

# LINEAR SYSTEM OF GEOMETRICALLY IRREDUCIBLE PLANE CUBICS OVER FINITE FIELDS

SHAMIL ASGARLI AND DRAGOS GHIOCA

**ABSTRACT.** We examine the maximum dimension of a linear system of plane cubic curves whose  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -members are all geometrically irreducible. Computational evidence suggests that such a system has a maximum (projective) dimension of 3. As a step towards the conjecture, we prove that there exists a 3-dimensional linear system  $\mathcal{L}$  with at most one geometrically reducible  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Let  $\mathcal{P}$  describe a property of a degree  $d$  algebraic hypersurface in  $\mathbb{P}^n$ . In algebraic geometry and adjacent fields, we are often interested in measuring the likelihood of the property  $\mathcal{P}$  for a “randomly chosen” hypersurface. When working over an infinite field, we can use Zariski dense open sets to show that property  $\mathcal{P}$  holds generically. However, the situation over finite fields is more subtle since open sets in the relevant parameter space may not have any  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -points (despite being Zariski dense over  $\overline{\mathbb{F}_q}$ ).

There are alternative methods to quantify how widespread a property  $\mathcal{P}$  holds for hypersurfaces over finite fields. One method is to count the proportion of degree  $d$  hypersurfaces over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  satisfying  $\mathcal{P}$ , and consider the asymptotic proportion (either as  $d \rightarrow \infty$  or  $q \rightarrow \infty$ ). As another natural metric, we can ask for the maximum size of a linear family  $\mathcal{P}$  can carry. More precisely, we can pose the following question for each finite field  $\mathbb{F}_q$ , and positive integers  $d$  and  $n$ .

**Question 1.** What is the maximum value of  $t \in \mathbb{N}$  for which there exist  $\{F_i = 0\}$  for  $i = 0, 1, \dots, t$  such that  $X_{[a_0, \dots, a_t]} = \{a_0 F_0 + \dots + a_t F_t = 0\}$  satisfies the property  $\mathcal{P}$  for all choices  $[a_0 : a_1 : \dots : a_t] \in \mathbb{P}^t(\mathbb{F}_q)$ ?

The question can be rephrased in the language of linear systems: what is the largest (projective) dimension of a linear system  $\mathcal{L} \cong \mathbb{P}^t$  of degree  $d$  hypersurfaces in  $\mathbb{P}^n$  such that each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$  satisfies  $\mathcal{P}$ ? An answer to Question 1 measures how much the property  $\mathcal{P}$  linearly propagates in the parameter space of all degree  $d$  hypersurfaces in  $\mathbb{P}^n$ . Larger values of  $t$  indicate higher levels of prevalence for  $\mathcal{P}$ . Question 1 has been addressed in recent papers when  $\mathcal{P}$  stands for “is smooth” [AGR23], “is irreducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ” [AGR24], “is reducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ” [AGR24], or “nonblocking with respect to  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -lines” [AGY23].

In this paper, we address Question 1 when  $\mathcal{P}$  stands for “is geometrically irreducible” (that is, irreducible over  $\overline{\mathbb{F}_q}$ ) for cubic plane curves:  $d = 3$  and  $n = 2$ . In this special case, every linear system  $\mathcal{L}$  of (projective) dimension 4 has an  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member that is a reducible plane cubic over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  by [AGR24, Theorem 1.3(d)]. Hence, the answer to Question 1 in this setting is at most 3. We predict that the answer is exactly 3.

**Conjecture 2.** There exists a linear system  $\mathcal{L} = \langle F_0, F_1, F_2, F_3 \rangle$  of cubic plane curves where each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$  is geometrically irreducible.

As partial progress, we establish the following result.

**Theorem 3.** *There exists a linear system  $\mathcal{L} = \langle F_0, F_1, F_2, F_3 \rangle$  of cubic plane curves where each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$  is irreducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  and there is at most one geometrically reducible  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$ .*

While we focus on the case of cubic plane curves in the present paper, the same question applies to hypersurfaces of degree  $d$  in  $\mathbb{P}^n$  for any  $d$  and  $n$ .

**Problem 4.** Determine the maximum (projective) dimension of a linear system  $\mathcal{L}$  of degree  $d$  hypersurfaces in  $\mathbb{P}^n$  such that each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member is geometrically irreducible.

---

2020 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 14N05; Secondary 14C21, 14H50, 14G15.

*Key words and phrases.* linear system, cubic curves, geometric irreducibility, finite fields.

By [AGR24, Theorem 1.3(d)], every linear system of dimension  $\binom{n+d-1}{n-1}$  has an  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member that is reducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ . Hence, the answer to Problem 4 is at most  $\binom{n+d-1}{n-1} - 1$ . On the other hand, by [AGR23, Theorem 2], when  $p = \text{char}(\mathbb{F}_q) \nmid \gcd(d, n+1)$ , there exists an  $n$ -dimensional linear system whose  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -members are all smooth, hence geometrically irreducible. Hence, the answer to Problem 4 is at least  $n$ . We expect the true answer to Problem 4 to be closer to the upper bound  $\binom{n+d-1}{n-1} - 1$ . After all, we expect most geometrically reducible hypersurfaces defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  to be reducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ .

We also have a related open problem with the condition “geometrically irreducible” relaxed to “not containing a linear component over  $\overline{\mathbb{F}_q}$ .”

**Problem 5.** Determine the maximum (projective) dimension of a linear system  $\mathcal{L}$  of degree  $d$  hypersurfaces in  $\mathbb{P}^n$  such that each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member has no linear factor.

By definition, the answer to Problem 4 is less than or equal to the answer to Problem 5. It is reasonable to expect that the two answers agree, at least for all sufficiently large  $q$  (as a function of  $n$  and  $d$ ). The heuristic is that most reducible hypersurfaces (over  $\overline{\mathbb{F}_q}$ ) have a linear factor. Note that Conjecture 2 concerns the case  $n = 2$  and  $d = 3$  for which Problems 4 and 5 coincide.

While these open problems are new, we note that the study of reducible members in a linear system of algebraic hypersurfaces is rich in literature. One case that has been investigated thoroughly is the number of reducible (or totally reducible) hypersurfaces in a pencil of hypersurfaces [Lor93, Vis93, PY08]. The setting between the cited work and the present work differs in a few places. We only consider  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -members while the previous work is about controlling reducibility over  $\overline{\mathbb{F}_q}$ -members. On the other hand, we do not restrict our attention to pencils and allow large-dimensional linear systems.

**Structure of the paper.** We provide two proofs for Theorem 3. In Section 2, we provide a non-constructive proof in the spirit of the work done in [AGR24], while in Section 3 we provide an explicit construction of a 3-dimensional linear system as desired for the conclusion of Theorem 3. Appendix A provides numerical evidence (computed using SageMath) that supports Conjecture 2 for all  $q \leq 11$ .

## 2. PROOF 1: GALOIS ORBITS

In this section, we discuss the construction in our previous paper [AGR24] joint with Reichstein in the special case of plane cubic curves. Note that [AGR24, Theorem 1.3(c)] provides a linear system of cubics  $\mathcal{L} \cong \mathbb{P}^3$  where each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$  is irreducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ . We will show that the same linear system  $\mathcal{L}$  has at most one geometrically reducible  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -members, establishing a proof of Theorem 3. We begin with reviewing the construction of  $\mathcal{L}$ .

The proof of [AGR24, Theorem 1.3(c)] is based on the existence of a point  $P \in \mathbb{P}^2(\mathbb{F}_{q^6})$  such that  $P$  is not contained in any degree 2 curve  $C$  over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  [AGR24, Theorem 1.1]. Equivalently, no conic defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  contains the Galois orbit  $S = \{P, P^\sigma, \dots, P^{\sigma^5}\}$ . Here,  $P^\sigma$  denotes the image of the point  $P$  under the Frobenius map  $[x : y : z] \mapsto [x^q : y^q : z^q]$ . For simplicity, let us write  $P_i = P^{\sigma^i}$  so that  $S = \{P_0, \dots, P_5\}$ .

Recall that the dimension of the  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -vector space of cubic forms in 3 variables is 10. Imposing the condition that a cubic passes through a specific point imposes at most 1 linear condition on the coefficients. Since  $S = \{P_0, \dots, P_5\}$  has 6 points and  $S$  is defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  (despite  $P_i$  not individually defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ ), the  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -vector subspace of all cubics passing through  $S$  has dimension at least  $10 - 6 = 4$ . Let  $F_0, F_1, F_2, F_3$  denote four linearly independent cubic forms in  $\mathbb{F}_q[x, y, z]$  each passing through all points of  $S$ .

Let  $\mathcal{L} = \langle F_0, F_1, F_2, F_3 \rangle \cong \mathbb{P}^3$  denote the 3-dimensional linear system of cubic curves passing through  $S$ . Let  $C$  be a reducible cubic curve (over  $\overline{\mathbb{F}_q}$ ) which is an  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$ . There are two ways in which a reducible cubic  $C = L \cup Q$  can pass through the set  $S$ :

- (a) Let  $L_{ij}$  be the line joining  $P_i$  and  $P_j$  and  $Q$  can vary in  $\mathbb{P}^1$ -worth of conics passing through the remaining 4 points.
- (b) Let  $Q_i$  be the conic passing through 5 points in the set  $S \setminus \{P_i\}$ . Then  $L$  can vary in  $\mathbb{P}^1$ -worth of lines passing through the remaining point  $P_i$ .

However, if  $C$  is defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ , it must be the case that  $C$  is a union of three  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -lines, Galois conjugated by  $\text{Gal}(\mathbb{F}_{q^3}/\mathbb{F}_q)$ . It is straightforward to see that *exactly one* of these curves, namely  $\overline{P_0P_3} \cup \overline{P_1P_4} \cup \overline{P_2P_5}$ , is defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ . Hence, all  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -members of  $\mathcal{L}$  are irreducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$  and exactly one  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}$  fails to be geometrically irreducible.

### 3. PROOF 2: EXPLICIT CONSTRUCTION

The first proof relies on the existence of a point  $P \in \mathbb{P}^2(\mathbb{F}_{q^6})$  which does not lie on any conic defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ . The proof of this assertion in [AGR24, Theorem 1.1] was obtained by an intricate counting argument and hence is nonconstructive by its nature. In this section, we offer an alternative proof of Theorem 3 which has the advantage of providing an explicit construction.

We start with a lemma on reducible cubic curves containing only the monomials  $x^2y, y^2z, z^2x, xyz$ .

**Lemma 6.** *Suppose  $ax^2y + by^2z + cz^2x + dxyz = 0$  is a geometrically reducible cubic curve. Then  $abc = 0$ .*

*Proof.* The reducible cubic has a linear factor  $L$ . Without loss of generality,  $L = x + \beta y + \gamma z$  for some scalars  $\beta, \gamma$ . If  $a = 0$ , then we are done. Hence, we may assume  $a = 1$  after scaling. We have:

$$(3.1) \quad x^2y + by^2z + cz^2x + dxyz = LQ$$

for some quadratic factor  $Q$ . We match the coefficients on both sides of (3.1) to prove that  $b = 0$ . We proceed in five steps:

- (1) The cubic has no  $x^3$  term, so  $Q$  has no  $x^2$  term. The term  $x^2y$  can only be constructed from multiplying  $x$  from  $L$  with a term in  $xy$  from  $Q$ ; thus, the coefficient of  $xy$  in  $Q$  must be 1.
- (2) If  $\beta \neq 0$ , then  $Q$  has no  $y^2$  term; in that case,  $LQ$  has the term  $(\beta y) \cdot xy$  which leads to the term  $xy^2$  in the cubic that cannot be canceled, a contradiction. Therefore,  $\beta = 0$ .
- (3) The cubic has no  $xy^2$  term and  $\beta = 0$ , so  $Q$  has no  $y^2$  term. The cubic has no  $x^2z$  term and  $Q$  has no  $x^2$  term, so  $Q$  has no  $xz$  term.
- (4) So,  $Q = xy + \delta_1yz + \delta_2z^2$  and  $L = x + \gamma z$ . From (3.1), we see  $\gamma\delta_1 = 0$ . If  $\gamma = 0$ , then  $x$  divides the cubic, implying that  $b = 0$ , as desired.
- (5) If  $\gamma \neq 0$ , then we have  $\delta_1 = 0$ . In this case, (3.1) reads:

$$(x + \gamma z)(xy + \delta_2z^2) = x^2y + by^2z + cz^2x + dxyz.$$

We obtain  $b = 0$ , as desired.

Thus, any geometrically reducible cubic of the form  $ax^2y + by^2z + cz^2x + dxyz = 0$  satisfies  $abc = 0$ .  $\square$

We will now present the second proof of our main theorem.

*Proof of Theorem 3.* Consider the linear system  $\mathcal{L}_1 = \langle x^2y, y^2z, z^2x, xyz \rangle$ . By the Normal Basis Theorem, there exists an element  $\alpha \in \mathbb{F}_{q^3}$  such that  $\alpha, \alpha^q, \alpha^{q^2}$  forms a basis of  $\mathbb{F}_{q^3}$  as an  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -vector space. We construct a new linear system from  $\mathcal{L}_1$  where  $x, y$ , and  $z$  are replaced by appropriate linear forms. Let

$$\begin{aligned} F &= (\alpha x + \alpha^q y + \alpha^{q^2} z)^2 (\alpha^q x + \alpha^{q^2} y + \alpha z), \\ G &= (\alpha^q x + \alpha^{q^2} y + \alpha z)^2 (\alpha^{q^2} x + \alpha y + \alpha^q z), \\ H &= (\alpha^{q^2} x + \alpha y + \alpha^q z)^2 (\alpha x + \alpha^q y + \alpha^{q^2} z), \\ T &= (\alpha x + \alpha^q y + \alpha^{q^2} z)(\alpha^q x + \alpha^{q^2} y + \alpha z)(\alpha^{q^2} x + \alpha y + \alpha^q z). \end{aligned}$$

Consider the linear system  $\mathcal{L}_2 = \langle F, G, H, T \rangle$ . The Frobenius map  $t \mapsto t^q$  sends  $F \mapsto G \mapsto H \mapsto F$  and fixes  $T$ . Thus, the linear system  $\mathcal{L}_2$  is defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ , meaning that we can find new generators  $R_0, R_1, R_2, R_3 \in \mathbb{F}_q[x, y, z]$  with  $\deg(R_i) = 3$  such that  $\mathcal{L}_2 = \langle R_0, R_1, R_2, R_3 \rangle$ . We claim that each  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}_2$  is geometrically irreducible except the member  $T \in \mathcal{L}_2$  which is a union of three lines conjugated by  $\text{Gal}(\mathbb{F}_{q^3}/\mathbb{F}_q)$ . Indeed, we have a new coordinate system induced by the linear transformation:

$$\begin{aligned} x' &= \alpha x + \alpha^q y + \alpha^{q^2} z \\ y' &= \alpha^q x + \alpha^{q^2} y + \alpha z \\ z' &= \alpha^{q^2} x + \alpha y + \alpha^q z \end{aligned}$$

Applying Lemma 6 in the new coordinate system, we see that any geometrically reducible  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}_2$  given by

$$aF + bG + cH + dT = 0,$$

satisfies  $abc = 0$ . After applying the Frobenius map  $t \mapsto t^q$  twice and using the fact that  $T$  is defined over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ , we get two additional equations:

$$\begin{aligned} aG + bH + cF + dT &= 0, \\ aH + bF + cG + dT &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

Since  $abc = 0$ , at least one of  $a, b, c$  is zero. The three equations above and the linear independence of  $F, G, H, T$  imply  $a = b = c = 0$ . Hence, the only geometrically reducible  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -member of  $\mathcal{L}_2$  is  $\{T = 0\}$ . Note that  $\{T = 0\}$  is irreducible over  $\mathbb{F}_q$ . Thus, the linear system  $\mathcal{L}_2$  satisfies the desired properties.  $\square$

#### APPENDIX A: COMPUTATIONAL EVIDENCE FOR THE CONJECTURE

We verified Conjecture 2 for all  $q \leq 11$  using SageMath [Sage21]. It suffices to randomly generate a cubic linear system  $\mathcal{L} = \langle F_0, F_1, F_2, F_3 \rangle$  until all  $\mathbb{F}_q$ -members of  $\mathcal{L}$  are geometrically irreducible. The table below lists the successful linear systems for  $q \in \{2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11\}$ .

$q = 2$	
$F_0 = x^2y + x^2z + y^2z$ $F_1 = x^3 + yz^2$	$F_2 = xy^2 + y^3 + xyz + xz^2$ $F_3 = x^2y + xy^2 + xz^2 + z^3$
$q = 3$	
$F_0 = y^3 + x^2z + y^2z + yz^2 + z^3$ $F_1 = x^3 - xy^2 + y^2z - xz^2 + yz^2 - z^3$	$F_2 = x^3 - x^2y - xy^2 + xz^2 - yz^2$ $F_3 = -x^3 - x^2y + y^3 + x^2z - xz^2$
$q = 4$	
$F_0 = x^2y + y^3 + x^2z + xyz + yz^2$ $F_1 = x^2y + xyz + y^2z + z^3$	$F_2 = x^3 + xy^2 + y^2z + xz^2 + yz^2$ $F_3 = x^3 + yz^2$
$q = 5$	
$F_0 = 2x^2y + xy^2 + y^3 + xz^2 + yz^2$ $F_1 = x^2y + 2xy^2 - 2y^3 - 2x^2z + 2y^2z - 2xz^2 - yz^2$	$F_2 = 2x^3 + x^2y + xy^2 + y^3 - 2x^2z - xyz - y^2z + xz^2 + 2yz^2$ $F_3 = -2x^2y - 2xy^2 - x^2z - 2xyz + y^2z - xz^2 + 2z^3$
$q = 7$	
$F_0 = -x^3 - 3xy^2 + y^3 + 3y^2z + xz^2 - 2yz^2 + 3z^3$ $F_1 = 3x^3 - 3x^2y - 3xy^2 - 3y^3 + xyz - 2y^2z - 2z^3$	$F_2 = x^3 - 2x^2y + y^3 - x^2z - 3xyz - 2y^2z + xz^2 - 3z^3$ $F_3 = -3x^3 - 2x^2y + 2xy^2 + 2y^3 - 2x^2z - 2y^2z - xz^2 + 3z^3$
$q = 8$	
$F_0 = x^2y + y^2z + xz^2 + yz^2$ $F_1 = x^2y + xy^2 + xz^2 + z^3$	$F_2 = x^3 + x^2y + y^2z + xz^2 + z^3$ $F_3 = x^2y + y^3 + x^2z + xyz + xz^2 + yz^2 + z^3$
$q = 9$	
$F_0 = -x^3 + x^2y + y^3 + x^2z + xyz - y^2z + xz^2 - yz^2$ $F_1 = xy^2 - x^2z - xyz - y^2z - z^3$	$F_2 = x^2y + xy^2 + x^2z + xz^2 + yz^2 + z^3$ $F_3 = xy^2 - y^3 - x^2z + y^2z - yz^2$
$q = 11$	
$F_0 = -3x^3 - 5xy^2 + 2x^2z + 4y^2z - 2xz^2 - 4z^3$ $F_1 = x^3 + xy^2 + 2y^3 + 3x^2z + 4xyz - y^2z - 3xz^2 + 2yz^2 - z^3$	$F_2 = 5x^3 + 3x^2y + y^3 - 2x^2z - 5xyz - y^2z - 5xz^2 - 3yz^2 - 4z^3$ $F_3 = 2x^3 - 3x^2y + 4xy^2 + 2y^3 - 5x^2z + y^2z - 2xz^2 - yz^2 + z^3$

#### REFERENCES

[AGR23] Shamil Asgarli, Dragos Ghioca, and Zinovy Reichstein, *Linear families of smooth hypersurfaces over finitely generated fields*, Finite Fields Appl. **87** (2023), Paper No. 102169, 10.

- [AGR24] ———, *Linear system of hypersurfaces passing through a Galois orbit*, arXiv e-prints (2024), available at <https://arxiv.org/abs/2310.10361>.
- [AGY23] Shamil Asgarli, Dragos Ghioca, and Chi Hoi Yip, *Existence of pencils with nonblocking hypersurfaces*, *Finite Fields Appl.* **92** (2023), Paper No. 102283, 11.
- [Lor93] Dino Lorenzini, *Reducibility of polynomials in two variables*, *J. Algebra* **156** (1993), no. 1, 65–75.
- [PY08] J. V. Pereira and S. Yuzvinsky, *Completely reducible hypersurfaces in a pencil*, *Adv. Math.* **219** (2008), no. 2, 672–688.
- [Sage21] The Sage Developers, *SageMath, the Sage Mathematics Software System (Version 9.4)*, 2021. <https://www.sagemath.org>.
- [Vis93] Angelo Vistoli, *The number of reducible hypersurfaces in a pencil*, *Invent. Math.* **112** (1993), no. 2, 247–262.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS AND COMPUTER SCIENCE, SANTA CLARA UNIVERSITY, 500 EL CAMINO REAL, USA 95053  
*Email address:* [sasgarli@scu.edu](mailto:sasgarli@scu.edu)

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA, VANCOUVER, BC V6T 1Z2  
*Email address:* [dghioca@math.ubc.ca](mailto:dghioca@math.ubc.ca)