

ON A MOD 3 PROPERTY OF ℓ -TUPLES OF PAIRWISE COMMUTING PERMUTATIONS

ABDELMALEK ABDESSELAM, BERNHARD HEIM, AND MARKUS NEUHAUSER

ABSTRACT. Let S_n denote the symmetric group of permutations acting on n elements. We investigate the double sequence $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ counting the number of ℓ tuples of elements of the symmetric group S_n , where the components commute, normalized by the order of S_n . Our focus lies on exploring log-concavity with respect to n :

$$N_\ell(n)^2 - N_\ell(n-1) N_\ell(n+1) \geq 0.$$

We establish that this depends on $n \pmod{3}$ for sufficiently large ℓ . These numbers are studied by Bryan and Fulman as the n th orbifold characteristics, generalizing work of Macdonald and Hirzebruch–Hofer concerning the ordinary and string-theoretic Euler characteristics of symmetric products. Notably, $N_2(n)$ represents the partition numbers $p(n)$, while $N_3(n)$ represents the number of non-equivalent n -sheeted coverings of a torus studied by Liskovets and Medynkh. The numbers also appear in algebra since $|S_n| N_\ell(n) = |\text{Hom}(\mathbb{Z}^\ell, S_n)|$.

2020 *Mathematics Subject Classification*. Primary 05A17, 11P82; Secondary 05A20.

Key words and phrases. Generating functions, log-concavity, partition numbers, symmetric group.

1. INTRODUCTION AND MAIN RESULTS

Let S_n denote the symmetric group on n elements. This paper delves into the log-concavity [Br15] of commuting ℓ -tuples of permutations in S_n . Let

$$C_{\ell,n} := \left\{ (\pi_1, \dots, \pi_\ell) \in S_n^\ell : \pi_j \pi_k = \pi_k \pi_j \text{ for } 1 \leq j, k \leq \ell \right\}.$$

Let $n \geq 20$. We establish that the normalized number of elements

$$N_\ell(n) := \frac{|C_{\ell,n}|}{|S_n|} \in \mathbb{N}$$

is log-concave with respect to n at n , for almost all ℓ (i. e. for all but finitely many), if and only if n is divisible by 3. This double sequence $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ emerges as the specialization of the ℓ th orbifold characteristic to the n th symmetric product of a manifold of ordinary Euler characteristic one, as demonstrated in the work of Bryan and Fulman [BF98]. Let $g_\ell(n)$ be the number of subgroups of \mathbb{Z}^ℓ of index n . Then:

Theorem 1.1 (Bryan and Fulman, Theorem 2.1). *For $\ell \in \mathbb{N}$, we have*

$$\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} P_n^{g_\ell}(x) t^n = \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} (1 - t^n)^{-x g_{\ell-1}(n)} = \exp \left(x \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} g_\ell(n) \frac{t^n}{n} \right),$$

where $P_n^{g_\ell}(x)$ is a polynomial of degree n with $P_n^{g_\ell}(1) = N_\ell(n)$.

We also refer to Abdesselam et al. ([ABDV23], p. 3) and White [Wh13].

In the instance where $\ell = 2$, we discover that the polynomials correspond to the D'Arcais polynomials [DA13], known in combinatorics as the (shifted) Nekrasov–Okounkov polynomials [NO06, Ha10]. Further, $P_n^{g_2}(1) = N_2(n) = p(n)$, where $p(n)$ denotes the number of partitions of n (see [An98, On04]). Additionally, $N_2(n)$ equals the number of conjugacy classes in S_n [ET68]. Moving forward, $\ell = 3$ gives a connection to topology (see the introduction of Britnell [Br13]) due to work of Liskovets and Medynkh [LM09]. It has been proven that $N_3(n)$ counts the number of non-equivalent n -sheeted coverings of a torus. Moreover, there is a direct connection to algebra and geometry highlighted by White [Wh13]. Obvious bijections exist between the elements of $C_{\ell,n}$ and $\text{Hom}(\mathbb{Z}^\ell, S_n)$ and the number of actions of the group \mathbb{Z}^ℓ on a set X of n labeled elements.

We call the double sequence $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ log-concave at n for ℓ , if

$$\Delta_\ell(n) := N_\ell(n)^2 - N_\ell(n-1) N_\ell(n+1) \geq 0.$$

If $\Delta_\ell(n) < 0$, we call the pair (n, ℓ) an exception (or strictly log-concave). In Section 1.1, Table 1 and Table 2 we recorded all exceptions for

$$1 \leq n \leq 30 \text{ and } 1 \leq \ell \leq 40.$$

1.1. Landscape of exceptions.

$n \setminus \ell$	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	
1			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
2																						
3			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•								
4																	•	•	•	•	•	•
5			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
6																						
7			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
8																•	•	•	•	•	•	•
9			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•									
10																						
11			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
12																						
13			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•												
14																						•
15			•	•	•	•	•	•	•													
16																						
17			•	•	•	•	•															
18																						
19			•	•	•																	
20																						
21			•	•																		
22																						
23			•																			
24																						
25			•																			
26																						
27																						
28																						
29																						
30																						

TABLE 1. Exceptions for $N_\ell(n)$ for $0 \leq \ell \leq 20$ and $1 \leq n \leq 30$

$n \setminus \ell$	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32	33	34	35	36	37	38	39	40
1	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
2																					
3																					
4	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
5																					
6																					
7	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
8	•	•	•	•	•	•	•														
9																					
10			•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
11	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•						
12																					
13							•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
14	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
15																					
16								•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
17				•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
18																					
19												•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
20								•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
21																					
22															•	•	•	•	•	•	•
23									•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
24																					
25																	•	•	•	•	•
26												•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
27																					
28																			•	•	•
29														•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
30																					

TABLE 2. Exceptions for $N_\ell(n)$ for $20 \leq \ell \leq 40$ and $1 \leq n \leq 30$

1.2. **Log-concavity of $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ at n for fixed n .** We state our main result.

Theorem 1.2. *Let $n \geq 2$. Then $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ is log-concave at n for almost all ℓ , if $n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$. Further, let $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$. Then $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ is strictly log-convex at n for almost all ℓ . If $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$, then $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ is log-concave at n for almost all ℓ , if $n < 20$ and strictly log-convex at n for almost all ℓ , if $n \geq 20$.*

Through an in depth examination of the proof, we obtain the following:

Corollary 1.3. *The possible bounds can be made explicit. Let*

$$\kappa(n) := \begin{cases} 1 + 8 \left(\frac{((n/3)!)^2 p(n-1)p(n+1)}{3^{-2n/3}} - 1 \right), & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ 1 + 8 \left(\left(\left(\frac{n-1}{3} \right)! p(n) \right)^2 2 \cdot 3^{2(n-1)/3} - 1 \right), & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ 2, & n = 2, \\ 1 + 8 \left(71 \cdot 2^{(n+1)/3} \left(\frac{n+1}{3} \right)! p(n+1) - 1 \right), & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}, \\ & 2 < n \leq 17, \\ 1 + 15 \left(\frac{3!6!7!2^{10}}{211} \left(\left(\frac{1}{6!2^6} + p(20) \right)^2 + \frac{p(20)}{6!2^5} \right) - 1 \right), & n = 20, \\ 1 + 8 \left(97 \cdot 2^{(n-2)/3} \cdot \left(\frac{n-2}{3} \right)! p(n) - 1 \right), & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}, \\ & n \geq 23. \end{cases}$$

Then $\Delta_\ell(n) > 0$ for $n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ and $\ell \geq \kappa(n)$, and $\Delta_\ell(n) < 0$ for $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$ and $\ell \geq \kappa(n)$. Moreover, let $n \geq 20$ and $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$, then $\Delta_\ell(n) < 0$ for $\ell \geq \kappa(n)$.

This leads to the following result:

Theorem 1.4. *Let $1 \leq n \leq 20$. Then we have the complete classification of exceptions as in Table 3.*

n		n	
1	$2 \leq \ell$	11	$2 \leq \ell \leq 35$
2	\emptyset	12	\emptyset
3	$2 \leq \ell \leq 13$	13	$2 \leq \ell \leq 9, 26 \leq \ell$
4	$16 \leq \ell$	14	$20 \leq \ell \leq 44$
5	$2 \leq \ell \leq 19$	15	$2 \leq \ell \leq 8$
6	\emptyset	16	$29 \leq \ell$
7	$2 \leq \ell$	17	$2 \leq \ell \leq 6, 24 \leq \ell \leq 54$
8	$15 \leq \ell \leq 26$	18	\emptyset
9	$2 \leq \ell \leq 12$	19	$2 \leq \ell \leq 4, 32 \leq \ell$
10	$22 \leq \ell$	20	$27 \leq \ell$

TABLE 3. Classification of exceptions for $1 \leq n \leq 20$

1.3. Log-concavity of $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ for fixed ℓ .

It is a well-known result that the partition function $p(n)$ is log-concave, as established by Nicolas [Ni78], and also by DeSalvo and Pak [DP15]. Consequently, as $N_2(n) = p(n)$ the same log-concavity holds true for the sequence $\{N_2(n)\}$. Actually, $\Delta_2(n) > 0$ for all even numbers n and all odd numbers $n > 25$. Both proofs rely on

the Rademacher formula for partition numbers, involving the Dedekind eta function. Limited knowledge exists on $\ell > 2$. We refer to Table 4 for the classification of all exceptions for $n \leq 10^5$ for $\ell = 3$ and $n \leq 10^4$ otherwise.

ℓ	log-concave	log-convex	proof/verification
1	\mathbb{N}	\emptyset	
2	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 25 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : 1 \leq n \leq 25 \text{ odd}\}$	1978 Nicolas
3	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 21 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : 1 \leq n \leq 21 \text{ odd}\}$	2024 H–N ($n \leq 10^5$)
4	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 19 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : 1 \leq n \leq 19 \text{ odd}\}$	2024 H–N ($n \leq 10^4$)
5	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 17 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17\}$	\vdots
6	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 17 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17\}$	\vdots
7	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 15 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15\}$	\vdots
8	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 15 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15\}$	\vdots
9	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 13 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13\}$	\vdots
10	$\{n \in \mathbb{N} : n > 11 \text{ or } n \text{ even}\}$	$\{1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11\}$	2024 H–N ($n \leq 10^4$)

TABLE 4. Log-concavity patterns for $1 \leq \ell \leq 10$

Table 4 provides some evidence suggesting that for a fixed ℓ the sequence $N_\ell(n)$ is log-concave for almost all n . Additionally, we refer to Table 5, where we recorded the possible smallest $n_0 = n_0(\ell)$ such that $N_\ell(n)$ is log-concave for all $n \geq n_0$.

$\ell_1 \setminus \ell_0$	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
0	1	26	22	20	18	18	16	16	14	12
10	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	15
20	15	15	15	18	18	18	21	21	24	24
30	24	27	30	30	33	36	36	39	42	45

TABLE 5. List of smallest n_0 such that $N_{\ell_1+\ell_0}(n)$ constitutes a log-concave sequence for all $n \geq n_0$ checked for $n \leq 10^3$

1.4. Exceptions for arbitrary ℓ large. From our joint studies for large ℓ and n , the following application arises.

Corollary 1.5. *Let an arbitrary $N \in \mathbb{N}$ be given. Then there exists a constant $L \in \mathbb{N}$, such that there exists an $n \geq N$ with $\Delta_\ell(n) < 0$ for all $\ell \geq L$.*

This follows from Corollary 1.3. Let $n \geq 20$, $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$ and $n \geq N$. Let $\ell \geq \kappa(n)$. Then the result of Corollary 1.3 follows. Further, we obtain:

Corollary 1.6. *Let ℓ be given and $\{N_\ell(n)\}$ be log-concave for almost all n . Let $n_0(\ell)$ be given, such that $\Delta_\ell(n) > 0$ for all $n \geq n_0(\ell)$. Then the sequence $\{n_0(\ell)\}_\ell$ is unbounded.*

2. PRELIMINARIES

Let $n, \ell \geq 1$. Let $g_\ell(n)$ denote the number of subgroups of \mathbb{Z}^ℓ of index n . Then

$$g_\ell(n) = \sum_{d|n} d g_{\ell-1}(d),$$

where $g_0(n) = 1$ for $n = 1$ and 0 otherwise. The function g_ℓ is multiplicative and satisfies the following for p prime and $m \in \mathbb{N}$:

$$g_\ell(p^m) = \frac{(p^\ell - 1) \cdots (p^{\ell+m-1} - 1)}{(p - 1) \cdots (p^m - 1)}.$$

Therefore, $g_1(n) = g_\ell(1) = 1$, $g_\ell(2) = 2^\ell - 1$, and $g_\ell(4) = \frac{1}{3} (2^\ell - 1) (2^{\ell+1} - 1)$. Let $\ell \geq 2$. Then

$$n^{\ell-1} \leq g_\ell(n) \leq n^\ell \leq \sigma(n) n^{\ell-1},$$

where $\sigma(n) := \sum_{d|n} d$.

Moreover, the identity (Theorem 1.1):

$$\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} N_\ell(n) t^n = \exp \left(\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} g_\ell(n) \frac{t^n}{n} \right)$$

implies that we have the following two properties:

$$(2.1) \quad N_\ell(n) = \sum_{k \leq n} \sum_{\substack{m_1, \dots, m_k \geq 1 \\ m_1 + \dots + m_k = n}} \frac{1}{k!} \frac{g_\ell(m_1) \cdots g_\ell(m_k)}{m_1 \cdots m_k},$$

$$(2.2) \quad N_\ell(n) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=1}^n g_\ell(k) N_\ell(n-k), \text{ where } N_\ell(0) := 1.$$

A straightforward calculation leads to:

Lemma 2.1. *Let $\ell, n \geq 1$, then $\Delta_1(n) = 0$. Let $\ell > 1$, then $\Delta_\ell(1) < 0$ and $\Delta_\ell(2) > 0$. Further, let $\ell > 1$, then $\Delta_\ell(3) < 0$ for $2 \leq \ell \leq 13$ and $\Delta_\ell(3) > 0$ for $\ell \geq 14$.*

3. PROOF OF THEOREM 1.2

Let $n, \ell \geq 2$. It is well-known [BM65, MM65, SS20, HN22] that the maximum $M_1(n)$ over all products of partitions of n is given by

$$M_1(n) := \max_{k \leq n} \max_{\substack{m_1, \dots, m_k \geq 1 \\ m_1 + \dots + m_k = n}} m_1 \cdots m_k = \begin{cases} 3^{n/3}, & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ 4 \cdot 3^{(n-4)/3}, & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ 2 \cdot 3^{(n-2)/3}, & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}. \end{cases}$$

This maximum is obtained for the following values of k dependent on $n \pmod{3}$:

$$k = \begin{cases} n/3, & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ (n-1)/3 \text{ or } (n+2)/3, & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ (n+1)/3, & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}. \end{cases}$$

Moreover, for each of these values of k , the number of tuples reaching the maximum is given by:

$$\begin{cases} 1, & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ \frac{n-1}{3} \text{ or } \binom{(n+2)/3}{2}, & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ \frac{n+1}{3}, & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}. \end{cases}$$

Since $n^{\ell-1} \leq g_\ell(n) \leq g_2(n) n^{\ell-1}$, we obtain:

$$(3.1) \quad A_\ell(n) \leq N_\ell(n) \leq N_2(n) (M_1(n))^{\ell-1}.$$

The values of $A_\ell(n)$ are given by

$$A_\ell(n) = \begin{cases} \frac{3^{(\ell-2)n/3}}{(n/3)!}, & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ \frac{3(4 \cdot 3^{(n-4)/3})^{\ell-2}}{2((n-4)/3)!}, & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ \frac{(2 \cdot 3^{(n-2)/3})^{\ell-2}}{((n-2)/3)!}, & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}. \end{cases}$$

We recall that $N_2(n) = p(n)$.

3.1. The case $n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$. We obtain via (3.1):

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{N_\ell(n)^2}{N_\ell(n-1)N_\ell(n+1)} &\geq \frac{3^{-2n/3}}{((n/3)!)^2 p(n-1)p(n+1)} \left(\frac{9}{8}\right)^{\ell-1} \\ &> \frac{3^{-2n/3}}{((n/3)!)^2 p(n-1)p(n+1)} \left(1 + \frac{\ell-1}{8}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, $\Delta_\ell(n) > 0$ for $\ell \geq 1 + 8 \left(\frac{((n/3)!)^2 p(n-1)p(n+1)}{3^{-2n/3}} - 1 \right)$.

3.2. **The case $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$.** We obtain via (3.1):

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{N_\ell(n)^2}{N_\ell(n-1)N_\ell(n+1)} &\leq \left(\left(\frac{n-1}{3} \right)! p(n) \right)^2 2 \cdot 3^{2(n-1)/3} \left(\frac{8}{9} \right)^{\ell-1} \\ &< \left(\left(\frac{n-1}{3} \right)! p(n) \right)^2 2 \cdot 3^{2(n-1)/3} \left(1 + \frac{\ell-1}{8} \right)^{-1}. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, $\Delta_\ell(n) < 0$ for $\ell \geq 1 + 8 \left(\left(\frac{n-1}{3} \right)! p(n) \right)^2 2 \cdot 3^{2(n-1)/3} - 1$.

3.3. **The case $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$.** This particular case is more delicate compared to all other cases.

A direct calculation reveals the following:

Lemma 3.1. *For fixed $n > 1$ the leading term of $N_\ell(n)$ in terms of ℓ is obtained by $B_\ell(n) = C_1(n) (M_1(n))^{\ell-1}$, defined by*

$$C_1(n) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{2^{n/3} \left(\frac{n}{3} \right)!}, & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ \frac{7}{6} \frac{1}{2^{(n-4)/3} \left(\frac{n-4}{3} \right)!}, & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ \frac{1}{2^{(n-2)/3} \left(\frac{n-2}{3} \right)!}, & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}. \end{cases}$$

The bases of the second order growth terms are obtained by $M_2(n)$ defined as

$$M_2(n) = \begin{cases} 2, & n = 3, \\ 2^3 \cdot 3^{(n-6)/3}, & n > 3, n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ 3, & n = 4, \\ 10, & n = 7, \\ 2^5 \cdot 3^{(n-10)/3}, & n > 7, n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ 5, & n = 5, \\ 2^4 \cdot 3^{(n-8)/3}, & n > 5, n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}. \end{cases}$$

Then we obtain

$$B_\ell(n) \leq N_\ell(n) \leq B_\ell(n) + p(n) M_2(n).$$

Proof. We obtain for $n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ that the leading term of $N_\ell(n)$ in terms of ℓ is $\frac{1}{2^{n/3} \left(\frac{n}{3} \right)!} \cdot 3^{(\ell-1)n/3}$. For $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$, $n \geq 4$, the maximal growth term of $N_\ell(n)$ with respect to ℓ is $2^{-\frac{n-4}{3}} \frac{7}{6 \left(\frac{n-4}{3} \right)!} \cdot \left(4 \cdot 3^{\frac{n-4}{3}} \right)^{\ell-1}$. For $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$, we obtain $N_\ell(n) = R + \frac{1}{\left(\frac{n-2}{3} \right)!} \cdot 2^{-\frac{n-2}{3}} \cdot \left(2 \cdot 3^{\frac{n-2}{3}} \right)^{\ell-1}$, where R collects the terms of strictly slower growth. Similarly for $M_2(n)$. \square

Continuing with the proof for $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$, considering for $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$, $n \geq 5$, the terms of largest growth in ℓ are obtained as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{(N_\ell(n))^2}{N_\ell(n-1)N_\ell(n+1)} \\ & \geq \frac{\frac{(C_1(n))^2}{C_1(n-1)C_1(n+1)} \left(\frac{(M_1(n))^2}{M_1(n-1)M_1(n+1)} \right)^{\ell-1}}{\left(1 + \frac{p(n-1)}{C_1(n-1)} \left(\frac{M_2(n-1)}{M_1(n-1)} \right)^{\ell-1} \right) \left(1 + \frac{p(n+1)}{C_1(n+1)} \left(\frac{M_2(n+1)}{M_1(n+1)} \right)^{\ell-1} \right)} \\ & \geq \frac{6n+1}{7n-2} \frac{1}{\left(1 + \frac{1}{71}\right)^2} > \frac{6n+1}{7n-2} \frac{35}{36} = \frac{5n+1}{6n-2} \geq 1 \end{aligned}$$

if $n \leq 17$ and $\frac{p(n+s)}{C_1(n+s)} \left(\frac{M_2(n+s)}{M_1(n+s)} \right)^{\ell-1} \leq \frac{1}{71}$ for $s = \pm 1$. This holds true if $\ell \geq 1 + \max_{s=\pm 1} \log_{M_1(n+s)/M_2(n+s)} \left(71 \frac{p(n+s)}{C_1(n+s)} \right)$.

Note that

$$\frac{M_1(n-1)}{M_2(n-1)} = \begin{cases} \frac{4}{3} \geq \frac{9}{8}, & n = 5, \\ \frac{12}{10} = \frac{6}{5} \geq \frac{9}{8}, & n = 8, \\ \frac{4 \cdot 3^{(n-5)/3}}{2^5 3^{(n-11)/3}} = \frac{9}{8}, & n > 8, n \equiv 2 \pmod{3} \end{cases}$$

and

$$\frac{M_1(n+1)}{M_2(n+1)} = \frac{3^{(n+1)/3}}{2^3 \cdot 3^{(n-5)/3}} = \frac{9}{8}.$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} \max_{s=\pm 1} \log_{M_1(n+s)/M_2(n+s)} \left(71 \frac{p(n+s)}{C_1(n+s)} \right) & \leq \max_{s=\pm 1} \log_{9/8} \left(71 \frac{p(n+s)}{C_1(n+s)} \right) \\ & = \log_{9/8} \left(71 \cdot 2^{(n+1)/3} \left(\frac{n+1}{3} \right)! p(n+1) \right) \end{aligned}$$

since $C_1(n+1) < C_1(n-1)$ for $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$ and $n > 2$.

In the opposite direction, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} & (N_\ell(n))^2 - N_\ell(n-1)N_\ell(n+1) \\ & \leq \frac{(C_1(n))^2}{C_1(n-1)C_1(n+1)} \left(\frac{(M_1(n))^2}{M_1(n-1)M_1(n+1)} \right)^{\ell-1} \left(1 + \frac{p(n)}{C_1(n)} \left(\frac{M_2(n)}{M_1(n)} \right)^{\ell-1} \right)^2 \\ & \leq \frac{6n+1}{7n-2} \left(1 + \frac{1}{97} \right)^2 < \frac{6n+1}{7n-2} \frac{49}{48} = \frac{7n+1}{8n-2} \leq 1 \end{aligned}$$

if $n \geq 23$ and $\frac{p(n)}{C_1(n)} \left(\frac{M_1(n)}{M_2(n)} \right)^{\ell-1} \leq \frac{1}{97}$. This holds true if $\ell \geq 1 + \log_{M_1(n)/M_2(n)} \left(97 \frac{p(n)}{C_1(n)} \right) = \log_{9/8} \left(97 \cdot 2^{(n-2)/3} \cdot \left(\frac{n-2}{3} \right)! p(n) \right)$ since $\frac{M_1(n)}{M_2(n)} = \frac{2 \cdot 3^{(n-2)/3}}{16 \cdot 3^{(n-8)/3}} = \frac{9}{8}$. In order to complete the analysis, let us consider the case $n = 20$. Including the third largest products as well, we derive the following through another straightforward calculation:

Lemma 3.2. *In terms of the first three growth terms, we have*

$$N_\ell(20) \leq C_1(20) (M_1(20))^{\ell-1} + C_2(20) (M_2(20))^{\ell-1} + p(20) (M_3(20))^{\ell-1}$$

with

$$C_2(20) = \frac{43}{4!4!3!2^3}, \quad M_3(20) = 5 \cdot 3^5.$$

With the first two growth terms, we establish for $n \in \{19, 21\}$

$$N_\ell(n) \geq C_1(n) (M_1(n))^{\ell-1} + C_2(n) (M_2(n))^{\ell-1}$$

with

$$C_2(19) = \frac{41}{6!2^3}, \quad C_2(21) = \frac{1}{3!4!2^5}.$$

Proof. For $n = 21 \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$, the leading terms of $N_\ell(n)$ regarding ℓ are $\frac{1}{27 \cdot 7!} \cdot 3^{7\ell-7} + \frac{1}{6 \cdot 2^5 \cdot 4!} (8 \cdot 3^5)^{\ell-1}$. For $n = 19 \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$, we obtain the leading first two terms of $N_\ell(n)$ regarding ℓ as $\frac{41}{6!} \cdot 2^{5\ell-8} \cdot 3^{3\ell-3} + \frac{7}{2^5 \cdot 6!} \cdot (4 \cdot 3^5)^{\ell-1}$. For $n = 20 \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$ we obtain the first two leading terms of $N_\ell(n)$ regarding ℓ as $2^{\ell-7} \cdot 3^{6\ell-6} \cdot \frac{1}{6!} + 2^{4\ell-8} \cdot 3^{4\ell-4} \cdot \frac{43}{4!4!3}$.

For $M_3(20)$ the calculation is similar. \square

Therefore, regarding the proof for $n = 20$, we establish

$$\begin{aligned} & (N_\ell(20))^2 - N_\ell(19) N_\ell(21) \\ & \leq \left(C_1(20) (M_1(20))^{\ell-1} + C_2(20) (M_2(20))^{\ell-1} + p(20) (M_3(20))^{\ell-1} \right)^2 \\ & \quad - \left(C_1(19) (M_1(19))^{\ell-1} + C_2(19) (M_2(19))^{\ell-1} \right) \\ & \quad \cdot \left(C_1(21) (M_1(21))^{\ell-1} + C_2(21) (M_2(21))^{\ell-1} \right) \\ & < -2^{5\ell-15} \cdot 3^{10\ell-10} \cdot \frac{211}{7!3!6!} + \left(C_2(20) (M_2(20))^{\ell-1} + p(20) (M_3(20))^{\ell-1} \right)^2 \\ & \quad + C_1(20) p(20) (M_1(20) M_3(20))^{\ell-1} \\ & < -\frac{211}{7!3!6!2^{10}} (2^5 3^{10})^{\ell-1} + \left((C_2(20) + p(20))^2 + 2C_1(20) p(20) \right) (10 \cdot 3^{11})^{\ell-1} \leq 0 \end{aligned}$$

if

$$\begin{aligned} \ell &\geq 1 + \log_{16/15} \left(\frac{2^{10} \cdot 3!6!7! \left((C_2(20) + p(20))^2 + 2C_1(20)p(20) \right)}{211} \right) \\ &= 1 + \log_{16/15} \left(\frac{3!6!7!2^{10}}{211} \left(\left(\frac{43}{4!4!3!2^3} + p(20) \right)^2 + \frac{p(20)}{6!2^5} \right) \right) \end{aligned}$$

since $(M_2(20))^2 = 2^8 3^8 < 10 \cdot 3^{11} = M_3(20) M_1(20)$.

Recall that $N_\ell(1) = 1$ and $N_\ell(2) = 2^{\ell-1}$ and we obtain $N_\ell(3) = \frac{1}{2} \cdot 3^{\ell-1} + 2^{\ell-1} - \frac{1}{2}$. Therefore, $\frac{N_\ell(1)N_\ell(3)}{(N_\ell(2))^2} > 1$ for $\ell \geq 2$ and it is $\frac{2}{3}$ for $\ell = 0$ and 1 for $\ell = 1$.

3.4. Remark. Note that from the proof we can actually derive the following bounds for $\ell \geq L(n)$:

$$L(n) = \begin{cases} 1 + \log_{9/8} \left(((n/3)!)^2 p(n-1)p(n+1) 3^{3n/2} \right), & n \equiv 0 \pmod{3}, \\ 1 + \log_{9/8} \left(\left(\left(\frac{n-1}{3} \right)! p(n) \right)^2 \cdot 2 \cdot 3^{2(n-1)/3} \right), & n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}, \\ 2, & n = 2, \\ 1 + \log_{9/8} \left(71 \cdot 2^{(n+1)/3} \left(\frac{n+1}{3} \right)! p(n+1) \right), & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}, \\ & 2 < n \leq 17, \\ 1 + \log_{16/15} \left(\frac{3!6!7!2^{10}}{211} \left(\left(\frac{1}{6!2^6} + p(20) \right)^2 + \frac{p(20)}{6!2^5} \right) \right), & n = 20, \\ 1 + \log_{9/8} \left(97 \cdot 2^{(n-2)/3} \cdot \left(\frac{n-2}{3} \right)! p(n) \right), & n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}, \\ & n \geq 23. \end{cases}$$

For $1 \leq n \leq 20$ this leads to the bounds in Table 6.

n	$\lceil L(n) \rceil$	n	$\lceil L(n) \rceil$
1	7	11	125
2	2	12	203
3	40	13	214
4	53	14	152
5	76	15	264
6	90	16	274
7	102	17	179
8	99	18	326
9	146	19	336
10	157	20	487

TABLE 6. Values of $\lceil L(n) \rceil$

The proof of Corollary 1.3 and Table 3 is now complete, after verifying the remaining cases with PARI/GP.

4. DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The datasets generated during and/or analysed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

5. ETHICS DECLARATIONS

5.1. Conflict of interest. The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments. The authors express their gratitude to Ken Ono for bringing together their shared research interests.

REFERENCES

- [ABDV23] A. Abdesselam, P. Brunialti, T. Doan, and P. Velie: *A bijection for tuples of commuting permutations and a log-concavity conjecture*. arXiv:2309.09407v1 [math.CO].
- [An98] G. E. Andrews: *The Theory of Partitions*. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge (1998).
- [Br15] P. Brändén: *Unimodality, log-concavity, real-rootness and beyond*. In Bóna Miklos (ed.), *Handbook of Enumerative Combinatorics*. Discrete Math. Appl. (Boca Raton) CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL (2015), 437–483.
- [Br13] J. R. Britnell: *A formal identity involving commuting triples of permutations*. *J. Combin. Theory Ser. A* **120** no. 4 (2013), 941–943.
- [BF98] J. Bryan and J. Fulman: *Orbifold Euler characteristics and the number of commuting m -tuples in the symmetric groups*. *Ann. Comb.* **2** no. 1 (1998), 1–6.
- [BM65] R. Bercov and L. Moser: *On Abelian permutation groups*. *Canadian Math. Bulletin* **8** no. 5 (1965), 627–630.
- [DA13] F. D’Arcais: *Développement en série*. *Intermédiaire Math.* **20** (1913), 233–234.
- [DP15] S. DeSalvo and I. Pak: *Log-concavity of the partition function*. *Ramanujan J.* **38** (2015), 61–73.
- [ET68] P. Erdős and P. Turán: *On some problems of statistical group theory IV*. *Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hungar.* **19** (3-4) (1968), 413–435.
- [GORZ19] M. Griffin, K. Ono, L. Rolén, and D. Zagier: *Jensen polynomials for the Riemann zeta function and other sequences*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **116** no. 23 (2019), 11103–11110.
- [Ha10] G. Han: *The Nekrasov–Okounkov hook length formula: refinement, elementary proof and applications*. *Ann. Inst. Fourier (Grenoble)* **60** no. 1 (2010), 1–29.
- [HN22] B. Heim and M. Neuhauser: *Log-concavity of infinite product generating functions*. *Res. Number Theory* **8** no. 3 (2022), article 53.
- [LM09] V. Liskovets and A. Mednykh: *On the number of connected and disconnected coverings over manifolds*. *Ars Math. Contemp.* **2** no. 2 (2009), 181–189.

- [LS03] A. Lubotzky and D. Segal: *Subgroup growth*, Progr. Math. **212**, Birkhäuser Verlag, Basel, 2003.
- [MM65] J. W. Moon and L. Moser: *On cliques in graphs*. Israel J. Math. **3** no. 1 (1965), 23–28.
- [NO06] N. Nekrasov and A. Okounkov: *Seiberg–Witten theory and random partitions*. In Etingof, Pavel (ed.) et al., The unity of mathematics. In honor of the ninetieth birthday of I. M. Gelfand. Papers from the conference held in Cambridge, MA, USA, August 31–September 4, 2003. Progr. Math. **244**, Birkhäuser, Boston (2006), 525–596.
- [Ni78] J.-L. Nicolas: *Sur les entiers N pour lesquels il y a beaucoup des groupes abéliens d’ordre N* . Ann. Inst. Fourier **28** no. 4 (1978), 1–16.
- [On04] K. Ono: *The web of modularity: Arithmetic of the coefficients of modular forms and q -series*, CBMS Regional Conference Series in Mathematics **102**, American Mathematical Society, Providence, 2004.
- [SS20] R. Schneider and A. V. Sills: *The product of parts or “norm” of a partition*. Integers: Elect. J. of Comb. Num. Theory **20A** (2020), article 13.
- [Wh13] T. White: *Counting free Abelian actions*. Preprint arXiv:1304.2830[math.CO], 2013.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, P. O. BOX 400137, UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA, CHARLOTTESVILLE, VA 22904-4137, USA

Email address: malek@virginia.edu

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS AND COMPUTER SCIENCE, DIVISION OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF COLOGNE, WEYERTAL 86-90, 50931 COLOGNE, GERMANY

LEHRSTUHL A FÜR MATHEMATIK, RWTH AACHEN UNIVERSITY, 52056 AACHEN, GERMANY

Email address: bheim@uni-koeln.de

KUTAISI INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY, 5/7, YOUTH AVENUE, KUTAISI, 4600 GEORGIA

LEHRSTUHL A FÜR MATHEMATIK, RWTH AACHEN UNIVERSITY, 52056 AACHEN, GERMANY

Email address: markus.neuhauser@kiu.edu.ge