Velichko's notions close to sequentially separability and their hereditary variants in C_p -theory

Alexander V. Osipov

Krasovskii Institute of Mathematics and Mechanics, Ural Federal University, Yekaterinburg, Russia

Abstract

A space X is sequentially separable if there is a countable $S \subset X$ such that every point of X is the limit of a sequence of points from S. In 2004, N.V. Velichko defined and investigated concepts close to sequentially separability: σ -separability and F-separability. The aim of this paper is to study σ -separability and F-separability (and their hereditary variants) of the space $C_p(X)$ of all real-valued continuous functions, defined on a Tychonoff space X, endowed with the pointwise convergence topology. In particular, we proved that σ -separability coincides with sequential separability. Hereditary variants (hereditarily σ -separability and hereditarily F-separability) coincides with Fréchet–Urysohn property in the class of cosmic spaces.

Keywords: sequentially separable, σ -separable, F-separable, strongly sequentially separable, C_p -theory, selection principles, Fréchet–Urysohn 2020 MSC: 54D65, 54C35, 54C65, 54C05

1. Introduction

If X is a topological space and $A \subseteq X$, then the sequential closure of A, denoted by $[A]_s$, is the set of all limits of sequences from A. A set is called sequentially closed if $A = [A]_s$. We denote by [A] or \overline{A} the closure of A in X.

Let us recall that a topological space X is

• *separable* if it contains a countable everywhere dense set;

• sequentially separable if X contains a countable set A sequentially dense in X, i.e. $X = [A]_s$;

Email address: oab@list.ru (Alexander V. Osipov)

• hereditarily sequentially separable if every subspace of X is sequentially separable;

• *strongly sequentially separable* if it is separable and every dense countable subspace is sequentially dense;

• Fréchet-Urysohn if for every $A \subset X$ and $x \in \overline{A}$ there exists a sequence in A converging to x.

It is obvious that every Fréchet-Urysohn separable space is strongly sequentially separable. It is clear that a hereditarily sequentially separable space is sequentially separable and a sequentially separable space is separable.

In [17], N.V. Velichko defined and investigated concepts close to sequentially separability such that σ -separability and F-separability.

Definition 1.1. The σ -closure of a set A in a space X is the set $[A]_{\sigma}$ consisting of all points x such that:

(a) $x \in [A]_s$;

(b) if a sequence $\langle x_n \rangle$ of points of A converges to x and $x \in [A \setminus \bigcup \{x_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}]$, then there exists a sequence $\langle y_n \rangle$ of points of the set $A \setminus \bigcup \{x_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ converging to x.

Definition 1.2. A set A is called σ -dense in X if $X = [A]_{\sigma}$. A space X is called σ -separable if it contains a countable σ -dense set.

Definition 1.3. The *F*-closure of a set *A* in a space *X* is the set $[A]_F$ consisting of all points *x* such that if $x \in [A']$, $A' \subseteq A$, then there exists a sequence $\langle x_n \rangle$ of points of the set *A'* converging to the point *x*.

Definition 1.4. A set A is called F-dense in X if $X = [A]_F$. A space X is called F-separable if it contains a countable F-dense set.

A space X is called *hereditarily* σ -separable (*hereditarily* F-separable) if every subspace of X is σ -separable (F-separable).

A network in a space X is defined as the family σ of subsets of X such that any open set of X is the union of some subfamily of σ . A space is a cosmic space if it has a countable network.

We consider the following space notations:

- **s** separable spaces;
- \bullet hs hereditarily separable spaces;
- \bullet \mathbf{ss} sequentially separable spaces;
- hss hereditarily sequentially separable spaces;
- sss strongly sequentially separable spaces;
- FU Fréchet-Urysohn spaces;
- $\mathbf{Fs} F$ -separable spaces;
- $\sigma \mathbf{s} \sigma$ -separable spaces;
- $\mathbf{h}\sigma\mathbf{s}$ hereditarily σ -separable spaces;
- hFs hereditarily *F*-separable spaces.

Velichko proved that any cosmic space is hereditarily sequentially separable (Theorem 1 in [17]) and a space is hereditarily σ -separable if and only if it is hereditarily *F*-separable (Theorem 4 in [17]).

The following examples were constructed in [17]:

- (1) Separable sequential compact space that is non-sequential separable;
- (2) Sequential separable sequential compact space that is non- σ -separable;
- (3) Cosmic space that is non- σ -separable;
- (4) F-separable space that is non-Fréchet-Urysohn;
- (5) σ -separable space that is non-*F*-separable.

Thus we have the following the relationships between these classes of spaces and counterexamples (Diagram 1).



Diagram 1.

The set of positive integers is denoted by \mathbb{N} and $\omega = \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}$. Let \mathbb{R} be the real line. Let X be a Tychonoff topological space, $C(X, \mathbb{R})$ be the space of all continuous functions on X with values in \mathbb{R} and τ_p be the pointwise convergence topology. Denote by $C_p(X)$ the topological space $(C(X, \mathbb{R}), \tau_p)$.

The symbol **0** stands for the constant function to 0. A basic open neighborhood of **0** in $C_p(X)$ is of the form $[F, (-\varepsilon, \varepsilon)] = \{f \in C_p(X) | f(F) \subset (-\varepsilon, \varepsilon)\}$, where F is a finite subset of X and $\varepsilon > 0$.

The study of separability and sequential separability in function spaces can be found in many papers [12–16]. In this paper we to study σ -separability and F-separability and their hereditary variants of the space $C_p(X)$. Unexpectedly, it turns out that σ -separability coincides with sequential separability, and hereditary analogues with strongly sequentially separability and hereditarily sequentially separability. In particular, hereditary σ -separability of $C_p(X)$ coincides with Fréchet–Urysohn property in the class of separable metrizable spaces X.

2. Main results

In [8], N. Noble proved that a space $C_p(X)$ is separable if and only if X has a coarser second countable topology.

Thus, we assume that all spaces X considered below are Tychonoff and has a coarser second countable topology.

Definition 2.1. (Def. 2.2 in [9]). A space X has the Velichko's property, if there exists a continuous bijection $f: X \to Y$ from a space X on a separable metric space Y such that f(U) is an F_{σ} -set of Y for any cozero-set U of X.

In [18] and [3], a criterion for the sequential separability of space $C_p(X)$ was obtained.

Theorem 2.2. ([18]) A space $C_p(X)$ is sequentially separable if and only if X has the Velichko's property.

Theorem 2.3. The following assertions are equivalent:

- 1. $C_p(X)$ is sequentially separable;
- 2. $C_p(X)$ is σ -separable;
- 3. X has Velichko's property.

Proof. By Theorem 2.2, $(1) \Leftrightarrow (3)$.

 $(2) \Rightarrow (1)$. It is trivial.

 $(1) \Rightarrow (2)$. Let $A = \{f_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ be a countable sequentially dense set in $C_p(X)$. Let $B = \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} B_n$ where $B_n = \{f_n + r : r \in \mathbb{Q} \cap [0, \frac{1}{2^n}]\}$. It is clear that B is a countable sequentially dense set in $C_p(X)$.

We claim that B is σ -dense in $C_p(X)$. Let $f = \lim_{i \to \infty} h_i$ where $\{h_i = f_{n_i} + r_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\} \subset B$ and $f \in [B \setminus [] \{h_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}].$

 $\begin{aligned} f_{n_i} + r_i &: i \in \mathbb{N} \} \subset B \text{ and } f \in [B \setminus \bigcup \{h_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}]. \\ \text{Since } r_i \to 0 \ (i \to \infty), \ f = \lim_{i \to \infty} f_{n_i}. \text{ Let } q_i \in \mathbb{Q} \cap [0, \frac{1}{2^{n_i}}] \text{ for each } i \in \mathbb{N} \\ \text{and } \{r_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\} \bigcap \{q_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\} = \emptyset. \end{aligned}$

(a) Suppose that there is $l \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $f \neq f_{n_i}$ for i > l.

Note that for every i > l there is $s(i) \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $s(i) \geq i$ and $f_{n_i} + q_{s(i)} \neq f_{n_k} + r_k$ for any $k \in \mathbb{N}$. Otherwise the sequence $(f_{n_i} + q_s)$ $(s \in \overline{i, \infty})$ would be a subsequence of (h_i) and it converged to the point f, but $(f_{n_i} + q_s)$ converged to the point f_{n_i} .

Then the sequence $(g_i) = (f_{n_i} + q_{s(i)})$ such that $f = \lim_{i \to \infty} g_i$ and $\{g_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\} \subseteq B \setminus \bigcup \{h_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}.$

(b) Suppose that $|\{i \in \mathbb{N} : f = f_{n_i}\}| = \omega$.

Then the sequence $(g_j) = (f_{n_j} + q_j) = (f + q_j)$ where $j \in \{i \in \mathbb{N} : f = f_{n_i}\}$ such that $f = \lim_{j \to \infty} g_j$ and $\{g_j\} \subseteq B \setminus \bigcup \{h_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}.$

A cover of a space is a family of proper subsets whose union is the entire space. For families \mathcal{A} and \mathcal{B} of covers of a space, the property that every cover in the family \mathcal{A} has a subcover in the family \mathcal{A} is denoted $\binom{\mathcal{A}}{\mathcal{B}}$. An ω -cover is a cover such that each finite subset of the space is contained in some set from the cover. A γ -cover is an infinite cover such that each point of the space belongs to all but finitely many sets from the cover.

An open cover is a cover by open sets. Given a space, let Ω and Γ be the families of open ω -covers and γ -covers, respectively. The property $\binom{\Omega}{\Gamma}$ is the celebrated γ -property of Gerlits and Nagy, who proved that a space has this property if and only if the space $C_p(X)$ is Fréchet–Urysohn ([4], Theorem 2). A space X is called γ -space if X has property $\binom{\Omega}{\Gamma}$.

Theorem 2.4. The following assertions are equivalent:

- 1. $C_p(X)$ is strongly sequentially separable and hereditarily sequentially separable;
- 2. $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily F-separable;
- 3. $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily σ -separable;
- 4. $C_p(X)$ is strongly sequentially separable and hereditarily separable;
- 5. $C_p(X)$ is Fréchet-Urysohn and hereditarily separable;
- 6. X is a γ -space and X^n is perfect normal for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$;
- 7. X is a γ -space and X^n is hereditarily Lindelöf for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$;
- 8. X is a γ -space and X^{ω} is perfect normal;
- 9. X is a γ -space and X^{ω} is hereditarily Lindelöf;
- 10. X is a γ -space and X^{ω} is hereditarily normal;
- 11. X is a γ -space and X^{ω} is hereditarily countably paracompact.

Proof. (1) \Rightarrow (2). Let $A \subseteq C_p(X)$. Then A is sequentially separable. Let $B \subseteq A$ be a countable sequentially dense subset of A and $f \in [B']$ for $B' \subseteq B$. Since $C_p(X)$ is a homogeneous space, we can assume that $f = \mathbf{0}$. By Theorem 7.5 in [9], $C_p(X)$ satisfies $S_1(\Omega_{\mathbf{0}}^{\omega}, \Gamma_{\mathbf{0}})$, i.e. for each sequence $(C_n : n \in \mathbb{N})$ of countable subsets of $C_p(X)$ such that $\mathbf{0} \in \bigcap [C_n]$ there is a sequence $(c_n : n \in \mathbb{N})$ such that for each $n, c_n \in C_n$, and $c_n \to \mathbf{0}$ $(n \to \infty)$.

Let $C_n = B'$ for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Then there is $\{c_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\} \subseteq B'$ such that $c_n \to \mathbf{0} \ (n \to \infty)$.

 $(2) \Leftrightarrow (3)$. By Theorem 4 in [17].

(3) \Rightarrow (4). Let D be a countable dense subset of $C_p(X)$. Fix a point $f \in C_p(X)$. Then the set $D \cup \{f\}$ is σ -separable. Thus, there is $D' \subset D \cup \{f\}$ such that $f \in [D']_s$, i.e. there is $\{f_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\} \subseteq D'$ such that $f_n \to f$ $(n \to \infty)$. Suppose that there is $n' \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $f_n = f$ for n > n'. Note that $f \in [D' \setminus \{f\}]$. Then, by σ -separability of $D \cup \{f\}$, there is $\{g_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\} \subseteq D' \setminus \{f\}$ such that $g_n \to f$ $(n \to \infty)$. It remains to note that $D' \setminus \{f\} \subseteq D$.

(4) \Rightarrow (5). By Velichko's Theorem (see Theorem 2 in [19] and Theorem II.5.33 in [1]), X^n is hereditarily Lindelöf for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Then, X is ϵ -space, i.e., all finite powers of X are Lindelöf (or, by Proposition in [4], if every open ω -cover of X contains an at most countable ω -subcover of X). By Theorem 7.5 in [9] and Theorem 3.6 in [6], X has property $\binom{\Omega}{\Gamma}$, i.e. X is a γ -space and, by Theorem 2 in [4], $C_p(X)$ is Fréchet–Urysohn.

 $(5) \Rightarrow (6)$. By Theorem 2 in [4], X is a γ -space. By Velichko's Theorem (see Theorem 2 in [19] and Theorem II.5.33 in [1]), X^n is hereditarily Lindelöf for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$. By Proposition 3.8.A.(b) in [2], X^n is perfect normal for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$.

(6) \Leftrightarrow (7). By Proposition 3.8.A.(b) in [2].

 $(7) \Rightarrow (1)$. By Theorem 7.5 in [9], $C_p(X)$ satisfies $S_1(\Omega_0^{\omega}, \Gamma_0)$ and, by Theorem 2 in [19], $C_p(X)$ hereditarily separable. It follows that $C_p(X)$ is strongly sequentially separable and hereditarily sequentially separable.

From the following results, the remaining implications hold.

(a) A countable product space is hereditarily normal iff it is perfectly normal iff it is hereditarily countably paracompact.

(b) A countable product space is perfect iff its all finite subproducts are perfect.

(c) The property $\binom{\Omega}{\Gamma}$ is preserved under taking finite or countable powers [5].

Since the hereditarily separability of $C_p(X)$ is preserved under taking finite or countable powers (moreover, $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily separable iff $C_p(X^n)$ is hereditarily separable iff $(C_p(X))^{\omega}$ is hereditarily separable (Proposition 1 in [19])), we have the following corollary.

Corollary 2.5. The following assertions are equivalent:

- 1. $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily F-separable;
- 2. $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily σ -separable;
- 3. $C_p(X^n)$ is hereditarily σ -separable for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$;
- 4. $C_p(X^n)$ is hereditarily *F*-separable for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$;
- 5. $C_p(X)^n$ is hereditarily σ -separable for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$;
- 6. $C_p(X)^n$ is hereditarily *F*-separable for every $n \in \mathbb{N}$;
- 7. $C_p(X)^{\omega}$ is hereditarily σ -separable;
- 8. $C_p(X)^{\omega}$ is hereditarily F-separable.

By Theorem 1 in [17], a cosmic space is hereditarily sequentially separable. Then we have the following corollary.

Corollary 2.6. Let X be a cosmic space. The following assertions are equivalent:

- 1. $C_p(X)$ is strongly sequentially separable;
- 2. $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily F-separable;
- 3. $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily σ -separable;
- 4. $C_p(X)$ is Fréchet-Urysohn;
- 5. X is a γ -space.

It is consistent and independent for arbitrary X, that $C_p(X)$ is strongly sequentially separable if and only if $C_p(X)$ is Fréchet–Urysohn. In fact it is consistent with **ZFC** that: $C_p(X)$ is strongly sequentially separable iff X is countable iff $C_p(X)$ is separable and Fréchet–Urysohn (Corollary 17 in [3]).

Proposition 2.7. (Cons. **ZFC**) $C_p(X)$ is separable and Fréchet–Urysohn if and only if $C_p(X)$ is first countable.

3. Examples

Let us consider separating examples in C_p -theory.

Example 3.1. There is a strongly sequentially separable space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not hereditarily *F*-separable (hereditarily σ -separable).

In ([10], Corollary 11), assume that $\aleph_1 < \mathfrak{p}$, we constructed a strongly sequentially separable space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not Fréchet–Urysohn. By Theorem 2.4, the space $C_p(X)$ is not hereditarily *F*-separable (hereditarily σ -separable).

Example 3.2. There is a sequentially separable space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not hereditarily separable.

The Sorgenfrey line S is the set \mathbb{R} with the topology generated by the halfopen intervals [a, b), for $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$. M. Patrakeev proved (constructively) that there exists a countable sequentially dense subset in the space $C_p(S)$. Thus, (see also Velichko's criterion (Theorem 2.2)), the space $C_p(S)$ is sequential separable. The product $S \times S$ is not Lindelöf, hence, $C_p(X)$ is not hereditarily separable (Theorem 2 in [19] and Theorem II.5.33 in [1]).

Example 3.3. There is a separable space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not (σ -separable) sequentially separable and it is not hereditarily separable.

It is enough to consider a discrete space X of cardinality \mathfrak{c} . Then, the space $C_p(X) = \mathbb{R}^{\mathfrak{c}}$ is separable, but it is not (σ -separable) sequentially separable (by Theorem 2.2). Since X is not Lindelöf, $\mathbb{R}^{\mathfrak{c}}$ is not hereditarily separable (Theorem 2 in [19]).

Example 3.4. There is a cosmic space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not (hereditarily σ -separable) hereditarily F-separable.

It is enough to consider any uncountable separable metric space X which it is not γ -space. Let X = [0, 1]. A space $C_p(Y)$ is cosmic if and only if Y is cosmic (Theorem I.1.3 in [1]). Hence, $C_p([0, 1])$ is cosmic, but $C_p([0, 1])$ is not Fréchet–Urysohn (Theorem II.3.4 in [1]). Thus, by Corollary 2.6, $C_p([0, 1])$ is not (hereditarily σ -separable) hereditarily F-separable.

Example 3.5. There is a hereditarily separable space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not cosmic.

In [7], assume that (CH), Michael constructed a non-cosmic space X such that X^{ω} is hereditarily Lindelöf. Then $C_p(X)$ is non-cosmic (Theorem I.1.3 in [1]) and it is hereditarily separable (Theorem 2 in [19]).

Clear that any countable space is a γ -space. Then, by Theorem 2.4, we have that $C_p(X)$ is a hereditarily σ -separable (hereditarily *F*-separable) space for any countable space *X*.

Example 3.6. There is a hereditarily σ -separable (hereditarily *F*-separable) space $C_p(X)$ such that it is not first countable.

It is enough to consider any uncountable separable metric γ -space.

4. Open questions

Question 4.1. Suppose that $C_p(X)$ is a hereditarily separable space. Is it true that $C_p(X)$ is hereditarily sequentially separable?

Question 4.2. Suppose that $C_p(X)$ is a hereditarily sequentially separable space. Is it true that $C_p(X)$ is cosmic?

Question 4.3. Suppose that $C_p(X)$ is a sequentially separable space. Is it true that $C_p(X)$ is *F*-separable?

Question 4.4. Suppose that $C_p(X)$ is a *F*-separable space. Is it true that $C_p(X)$ is Fréchet–Urysohn?

Note that the space $C_p(\mathbb{S})$ is sequentially separable space, but is not strongly sequentially separable (Example 3.2). Thus, $C_p(\mathbb{S})$ answers either Question 4.3 or Question 4.4.

Question 4.5. Is there an example of a separable Fréchet–Urysohn space $C_p(X)$ that is not hereditarily *F*-separable (Fréchet–Urysohn and hereditarily separable)?

By Proposition 2.7, this example depends on a model of set theory.

The next question is a weakening of Question 4.1, but nevertheless has independent interest.

Question 4.6. Suppose that $C_p(X)$ is a hereditarily separable space. Is it true that $C_p(X)$ is sequentially separable?

Thus we have the following the relationships between studied classes of C_p -spaces, counterexamples and open questions (Diagram 2).



Diagram 2.

References

- A.V. Archangel'skii, Topological function spaces. Math. its Appl., vol. 78, Dordrecht: Kluwer, 1992, 205 p. ISBN: 0-7923-1531-6. Original Russian text published in Arkhangel'skii A.V. *Topologicheskie prostranstva funktsii*, Moscow: MGU Publ., 1989, 222 p.
- [2] R. Engelking, General Topology, Revised and completed edition, Heldermann Verlag Berlin (1989).
- [3] P. Gartside, J. Lo, A. Marsh, Sequential density, Topology and its Applications 130 (2003), 75–86.
- [4] J. Gerlits, Zs. Nagy, Some Properties of C(X), I, Topology and its Applications 14 (1982), 151–161.
- [5] W. Just, A.W. Miller, M. Scheepers and P.J. Szeptycki, The combinatorics of open covers (II), Topol. Appl., 73 (1996) 241–266.
- [6] Lj.D.R. Kočinac, Selection principles and continuous images, Cubo Math. J., 8:2 (2006) 23–31.
- [7] E. A. Michael, Paracompactness and the Lindelöf property in finite and countable Cartesian products, Comput. Math. 23 (1971), 199–214.
- [8] N. Noble, The density character of function spaces, Proc. Am. Math. Soc.,42, No. 1, (1974) 228–233.
- [9] A.V. Osipov, Projective versions of the properties in the Scheepers Diagram, Topology and its Applications, 278 (2020), 107232.
- [10] A. V. Osipov, P. Szewczak, B. Tsaban, Strongly sequentially separable function spaces, via selection principles, Topology and its Applications, 270 (2020), 106942.
- [11] A. V. Osipov, The Separability and Sequential Separability of the Space C(X), Math. Notes, 104:1 (2018), 86–95.
- [12] A. V. Osipov, On selective sequential separability of function spaces with the compact-open topology, Hacettepe Journal of mathematics and statistics, 48:6 (2019), 1761–1766.

- [13] A. V. Osipov, On the different kinds of separability of the space of Borel functions, Open Mathematics, 16 (2018), 740–746.
- [14] A. V. Osipov, S. Özçağ, Variations of selective separability and tightness in function spaces with set-open topologies, Topology and its Applications, 217 (2017), 38–50.
- [15] A. V. Osipov, E. G. Pytkeev, On sequential separability of functional spaces, Topology and its Applications, 221 (2017), 270–274.
- [16] A. V. Osipov, On separability of the functional space with the openpoint and bi-point-open topologies, Acta Mathematica Hungarica, 150:1 (2016), 167–175.
- [17] N.V. Velichko, Notions close to separability, Proceedings of the Steklov Institute of Mathematics, suppl. 1, 2004, 30–35.
- [18] N.V. Velichko, On sequential separability, Mathematical Notes, 78:5, (2005), 610–614.
- [19] N. V. Velichko, Weak topology of spaces of continuous functions, Mat. Zametki, 30:5 (1981), 703–712 (in Russian); Math. Notes, 30:5 (1981), 849–854.