# A PROBLEM OF ERDŐS ABOUT RICH DISTANCES

KRISHNENDU BHOWMICK

ABSTRACT. An old question posed by Erdős asked whether there exists a set of n points such that  $c \cdot n$  distances occur more than n times. We provide an affirmative answer to this question, showing that there exists a set of n points such that  $\lfloor \frac{n}{4} \rfloor$  distances occur more than n times. We also present a generalized version, finding a set of n points where  $c_m \cdot n$  distances occurring more than n + m times.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

In a 1997 paper, Erdős [1] asked the following question:

**Problem** (Erdős). For a set of n points in a plane, can  $c \cdot n$  of the distances occur more than n times?

We provide an affirmative answer to the question by proving the following theorem:

**Theorem 1.1.** For all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , there exists a set of n points such that  $\lfloor \frac{n}{4} \rfloor$  distances occur at least n + 1 times.

We also show the following generalization of Theorem 1.1, indicating that  $c_m$  distances can occur n + m times.

**Theorem 1.2.** For all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , there exist a set of n points such that at least  $\lfloor \frac{n}{2(m+1)} \rfloor$  distances occur at least n + m times.

### 2. Proof of Theorem 1.1

We start with proving the following simple claim:

**Claim 2.1.** In a regular m-gon,  $\lfloor \frac{m-1}{2} \rfloor$  distances appear m times.

*Proof.* Observe that in a regular m-gon  $v_1 \dots v_m$ , the distances  $||v_i - v_{(i+k)}||$  and  $||v_j - v_{(j+k)}||$  are equal for all  $i, j \in [m]$  and some  $k \in \lfloor \lfloor \frac{m-1}{2} \rfloor$ . Thus, we conclude  $\lfloor \frac{m-1}{2} \rfloor$  of the distances are repeating m times.

Proof of Theorem 1.1. For n < 4 the statement is vacuously true. Hence, we will assume  $n \ge 4$ . We will consider two cases: Case 1 for n odd and Case 2 for n even.

**Case 1** Since *n* is odd, let n = 2m + 1. Consider an (m+1)-gon  $v_1 \dots v_{m+1}$ . From Claim 2.1,  $\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$  of the distances are repeated m + 1 times. Now, rotate the (m + 1)-gon around



FIGURE 1. A set of 9 points with 2 distances appearing 10 times.



FIGURE 2. A set of 11 points with 2 distances appearing at least 12 times.

vertex  $v_1$  to get a new (m+1)-gon  $v_1r_2 \ldots r_{m+1}$ . Again,  $\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$  of the distances are repeating m+1 times in the new (m+1)-gon. Since  $v_1$  is the only common vertex between the two (m+1)-gons, the total number of vertices in the two (m+1)-gons is

$$2 \cdot (m+1) - 1 = 2m + 1 = n.$$

Also observe that as n is odd,  $\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor = \lfloor \frac{n-1}{4} \rfloor = \lfloor \frac{n}{4} \rfloor$  of the distances occur

$$2 \cdot (m+1) = 2m + 2 = n + 1$$

times. Hence, we get a set of n points  $\{v_1, \ldots, v_{m+1}, r_2, \ldots, r_{m+1}\}$  where  $\lfloor \frac{n}{4} \rfloor$  distances occur at least n+1 times. This concludes Case 1.



FIGURE 3. A set of 10 points with 2 distance appearing at least 11 times.

**Case 2** The proof is similar to that of Case 1. However, instead of rotating a regular polygon around one of its vertices, we will reflect a regular polygon on one of its edges.

Since n is even, let n = 2m. Consider an (m+1)-gon  $v_1 \dots v_{m+1}$ . From Claim 2.1,  $\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$  of the distances are repeated m+1 times. Now, reflect the (m+1)-gon over the edge  $v_1v_2$  to get a new (m+1)-gon  $v_1v_2v'_3 \dots v'_{m+1}$ . Again,  $\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$  of the distances are repeated m+1 times in the new (m+1)-gon. Since  $v_1$  and  $v_2$  are the only common vertices between the two (m+1)-gons, the total number of vertices in the union of the two (m+1)-gons is

$$2 \cdot (m+1) - 2 = 2m = n$$

Also, observe that the only distance common between the two (m + 1)-gons is  $||v_1 - v_2||$ , and repeating only for the edge  $v_1v_2$ . Thus,  $\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor = \lfloor \frac{n}{4} \rfloor$  of the distances occur at least

$$2 \cdot (m+1) - 1 = 2m + 1 = n + 1$$

times. Hence, we get a set of n points  $\{v_1, \ldots, v_{m+1}, v'_3, \ldots, v'_{m+1}\}$  where  $\lfloor \frac{n}{4} \rfloor$  many of the distances occur at least n+1 times. This concludes Case 2 and proves the theorem.

3. Proof of Theorem 1.2



FIGURE 4. A set of 8 points with 1 distance appearing at least 11 times. The diagram consists of two rotations and one reflection of the triangle  $v_1v_2v_3$ .

Proof of Theorem 1.2. For n < m+3 the statement is vacuously true hence, we will assume  $n \ge m+3$ . Let n = (m+1)k + r for some  $r \in [2, m+2]$ . To prove this theorem, we start with a regular (k+2)-gon  $v_1 \ldots v_{k+2}$ . Fix a vertex, say  $v_1$ , and take (r-2) arbitrary rotations of the (k+2)-gon around  $v_1$ , resulting in a total of (r-1) regular (k+2)-gons

with a common vertex  $v_1$ . Now iteratively reflect the (k+2)-gon over an edge  $v_i, v_{i+1}$  for some  $i \in [k]$ , then chose another edge of any the (k+2)-gon and reflect again with a total of (m+2-r) reflections. Hence, the total number of points is

$$(k+2) + (r-2)(k+1) + (m+2-r)(k) = (m+1)k + r = n.$$

Observe that from Claim 2.1  $\lfloor \frac{k+1}{2} \rfloor$  of the distances repeat k+2 times in each (k+2)-gon, with only repetition of one edge for each reflection. Since there are m+2-r reflections in total,  $\lfloor \frac{k+1}{2} \rfloor$  distances appear at least

$$(k+2)(m+1) - (m+2-r) = [(m+1)k+r] + m = n + m$$

times. Finally, since n = (m+1)k + r we have,

$$\left\lfloor \frac{k+1}{2} \right\rfloor \ge \left\lfloor \frac{n}{2(m+1)} \right\rfloor$$

and we conclude that at least  $\lfloor \frac{n}{2(m+1)} \rfloor$  of the distances appear at least n+m times.  $\Box$ 

## 4. Further Research

In [1], the main problem of this paper was mentioned in the context of the previously conjectured Erdős' distinct distance problem [2] from 1946.

**Problem** (Erdős' Distinct Distance Problem). Does every set of n distinct points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  determine  $\gg n/\sqrt{\log n}$  many distinct distances?

Erdős' distinct distance problem was almost settled (with a remaining gap of  $\sqrt{\log n}$ ) by Guth and Katz [3]. In the same paper [1] Erdős also mentioned another question of himself and Pach.

**Problem** (Erdős and Pach). Let  $A \subset \mathbb{R}^2$  be a set of n points. Must there be two distances which occur at least once but between at most n pairs of points?

Pannwitz and Hopf [4] proved that the largest distance between points of A can occur at most n times, but it remains unknown whether a second such distance must occur. Erdős and Pach believe that such a distance exists.

Another popular distance problem of Erdős mentioned alongside the distinct distance problem [2] is known as Erdős' unit distance problem.

**Problem** (Erdős' Unit Distance Problem). Does every set of n distinct points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  contain at most  $n^{1+O(1/\log \log n)}$  pairs which are distance 1 apart?

This bound would be best possible as it is achievable for the integer lattice. The best known upper bound is  $O(n^{4/3})$ , due to Spencer, Szemerédi, and Trotter [5].

### Acknowledgements

The author was supported by the Austrian Science Fund FWF Project P 34180. I am deeply grateful to Oliver Roche-Newton for his invaluable comments and suggestions. I also thank Alexander Polyanskii and Adam Sheffer for their feedback on an earlier draft of this paper.

#### References

- Paul Erdős, Some old and new problems in various branches of combinatorics, Discrete Mathematics 165/166 (1997) 227-231.
- [2] Paul Erdős, On sets of distances of points, American Mathematical Monthly. 53 (5) (1946): 248–250.
- [3] Larry Guth and Nets Hawk Katz, On the Erdős distinct distances problem in the plane, Annals of Mathematics. 181 (1)(2015): 155–190.
- [4] H. Hopf and E. Pannwitz, Aufgabe Nr. 167, Jahresbericht d. Deutsch. Math.- Verein. 43 (1934), 114.
- [5] Spencer, J. and Szemerédi, E. and Trotter, Jr., W., Unit distances in the Euclidean plane, Graph theory and combinatorics (Cambridge, 1983) (1984), 293-303.

JOHANN RADON INSTITUTE FOR COMPUTATIONAL AND APPLIED MATHEMATICS, LINZ, AUSTRIA *Email address*: Krishnendu.Bhowmick@oeaw.ac.at