Marie Curie and her contemporaries tried to speed up alpha emission by different types of effects without achieving any success. The purpose of the experiments that we have conducted so far with ultrasounds, cavitation and shock-waves [5, 6, 7, 8, 9] has never been devoted to speed up alpha emission, although the experiment with Thorium might seem to be aimed at this target. It has turned out that cavitation is able to generate locally very peculiar conditions of pressure, temperature and energy density that bring about new phenomena like, for instance, sonoluminescence and other anomalous effects which seem to involve atomic species at their nuclear level [10]. Although some researchers frown at these phenomena due to, they say, the lack of convincing proofs, we think that they are worth of being studied as they are likely to be the tip of the iceberg of a completely new physics. The decision of subjecting to cavitation a solution of Thorium was based on three experimental evidences: the anomalous transmutations that we detected in solutions subjected to cavitation [7, 8, 9], the emission of bursts of neutrons detected from iron solutions treated by cavitation [5, 6] and the evidences achieved by Russian teams [11, 12] of the modified secular equilibrium of Thorium in solutions subjected to electric explosions of Titanium thin wires. Our target, in carrying out these experiments with Thorium, was only to check whether cavitation, that brings about anomalous transmutations and emission of neutrons from solution of stable elements, might affect Thorium as well and produce effects similar to those induced by electric explosions of the Russian teams. Moreover, we would like to add that according to some predictions of our theory [13, 14] all of these anomalous effects (anomalous transmutations, emission of neutrons from Iron, and all of the evidences collected in 20 years of low energy nuclear reactions [10]) need very precise local condition to take place, in terms of energy density and time of release of this energy, which are not easy at all to be simultaneously achieved. From this perspective, the attempts to speed up alpha emission carried out between the end of the XIX and the beginning of the XX century were very unlikely to be systematically successful because of the difficulty to make out these effects among other more evident phenomena. The first and main remark of Kowalski is about the reduction of the concentration of Thorium and the chance that this reduction might be due to a redistribution of the atoms of Thorium rather than its transmutation. In particular he suggests that "*Cavitation generates reactive chemical species like ozone or hydrogen peroxide. This leads to progressive accumulation of thorium on available surfaces, such as inner walls of the glass container, or the cavitator. If this were to happen then the solution removed from the vessel, after the treatment, would indeed be less concentrated than the solution before the treatment*".

The hypothesis that the Thorium was deposited on the walls on the vessel is legitimate

and indeed we thought of it. However, the convective motions of the liquid in the vessel induced by ultrasounds formed a continuous flow all along the walls and the surface of the sonotrode that prevented the atomic species from being adsorbed on them<sup>1</sup>. This consideration, supported by the evidences of these convective flows, convinced us that the hypothesis of adsorption could be put off to future and more accurate investigations. The author complains about the lack of information on the etching procedure of CR39. They were etched by a solution of NaOH 6.5N at a temperature of 90 degrees centigrade for 4.5 hours. In replying to this request we refer, as well, to the last statement of the author that complains about the sentence in our manuscript [2] in which we talked about CR39 and alpha particles and said "a polycarbonate whose energy calibration is just designed to detect those emitted by Radon-222". This sentence, which is indeed too short, and hence generated the remark, has to be interpreted by referring the calibration not to the CR39, but to the etching procedure which was suggested by the manufacturer in order to obtain tracks comparable to those on the CR39 chips provided as calibration reference and irradiated by Radon-222. In a further remark, the author complains about the lack of information on the measured track densities. We inspected the CR39 chips by an optical microscope, but concentrated on the "star-shaped" tracks only in order to establish that their shape and features were all compatible on the different chips. The decision to pay attention only to the "star-shaped" tracks finds its reason in the details provided in order to answer another remark of Kowalski. This remark is about these "star-shaped" tracks on the CR39 which are brought about by 5 alpha particles emitted during the decay chain of Thorium-228 down to Lead-208.

Kowalski says that in a agitated liquid containing Thorium, unlike in a solid, the tracks on the CR39 are not likely to be "star-shaped" because, due to the shaking of the solution, a nucleus of Thorium would be separated from its daughter nuclides and hence the emitted five alpha particles from Thorium-228 and its daughters down to the stable Lead-208 would not hit the CR39 on the same spot. This remark refers to an issue which was considered at length before defining the most suitable procedure to detect unmistakably by CR39 the tracks of Thorium. We knew that on the CR39 surface, after etching, there would be both tracks due to alpha particles of the natural background radioactivity and the tracks due to the alpha particles of Thorium. Although 0.03 ppb of Thorium in 250 ml of deionised bidistilled water mean an activity of about  $10^{-6}$  Ci which is 3 to 5 orders of magnitude higher than the natural radioactivity of water, one has to consider that the range of alpha particle of 5 MeV in water is about 40 microns. This circumstance radically reduces the volume of the solution that surrounds the upper free side of the CR39<sup>2</sup> and hence reduces the number of Thorium atoms which can produce tracks. All considered and estimated, we understood that, had we based our comparisons

---

<sup>1</sup>In our previous works [5, 6] we specified that the vessel was suitably chosen to be a true reaction chamber that would contribute to the generate the cavitation in its central part between the sonotrode tip and the bottom of the chamber and would contribute to produce convective motions along the lateral walls and the bottom. Vessels of different shape and dimension were tested and examined for the purpose.

<sup>2</sup>We remind that the CR39 chip was inside the vessel, laid horizontally on its bottom and aligned with the

among the differently treated CR39 chips on the density of tracks, it might have been hard to achieve a sufficiently clear picture.

Thus we decided to base our measurement on the number of the unmistakable star-shaped tracks and hence designed a measurement protocol that allowed the formation of these peculiar tracks. We will briefly illustrate this protocol here. Let's focus our attention on the CR39 chip in the vessel with non cavitated solution and on the CR39 chip in the vessel with cavitated solution. The two vessels were prepared at the same time and as soon as they were ready we began the cavitation of one of them. The cavitation lasted 90 minutes and the two vessels were kept in two separate rooms. In the non cavitated vessel the solution was, of course, still for 90 minutes. At the end these 90 minutes we turned off the ultrasounds and took out the CR39 chip from the non cavitated solution being careful to leave a layer of solution on the upper side of it. We let this layer evaporate. As to the CR39 chip in the cavitated solution, we did not take it out at the end of the 90 minutes but waited for further 90 minutes since we wanted the solution to cool and be still as it had been still the non cavitated one in order to let the heavy Thorium atoms to deposit as it must have happened in the other solution. After these further 90 minutes we took out the CR39 chip from the solution as we had done for the non cavitated sample and let the layer evaporate. As the liquid evaporated, some atoms of Thorium deposited on the upper surface of the CR39 and together with its daughter nuclides produced on the same spot the "star-shaped" tracks. The last remarks of Kowalski is about the activity of the solutions that we used and the lack of information about the special equipment for handling highly radioactive liquid sources. He estimated that the activity of our solutions was 1 Ci per litre. This is a huge activity indeed, but certainly not the activity of our solutions which was between  $10^{-5}$  and  $10^{-6}$  Ci for 250 ml (calculated and measured). We would like to point out that this value of activity is compatible with that of the radioactive sources which do not require the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) licence to be handled and can be sold to the general public. We reckon that the author must have misinterpreted the concentration of Thorium which is 0.03 ppb (part per billion) that is 0.03 micro grams of Thorium in 1 litre of solution. As to the precautions adopted to work with these solutions, we certainly complied with all the security measures, but we reckon that this information is of no use in a scientific letter. Nevertheless, we report here that these experiments were conducted in collaboration with the Italian Army at the Nuclear-Chemical-Bacteriological facilities. We planned and supervised the experiments and interpreted its results, but most of the operations were carried out by authorised and trained personnel in a hot cells.

---

sonotrode tip.

## 2 Conclusions

We certainly agree with the author that critical comments contribute to improve the quality of further experiments and their interpretations. However, together with him we reckon that "they are no substitute for additional experiments". Even if he were convinced by the arguments that we presented in [2] and by the convergence of our results [2] with those obtained by Russian teams [11, 12], further and better experiments must be performed. We do hope that these comments and replies with additional details will encourage other research teams to experiment and not just comment on this issue in order to obtain further indications either in agreement or in disproof.

## References

- [1] L. Kowalski, Phys. Lett. A (this issue).
- [2] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, A. Petrucci, Phys. Lett. A 373 (2009) 1956-1958.
- [3] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, A. Petrucci, Phys. Lett. A 373 (2009) 3797-3800.
- [4] G. Ericsson, S. Pomp, H. Sjstrand, E. Traneus, Phys. Lett. A 373 (2009) 3795-3796.
- [5] F. Cardone, G. Cherubini, A. Petrucci, Phys. Lett. A 373 (2009) 862
- [6] F. Cardone, G. Cherubini, R. Mignani, W. Perconti, A. Petrucci, F. Rosetto, G. Spera, Ann. Fond. L. de Broglie, (in press), arXiv:0710.5115.
- [7] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, Int. J. Mod. Phys. B 17, 307 (2003).
- [8] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, W. Perconti, E. Pessa, G. Spera, Jour. Radioanalytical Nucl. Chem. 265, 151 (2005).
- [9] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, W. Perconti, E. Pessa, G. Spera, Gravitation and Cosmology 11, 1-2 (41-42) (2005).
- [10] E. Storms, The Science of Low Energy Nuclear Reaction - A Comprehensive Compilation of Evidence and Explanations about Cold Fusion. World Scientific, Singapore (2007).
- [11] L.I. Urutskoev, V.I. Liksonov, V.G. Tsinoev, Ann. Fond. L. de Broglie 27, 701 (2002).
- [12] A.G. Volkovich, A.P. Govorum, A.A. Gulyaev, S.V. Zhukov, V.L. Kuznetsov, A.A. Rukhadze, A.V. Steblevskii, L.L. Urutskoev, Ann. Fond. L. de Broglie, 30, 1, (2005).
- [13] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, Energy and Geometry, World Scientific, Singapore, (2004).
- [14] F. Cardone, R. Mignani, Deformed Spacetime, Springer, Heidelberg-Dordrecht, (2007).