Supercooled Goldstones at the QCD chiral phase transition

Adrien Florio,^{1, 2, *} Eduardo Grossi,^{3, †} Aleksas Mazeliauskas,^{4, ‡} Alexander Soloviev,^{5, §} and Derek Teaney^{6, ¶}

¹Fakultät für Physik, Universität Bielefeld, D-33615 Bielefeld, Germany

²Department of Physics, Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, New York 11973-5000, USA

³Dipartimento di Fisica, Università di Firenze and INFN Sezione di Firenze,

via G. Sansone 1, 50019 Sesto Fiorentino, Italy

⁴Institut für Theoretische Physik, Universität Heidelberg D-69120 Heidelberg, Germany

⁵Faculty of Mathematics and Physics, University of Ljubljana, Jadranska ulica 19, SI-1000 Ljubljana, Slovenia

⁶Center for Nuclear Theory, Department of Physics and Astronomy,

Stony Brook University, New York 11794-3800, USA

(Dated: April 7, 2025)

We discuss the universal non-equilibrium enhancement of long-wavelength Goldstone bosons induced by quenches to broken phase in Model G — the dynamical universality class of an O(4)-antiferromagnet and chiral QCD phase transition. Generic scaling arguments predict a parametric enhancement in the infrared spectra of Goldstones, which is confirmed by fully-fledged stochastic simulations. The details of the enhancement are determined by the non-linear dynamics of a superfluid effective theory, which is a limit of Model G reflecting the broken O(4) symmetry. Our results translate to a parametric enhancement of low-momentum pions in heavy-ion collisions at the LHC, which are underpredicted in current hydrodynamic models without critical dynamics.

Introduction. Criticality is central to the understanding of a plethora of phenomena across different physical systems. The core reason behind this is that critical systems are universal: a ferromagnet behaves in the same way close to its transition point from an ordered phase to a disordered one as some cellular membranes [1]. This universality applies not only to a system's static properties but also to its dynamic properties. The typical dynamical time-scale τ_R associated with the relaxation of the relevant order parameters diverges at criticality, a phenomenon known as critical slowing down. Near criticality, the order parameter is a slow variable, whose dynamics has to and can be included in any effective hydrodynamical description of the system [2–4].

The collision of ultra-relativistic ions forms a "fireball" of quark-gluon plasma (QGP), the high-temperature phase of quantum chromodynamics (QCD) where chiral symmetry is restored [5]. The subsequent rapid expansion and cooling leads to the hadronic phase of QCD, where quarks and gluons are confined, and chiral symmetry is broken. This transition is a crossover [6, 7] but is close in parameter space to a second-order critical point. Indeed, in the limit where the up and down quark masses are exactly zero (the "chiral limit" of QCD), the transition is known to be second order [8–11] and conjectured to be in the universality class of an O(4)-antiferromagnet.

It has been known for a long time that the dynamical universality class of chiral QCD is the "Model G" of Hohenberg and Halperin [12]. The pioneering works [12– 15] have speculated that the rapid QGP expansion could lead to a formation of disoriented chiral condensate, but these predictions were never experimentally confirmed in low energy nuclear collisions [16–19]. With the advent of high-energy heavy-ion collisions at the LHC, the standard relativistic hydrodynamics models of heavy-ion collision have surpassed expectations in describing lowmomentum hadronic data and have put tight constraints on QGP transport properties [20]. Nevertheless, a persistent model-to-data tension of low momentum pions (the Goldstones of chiral symmetry breaking) indicates an incompleteness of the hydrodynamic description of QGP [21–28]. Recent advances, in particular in lattice QCD and the high-precision data at the LHC, have revived interest in chiral critical dynamics and its phenomenological signatures [29–37].

In this work, we discuss some universal nonequilibrium features of Goldstone modes in Model G during quenches from the restored to the broken phase (supercooling). Because of their coupling to conserved charges, the Goldstone modes behave as pseudo-particles and can propagate ballistically over many correlation lengths before diffusing back to the medium. This separation of scales leads to a parametric enhancement in their infrared spectrum. We confirm this prediction by detailed stochastic simulations of instantaneous quenches in Model G, which are further detailed in our companion paper [38]. For the QCD chiral phase transition, our results imply a parametric enhancement of low momentum pions over thermal yields. We conclude by commenting on potential phenomenological implications in heavy-ion collisions.

O(4)-antiferromagnet (Model G). We briefly review Model G [2] and refer the reader to our companion paper [38] and previous works [31]. Model G captures the dynamics of an O(4) local order parameter $(\phi_0, \phi_1, \phi_2, \phi_3)$ coupled to partially conserved axial charges n_A^ℓ and conserved vector charges n_V^ℓ , which can be combined in an antisymmetric O(4) tensor n_{ab} with $n_{0\ell} = n_A^\ell$ and $n_{\ell_1\ell_2} = \epsilon^{\ell_1\ell_2\ell}n_V^\ell$. In equilibrium, the fields are distributed according to the following Landau-Ginzburg free energy

$$\mathcal{H}[\phi] = \int d^3x \left[\frac{1}{2} \nabla \phi_a \nabla \phi_a + U(\phi) + \frac{1}{4\chi_I} n_{ab} n^{ab} \right]$$
(1a)

$$U(\phi) = \frac{1}{2}m_0^2 \phi^2 + \frac{\lambda}{4}(\phi \cdot \phi)^2.$$
 (1b)

The dynamics is governed by the following equations of motion (EoM)

$$\partial_t \phi_a + \frac{1}{\chi_I} n_{ab} \phi_b = \Gamma_0 \frac{\delta \mathcal{H}}{\delta \phi_a} + \theta_a \,, \tag{2a}$$

$$\partial_t n_{ab} + \nabla \cdot (\nabla \phi_{[a} \phi_{b]}) = \sigma_0 \nabla^2 \frac{\delta \mathcal{H}}{\delta n_{ab}} + \partial_i \Xi^i_{ab} \,. \tag{2b}$$

Here the left-hand side of the equations of motion encodes the ideal symplectic structure of the system and determines the superfluid dynamics discussed below. The right-hand side encodes the dissipative dynamics, governed by the relaxation coefficient Γ_0 and the charge conductivity σ_0 . Finally, the noise terms θ and Ξ reproduce the fluctuation-dissipation theorem.

At fixed coupling λ , the model has a critical mass m_c^2 ; for example, for $\lambda = 4$, $m_c^2 = -4.811$ [34, 39]. For $m_0^2 > m_c^2$, the O(4) symmetry remains unbroken, and the mean value of the order parameter ϕ_a (the chiral condensate in QCD) vanishes. For $m_0^2 < m_c^2$, the O(4)symmetry is spontaneously broken to O(3), producing three Goldstone modes $\vec{\pi} = (\pi_1, \pi_2, \pi_3)$, identified as pions.

In the broken phase, the magnitude of the order parameter ϕ_a is approximately constant, and the left-hand side of (2) describes the coupling between conserved charges and Goldstone modes (or the direction of ϕ_a). When the dissipative terms on the right-hand side are neglected, the resulting coupled equations correspond to an ideal non-abelian superfluid, reflecting the breaking of O(4)symmetry [30, 40]. In this limit, the ideal superfluid theory depends on just two parameters: $f^2 = \phi_a \phi_a$ and the susceptibility χ_I , both of which can be determined from Euclidean measurements in lattice QCD [41–43].

A linearized analysis of the superfluid equations (including dissipation) yields the pion dispersion relation, $\omega(k) = vk - iD_Ak^2/2$, with $v^2 = f^2/\chi_I$ [44]. Thus, the propagation of long-wavelength pions is characterized by two timescales: a "ballistic" timescale 1/(vk) and a "diffusive" timescale $1/(D_Ak^2)$.

Even near the critical point, these timescales remain parametrically separated for $k\xi \ll 1$. Matching the hydrodynamic EFT to the underlying critical theory gives $v \sim \xi^{(2-d)/2} \sim \xi/\tau_R$, where ξ is the diverging correlation



FIG. 1. Illustration of instantaneous quenches in Model G. (Left) At every point in space, the effective potential of the theory suddenly changes from a convex potential to a double-well potential. Fields without an expectation value become metastable. After a time of order τ_R , the field locally reach a given minimum in field space ("bottom of the well"), leading to many small randomly oriented domains shown in the right panel. (Right) The domains merge in a time $t_B \sim L/v$ with dynamics given by the superfluid limit of Model G (see text).

length and $\tau_R \sim \xi^{d/2}$ is the relaxation time of the order parameter [45]. Meanwhile, the diffusion constant scales as $D_A \sim \xi^2 / \tau_R$ [44].

For a system of size L with $k \sim 1/L$, we then find the parametric separation:

$$t_B \equiv \frac{L}{v} \sim \tau_R \left(\frac{L}{\xi}\right) \,, \tag{3}$$

and

$$t_D \equiv \frac{L^2}{D_A} \sim \tau_R \left(\frac{L}{\xi}\right)^2 \,. \tag{4}$$

Thus, in the limit of large systems, $L/\xi \gg 1$, the hierarchy $\tau_R \ll t_B \ll t_D$ holds near the critical point. As we will see, when the system undergoes an instantaneous quench from the symmetric to the broken phase, the hierarchy of timescales leads to a strong enhancement of the infrared spectrum of the Goldstone modes (pions).

Quenches and scaling analysis. We consider the setup shown in Fig. 1. The system begins in thermal equilibrium at $T > T_c$ $(m_0^2 > m_c^2, \text{ red-dashed potential})$ and is suddenly quenched into the broken phase at $T\,<\,T_c$ $(m_0^2 < m_c^2)$, blue potential), with the quench tuned so that the correlation length ξ remains the same before and after. The initial state is then metastable. In a region of size ℓ , several correlation lengths long, fluctuations of the locally averaged order parameter $\bar{\phi}_a$ are of order $\sim \sqrt{\chi/\ell^d}$, where $\chi \sim \xi^{2-\eta}$ is the chiral susceptibility. These fluctuations trigger the instability, and the local order parameter begins to "roll down the hill" of the potential, approaching the new equilibrium value $\bar{\sigma}_{\rm eq} \sim \xi^{-(d-2+\eta)/2}$ on a short timescale $\sim \tau_R$. At this point, many small, randomly oriented domains have formed. On a longer timescale $t \sim L/v$, these domains begin to grow and merge. Since this growth time

 $t_B \sim L/v$ is much longer than the relaxation time τ_R , the superfluid (hydrodynamic) limit of Model G provides an appropriate dynamical description of the condensate growth. We will now elaborate on this picture.

As a proxy for the global condensate, we focus on "magnetization" $M_a(t) = \phi_a(t, \mathbf{k} = 0)$, which is the zeroth mode of the Fourier transformed order parameter $\phi_a(t, \mathbf{k}) \equiv \frac{1}{V} \sum_{\mathbf{x}} e^{i\mathbf{k}\cdot\mathbf{x}}\phi_a(t, \mathbf{x})$. In addition, we consider the three pion fields $\pi^l(t, \mathbf{k})$, which are projections of $\phi_a(t, \mathbf{k})$ orthogonal to M_a . In particular, we study the non-equilibrium evolution of the following equal-time two-point correlation functions

$$G_0(t) \equiv \frac{V}{4} \sum_{a=1}^4 \left\langle M_a(t) M_a(t) \right\rangle , \qquad (5)$$

$$G_{\pi\pi}(t, \boldsymbol{k}) \equiv \frac{V}{3} \sum_{\ell=1}^{3} \left\langle \pi^{\ell}(t, \boldsymbol{k}) \pi^{\ell}(t, -\boldsymbol{k}) \right\rangle .$$
 (6)

We refer to our companion paper [38] for the complete discussion.

In equilibrium the magnetization becomes of order $M_a \sim \bar{\sigma}_{eq}$, which implies that $G_0(t) \sim V \bar{\sigma}_{eq}^2 \sim \xi^{2-\eta} (L/\xi)^d$. Although locally the order parameter finds the new minimum on timescale τ_R , their global alignment and growth of magnetization takes place over the ballistic timescale t_B , i.e., the time Goldstones (pions) need to propagate the volume. This statement is generic but is predictive only because of the parametric scale separation in (3) and (4). Having recognized the relevant timescale and asymptote leads us to formulate the following form of the scaling hypothesis for the non-equilibrium evolution of the correlation function G_0 for intermediate times $\tau_R \ll t \ll t_D$

$$G_0(t,\xi,L) = \xi^{2-\eta} \left(\frac{L}{\xi}\right)^d \mathcal{F}(vt/L,\xi/L) .$$
 (7)

So far, since $v \sim \xi/\tau_R$, this is a simple rewrite of the usual statement of the dynamical scaling hypothesis, where time is scaled by $\tau_R \propto \xi^{\zeta}$ and lengths are scaled by ξ . Now, however, for $L \to \infty$ and vt/L fixed, we expect \mathcal{F} to be a regular function as $\xi/L \to 0$ and the ξ/L dependence can be dropped. In other words, after factoring out explicitly the extensive behavior of the condensate, we expect the remaining functional dependence to have a well-behaved thermodynamic limit. For times $\tau_R \ll t \ll t_B, G_0$ must be independent of system volume, so $\mathcal{F}(vt/L) \sim (vt/L)^d$ and the magnetization grows as a power-law in time $G_0 = \xi^{2-\eta} (t/\tau_R)^d$. These scalings are the mathematical reflection of Fig. 1.

We have identified a significant regime with times $\tau_R \ll t \sim t_B \ll t_D$. Since the relevant lengths $\sim vt$ are large compared to the correlation length ξ , and the times

are long compared to τ_R , this is a hydrodynamic regime with locally broken symmetry. However, dissipation does not become important until times $\sim t_D$. Therefore, the appropriate hydrodynamic description in this regime is given by the ideal superfluid equations discussed above. In the future, these superfluid equations can be simulated directly to determine condensate growth.

The same scaling analysis can be applied to the pion correlation function (6). Still, in the regime where $\xi \ll L$, for times $t \lesssim t_B$, all directions in field space are uncorrelated and should behave similarly. It is therefore reasonable to expect the pion correlator scales in a similar fashion $G_{\pi\pi}(t,\xi,k,L) = \xi^{2-\eta} (L/\xi)^d \mathcal{F}(vkt,kL)$ with \mathcal{F} again regular in its arguments. For $1 \ll kL \ll L/\xi$ and $vkt \sim 1$, we expect the correlation function to be volume independent. Hence, we anticipate $\mathcal{F}(vkt,kL)$ to simplify to $\mathcal{F}(vkt)/(kL)^d$. As a result, we obtain for $\tau_R \ll t \ll t_D$

$$G_{\pi\pi}(t,\xi,k) = \frac{\xi^{2-\eta}}{(k\xi)^d} \mathcal{F}(vkt) , \qquad (8)$$

where $k\xi \ll 1$ and $vkt \sim 1$.

The scaling arguments can also be extended to small but finite pion masses m (i.e. in the presence of a small explicit symmetry breaking). The scaling form becomes $G_{\pi\pi}(t,\xi,k,L,m) = \xi^{2-\eta} (L/\xi)^d \mathcal{F}(vmt,kL,mL)$. Assuming that \mathcal{F} is volume independent for momenta such that $1/L \ll k \ll m \ll 1/\xi$, immediately implies

$$G_{\pi\pi}(t,\xi,k,m) = \xi^{2-\eta} \left(\frac{1}{m\xi}\right)^d \mathcal{F}(vmt) \ . \tag{9}$$

The effects of the non-equilibrium dynamics are striking. Recalling that the late-time, equilibrium value of the pion correlator is $G_{\pi\pi}^{\text{eq}}(\xi,k) \sim 1/((k\xi)^2 + (m\xi)^2)$ [31], Eqs. (8) and (9) correspond to a parametric enhancement over the equilibrium values (d = 3)

$$\frac{G_{\pi\pi}(t,k)}{G_{\pi\pi}^{\rm eq}(k)} \underset{t\sim 1/vk}{\sim} \begin{cases} 1/k\xi, & k \gg m\\ 1/m\xi, & k \ll m \end{cases}.$$
(10)

This is the key result of our analysis. We predict that during sudden quenches to the broken phase, the infrared spectrum of Goldstones (pions) is parametrically enhanced relative to equilibrium expectation.

We summarize the non-equilibrium evolution of $G_{\pi\pi}(t,k)$ in Fig. 2. The instability triggered by quenching the system develops in time $t \sim \tau_R$ and provides initial conditions for the growth of the correlator. The parametric enhancement of $1/k\xi$ over its equilibrium value occurs when the particles propagate ballistically, for times $t \sim \tau_R/(k\xi)$. Eventually, for longer times of order $t \sim \tau_R/(k\xi)^2$, the system rethermalizes through diffusive processes.



FIG. 2. Schematic depiction of the pion-pion correlator at small momenta $k\xi \ll 1$, after a symmetric quench from the restored to the broken phase. Three timescales characterize the evolution. The onset of the instability happens for $t \sim \tau_R$ (initial conditions). Different pions of size $1/k \sim \xi$ are then uncorrelated for a time of order $\tau_R/k\xi$ (ballistic transport). This phase displays a parametric enhancement of the correlator of order $1/k\xi$ over its equilibrium value. Finally, the system diffuses back to equilibrium over times $\tau_R/(k\xi)^2$ (diffusion).

Numerical simulations. The scaling predictions can be tested by numerical simulations of (2a) and (2b). The details are reported in the accompanying work [38]. In Figs. 3 and 4, we reproduce the main results for the magnetization and the pion correlation function, which confirms our scaling analysis. Figure 3 shows the evolution of the condensate, estimated from $\sqrt{\langle M^2 \rangle}$, following an instantaneous symmetric quench, i.e. from t_r to $-t_r$, where $t_r = (m_0^2 - m_c^2)/|m_c^2|$ is the reduced temperature. It is helpful to recall that the critical scaling of the correlation length is $\xi \sim |\mathbf{t}_r|^{-\nu}$ with $\nu = 0.7377(41)$ [46]. The scaling analysis is confirmed by the data collapse in the lower panel when time is measured in units of ballistic time $t_D = L/v$ and the y-axis is scaled by $\bar{\sigma}_{eq}$. The violations from perfect scaling are due to the finite volume corrections which differentiate $\sqrt{\langle M_a M_a \rangle}$ from $\bar{\sigma}_{eq}$ [46]¹.

The non-equilibrium evolution of $G_{\pi\pi}(t,k)$ is shown in Fig. 4. The upper plot shows the raw data for quenches with different initial \mathbf{t}_r and fixed $k = 2\pi/L$. Quenches starting further away from T_c are more enhanced because they have smaller ξ and hence smaller $k\xi$. In the lower panel, we show the data collapse when the time is rescaled by vk and the y-axis by $(k\xi)/G_{\pi\pi}^{eq}$. The almost perfect collapse between $tvk \sim 1$ to $tvk \sim 4$ confirms the scaling prediction (8). We see that after the



FIG. 3. Condensate approximated by $\sqrt{\langle M_a M_a \rangle_{eq}}$, as a function of time, after symmetric quenches from \mathbf{t}_r to $-\mathbf{t}_r$. The upper panel is the raw data. The lower panel has the *x*-axis rescaled by v/L and the y-axis rescaled by $\bar{\sigma}_{eq}$. The data collapse, up to finite volume correction, confirms the scaling prediction.

initial growth, the pion correlation function slowly relaxes to equilibrium over a parametrically longer diffusive timescale t_D , and the scaling form (8) does not hold.

Much more can be said about the dynamics of instantaneous quenches. We refer the interested reader to the accompanying paper [38] for additional results, in particular, the evolution of finite k fluctuations parallel to M_a , i.e., the sigma field, as well as detailed mean-field computations of $G_0(t)$ and $G_{\pi\pi}(t,k)$. We find that the mean-field analysis reproduces the critical scaling and enhancement $(L/\xi)^d$ for the critical dimension d = 4. However, the mean-field condensate grows exponentially rather than like a power law. Moreover, the enhancement in the pion correlation function is independent of k.

Discussion. The chiral phase transition in QCD spontaneously breaks $O(4) \simeq SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R$ symmetry below T_c , which leads to the formation of a non-abelian superfluid. The associated Goldstone modes are pions and their dynamic critical behavior belongs to the universality class of Model G [2]. For the case of instan-

¹ In practice, the finite-size corrections to the magnetization can be parametrized as $\sqrt{\langle M_a M_a \rangle_{\rm eq}} \approx \bar{\sigma}_{\rm eq} \left(1 + 0.69 \frac{\xi}{L}\right)$ [38].



FIG. 4. Pion-pion correlator at $k = 2\pi/L$ for different initial reduced temperatures t_r . The upper panel shows the raw data. The lower plots show the same data with the *x*-axis rescaled by vk and the *y*-axis by $k\xi/G_{\pi\pi}^{eq}$. The almost perfect collapse at the intermediate time confirms the scaling hypothesis and that the correlator is parametrically enhanced by $1/k\xi$. Late time explicitly shows thermalization, as the correlators approach their respective $k\xi$ asymptotes.

taneous quenches to the broken phase, we use generic scaling arguments and explicit numerical simulations to understand the non-equilibrium dynamics of two-point correlation functions and condensate growth (see also the companion paper [38]). We identify three parametrically separated time scales: local relaxation τ_R , ballistic transport $\tau_R(L/\xi)$, and diffusion $\tau_R(L/\xi)^2$. The key result of our analysis is that at intermediate ballistic times, the infrared spectrum of the pion correlation function is parametrically enhanced over the equilibrium expectation, Eq. (10). Crucially, this effect is robust to explicit chiral symmetric breaking, i.e., for finite pion masses.

Chiral symmetry is a fundamental property of QCD and the experimental observation of the associated dynamic critical behavior in high-energy nuclear collisions would be a breakthrough discovery. Our results should be a strong motivation for future experiments, such as ALICE3 [47], to carefully measure the yield and correlations of low momentum pions (at or below the pion mass). At the same time, the standard hydrodynamic models of heavy ion collisions should include the chiral critical dynamics in their phenomenological predictions. Although not a simple task, systematically including the stochastic Model G dynamics based on [39, 48] into real-world hydro codes is an essential next step.

Of immediate relevance is the yield of low-momentum pions, which begins to rise above the equilibrium hydro curve for $p_T \lesssim 400 \,\text{MeV}$, reaching a ~ 50% enhancemnt for $p_T \sim m_{\pi}$ [28]. The main challenge in reproducing this trend with current hydro models is the absence of a soft momentum scale that can cause the deviation from equilibrium only at small p_T . While it is still too early to draw definitive conclusions, our analysis naturally explains why Goldstone pions should exhibit this behavior.

We conclude by reiterating that critical dynamics is inherent to QCD physics. Our work is part of a broader effort to understand the universal dynamical properties of non-equilibrium critical systems. Therefore our results are relevant to non-abelian superfluids in other systems [49–51]. Although in this work we focused on two-point functions, the critical dynamics will certainly manifest in higher-order correlation functions. In the context of heavy-ion physics, this can be studied by analyzing the fluctuations of soft pion yields and Hanbury-Brown and Twiss like correlations [52]. We look forward to further theoretical and experimental explorations of these effects.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We would like to thank Jürgen Berges, Jean-Paul Blaizot, Jannis Gebhard, Alexander Kalweit, Govert Nijs, Thimo Preis, Klaus Reygers, Thomas Schäfer, Wilke van der Schee, Dam T. Son, and Urs Wiedemann for helpful discussions. This work is supported by the DFG through Emmy Noether Programme (project number 545261797 (A.F.) and project number 496831614 (A.M.)), through CRC 1225 ISOQUANT (project number 27381115) (A.M.). A.S. was supported by funding from Horizon Europe research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement No. 101103006 and the project N1-0245 of Slovenian Research Agency (ARIS). This work was supported by U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Office of Nuclear Physics, Grant No. DE-SC0012704 (A.F.) and Grant No. DE-FG-02-88ER40388 (D.T.). This research used resources of the National Energy Research Scientific Computing Center (NERSC), a Department of Energy Office of Science User Facility using NERSC award NP-ERCAP0028307.

- * aflorio@physik.uni-bielefeld.de
- [†] eduardo.grossi@unifi.it
- [‡] a.mazeliauskas@thphys.uni-heidelberg.de
- [§] alexander.soloviev@fmf.uni-lj.si
- \P derek.teaney@stonybrook.edu
- S. L. Veatch, P. Cicuta, P. Sengupta,
 A. Honerkamp-Smith, D. Holowka, and B. Baird,
 "Critical fluctuations in plasma membrane vesicles," ACS chemical biology 3 no. 5, (2008) 287–293.
- P. C. Hohenberg and B. I. Halperin, "Theory of dynamic critical phenomena," *Rev. Mod. Phys.* 49 (Jul, 1977) 435-479. https: //link.aps.org/doi/10.1103/RevModPhys.49.435.
- [3] M. Crossley, P. Glorioso, and H. Liu, "Effective field theory of dissipative fluids," *JHEP* 09 (2017) 095,
- arXiv:1511.03646 [hep-th].
 [4] M. Stephanov and Y. Yin, "Hydrodynamics with parametric slowing down and fluctuations near the critical point," *Phys. Rev. D* 98 no. 3, (2018) 036006, arXiv:1712.10305 [nucl-th].
- [5] R. D. Pisarski and F. Wilczek, "Remarks on the Chiral Phase Transition in Chromodynamics," *Phys. Rev. D* 29 (1984) 338–341.
- [6] S. Borsanyi, Z. Fodor, J. N. Guenther, S. K. Katz, K. K. Szabo, A. Pasztor, I. Portillo, and C. Ratti, "Higher order fluctuations and correlations of conserved charges from lattice QCD," *JHEP* **10** (2018) 205, arXiv:1805.04445 [hep-lat].
- [7] HotQCD Collaboration, A. Bazavov *et al.*, "Chiral crossover in QCD at zero and non-zero chemical potentials," *Phys. Lett. B* 795 (2019) 15-21, arXiv:1812.08235 [hep-lat].
- [8] HotQCD Collaboration, H. T. Ding et al., "Chiral Phase Transition Temperature in (2+1)-Flavor QCD," *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **123** no. 6, (2019) 062002, arXiv:1903.04801 [hep-lat].
- [9] O. Kaczmarek, F. Karsch, A. Lahiri, L. Mazur, and C. Schmidt, "QCD phase transition in the chiral limit," 3, 2020. arXiv:2003.07920 [hep-lat].
- [10] A. Y. Kotov, M. P. Lombardo, and A. Trunin, "QCD transition at the physical point, and its scaling window from twisted mass Wilson fermions," *Phys. Lett. B* 823 (2021) 136749, arXiv:2105.09842 [hep-lat].
- [11] F. Cuteri, O. Philipsen, and A. Sciarra, "On the order of the QCD chiral phase transition for different numbers of quark flavours," *JHEP* 11 (2021) 141, arXiv:2107.12739 [hep-lat].
- [12] K. Rajagopal and F. Wilczek, "Static and dynamic critical phenomena at a second order QCD phase transition," *Nucl. Phys. B* **399** (1993) 395–425, arXiv:hep-ph/9210253.
- [13] J. D. Bjorken, "A Full Acceptance Detector for SSC Physics at Low and Intermediate Mass Scales: An Expression of Interest to the SSC," *Int. J. Mod. Phys.* A 7 (1992) 4189–4258.
- [14] J.-P. Blaizot and A. Krzywicki, "Soft pion emission in high-energy heavy ion collisions," *Phys. Rev. D* 46 (1992) 246–251.

- [15] S. Gavin, A. Gocksch, and R. D. Pisarski, "How to make large domains of disoriented chiral condensate," *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **72** (1994) 2143–2146, arXiv:hep-ph/9310228.
- [16] UA1 Collaboration, G. Arnison *et al.*, "Search for Centauro Like Events at the CERN Proton Anti-proton Collider," *Phys. Lett. B* **122** (1983) 189.
- [17] UA5 Collaboration, G. J. Alner *et al.*, "An accelerator search at 900 GeV CM energy for the Centauro phenomenon," *Phys. Lett. B* 180 (1986) 415–422.
- [18] C. R. A. Augusto, S. L. C. Barroso, V. Kopenkin, M. Moriya, C. E. Navia, and E. H. Shibuya, "Search for disoriented chiral condensate in cosmic gamma - hadron families," *Phys. Rev. D* 59 (1999) 054001.
- [19] MiniMax Collaboration, T. C. Brooks *et al.*, "A Search for disoriented chiral condensate at the Fermilab Tevatron," *Phys. Rev. D* 61 (2000) 032003, arXiv:hep-ex/9906026.
- [20] W. Busza, K. Rajagopal, and W. van der Schee, "Heavy Ion Collisions: The Big Picture, and the Big Questions," Ann. Rev. Nucl. Part. Sci. 68 (2018) 339–376, arXiv:1802.04801 [hep-ph].
- [21] **ALICE** Collaboration, B. Abelev *et al.*, "Centrality dependence of π , K, p production in Pb-Pb collisions at $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 2.76$ TeV," *Phys. Rev. C* 88 (2013) 044910, arXiv:1303.0737 [hep-ex].
- [22] ALICE Collaboration, S. Acharya *et al.*, "Production of charged pions, kaons, and (anti-)protons in Pb-Pb and inelastic *pp* collisions at $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 5.02$ TeV," *Phys. Rev. C* **101** no. 4, (2020) 044907, arXiv:1910.07678 [nucl-ex].
- [23] A. Mazeliauskas and V. Vislavicius, "Temperature and fluid velocity on the freeze-out surface from π , K, p spectra in pp, p-Pb and Pb-Pb collisions," *Phys. Rev. C* **101** no. 1, (2020) 014910, arXiv:1907.11059 [hep-ph].
- [24] I. Melo and B. Tomášik, "Kinetic freeze-out in central heavy-ion collisions between 7.7 and 2760 GeV per nucleon pair," J. Phys. G 47 no. 4, (2020) 045107, arXiv:1908.03023 [nucl-th].
- [25] D. Devetak, A. Dubla, S. Floerchinger, E. Grossi, S. Masciocchi, A. Mazeliauskas, and I. Selyuzhenkov, "Global fluid fits to identified particle transverse momentum spectra from heavy-ion collisions at the Large Hadron Collider," *JHEP* 06 (2020) 044, arXiv:1909.10485 [hep-ph].
- [26] G. Nijs, W. van der Schee, U. Gürsoy, and R. Snellings, "Bayesian analysis of heavy ion collisions with the heavy ion computational framework Trajectum," *Phys. Rev. C* 103 no. 5, (2021) 054909, arXiv:2010.15134 [nucl-th].
- [27] JETSCAPE Collaboration, D. Everett et al.,
 "Multisystem Bayesian constraints on the transport coefficients of QCD matter," *Phys. Rev. C* 103 no. 5, (2021) 054904, arXiv:2011.01430 [hep-ph].
- [28] P. Lu, R. Kavak, A. Dubla, S. Masciocchi, and I. Selyuzhenkov, "Quantification of the low-p_T pion excess in heavy-ion collisions at the LHC and top RHIC energy," arXiv:2407.09207 [hep-ph].
- [29] S. Schlichting, D. Smith, and L. von Smekal, "Spectral functions and critical dynamics of the O(4) model from classical-statistical lattice simulations," *Nucl. Phys. B*

950 (2020) 114868, arXiv:1908.00912 [hep-lat].

- [30] E. Grossi, A. Soloviev, D. Teaney, and F. Yan, "Transport and hydrodynamics in the chiral limit," *Phys. Rev. D* 102 no. 1, (2020) 014042, arXiv:2005.02885 [hep-th].
- [31] E. Grossi, A. Soloviev, D. Teaney, and F. Yan, "Soft pions and transport near the chiral critical point," *Phys. Rev. D* **104** no. 3, (2021) 034025, arXiv:2101.10847 [nucl-th].
- [32] X. Cao, M. Baggioli, H. Liu, and D. Li, "Pion dynamics in a soft-wall AdS-QCD model," JHEP 12 (2022) 113, arXiv:2210.09088 [hep-ph].
- [33] L. H. Yao and U. C. Täuber, "Critical dynamics of the antiferromagnetic O(3) nonlinear sigma model with conserved magnetization," *Phys. Rev. E* 105 no. 6, (2022) 064128, arXiv:2204.11145 [cond-mat.stat-mech].
- [34] A. Florio, E. Grossi, and D. Teaney, "Dynamics of the O(4) critical point in QCD: Critical pions and diffusion in model G," *Phys. Rev. D* 109 no. 5, (2024) 054037, arXiv:2306.06887 [hep-lat].
- [35] J. Braun et al., "Soft modes in hot QCD matter," arXiv:2310.19853 [hep-ph].
- [36] J. V. Roth, Y. Ye, S. Schlichting, and L. von Smekal, "Dynamic critical behavior of the chiral phase transition from the real-time functional renormalization group," *JHEP* 01 (2025) 118, arXiv:2403.04573 [hep-ph].
- [37] J. V. Roth, Y. Ye, S. Schlichting, and L. von Smekal, "Universal critical dynamics near the chiral phase transition and the QCD critical point," (9, 2024), arXiv:2409.14470 [hep-ph].
- [38] A. Florio, E. Grossi, A. Mazeliauskas, A. Soloviev, and D. Teaney, "Quenching through the QCD chiral phase transition," arXiv:see parallel submission [hep-lat].
- [39] A. Florio, E. Grossi, A. Soloviev, and D. Teaney, "Dynamics of the O(4) critical point in QCD," *Phys. Rev. D* 105 no. 5, (2022) 054512, arXiv:2111.03640 [hep-lat].
- [40] D. T. Son, "Hydrodynamics of nuclear matter in the chiral limit," *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 84 (2000) 3771-3774, arXiv:hep-ph/9912267.
- [41] A. Bazavov et al., "Meson screening masses in (2+1)-flavor QCD," Phys. Rev. D 100 no. 9, (2019)

094510, arXiv:1908.09552 [hep-lat].

- [42] M. Cè, T. Harris, A. Krasniqi, H. B. Meyer, and C. Török, "Aspects of chiral symmetry in QCD at T=128 MeV," *Phys. Rev. D* 107 no. 5, (2023) 054509, arXiv:2211.15558 [hep-lat].
- [43] A. Krasniqi, M. Cè, R. J. Hudspith, and H. B. Meyer, "Hot QCD matter around the chiral crossover: A lattice study with O(a)-improved Wilson fermions," *Phys. Rev.* D 110 no. 11, (2024) 114506, arXiv:2407.01657 [hep-lat].
- [44] D. T. Son and M. A. Stephanov, "Real time pion propagation in finite temperature QCD," *Phys. Rev. D* 66 (2002) 076011, arXiv:hep-ph/0204226.
- [45] D. T. Son and M. A. Stephanov, "Pion propagation near the QCD chiral phase transition," *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 88 (2002) 202302, arXiv:hep-ph/0111100 [hep-ph].
- [46] J. Engels and F. Karsch, "Finite size dependence of scaling functions of the three-dimensional O(4) model in an external field," *Phys. Rev. D* 90 no. 1, (2014) 014501, arXiv:1402.5302 [hep-lat].
- [47] ALICE Collaboration, "Letter of intent for ALICE 3: A next-generation heavy-ion experiment at the LHC," arXiv:2211.02491 [physics.ins-det].
- [48] G. Başar, J. Bhambure, R. Singh, and D. Teaney, "Stochastic relativistic advection diffusion equation from the Metropolis algorithm," *Phys. Rev. C* 110 no. 4, (2024) 044903, arXiv:2403.04185 [nucl-th].
- [49] A. Jain, "Theory of non-Abelian superfluid dynamics," *Phys. Rev. D* 95 no. 12, (2017) 121701, arXiv:1610.05797 [hep-th].
- [50] P. Glorioso, L. V. Delacrétaz, X. Chen, R. M. Nandkishore, and A. Lucas, "Hydrodynamics in lattice models with continuous non-Abelian symmetries," *SciPost Phys.* **10** no. 1, (2021) 015, arXiv:2007.13753 [cond-mat.stat-mech].
- [51] G. K. Buza, T. Mitra, and A. Soloviev, "Superfluids in expanding backgrounds and attractor times," arXiv:2410.01892 [hep-ph].
- [52] U. A. Wiedemann and U. W. Heinz, "Particle interferometry for relativistic heavy ion collisions," *Phys. Rept.* **319** (1999) 145–230, arXiv:nucl-th/9901094.