# The Carina Project: II. Stellar Populations ${ }^{1}$ 

M. Monelli ${ }^{1,2}$, L. Pulone ${ }^{1}$, C. E. Corsi ${ }^{1}$, M. Castellani ${ }^{1}$, G. Bono ${ }^{1}$, A. R. Walker ${ }^{3}$, E. Brocato $^{4}$, R. Buonanno ${ }^{1,2}$, F. Caputo ${ }^{1}$, V. Castellani ${ }^{1,5}$, M. Dall'Ora ${ }^{1,2}$, M. Marconi ${ }^{6}$, M. Nonino ${ }^{7}$, V. Ripepi ${ }^{6}$, H. A. Smith ${ }^{8}$<br>1. INAF - Osservatorio Astronomico di Roma, via Frascati 33, 00040 Monte Porzio Catone, Italy; bono, buonanno, caputo, corsi, dallora, mkast, monelli, pulone, vittorio@mporzio.astro.it<br>2. Università Tor Vergata, Via della Ricerca Scientifica 1, 00133 Rome, Italy<br>3. Cerro Tololo Inter-American Observatory, National Optical Astronomy Observatories ${ }^{2}$, Casilla 603, La Serena, Chile; awalker@noao.edu<br>4. INAF - Osservatorio Astronomico di Teramo, via M. Maggini, 64100 Teramo, Italy; brocato@te.astro.it<br>5. INFN - Sezione di Ferrara, via Paradiso 12, 44100 Ferrara, Italy.<br>6. INAF - Osservatorio Astronomico di Capodimonte, via Moiariello 16, 80131 Napoli, Italy; marcella, ripepi@na.astro.it<br>7. INAF - Osservatorio Astronomico di Trieste, via G.B. Tiepolo 11, 40131 Trieste, Italy; nonino@ts.astro.it<br>8. Dept. of Physics and Astronomy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI 48824, USA; smith@pa.msu.edu

[^0]
#### Abstract

We present a new (V,B-V) Color-Magnitude Diagram (CMD) of the Carina dwarf spheroidal (dSph) that extends from the tip of the Red Giant Branch (RGB) down to $V \sim 25$ mag. Data were collected with the Wide Field Imager (WFI) available at 2.2 m ESO/MPI telescope and cover an area of $\approx 0.3$ degree $^{2}$ around the center of the galaxy. We confirm the occurrence of a substantial amount of old stars with ages around 11 Gyr , together with an intermediate-age population around 5 Gyr (Smecker-Hane et al. 1994,1996; Hurley-Keller, Mateo, \& Nemec 1998). Moreover, we also detected a new well-defined blue plume of young Main-Sequence (MS) stars with an age at most of the order of 1 Gyr. This finding is further supported by the detection of a sizable sample of Anomalous Cepheids (ACs), whose occurrence can be understood in terms of stars with ages $\approx 0.6 \mathrm{Gyr}$. The evidence for such a young population appears at odds with current cosmological models which predict that the most recent star formation (SF) episodes in dSph should have taken place 2-3 Gyr ago. At odds with previous results available in the literature we found that stars along the RGB of the old and of the intermediate-age stellar population indicate a mean metallicity roughly equal to $\mathrm{Z}=0.0004([F e / H] \approx-1.7)$ and a small dispersion around this value. This finding is further strengthened by the reduced spread in luminosity of RR Lyrae and Horizontal Branch (HB) stars in the old stellar population and of the Red Clump ( RC ) in the intermediate-age one.

We find evidence for a smooth spatial distribution of the intermediate-age stellar population ( $\approx 5 \mathrm{Gyr}$ ), which appears more centrally concentrated than the oldest one ( $\approx 11 \mathrm{Gyr}$ ). The radial distribution of the old population appears more clumpy, with a peak off-centered by $\approx 2$ arcmin when compared with the Carina center. Star counts show a well-defined shoulder in the North-East direction along both the minor and the major axis. Current data do not allow us to assess whether this feature is the the break in the slope of star count profiles predicted by Johnston, Sigurdsson \& Hernquist (1999).


Subject headings: galaxies: formation - galaxies: individual: Carina - galaxies: Local Group - galaxies: structures - stars: evolution

## 1. Introduction

The dSph galaxies are key stellar systems in several long-standing astrophysical problems (Gallagher \& Wyse 1994; Mateo 1998, hereinafter M98; van den Bergh 2000), and are fundamental laboratories to investigate the evolutionary history of Local Group (LG) galaxies. According to the evidence of a rather large population of RR Lyrae variables, these systems were early considered as a sort of nearby low-density globular clusters. However, more recent investigations have already revealed that several dSphs have experienced a much more complex evolutionary history than Galactic Globular Clusters (GGCs) do (see e.g. Da Costa 1999). The stellar population content of dwarf galaxies has thus become a target of great relevance.

However, the limited area covered by astronomical detectors hampered for a long time an exhaustive investigation of these extended celestial objects. During the last few years the use of wide field detectors has provided an opportunity to sample the bulk of their stellar populations. To take advantage of such an opportunity we planned to use the WFI available at $2.2 \mathrm{~m} \mathrm{ESO} / \mathrm{MPI}$ telescope to investigate stellar populations in Carina. The main idea is to supply a complete census of both static and variable stars by collecting time series data covering the pulsation cycle of evolved variables such as RR Lyrae and Anomalous Cepheids. The reasons why we selected this dSph are manifold. It is located in the southern sky, it presents evidence for multiple stellar populations (Mould \& Aaronson 1983; Mighell 1990,1997; Smecker-Hane et al. 1994,1996; Hurley-Keller et al. 1998; Hernandez et al. 2000; Dolphin 2002), and the occurrence of RR Lyrae variables has been already proved (Saha, Monet \& Seitzer 1986, hereinafter SMS). Moreover, recent measurements suggest that its core radius is roughly 10 arcmin , while the tidal radius is approximately 30 arcmin (Irwin \& Hatzidimitriou 1995, hereinafter IH). This means that with a single field of about $30 \times 30$ arcmin one collects a substantial fraction of its stellar content.

The first deep photometric investigation $(V \sim 25)$ of Carina dates back to Mighell (1990). He collected V,R images of an off-center field ( $3^{\prime} .5 \times 5^{\prime} .6$ ) with EFOSC at the ESO 3.6 m telescope and found that the old population could account for approximately the $15 \%$ of the Carina stellar content. A detailed analysis of the Carina bright stellar component ( $\mathrm{V} \approx 22$ ) was provided by Smecker-Hane et al. (1994) who used the CTIO 1.5 m telescope to cover with a mosaic of B,I images the central $30^{\prime} .2 \times 24^{\prime} .6$ region. These data were supplemented with deep B,R data collected by Smecker-Hane et al. (1996) with the CTIO 4 m telescope and reaching a limiting magnitude of $\mathrm{R} \approx 25$. The new data disclosed for the first time the region across the MS Turn Off (TO) of both an intermediate and an old population. This occurrence was confirmed by Hurley-Keller et al. (1998) on the basis of deep $\mathrm{B}, \mathrm{V}$ images $(\mathrm{V} \approx 25)$ of three off-center fields, covering a sky area of $\approx 15$
$\operatorname{arcmin}^{2}$ each. Deep V,I data have been collected by Mighell (1997) with the Hubble Space Telescope (HST) down to a limiting magnitude of $V \sim 27$ mag. Although these data provided an accurate CMD well below the TO of the old population the main conclusions of this investigation were partially hampered by the limited size of the stellar sample, due to the low central stellar density and to the small field-of-view covered by the WFPC2 $\left(2^{\prime} .4 \times 2^{\prime} .4\right)$. The quoted investigations brought forward two morphologically distinct HBs and the occurrence of multiple TOs, interpreted by the previous authors as an evidence for SF episodes of approximately 2, 3-6 (intermediate-age population), and 11-13 (old population) Gyr. In a recent photometric investigation, Harbeck et al. (2001) using evolved Helium burning stars ( $\mathrm{HB}, \mathrm{RC}$ ) as stellar tracers found a radial age gradient between old (HB) and intermediate-age (RC) stars. This analysis was based on Washington system C, $T_{1}$ data collected with the CTIO 1.5 m telescope that cover two rectangular regions of $14^{\prime} \times 25^{\prime}$ along the major and the minor axis. Note that the occurrence of spatial variations in age and in metallicity in a large sample of LG dwarf galaxies was already suggested by Grebel (1999) on the basis of HST data.

In this paper we present the results of our photometry which produced $B, V$ magnitudes for about 68,000 objects, down to $\mathrm{V} \sim 25.5$. In $\S 2$, we discuss the photometric data set collected with the WFI, together with the reduction procedures and the evaluation of intrinsic errors (§2.1). The approach adopted to transform stellar positions from pixels to equatorial coordinates are presented in $\S 2.2$. The estimate of the relative photometric zero-point of the 8 individual chips is outlined in $\S 3$, together with the absolute zero-point calibration. The main features of the CMD are discussed in $\S 4$, while $\S 5$ deals with the radial distribution of selected evolutionary phases. A brief summary of the results and the future perspectives of the Carina Project are outlined in $\S 6$.

## 2. Observations and Data Reduction

Multiband B and V time series data of the Carina dSph were collected (E.B., V.C.) for this project with the WFI available at the 2.2 m ESO/MPI telescope (hereinafter WFI) located in La Silla over three consecutive nights, from 5th to 7th January 2000. The WFI is a mosaic camera of $2 \times 4 \mathrm{EEV}$ (English Electric Valve, now e2v technologies. See also the web page http://e2vtechnologies.com/) 2046x4098 CCD chips. The pixel scale for this instrument is $0.238^{\prime \prime}$, therefore each chip covers a sky area of $8^{\prime} .1 \times 16^{\prime} .2$. The observed field covers an area of $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$, and was centered on Carina. Table 1 summarizes positional data together with other relevant parameters of the Carina dSph. Together with these data we also adopted a set of B,V images collected for the same project with the Mosaic

Camera at the CTIO 4m Blanco telescope that cover the Carina central region as well as a set of B,V,I images collected with the WFI by the EIS project and available in the ESO Science Archive ${ }^{3}$ that cover one square degree around the Carina center (see Table 2 for more details). Fig. 1 shows the Carina true color image obtained by combining the B,V,I median images of the three different data sets. Current photometric investigation is based on the time series data collected with the WFI. The CTIO data will be discussed in a forthcoming paper, while the EIS data have only been adopted to improve the accuracy of the astrometric solution (see §2.2).

To optimize the sampling of the light curve of radial variables such as RR Lyrae and ACs, we secured 54 consecutive B and V exposures of $\approx 500 \mathrm{~s}$ each. The pulsation properties of these bright variable stars are discussed in a companion paper (Dall'Ora et al. 2003, hereinafter Paper I). The B,V images were not dithered, because the gaps between the individual chips of the WFI are relatively small $\sim 23$ arcsec along the Y-axis and $\sim 7$ arcsec along the X-axis. Moreover, the bright field star HD 48652 ( $\mathrm{V}=9.14$ ) of spectral type F2V was located between the gaps to avoid blooming effects. To improve the photometric accuracy of faint stars a few deeper exposures were also collected. Table $3^{4}$ gives the $\log$ of the observations together with information on the average seeing conditions. One finds that the quality of the images is good, with an average seeing $<1.0^{\prime \prime}$ both in the B and in the V band, respectively. As a result of both observing strategy and image quality we ended up with accurate photometry $(S / N=50)$ down to $V \approx 23$ and $B \approx 23.5$.

### 2.1. Data reduction

Raw images have been pre-processed by using the NOAO mscred (Valdes 1997) tasks available in the IRAF data analysis environment for bias subtraction and flat fielding. To flat field the data we adopted median sky and dome flats collected during the observing nights. To reject cosmic rays and to improve the detection and measurements of faint objects we stacked the eight individual CCD chips using the entire set of B and V images, excluding only a few images characterized by poor-image quality (seeing $>1.4^{\prime \prime}$ ). This task was performed by using the following DAOPHOT procedures: daomatch, daomaster, and montage2 (Stetson 1987, 1994, private communication). The final eight median images correspond to a total exposure time of $27,700 s$ and $28,600 s$ in $V$ and in $B$ band, respectively. Note that the median images are not affected by CCD defects due to a shift of

[^1]a few pixels in the pointing between the individual B and V images.
Photometry over the median images was carried out by using the stand-alone version of the DAOPHOT package (Stetson 1987). The routine daofind for star detections was applied to both $V$ and $B$ median images. The detection threshold was fixed at $5 \sigma$ above the local background level. The typical full width at half maximum (FWHM) of stars in our frames is $\simeq 1^{\prime \prime}$. The list of star candidates was thus cleaned of extended objects with FWHM larger than $2^{\prime \prime}$ as well as of spurious identifications. A total of 68,000 stars were identified and their fluxes measured with the PSF-fitting algorithm allstar. Photometric errors on the mean V and B magnitudes range from 0.03 for $23 \leq V \leq 23.5$ to 0.02 for $23.5 \leq B \leq 24.0$. This means that current photometry is very accurate from the tip of the RGB down to the TO of the old stellar population.

### 2.2. Astrometry

The transformation of objects from pixel positions to equatorial coordinates is a relevant step to properly address the radial distribution of stellar populations in Carina and to firmly locate the star candidates for forthcoming spectroscopic surveys. We first performed the astrometric calibration of a set of eight B-band pointings collected by the EIS project that cover 1 square degree around the Carina center (see Tables 2 and 3 ). We adopted the EIS data because they were collected with the WFI, cover a wide sky area, and therefore they allowed us to pin point a sizable sample of reference stars, and in turn a better accuracy in the astrometric solution. In particular, we selected $\approx 5000$ reference objects from GSC2 catalog (McLean et al. 2000) whose magnitude in the $F_{\text {mag }}$ band ranges from 12 to 19.5. The astrometric pipeline we are developing ${ }^{5}$ was applied to match, via the triangulation method (see e.g. Groth 1986), the sources extracted from each chip of the EIS images with those present in the GSC2 catalog.

Finally, a third order polynomial was used to constrain the full astrometric solution, and this solution was used to perform the drizzling of the entire square degree into a TAN (tangential) plane. Once the astrometric solution for these images has been fixed, we used the source extraction package SExtractor (Bertin \& Arnouts 1996) to pin point bright but not saturated stars. The selected stars were used to anchor the secondary astrometric reference system to be adopted for the deeper median B image. The astrometric solution for this image was obtained using the same approach adopted for the wider ones. Note

[^2]that the astrometric solution was now applied to the star centroids derived using allstar (see $\S 2.1$ ). Fig 2 . shows the the spatial distribution of the detected stars in equatorial coordinates, clearly disclosing the core radius of the galaxy. The gaps are due to the fact that current images were not dithered, while the empty circle located close to the center of the galaxy is due to the bright field star HD 48652.

As an independent check of the intrinsic accuracy of current astrometric solution, we compared the position of the stars extracted from EIS images with those given in the UCAC1 catalog (Zacharias et al. $2000^{6}$ ). By neglecting saturated stars, we ended up with a sample of 107 bright stars whose coordinates in the UCAC1 catalog were estimated with an accuracy better than 70 mas. Fig. 3 shows the difference in both right ascension and declination between the coordinates in the UCAC1 catalog and those from the EIS images routed on the GSC2 catalog. We found that current uncertainties on individual coordinates appear, at $1 \sigma$ level, smaller than 100 mas. Note that the uncertainties labeled in the figure were estimated over the entire sample, i.e. no $\sigma$ clipping has been applied.

## 3. Photometric calibrations

To accomplish the scientific goal of this project we plan to use photometric data collected with different CCD cameras and different telescopes. To improve the accuracy of the absolute calibration as well as of the relative calibration of individual chips in wide field imager mosaics, instead of observing standard stars during each observing night we adopted the observing strategy of collecting B and V data for local secondary stars distributed over our Carina field. Such a strategy maximizes the use of telescope time and substantially improves the overall accuracy of different data sets. Absolute B and V-band photometry of a few dozens of stars located across the Carina center was secured during the night of December $31 / 2000$ (see Tables 4 and 5) by using the 0.9 m CTIO telescope. However, these local secondary standards do not cover the entire field of the WFI, since they only cover an area corresponding to the four central CCD chips of WFI, not the entire field. Moreover, the $\mathrm{B}-\mathrm{V}$ color of these stars is redder than $\mathrm{B}-\mathrm{V} \sim 0.5$, and therefore they do not cover the typical colors of blue HB stars and relatively young MS stars.

To improve the accuracy of the relative calibration among the eight individual CCD chips and to improve the absolute calibration we performed an independent calibration using data available in the ESO Science Archive, as provided by two independent sets of B,V data of the Carina dSph together with observations of standard stars in different

[^3]Landolt (1992) fields collected with the same equipment (WFI, see Tables 4 and 5). The former set (December 31/1999, ESO-064.N-0512) includes 7 standard stars in the Landolt field Rubin 149, while the latter one (March 5/2000, ESO-064.N-0564) includes standard stars in 4 Landolt fields, namely Rubin 149, PG 1633 (5), PG 0918 (4), and PG 1323 (3).

The selection of the above data from the ESO Science Archive follows a twofold motivation : i) B,V data of the same standard field (Rubin 149) were collected with each of the 8 CCD chips. This means that we can properly estimate the response of the individual chips of the WFI mosaic. ii) Previous standard fields do belong to the fields for which Stetson $\left(2000^{7}\right)$ made available to the astronomical community an extended list of standards. Moreover and even more importantly, the Carina calibration fields observed together with these standards are fully (March set) or partially (December set) overlapped to our scientific data. Table 5 lists the standard stellar fields adopted in our calibration, the number and the time exposures in each band, the name of the standard field, as well the pointings on the Carina dSph.

Each data set presents pros and cons; indeed the exposure times of the first set is of the order of $20-30 \mathrm{sec}$, standards were observed with each of the 8 CCD chips, but only the Rubin 149 field was observed and at very similar air masses. On the other hand, the second set presents shorter exposure times ( $\mathrm{t} \approx 5-10 \mathrm{~s}$ ), but 4 Landolt fields were observed and at different air masses. In order to use all the available information and to avoid deceptive systematic errors in the calibration we decided to perform independent calibrations. The reason is because the two calibrations allow us to cross check both the relative and the absolute zero-points as well as the color dependence.

### 3.1. Relative calibration

The advent of wide field cameras with CCD mosaics have had a strong impact on the study of stellar populations in globular clusters and in extragalactic systems but introduced several calibrations problems that need a careful investigation well-beyond the classical flat-fielding procedures. The large field of view coupled with the contemporary use of different CCD chips and/or readout solutions do not imply that the response of the detectors is homogeneous within a few percent in different regions of the field. To constrain relative differences across the WFI camera we reduced the data of the standard field Rubin 149 collected in Dec 1999, since it has been observed in each chip with exposure times that allow us to reach a good $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{N}$ ratio down to $\mathrm{V} \sim 19 \mathrm{mag}$.

[^4]The observations were secured at almost constant air mass ( $\approx 1.15$ ), and therefore we can neglect the extinction corrections as far as the relative calibration is concerned. The raw images were pre-processed by using the same procedure adopted for the scientific images (see $\S 2.1$ ). The synthetic aperture photometry was performed with a radius of 30 px ( $\simeq 7 \mathrm{arcsec}$ ). The analysis of the residuals of the instrumental magnitudes of the same stars measured in the 8 chips (taking as reference the chip \#56) shows a quite odd behavior: the relative difference among the chips shows small zero-point off-sets of the order of a few hundredths of magnitude but the scatter was substantially larger than expected according to the random photometric errors, especially for the four top chips (see Fig. 4).

The residuals did not show any evident correlation with the magnitude and the color, but we found out that they present a well-defined dependence on the declination. The effect is of the order of several hundredths of magnitude at the edges of the WFI and is vanishing when moving toward the center of the mosaic. A smaller dependence on the RA might be present but in our opinion it can be neglected because it is at most of the order of 0.01 mag . Note that we found the same trend if we adopt the chip $\# 51$ as a reference, the only difference is that the scatter now is larger in the 4 bottom chips. This means that the same star, when observed in different regions of the WFI can present magnitude differences up to $\sim 0.07$ mag. Moreover and even more importantly, we found that this effect changes from chip to chip and also depends on the photometric band. In particular current data suggest that the effect is larger in the V than in the B band. Similar problems were already found by Andersen, Freyhammer, \& Storm (1995) and by Manfroid \& Selman (2001). The latter authors used the WFI and suggested a correction procedure called "photometric superflat" that relies on observations of dense stellar fields with an ad hoc dithering of scientific images.

Fortunately, the data of the field Rubin 149 are well distributed over the 8 chips and allowed us to give an empirical quantitative estimate of the corrections needed to overcome the problem. The corrections resulted in a set of polynomials which correct the instrumental magnitudes of each individual chip as a function of the Y coordinate. These corrections have been applied to the standard stars of Rubin 149. Fig. 5 shows the difference between the V standard magnitudes and the magnitudes measured in the 8 chips, once the positional effect has been removed, plotted as a function of the V magnitude. Fig. 6 shows the same residuals but plotted as a function of the (B-V) color. Data plotted in these figures disclose quite clearly that the spurious scatter among the individual chips has been properly removed, and indeed the scatter is homogeneous and dominated by the $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{N}$ ratio of individual measurements. Moreover, it is noteworthy that data plotted in Fig. 6 do not display a significative trend with the (B-V) color.

Figures 7 and $8^{8}$ show the same data of Figs. 5 and 6, but for the the B magnitude. Data plotted in these figures support the evidence that both the $\Delta V$ and the $\Delta B$ present a trend neither with the magnitude nor with the B-V color. This suggests that current procedure supplies homogeneous instrumental magnitudes, within a few percent, wherever the stars are located inside the WFI mosaic. To investigate whether the previous corrections change with time we applied the same corrections to the standard fields observed in March 2000, as well as to the WFI data for 47 Tuc collected in November 1999 and available at the ESO Science Archive. Interestingly enough, we found that the empirical corrections supply a good calibration also for these data sets. This suggests that within this time interval the relative response of the camera did not change. A more detailed discussion concerning the empirical corrections for the different photometric bands will be addressed in a forthcoming paper.

### 3.2. Absolute calibration

To improve the color range covered by standard stars and to estimate the extinction coefficients we also adopted the set of observations collected in March 2000 (see Table $5^{9}$ ). To estimate the extinction coefficients we selected $22+11$ standard stars brighter than $\mathrm{V}=17$ mag from the Stetson's standards (Stetson 2000) located in the Landolt fields PG1633 and PG0918, since they have been collected at substantially different air masses. We find that the first order extinction coefficient are: $k_{v}=0.13 \pm 0.02$ and $k_{b}=0.25 \pm 0.02$. Interestingly enough, these values are quite similar to the mean values measured at La Silla over the same period of the year (see the ESO web page http://www.ls.eso.org/lasilla/atm-ext/ and the Geneva Observatory web page http://obswww.unige.ch/photom/extlast.html).

As a final step we adopted most of the Stetson's standard stars in the four Landolt fields brighter than $V=19$. We ended up with a sample of 117 standard stars in the color range $-0.2 \leq B-V \leq 1.4$. The aperture photometry was performed using the same radius adopted for Rubin 149. We find that the transformations into the Johnson B,V standard system are:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& V=v_{1}^{0} s-0.117( \pm 0.013)\left(b_{1}^{0} s-v_{1}^{0} s\right)+24.068( \pm 0.025) \\
& B=b_{1}^{0} s+0.456( \pm 0.016)\left(b_{1}^{0} s-v_{1}^{0} s\right)+24.788( \pm 0.033)
\end{aligned}
$$

[^5]where $v_{1}^{0} s$ and $b_{1}^{0} s$ are the instrumental magnitudes scaled to the same exposure time (1s) and corrected for the extinction as well as for the positional effect discussed in the previous subsection. The errors in parentheses are the errors on the coefficients.

Fig. 9 shows the comparison between the Stetson's magnitudes and colors with those based on current photometry and calibrations. The comparison does not show any systematic trend with magnitudes and colors and the agreement is satisfactory. Current uncertainties are consistent with the $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{N}$ ratio of photometric data involved in the measurements.

The scientific B,V frames centered on Carina collected together with the Landolt standard fields during the observing run of March 2000 (see Table 3) have been used to provide a set of secondary Johnson standards to be used for the absolute calibration of the data. Approximately 60 bright and isolated stars were selected in each CCD chip, and then measured with aperture photometry, corrected for the individual positional effect of the chip, and eventually calibrated with the previous transformations. The Carina field observed together with the standard stars in December 1999 (see Table 3) partially overlaps with the Carina field observed in March. The chips \# 50 and \# 57 (March) overlap with the chips \# 53 and \# 54 (December). The photometry and the absolute calibration of the December data set were performed by following the same procedure adopted for the March data set. Fig. 10 displays the difference in color (top) and in V magnitude (bottom) between the secondary standards in common between the two data sets. Data plotted in this figure show, within photometric uncertainties, a good agreement for $15 \leq V \leq 19$ mag. This supports the internal consistency of the absolute calibration.

To calibrate the entire sample of $\sim 68,000$ Carina stars distributed throughout the WFI mosaic we can now follow two different routes: i) the individual subsamples of secondary standards once located in the 8 CCDs can be adopted to supply independent color equations for each chip; ii) the instrumental magnitudes of the secondary standards in the 8 CCD chips are at first homogenized using the corrections derived in §4.1, and then adopted to derive a unique set of color equations valid for the entire WFI mosaic. We performed several tests to account for the uncertainties affecting the two different routes, and eventually we decided to adopt the former one to avoid the possible errors due to small differences in the PSF adopted for the various chips.

To check a posteriori the accuracy of current calibrations we performed an independent test. We already mentioned that an independent set of secondary standards are available for this project that have been collected with different observational equipment. Fig. 11 shows the difference in magnitudes and colors for the 25 stars brighter than $\mathrm{V} \sim 17.5 \mathrm{mag}$ in common between the two samples. The data do not present any magnitude or color
dependence, therefore we can conclude that two fully independent calibrations give the same results within the errors. This result further strengthens the procedure adopted to transform the instrumental magnitudes into the Johnson B,V bands.

As a final test we also compared the accuracy of our photometry with the B,V data of the Carina galaxy collected by Hurley-Keller et al. (1998). The top panel of Fig. 12 shows a large spread in the color difference but such a difference presents a systematic trend only for very red stars $(B-V) \geq 1.3$. Note that the discrepant points in the $\Delta(B-V)$ diagram and the discrepant bright points in the $\Delta V$ diagram are the same objects. The absolute calibration of the previous data was performed by Mateo et al. (1991) and they pointed out technical difficulties for the calibration of bright stars. On the other hand, the difference in the V magnitude plotted in the bottom panel discloses the occurrence of a systematic shift roughly equal to 0.05 mag . The agreement that we found with the independent photometry discussed in Fig. 11 and the fact that the intrinsic accuracy of the calibration adopted by Hurley-Keller et al. (1998) is of the order of $\pm 0.03$ (Mateo et al. 1991) supports the evidence that current magnitudes are marginally affected by systematic errors.

## 4. The Color Magnitude Diagram

Figure 13 shows the CMD of the eight individual chips. The number of detected stars traces the position of the galaxy, and indeed the center is located close to the top left corner of chip n. $\# 55$. In the four central chips one finds evidence for the multiple stellar populations, and in particular the sequences of H burning stars in the TO-Sub Giant Branch (SGB) region and of He burning giants, that are distributed along an extended and possibly very old HB , as well as in a well-defined RC typical of intermediate-mass stars. These observational features are further strengthened by data plotted in Fig. 14, that shows the CMD for the entire sample of stars.

On the basis of deep V,I $(\mathrm{V} \approx 27)$ band data collected with HST, Mighell (1997, and references therein) suggested that the very old population in Carina is a small fraction, if any, of the entire galaxy. A similar conclusion was also reached by Hurley-Keller et al. (1998). According to these authors the bulk of the stars in Carina formed in two different episodes roughly 3 and 7 Gyr ago, with the additional evidence of approximately $10-20 \%$ of very old stars with ages $\approx 15$ Gyr. However, Hernandez, Gilmore \& Valls-Gabaud (2000) on the basis of the same HST data concluded that Carina experienced three different SF episodes, namely at 3,5 , and 8 Gyr ago, with no evidence of stars older than 10 Gyr . This result has been recently questioned by Dolphin (2002) who marginally detected ( $1 \sigma$ level) older stars. These empirical results support the evidence that to properly estimate the
fraction of different stellar components in dSph galaxies a substantial portion of the body of these systems need to be covered.

To figure out the Carina evolutionary properties according to the observed CM diagram, one has first to single out detailed information on its metal content. This has been done by comparing the distribution in the CMD of the oldest Carina population with similar diagrams of old stellar systems with known metal abundance. This approach relies on the well-known evidence that the slope of the RGB is a bona fide metallicity indicator (Hartwick 1968). To our great surprise we found that the Carina old stellar population nicely follows the stellar distribution of the GGC NGC 1904 (Piotto et al. 2002), for which a mean metallicity of $[\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}] \approx-1.69(\mathrm{Z}=0.0004)$ has been estimated (Zinn \& West 1984). This empirical evidence strongly suggests not only a similar metallicity, but also a similar age, thus constraining the age of Carina old population in the range of ages typical of GGCs, i.e. $10-13 \mathrm{Gyr}$ (Vandenberg et al. 2002). We notice that this metallicity estimate appears in good agreement with recent low-resolution spectra of the near infrared Ca II triplet in 52 stars located close to the tip of the Carina RGB. These data support a mean metallicity of $[F e / H]=-1.99 \pm 0.08$ (Smecker-Hane et al. 1999). However, these measurements present an intrinsic spread in metallicity of $\approx 0.25$ dex $(1 \sigma)$ and a full width of approximately 1 dex. This suggests that Carina could underwent a complex chemical evolution and/or SF history during the last few Gyrs. Before we can dig into speculations concerning the occurrence of the so-called age-metallicity degeneracy (e.g., Hodge 1989; Da Costa 1991) we need accurate, high resolution spectroscopic measurements of heavy element abundances. Recent findings brought forward systematic differences not only between photometric indices and spectroscopic observations (Bonifacio et al. 2000; Cole, Smecker-Hane, \& Gallagher 2000) but also between metallicities based on Ca II triplet and on Fe-peak element abundances (Tolstoy et al. 2001). Note that the latter is a thorny problem in stellar systems such as dwarf galaxies, because Ca is an $\alpha$-element.

An even more compelling comparison can be performed with the old LMC cluster Reticulum (Monelli et al. 2002), for which spectroscopic measurements support a metal abundance of $[\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}]=-1.71 \pm 0.09$ ( $\mathrm{Z}=0.0004$, Suntzeff et al. 1992). This cluster indeed presents several advantages when compared with NGC 1904, the absolute calibration is more accurate, the relevant evolutionary phases are very well-defined across the CMD, and in particular the HB luminosity level. The comparison of HBs is facilitated because the Reticulum HB completely covers the instability strip (32 RR Lyrae, Walker 1992), whereas NGC 1904 only contains blue HB stars and a few RR Lyrae (4 bona fide and 4 candidates, see Ferraro et al. 1992, and references therein). Fig. 15 shows that by simply decreasing the apparent magnitude of Reticulum stars by $\Delta V \approx 1.68$ mag the old Carina population nicely overlaps the Reticulum stellar loci all over H and He burning phase. One can derive
the conclusion that not only the two populations have quite similar evolutionary properties, but also that the two stellar systems should have quite similar reddenings. According to the pulsation properties of RR Lyrae stars, Walker (1992) estimated a mean reddening for Reticulum of $E(B-V)=0.03 \pm 0.02$. The reddening map provided by Burstein \& Heiles (1982) supplies for Carina a mean reddening of $E(B-V) \approx 0.025$, while the dust infrared map by Schlegel, Finkbeiner, \& Davis (1998) provides, across the central 0.3 degree ${ }^{2}$ covered by our data, a mean reddening value of $E(B-V)=0.058 \pm 0.013$. According to this map the reddening along the Northern direction is constant, whereas when moving from East to West presents a mild increase. In the following we assume $\mathrm{E}(\mathrm{B}-\mathrm{V})=0.03$, with an uncertainty which should not be larger than $\pm 0.01-0.02 \mathrm{mag}$.

Once we fixed both reddening value and metal content, we can compare empirical data with suitable theoretical isochrones. The comparison was performed using stellar isochrones from the Pisa Evolutionary Library (Castellani et al. 2003, in preparation). The mixing length value adopted in these evolutionary models was calibrated as a function of metal content on the observed RGBs of GGCs. Theoretical predictions were transformed into the observational plane by adopting the bolometric corrections and the color-temperature relations predicted by atmosphere models (Castelli, Gratton, \& Kurucz 1997a,b). To validate physical assumptions adopted to construct current stellar isochrones, Fig. 16 shows the fit of the 11 Gyr isochrone (solid line) and of the Zero-Age-Horizontal-Branch (ZAHB, dashed line) to empirical data for the two quoted globular clusters. Theoretical predictions for NGC 1904 were plotted by adopting an apparent distance modulus of $D M_{V}=(m-M)_{V}=15.72 \mathrm{mag}$ and a reddening of $\mathrm{E}(\mathrm{B}-\mathrm{V})=0.03$ (Kravtsov et al. 1997). The distance was estimated using the apparent magnitude of HB stars estimated by Kravtsov et al. (1997, $\left.V_{H B}=16.25\right)$ and the calibration of the $M_{V}$ vs $[\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}]$ relation provided by Caputo et al. (2000). The distance modulus we adopted for Reticulum is based on the classical Cepheid distance scale (Bono et al. 2002). Data plotted in this figure show that theory accounts quite well for both H and He burning evolutionary phases. Now we adopt the same theoretical framework to constrain evolutionary properties of Carina stellar populations. Fig. 17 shows that theoretical predictions, by assuming a reddening of $\mathrm{E}(\mathrm{B}-\mathrm{V})=0.03$, a mean metallicity of $\mathrm{Z}=0.0004$, and a distance $D M_{V}=20.24$ nicely fit the observed distributions for selected assumptions about stellar ages (see labeled values). The adopted distance appears in reasonable agreement with previous evaluations by Mighell (1997), Mateo, Hurley-Keller, \& Nemec (1998), Girardi \& Salaris (2001), and by Paper I. As a whole, we found evidence for a substantial amount of old stars with ages ranging around $11 \pm 1$ Gyr. This finding, as well as the sizable sample of RR Lyrae stars (75) we have detected, confirms the early results by SMS and by Smecker-Hane et al. (1994).

At the same time, data plotted in Fig. 17 show that the bulk of the intermediate-mass
stars present TO ages in the range of $5 \pm 2 \mathrm{Gyr}$. Age estimates for RC stars provided by Caputo, Castellani \& Degl'Innocenti (1995) on the basis of the difference in luminosity with the SGB give quite similar ages. This means that we can safely conclude that RC stars in Carina are the bona fide counterpart of the above intermediate-age population.

Moreover and even more importantly, data in Fig. 17 bring forward the occurrence of young MS stars with ages younger than 1 Gyr (see the 0.6 Gyr isochrone plotted in the figure). The occurrence of relatively young stars is interesting because the available literature suggested that the most recent SF episode in Carina took place approximately 2-3 Gyr ago (Dolphin 2002). In this context it is worth mentioning that a stellar population as young as this might account for the sizable sample of Anomalous Cepheids ( 6 bona fide plus 9 candidates) we detected (see Paper I). If we assume that these bright variables are the progeny of young single stars then young, intermediate-mass He burning structures should account for their distribution in the CMD. To further constrain the nature of these objects we decided to investigate, as suggested by the referee, whether they could be Blue Stragglers (BSs) of the old stellar population. Following Fusi Pecci et al. (1992) and Mateo, Fischer, \& Krzeminski (1995) we estimated the specific frequency of blue plume stars and we found that $N_{B} / N_{H B}=360 / 280 \approx 1.3$. Recent empirical estimates suggest that GGCs characterized by very low central densities present a specific frequency of BSs that is at least a factor of 2.5 smaller, namely $N_{B S} / N_{H B} \approx 0.5$ (Preston \& Sneden 2000). This finding further strengthens the hypothesis that blue plume stars are genuine young stars.

Figure 18 shows the comparison between old, low-mass RR Lyrae stars (circles) and young, intermediate-mass ACs (triangles) with theoretical predictions for Zero Age He-burning structures at fixed chemical composition and different assumptions for the progenitor age (Cassisi et al. 2003, in preparation). Data in this figure support the evidence that the position of bright and bluer ACs appear in reasonable agreement with stars originating from the Zero Age He-burning structures constructed assuming the same chemical composition of the old stellar component ( $\mathrm{Y}=0.23, \mathrm{Z}=0.0004$ ), a progenitor age of 0.6 Gyr, and therefore with a stellar mass $M \approx 2.2 M_{\odot}$. This finding is in good agreement with the lower limit in stellar mass provided in Paper I on the basis of their pulsation properties, i.e. $M \geq 1.4-1.5 M_{\odot}$. However, we cannot exclude that some redder ACs are the result of mass transfer in old binary systems (Renzini, Mengel, \& Sweigart 1977; Corwin, Carney, \& Nifong 1999).

To constrain the Carina mean metallicity we performed the same comparison between theory and observations of Figures 17 and 18 but using isochrones and He burning models for $\mathrm{Z}=0.0006([\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}] \approx-1.5)$ and $\mathrm{Z}=0.0002([\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}] \approx-2.0)$. Interestingly enough, we found that the new predictions for plausible assumptions concerning the distance
and the reddening do not account for the three observables that are more sensitive to metal abundance, namely RGB color, HB luminosity, and RC color. In particular, more metal-rich predictions account for RGB color, and HB luminosity but Zero Age He-burning models are systematically bluer than RC stars. On the other hand, the more metal-poor predictions account for HB luminosity and RC color, but the isochrones for the same ages are systematically redder than RGB stars.

Before concluding this section, let us notice that an age of the order of 11 Gyr makes the Carina old population coeval not only with NGC 1904 and Reticulum, but also with several other well studied globulars in the Galaxy (Cassisi et al. 1999) as well as in the Magellanic Clouds (Brocato et al. 1996). As long as the evidence that these stellar systems are coeval is not affected at all by the adopted theoretical evolutionary scenario, the evaluation of the absolute age does depend on it. By adopting the same theoretical framework but neglecting the efficiency of element diffusion we would derive cluster ages older by approximately 1 Gyr.

## 5. Radial distributions

On the basis of preliminary empirical evidence (Mighell 1997; Harbeck et al. 2001) it has been suggested that the old and the intermediate-age populations in Carina present different radial distributions. To investigate the spatial distribution of different stellar populations, we selected stars in suitable boxes representative of the old (see dashed boxes in Fig. 19) and of the intermediate-age population (solid boxes). This approach, when compared with similar analyses in the literature, presents the substantial advantage to use quite large stellar samples both for the old $(\approx 1000)$ and the intermediate-age ( $\approx 5000$ ) populations. Fig. 20 shows the comparison between the isodensities of the whole stellar sample (dashed contours) in Carina with those for the old (HB, SGB) stellar population (solid contours). The isodensity contours range from $\approx 20 \%$, to $100 \%$ of the central maximum density with a density step of $20 \%$. The central maximum density in the central bin $(2 \times 2 \operatorname{arcmin}$ squared $)$ is $\approx 1400$ for the entire galaxy and $\approx 10$ for old HB stars. Fig. 21 shows the same data, but the solid contours refer to the young ( RC , intermediate-age $\mathrm{MS})$ stellar population. The central maximum density is $\approx 20$ for RC stars. Data plotted in these figures show that the isodensity contours of the intermediate-age population resembles quite well the density distribution of the whole data. On the contrary, the isodensity contours of the old population appear more irregular, with a small offset of about 2 arcmin in the peak density of the old population when compared with the Carina center (see the cross in Fig. 20 and 21). To estimate on a quantitative basis the difference between
the two populations we performed several two-tails Kolmogorov-Smirnov (KS) tests. At first, we tested whether the two old subsamples, i.e. the HB and SGB, present the same radial distributions. We found that the two distributions are almost identical, since the KS probability is equal to $90 \%$. The same outcome applies to the two young subsamples, namely RC and intermediate-age MS, and indeed the KS probability is equal to $94 \%$. On the the other hand, the KS test applied to the old and the young samples, supplies a vanishing probability that the two radial distributions are the same.

To avoid deceptive errors introduced by the spatial smoothing of the isocontour levels we decided to investigate the in situ spatial distributions of the two populations along the major and the minor axis, assuming a position angle of approximately 60 degrees ( $p a=65 \pm 5, \mathrm{IH}$ ). Moving along the major axis and by assuming a bin size of 2 arcmin we computed the histogram of the entire stellar content of the galaxy. The same procedure was repeated but along the minor axis. Fig. 22 shows the spatial distribution along the major (top) and the minor (bottom) axis respectively. Interestingly enough, we found that the eccentricity $(e=1-b / a)$, where $b$ and $a$ are the FWHMs of the individual distributions given by the gaussian fits, is roughly equal to $\approx 0.3$. This estimate is in good agreement with the estimate provided by IH.

The same procedure has been applied to the old and the young samples. Figures 23 and 24 show the two spatial distributions along the major axis and the minor axis respectively. In both cases the spatial distribution of the old component is broader than the distribution of the young component. It turns out that the eccentricity of the old component is $\approx 0.27$, and therefore quite similar to the eccentricity of the entire galaxy. On the other hand, the eccentricity of the young population is $\approx 0.38$. We performed several tests by changing the bin size from 1.5 to 3 arcmin and we found that the eccentricities of the young and old populations change by less than a few percent. Therefore, current estimates seem to suggest that the old stellar component is distributed over a sort of "spheroidal halo", while the young component is more concentrated and flattened along the major axis. Moreover, data plotted in Fig. 23 also show an interesting feature: the spatial distribution along the major axis of the old population peaks at $\approx 2 \pm 1 \mathrm{arcmin}$ from the Carina center, while it is centrally peaked along the minor axis. On the contrary, the young population is centrally peaked both along the major and the minor axis. This evidence further supports the hypothesis of a difference in the spatial distribution between the old and the young stellar populations.

We mention that data plotted in Fig. 22, also suggest that the spatial distribution of the old component along the two axes is not centrally symmetric. The slope of the star counts in the South-West direction is steeper than along the opposite direction. These
empirical evidence seem to suggest that the young and more massive population is more centrally concentrated than the old one. The present result, once confirmed, might provide valuable constraints on the Carina dynamical history and on its interaction with the Galaxy (Kuhn, Smith, \& Hawley 1996; Majewski et al. 2000).

In a recent photometric investigation Stetson, Hesser, \& Smacker-Hane (1998) found that different stellar components in the Fornax dSph might present different centroids. Therefore, we performed a new test to figure out whether the young stellar component in Carina exhibits the same radial distribution as the intermediate-age one. The KS test suggests that blue plume stars present a radial distribution quite similar to RC and MS stars, and indeed the KS probability is roughly equal to $\approx 50 \%$. On the other hand, the KS test with old HB stars indicates that the two populations are different, since the KS probability is vanishingly $(\mathrm{P}=0.00001)$ small.

Finally, we also investigated the radial distribution of blue plume stars along the major and the minor axis. The comparison between data plotted in Fig. 25 and data plotted in the bottom panel of Fig. 23 and 24 indicates that the radial distributions of these two stellar components are quite similar along the minor axis. Nevertheless there is a mild evidence that blue plume stars along the major axis appear more centrally concentrated. Unfortunately, current data do not allow us to constrain on a quantitative basis the difference in the centroids.

## 6. Summary and final remarks

This is the second paper of a large program devoted to the evolutionary and pulsation properties of Carina stellar populations. We presented B,V time series data collected over three consecutive nights with the WFI. Special care has been given to the relative and absolute photometric calibration of the data. We found that the response of the eight individual chips is not uniform but depends on the position of the star across the chip. On the basis of a sizable sample of standard stars observed with the eight chips we removed the positional effect. To firmly constrain the photometric zero-point we performed two independent absolute calibrations using data collected with different telescopes. The comparison between the two sets of secondary standards shows a good agreement within the errors. We investigated the main evolutionary phases of the CMD as a function of the position and we found that when moving along the minor axis the radial distribution of young and intermediate-age stars decreases more rapidly than the distribution of the old stellar population. We found that theoretical predictions for $\mathrm{Z}=0.0004$ are in good agreement not only for MS stars but also for old, low-mass HB stars as well as for young
and intermediate-age He-burning stars.
The comparison between theory and observations brought forward several interesting findings:
i) A well-defined plume of blue and bright MS stars located at $V \approx 22$ and $(B-V) \approx 0$ suggest that the last SF episode in Carina took place not more than 1 Gyr ago. This seems a robust identification, since this region of the CMD is marginally affected by field contamination. The occurrence of a young stellar population is supported by the large sample of ACs we have identified. If these interesting objects are the evolutionary aftermath of young single stars, then their distribution in the CMD can be explained, according to current theoretical predictions, as central He-burning models with stellar masses ranging from $\approx 1.4$ to $\approx 2.0 \mathrm{M} / M_{\odot}$ and stellar ages of the order of 0.6 Gyr . This evidence together with previous findings on the Fornax dSph (Stetson et al. 1998; Gallart et al. 2002) are at odds with the dynamical mechanism, "tidal stirring", suggested by Mayer et al. (2001a,b) to account for the dSphs in the Local Group. The numerical simulations they performed suggest that the SF after 2-3 orbits (approximately 10 Gyr ) should be vanishing, since the gas was either transformed into stars or stripped by tidal shocks.
ii) The CMD for magnitudes ranging from $\mathrm{V} \approx 22$ to $\mathrm{V} \approx 23$ shows a broad MS and a well-populated SGB. These features support the evidence that Carina experienced an important SF episode $6 \pm 1 \mathrm{Gyr}$ ago. After this event the SF was less efficient but an ongoing process for at least 3-4 Gyr. This evidence is in contrast with standard Cold Dark Matter (CDM) theories. In fact, dSphs within this theoretical framework were the first galaxies to be formed. Therefore dSphs with low-velocity dispersions ( $\leq 10 \mathrm{~km} / \mathrm{s}$ ) should not present any SF activity during the last 12 Gyr (Moore et al. 1999; Cen 2001). On the other hand, empirical data strongly support the evidence that a large fraction of dSphs in the LG have low-velocity dispersions and experienced SF activity during the last few Gyrs (Caputo et al. 1999; Piersimoni et al. 1999; Tolstoy et al. 2001, and references therein).
iii) The detection of a sizable sample of blue and red HB stars as well as of RR Lyrae stars confirms the previous findings by Smecker-Hane et al. (1994) and by Saha, Monet \& Seitzer (1986) concerning the occurrence of a old stellar population in Carina. Note that the results concerning the occurrence of a young stellar component in Carina is a consequence of the fact that current data cover a substantial portion of the body of the galaxy, while data sets available in the literature either reach brighter limit magnitudes or cover a smaller field of view. In particular, the small field of view covered by WFPC2 hampers HST observations due to the low stellar density in the central regions of dSphs.
$i v)$ Magnitude distribution of HB stars as well as of RR Lyrae stars show, within current uncertainty, a very small spread in luminosity. This finding together with the luminosity and the color of RC stars suggests that the spread in metallicity among old and intermediate-age
populations is relatively small.
Thanks to the large field of view covered by our data we also investigated the radial distribution of old and intermediate-age stellar populations. To avoid deceptive errors due to the size of the sample we selected HB and SGB stars for the old, low-mass population and RC and MS stars for the intermediate-age stellar component. Interestingly enough we found that:
$i$ ) The isodensity contours of the intermediate-age population properly fit the spatial distribution of the entire galaxy, whereas the isodensity contours of the old population is somehow more clumpy.
ii) The peak of the old stellar population is roughly 2 arcmin off-center when compared with the peak of the intermediate-age population. This finding is supported by the spatial distribution of the two stellar components along the major and the minor axis respectively. iii) The spatial distribution of the old population is, in contrast with the intermediate-age one, asymmetric along the two axes. According to these evidence it seems that the relatively young stellar population is more centrally concentrated than the old one. This finding confirms preliminary empirical evidence for Carina suggested by Mighell (1997) and, more strongly, by Harbeck et al. (2001) and further supports the occurrence of different radial distributions in dSphs that present multiple stellar components (Stetson et al. 1998; Harbeck et al. 2001). Moreover, the old population presents a steeper gradient along the South-West than the North-East direction. A well-defined "shoulder" is present approximately $4-6$ arcmin along the North-East direction both along the major and the minor axis. According to recent numerical experiments (Johnston, Sigurdsson, \& Hernquist 1999) a robust signature of the tidal interaction of a dwarf satellite with the Galaxy is the occurrence of a break in the slope of star count profile at the location where unbound stars dominate (see their Figs. 15 and 16). If the shoulder we detected is the empirical indicator of the predicted break then current finding supplies a qualitative support to the large star mass-loss rate, roughly $30 \% \mathrm{Gyr}^{-1}$, that Johnston et al. (1999) predict for Carina.

More detailed information concerning the Carina orbit and its velocity are required to figure out whether dSph companions are dominated by dark matter halos or by the tidal interaction with the Galaxy (Kuhn \& Miller 1989; Klessen \& Zhao 2002). The empirical scenario concerning Carina is still puzzling, since both IH and Majewski et al. (2000) found evidence of an extra tidal component at a radius of $\approx 20$ arcmin. This supports the evidence that Carina is interacting with the tidal field of the Galaxy. On the other hand, Walcher et al. (2002) in a recent investigation based on CCD observations that cover a wide area (4 square degrees) around Carina did not detect the break in the slope of the density profile. This suggests that Carina might be dominated by a dark matter halo, whereas our finding tends to support the first working hypothesis. Current empirical scenario does
not help to settle this fundamental problem, and indeed detailed star counts well behind the tidal radius support the evidence that Ursa Minor dSph is undergoing a strong tidal interaction with the Milk Way (Kleyna et al. 1998; Martinez-Delgado et al. 2001). On the other hand, similar investigations on the Draco dSph do not find evidence of tidally induced tails (Aparicio, Carrera, \& Martinez-Delgado 2001; Odenkirchen et al. 2001; Piatek et al. 2002).

However, current data do cover only a limited region around the center of the system. It is worth mentioning that we have already collected B and V time series data of the same field with the prime focus Mosaic Imager at CTIO 4m Blanco telescope. These data will be presented in a forthcoming paper together with multiband photometric data available in the ESO archive. This is just the beginning of the story, new deeper and accurate photometric databases already secured by our group will certainly supply more tight constraints on still open problems concerning the stellar population content of the Carina galaxy. It goes without saying that the difference in both the chemical composition and in the radial distribution among old, intermediate-age, and relatively young populations will certainly benefit of new and massive spectroscopic measurements. An observational challenge that the new multifiber spectrographs available in telescopes of the 4 m (Hydra) and 8 m (Flames/Giraffe) class should allow us to cope with in the near future.

It is a pleasure to thank Frank Valdes for many helpful suggestions and advice on installing the mscred package we used for the pre-processing of the WFI images. We acknowledge W. Gieren and G. Pietrzynski as well as the 2p2 ESO team and in particular R. Mendez and F. Selman for insightful discussions concerning the treatment of WFI data. We wish also to thank an anonymous referee for his/her detailed suggestions and helpful comments that improved both the content and the readability of this paper. We are grateful to S. Cassisi, M. Cignoni, S. Degl'Innocenti, and P. G. Prada Moroni for sending us detailed sets of isochrones and HB models as well as to D. Hoard for carrying out the Jan 312000 observations. This research has made use of NASA's Astrophysics Data System Abstract Service and of SIMBAD database operated at CDS, Strasbourg, France. This work was supported by MIUR/Cofin 2000 under the project: "Stellar Observables of Cosmological Relevance". HAS thanks the US National Science Foundation for support under the grant AST99-86943.

## REFERENCES

Andersen, M. I., Freyhammer, L., \& Storm, J. 1995, in ESO/ST-ECF workshop on calibrating and understanding HST and ESO instruments, ed P. Benvenuti (ESO: Garching), 87

Aparicio, A., Carrera, R., \& Martinez-Delgado, D. 2001, AJ, 122, 2524
Bertin, E., \& Arnouts, S. 1996, A\&A, 117, 393
Binney, J., \& Tremaine, S. 1987, Galactic Dynamics (New York: Princeton Univerity Press)
Bonifacio, P., Hill, V., Molaro, P., Pasquini, L., Di Marcantonio, P., \& Santin, P. 2000, A\&A, 359, 663

Bono, G., Caputo, F., Santolamazza, P., Cassisi, S., Piersimoni A. 1997, AJ, 113, 2209
Bono, G., Groenewegen, M. A. T., Marconi, M., \& Caputo, F. 2002, ApJ, 574, L33
Brocato, E., Castellani, V., Ferraro F.R., Piersimoni, A.N., Testa, V., 1996, MNRAS, 282, 614.

Burstein, D., \& Heiles, C. 1982, AJ, 87, 1165
Caputo, F., Cassisi, S., Castellani, M., Marconi, G., Santolamazza, P. 1999, AJ, 117, 2199
Caputo, F., Castellani, V., \& Degl'Innocenti, S. 1995, A\&A, 304, 365
Caputo, F., Castellani, V., Marconi, M., \& Ripepi, V. 2000, MNRAS, 316, 819
Cassisi, S., Castellani, V., Degl'Innocenti, S., Salaris, M., Weiss, A. 1999, A\&AS, 134, 103
Castelli, F., Gratton, R.G., Kurucz, R. L., 1997a, A\&A, 318, 841
Castelli, F., Gratton, R.G., Kurucz, R. L., 1997b, A\&A, 324, 432
Cen, R. 2001, ApJ, 549, 195
Cole, A. A., Smecker-Hane, T. A., \& Gallagher, J. S. III 2000, AJ, 120, 1808
Corwin, T., Carney, B. W., \& Nifong, B. G. 1999, AJ, 118, 2875
Da Costa, G. S. 1991, in IAU Symp. 148, The Magellanic Clouds, ed. R. Haynes \& D. Milne (Dordrecht: Kluwer), 183

Da Costa, G. S. 1999, in The Third Stromlo Symposium: The Galactic Halo, ed. B.K. Gibson, T.S. Axelrod, \& M.E. Putman, (San Francisco: ASP Conf. Series), 153

Dall'Ora, M. et al. 2002, AJ, accepted (Paper I)
Dolphin, A. E. 2002, MNRAS, 332, 91
Ferraro, F. R., Clementini, G., Fusi Pecci, F., Sortino, R., \& Buonanno, R. 1992, MNRAS, 256, 391

Fusi Pecci, F., Ferraro, F. R., Corsi, C. E., Cacciari, C., Buonanno, R. 1992, AJ, 104, 1831
Gallart, C., Zinn, R., Pont, F., Hardy, E., Marconi, G., \& Buonanno, R. 2002, Msngr, 108, 16

Gallagher, J. S. III, \& Wyse, R. F. G. 1994, PASP, 106, 1225
Girardi, L. \& Salaris, M. 2001, MNRAS, 323, 109
Grebel, E. K. 1999, in IAU Symp. 192, The stellar content of Local Group galaxies, ed. P. Whitelock \& R. Cannon, (San Francisco: ASP), 17

Groth, E. 1986, AJ, 91,1244
Harbeck, D., et al. 2001, AJ, 122, 3092
Hartwick, F. 1968, ApJ, 154, 475
Hernandez, X., Gilmore, G., \& Valls-Gabaud D. 2000, MNRAS, 317, 831
Hurley-Keller, D., Mateo, M., \& Nemec, J. 1998, AJ, 115, 1840
Hodge, P. W. 1989, ARA\&A, 27, 139
Irwin, M., \& Hatzidimitriou, D. 1995, MNRAS, 277, 1354 (IH)
Johnston, K. V., Sigurdsson, S., \& Hernquist, L. 1999, MNRAS, 302, 771
King, I. 1962, AJ, 67, 471
Klessen, R. S. \& Zhao, H. S. 2002, ApJ, 566, 838
Kleyna, J. T., Geller, M. J., Kenyon, S. J., Kurtz, M. J., \& Thorstensen, J. R. 1998, AJ, 115, 2359

Kravtsov, V., Ipatov, A., Samus, N., Smirnov, O., Alcaino, G., Liller, W., \& Alvarado, F. 1997, A\&AS, 125, 1

Kuhn, J. R., \& Miller, R. H. 1989, ApJ, 341, 41
Kuhn, J. R., Smith, H. A., Hawley, S. L. 1996, ApJ, 469, 93
Landolt, A. U. 1992, AJ, 104, 372
Majewski, S. R., Ostheimer, J. C., Patterson, R. J., Kunkel W. E., Johnston, K. V., \& Geisler, D. 2000, AJ, 119, 760

Manfroid, J., \& Selman, F. 2001, Msngr, 104, 16
Martinez-Delgado, D., Alonso-Garcia, J., Aparicio, A., \& Gomez-Flechoso, M. A. 2001, ApJ, 549, L63

Mateo, M. 1998, ARA\&A, 36, 435 (M98)
Mateo, M., Fischer, P., \& Krzeminski, W. 1995, AJ, 110, 2166
Mateo, M., Hurley-Keller, D., \& Nemec J. 1998, AJ, 115, 1856
Mateo, M., Nemec, J., Irwin, M., \& McMahon, R. 1991, AJ, 101, 892
Mateo, M., Olszewski, E. W., Pryor, C., Welch, D. L., \& Fische, P. 1993, AJ, 105, 510
Mayer, L., Governato, F., Colpi, M., Moore, B., Quinn, T., Wadsley, J., Stadel, J., \& Lake, G. 2001a, ApJ, 547, L123

Mayer, L., Governato, F., Colpi, M., Moore, B., Quinn, T., Wadsley, J., Stadel, J., \& Lake, G. 2001b, ApJ, 559, 754

McLean, B. J., Greene, G. R., Lattanzi, M. G., \& Pirenne, B. 2000, in ADASS IX, ed. N. Manset, C. Veillet, \& D. Crabtree (San Francisco: ASP Conf. Series), 145

Mighell, K. J. 1990, A\&AS, 82, 1
Mighell, K. J. 1997, AJ, 114, 1458
Monelli, M. et al. 2002, in New Horizons in Globular Cluster Astronomy, ed. G. Piotto, G. Meylan, G. Djorgowski, \& M. Riello (San Francisco: ASP), astro-ph/0210650

Moore, B., Ghigna, S., Governato, F., Lake, G., Quinn, T., Stadel, J., Tozzi, P. 1999, ApJ, 524, L19

Mould, J., \& Aaronson, M. 1983, ApJ, 273, 530
Nonino, M., et al. 1999, A\&AS, 137, 51
Odenkirchen, M., et al. 2001, AJ, 122, 2538
Piatek, S., Pryor, C., Armandroff, T. E., Olszewski, E. W. 2002, AJ, 123, 2511
Piersimoni, A. M., Bono, G., Castellani, M., Marconi, G., Cassisi, S., Buonanno, R., \& Nonino, M. 1999, A\&A, 352, 63

Piotto, G. et al. 2002, A\&A, 391, 945
Preston, G. W., \& Sneden, C. 2000, AJ, 120, 1014
Renzini, A., Mengel, J. G., \& Sweigart, A. V. 1977, A\&A, 56, 369
Saha, A., Monet, D. G., \& Seitzer, P. 1986, AJ, 92, 302 (SMS)
Schlegel, D. J., Finkbeiner, D. P., Davis, M. 1998, ApJ, 500, 525
Smecker-Hane, T. A., Stetson, P. B., Hesser, J. E., \& Lehnert, M. D. 1994, AJ, 108, 507
Smecker-Hane, T. A., Stetson, P. B., Hesser, J. E., \& Vandenberg, D. A. 1996, in The Impact of Stellar Physics on Galaxy Evolution, ed. C. Leitherer, U. Fritze-von-Alvensleben, \& J. Huchra, (San Francisco: ASP), 328

Smecker-Hane, T. A., Mandushev, G. I., Hesser, J. E., Stetson, P. B., da Costa, G. S., \& Hatzidimitriou, D. 1999, in Spectrophotometric Dating of Stars and Galaxies, ed. I. Hubeny, S. Heap, \& R. Cornett (San Francisco: ASP), 159

Stetson, P. B., Hesser, J. E., Smecker-Hane, T. A. 1998, PASP, 110, 533
Stetson, P. B. 1987, PASP, 99, 191
Stetson, P. B. 1994, PASP, 106, 250
Stetson, P. B. 2000, PASP, 112, 925
Suntzeff, N. B., Schommer, R. A., Olszewski, E. W., \& Walker, A. R. 1992, AJ, 104, 1743
Tolstoy, E., Irwin, M. J., Cole, A. A., Pasquini, L., Gilmozzi, R., \& Gallagher, J. S. 2001, MNRAS, 327, 91

Valdes, F. 1997, in ADASS VI, ed. G. Hunt \& H. E. Payne, (San Francisco: ASP Conf. Series), 455

Walker, A. R. 1992, AJ, 103, 1166
Walcher, J., Fried, J. W., Burkert, A., \& Klessen, R. S. A\&A, astro-ph/0207467
VandenBerg, D. A., Richard, O., Michaud, G., \& Richer, J. 2002, ApJ, 571, 487
van den Bergh, S. 2000, The Galaxies of the Local Group, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)

Zacharias, N., et al. 2000, AJ, 120, 2131
Zinn, R. \& West, M. J. 1984, ApJS, 55, 45

Table 1. Positional, photometric and structural parameters of the Carina dSph.

| Parameter | Ref. $^{\text {a }}$ |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| $\alpha(\mathrm{J} 2000)$ | 064137 | 1 |
| $\delta(\mathrm{~J} 2000)$ | -505800 | 1 |
| $M_{V}(\mathrm{mag})^{\mathrm{b}}$ | -8.9 | 2 |
| $r_{c}(\mathrm{arcmin})^{\mathrm{c}}$ | $11.96 \pm 1.5 / 14^{\mathrm{d}}$ | 2 |
| $r_{t}(\operatorname{arcmin})^{\mathrm{e}}$ | $22.54 \pm 1.4 / 32^{\mathrm{d}}$ | 2 |
| $e^{\mathrm{f}}$ | $0.32 \pm 0.04$ | 2 |
| $P A(\mathrm{deg})^{\mathrm{g}}$ | $64 \pm 2.5$ | 2 |
| $\sigma_{V}\left(\mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}{ }^{-1}\right)^{\mathrm{h}}$ | $6.8 \pm 1.6$ | 3 |
| $[\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}]^{\mathrm{i}}$ | $-2.0 \pm 0.30$ | 4 |
| $\mathrm{E}(\mathrm{B}-\mathrm{V})^{\mathrm{j}}$ | $0.04 \pm 0.02$ | 1 |
| $(m-M)_{0}(\mathrm{mag})^{\mathrm{k}}$ | $20.03 \pm 0.09$ | 1 |

${ }^{a}$ References: 1) Mateo 1998; 2) Walcher et al. 2002; 3) Mateo et al. 1993; 4) Smecker-Hane et al. 1999a. ${ }^{b}$ Total Visual magnitude. ${ }^{c}$ Core radius. ${ }^{d}$ The two estimates refer to an empirical (King 1962) and to a theorethical (Binney \& Tremaine 1987) profile. ${ }^{e}$ Tidal radius. ${ }^{f}$ Eccentricity. $g$ Major axis position angle. ${ }^{h}$ Stellar central velocity, dispersion. ${ }^{i}$ Metallicity. ${ }^{j}$ Reddening. ${ }^{k}$ True distance modulus.

Table 2. Photometric data adopted in this investigation.

| Field | Instrument | Images | FOV $^{\text {a }}$ | R.A. $^{\text {b }}$ | DEC. $^{\text {b }}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| C | WFI@2.2m $^{\mathrm{c}}$ | $54(\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{~V})$ | $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$ | 064137 | -505800 |
| C | MC@4m $^{\mathrm{d}}$ | $50(\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{~V})$ | $36^{\prime} \times 36^{\prime}$ | $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ |
| EIS-a | WFI@2.2m $^{\mathrm{e}}$ | $2(\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{~V}, \mathrm{I})$ | $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$ | 064236 | -504500 |
| EIS-b | WFI@2.2m $^{\mathrm{e}}$ | $2(\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{~V}, \mathrm{I})$ | $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$ | 063855 | -504500 |
| EIS-c | WFI@2.2m $^{\mathrm{e}}$ | $2(\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{~V}, \mathrm{I})$ | $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$ | 063855 | -511100 |
| EIS-d | WFI@2.2m $^{\mathrm{e}}$ | $2(\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{~V}, \mathrm{I})$ | $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$ | 064236 | -511100 |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ Field of view (arcmin). ${ }^{b}$ Field coordinates (J2000). ${ }^{c}$ Data set collected with the WFI available at the 2.2 m ESO/MPI telescope. The photometry is discussed in this paper. ${ }^{d}$ Data set collected with the Mosaic Camera available at the 4 m CTIO Blanco telescope. These data were adopted to produce Fig. 1, the photometry will be discussed in a forthcoming paper. ${ }^{e}$ Data set collected with the WFI by the EIS project. telescope. These data were adopted to produce Fig. 1 and to improve the accuracy of the astrometric solution (see §2.3). The photometry will be discussed in a forthcoming paper.

Table 3. Log of scientific CCD images of Carina

| Frame <br> (1) | Date ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> (2) | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{JD}^{\mathrm{b}} \\ & (3) \end{aligned}$ | UT Start ${ }^{\text {c }}$ <br> (4) | Exposure ${ }^{\mathrm{d}}$ <br> (5) | Filter ${ }^{\text {e }}$ <br> (6) | Seeing ${ }^{f}$ (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Central field ${ }^{\text {g }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 46253 | Jan5 | 48.0554 | 1:19:51 | 300 | V | 1.7 |
| 46254 | Jan5 | 48.0607 | 1:27:29 | 300 | B | 1.5 |
| 46358 | Jan5 | 49.0162 | 0:23:25 | 30 | V | 1.4 |
| 46359 | Jan5 | 49.0211 | 0:30:27 | 30 | V | 1.5 |
| 46364 | Jan5 | 49.0648 | 1:33:19 | 500 | V | 1.7 |
| 46365 | Jan5 | 49.0724 | 1:44:18 | 500 | B | 1.2 |
| 46366 | Jan5 | 49.0792 | 1:54:07 | 500 | V | 1.1 |
| 46367 | Jan5 | 49.0872 | 2:05:39 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| 46368 | Jan5 | 49.0949 | 2:16:43 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46369 | Jan5 | 49.1033 | 2:28:50 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| 46370 | Jan5 | 49.1120 | 2:41:21 | 500 | V | 1.1 |
| 46371 | Jan5 | 49.1206 | 2:52:21 | 500 | B | 1.2 |
| 46372 | Jan5 | 49.1268 | 3:02:40 | 500 | V | 1.1 |
| 46373 | Jan5 | 49.1345 | 3:13:48 | 500 | B | 1.2 |
| 46374 | Jan5 | 49.1418 | 3:24:12 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46375 | Jan5 | 49.1486 | 3:34:07 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| 46376 | Jan5 | 49.1556 | 3:44:08 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46377 | Jan5 | 49.1624 | 3:53:57 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46378 | Jan5 | 49.1693 | 4:03:51 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46379 | Jan5 | 49.1761 | 4:13:36 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46382 | Jan5 | 49.1969 | 4:43:38 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46383 | Jan5 | 49.2040 | 4:53:49 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46384 | Jan5 | 49.2108 | 5:03:34 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46385 | Jan5 | 49.2181 | 5:14:11 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46386 | Jan5 | 49.2285 | 5:29:02 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46387 | Jan5 | 49.2363 | 5:40:20 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46388 | Jan5 | 49.2431 | 5:50:11 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46391 | Jan5 | 49.2593 | 6:13:27 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46392 | Jan5 | 49.2662 | 6:23:24 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46393 | Jan5 | 49.2731 | 6:33:18 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46394 | Jan5 | 49.2799 | 6:43:06 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46395 | Jan5 | 49.2873 | 6:53:50 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46396 | Jan5 | 49.2942 | 7:03:40 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46397 | Jan5 | 49.3011 | 7:13:43 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46398 | Jan5 | 49.3079 | 7:23:28 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46399 | Jan5 | 49.3148 | 7:33:23 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46400 | Jan5 | 49.3216 | 7:43:12 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| 46401 | Jan5 | 49.3287 | 7:53:28 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46402 | Jan5 | 49.3357 | 8:03:33 | 500 | B | 1.2 |

Table 3-Continued

| Frame <br> (1) | Date ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> (2) | $\mathrm{JD}^{\mathrm{b}}$ <br> (3) | UT Start ${ }^{\text {c }}$ <br> (4) | Exposure ${ }^{\text {d }}$ <br> (5) | Filter ${ }^{\text {e }}$ <br> (6) | Seeing ${ }^{\text {f }}$ <br> (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 46403 | Jan5 | 49.3425 | 8:13:15 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46404 | Jan5 | 49.3494 | 8:23:13 | 500 | B | 1.3 |
| 46405 | Jan5 | 49.3564 | 8:33:19 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46406 | Jan5 | 49.3632 | 8:43:07 | 500 | B | 1.3 |
| 46509 | Jan6 | 50.0440 | 1:03:26 | 500 | V | 1.4 |
| 46510 | Jan6 | 50.0525 | 1:15:41 | 500 | B | 1.4 |
| 46511 | Jan6 | 50.0598 | 1:26:09 | 900 | V | 1.5 |
| 46512 | Jan6 | 50.0727 | 1:44:46 | 900 | B | 1.4 |
| 46513 | Jan6 | 50.0856 | 2:03:16 | 900 | V | 1.3 |
| 46514 | Jan6 | 50.0978 | 2:20:53 | 900 | B | 1.3 |
| 46516 | Jan6 | 50.1180 | 2:50:03 | 600 | V | 1.1 |
| 46517 | Jan6 | 50.1271 | 3:03:06 | 600 | B | 1.2 |
| 46518 | Jan6 | 50.1361 | 3:16:04 | 600 | V | 1.1 |
| 46520 | Jan6 | 50.1548 | 3:43:02 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| 46521 | Jan6 | 50.1630 | 3:54:44 | 500 | V | 1.1 |
| 46522 | Jan6 | 50.1717 | 4:07:23 | 500 | B | 1.2 |
| 46523 | Jan6 | 50.1790 | 4:17:50 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46524 | Jan6 | 50.1860 | 4:27:53 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46525 | Jan6 | 50.1933 | 4:38:27 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46526 | Jan6 | 50.2004 | 4:48:37 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46527 | Jan6 | 50.2074 | 4:58:47 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46528 | Jan6 | 50.2156 | 5:10:33 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46529 | Jan6 | 50.2228 | 5:20:51 | 144 | V | 1.0 |
| 46531 | Jan6 | 50.2345 | 5:37:42 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46532 | Jan6 | 50.2427 | 5:49:36 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46533 | Jan6 | 50.2500 | 5:59:56 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46534 | Jan6 | 50.2584 | 6:12:11 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46535 | Jan6 | 50.2654 | 6:22:11 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46536 | Jan6 | 50.2727 | 6:32:48 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46537 | Jan6 | 50.2796 | 6:42:43 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46538 | Jan6 | 50.2867 | 6:52:57 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46540 | Jan6 | 50.3007 | 7:13:04 | 156 | V | 1.0 |
| 46541 | Jan6 | 50.3048 | 7:18:55 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46544 | Jan6 | 50.3279 | 7:52:13 | 500 | V | 1.1 |
| 46545 | Jan6 | 50.3361 | 8:04:00 | 600 | B | 1.3 |
| 46546 | Jan6 | 50.3440 | 8:15:23 | 600 | V | 1.0 |
| 46547 | Jan6 | 50.3521 | 8:27:05 | 700 | B | 1.2 |
| 46548 | Jan6 | 50.3623 | 8:41:49 | 120 | B | 1.4 |
| 46549 | Jan6 | 50.3649 | 8:45:28 | 30 | B | 1.2 |
| 46550 | Jan6 | 50.3673 | 8:48:58 | 120 | V | 1.1 |

Table 3-Continued

| Frame <br> (1) | Date ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> (2) | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{JD}^{\mathrm{b}} \\ & (3) \end{aligned}$ | UT Start ${ }^{\text {c }}$ <br> (4) | Exposure ${ }^{\mathrm{d}}$ <br> (5) | Filter ${ }^{\text {e }}$ <br> (6) | Seeing ${ }^{f}$ <br> (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 46551 | Jan6 | 50.3694 | 8:52:04 | 30 | V | 1.1 |
| 46602 | Jan7 | 51.0407 | 0:58:44 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46603 | Jan7 | 51.0477 | 1:08:43 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46604 | Jan7 | 51.0548 | 1:18:55 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46605 | Jan7 | 51.0620 | 1:29:22 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46606 | Jan7 | 51.0688 | 1:39:05 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46607 | Jan7 | 51.0755 | 1:48:45 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46608 | Jan7 | 51.0822 | 1:58:25 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46609 | Jan7 | 51.0890 | 2:08:15 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46610 | Jan7 | 51.0981 | 2:21:17 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46611 | Jan7 | 51.1049 | 2:31:06 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46614 | Jan7 | 51.1229 | 2:57:07 | 500 | V | 0.7 |
| 46615 | Jan7 | 51.1297 | 3:06:49 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46616 | Jan7 | 51.1364 | 3:16:32 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46617 | Jan7 | 51.1432 | 3:26:17 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46618 | Jan7 | 51.1500 | 3:36:04 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46619 | Jan7 | 51.1568 | 3:45:47 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46620 | Jan7 | 51.1635 | 3:55:34 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46621 | Jan7 | 51.1703 | 4:05:18 | 500 | B | 0.8 |
| 46622 | Jan7 | 51.1770 | 4:14:58 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46623 | Jan7 | 51.1838 | 4:24:42 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46624 | Jan7 | 51.1906 | 4:34:32 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46625 | Jan7 | 51.1974 | 4:44:22 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46626 | Jan7 | 51.2042 | 4:54:04 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46627 | Jan7 | 51.2110 | 5:03:54 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46628 | Jan7 | 51.2202 | 5:17:12 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46629 | Jan7 | 51.2270 | 5:26:56 | 500 | B | 1.3 |
| 46630 | Jan7 | 51.2337 | 5:36:34 | 500 | V | 1.2 |
| 46631 | Jan7 | 51.2405 | 5:46:21 | 500 | B | 1.3 |
| 46632 | Jan7 | 51.2472 | 5:56:05 | 500 | V | 1.0 |
| 46633 | Jan7 | 51.2539 | 6:05:44 | 500 | B | 1.2 |
| 46634 | Jan7 | 51.2607 | 6:15:28 | 500 | V | 1.1 |
| 46635 | Jan7 | 51.2675 | 6:25:14 | 500 | B | 1.2 |
| 46637 | Jan7 | 51.2808 | 6:44:29 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46638 | Jan7 | 51.2876 | 6:54:12 | 500 | B | 0.9 |
| 46639 | Jan7 | 51.2944 | 7:03:58 | 500 | V | 0.8 |
| 46640 | Jan7 | 51.3015 | 7:14:13 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46641 | Jan7 | 51.3084 | 7:24:14 | 500 | V | 0.9 |
| 46642 | Jan7 | 51.3162 | 7:35:21 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| 46643 | Jan7 | 51.3232 | 7:45:28 | 500 | V | 1.2 |

Table 3-Continued

| Frame <br> (1) | Date ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> (2) | $\mathrm{JD}^{\mathrm{b}}$ <br> (3) | UT Start ${ }^{\text {c }}$ <br> (4) | Exposure ${ }^{\text {d }}$ <br> (5) | Filter ${ }^{\mathrm{e}}$ <br> (6) | Seeing ${ }^{f}$ <br> (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 46644 | Jan7 | 51.3303 | 7:55:39 | 500 | B | 1.0 |
| 46645 | Jan7 | 51.3372 | 8:05:33 | 900 | V | 0.9 |
| 46646 | Jan7 | 51.3492 | 8:22:54 | 900 | B | 1.1 |
| 46647 | Jan7 | 51.3616 | 8:40:46 | 500 | B | 1.1 |
| EIS-a field ${ }^{\text {8 }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 52197 | Feb26 | 100.042209 | 1:00:47 | 240 | B | 1.6 |
| 52198 | Feb26 | 100.046436 | 1:06:52 | 240 | B | 1.5 |
| 52201 | Feb26 | 100.053631 | 1:17:14 | 240 | V | 1.4 |
| 52202 | Feb26 | 100.057854 | 1:23:19 | 240 | V | 1.6 |
| 52204 | Feb26 | 100.063370 | 1:31:15 | 240 | I | 1.5 |
| 52205 | Feb26 | 100.067260 | 1:36:51 | 240 | I | 1.5 |
| EIS-b field ${ }^{\text {g }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 52213 | Feb26 | 100.096887 | 2:17:56 | 30 | B | 1.9 |
| 52214 | Feb26 | 100.101842 | 2:19:31 | 240 | B | 1.8 |
| 52210 | Feb26 | 100.084558 | 2:01:46 | 240 | V | 1.7 |
| 52211 | Feb26 | 100.090131 | 2:09:47 | 240 | V | 1.8 |
| 52207 | Feb26 | 100.073152 | 1:45:20 | 240 | I | 1.7 |
| 52208 | Feb26 | 100.076994 | 1:50:52 | 240 | I | 1.7 |
| EIS-c field ${ }^{\text {g }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 52217 | Feb26 | 100.107976 | 2:35:29 | 240 | B | 2.0 |
| 52218 | Feb26 | 100.112669 | 2:42:15 | 240 | B | 1.9 |
| 52220 | Feb26 | 100.119605 | 2:52:14 | 240 | V | 1.9 |
| 52221 | Feb26 | 100.123418 | 2:57:43 | 240 | V | 1.9 |
| 52225 | Feb26 | 100.137814 | 3:18:27 | 240 | I | 0.9 |
| 52226 | Feb26 | 100.141563 | 3:23:51 | 240 | I | 0.9 |
| EIS-d field ${ }^{\text {g }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 52234 | Feb26 | 100.167139 | 4:00:41 | 240 | B | 1.7 |
| 52235 | Feb26 | 100.170812 | 4:05:58 | 240 | B | 1.7 |
| 52231 | Feb26 | 100.157976 | 3:47:29 | 240 | V | 1.7 |
| 52232 | Feb26 | 100.161693 | 3:52:50 | 240 | V | 1.4 |
| 52228 | Feb26 | 100.148599 | 3:33:59 | 240 | I | 1.5 |
| 52229 | Feb26 | 100.152297 | 3:39:19 | 240 | I | 1.5 |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ UT Date 2000. ${ }^{b}$ Julian Day - $2451500.0^{c}$ UT start of the exposure time. ${ }^{d}$ Individual exposure time (sec). ${ }^{e}$ The B and the V filters are the $\mathrm{B} / 99$ and the V/89 ESO filters. ${ }^{f}$ Individual seeing (arcsec). ${ }^{g}$ See Table 2 for more details.

Table 4. Standard stellar fields observed for this investigation.

| Set | Field | Instrument | Images |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Dec $^{\text {a }}$ | Rubin 149 | WFI@2.2m | (B,V) |
| Jan $^{\text {b }}$ | SA 98, Rubin 149, PG 1047 | 0.9 m CTIO | (B,V) |
| Mar $^{\mathrm{c}}$ | Rubin 149, PG 0918, PG 1323, PG 1633 | WFI@2.2m | (B,V) |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ Data set collected between Dec 1999 and Jan 2000 with the WFI at the 2.2 m ESO/MPI telescope. ${ }^{b}$ Data sets collected on Jan 31 at the 0.9 m CTIO telescope. ${ }^{c}$ Data sets collected on March 2000 with the WFI.

Table 5. Log of standard stellar fields and scientific CCD images.

| Frame <br> (1) | Date ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> (2) | Exposure ${ }^{\text {b }}$ <br> (3) | Filter <br> (4) | Field ${ }^{\text {c }}$ <br> (5) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| December set ${ }^{\text {d }}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 45642 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45649 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45662 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45650 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45665 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45641 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45659 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45648 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45668 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45655 | Dec31 | 30 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 45647 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45657 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45656 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45643 | Dec31 | 30 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45663 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45664 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45651 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45644 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45658 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45670 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45669 | Dec31 | 20 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 45788 | Jan1 | 300 | V | Carina OC |
| 45789 | Jan1 | 300 | V | Carina OC |
| 45790 | Jan1 | 300 | V | Carina OC |
| 45791 | Jan1 | 300 | B | Carina OC |
| 45792 | Jan1 | 300 | B | Carina OC |
| 45793 | Jan1 | 300 | B | Carina OC |
| January set ${ }^{\text {e }}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 56 | Jan31 | 60 | B | SA 98 |
| 57 | Jan31 | 60 | V | SA 98 |
| 58 | Jan31 | 30 | B | SA 98 |
| 59 | Jan31 | 30 | V | SA 98 |
| 66 | Jan31 | 40 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 67 | Jan31 | 40 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 68 | Jan31 | 20 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 69 | Jan31 | 20 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 84 | Jan31 | 60 | B | PG 1047 |
| 85 | Jan31 | 60 | B | PG 1047 |
| 86 | Jan31 | 30 | V | PG 1047 |

Table 5-Continued

| Frame <br> $(1)$ | Date $^{\mathrm{a}}$ <br> $(2)$ | Exposure $^{\mathrm{b}}$ <br> $(3)$ | Filter <br> $(4)$ | Field $^{\mathrm{c}}$ <br> $(5)$ |
| ---: | :---: | ---: | :---: | :---: |
| 87 | Jan31 | 30 | V | PG 1047 |
| 60 | Jan31 | 400 | B | Carina C |
| 61 | Jan31 | 600 | V | Carina C |
| 62 | Jan31 | 400 | B | Carina C |
| 63 | Jan31 | 600 | V | Carina C |
| 64 | Jan31 | 400 | B | Carina C |
| 65 | Jan31 | 600 | V | Carina C |
|  |  | March set |  |  |
| 53481 | Mar5 | 7 | B | Rubin 149 |
| 53482 | Mar5 | 7 | V | Rubin 149 |
| 53489 | Mar5 | 15 | B | PG 0918 |
| 53508 | Mar5 | 15 | B | PG 0918 |
| 53488 | Mar5 | 8 | V | PG 0918 |
| 53507 | Mar5 | 12 | V | PG 0918 |
| 53528 | Mar5 | 8 | B | PG 1323 |
| 53526 | Mar5 | 8 | V | PG 1323 |
| 53542 | Mar5 | 10 | B | PG 1633 |
| 53555 | Mar5 | 10 | B | PG 1633 |
| 53543 | Mar5 | 10 | V | PG 1633 |
| 53554 | Mar5 | 10 | V | PG 1633 |
| 53491 | Mar5 | 300 | B | Carina C |
| 53492 | Mar5 | 300 | V | Carina C |
|  |  |  |  |  |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ UT Date for the December set 1999/2000, while for the January and the March set is 2000 . Individual exposure time (sec). ${ }^{c}$ Observed field. The field "Carina C" is centered on the galaxy, while "Carina OC" is shifted by $\approx 25$ arcmin in right ascension, East direction. ${ }^{d}$ Data collected with the WFI at the 2.2 m ESO/MPI telescope, field of view $34^{\prime} \times 33^{\prime}$. ${ }^{e}$ Data collected with the 0.9 m CTIO telescope, field of view $14 \times 14^{\prime}$.

Fig. 1.- Carina true color image obtained using the iraftask color.rgbsun. The image covers a field of approximately 1 degree $^{2}$ centered on Carina and it was created by combining the deep $B, V$ median images of the central regions $\left(\approx 0.3\right.$ degree ${ }^{2}$ ) collected with the WFI and the MOSAIC Imager at the 4 m Blanco/CTIO telescopes, together with the shallower B,V,I median images collected by EIS with the WFI. Northern and Eastern directions are on top and on the left, respectively. (Only available at "Carina Project" website)

Fig. 2.- Map in Galactic coordinates of the 68,000 stars identified in the central Carina field. The gaps mark the individual chips and are present becaused B and V images were not dithered. Empty circles are due to saturated Galactic field stars. The cross marks the Carina center (see Table 1), while the orientation is showed in the bottom right corner.

Fig. 3.- Difference in right ascension and declination between current astrometric positions, obtained using the GSC2 catalog, and the UCAC1 catalog. Note that the bulk of the 107 stars in our sample presents a discrepancy smaller, at $1 \sigma$ level, than 100 mas.

Fig. 4.- Relative response of the 8 chips of the WFI mosaic. The difference in instrumental V magnitude of the same stars as a function of V magnitude measured in each chip and in the reference chip $\# 56$. The unexpected large scatter in the residuals for the top chips $\# 50-\# 53$ suggests a dependence of the residuals on the position of the stars in the mosaic.

Fig. 5.- Relative response of the 8 chips of the WFI mosaic. The standard stars from Stetson (120-140) in the Rubin 149 field measured in the 8 chips in the V band have been corrected following the procedure described in $\S 4$ and calibrated. The residuals now present a homogeneous pattern independent of the position inside the chips and the scatter attains values connected with the $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{N}$ ratio of the individual measurements.

Fig. 6. - Same as Fig. 5, but as a function of the (B-V) color.

Fig. 7.- Same as Fig. 5, but for the B magnitude.

Fig. 8. - Same as Fig. 6, but for the B magnitude.

Fig. 9.- Comparison between the (B-V) colors (top) and the V magnitudes (bottom) of Stetson's standard stars brighter than $\mathrm{V}=17 \mathrm{mag}$ and current photometry and calibrations.

Fig. 10. - Comparison between two independent absolute calibrations. A set of isolated and good $\mathrm{S} / \mathrm{N}$ stars have been selected as secondary standards. These stars have been measured and calibrated independently on the B,V data collected in December 1999 and on the B,V data collected in March 2000. The residuals show a good agreement both in magnitude and in color.

Fig. 11.- Comparison between (B-V) colors (top) and V magnitudes (bottom) of current secondary standards and the secondary standards collected with the 0.9 m CTIO telescope. The two independent calibrations are consistent within the errors.

Fig. 12.- Comparison between the (B-V) colors (top) and the V magnitudes (bottom) by Hurley-Keller et al. (1998) and current photometry.

Fig. 13. - The CMD of Carina central regions across the eight individual chips of the WFI. The orientation is the same as in Fig. 2.

Fig. 14.- The cumulative CMD of Carina central area. The parameters adopted to select the bona fide stars are $\mid$ sharpness $\mid \leq 1$ and $\chi \leq 3$.

Fig. 15. - The same as Fig. 14, but together with Carina stars (dots) are also plotted the stars belonging to the old LMC cluster Reticulum (red open circles, Monelli et al. 2002). The latter sample was artificially shifted in magnitude by $\approx 1.68 \mathrm{mag}$ to match the old Carina population.

Fig. 16. - Top - Comparison between theoretical predictions and empirical data for the GGC NGC 1904. The solid line shows an isochrone of 11 Gyr , constructed by adopting $\mathrm{Y}=0.23, \mathrm{Z}=0.004$, and a mixing length $\alpha=2$. The dashed line displays the ZAHB for the same chemical composition (see text for details). The photometry was performed by Piotto et al. (2002, see also the web page http://www.menhir.pd.astro.it). Bottom - Same as the top, but the data refer to Reticulum (Monelli et al. 2002). Theoretical models were plotted using distance moduli and reddening estimates available in the literature. See text for more details.

Fig. 17.- The cumulative CMD of Carina together with theoretical isochrones (solid blue lines) at fixed chemical composition $-\mathrm{Y}=0.23, \mathrm{Z}=0.0004$ - and mixing length $\alpha=2$. The isochrones range from 0.6 to 11 Gyr (see labeled values). Dashed line shows the ZAHB for the same chemical composition and for a progenitor age of 12 Gy. Note that the isochrone for $t \approx 5$ Gyr nicely fits the red clump region. Red open circles display the Reticulum ridge line. See text for details concerning distance and reddening correction.

Fig. 18. - Comparison between predicted and empirical He-burning stars. Together with static stars (small dots) are also plotted the Carina variables: circles RR Lyrae stars, triangles, ACs. Crosses mark variables that present poor-phase coverage. Different line styles display predicted Zero Age He-burning structures at fixed chemical composition and progenitor ages ranging from $12\left(M=0.8 M_{\odot}\right)$ to $0.6\left(M=2.2 M_{\odot}\right)$ Gyr.

Fig. 19. - The dashed and the solid boxes show the CMD regions selected as representative of the old (HB and SGB) and of the young (RC, intermediate-age MS) population respectively. Variables have been plotted using the same symbols as in Fig. 18.

Fig. 20. - The isodensity map of the Carina stellar content (dashed contours). The solid contours show the isodensity levels of the old (HB and SGB) stellar population. The isodensity levels range from $20 \%$ to $100 \%$ with a step of $20 \%$.

Fig. 21.- Same as Fig. 20, but the solid contours show the isodensity levels of the young ( RC and intermediate-age MS) stellar population.

Fig. 22.- Histograms of the star counts along the major (top) and the minor (bottom) axis for the entire stellar population of the Carina dSph. The sigma of the gaussian fits are labeled.

Fig. 23. - Histograms of the star counts for the old (top) and the intermediate-age (bottom) stellar populations (see text for details) along the Carina major axis.

Fig. 24. - Same as Fig. 23, but along the Carina minor axis. As in the case of the major axis, the old population shows a broad distribution.

Fig. 25.- Same as Fig. 22, but for blue plume stars along the major (top) and the minor (bottom) axis.

This figure "monelli.fig2.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig3.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig4.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig5.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig6.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig7.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig8.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig9.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig10.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig11.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig12.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig13.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig14.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig15.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig16.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig17.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig18.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig19.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig20.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig21.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig22.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig23.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig24.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1

This figure "monelli.fig25.png" is available in "png" format from: http://arxiv.org/ps/astro-ph/0303493v1


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Based on observations collected at the European Southern Observatory, La Silla, Chile on Osservatorio Astronomico di Capodimonte guaranteed time.
    ${ }^{2}$ Operated by Associations of Universities for Research in Astronomy (AURA), Inc., under cooperative agreement with the National Science Foundation.

[^1]:    ${ }^{3}$ For more details see http://www.eso.org/science/eis.
    ${ }^{4}$ The complete version of this table is only available in the on-line edition of the manuscript.

[^2]:    ${ }^{5}$ Current astrometric pipeline (Nonino et al. 1999) is partly based on tools available at ftp://ftp.strw.leidenuniv.nl/pub/ldac/software/

[^3]:    ${ }^{6}$ See also the web page http://ad.usno.navy.mil/ad/ucac/

[^4]:    ${ }^{7}$ See also the web page http://cadcwww.hia.nrc.ca/standards

[^5]:    ${ }^{8}$ These figures are only available in the on-line edition of the manuscript.
    ${ }^{9}$ This table is only available in the on-line edition of the manuscript.

