

An impediment to torsion from spectral geometry

Arkadiusz Bochniak*

Max-Planck-Institut für Quantenoptik, Hans-Kopfermann-Str. 1, Garching, 85748, Germany and
Munich Center for Quantum Science and Technology, Schellingstraße 4, München, 80799, Germany

Ludwik Dąbrowski†

Scuola Internazionale Superiore di Studi Avanzati, Via Bonomea 265, Trieste, 34136, Italy

Andrzej Sitarz‡ and Paweł Zalecki§

Institute of Theoretical Physics, Jagiellonian University, Łojasiewicza 11, Kraków, 30-348, Poland

(Dated: December 30, 2024)

Modifications of standard general relativity that bring torsion into a game have a long-standing history. However, no convincing arguments exist for or against its presence in physically acceptable gravity models. In this Letter, we provide an argument based on spectral geometry (using methods of pseudo-differential calculus) that suggests that the torsion shall be excluded from the consideration. We demonstrate that there is no well-defined functional extending to the torsion-full case of the spectral formulation of the Einstein tensor.

Introduction. – Riemannian and Lorentzian geometries are the fundamental basis of modern theoretical physics, especially in the context of gravity theories. General relativity is a particular example of how geometric concepts influence our understanding of the world around us, starting from mathematical ideas explaining the expansion of the universe and ending with applications that make our everyday lives easier, such as the global positioning system. Differential operators play an important role in the mathematical description of physical problems. It is well-known that their spectra not only encode several characteristics of the system’s dynamics but also possess information about certain properties of the underlying geometric structure. The latter idea is the essence of the famous Mark Kac question: *Can one hear the shape of a drum?* [1], which can be referred to as the birth of modern spectral geometry, a branch of mathematics that intends to study the geometric properties of objects by analyzing the spectra of some operators associated with them. Spectral methods are nowadays widely used in modern physics; in particular, quantum-mechanical systems are naturally studied by examining the spectrum of the associated Hamiltonian. Later, a groundbreaking idea by Alain Connes was used in his formulation of noncommutative geometry: an approach to geometry where algebraic structures and spectra of certain operators play an essential role [2, 3]. This formulation allows us to go beyond classical spaces, including models that could be referred to as *quantum spaces* and have potential applications in other branches of physics, e.g. in particle physics [4] or condensed matter [5]. Despite the rapid development of new methods and the results obtained within this field, several open questions

remained unanswered, even in the purely classical framework.

The main objects of interest in classical spectral geometry are functionals defined for (pseudo-)differential operators on certain vector bundles. More precisely, let M be an even-dimensional ($n \equiv \dim(M) = 2m$) oriented closed Riemannian manifold, take $E \rightarrow M$ to be a (complex) vector bundle over M and consider the algebra $\Psi\text{DO}(E)$ of classical pseudo-differential operators (ΨDO) [6] acting on sections of this bundle. As demonstrated by Mariusz Wodzicki [7], this algebra possesses a unique (up to a multiplicative constant) trace, called the *Wodzicki residue*,

$$\mathcal{W}\text{res}(P) = \int_M \left(\int_{|\xi|=1} \text{Tr}(\sigma_{-n}(P)(x, \xi)) \right) d^n x. \quad (1)$$

Here, Tr denotes the trace over $\text{End}(E)$ (at a given point), and $\sigma_{-n}(P)$ is the symbol of order $-n$ of $P \in \Psi\text{DO}(E)$. We recall that for a differential operator of order d , $P = \sum_{|\alpha|=0}^d (-i)^{|\alpha|} a_\alpha(x) \partial_x^\alpha$, its symbol (in multi-index notation) reads $\sum_{|\alpha|=0}^d a_\alpha(x) \xi^\alpha$; this notion can be extended into the full algebra of $\Psi\text{DO}(E)$ – cf. [8].

One of the crucial observations made in the early days of this field was that the Wodzicki residue of powers of the Laplace operator reproduces certain geometric quantities. More precisely, it has been demonstrated that

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{W}\text{res}(f \Delta^{-m}) &\sim \int_M f \, \text{dvol}_g, \\ \mathcal{W}\text{res}(f \Delta^{-m+1}) &\sim \int_M f R(g) \, \text{dvol}_g, \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

i.e., the volume form and the Ricci scalar can be spectrally reconstructed; cf. [4, 9, 10]. The natural question is whether it is possible to encode spectrally (in terms of Wodzicki residue) other geometric quantities like metric, Riemann tensor, Ricci tensor, or Einstein tensor, etc.

* arkadiusz.bochniak@mpq.mpg.de

† dabrow@sissa.it

‡ andrzej.sitarz@uj.edu.pl

§ pawel.zalecki@doctoral.uj.edu.pl

The positive answer for the metric and the Einstein tensors was recently found in [11]. Spectral methods were also used to examine the torsion in [12] providing an intrinsic method to detect its presence in the Dirac operator. In this Letter, we argue that torsion's presence in gravity models hinders obtaining geometric quantities within spectral geometry.

Einstein functional with torsion– The natural proposed way of considering the effect of torsion is to study the Einstein functional. To do so, it is convenient to consider M to be a spin manifold and the Dirac operator D to act on the sections of the spinor bundle. The Einstein functional is a bilinear functional on the space differential forms,

$$\mathcal{G}(u, w) = \mathcal{W}\text{res}(u\{D, w\}D|D|^{-n}). \quad (3)$$

and, for the Dirac operator that comes from the torsion-free Levi-Civita connection, we have:

$$\mathcal{G}(u, w) \sim \int_M \text{dvol}_g G^{ab} u_a w_b, \quad (4)$$

where G^{ab} is the Einstein tensor [11]. Such functionals, which have densities represented as evaluations of tensors on the forms, we call *tensor type functionals*.

Following this logic, we compute the spectral Einstein functional (3) in the presence of torsion. We have $D = D_0 + B$ with D_0 being the torsionless Dirac operator constructed from the Levi-Civita connection lifted to the spinor bundle, $D_0 = i\gamma^a \nabla_a^{(s)}$, and $B = -\frac{i}{8} T_{abc} \gamma^a \gamma^b \gamma^c$ the 3-form perturbation, with γ^i Clifford generators and T the (anti-symmetric part of) torsion. The square of such Dirac operator is a Laplace-type operator L , that is, its symbol, at any given point x on the manifold, is given by $\sigma(L) = \mathfrak{a}_2 + \mathfrak{a}_1 + \mathfrak{a}_0$, where, in normal coordinates at this point, the respective homogeneous symbols are,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathfrak{a}_2 &= (\delta_{ab} + \frac{1}{3} R_{acbd} x^c x^d) \xi_a \xi_b + o(\mathbf{x}^2), \\ \mathfrak{a}_1 &= i(P_{ab} x^b + S_a) \xi_a + o(\mathbf{x}), \\ \mathfrak{a}_0 &= Q + o(\mathbf{1}), \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

where R_{acbd} is the Riemann tensor and P_{ab} , S_a , and Q are tensors valued in endomorphisms of the vector bundle, which are evaluated at the given point on the manifold. Note that the usual Laplace operator acting on functions corresponds to $P_{ab} = \frac{2}{3} \text{Ric}_{ab}$, where Ric the Ricci tensor and $S_a = Q = 0$. For a second-order differential operator O , with a symbol expressed in normal coordinates around x , $\sigma(O) = F^{ab} \xi_a \xi_b + iG^a \xi_a + H + o(\mathbf{1})$, where $F^{ab} = F^{ba}$, G^a and H are endomorphisms of the fibre at point x , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{W}\text{res}(OL^{-m}) &= \frac{\nu_{n-1}}{24} \int_M \text{dvol}_g \text{Tr} [24H + 12G^a S_a \\ &+ F^{aa}(-12Q + 6P_{bb} - 2R - 3S_b S_b) \\ &+ 2F^{ab}(-6P_{ab} + 2\text{Ric}_{ab} - 3S_a S_b)], \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

where R is the scalar curvature; see [13] for the detailed derivation. This fact, together with the knowledge of symbols of L^{-k} , allows us to compute the density of the Einstein functional [14] using the standard techniques of the pseudo-differential calculus (see e.g. [8]). The resulting expression is of the form $\mathcal{G}_{D_0}(u, w)(x) + \delta\mathcal{G}(u, w)(x)$ with \mathcal{G}_{D_0} being the standard density of the Einstein functional for the torsionless case and

$$\begin{aligned} \delta\mathcal{G}(u, w)(x) &= \frac{\nu_{n-1}}{2} \text{Tr} \left\{ i u_a w_{bc} [\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_0\} \right. \\ &+ u_a w_b \left[\frac{i}{2} [\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_c\} \right. \\ &\left. \left. + (\delta^{ab} B_0 - \gamma^a \{\gamma^b, B_0\}) (\{\gamma^c, B_0\} \gamma^c - 2B_0) \right] \right\}, \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

where the expansions in normal coordinates were used: $B = B_0 + B_a x^a + o(\mathbf{x})$, $w = (w_a + w_{ab} x^b + w_{abc} x^b x^c) \gamma^a + o(\mathbf{x}^2)$, etc. The above expression has, however, an important disadvantage: it cannot represent a well-defined *functional of a tensor type* since there is an explicit dependence also on the derivatives of w unless $\text{Tr}([\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_0\})$ vanishes. This is, however, not possible for the endomorphism B representing a torsion T unless the torsion itself is zero. One can then argue that perhaps there is a potential modification of the spectral Einstein functional that does not include derivatives and reduces to the classical result in the torsionless case. In this Letter, we argue that no such coherent modification is possible.

Modified Einstein functionals– By power-counting argument for pseudo-differential calculus, we argue that potential modifications of the spectral Einstein functional are of the form $\mathcal{G}' = \sum_{k \in \mathbb{Z}} (\alpha_k F_1(k) + \beta_k F_2(k))$ with (only finitely many nonzero) $\alpha_k, \beta_k \in \mathbb{C}$, and

$$\begin{aligned} F_1(k) &= \mathcal{W}\text{res}(u|D|^k w|D|^{-n-k+2}), \\ F_2(k) &= \mathcal{W}\text{res}(u|D|^k w|D|^{-n-k}). \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

The previously defined Einstein functional is reconstructed with $F_1(0) + F_2(0)$. To start analyzing the problem, we begin with the expression for F_1 . The main step in this computation is to find the expressions for the symbol of $[|D|^k, w_b \gamma^b]$ – for details, see [13]. We then analyze the Wodzicki residue of $u|D|^k w|D|^{-n-k+2}$, taking into account only those terms that depend on the derivatives of w or are linear in w but contain contractions of the Riemann tensor. As a result, we get [13] that, up to an irrelevant global constant,

$$\begin{aligned} F_1(k) &= \frac{2-n}{24} \text{Tr}(\mathbb{1}) u_a w_a R \\ &- \frac{k(n+k-2)}{n} \text{Tr}(\mathbb{1}) u_a w_{acc} \\ &- i \frac{k(k+n-2)}{2n} u_a w_{bc} \text{Tr}([\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_0\}) \\ &+ (\dots), \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

where (\dots) represents all the remaining terms not pertinent to our analysis. Similarly, by analyzing the symbol

of $D|D|^k$, we deduce (see [13]) that

$$\begin{aligned}
 F_2(k) = & \left[\frac{n-2}{24} u_a w_a R + \frac{1}{6} u_a w_a G_{ab} \right. \\
 & + \frac{k(n+k)}{n+2} u_a w_{acc} - \left. \frac{4k(n+k)}{n(n+2)} u_a w_{bab} \right] \text{Tr}(\mathbb{1}) \\
 & + i \left(\frac{k(n+k)}{2n} + \frac{1}{2} \right) u_a w_{bc} \text{Tr}([\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_0\}) \\
 & + (\dots).
 \end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

Let us now consider the modified spectral Einstein functionals \mathcal{G}' and the necessary and sufficient conditions that the result does not depend on the derivatives of w . First, observe that to eliminate mixed second-order derivatives of w in $\sum_k \beta_k F_2(k)$ we must have $\sum_k \beta_k k(n+k) = 0$. Next, we have to independently eliminate the second-order derivatives in $\sum_k \alpha_k F_1(k)$, which leads to $\sum_k \alpha_k k(n+k-2) = 0$.

For terms with derivatives of the first order, we easily deduce that $\sum_k \beta_k = 0$ or $\text{Tr}([\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_0\})$ must vanish identically. However, the former is not acceptable because not only would first-order derivatives be eliminated but also the standard Einstein tensor (even in the torsionless case) would have to vanish. Therefore, the only physically acceptable solution is that $\text{Tr}([\gamma^a, \gamma^b] \{\gamma^c, B_0\})$ vanishes. This is impossible for the case where the perturbation is a 3-form, which is the case with antisymmetric torsion [15].

Conclusions – We have demonstrated that spectral geometry imposes a strong obstruction on the presence of

torsion in geometric models: for the spectral Einstein functional to be well defined, the torsion T must vanish [16]. Despite the potential compelling possibilities of analyzing gravity models with torsion, describing the twisting of the reference frame along geodesics, the structural arguments based on spectral geometry provide a strong indication that physically acceptable models should be based on torsionless connections, so the widely used assumption of describing physical systems based on the Levi-Civita connection seems to be, from the spectral perspective, more fundamental than it was supposed so far. We speculate that spectral geometry methods could lead to further structural obstructions for building blocks of modified gravity models. We postpone this intriguing possibility for future research.

Acknowledgements– The work of A.B. was partially funded by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, German Research Foundation) under Germany's Excellence Strategy - EXC-2111 - 390814868. A.B. is supported by the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation. A.S. is supported by the Polish National Science Centre grant 2020/37/B/ST1/01540. L.D. is affiliated to GNFM-INDAM (Istituto Nazionale di Alta Matematica) and acknowledge that this research is part of the EU Staff Exchange project 101086394 "Operator Algebras That One Can See". A.B. and L.D. acknowledge that this research was partially supported by the University of Warsaw Thematic Research Programme "Quantum Symmetries".

-
- [1] M. Kac, Can One Hear the Shape of a Drum?, The American Mathematical Monthly **73**, 1 (1966).
- [2] A. Connes, *Noncommutative Geometry* (Academic Press, 1994).
- [3] A. H. Chamseddine and A. Connes, Universal Formula for Noncommutative Geometry Actions: Unification of Gravity and the Standard Model, Phys. Rev. Lett. **77**, 4868 (1996).
- [4] A. Connes, Gravity coupled with matter and the foundation of non-commutative geometry, Commun.Math. Phys. **182**, 155– (1996).
- [5] J. Bellissard, A. van Elst, and H. Schulz-Baldes, The noncommutative geometry of the quantum Hall effect, Journal of Mathematical Physics **35**, 5373 (1994).
- [6] M. A. Shubin, *Pseudodifferential operators and spectral theory*, 2nd ed. (Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 2001) pp. xii+288, translated from the 1978 Russian original by Stig I. Andersson.
- [7] M. Wodzicki, Noncommutative residue Chapter i. Fundamentals, in *K-Theory, Arithmetic and Geometry: Seminar, Moscow University, 1984*, edited by Y. I. Manin (Springer Berlin Heidelberg, Berlin, Heidelberg, 1987) pp. 320–399.
- [8] P. B. Gilkey, *Invariance theory, the heat equation and the Atiyah-Singer index theorem* (Publish or Perish, Dillington, 1984).
- [9] W. Kalau and M. Walze, Gravity, non-commutative geometry and the Wodzicki residue, Journal of Geometry and Physics **16**, 327 (1995).
- [10] D. Kastler, The dirac operator and gravitation, Commun.Math. Phys. **166**, 633 (1995).
- [11] L. Dąbrowski, A. Sitarz, and P. Zalecki, Spectral metric and Einstein functionals, Advances in Mathematics **427**, 109128 (2023).
- [12] L. Dąbrowski, A. Sitarz, and P. Zalecki, Spectral Torsion, Commun. Math. Phys. **405**, 130 (2024).
- [13] See Supplemental Material, to appear soon.
- [14] We recently became aware of a structurally similar result in [17], however exact values of the coefficients presented therein are inconsistent with our result.
- [15] We remark that allowed perturbations of the Dirac operator for which the term vanishes identically include gauge perturbations, where B is a one-form.
- [16] More precisely, this shows that the antisymmetric part of the torsion has to vanish. The vectorial one also must be, to the self-adjointness of the Dirac operator. Cartan torsion can potentially be allowed as being completely transparent in this approach.
- [17] J. Hong and Y. Wang, The spectral Einstein functional for the Dirac operator with torsion (2024), arXiv:2412.08028 [math.DG].