

# On the structure of low-rank matrices that approximate the identity matrix

Yuri Malykhin

December 13, 2024

Consider the problem of elementwise approximation of the  $N \times N$  identity matrix by matrices of rank not exceeding given  $n$ :

$$\min_{\text{rank } A \leq n} \max_{1 \leq i, j \leq N} |A_{i,j} - \delta_{i,j}|. \quad (1)$$

The quantity (1) equals to the Kolmogorov width of the octahedron,  $d_n(B_1^N, \ell_\infty^N)$ . This width was studied in the papers [K74, Gl86, H79], etc. Some applications to combinatorics are given in [A09].

The probabilistic method ( $A_{i,j} = N^{-1} \langle x^i, x^j \rangle$  with random  $x^1, \dots, x^N \in \{-1, 1\}^n$ , see. [K74]) gives the bound  $d_n(B_1^N, \ell_\infty^N) \leq 2\sqrt{\ln(N)/n}$ ; therefore, good approximation of the identity matrix is possible for  $n \asymp \log N$ . On the other hand, it is well known that a nontrivial approximation requires at least logarithmic rank. Say, if the error (1) does not exceed  $1/3$ , then  $N$  columns of the approximation matrix lie inside a ball of radius  $5/6$  in an  $n$ -dimensional subspace of  $\ell_\infty^N$ ; and they are  $1/3$ -separated. Standard volume argument shows that  $N \leq 6^n$ .

B.S. Kashin asked a question: is it true that for matrices of rank  $n \asymp \log N$  that approximate the identity matrix, positive proportion of elements have absolute value greater than  $\gamma$ , with  $\gamma \asymp n^{-1/2}$ ?

Given a matrix  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{N \times N}$ , we define the distribution function  $F_A^*(\gamma) := N^{-2} |\{(i, j) : |A_{i,j}| > \gamma\}|$ .

**Theorem.** *Let  $A$  be a  $N \times N$  matrix of rank  $n$ , such that*

$$\max_{1 \leq i, j \leq N} |A_{i,j} - \delta_{i,j}| \leq 1/3.$$

Then the inequality holds

$$F_A^*(\gamma) \geq c \frac{\log N}{n \log(2 + \frac{n}{\log N})}, \quad \text{where } \gamma := c \max\{n^{-3/2} \log N, n^{-1}\}.$$

Here  $c$  is an absolute positive constant.

**Corollary 1.** *In the conditions of the Theorem, if  $n \leq K \log N$  for some  $K$ , then at least  $c(K)N^2$  elements of the matrix  $A$  have absolute value  $> c(K)n^{-1/2}$ , where  $c(K) > 0$  and depends only on  $K$ .*

This corollary gives an affirmative answer to Kashin's question. The probabilistic method shows that the order  $n^{-1/2}$  is sharp.

**Corollary 2.** *In the conditions of the Theorem, the proportion of nonzero elements of  $A$  is at least  $c \log(N)/(n \log(2 + n/\log N))$ .*

It is easy to construct a matrix that approximates the identity but the proportion of nonzero elements is  $\asymp \log(N)/n$ .

We will use the following statements.

**Lemma A** ([G95]). *Let  $K \subset \mathbb{R}^n$  be a symmetric convex body, let  $D \supset K$  be its minimal volume ellipsoid,  $|\cdot|_D$  is the Euclidean norm corresponding to  $D$ . Then for any  $\varepsilon \in (0, 1)$  there exist vectors  $x^1, \dots, x^k \in K \cap \partial D$ ,  $k \geq n(1 - \varepsilon)$ , such that for any reals  $t_1, \dots, t_k$  the inequality holds*

$$\left| \sum_{m=1}^k t_m x^m \right|_D \geq c_0 \varepsilon n^{-1/2} \sum_{m=1}^k |t_m|. \quad (2)$$

This lemma was proven in [ST89] with the coefficient  $\varepsilon^{3/2}n^{-1/2}$ ; in [G95] the result was improved to  $\varepsilon n^{-1/2}$ . Lemma was used to bound the Banach–Mazur distance from an arbitrary  $n$ -dimensional space to  $\ell_\infty^n$ . Giannopoulos [G95] proved that  $d(X_n, \ell_\infty^n) \leq Cn^{5/6}$ .

**Lemma B.** *Let  $K \subset \mathbb{R}^n$  be a symmetric convex body. There exist  $x^1, \dots, x^n \in \text{extr } K$ , such that any  $x \in K$  is represented as  $x = \sum_{m=1}^n t_m x^m$  with some  $t_1, \dots, t_n \in [-1, 1]$ .*

The basis  $x^1, \dots, x^n$  is just an Auerbach basis. One can construct it by a volume maximization [LT, Ch.1] so we can take  $x^m \in \text{extr } K$ .

Let us prove the Theorem.

*Proof.* Let us say that elements  $|A_{i,j}| > \gamma$  are “large”, and let us call the proportion of large elements by “density”.

The matrix  $A$  has density  $F_A^*(\gamma)$ . Let  $\varkappa$  be the maximal density of columns of  $A$ . We can assume that  $\varkappa = O(F_A^*(\gamma))$  and prove a lower bound for  $\varkappa$ . Indeed, there are at most half columns with density  $> 2F_A^*(\gamma)$ ; one can delete columns and rows with that indexes and pass to a half-sized submatrix.

Let  $v^1, \dots, v^N$  be the columns of  $A$ ;  $V := \text{span}\{v^j\}_{j=1}^N$  — the  $n$ -dimensional subspace in  $\mathbb{R}^N$ ;  $K := \text{conv}\{\pm v^j\}_{j=1}^N$ ;  $D \subset V$  is the minimal volume ellipsoid of  $K$ ;  $\|\cdot\|_K$  — the norm in  $V$  with unit ball  $K$ ;  $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle_D$  and  $|\cdot|_D$  — scalar product and norm in  $V$  that correspond to the ellipsoid  $D$ .

Fix  $\varepsilon \in (0, 1)$ ; we will specify its value later. By Lemma A there exist vectors  $x^1, \dots, x^k \in K \cap \partial D$ ,  $k \geq n(1 - \varepsilon)$ , such that the inequality (2) holds. We have  $K \cap \partial D \subset \text{extr } K \subset \{\pm v^j\}_{j=1}^N$ , so w.l.o.g.  $x^1 = v^{j_1}, \dots, x^k = v^{j_k}$  with some indexes  $j_1, \dots, j_k$ . (Soon we will use this.)

Let us add to vectors  $\{x^m\}_1^k$  some vectors  $y^1, \dots, y^{n-k} \in V$  orthogonal to  $\{x^m\}_1^k$  (with respect to  $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle_D$ ) to make a basis of  $V$ . Now we can expand columns of our matrix in this basis:

$$v^j = \sum_{m=1}^k t_m^j x^m + \sum_{l=1}^{n-k} s_l^j y^l, \quad j = 1, \dots, N.$$

We have  $v^j \in K$ , so

$$1 \geq \|v^j\|_K \geq \|v^j\|_D \geq \left| \sum_{m=1}^k t_m^j x^m \right|_D \geq c_0 \varepsilon n^{-1/2} \sum_{m=1}^k |t_m^j|.$$

Therefore

$$A_{i,j} = (v^j)_i = \sum_{m=1}^k t_m^j x_i^m + \sum_{l=1}^{n-k} s_l^j y_i^l = \langle x_i, t^j \rangle + \langle y_i, s^j \rangle, \quad \|t^j\|_1 \leq (c_0 \varepsilon)^{-1} n^{1/2}.$$

where  $x_i, t^j \in \mathbb{R}^k$ ;  $y_i, s^j \in \mathbb{R}^{n-k}$ .

Vectors  $x_i = (x_i^1, \dots, x_i^k) = (v_i^{j_1}, \dots, v_i^{j_k})$  are rows of the matrix that consists of columns of  $A$  with indexes  $j_1, \dots, j_k$ . This matrix has density  $\leq \varkappa$ . Hence, at least half of its rows has density  $\leq 2\varkappa$ ; let us denote by  $I$  the set of indexes of these rows. So, the density of  $x_i$  is at most  $2\varkappa$  for  $i \in I$ .

Write  $x_i$  as  $x_i = w_i + z_i$ , where  $w_i$  contains only large coordinates of  $x_i$  and  $z_i$  contains all other coordinates. We have

$$|\langle x_i, t^j \rangle - \langle w_i, t^j \rangle| \leq \|t^j\|_1 \cdot \gamma \leq (c_0 \varepsilon)^{-1} n^{1/2} \gamma \leq 1/15$$

provided that  $\gamma/\varepsilon \leq 1/(15c_0n^{1/2})$ . Consider the matrix

$$B_{i,j} = \langle w_i, t^j \rangle + \langle y_i, s^j \rangle, \quad i, j \in I.$$

We will use three properties: the number of nonzero elements in each vector  $w_i$  is at most  $m := \lfloor 2\kappa k \rfloor$ ; the dimension of  $y_i, s^j$  is at most  $n\varepsilon$ ; the matrix  $B$  approximates the identity:  $|B_{i,j} - \delta_{i,j}| \leq 2/5$ .

Consider the rows of  $B$ . They are  $1/5$ -separated in  $\ell_\infty^I$ . On the other hand, we can construct an  $(1/11)$ -net in  $\ell_\infty^I$  for the set of rows in the following way. For any  $i \in I$  the set  $\Lambda = \text{supp } w_i$  has at most  $m$  elements, so there are at most  $(en/m)^m$  variants for  $\Lambda$ . (If  $m = 0$ , we put  $(en/m)^m = 1$ .)

Fix a set  $\Lambda$  and consider the submatrix  $B_\Lambda$  of  $B$  that consists of rows  $i$  such that  $\text{supp } w_i = \Lambda$ . We have  $B_{i,j} = \langle w_i|_\Lambda, t^j|_\Lambda \rangle + \langle y_i, s^j \rangle$  for this submatrix; hence  $\text{rank } B_\Lambda \leq m + n\varepsilon$ . Rows of  $B_\Lambda$  lie in a ball (of fixed diameter) in the space of dimension at most  $m + n\varepsilon$ ; the size of the net for such a ball does not exceed  $\exp(C(m + n\varepsilon))$ .

The size of the net is at least the number of rows in  $B$ , so

$$(en/m)^m \cdot \exp(C(m + n\varepsilon)) \geq |I| \geq N/2.$$

Take the logarithm:  $m \ln(en/m) + Cm + Cn\varepsilon \geq \ln(N/2)$ . Define

$$\varepsilon := \min \left\{ \frac{1}{2}, \frac{\ln(N/2)}{2Cn} \right\},$$

then  $m \ln(C_1n/m) \geq \ln(N/2)/2$ . It follows that  $m \neq 0$ . Moreover,  $k \geq n(1 - \varepsilon) \geq n/2$ ;  $2\kappa n \geq m = \lfloor 2\kappa k \rfloor \geq \kappa k \geq \kappa n/2$ , therefore:

$$\kappa \ln(2C_1/\kappa) \geq \frac{\ln(N/2)}{4n}.$$

This proves the required bound for  $\kappa$  with  $\gamma \asymp n^{-1/2}\varepsilon$ . We know that  $A$  approximates the identity, so  $n \geq c_3 \log N$  and hence  $\gamma \asymp n^{-3/2} \log N$  in both cases ( $\varepsilon = 1/2$ ,  $\varepsilon < 1/2$ ).

For  $\gamma \asymp n^{-1}$  one should use Lemma B; everything is analogous.  $\square$

Let us mention another approach to the problem of estimating the number of large elements of a matrix for given parameters  $N, n, \gamma$ . Consider the minimal  $M$  such that  $d_n(B_1^M, \ell_\infty^M) > \gamma$ . Let  $A$  be a matrix of rank  $n$  that approximates the  $N \times N$  identity matrix. W.l.o.g.  $A$  is symmetric. Consider

the graph  $G$  with  $N$  vertices and edges between pairs  $i, j$  such that  $|A_{i,j}| \leq \gamma$ . Then  $G$  does not contain complete subgraphs with  $M$  vertices (otherwise an approximation of  $M \times M$  identity matrix with an error  $\leq \gamma$  occurs). The number of edges in  $G$  is bounded via Turan's theorem by  $(1 - (M-1)^{-1})N^2/2$ .

## References

- [ST89] S.J. Szarek, M. Talagrand, “An ‘isomorphic’ version of the Sauer-Shelah lemma and the Banach-Mazur distance to the cube”, *GFAA*, v.1376 (1989).
- [G95] A. Giannopoulos, “A Note on the Banach-Mazur Distance to the Cube”. *GFAA*, v.77 (1995).
- [K74] B.S. Kashin, “On Kolmogorov diameters of octahedra” (in Russian), *Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR*, **214**:5 (1974), 1024–1026.
- [G186] E.D. Gluskin, “The octahedron is badly approximated by random subspaces”, *Funct. Anal. Appl.*, **20**:1 (1986), 11–16.
- [H79] K. Hollig, “Approximationszahlen von Sobolev-Einbettungen”, *Math. Ann.*, **242**:3 (1979), 273–281.
- [A09] N. Alon, “Perturbed Identity Matrices Have High Rank: Proof and Applications”, *Combinatorics, Probability and Computing*, **18**:1-2 (2009), 3–15.
- [LT] J. Lindenstrauss, L. Tzafriri, *Classical Banach Spaces I and II*, Springer. 1996.