

# The Modular Isomorphism Problem – the alternative perspective on counterexamples \*

Czesław Bagiński      Kamil Zabielski

Faculty of Computer Science  
Białystok University of Technology  
Wiejska 45A Białystok, 15-351 Poland

## Abstract

As a result of impressive research [GLMdR22], D. García-Lucas, Á. del Río and L. Margolis defined an infinite series of non-isomorphic 2-groups  $G$  and  $H$ , whose group algebras  $\mathbb{F}G$  and  $\mathbb{F}H$  over the field  $\mathbb{F} = \mathbb{F}_2$  are isomorphic, solving negatively the long-standing Modular Isomorphism Problem (MIP). In this note we give a different perspective on their examples and show that they are special cases of a more general construction. We also show that this type of construction for  $p > 2$  does not provide a similar counterexample to the MIP.

Let  $p$  be a prime number,  $G$  and  $H$  finite  $p$ -groups and  $\mathbb{F}$  a field of characteristic  $p$ . The long-standing conjecture, due to R. Brauer called the Modular Isomorphism Problem (MIP), states that if  $\mathbb{F}G$  and  $\mathbb{F}H$  are isomorphic algebras then  $G$  and  $H$  are isomorphic groups. The problem is settled in the positive in many cases but recently for  $p = 2$  an infinite series of counterexamples was given ([GLMdR22]). In this paper we show that these counterexamples are special cases of a more general construction for  $p = 2$ . We show also that for  $p > 2$  the analogous construction does not provide a similar counterexample to the MIP. Therefore the case  $p > 2$  remains open.

For a survey of known results concerning the MIP see an excellent paper by L. Margolis [Mar22]. The terminology used in the paper is standard. Our research was supported by extensive use of GAP software ([GAP]).

We begin with easy folklore observations. Let  $K$  be a dihedral group of order  $2^{k+1}$ ,

$$K = \langle t, s \mid t^2 = s^2 = (ts)^{2^k} = 1 \rangle. \quad (1)$$

---

\*Mathematics Subject Classification: 16S34, 16U60, 20C05, 20D15.

Keywords: group rings, modular isomorphism problem, modular group algebra.

This work was supported by the Grant WZ/WI-IIT/2/2022 from the Białystok University of Technology and funded from the resources for research by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of Poland.

If we put  $r = ts$ , then this presentation can be replaced by the following one

$$K = \langle t, r \mid t^2 = r^{2^k} = 1, r^t = r^{-1} \rangle. \quad (2)$$

Let  $C = \langle c \mid c^{2^n} = 1 \rangle$ ,  $D = \langle d \mid d^{2^m} = 1 \rangle$ , where  $n > m \geq k \geq 3$ . In the group

$$P = K \times C \times D,$$

we define three elements  $x = tc$ ,  $y = sd$ ,  $z = tsd = rd$  and two subgroups

$$G = \langle x, y \rangle, \quad H = \langle x, z \rangle.$$

**Lemma 1.** *The following properties are satisfied:*

- (i)  $|G| = |H| = 2^{n+m+k-1}$ ;
- (ii)  $G' = H' = P' = K' = \langle (ts)^2 \rangle$  and the nilpotency class of groups  $G, H, P, K$  is equal to  $k$ ;
- (iii)  $\Phi(G) = \Phi(H) = \Phi(P) = \langle (ts)^2, c^2, d^2 \rangle$ ;
- (iv) The subgroup  $M = \langle ts, c, d \rangle$  is abelian and maximal in  $P$ ;
- (v) The subgroup  $G \cap M = \langle xy, c^2, d^2 \rangle$  is maximal in  $G$ ;
- (vi) The subgroup  $H \cap M = \langle z, c^2, d^2 \rangle$  is maximal in  $H$ ;
- (vii) The groups  $G$  and  $H$  are not isomorphic.

*Proof.* (i) The projection of  $P$  onto  $K$  restricted to  $G$  maps  $G$  onto  $K$ . The kernel of this restricted projection is equal to  $G \cap (C \times D) = \langle c^2, d^2 \rangle = \langle x^2, y^2 \rangle$ . Therefore  $|G| = |K| \cdot |\langle c^2, d^2 \rangle| = 2^{n+m+k-1}$ . The same projection restricted to  $H$  is also a map of  $H$  onto  $K$  with the kernel  $H \cap (C \times D) = \langle c^2, d^2 \rangle = \langle x^2, (x^{-1}z)^2 \rangle$ , because  $(x^{-1}z)^2 = (c^{-1}t^{-1}tsd)^2 = c^{-2}d^2$ . Thus also  $|H| = 2^{n+m+k-1}$ .

(ii) The commutator subgroup  $K'$  of  $K$  is cyclic and generated by

$$[t, s] = t^{-1}s^{-1}ts = (ts)^2 = r^2 = [t, r].$$

But  $[t, s] = [x, y]$  and  $[t, r] = [x, z]$ , so  $K' = G' = H'$ . It is also obvious by construction of  $P$ , that  $K' = P'$ . It follows analogously that the next terms of the lower central series of these groups are equal. More precisely,  $\gamma_i(X) = (ts)^{2^{i-1}}$  for  $i \geq 2$  and  $X \in \{G, H, P, K\}$ .

(iii) It is clear that  $\Phi(P) = \Phi(K) \Phi(C) \Phi(D) = \langle (ts)^2, c^2, d^2 \rangle$ . Further  $[x, y] = [tc, sd] = [t, s] = (ts)^2$ ,  $x^2 = (tc)^2 = c^2$ ,  $y^2 = (sd)^2 = d^2$ , hence  $\Phi(G) = \Phi(P)$ . As  $[x, z] = [tc, tsd] = [t, ts] = t(st)t(ts) = (ts)^2$ ,  $x^2 = c^2$ ,  $z^2 = (tsc)^2 = (ts)^2 c^2$ , we have  $\Phi(H) = \Phi(P)$ .

(iv-vi)  $M$  is abelian, because  $c$  and  $d$  are central in  $P$ . Moreover  $|M| = o(ts) \cdot o(c) \cdot o(d) = 2^{k+m+n}$ , which means that  $|P : M| = 2$ . The maximality of  $G \cap M$  in  $G$  and  $H \cap M$  in  $H$  is obvious as  $M$  is abelian.

(vii) By the assumption  $n > m \geq k$ , the order of  $xy$  is equal to  $2^n$ , as  $(xy)^2 = (tcsd)^2 = (ts)^2 c^2 d^2$ . This is maximal order of generators of  $G \cap M$ , therefore  $\exp(G \cap M) = 2^n$ . Similarly, the element  $z$  has order  $2^m$ , so  $c^2$  has maximal order among generators of  $H \cap M$

and then  $\exp(H \cap M) = 2^{n-1}$ . It is well-known that if a non-abelian  $p$ -group  $X$  has two different abelian subgroups of index  $p$ , then  $\Phi(X)$  is in the center of  $X$ , in particular  $X$  is of class of 2. Since  $G$  and  $H$  have nilpotency class  $k \geq 3$  the subgroups  $G \cap M$  and  $H \cap M$  are the unique abelian subgroups of index 2 in  $G$  and  $H$  respectively. Now groups  $G \cap M$  and  $H \cap M$  have different exponents, therefore they are not isomorphic. Hence  $G$  and  $H$  are not isomorphic as well.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.** *The groups  $G$  and  $H$  can be described in terms of generators and relations in the following way:*

$$\begin{aligned} G &= \langle x, y, u \mid x^{2^n} = y^{2^m} = u^{2^{k-1}} = 1, y^x = yu, u^x = u^{-1}, u^y = u^{-1} \rangle; \\ H &= \langle x, z, u \mid x^{2^n} = z^{2^m} = u^{2^{k-1}} = 1, z^x = zu, u^x = u^{-1}, u^z = u \rangle. \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

*Proof.* The correspondence  $x \rightarrow tc, y \rightarrow sd$  can be extended to a homomorphism of  $G$  described by (3) into  $P$  because  $tc$  and  $sd$  satisfy the relations (3) for  $G$ . Since  $\langle tc, sd \rangle$  generate a subgroup of order  $2^{k+m+n-1}$  this homomorphism is an embedding. One can use a similar argument for the group  $H$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $A$  be a 2-group generated by elements  $a$  and  $b$  of order  $2^n$  and  $2^m$  respectively such that  $a^2$  and  $b^2$  are central in  $A$ ,  $|A'| = 2^{k-1}$  and  $\langle a^2, b^2 \rangle \cap A' = 1$ . Then  $A$  is isomorphic to  $G$ .*

*Proof.* Note that  $A/\langle a^2, b^2 \rangle$  as a group generated by two elements of order 2 is dihedral of order  $2^{k+1}$ . Since  $x^2 = c^2, y^2 = d^2$  are central in  $G$ ,  $|G'| = 2^{k-1}$  and  $\langle x^2, y^2 \rangle \cap G' = 1$ . Therefore the correspondence  $a \rightarrow x, b \rightarrow y$  extends in a natural way to an isomorphism of  $A$  onto  $G$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 4.** *In the group algebra  $\mathbb{F}H$  let  $\beta = 1 + x(1 + z)$ . Then*

- (i)  $\beta$  has order  $2^k$  in the group of units of  $\mathbb{F}H$  and  $\beta^2$  is a central element of  $\mathbb{F}H$ ;
- (ii) the subgroup  $\langle x, \beta \rangle$  is isomorphic to  $G$  and spans  $\mathbb{F}H$ .

*Proof.* (i) Note first that

$$\begin{aligned} \beta^2 &= (1 + x(1 + z))^2 = 1 + x(1 + z)x(1 + z) = 1 + x^2(1 + z^x)(1 + z) = \\ &= 1 + x^2(1 + (z + z^x) + (z^x z)). \end{aligned}$$

Further  $z + z^x = tsd + tsd^{tc} = tsd + ts^t d = td(s + s^t) = tsd(1 + (st)^2) = z(1 + [z, t])$  and  $z^x z = (tsd)^{tc}(tsd) = (ts^t d)(tsd) = d^2 = z^2$ , so

$$\beta^{2^{m-1}} = 1 + x^{2^{m-1}}(1 + z^{2^{m-2}}(1 + (st)^{2^{m-1}}) + z^{2^{m-1}}) \neq 1$$

and

$$\beta^{2^m} = 1 + x^{2^m}(1 + z^{2^{m-1}}(1 + (st)^{2^m}) + z^{2^m}) = 1,$$

because  $(st)^{2^m} = z^{2^m} = 1$ . We have also  $(\beta^2)^x = 1 + x^2(1 + (z^x + z) + z^x z) = \beta^2$ , because  $z^x z = z z^x = d^2$ .

- (ii) Consider the group  $\tilde{G} = \langle x, \beta \rangle$ . Since  $x^2, \beta^2 \in \mathcal{Z}(\mathbb{F}H)$  the factor group  $\tilde{G}/\langle x^2, \beta^2 \rangle$  is a dihedral group. The commutator subgroup of  $\tilde{G}$ , generated by the element

$$\begin{aligned} [\beta, x] &= 1 + \beta^{-1}x^{-1}(\beta x + x\beta) = 1 + \beta^{-1}(\beta^x + \beta) \\ &= 1 + \beta^{-1}x(z^x + z) = 1 + \beta^{-1}xz([z, x] + 1) = 1 + \beta^{-1}xz((ts)^2 + 1), \end{aligned}$$

has order  $2^{k-1}$  and has trivial intersection with  $\langle x^2, \beta^2 \rangle$ .

It follows from Lemma 3 that  $\tilde{G}$  is isomorphic to  $G$ .

At the very end, we observe that  $x$  and  $\beta = 1 + x(1 + z) = z + (x + 1)(z + 1)$  are linearly independent modulo  $A^2(\mathbb{F}H)$ , where  $A(\mathbb{F}H)$  is the augmentation ideal of  $\mathbb{F}H$ . Therefore by Jennings theory [Pas78, Chapter 3.3] both generate the whole algebra  $\mathbb{F}H$ .  $\square$

As an immediate consequence of the lemmas we obtain the following

**Theorem 5.** *For every  $m, n, k, n > m \geq k \geq 3$  there exist non-isomorphic 2-groups  $G$  and  $H$  of order  $2^{m+n+k-1}$  and cyclic commutator subgroup of order  $2^{k-1}$  whose group algebras over the 2-element field are isomorphic.*

**Remark 6.** (i) There are many elements in  $\mathbb{F}H$  that, together with the element  $x$ , generate a group isomorphic to  $G$  spanning  $\mathbb{F}H$ . For instance, if  $\zeta$  is a central unit of  $\mathbb{F}H$  of order  $< 2^m$ ,  $\tilde{x}$  is an element of  $H$  such that  $z^{\tilde{x}} \neq z$ , then  $\tilde{\beta} = \zeta + \tilde{x}(1 + z)$  is such an element.

(ii) If we put  $k = 3$ , we get the examples from [GLMdR22] with  $\beta = d^2 + zx[z, x](1 + z)$ .

(iii) If, in the above construction, we replace the dihedral group  $K$  with the semidihedral or the generalized quaternion group of order  $2^{k+1}$ , we get the same groups (up to isomorphism) as the groups  $G$  and  $H$ .

It follows from Lemma 1, that in the counterexample the abelian subgroups of index 2 in  $G$  and  $H$  are not isomorphic. Let us consider analogous construction as in the counterexample taking  $p > 2$ . As a basis of the construction take a  $p$ -group  $K = \langle s, s_1 \rangle$  of maximal class (similarly as in the case  $p = 2$ ) having an abelian subgroup of index  $p$  (all they are described; see for instance [Bla58, Section 4 and Theorem 4.3]). Then in the group  $K \times \langle c \mid c^{p^m} = 1 \rangle \times \langle d \mid d^{p^n} = 1 \rangle$ , where  $m, n \in \mathbb{N}$  are arbitrarily fixed, take a subgroup  $G = \langle sc, s_1d \rangle$ . In this group, the subgroup  $N = C_G(G'/\Phi(G'))$  is abelian and has index  $p$  in  $G$ .

The following lemma is a consequence of Proposition 1.4 [BC88] and Lemma 1 [CB88].

**Lemma 7.** *If the subgroup  $N$  of  $G$  defined by equation  $N = C_G(G'/\Phi(G'))$  has index  $p$  in  $G$ , then the subring  $I(N) + I(G')\mathbb{F}G$  is determined by the structure of  $\mathbb{F}G$ . In particular the ideal  $I(N)\mathbb{F}G$  of  $\mathbb{F}G$  and the orders of factors  $\mathcal{M}_i(N)/\mathcal{M}_{i+1}(N)$  of the Brauer-Jennings-Zassenhaus series of  $N$  are determined.*

**Proposition 8.** *Let  $G$  be a finite 2-generated  $p$ -group in which the subgroup*

$$N = C_G(G'/\Phi(G'))$$

*is abelian and has index  $p$  then  $N$  is determined by  $\mathbb{F}G$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $H$  be a  $p$ -group such that  $\mathbb{F}G \cong \mathbb{F}H$ , then  $H$  is also 2-generated and contains a subgroup  $M = C_H(H'/\Phi(H'))$  of index  $p$ . Suppose first that  $M$  is abelian. It is well-known, see the proof of [Pas78, Lemma 14.2.7], that the series  $\{|\mathcal{M}_i(M)/\mathcal{M}_{i+1}(M)|, i \geq 1\}$  determines the isomorphism class of  $M$ . Since  $|\mathcal{M}_i(M)/\mathcal{M}_{i+1}(M)| = |\mathcal{M}_i(N)/\mathcal{M}_{i+1}(N)|$ ,  $i \geq 1$ , by Lemma 7, we obtain  $M \cong N$ . Therefore to complete the proof we need to show that  $M$  is abelian.

It is true, if we assume additionally that  $G$  is a  $p$ -group of maximal class, by [BC88, Theorem 3.2]. We employ the proof of this theorem in the context of our case.

The set  $\Phi(N) - Z(N)$  consists of all elements  $g \in G$  that are the  $p$ -th powers of the non-central elements of  $G$ . Since  $N$  is abelian and  $|G : N| = p$ , the  $G$ -class sums  $\widehat{C}_g$  of these elements are the only  $p$ -th powers of other  $G$ -class sums in  $\mathbb{F}G$ . It follows from [MaC81] that the number of such class sums is determined by  $\mathbb{F}G$ , so the number of  $H$ -class sums  $\widehat{C}_h$ ,  $h \in H$ , which are  $p$ -th powers is the same in  $\mathbb{F}H$ . Since  $N/\Phi(G') \cong M/\Phi(H')$  this property have exactly the class sums  $\widehat{C}_h$ , if  $h \in \Phi(M) - Z(H)$ . The number of  $G$ -class sums which are  $p$ -th powers is as large as possible, because all they have cardinality  $p$ . Therefore all  $H$ -class sums of noncentral elements of  $\Phi(M)$  have cardinality  $p$ , because  $|\Phi(N) - Z(G)| = |\Phi(M) - Z(H)|$ .

Let  $H = \langle h, y \rangle$ , where  $y \in M$ . If  $\Phi(H) = 1$ , then  $M$  is abelian, so assume that  $\Phi(M) \neq 1$ . Now it is clear that  $y^p \notin \Phi(H')$ , which implies that  $y^p$  is not central, because  $|H' \cap Z(H)| = p$  and then  $H' \cap Z(H) \leq \Phi(H')$ . Thus  $\widehat{C}_{y^p} = \widehat{C}_y^p$  and then  $|H : C_H(y)| = |H : C_H(y^p)| = p$ , by [Seh67]. Therefore  $C_H(y) = M$ , or equivalently  $y \in Z(M)$ . Now,  $M$  is generated by  $Z(H)$  and all conjugates of  $y$ , which are also contained in  $Z(M)$ . Hence  $M$  is abelian. This ends the proof. □

In the counterexample the subgroup  $C_G(G'/\Phi(G')) = G$  hence Proposition 8 can not be applied for  $p = 2$ . Simultaneously, Proposition 8 shows that there are no similar counterexamples for odd primes.

## References

- [BC88] C. Bagiński and A. Caranti, *The Modular Group Algebras of  $p$ -Groups of Maximal Class*, Can. J. Math. **40** (1988), no. 6, 1422–1435.
- [CB88] C. Bagiński, *The isomorphism question for modular group algebras of metacyclic  $p$ -groups*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **104** (1988), no. 1, 39–42.
- [Bla58] N. Blackburn, *On a special class of  $p$ -groups*, Acta Mathematica **100** (1958), no. 1–2, 45–92.
- [GLMdR22] D. García-Lucas, L. Margolis, and A. del Río, *Non-isomorphic 2-groups with isomorphic modular group algebras*, J. Reine Angew. Math. **2022** (2022), no. 783, 269–274.
- [Seh67] S. K. Sehgal, *On the isomorphism of group algebras*, Math. Z. **95** (1967), no. 1, 71–75.

- [MaC81] M. M. Parmenter and C. Polcino Milies, *A note on isomorphic group rings*, Bol. Soc. Bras. Mat. **12** (1981), no. 2, 57–59.
- [Pas78] D. S. Passman, *The algebraic structure of group rings*, Pure & Applied Mathematics, John Wiley & Sons, Nashville, TN, 1978.
- [Mar22] L. Margolis, *The Modular Isomorphism Problem: A Survey*, Jahresber. Dtsch. Math.-Ver. **124** (2022), no. 3, 157–196.
- [GAP] The GAP Group, *GAP – Groups, Algorithms, and Programming, Version 4.12.2*; 2022, <https://www.gap-system.org>.