Popa's "Recurrent Sequences" and Reciprocity

STEVEN FINCH

December 16, 2024

ABSTRACT. Dumitru Popa found asymptotic expansions for certain non-linear recurrences, but left open the numerical evaluation of associated constants. We address this issue. A change of variables involving reciprocals and the algorithm of Mavecha & Laohakosol play a key role in our computations.

If a positive real sequence $\{x_k\}_{k=0}^{\infty}$ satisfies

$$x_k \sim \alpha k + \beta \ln(k) + C, \quad \alpha \neq 0$$

as $k \to \infty$, then (by Proposition 12 of [1] or Proposition 7 of [2])

$$y_k = \frac{1}{x_k} \sim \frac{1}{\alpha k} - \frac{\beta}{\alpha^2} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{\alpha^2} \frac{1}{k^2}.$$

Assuming $\{x_k\}$ satisfies the recurrence $x_{k+1} = f(x_k)$, we have $y_{k+1} = g(y_k)$ where

$$g(y) = \frac{1}{f\left(\frac{1}{y}\right)}$$

because $1/y_{k+1} = f(1/y_k)$. Accurately computing the constant C requires many terms in the asymptotic expansion of $\{x_k\}$. The work of de Bruijn [3] and Bencherif & Robin [4] gave rise to Mavecha & Laohakosol's efficient algorithm [5], which cannot be applied directly to $\{x_k\}$ but (under some circumstances) can be applied to $\{y_k\}$. Hence the interplay between f(x) and g(y) is crucial in our paper. We draw upon examples of Popa's [1, 2], as well as examples of our own [6, 7, 8, 9, 10]. We also make reference to Popa's addition theorem (Theorems 3 / 4 of [1] / [2]) involving

$$f(x) = x + \varphi\left(\frac{1}{x}\right)$$
 for smooth $\varphi(x) > 0 \ \forall x \ge 0$

and Popa's multiplication theorem (Theorems 6 / 5 of [1] / [2]) involving

$$f(x) = x \cdot \psi\left(\frac{1}{x}\right)$$
 for smooth $\psi(x) > 1 \ \forall x > 0; \ \psi(0) = 1; \ \psi'(0) \neq 0.$

For simplicity, initial conditions $x_0 = y_0 = 1$ are presumed throughout.

⁰Copyright © 2024 by Steven R. Finch. All rights reserved.

1. p-Sequences

Let $f(x) = x^{1-p}(1+x)^p$ where $0 , then <math>g(y) = y/(1+y)^p$. By the multiplication theorem with $\psi(x) = (1+x)^p$,

$$x_k \sim \alpha k + \beta \ln(k) + C + \gamma \frac{\ln(k)}{k} + \delta \frac{1}{k}$$

where

$$\alpha = p, \qquad \beta = -\frac{1}{2} + \frac{p}{2}, \qquad \gamma = \frac{1}{4p} - \frac{1}{2} + \frac{p}{4}, \qquad \delta = -\frac{1}{12p} - \frac{C}{2p} + \frac{1}{4} + \frac{C}{2} - \frac{p}{6}.$$

We cover the cases p = 1/2, 1/3 and 2/3 separately. The boundary case p = 1 is trivial. There is otherwise no reason to restrict p < 1; we deal with p = 2 as well.

1.1. Case p = 1/2. This occurred as Corollary 9 in [1] and in Section 5 of [8] (for the latter, a brute-force method was employed to calculate C rather than the Mavecha-Laohakosol algorithm). We find

$$x_k \sim \frac{1}{2}k - \frac{1}{4}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{8}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} - \frac{C}{2}\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{2}{k} + \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{4C}{k^2} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} - \left(\frac{1}{2} + 4C\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + \left(2C + 8C^2\right) \frac{1}{k^3} + \frac{1}{4} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} - \left(\frac{5}{8} + 3C\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(\frac{1}{4} + 5C + 12C^2\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} - \left(-\frac{1}{24} + C + 10C^2 + 16C^3\right) \frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{2}{k} - \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = 4C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - \frac{1}{2}k + \frac{1}{4}\ln(k) \right) = C = 1.1751774424585571398132856....$$

1.2. Case p = 1/3. We find

$$x_k \sim \frac{1}{3}k - \frac{1}{3}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{3}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} - \left(\frac{1}{18} + C\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{3}{k} + 3\frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{9C}{k^2} + 3\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} - (3 + 18C)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + \left(\frac{1}{2} + 9C + 27C^2\right)\frac{1}{k^3} + 3\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} - \left(\frac{15}{2} + 27C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(\frac{9}{2} + 45C + 81C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} - \left(\frac{1}{2} + \frac{27C}{2} + \frac{135C^2}{2} + 81C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{3}{k} - 3 \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = 9C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - \frac{1}{3}k + \frac{1}{3}\ln(k) \right) = C = 1.3842423952717873718895461....$$

1.3. Case p = 2/3. We find

$$x_k \sim \frac{2}{3}k - \frac{1}{6}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{24}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} - \left(-\frac{1}{72} + \frac{C}{4}\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{3}{2k} + \frac{3}{8} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{9C}{4} \frac{1}{k^2} + \frac{3}{32} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} - \left(\frac{3}{32} + \frac{9C}{8}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + \left(-\frac{1}{32} + \frac{9C}{16} + \frac{27C^2}{8}\right) \frac{1}{k^3} + \frac{3}{128} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} - \left(\frac{15}{256} + \frac{27C}{64}\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(\frac{45C}{64} + \frac{81C^2}{32}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} - \left(-\frac{5}{256} + \frac{135C^2}{64} + \frac{81C^3}{16}\right) \frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{3}{2k} - \frac{3\ln(k)}{8 k^2} \right) = \frac{9C}{4},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - \frac{2}{3}k + \frac{1}{6}\ln(k) \right) = C = 1.0603463553715904094868689....$$

1.4. Case p = 2. We find

$$x_k \sim 2k + \frac{1}{2}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{8}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} + \left(-\frac{1}{8} + \frac{C}{4}\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{2k} - \frac{1}{8} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{4} \frac{1}{k^2} + \frac{1}{32} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} + \left(-\frac{1}{32} + \frac{C}{8}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + \left(\frac{1}{32} - \frac{C}{16} + \frac{C^2}{8}\right) \frac{1}{k^3}$$
$$- \frac{1}{128} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} + \left(\frac{5}{256} - \frac{3C}{64}\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} - \left(\frac{1}{32} - \frac{5C}{64} + \frac{3C^2}{32}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^4}$$
$$+ \left(\frac{11}{768} - \frac{C}{16} + \frac{5C^2}{64} - \frac{C^3}{16}\right) \frac{1}{k^4}$$

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{2k} + \frac{1}{8} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = \frac{C}{4},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - 2k - \frac{1}{2} \ln(k) \right) = C = 1.7231423751374234610635627....$$

2. Radicals

2.1. Case $\sqrt{1+x+x^2}$. Corollary 9 of [1] was devoted to $\sqrt{x^2+a\,x+b}$ where a>0 and $b\geq 0$. We examined already a=1 and b=0 in Section 1.1. The boundary case a=0 and b=1 is trivial. A vital participant here is the multiplication theorem with $\psi(x)=\sqrt{1+a\,x+b\,x^2}$. For a=b=1, we find

$$f(x) = \sqrt{1 + x + x^2}, \qquad g(y) = \frac{y}{\sqrt{1 + y + y^2}},$$

$$x_k \sim \frac{1}{2}k + \frac{3}{4}\ln(k) + C + \frac{9\ln(k)}{8} + \left(\frac{3}{2} + \frac{3C}{2}\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{2}{k} - 3\frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{4C}{k^2} + \frac{9\ln(k)^2}{2k^3} + \left(-\frac{9}{2} + 12C\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} - \left(6 + 6C - 8C^2\right)\frac{1}{k^3}$$

$$-\frac{27\ln(k)^3}{4k^4} + \left(\frac{135}{8} - 27C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(\frac{81}{4} + 45C - 36C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4}$$

$$+\left(-\frac{25}{8} + 27C + 30C^2 - 16C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{2}{k} + 3 \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = 4C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - \frac{1}{2}k - \frac{3}{4}\ln(k) \right) = C = -0.0431693967745555915829486....$$

Incidentally, Proposition 13 of [1] was devoted to $y/\sqrt{1+ay+by^2}$; Popa was indeed aware of reciprocity. He did not, however, pursue its use in calculating C. Propositions 10 & 14 demonstrated likewise, but we omit these for reasons of space.

2.2. Case $x + \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{x}}$. Corollary 5 of [1] was devoted to $x + \sqrt{a + \frac{b}{x}}$ where a > 0 and b > 0. A vital participant here is the addition theorem with $\varphi(x) = \sqrt{a + bx}$. For a = b = 1, we find

$$f(x) = x + \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{x}}, \qquad g(y) = \frac{y}{1 + y\sqrt{1 + y}},$$
$$x_k \sim k + \frac{1}{2}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{4}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} + \left(\frac{1}{8} + \frac{C}{2}\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{k} - \frac{1}{2} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{k^2} + \frac{1}{4} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} + \left(-\frac{1}{4} + C\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} - \left(\frac{1}{8} + \frac{C}{2} - C^2\right) \frac{1}{k^3}$$
$$- \frac{1}{8} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} + \left(\frac{5}{16} - \frac{3C}{4}\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(\frac{1}{16} + \frac{5C}{4} - \frac{3C^2}{2}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^4}$$
$$+ \left(\frac{1}{96} + \frac{C}{8} + \frac{5C^2}{4} - C^3\right) \frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - k - \frac{1}{2} \ln(k) \right) = C = 0.9330050241078502218961438....$$

3. Exponentials / Logarithms

It is surprising that the first & second examples below do not appear in [1], due to their simplicity. The seventh & eighth examples are understandably missing, as they are more complicated.

3.1. Case $x \exp\left(\frac{1}{x}\right)$. We find, via multiplication,

$$f(x) = x \exp\left(\frac{1}{x}\right), \quad g(y) = y \exp(-y),$$

$$x_k \sim k + \frac{1}{2}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{4}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} - \left(\frac{1}{6} - \frac{C}{2}\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{k} - \frac{1}{2}\frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{k^2} + \frac{1}{4}\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} + \left(-\frac{1}{4} + C\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3}$$

$$+ \left(\frac{1}{6} - \frac{C}{2} + C^2\right)\frac{1}{k^3} - \frac{1}{8}\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} + \left(\frac{5}{16} - \frac{3C}{4}\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4}$$

$$- \left(\frac{3}{8} - \frac{5C}{4} + \frac{3C^2}{2}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} + \left(\frac{7}{48} - \frac{3C}{4} + \frac{5C^2}{4} - C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k\to\infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = C,$$

$$\lim_{k\to\infty} \left(x_k - k - \frac{1}{2} \ln(k) \right) = C = 1.2902472086877642916676156....$$

The asymptotic series for $\{y_k\}$ appeared in Section 14 of [9]; the map $y \mapsto -g(-y)$ is the functional inverse of the Lambert map $y \mapsto W(y)$ and hence g & W are kindred functions (i.e., corresponding recursions possess remarkably similar expansions).

3.2. Case $x + \exp\left(\frac{1}{x}\right)$. We find, via addition,

$$f(x) = x + \exp\left(\frac{1}{x}\right), \quad g(y) = \frac{y}{1 + y \exp(y)},$$

$$x_k \sim k + \ln(k) + C + \frac{\ln(k)}{k} + \frac{C}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{k} - \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{k^2} + \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} + (-1 + 2C)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + (-C + C^2)\frac{1}{k^3}$$

$$-\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} + \left(\frac{5}{2} - 3C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(-1 + 5C - 3C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4}$$

$$+ \left(\frac{1}{6} - C + \frac{5C^2}{2} - C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} (x_k - k - \ln(k)) = C = 1.4196070070201119940555181....$$

3.3. Case $x\left[1+\ln\left(1+\frac{1}{x}\right)\right]$. This occurred as Corollary 8 in [1], to be discussed more later. We find, via multiplication,

$$f(x) = x \left[1 + \ln\left(1 + \frac{1}{x}\right) \right], \quad g(y) = \frac{y}{1 + \ln(1 + y)},$$

$$x_k \sim k - \frac{1}{2}\ln(k) + C + \frac{1}{4}\frac{\ln(k)}{k} + \left(\frac{1}{6} - \frac{C}{2}\right)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{k} + \frac{1}{2}\frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{k^2} + \frac{1}{4}\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} - \left(\frac{1}{4} + C\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3}$$

$$+ \left(-\frac{1}{6} + \frac{C}{2} + C^2\right)\frac{1}{k^3} + \frac{1}{8}\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} - \left(\frac{5}{16} + \frac{3C}{4}\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4}$$

$$+ \left(-\frac{1}{8} + \frac{5C}{4} + \frac{3C^2}{2}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} + \left(\frac{1}{8} + \frac{C}{4} - \frac{5C^2}{4} - C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{k} - \frac{1}{2} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - k + \frac{1}{2} \ln(k) \right) = C = 0.8725870124185800733516473....$$

3.4. Case $x + 1 + \ln\left(1 + \frac{1}{x}\right)$. Corollary 4 of [1] was devoted to $x + \ln\left(a + \frac{b}{x}\right)$ where a > 1 and b > 0. We set a = b = e and find, via addition,

$$f(x) = x + 1 + \ln\left(1 + \frac{1}{x}\right), \quad g(y) = \frac{y}{y + 1 + y\ln(1 + y)},$$

$$x_k \sim k + \ln(k) + C + \frac{\ln(k)}{k} + (1 + C)\frac{1}{k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{k} - \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{C}{k^2} + \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} + (-1 + 2C)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + (-1 - C + C^2)\frac{1}{k^3}$$

$$-\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} + \left(\frac{5}{2} - 3C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(2 + 5C - 3C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4}$$

$$+\left(-\frac{1}{4} + 2C + \frac{5C^2}{2} - C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{k} + \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} \right) = C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} (x_k - k - \ln(k)) = C = 0.409139256166675934818465....$$

3.5. Case $x \exp\left(\sqrt{1+\frac{1}{x}}-1\right)$. This occurred as Corollary 7 in [1], to be discussed more later. We find, via multiplication,

$$f(x) = x \exp\left(\sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{x}} - 1\right), \quad g(y) = y \exp\left(1 - \sqrt{1 + y}\right),$$

$$x_k \sim \frac{k}{2} + C - \frac{1}{12k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{2}{k} - \frac{4C}{k^2} + \left(\frac{1}{3} + 8C^2\right) \frac{1}{k^3} - \left(\frac{1}{24} + 2C + 16C^3\right) \frac{1}{k^4} + \left(\frac{151}{1080} + \frac{C}{3} + 8C^2 + 32C^4\right) \frac{1}{k^5}$$

$$-\left(\frac{67}{1440} + \frac{151C}{108} + \frac{5C^2}{3} + \frac{80C^3}{3} + 64C^5\right) \frac{1}{k^6}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{2}{k} \right) = 4C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \left(x_k - \frac{k}{2} \right) = C = 1.0398066960295413916327213....$$

These are the first asymptotic expansions in this paper for which all logarithmic terms evidently vanish.

3.6. Case $x \left[1 + \ln\left(1 + \frac{2}{x} + \frac{2}{x^2}\right)\right]$. This occurred as Corollary 8 in [1], to be discussed more later. Via multiplication,

$$f(x) = x \left[1 + \ln\left(1 + \frac{2}{x} + \frac{2}{x^2}\right) \right], \quad g(y) = \frac{y}{1 + \ln(1 + 2y + 2y^2)},$$
$$x_k \sim 2k + C + \frac{1}{3k},$$

$$y_k \sim \frac{1}{2k} - \frac{C}{4k^2} + \left(-\frac{1}{12} + \frac{C^2}{8}\right) \frac{1}{k^3} - \left(\frac{1}{96} - \frac{C}{8} + \frac{C^3}{16}\right) \frac{1}{k^4} + \left(\frac{139}{4320} + \frac{C}{48} - \frac{C^2}{8} + \frac{C^4}{32}\right) \frac{1}{k^5} + \left(\frac{13}{960} - \frac{139C}{1728} - \frac{5C^2}{192} + \frac{5C^3}{48} - \frac{C^5}{64}\right) \frac{1}{k^6}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^2 \left(y_k - \frac{1}{2k} \right) = \frac{C}{4},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} (x_k - 2k) = C = 0.3410952769697805797926024....$$

Like the asymptotic expansions in Section 3.5, all logarithmic terms evidently vanish and convergence is quick.

3.7. Case $x \exp\left(\sqrt{\frac{1}{x}}\right)$. Corollary 7 of [1] was devoted to $x \exp\left(\sqrt{a^2 + \frac{1}{x}} - a\right)$ where a > 0; the case a = 1 was discussed earlier in Section 3.5. The case a = 0 is on the boundary of allowable values and Popa's expansion for x_k does not apply to $f(x) = x \exp\left(\sqrt{\frac{1}{x}}\right)$. Mavecha & Laohakosol's algorithm *does*, however, apply to $g(y) = y \exp\left(-\sqrt{y}\right)$:

$$y_k \sim \frac{4}{k^2} - 4\frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} - \frac{16C}{k^3} + 3\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + (-2 + 24C)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} + \left(\frac{4}{3} - 8C + 48C^2\right)\frac{1}{k^4}$$
$$-2\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^5} + \left(\frac{7}{2} - 24C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^5} + \left(-\frac{11}{3} + 28C - 96C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^5}$$
$$+ \left(\frac{7}{6} - \frac{44C}{3} + 56C^2 - 128C^3\right)\frac{1}{k^5}$$

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^3 \left(y_k - \frac{4}{k^2} + 4 \frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} \right) = 16C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \frac{1}{k} \left(x_k - \frac{1}{4} k^2 - \frac{1}{4} k \ln(k) \right) = C = 0.8791712792948618603132189....$$

3.8. Case $x \left[1 + \ln \left(1 + \frac{1}{x^2} \right) \right]$. Corollary 8 of [1] was devoted to $x \ln \left(e + \frac{a}{x} + \frac{b}{x^2} \right)$ where a > 0 and $b \ge 0$; the case $a = e \ \& \ b = 0$ was discussed earlier in Section 3.3 and the case a = b = 2e in Section 3.6. The case $a = 0 \ \& \ b = e$ is on the boundary of allowable values and Popa's expansion for x_k does not apply to $f(x) = x \left[1 + \ln \left(1 + \frac{1}{x^2} \right) \right]$. Mavecha & Laohakosol's algorithm does, however, apply to $g(y) = \frac{y}{1 + \ln(1 + y^2)}$:

$$\sqrt{2}y_k \sim \frac{1}{k^{1/2}} - \frac{C}{k^{3/2}} + \left(-\frac{1}{48} + \frac{3C^2}{2}\right) \frac{1}{k^{5/2}} + \left(-\frac{1}{256} + \frac{5C}{48} - \frac{5C^3}{2}\right) \frac{1}{k^{7/2}} + \left(\frac{139}{69120} + \frac{7C}{256} - \frac{35C^2}{96} + \frac{35C^4}{8}\right) \frac{1}{k^{9/2}} + \left(\frac{55}{36864} - \frac{139C}{7680} - \frac{63C^2}{512} + \frac{35C^3}{32} - \frac{63C^5}{8}\right) \frac{1}{k^{11/2}}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{3/2} \left(\sqrt{2} y_k - \frac{1}{k^{1/2}} \right) = C,$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{1/2} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} x_k - k^{1/2} \right) = C = 0.2005534003696638830775944....$$

Let $f(x) = x + 1/x^{q-1}$ where q > 1, then $g(y) = y/(1 + y^q)$. Details of a transformation, followed by the multiplication theorem with $\psi(x) = (1 + x)^q$, were given in Section 3 of [10]. This yielded a six-term series, the first three terms of which are

$$q^{1-1/q} \, x_k \sim q \, k^{1/q} + \left(-\frac{1}{2q} + \frac{1}{2} \right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{1-1/q}} + \frac{C}{k^{1-1/q}}.$$

We cover the cases q = 2, 3, 3/2, 4 and 4/3 separately. The boundary case q = 1 is trivial. There is otherwise no reason to restrict q > 1; we deal with q = 1/2 as well.

4.1. Case q=2. The asymptotics of $x_{k+1}=x_k+1/x_k$ have generated considerable interest [11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16]; Corollaries 15 / 8 of [1] / [2] and Sections 4 / 3 of [7] / [10] also. We find

$$\begin{split} 2^{1/2}y_k &\sim \frac{1}{k^{1/2}} - \frac{1}{8}\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{3/2}} - \frac{C}{2}\frac{1}{k^{3/2}} + \frac{3}{128}\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{5/2}} + \left(-\frac{1}{32} + \frac{3C}{16}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{5/2}} \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{1}{32} - \frac{C}{8} + \frac{3C^2}{8}\right)\frac{1}{k^{5/2}} - \frac{5}{1024}\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^{7/2}} + \left(\frac{1}{64} - \frac{15C}{256}\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{7/2}} \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{7}{256} + \frac{C}{8} - \frac{15C^2}{64}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{7/2}} + \left(\frac{11}{768} - \frac{7C}{64} + \frac{C^2}{4} - \frac{5C^3}{16}\right)\frac{1}{k^{7/2}} \end{split}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{3/2} \left(2^{1/2} y_k - \frac{1}{k^{1/2}} + \frac{1}{8} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{3/2}} \right) = \frac{C}{2},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{1/2} \left(2^{1/2} x_k - 2k^{1/2} - \frac{1}{4} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{1/2}} \right) = C = 0.8615711875687117305317813....$$

An apt name "add-the-reciprocal sequence" has been proposed for $1, 2, 5/2, 29/10, 941/290, \dots$ [17, 18].

4.2. Case q = 3. We find

$$\begin{split} 3^{1/3}y_k &\sim \frac{1}{k^{1/3}} - \frac{1}{9}\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{4/3}} - \frac{C}{3}\frac{1}{k^{4/3}} + \frac{2}{81}\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{7/3}} + \left(-\frac{1}{27} + \frac{4C}{27}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{7/3}} \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{5}{162} - \frac{C}{9} + \frac{2C^2}{9}\right)\frac{1}{k^{7/3}} - \frac{14}{2187}\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^{10/3}} + \left(\frac{11}{486} - \frac{14C}{243}\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{10/3}} \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{53}{1458} + \frac{11C}{81} - \frac{14C^2}{81}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{10/3}} + \left(\frac{1}{54} - \frac{53C}{486} + \frac{11C^2}{54} - \frac{14C^3}{81}\right)\frac{1}{k^{10/3}} \end{split}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{4/3} \left(3^{1/3} y_k - \frac{1}{k^{1/3}} + \frac{1}{9} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{4/3}} \right) = \frac{C}{3},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{2/3} \left(3^{2/3} x_k - 3k^{1/3} - \frac{1}{3} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{2/3}} \right) = C = 1.3784186157718345713984647....$$

4.3. Case q = 3/2. We find

$$\left(\frac{3}{2}\right)^{2/3} y_k \sim \frac{1}{k^{2/3}} - \frac{1}{9} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{5/3}} - \frac{2C}{3} \frac{1}{k^{5/3}} + \frac{5}{324} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{8/3}} + \left(-\frac{1}{54} + \frac{5C}{27}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{8/3}}$$

$$+ \left(\frac{2}{81} - \frac{C}{9} + \frac{5C^2}{9}\right) \frac{1}{k^{8/3}} - \frac{5}{2187} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^{11/3}} + \left(\frac{13}{1944} - \frac{10C}{243}\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{11/3}}$$

$$+ \left(-\frac{41}{2916} + \frac{13C}{162} - \frac{20C^2}{81}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{11/3}} + \left(\frac{5}{648} - \frac{41C}{486} + \frac{13C^2}{54} - \frac{40C^3}{81}\right) \frac{1}{k^{11/3}}$$

$$-\lim_{k\to\infty} k^{5/3} \left(\left(\frac{3}{2} \right)^{2/3} y_k - \frac{1}{k^{2/3}} + \frac{1}{9} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{5/3}} \right) = \frac{2C}{3},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{1/3} \left(\left(\frac{3}{2} \right)^{1/3} x_k - \frac{3}{2} k^{2/3} - \frac{1}{6} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{1/3}} \right) = C = 0.8010888849039666437110775....$$

4.4. Case q = 4. We find

$$\begin{split} 4^{1/4}y_k &\sim \frac{1}{k^{1/4}} - \frac{3}{32}\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{5/4}} - \frac{C}{4}\frac{1}{k^{5/4}} + \frac{45}{2048}\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{9/4}} + \left(-\frac{9}{256} + \frac{15C}{128}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{9/4}} \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{7}{256} - \frac{3C}{32} + \frac{5C^2}{32}\right)\frac{1}{k^{9/4}} - \frac{405}{65536}\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^{13/4}} + \left(\frac{189}{8192} - \frac{405C}{8192}\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{13/4}} \\ &\quad + \left(-\frac{297}{8192} + \frac{63C}{512} - \frac{135C^2}{1024}\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^{13/4}} + \left(\frac{75}{4096} - \frac{99C}{1024} + \frac{21C^2}{128} - \frac{15C^3}{128}\right)\frac{1}{k^{13/4}} \end{split}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{5/4} \left(4^{1/4} y_k - \frac{1}{k^{1/4}} + \frac{3}{32} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{5/4}} \right) = \frac{C}{4},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{3/4} \left(4^{3/4} x_k - 4k^{1/4} - \frac{3}{8} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{3/4}} \right) = C = 2.5097227971726886238611225....$$

4.5. Case q = 4/3. We find

$$\left(\frac{4}{3}\right)^{3/4} y_k \sim \frac{1}{k^{3/4}} - \frac{3}{32} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{7/4}} - \frac{3C}{4} \frac{1}{k^{7/4}} + \frac{21}{2048} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{11/4}} + \left(-\frac{3}{256} + \frac{21C}{128}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{11/4}}$$

$$+ \left(\frac{5}{256} - \frac{3C}{32} + \frac{21C^2}{32}\right) \frac{1}{k^{11/4}} - \frac{77}{65536} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^{15/4}} + \left(\frac{27}{8192} - \frac{231C}{8192}\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^{15/4}}$$

$$+ \left(-\frac{67}{8192} + \frac{27C}{512} - \frac{231C^2}{1024}\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{15/4}} + \left(\frac{19}{4096} - \frac{67C}{1024} + \frac{27C^2}{128} - \frac{77C^3}{128}\right) \frac{1}{k^{15/4}}$$

and thus

$$-\lim_{k\to\infty} k^{7/4} \left(\left(\frac{4}{3} \right)^{3/4} y_k - \frac{1}{k^{3/4}} + \frac{3 \ln(k)}{32 k^{7/4}} \right) = \frac{3C}{4},$$

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} k^{1/4} \left(\left(\frac{4}{3} \right)^{1/4} x_k - \frac{4}{3} k^{3/4} - \frac{1}{8} \frac{\ln(k)}{k^{1/4}} \right) = C = 0.8248745112329031526004762....$$

4.6. Case q = 1/2. Starting with $z_{k+1} = z_k + \sqrt{z_k}$, $z_0 = 1$, let $x = \sqrt{z}$ and obtain $x_{k+1} = \sqrt{x_k^2 + x_k}$, i.e., the *p*-sequence with p = 1/2. The expansion of x_k appears in Section 1.1; omitting details (Proposition 12 of [1] or Proposition 7 of [2]), we find

$$\lim_{k \to \infty} \frac{1}{k} \left(z_k - \frac{1}{4} k^2 + \frac{1}{4} k \ln(k) \right) = 1.1751774424585571398132856...$$
$$= 0.5 + 0.6751774424585571398132856...$$

Therefore we have come full circle. A name "add-the-square-root sequence" has been proposed for

$$z_0 = 1$$
, $z_1 = 2$, $z_2 = 2 + \sqrt{2}$, $z_3 = 2 + \sqrt{2} + \sqrt{2 + \sqrt{2}}$, ...

and the alternative constant appears merely because authors of [17] prescribed $\tilde{z}_1 = 1$, $\tilde{z}_2 = 2$, ... instead:

$$\tilde{z}_k = z_{k-1} \sim \frac{1}{4}(k-1)^2 \sim \frac{1}{4}k^2 - \frac{1}{2}k \sim z_k - \frac{1}{2}k$$

hence $\tilde{z}_k/k \sim z_k/k - 1/2$. Our search for a nontrivial nonlinear recurrence with known C (defined independently of the sequence, e.g., an expression in closed-form) continues without success.

5. Appendix

The Mavecha-Laohakosol algorithm [5] is applicable to an analytic function g(y) whose Taylor series at the origin starts as

$$y + a_1 y^{\tau+1} + a_2 y^{2\tau+1} + a_3 y^{3\tau+1} + \cdots$$

where $a_1 < 0$ and $\tau \ge 1$ is an integer. We demonstrate its use on the reciprocal p-sequence $\{y_k\}$ with p = 1/2, finding its asymptotic expansion to order $1/k^6$.

Formulaic knowledge of [9] is assumed. Given $g(y) = y/\sqrt{1+y}$, we have $\tau = 1$,

$$\{a_m\}_{m=1}^7 = \left\{-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{3}{8}, -\frac{5}{16}, \frac{35}{128}, -\frac{63}{256}, \frac{231}{1024}, -\frac{429}{2048}\right\}$$

and $\lambda = 2$; consequently

$$\{b_j\}_{j=1}^6 = \left\{ -\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}, -\frac{5}{8}, \frac{7}{8}, -\frac{21}{16}, \frac{33}{16} \right\},$$

$$\{a_{0j}\}_{j=1}^6 = \left\{ 1, -1, \frac{4}{3}, -2, \frac{16}{5}, -\frac{16}{3} \right\},$$

$$\{c_i\}_{i=1}^5 = \left\{ 0, \frac{1}{48}, -\frac{1}{72}, \frac{1}{240}, \frac{1}{225} \right\},$$

$$T_2 = -\frac{1}{2}Y,$$

$$T_3 = \frac{1}{4}Y^2 + \frac{1}{4}Y - \frac{1}{48},$$

$$T_4 = -\frac{1}{6}Y^3 - \frac{3}{8}Y^2 - \frac{1}{12}Y + \frac{7}{288},$$

$$T_5 = \frac{1}{8}Y^4 + \frac{11}{24}Y^3 + \frac{5}{16}Y^2 - \frac{1}{32}Y - \frac{47}{2880},$$

$$T_6 = -\frac{1}{10}Y^5 - \frac{25}{48}Y^4 - \frac{31}{48}Y^3 - \frac{3}{32}Y^2 + \frac{233}{2880}Y + \frac{41}{14400}$$

and

$$P_{2} = Y^{2} - \frac{1}{2}Y,$$

$$P_{3} = Y^{3} - \frac{5}{4}Y^{2} + \frac{1}{4}Y + \frac{1}{48},$$

$$P_{4} = Y^{4} - \frac{13}{6}Y^{3} + \frac{9}{8}Y^{2} - \frac{1}{24}Y - \frac{7}{288},$$

$$P_{5} = Y^{5} - \frac{77}{24}Y^{4} + \frac{71}{24}Y^{3} - \frac{2}{3}Y^{2} - \frac{29}{288}Y + \frac{47}{2880},$$

$$P_{6} = Y^{6} - \frac{87}{20}Y^{5} + \frac{145}{24}Y^{4} - \frac{45}{16}Y^{3} + \frac{1}{32}Y^{2} + \frac{427}{2880}Y - \frac{139}{57600}.$$

The remarkable formula connecting P_m and asymptotics of $y_k = g(y_{k-1})$ is

$$y_k \sim \left(\frac{\lambda}{k}\right)^{1/\tau} \left\{ 1 + \sum_{m=1}^6 P_m \left(-\frac{1}{\tau} \left[b_1 \ln(k) + 2C \right] \right) \frac{1}{k^m} \right\},$$

the first four terms of which imply

$$y_k \sim \frac{2}{k} + \frac{\ln(k)}{k^2} - \frac{4C}{k^2} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^3} - \left(\frac{1}{2} + 4C\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^3} + \left(2C + 8C^2\right) \frac{1}{k^3} + \frac{1}{4} \frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^4} - \left(\frac{5}{8} + 3C\right) \frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^4} + \left(\frac{1}{4} + 5C + 12C^2\right) \frac{\ln(k)}{k^4} - \left(-\frac{1}{24} + C + 10C^2 + 16C^3\right) \frac{1}{k^4}$$

(echoing Section 1.1). The fifth & sixth terms substantially extend the series:

$$\begin{split} &\frac{1}{8}\frac{\ln(k)^4}{k^5} - \left(\frac{13}{24} + 2C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^5} + \left(\frac{9}{16} + \frac{13}{2}C + 12C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^5} \\ &- \left(\frac{1}{24} + \frac{9}{2}C + 26C^2 + 32C^3\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^5} + \left(-\frac{7}{144} + \frac{1}{6}C + 9C^2 + \frac{104}{3}C^3 + 32C^4\right)\frac{1}{k^5} \\ &+ \frac{1}{16}\frac{\ln(k)^5}{k^6} - \left(\frac{77}{192} + \frac{5}{4}C\right)\frac{\ln(k)^4}{k^6} + \left(\frac{71}{96} + \frac{77}{12}C + 10C^2\right)\frac{\ln(k)^3}{k^6} \\ &- \left(\frac{1}{3} + \frac{71}{8}C + \frac{77}{2}C^2 + 40C^3\right)\frac{\ln(k)^2}{k^6} + \left(-\frac{29}{288} + \frac{8}{3}C + \frac{71}{2}C^2 + \frac{308}{3}C^3 + 80C^4\right)\frac{\ln(k)}{k^6} \\ &- \left(-\frac{47}{1440} - \frac{29}{72}C + \frac{16}{3}C^2 + \frac{142}{3}C^3 + \frac{308}{3}C^4 + 64C^5\right)\frac{1}{k^6}. \end{split}$$

Our simple procedure for estimating the constant C involves computing y_K exactly via recursion, for some suitably large index K. We then set the value y_K equal to our series and numerically solve for C. The effect of using the additional series terms is fairly dramatic. When employing terms up to order $1/k^4$, an index $\approx 10^{10}$ may be required for 25 digits of precision in the C estimate. By way of contrast, when employing terms up to order $1/k^6$, an index $\approx 10^6$ might suffice.

6. Addendum

The q-sequence with q=2, when squared, has asymptotics

$$x_k^2 \sim 2k + \frac{1}{2}\ln(k) + 2C.$$

If we prescribe $\tilde{x}_1 = 1$, $\tilde{x}_2 = 2$, ... instead:

$$\tilde{x}_k^2 = x_{k-1}^2 \sim 2(k-1) \sim x_k^2 - 2$$

then

$$\tilde{x}_k^2 \sim 2k + \frac{1}{2}\ln(k) + 2(C-1)$$

and our estimate

$$2(C-1) = -0.2768576248625765389364372...$$

improves upon a figure -0.2768576 given years ago by Jean Anglesio [12].

The same sequence $\{x_k\}$ arises in graph theory [14], arithmetic dynamics [15] and approximation [13, 19]. Define an infinite product

$$r = \prod_{k=0}^{\infty} \left(1 + \frac{1}{x_k^2} \right)^{1/2^{k+1}} = 1.54170091336287603176....$$

Consider the class S_n of all integer polynomials of the exact degree n and all n zeroes both in [-1,1] and simple. Let

$$\sum_{k=0}^{n} a_{k,n} x^k \in S_n, \quad a_{n,n} \neq 0, \quad n = 1, 2, 3, \dots$$

be an arbitrary sequence R of polynomials. It is known that [20]

$$\inf_{R} \liminf_{n \to \infty} |a_{n,n}|^{1/n} \le r$$

and quite possible that no better bound exists. It is fascinating that $x_k + 1/x_k$ should have occurred at all in these problems. We speculate about other unexpected places where nonlinear recurrences might emerge.

7. Acknowledgements

My attempts to reach Popa have regrettably failed. In the statement of Theorem 5 of [2], the lead coefficient 1/2 of the 1/n term should be 1/4. Also, in the statement of Theorem 10 of [2], the lead coefficient $2a_1^4K^2$ of the $1/n^3$ term should be $2a_1^6K^2$ (Popa's corresponding expression $2a_1^2C^2$ on the following page, where $C = -a_1^2K$, is correct). This algebraic error affects his Corollary 11. The creators of Mathematica earn my gratitude every day: this paper could not have otherwise been written.

REFERENCES

- [1] D. Popa, Recurrent sequences and the asymptotic expansion of function. GazetaMat.Ser.Av. 37 (2019)n. 3-4. 1-16: http://ssmr.ro/gazeta/gma/2019/gma3-4-2019-continut.pdf.
- [2] D. Popa, Refined asymptotic expansions for some recurrent se-Mat.Ser.1-2, 18-26;quences, GazetaAv. 41 (2023)http://ssmr.ro/gazeta/gma/2023/gma1-2-2023-continut.pdf.
- [3] N. G. de Bruijn, Asymptotic Methods in Analysis, North-Holland, 1958; MR0099564 / Dover, 1981; MR0671583.
- [4] F. Bencherif and G. Robin, Sur l'itéré de $\sin(x)$, Publ. Inst. Math. (Beograd) 56(70) (1994) 41–53; MR1349068; http://eudml.org/doc/256122.
- [5] S. Mavecha and V. Laohakosol, Asymptotic expansions of iterates of some classical functions, *Appl. Math. E-Notes* 13 (2013) 77–91; MR3121616; http://www.emis.de/journals/AMEN/2013/2013.htm.
- [6] S. R. Finch, A deceptively simple quadratic recurrence, arXiv:2409.03510.
- [7] S. R. Finch, Generalized logistic maps and convergence, arXiv:24409.15175.
- [8] S. R. Finch, Iterated radical expansions and convergence, arXiv:2410.02114.
- [9] S. R. Finch, What do $\sin(x)$ and $\arcsin(x)$ have in common? $\operatorname{arXiv}:2411.01591$.
- [10] S. R. Finch, Exercises in iterational asymptotics, arXiv:2411.16062.
- [11] D. J. Newman, Problem 60, A Problem Seminar, Springer-Verlag, 1982, pp. 12, 34, 78; MR0678095.
- [12] D. M. Bloom and K.-W. Lau, Problem E3276: The limit of an approximation, *Amer. Math. Monthly* 95 (1988) 654; 97 (1990) 244–245.

- [13] H. L. Montgomery, Ten Lectures on the Interface between Analytic Number Theory and Harmonic Analysis, Amer. Math. Soc., 1994, p. 187; MR1297543.
- [14] M. Larsen, J. Propp and D. Ullman, The fractional chromatic number of Mycielski's graphs, J. Graph Theory 19 (1995) 411–416; MR1324490.
- [15] J. H. Silverman, *The Arithmetic of Dynamical Systems*, Springer-Verlag, 2007, pp. 113–114; MR2316407.
- [16] L. F. Klosinski, G. L. Alexanderson and L. C. Larson, Problem B6, The sixty-seventh William Lowell Putnam mathematical competition, Amer. Math. Monthly 114 (2007) 714–724.
- [17] J. E. Schoenfield and N. J. A. Sloane, Sequence 6, 7, 5, 1, 7, 7, 4, 4, 2, 4, 5, 8, . . ., http://oeis.org/A332396.
- [18] A. Fink and N. J. A. Sloane, Sequence numerators & denominators for q=2, http://oeis.org/A073833, http://oeis.org/A073834.
- [19] S. R. Finch, Integer Chebyshev constant, *Mathematical Constants*, Cambridge Univ. Press, 2003, pp. 268–272; MR2003519.
- [20] I. E. Pritsker, Polynomials with integer coefficients and their zeros, *Ukrain. Mat. Visn.* 9 (2012) 81–97; Engl. transl. in *J. Math. Sci. (N.Y.)* 183 (2012) 810–822; arXiv:1307.6200; MR3165799.

Steven Finch MIT Sloan School of Management Cambridge, MA, USA steven_finch_math@outlook.com