

A remark on the rigidity of a property characterizing the Fourier transform

Hermann König, Vitali Milman

Consider the classical Fourier transform on \mathbb{R}^n given by

$$\mathcal{F}f(x) = \int_{\mathbb{R}^n} \exp(-2\pi i \langle x, y \rangle) f(y) dy$$

e.g. on the Schwartz space $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ of rapidly decreasing smooth functions $f : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$. As well-known, \mathcal{F} acts bijectively on $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ and exchanges products with convolutions. In a series of papers by Alesker, Artstein-Avidan, Faifman and Milman [AAM], [AAFM] and [AFM] it was shown that these properties essentially characterize the Fourier transform. The final result in [AFM] is: Any bijective transformation $T : \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n) \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ satisfying $T(f \star g) = Tf \cdot Tg$ for all $f, g \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ is just a slight modification of the Fourier transform: there exists a diffeomorphism $\omega : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ such that either $Tf = (\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega$ for all $f \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ or $Tf = \overline{(\mathcal{F}f)} \circ \omega$ for all $f \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$. If in addition $T(f \cdot g) = Tf \star Tg$ holds for all $f, g \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$, the diffeomorphism is given by a linear map $\omega = A$, see [AFM]. Note that T is not assumed to be linear or continuous. Nevertheless the real linearity and the continuity are a consequence of the result.

The idea in the proof of [AFM] is to consider the map $S = T \circ \mathcal{F}^{-1} : \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n) \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$, which is multiplicative, $S(F \cdot G) = SF \cdot SG$ for all $F, G \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$. The paper [AFM] characterizes bijective multiplicative maps between suitable function spaces like $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ as having the form $SF = F \circ \omega$ or $SF = \overline{F} \circ \omega$ for a diffeomorphism ω . Already in 1949 Milgram [Mi] had studied bijective multiplicative operators $S : C(M) \rightarrow C(M)$ on real-valued spaces of continuous functions $C(M)$ on a finite dimensional manifold M . They have the form $Sf(x) = |f(\omega(x))|^{p(x)} \operatorname{sgn} f(\omega(x))$, where $p : M \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ is a suitable continuous function and $\omega : M \rightarrow M$ is a homeomorphism. This result was extended to spaces of smooth functions $C^k(M)$ on a differentiable C^k -manifold M by Mrčun and Šemrl [MS] for $k \in \mathbb{N}$. It was extended to $C^\infty(M)$ -functions and other function algebras like the Schwartz space $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ and to spaces of complex-valued functions in [AFM], see also the earlier paper [AAFM]. The proof in [AFM] also works in the case that the constant function 1 does not belong to the space, as in the case of $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$. As indicated, the result for $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ is useful to characterize the Fourier transform as essentially a bijective map T on $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ which maps convolutions to products and vice-versa, yielding a characterization up to diffeomorphisms ω and complex conjugation, $Tf = (\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega$ or $Tf = \overline{(\mathcal{F}f)} \circ \omega$, see [AFM].

We examine the question whether these characterizations are rigid under perturbations. Again we do not assume linearity or continuity of the operators T under consideration.

As for the spaces on which T operates, let us assume that M is a finite dimensional C^k -manifold, $k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \cup \{\infty\}$ (for $k = 0$ just a manifold) and that

$$E \subset C^k(M) := \{f : M \rightarrow \mathbb{K} \mid f \text{ k-times continuously differentiable}\}$$

is a linear subspace, where $\mathbb{K} \in \{\mathbb{R}, \mathbb{C}\}$. We let $C(M) = C^0(M)$. We call E *rich* if $f, g \in E$ always implies $f \cdot g \in E$ and if for all $x \in M$ and all $r > 0$ there is $h \in E$ with $|h(x)| > r$. The following rigidity result holds for bijective multiplicative operators.

Proposition 1 *Let $k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \cup \{\infty\}$, M be a finite dimensional C^k -manifold and $E \subset C^k(M)$ be a rich subspace. Let $a : M \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ be a function and assume that $T : E \rightarrow E$ is a bijective operator such that for all $f, g \in E$ and all $x \in M$*

$$|T(f \cdot g)(x) - Tf(x) \cdot Tg(x)| \leq a(x) \quad (1)$$

holds. Then

$$T(f \cdot g) = Tf \cdot Tg \text{ for all } f, g \in E. \quad (2)$$

Thus almost multiplicativity implies multiplicativity: The operation is rigid. Note that T is not assumed to be linear; otherwise (1) would directly imply (2). Since we fix a point x with (1) and prove (2) for this point x , (1) implies (2) for any subset A of M . Choosing A to be a dense subset of M yields that, if condition (1) holds for all $x \in A$, (2) will follow for all $f, g \in E$ on $\bar{A} = M$, since $T(f \cdot g)$ and $Tf \cdot Tg$ are continuous.

Proof. Let $g \in E$ and $x \in M$ be fixed. Since E is rich, for any $r > 0$ there is $k_r \in E$ with $|k_r(x)| > r$. Since T is bijective, there is $h_r \in E$ with $|(Th_r)(x)| = |k_r(x)| > r$. The assumption implies

$$\left| \frac{T(g \cdot h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} - Tg(x) \right| \leq \frac{a(x)}{|(Th_r)(x)|} \leq \frac{a(x)}{r}.$$

Hence $Tg(x) = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(g \cdot h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)}$.

Next, consider $x \in M$ and $f, g \in E$ as well as $h_r \in E$ with $|(Th_r)(x)| > r$. Then

$$|T(f \cdot g \cdot h_r)(x) - T(f \cdot g)(x) \cdot (Th_r)(x)| \leq a(x),$$

$$|T(f \cdot g \cdot h_r)(x) - Tf(x) \cdot T(g \cdot h_r)(x)| \leq a(x).$$

Therefore

$$\begin{aligned} |Tf(x) \cdot T(g \cdot h_r)(x) - T(f \cdot g)(x) \cdot (Th_r)(x)| &\leq 2a(x), \\ |Tf(x) \cdot \frac{T(g \cdot h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} - T(f \cdot g)(x)| &\leq \frac{2a(x)}{|(Th_r)(x)|} \leq \frac{2a(x)}{r}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence $T(f \cdot g)(x) = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} T f(x) \cdot \frac{T(g \cdot h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} = T f(x) \cdot T g(x)$ and T is multiplicative. \square

For $k \in \mathbb{N} \cup 0 \cup \infty$, $E = C^k(M)$ and $E = \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ are rich subspaces. For $k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{\infty\}$, by [MS] and [AFM], equation (2) implies for bijective operators $T : E \rightarrow E$ that $T f = f \circ \omega$ for all $f \in E$ or $T f = \overline{f} \circ \omega$ for all $f \in E$ (in the complex case) where $\omega : M \rightarrow M$ is a suitable C^k -diffeomorphism, in the case of $E = \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ a C^∞ -diffeomorphism.

For continuous functions on M , $k = 0$, by [M], we have that $T f(x) = |f \circ \omega(x)|^{p(x)} \operatorname{sgn}(f \circ \omega(x))$ for all $f \in E$ (in the real case), where $\omega : M \rightarrow M$ is a homeomorphism and $p : M \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ is a continuous function.

Let us call a subspace $E \subset C^k(\mathbb{R}^n)$, $k \in \mathbb{N} \cup 0 \cup \infty$ *convolution-stable*, if for all $f, g \in E$ we have $f \star g \in E$. The following rigidity result holds for the convolution operator.

Proposition 2 *Let $n \in \mathbb{N}$, $k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \cup \{\infty\}$, $E \subset C^k(\mathbb{R}^n)$ be a convolution-stable subspace and $F \subset C^k(\mathbb{R}^n)$ be a rich subspace. Let $a : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ be a function and assume that $T : E \rightarrow F$ is a bijective operator such that for all $f, g \in E$ and all $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$*

$$|T(f \star g)(x) - T f(x) \cdot T g(x)| \leq a(x) \quad (3)$$

holds. Then

$$T(f \star g) = T f \cdot T g \quad \text{for all } f, g \in E. \quad (4)$$

Again, T is assumed neither real-linear nor continuous.

Proof. Let $g \in E$, $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and $r > 0$. Since F is rich, there is $k_r \in F$ with $|k_r(x)| > r$. Since $T : E \rightarrow F$ is bijective, there is $h_r \in E$ with $|(Th_r)(x)| = |k_r(x)| > r$. Hence

$$\left| \frac{T(g \star h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} - T g(x) \right| \leq \frac{a(x)}{|(Th_r)(x)|} \leq \frac{a(x)}{r}.$$

Hence $T g(x) = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(g \star h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)}$.

Similarly as above, this implies for $f, g \in E$ by considering $T(f \star g \star h_r)$ that

$$|T f(x) \cdot T(g \star h_r)(x) - T(f \star g)(x) \cdot (Th_r)(x)| \leq 2a(x)$$

and

$$T(f \star g)(x) = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} T f(x) \cdot \frac{T(g \star h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} = T f(x) \cdot T g(x),$$

thus $T(f \star g) = T f \cdot T g$. \square

The proof shows that if (3) holds for one point x , (4) will also hold for x . Hence if (3) holds for all x in a dense subset A of \mathbb{R}^n , (4) will be true on $\bar{A} = \mathbb{R}^n$. Note that $T(f \star g)$

and $Tf \cdot Tg$ are continuous by assumption.

We may apply this to $E = F = \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$. Then equation (4) implies that there exists a C^∞ -diffeomorphism $\omega : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ that either $Tf = (\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega$ for all $f \in E$ or $Tf = \overline{(\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega}$ for all $f \in E$.

In the continuous case of Proposition 2, $k = 0$, there exists additionally a continuous function $p : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ such that $Tf(x) = |(\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega(x)|^{p(x)} \operatorname{sgn}((\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega(x))$ for all $f \in E$ and $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$. This follows by applying (2) to the multiplicative map $S := T\mathcal{F}^{-1} : F \rightarrow F$, see Theorems 1.3 and 1.10 of [AFM].

Another application of (3) and (4) is given by the choice $E = C_c^\infty(\mathbb{R}^n, \mathbb{C})$, the complex-valued C^∞ -functions with compact support and $F = \mathcal{F}(E) = PW(\mathbb{R}^n, \mathbb{C})$, the Paley-Wiener space of functions $f : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ decreasing polynomially on \mathbb{R}^n and being extendable to $F : \mathbb{C}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ with $|F(z)| \leq A \exp(B|z|)$ for all $z \in \mathbb{C}^n$, where $A, B > 0$ are constants. Then by Theorem 1.5 of [AFM] $T(f \star g) = Tg \cdot Tg$ also implies that either $Tf = (\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega$ for all $f \in E$ or $Tf = \overline{(\mathcal{F}f) \circ \omega}$ for all $f \in E$.

Proposition 3 *Let $n \in \mathbb{N}$, $E = \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ and $a > 0$ be a constant. Assume that $T : E \rightarrow E$ is a bijective operator satisfying*

$$|T(f \cdot g)(x) - (Tf \star Tg)(x)| \leq a \quad (5)$$

for all $f, g \in E$ and all $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Then

$$T(f \cdot g) = Tf \star Tg \quad (6)$$

for all $f, g \in E$.

Proof. Let $f \in E$ and $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ be fixed. Choose an approximation of the δ -distribution in F , i.e. a sequence of $L_1(\mathbb{R}^n)$ -functions $(l_r)_{r \in \mathbb{N}}$ such that for all $h \in F$ we have $\lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} (h \star l_r)(x) = h(x)$. Since T is bijective, we may choose $\psi_r \in E$ such that $T(\psi_r) = r \cdot l_r$. By (5)

$$\begin{aligned} |T(f \cdot \psi_r)(x) - (Tf \star T\psi_r)(x)| &\leq a, \\ \left| \frac{T(f \cdot \psi_r)(x)}{r} - (Tf \star l_r)(x) \right| &\leq \frac{a}{r}, \end{aligned}$$

so that

$$\lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(f \cdot \psi_r)(x)}{r} = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} (Tf \star l_r)(x) = Tf(x). \quad (7)$$

For $f, g \in E$ we have by (5) for all $y \in \mathbb{R}^n$

$$|T(f \cdot g \cdot \psi_r)(y) - (Tf \star T(g \cdot \psi_r))(y)| \leq a$$

and

$$T(g \cdot \psi_r)(y) - (Tg \star T\psi_r)(y) =: \phi(y), |\phi(y)| \leq a,$$

with $\phi \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ depending on g and ψ_r . Hence

$$\left| \frac{T(f \cdot g \cdot \psi_r)(x)}{r} - \frac{(Tf \star Tg \star T\psi_r)(x)}{r} - \frac{(Tf \star \phi)(x)}{r} \right| \leq \frac{a}{r}. \quad (8)$$

Note that $(Tf \star \phi)(x)$ is well defined and bounded independent of g and ψ_r , since $Tf \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ and $\phi \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ is uniformly bounded by a . By (7)

$$\lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(f \cdot g \cdot \psi_r)(x)}{r} = T(f \cdot g)(x),$$

and

$$\lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{(Tf \star Tg \star T\psi_r)(x)}{r} = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} (Tf \star Tg \star l_r)(x) = (Tf \star Tg)(x).$$

Therefore (8) implies $T(f \cdot g)(x) = (Tf \star Tg)(x)$ for all $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$. \square

Consider the operator $S = \mathcal{F}^{-1}T : E \rightarrow E$. By (6) S is multiplicative, and Theorem 1.3 of [AFM] implies that there is a C^∞ -diffeomorphism $\omega : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ such that either $Tf = \mathcal{F}(f \circ \omega)$ for all $f \in E$ or $Tf = \overline{\mathcal{F}(f \circ \omega)}$ for all $f \in E$.

For $k = 0$ we get for real-valued functions $Tf(x) = |\mathcal{F}(f \circ \omega)(x)|^{p(x)} \operatorname{sgn}(\mathcal{F}(f \circ \omega)(x))$ for all $f \in E$ and $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$, where $p : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ is a suitable continuous function.

We also prove a rigidity result for the chain rule.

Proposition 4 *Let $a : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ be a function. Assume that $T : C^1(\mathbb{R}) \rightarrow C(\mathbb{R})$ satisfies*

$$|T(f \circ g)(x) - (Tf)(g(x)) \cdot Tg(x)| \leq a(x) \quad (9)$$

for all $f, g \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ and all $x \in \mathbb{R}$. Suppose that for all $x \in \mathbb{R}$ and $r > 0$ there is a bounded function $h_r \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ such that $h_r(x) = x$ and $|(Th_r)(x)| > r$. Then for all $f, g \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$

$$T(f \circ g) = (Tf) \circ g \cdot Tg. \quad (10)$$

Again, T is not assumed to be continuous or linear. If (9) holds for all x in a dense subset of \mathbb{R} , (10) will follow on \mathbb{R} .

Proof. Let $x \in \mathbb{R}$ and $r > 0$. By assumption there is $h_r \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ with $h_r(x) = x$ and $|(Th_r)(x)| > r$. By (9) for all $f \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$

$$|T(f \circ h_r)(x) - (Tf)(h_r(x)) \cdot (Th_r)(x)| = |T(f \circ h_r)(x) - (Tf)(x) \cdot (Th_r)(x)| \leq a(x),$$

$$\left| \frac{T(f \circ h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} - (Tf)(x) \right| \leq \frac{a(x)}{|(Th_r)(x)|} \leq \frac{a(x)}{r},$$

so that $(Tf)(x) = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(f \circ h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)}$. Considering for $f, g \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ the map $f \circ g \circ h_r$, we have by (9)

$$\begin{aligned} T(f \circ g \circ h_r)(x) &= (Tf)((g \circ h_r)(x)) \cdot T(g \circ h_r)(x) + \psi_1(x) \\ &= (Tf)(g(x)) \cdot T(g \circ h_r)(x) + \psi_1(x) , \end{aligned}$$

where ψ_1 depends on f, g and h_r , but satisfies $|\psi_1(x)| \leq a(x)$. Further

$$\begin{aligned} T(g \circ h_r)(x) &= (Tg)(h_r(x)) \cdot (Th_r)(x) + \psi_2(x) \\ &= (Tg)(x) \cdot (Th_r)(x) + \psi_2(x) , \end{aligned}$$

again ψ_2 depending on g and h_r , but with $|\psi_2(x)| \leq a(x)$. We find

$$\begin{aligned} T(f \circ g)(x) &= \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(f \circ g \circ h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} = \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \left((Tf)(g(x)) \cdot \frac{T(g \circ h_r)(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} + \frac{\psi_1(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} \right) \\ &= (Tf)(g(x)) \cdot (Tg)(x) + \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} \left(\frac{\psi_1(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} + \frac{(Tf)(g(x))\psi_2(x)}{(Th_r)(x)} \right) \\ &= (Tf)(g(x)) \cdot (Tg)(x) . \end{aligned}$$

Therefore $T(f \circ g) = (Tf) \circ g \cdot Tg$ follows. \square

By [AKM], see also [KM], equation (10) implies that there is $p \geq 0$ and there is a continuous positive function $H \in C(\mathbb{R})$ such that we have either $Tf = \frac{H \circ f}{H} |f'|^p$ for all $f \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ or in the case $p > 0$ that $Tf = \frac{H \circ f}{H} |f'|^p \operatorname{sgn}(f')$ for all $f \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$.

In the case of the Leibniz rule, we have the following rigidity result.

Proposition 5 *Suppose $T : C^1(\mathbb{R}) \rightarrow C(\mathbb{R})$ is an operator and $a : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{>0}$ is a function such that for all $f \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ and $x \in \mathbb{R}$ we have*

$$|T(f \cdot g)(x) - Tf(x) \cdot g(x) - f(x) \cdot Tg(x)| \leq a(x) . \quad (11)$$

Assume for all $x \in \mathbb{R}$ there are functions $h_n \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ such that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |h_n(x)| = \infty$ and $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{|Th_n(x)|}{|h_n(x)|} = 0$. Then for all $f, g \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$

$$T(f \cdot g) = Tf \cdot g + f \cdot Tg . \quad (12)$$

Proof. Let $x \in \mathbb{R}$ and h_n be as in the statement of the proposition. Then (11) implies

$$\left| \frac{T(f \cdot h_n)(x)}{h_n(x)} - Tf(x) - f(x) \cdot \frac{Th_n(x)}{h_n(x)} \right| \leq \frac{a(x)}{|h_n(x)|} ,$$

so that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T(f \cdot h_n)(x)}{h_n(x)} = Tf(x)$. This implies for $f, g \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$ that

$$\left| \frac{T(f \cdot g \cdot h_n)(x)}{h_n(x)} - f(x) \cdot \frac{T(g \cdot h_n)(x)}{h_n(x)} - g(x) \cdot Tf(x) \right| \leq \frac{a(x)}{|h_n(x)|},$$

which implies that $T(f \cdot g) = Tf \cdot g + f \cdot Tg$. \square

Equation (12) implies by [KM] or [KM1] that there are continuous functions $c, d : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ such that T has the form

$$Tf(x) = c(x) f'(x) + d(x) f(x) \ln |f(x)|$$

for all $f \in C^1(\mathbb{R})$,

References

- [AAM] S. Alesker, S. Artstein-Avidan, V. Milman; A characterization of the Fourier transform and related topics, Amer. Math. Soc. Transl. 226 (2009), 11-26.
- [AAFM] S. Alesker, S. Artstein-Avidan, D. Faifman, V. Milman; A characterization of product preserving maps with applications to a characterization of the Fourier transform, Illinois J. Math. 54 (2010), 1115-1132.
- [AFM] S. Artstein-Avidan, D. Faifman, V. Milman; On multiplicative maps of continuous and smooth functions, Geometric aspects of functional analysis, Lecture Notes in Math. 2050, 35-59, Springer, Heidelberg, 2012.
- [AKM] S. Artstein-Avidan, H. König, V. Milman; The chain rule as a functional equation, Journ. Funct. Anal. 259 (2010), 2999-3024.
- [KM] H. König, V. Milman; Operator relations characterizing derivatives, Birkhäuser, 2018.
- [KM1] H. König, V. Milman; Characterizing the derivative and the entropy function by the Leibniz rule, with an appendix by D. Faifman, J. Funct. Anal. 261 (2011), 1325-1344.
- [M] A.N. Milgram; Multiplicative semigroups of continuous functions, Duke Math. J. 16 (1940), 377-383.
- [MS] J. Mrčun, P. Šemrl; Multiplicative bijections between algebras of differentiable functions, Ann. Acad. Sci. Fenn. Math. 32 (2007), 471-480.

H. König
Mathematisches Seminar
Universität Kiel
24098 Kiel, GERMANY

V. Milman
School of Mathematical Sciences
Tel Aviv University
Ramat Aviv, Tel Aviv 69978, ISRAEL