Does light slowdown in dielectric media?

Vernon Cooray¹, Gerald Cooray², Farhad Rachidi^{3,} Marcos Rubinstein⁴

¹Department of Electrical Engineering, Uppsala University, 752 37 Uppsala, Sweden.

2 Karolinska Institute, Stockholm, Sweden

3 Electromagnetic Compatibility Laboratory, Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (EPFL), 1015 Lausanne, Switzerland

4 HEIG-VD, University of Applied Sciences and Arts Western Switzerland, 1401 Yverdon-les-Bains, Switzerland

Abstract:

Observations and theoretical principles indicate that electromagnetic waves, including light, propagate in dielectric media at speeds lower than those in free space, as eloquently expressed in Maxwell's equations featuring material-dependent permittivity and permeability. This study reveals that the observed slower propagation of waves in dielectric media arises from an interference between two types of waves: a forward-moving primary wave and a set of secondary waves induced by the primary wave's interaction with the medium. The forward-moving primary wave and secondary waves travel at the speed of light in vacuum. Notably, the reflected wave caused by the impedance discontinuity on the boundary of a dielectric medium is manifested by the induced secondary waves moving in the opposite direction to the primary wave. From a photonic point of view, photons will be moving back and forth below the slowly moving apparent front of the observed wave with the speed of light in vacuum. Ahead of this front the probability of finding photons is zero due to complete destructive interference of the waves in that region. From a photonic perspective, beneath the gradually advancing facade of the observed wave, photons move at the unyielding speed of light in vacuum. The likelihood of detecting photons ahead of the front diminishes to zero, a consequence of the thorough destructive interference manifesting within that specific region.

1. Introduction

Maxwell's equations predict that the speed of electromagnetic wave propagation in dielectric media is slower than the speed of light in vacuum. This speed is determined by the expression $v = 1/\sqrt{\mu_o \varepsilon_o \varepsilon_r}$, where ε_r is the relative dielectric constant of the medium [1]. The relative dielectric constant relies on the intricate interaction of microscopic electromagnetic fields within the medium. Additionally, the macroscopic Maxwell's Equations have been formulated through statistical physical principles based on microscopic fields, as discussed in [2]. Our investigation delves into the propagation of electromagnetic radiation fields in a dielectric medium, demonstrating that the interaction among multiple planar waves produces a resultant wave traveling at an apparent speed less than that of light. A different yet somewhat related matter involves the momentum of electromagnetic waves within dielectric media. Ongoing discussions within the pertinent literature surround this issue, and the current study may offer insights that could present an alternative perspective on this intricate problem [3, 4, 5].

An analogous problem arises in estimating the propagation of currents within the lightning channel when modelled as an ideal transmission line, assuming electromagnetic waves and electric currents travel at the speed of light in vacuum [6]. However, observations reveal that the actual speed of current propagation in lightning flashes is slower than the speed of light in vacuum. In two publications, Cooray [7] and Cooray and Diendorfer [8] have demonstrated that by treating the lightning channel as an ideal transmission line, the speed of current propagation can be estimated through the interaction of two current waveforms, both advancing at the speed of light. Yet, these interacting waves result in a wave front that propagates at an apparent speed less than the speed of light in vacuum. Drawing inspiration from this concept, we extend a similar approach to estimate the propagation speed of electromagnetic waves or light in dielectric media.

In examining this issue, we have envisioned a specific physical scenario: an electromagnetic wave propagating in vacuum is incident on a semi-infinite and non-dispersive dielectric medium, advancing perpendicularly to the boundary. This wave persists, maintaining the speed of light in vacuum as it traverses the dielectric medium—a wave we designate as the primary wave. Upon entry into the medium, the electric field of this primary wave interacts with the dielectric, giving rise to secondary waves. These secondary waves propagate both forward and backward with respect to the primary wave's direction. The wave front, observable as the resultant wave, comprising the primary and secondary waves, each moving at the speed of light in vacuum, manifests a speed less than that of light, as we will demonstrate. This observed wave is measurable within the dielectric medium. It's important to note that secondary waves generated at a given point contribute to the creation of additional secondary waves at other points in the medium.

The advancing secondary wave, formed by the superposition of all elementary forward-moving secondary waves within the dielectric medium, effectively cancels out the primary wave in all points situated ahead of the observed wave front. Consequently, the wave amplitude preceding the observed wave front is nullified, despite the coexistence of both the forward-moving secondary wave and the primary wave in locations ahead of the wave front. Thus, the total electromagnetic wave or the observed wave at any given point, say $E_{obs}(z, t)$, consists of three waves, namely, (i) the primary wave, (ii) the forward-moving secondary wave, and (iii) the backward-moving secondary wave. This can be written as

$$
E_{obs}(z,t) = E_{prim}(z,t) + E_{sf}(z,t) + E_{sb}(z,t)
$$
 (1)

In the above equation, $E_{prim}(z,t)$ denotes the primary wave, $E_{sf}(z,t)$ denotes the forward-moving secondary wave and $E_{sb}(z,t)$ denotes the backward-moving secondary wave.

This paper aims to derive an expression for the source fields of secondary waves generated within a thin sheet of dielectric material positioned parallel to the vacuum-dielectric boundary. Initially, it is crucial to note that the electric field acting upon this sheet comprises both the primary wave and additional secondary waves generated at various layers within the medium. To clarify, the observed wave at any given layer is the cumulative effect of the primary wave and the sum of all secondary waves generated across other layers. Therefore, when determining the secondary waves generated at a specific layer of the material, it is imperative to consider the influence of the observed wave.

2. The source fields of the secondary waves

 As mentioned earlier, the observed wave consists of the sum of three waves: the primary wave, the forward-moving secondary wave, and the backward-moving secondary wave. Let us represent the observed wave without the contribution from the backward-moving secondary wave by

$$
E_{obs-sb}(z,t) = E_0 \sin[\omega(t - z/v)] \tag{2}
$$

In formulating the above equation, we made the assumption that the boundary of the medium is located at $z = 0$ and the wave propagates with an apparent speed v along the positive z-direction. For the sake of generality, we can consider the wave to be linearly polarized in any direction perpendicular to the zaxis. Any other polarization can be addressed by treating it as a combination of two linearly polarized waves, allowing for separate analysis to determine the secondary waves.

Our objective is to derive an expression for the source amplitude of the forward-moving secondary waves generated during the interaction of E_{obs-sb} with a layer of the dielectric material.

A schematic diagram of the physical scenario occurring at any given time t_i is shown in Figure 1. Observe that the dielectric medium is semi-infinite and the waves moving through it are plane waves that extend throughout the dielectric medium. At time t , the wave defined by Equation 2 has propagated a distance vt through the dielectric medium where v is the observed speed of electromagnetic wave inside the medium. Consider a layer of dielectric material of thickness dz located at a distance z from the point of incidence of the beam into the dielectric medium. Due to the interaction of the wave with the dielectric medium, the element dz acts as a source of secondary waves. The contribution to the forward-moving secondary wave from the layer of thickness dz is given by

Figure 1: Geometry pertinent to the estimation of the source fields of the secondary waves.

$$
dE_{sf}(z,t) = E_{obs-sb}(z + dz,t) - E_{obs-sb}(z,t - dz/c)
$$
 (3)

Using the Taylor's expansion of the last term in (3) , the above equation for infinitesimal dz can be rewritten as

$$
dE_{sf}(z,t) = \left[\frac{E_{obs-sb}(z+dz,t) - E_{obs-sb}(z,t)}{dz} + \frac{1}{c} \frac{\partial E_{obs}(z,t)}{\partial t}\right] dz \tag{4}
$$

From the relationship given in Equation 4, the equation that governs the secondary field generated by the observed wave in the layer of thickness dz at location z can be written as

$$
dE_{sf}(z,t) = \left\{ \frac{\partial E_{obs-sb}(z,t)}{\partial z} + \frac{1}{c} \frac{\partial E_{obs-sb}(z,t)}{\partial t} \right\} dz
$$
 (5)

The expression given by Equation (5) can be employed to assess the contribution to the forward-moving secondary waves originating from any thin layer within the dielectric medium, arising from the interaction with the observed wave. It is crucial to emphasize that Equation (5) is not limited to sinusoidal variations, as illustrated in Equation (2). Instead, it offers a versatile tool for estimating the magnitude of secondary waves associated with observed waves exhibiting diverse time variations. This flexibility underscores the applicability of the formula across a broad range of electromagnetic wave scenarios.

Using Equation (5), the contribution to the forward-moving secondary wave from the layer of thickness dz located at a distance z from the origin can be obtained and the result is

$$
dE_{sf}(z,t) = -E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \phi(z)\right) dz \quad (6)
$$

In Equation (6) the phase difference $\phi(z)$ is equal to z/v .

Since the contribution to the secondary waves from the layer of thickness dz is the same for both forward and backward-moving secondary waves, the contribution to the backward-moving secondary wave from the same dielectric layer can also be written directly as

$$
dE_{sb}(z,t) = -E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \phi(z)\right) dz \tag{7}
$$

This is the case because once excited by the electric field, the thin sheet of dielectric behaves as a radiating current sheet. A radiating current sheet will radiate with equal intensity in both perpendicular directions (i.e. in the direction of $+z$ and $-z$).

Now the net forward-moving secondary wave and the net backward-moving secondary wave at any point can be obtained by summing the contribution to these waves by different layers of the dielectric material. In the next subsections we will derive the expression for the net forward- and backwardmoving secondary waves.

3.1 The forward and backward-moving secondary waves

 Let us first examine the forward-moving secondary wave. Consider the events taking place at time t . The situation at this time is illustrated in Figure 2. The primary wave has propagated a distance ct across the medium and the secondary wave has also travelled the same distance. The observed wave has travelled a distance v_t . First, we will estimate the amplitude of the forward-moving secondary wave at a point \bar{z} where $\bar{z} > vt$. The forward-moving secondary wave at this point is generated by the sum of all elementary forward-moving secondary waves generated along the path of the electromagnetic wave. Consider a dielectric layer of thickness $d\xi$ located at a distance ξ from the boundary of the dielectric medium. The contribution to the forward-moving secondary wave at z produced by this element is

$$
dE_{sf}(\xi, t) = -E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \xi / v - \frac{(z - \xi)}{c}\right) d\xi \quad (10)
$$

The total contribution of all elementary layers to the electric field at \bar{z} is given by

$$
E_{sf}(z,t) = -\int_0^{z_{\text{max}}} E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \xi / v - \frac{(z - \xi)}{c}\right) d\xi \quad (11)
$$

In the above integral z_{max} is the limiting value of ζ that can make a contribution to the secondary wave at z. Note that at time t , elements located above z_{max} do not have enough time for their effect to be felt at height z . The value of z_{max} is given by

Figure 2: Geometry pertinent to the evaluation of the forward-moving secondary wave at any location.

 $z_{\text{max}} = (t - z/c)/(1/v - 1/c)$ (12)

After performing the integral, we obtain

$$
E_{sf}(z,t) = -E_0 \sin \omega (t - z/c) \quad z \ge vt \quad (13)
$$

This is the forward-moving secondary wave at any location beyond the front of the observed wave. Now we will estimate the nature of the secondary wave below the front of the observed wave. To that aim, the integral has to be changed as follows

$$
E_{sf}(z,t) = -\int_0^z E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \xi / v - \frac{(z - \xi)}{c}\right) d\xi \qquad z < vt \quad (14)
$$

The solution of which is

$$
E_{sf}(z,t) = -E_0 \left[\sin \omega (t - z/c) - \sin \omega (t - z/v) \right] \qquad z < vt \qquad (15)
$$

In the preceding analysis, a straightforward sinusoidal wave was employed to elucidate the procedure. Nevertheless, it is essential to note that the same methodology can be applied to calculate the secondary waves associated with any electromagnetic wave featuring alternative time dependencies. The versatility of this approach extends beyond a specific waveform, allowing for a comprehensive understanding of secondary wave generation in various electromagnetic scenarios.

Now, let us derive an expression for the backward-moving secondary wave. As before, consider the events taking place at time t . The situation at this time is illustrated in Figure 3. The primary wave has propagated a distance ct across the medium and the forward-moving secondary wave has also travelled the same distance. The observed wave has travelled a distance v_t . The point where we would like to estimate the amplitude of the backward-moving secondary wave is z . The backward-moving secondary wave at this point is generated by the sum of all elementary secondary waves generated at all points located beyond the point z. Consider an element $d\xi$ located at height ξ . The contribution to the backward-moving secondary wave at z produced by this element is

$$
dE_{sb}(\xi,t) = -\omega E_0 \left(\frac{1}{\nu} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \xi / \nu - \frac{(\xi - z)}{c}\right) d\xi \quad (17)
$$

Figure 3: Geometry pertinent to the evaluation of the backward-moving secondary wave at any location. The total contribution at z is given by

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\int_{z}^{z_{\text{max}}} E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right) \cos \omega \left(t - \xi / v - \frac{(\xi - z)}{c}\right) d\xi \quad (18)
$$

It is important to note that any dielectric layer situated above z_{max} does not play a role in generating the backward-moving secondary wave at z . The value of z_{max} is given by

$$
z_{\text{max}} = (t + z/c)/(1/v + 1/c))
$$
 (19)

After performing the integral, we obtain

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\frac{\left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right)}{\left(\frac{1}{v} + \frac{1}{c}\right)} E_0 \sin \omega (t - z/v) \tag{20}
$$

Note that this equation mimics a wave moving in the forward direction. However, it consists of a multitude of secondary waves all moving in a backward direction with the speed of light in vacuum. However, observe that these waves are initiated at the front of the observed wave which is moving with the speed ν .

4. The primary wave

Since the forward-moving secondary wave interferes destructively with the primary wave at all points beyond the front of the observed wave, the primary wave is given by

$$
E_{prim}(z,t) = E_0 \sin \omega(t - z/c)
$$
 (16)

Observe that the presence of a backward-moving secondary wave does not contribute to the total wave ahead of the observed wave and for this reason the above result is independent of the presence or the absence of the backward-moving secondary wave.

6. The reflected wave

Let us consider the nature of the backward-moving secondary wave at locations below the boundary, i.e., $z < 0$. Consider any arbitrary point z where $z < 0$, The backward-moving wave at this location is given by

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\int_{0}^{z_{\text{max}}} E_0 \omega \left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c} \right) \cos \omega \left(t - \xi / v - \frac{(\xi - z)}{c} \right) d\xi \quad z < 0 \tag{21}
$$

The solution of which is

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\frac{\left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right)}{\left(\frac{1}{v} + \frac{1}{c}\right)} E_0 \sin \omega (t + z/c) \quad z < 0 \quad (22)
$$

This waveform signifies a wave emanating from the dielectric medium and advancing at the speed of light in vacuum in a direction opposite to that of the primary wave. As soon as the incident wave reaches the dielectric boundary, this wave emerges and extends beyond the dielectric medium. It can be recognized as the reflected wave induced by the impact of the primary wave at the dielectric medium's boundary. Therefore, the analytical framework presented here adeptly accommodates the reflected wave generated when the primary wave penetrates the medium. The reflected wave can be expressed as:

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\frac{(n-1)}{(n+1)} E_0 \sin \omega (t + z/c) \quad z < 0 \quad (23)
$$

In the above equation, n is the refractive index of the dielectric medium.

In the aforementioned analysis, a simple sinusoidal wave was employed to illustrate the concept of representing a slow-moving wave in a dielectric medium through the interaction of three waves propagating at the speed of light in vacuum. With this foundation, we are now poised to delineate the comprehensive structure of the electromagnetic wave as it propagates through the dielectric medium.

7. Discussion

The analysis presented herein reveals that the propagation of an electromagnetic wave or a light beam through a dielectric medium can be conceptualized as the interaction of three waves moving at the speed of light in vacuum. These waves include the incident or primary wave, along with two secondary waves generated through the interaction of the electromagnetic wave's electric field with the dielectric medium.

Among these secondary waves, one travels backward in relation to the incident wave, while the other travels in the same direction as the incident wave. The secondary wave moving backward corresponds to the reflected wave when the primary wave encounters the boundary of the dielectric medium. Importantly, the primary and forward-moving secondary waves exhibit mutual cancellation at all points beyond the front of the observed wave. In summary, the three wave components are as follows:

Figure 4: Different components of the electromagnetic waves inside and outside the dielectric medium at one particular moment in time. The shaded area represents the dielectric medium. In constructing this diagram, the frequency of the wave was taken to be 5×10^8 Hz and the relative dielectric constant was fixed at 3.

The primary or the incident wave is given by:

$$
E_{prim}(z,t) = E_0 \sin \omega(t - z/c) \quad (24)
$$

The forward-moving secondary wave is given by:

$$
E_{sf}(z,t) = -E_0 \sin \omega(t - z/c) \quad z > vt \quad (25)
$$

$$
E_{sf}(z,t) = -E_0 \left[\sin \omega(t - z/c) - \sin \omega(t - z/v) \right] \quad z \le vt \quad (26)
$$

The backward-moving secondary wave is given by:

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\frac{\left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right)}{\left(\frac{1}{v} + \frac{1}{c}\right)} E_0 \sin \omega (t - z/v) \quad 0 < z \le vt \quad (27)
$$

All these components are propagating with the speed of light in vacuum. It's noteworthy that while Equation 27 characterizes a wave in motion at a speed v , as elucidated by Equation 17, this wave comprises a composite of elementary backward-moving secondary waves, each propagating at the speed of light in vacuum. It's essential to recognize that these elementary waves originate at the forefront of the observed wave, which itself is advancing at a speed of v (see Equation 28 below).

The observed wave is given by

$$
E_{obs}(z,t) = E_0 \sin \omega(t - z/v) \left[1 - \frac{\left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right)}{\left(\frac{1}{v} + \frac{1}{c}\right)} \right] z \le vt \quad (28)
$$

The wave moving out from the dielectric medium or the reflected wave, which indeed is the backwardmoving secondary wave, is given by

$$
E_{sb}(z,t) = -\frac{\left(\frac{1}{v} - \frac{1}{c}\right)}{\left(\frac{1}{v} + \frac{1}{c}\right)} E_0 \sin \omega(t + z/c) \quad z \le 0 \quad (29)
$$

These field components are depicted pictorially in Figure 4. If the E-field is polarized along the x-axis, the component of the B-field directed along the y-axis can be obtained from $\frac{\partial B_y}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial E_x}{\partial t}$. These field components are in exact agreement with the predictions of classical electromagnetics. However, all the components of the wave are moving with the speed of light in vacuum. $\frac{\partial B_y}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial E_y}{\partial z}$

8. Conclusion

An electromagnetic wave traversing through a dielectric medium experience a reduced propagation speed compared to free space. Our analysis elucidates this reduction as a result of the interaction between two sets of electromagnetic waves: the incident (primary) wave and a series of secondary waves generated through the interaction of the wave's electric field with the dielectric. The interplay between these secondary and primary waves leads to the observed wave front propagating at a speed lower than that of light in free space.

The backward-moving segment of the secondary wave corresponds to the reflected wave, emerging from the impedance discontinuity at the boundary where the primary wave enters the dielectric medium. Our demonstration establishes that the secondary wave generated within a specific volume of the medium is proportional to the derivative of the electric field encountered by the medium.

From a photonic perspective, beneath the gradually advancing facade of the observed wave, photons move at the unyielding speed of light in vacuum. The likelihood of detecting photons ahead of the front diminishes to zero, a consequence of the thorough destructive interference manifesting within that specific region.

References:

[1] Jackson, J.D. Classical Electrodynamics, 3rd ed.; Wiley: Hoboken, NJ, USA, 1998.

[2] De Groot SR, Suttorp LG. Covariant derivation of the Maxwell equations: Multipole expansion of the polarization tensor to all orders. Physica. 1965 Dec 1;31(12):1713-27

[3] P. W. Milonni and R. W. Boyd, "Momentum of light in a dielectric medium," Adv. Opt. Photonics 2(4), 519–553 (2010). [CrossRef]

[4] S. M. Barnett and R. Loudon, "The enigma of optical momentum in a medium," Phil. Trans. R. Soc. A 368(1914), 927–939 (2010). [CrossRef]

[5] S. M. Barnett, "Resolution of the Abraham-Minkovski dilemma," Phys. Rev. Lett. 104(7), 070401 (2010). [CrossRef]

[6] Cooray, V., G. Cooray, F. Rachidi and M. Rubinstein, The Upper Bound of the Speed of Propagation of Waves along a Transmission Line, Progress In Electromagnetics Research M, Vol. 93, 119–125, 2020

[7] Cooray, V., A novel procedure to represent lightning strokes – current dissipation return stroke models, Trans. IEEE(EMC), vol. 51, pp. 748 – 755, 2009.

[8] Cooray, V. and G. Diendorfer, Merging of current generation and current dissipation lightning return stroke models, Electric Power Systems Research, Volume 153, 10-18, 2017.