

Red or Blue Tensor Spectrum from GW170817-compatible Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet Theory: A Detailed Analysis

V.K. Oikonomou,^{1,2,*} Pyotr Tsyba^{2,†} and Olga Razina^{2‡}

¹⁾ *Department of Physics, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Thessaloniki 54124, Greece*

²⁾ *L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University - Astana, 010008, Kazakhstan*

In this work we shall prove that the tensor spectral index of the primordial tensor perturbations for GW170817-compatible Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet theories, takes the approximate simplified form $n_{\mathcal{T}} \simeq 2 \left(-1 + \frac{1}{\lambda(\phi)} \right) \epsilon_1$ at leading order, with $\lambda(\phi)$ being a function of the scalar field which depends on the scalar field potential and the second derivative of the scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling $\xi''(\phi)$. With our analysis we aim to provide a definitive criterion for selecting Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet models that can provide a blue-tilted inflationary phenomenology, by simply looking at the scalar potential and the scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling. We shall prove this using two distinct approaches and as we show the tilt of the tensor spectral index is determined by the values of the potential $V(\phi)$ and of scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling at first horizon crossing. Specifically the blue-tilted tensor spectral index can occur when $\xi''(\phi_*)V(\phi_*) > 0$ at first horizon crossing.

PACS numbers: 04.50.Kd, 95.36.+x, 98.80.-k, 98.80.Cq, 11.25.-w

I. INTRODUCTION

The current interest in theoretical physics is on inflationary theories [1–5] which will be experimentally scrutinized in the next decade. Indeed, several future experiments will directly seek for hints of the inflationary theory, either direct like the stage 4 Cosmic Microwave Background (CMB) experiments [6, 7] which will seek for B -modes of inflation, or indirect like the future gravitational waves experiments [8–16]. These experiments, apart from constraining, it is also possible to rule out inflation [17]. The gravitational wave experiments will be able to discover the existence or not of a stochastic gravitational waves background with small anisotropies, which cannot be attributed to astrophysical sources due to the small anisotropies.

In 2023 an exciting observation from the NANOGrav collaboration [18] has placed many hopes on the stochastic gravitational wave background existence. Specifically NANOGrav [18] confirmed the existence of a stochastic gravitational wave background and this observation was also confirmed simultaneously by other pulsar timing arrays (PTA) experiments [19–21]. The absence of large anisotropies [22], the absence of a single supermassive black hole merger event and the lack of a definitive theoretical solution to the last parsec problem [23] makes the cosmological interpretation of the signal more likely, at least for the time being and many works have appeared in the literature, explaining the 2023 NANOGrav signal [24–68], see also [69–75] for previous works, and also [28, 29, 76]. In the case that the stochastic gravitational wave background is due to a cosmological source, the inflationary perspective of generating such a signal is significantly constrained because in such a case a significantly blue-tilted tensor spectral index combined with a low-reheating temperature is required [24, 25, 77–79].

In fact, in some cases it is not necessary to have a strongly blue-tilted tensor spectral index to explain the NANOGrav signal, but an abnormal reheating or a post-reheating era is required [25]. The blue-tilted inflationary tensor spectral index however is a prerequisite to explain the NANOGrav theories, and there exist theories that can generate a blue-tilted tensor spectral index, like for example string gas theories [80–82], Loop Quantum Cosmology scenarios [83–86], non-local gravity models [87–89] or conformal field theories [90]. One string-originating theory that can produce a blue-tilted tensor spectral index is Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet theory, and for mainstream of articles and reviews see Refs. [91–99, 101, 102] and [5, 103–106] respectively.

Due to the importance of obtaining a blue-tilted spectral index, in this article we shall derive and prove in detail that the tensor spectral index for a general GW170817-compatible Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet theory can be written in a closed and simplified form for two distinct approaches, and we shall analyze the cases when it is blue-tilted or

*Electronic address: v.k.oikonomou1979@gmail.com;voikonomou@gapps.auth.gr

†Electronic address: pyotrtsyba@gmail.com

‡Electronic address: olvikraz@mail.ru

red-tilted and which parameters or functions determine the sign of the tensor spectral index at first horizon crossing. As we will show, the size and magnitude of the second derivative of the Gauss-Bonnet scalar coupling function $\xi''(\phi)$ at first horizon crossing and the value of the scalar field potential $V(\phi)$, fully determine the sign of the tensor spectral index.

A. Inflation with GW170817-compatible Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet Theory and the Tensor Spectral Index

Before we go to the core of our analysis, let us discuss the inflationary dynamics of GW170817-compatible Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity which was developed in [101, 102]. The Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity action is the following,

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left(\frac{R}{2\kappa^2} - \frac{\omega}{2} \partial_\mu \phi \partial^\mu \phi - V(\phi) - \frac{1}{2} \xi(\phi) \mathcal{G} \right), \quad (1)$$

where R stands for the Ricci scalar, also $\kappa = \frac{1}{M_p}$ where M_p is the reduced Planck mass and furthermore \mathcal{G} stands for the four dimensional Gauss-Bonnet invariant which is $\mathcal{G} = R^2 - 4R_{\alpha\beta}R^{\alpha\beta} + R_{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta}R^{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta}$ where $R_{\alpha\beta}$ is the Ricci and also $R_{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta}$ is the Riemann tensor. Let us consider a flat Friedmann-Robertson-Walker (FRW) geometric background, with metric,

$$ds^2 = -dt^2 + a(t)^2 \sum_{i=1}^3 (dx^i)^2, \quad (2)$$

with $a(t)$ denoting as usual the scale factor. By varying the gravitational action with respect to the metric and with respect to a time-dependent scalar field, for a FRW metric, the field equations read,

$$\frac{3H^2}{\kappa^2} = \frac{1}{2} \dot{\phi}^2 + V + 12\dot{\xi}H^3, \quad (3)$$

$$\frac{2\dot{H}}{\kappa^2} = -\dot{\phi}^2 + 4\ddot{\xi}H^2 + 8\dot{\xi}H\dot{H} - 4\dot{\xi}H^3, \quad (4)$$

$$\ddot{\phi} + 3H\dot{\phi} + V' + 12\xi'H^2(\dot{H} + H^2) = 0. \quad (5)$$

For the inflationary era analysis, we shall assume that the following slow-roll conditions apply,

$$\dot{H} \ll H^2, \quad \frac{\dot{\phi}^2}{2} \ll V, \quad \ddot{\phi} \ll 3H\dot{\phi}. \quad (6)$$

The speed of the tensor perturbations of the FRW background metric is [91, 101, 102],

$$c_T^2 = 1 - \frac{Q_f}{2Q_t}, \quad (7)$$

with $Q_f = 8(\ddot{\xi} - H\dot{\xi})$, $Q_t = F + \frac{Q_b}{2}$, $F = \frac{1}{\kappa^2}$ and $Q_b = -8\dot{\xi}H$. The GW170817 event imposed the constraint that the gravitational wave speed is nearly equal to the speed of light, so this means that $Q_f \simeq 0$ which in turn means that $\ddot{\xi} \simeq H\dot{\xi}$. By expressing this in terms of the scalar field, we have,

$$\xi'' \dot{\phi}^2 + \xi' \ddot{\phi} = H\xi' \dot{\phi}, \quad (8)$$

with the ‘‘prime’’ indicating differentiation with respect to the scalar field. Furthermore, if we require that the following condition holds true,

$$\xi' \ddot{\phi} \ll \xi'' \dot{\phi}^2, \quad (9)$$

we can rewrite the constraint (8) in the following way,

$$\dot{\phi} \simeq \frac{H\xi'}{\xi''}, \quad (10)$$

therefore by combining Eqs. (5) and (10) we obtain,

$$\frac{\xi'}{\xi''} \simeq -\frac{1}{3H^2} (V' + 12\xi'H^4). \quad (11)$$

Now we further assume that

$$\kappa \frac{\xi'}{\xi''} \ll 1, \quad (12)$$

$$12\dot{\xi}H^3 = 12\frac{\xi'^2 H^4}{\xi''} \ll V, \quad (13)$$

which will simplify the field equations and we can obtain the slow-roll indices in closed form. Hence, in view of Eqs. (6), (10) and (13), the field equations become,

$$H^2 \simeq \frac{\kappa^2 V}{3}, \quad (14)$$

$$\dot{H} \simeq -\frac{1}{2}\kappa^2 \dot{\phi}^2, \quad (15)$$

$$\dot{\phi} \simeq \frac{H\xi'}{\xi''}, \quad (16)$$

and furthermore the condition (13) becomes,

$$\frac{4\kappa^4 \xi'^2 V}{3\xi''} \ll 1. \quad (17)$$

In addition, the differential equation (11) which directly relates the functional forms of the scalar field potential and the scalar field coupling function of the Gauss-Bonnet invariant, takes the form,

$$\frac{V'}{V^2} + \frac{4\kappa^4}{3}\xi' \simeq 0. \quad (18)$$

In view of the above, we can obtain the slow-roll indices acquire a closed and simplified form,

$$\epsilon_1 \simeq \frac{\kappa^2 \omega}{2} \left(\frac{\xi'}{\xi''} \right)^2, \quad \epsilon_2 \simeq 1 - \epsilon_1 - \frac{\xi' \xi'''}{\xi''^2}, \quad \epsilon_3 = 0, \quad (19)$$

$$\epsilon_4 \simeq \frac{\xi'}{2\xi''} \frac{\mathcal{E}'}{\mathcal{E}}, \quad (20)$$

$$\epsilon_5 \simeq -\frac{2\kappa^4 \xi'^2 V}{3\xi'' - 4\kappa^4 \xi'^2 V}, \quad (21)$$

$$\epsilon_6 \simeq \epsilon_5(1 - \epsilon_1), \quad (22)$$

with $\mathcal{E} = \mathcal{E}(\phi)$ being defined in the following way,

$$\mathcal{E}(\phi) = \frac{1}{\kappa^2} \left(1 + 72 \frac{\epsilon_1^2}{\lambda^2} \right), \quad (23)$$

with the function $\lambda(\phi)$ being defined as follows,

$$\lambda(\phi) = \frac{3\omega}{4\xi'' \kappa^2 V}. \quad (24)$$

Now, in terms of the slow-roll indices, the scalar spectral index n_S , the tensor-to-scalar ratio r and the tensor-spectral index n_T are,

$$n_S = 1 - 4\epsilon_1 - 2\epsilon_2 - 2\epsilon_4, \quad (25)$$

$$n_T = -2(\epsilon_1 + \epsilon_6), \quad (26)$$

$$r = 16 \left| \left(\frac{\kappa^2 Q_e}{4H} - \epsilon_1 \right) \frac{2c_A^3}{2 + \kappa^2 Q_b} \right|, \quad (27)$$

where c_A denotes the sound wave speed,

$$c_A^2 = 1 + \frac{Q_a Q_e}{3Q_a^2 + \phi^2 \left(\frac{2}{\kappa^2} + Q_b \right)}, \quad (28)$$

with,

$$Q_a = -4\dot{\xi}H^2, \quad Q_b = -8\dot{\xi}H, \quad Q_t = F + \frac{Q_b}{2}, \quad Q_c = 0, \quad Q_e = -16\dot{\xi}\dot{H}. \quad (29)$$

The tensor-to-scalar ratio can be further simplified as follows,

$$r \simeq 16\epsilon_1. \quad (30)$$

Regarding the tensor spectral index, we shall demonstrate that it can be written in the following closed and simple form,

$$n_T \simeq -2\epsilon_1 \left(1 - \frac{1}{\lambda} + \frac{\epsilon_1}{\lambda} \right), \quad (31)$$

where $\lambda(\phi)$ is defined in Eq. (24). We shall show that the above form can be obtained by using various approaches. To start with, let us begin our analysis from the tensor spectral index of Eq. (26) and focus on the slow-roll index ϵ_6 defined in Eq. (22). So we start from,

$$\epsilon_6 = - \frac{2\kappa^4 \xi'^2 \left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\kappa^2 \omega \left(\frac{\xi'}{\xi''} \right)^2 \right)}{\xi''^2 \left(\frac{3}{\xi''V} - 4\kappa^4 \left(\frac{\xi'}{\xi''} \right)^2 \right)}, \quad (32)$$

which can be written in terms of the slow-roll index ϵ_1 as follows,

$$\epsilon_6 = - \frac{\frac{4\kappa^2}{\omega} \epsilon_1 (1 - \epsilon_1)}{\frac{3}{\xi''V} - \frac{8\kappa^2 \epsilon_1}{\omega}}, \quad (33)$$

or equivalently,

$$\epsilon_6 = - \frac{\epsilon_1 (1 - \epsilon_1)}{\frac{3\omega}{4\kappa^2 \xi''V} - 2\epsilon_1}. \quad (34)$$

Thus by inserting the above in Eq. (26) we get,

$$n_T \simeq -2 \left(\epsilon_1 - \frac{\epsilon_1 (1 - \epsilon_1)}{\frac{3\omega}{4\kappa^2 \xi''V} - 2\epsilon_1} \right), \quad (35)$$

and since $\epsilon_1 \ll 1$ we expand the above for small values of ϵ_1 and we get,

$$n_T \simeq 2 \left(-1 + \frac{1}{\lambda} \right) \epsilon_1 - \frac{2(\lambda - 2)}{\lambda^2} \epsilon_1^2 + \dots - 2^{n-1} \frac{\lambda - 2}{\lambda^n} \epsilon_1^n. \quad (36)$$

Thus at first order, the tensor spectral index has the following form,

$$n_{\mathcal{T}} \simeq 2 \left(-1 + \frac{1}{\lambda} \right) \epsilon_1. \quad (37)$$

We can arrive at the same expression by using a different approach, starting from Eq. (26) and using Eq. (22), and then we get approximately,

$$n_{\mathcal{T}} \simeq -2 (\epsilon_1 + \epsilon_5 - \epsilon_5 \epsilon_1), \quad (38)$$

and it can be proven that ϵ_5 takes a simpler form than the one in Eq. (21), since,

$$\epsilon_5 = - \frac{\epsilon_1}{\frac{3\omega}{\xi'' V 4\kappa^2} - 2\epsilon_1}. \quad (39)$$

Due to the approximation we assumed earlier, namely $\frac{4\xi'^2 \kappa^4 V}{3\xi''} \ll 1$, we get,

$$\epsilon_5 \simeq - \frac{2\kappa^4 \xi'^2 V}{3\xi''} = - \frac{\epsilon_1}{\lambda}, \quad (40)$$

thus, the tensor spectral index (38) acquires the following form,

$$n_{\mathcal{T}} \simeq -2\epsilon_1 \left(1 - \frac{1}{\lambda} \right) - \frac{2\epsilon_1^2}{\lambda}, \quad (41)$$

which is identical to the expression given in Eq. (37) if terms of the order $\sim \mathcal{O}(\epsilon_1)$ are kept in the expansion. Thus we proven using two distinct approaches that the tensor spectral index at first order approximation can take the simplified form given in Eq. (37). It is apparent that the tilt of the spectral index is critically affected by the values of the function $\lambda(\phi)$ at first horizon crossing, since in our formalism ϵ_1 is always positive. Thus the following cases determine the tilt of the tensor spectral index,

$$n_{\mathcal{T}} \simeq \begin{cases} -2\epsilon_1, & \text{when } |\lambda(\phi_*)| \gg 1 \\ \frac{2\epsilon_1}{\lambda}, & \text{when } |\lambda(\phi_*)| \ll 1 \\ 0, & \text{when } |\lambda(\phi_*)| \simeq 1, \\ \frac{\epsilon_1(1-\lambda)}{\lambda} > 0, & \text{when } \lambda(\phi_*) < 1, \end{cases} \quad (42)$$

where ϕ_* is the value of the scalar field at the first horizon crossing. Thus the strongly blue-tilted tensor spectral index can occur when $|\lambda(\phi_*)| \ll 1$ and when $\lambda(\phi_*) > 0$, and also in the case that $\lambda < 1$ the tensor spectral index is also blue-tilted but not necessarily strongly blue-tilted. Now it is apparent that the values and the sign of the function $\lambda(\phi)$ are determined by the values and signs of $\xi''(\phi)$ and of $V(\phi)$ at the first horizon crossing. Thus the blue-tilted tensor spectral index can occur when $\xi''(\phi_*)V(\phi_*) > 0$ at first horizon crossing. Clearly this is more or less model dependent, but our analysis provides insights in the analysis of inflationary phenomenology of Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet models, because models with positive potentials must have $\xi''(\phi) > 0$ in order to generate a blue-tilted tensor spectral index and also models with negative values of the potential at first horizon crossing must have $\xi''(\phi_*) < 0$ in order to generate a blue-tilted tensor spectral index.

Let us consider in brief some illustrative examples, the phenomenology of which is well studied in the literature and these provide a viable inflationary phenomenology [102]. Consider the following functional form of the scalar coupling function $\xi(\phi)$,

$$\xi(\phi) = \beta \left(\frac{\phi}{M} \right)^\nu, \quad (43)$$

with β being a dimensionless parameter, and M is a free parameter with mass dimensions $[m]^1$. By combining Eqs. (43) and (18) and solving the differential equation (18), we get the following scalar field potential,

$$V(\phi) = \frac{3}{3\gamma\kappa^4 + 4\beta\kappa^4 \left(\frac{\phi}{M} \right)^\nu}, \quad (44)$$

with γ being a dimensionless integration constant. Since in this case, we always have $\xi''(\phi) > 0$, the sign of the tensor spectral index will be determined by the scalar potential value, which is positive in order for a viable phenomenology

to be ensured. Indeed a viable phenomenology is guaranteed for the following values of the free parameters [102] $\mu = 2.09 \times 10^{-22} \times \kappa$, $\beta = [0.000025, 1.69055]$, $\gamma = 10^{200}$, for $N = [50, 63]$ e -foldings, for which the corresponding tensor spectral index values are in the range $n_{\mathcal{T}} = [0.006, 1.108]$. Thus for these values the scalar potential is positive, and as we expected, the tensor spectral index is blue-tilted. Another model of this sort is obtained for the scalar coupling function $\xi(\phi)$ having the form $\xi(\phi) = \beta \exp\left(\left(\frac{\phi}{M}\right)^2\right)$, where β is a dimensionless parameter, and M is a free parameter with mass dimensions $[m]^1$. By combining $\xi(\phi)$ and Eq. (18) and by solving the differential equation (18) we obtain the following scalar potential,

$$V(\phi) = \frac{3}{3\gamma\kappa^4 + 4\beta\kappa^4 e^{\frac{\phi^2}{M^2}}}, \quad (45)$$

where γ is a dimensionless integration constant. In this case we have $\xi''(\phi) > 0$ if $\beta > 0$ and $\xi''(\phi) < 0$ if $\beta < 0$, and the same applies for the scalar potential, which is however affected by the free parameter γ too. Thus in this case, the product $\xi(\phi_*)V(\phi_*)$ at the first horizon crossing will determine the sign of the tensor spectral index. Therefore, one must find which values of the free parameters guarantee a viable inflationary phenomenology, and the condition $\xi(\phi_*)V(\phi_*) > 0$ can easily be examined. In this case, a viable phenomenology is guaranteed for the following values of the free parameters [102] $\mu = [22.091, 22.0914]$, $\beta = -1.5$, $\gamma = 2$, for $N = 60$ e -foldings. Thus both the potential and the second derivative of the scalar Gauss-Bonnet coupling function are negative, thus the tensor spectral index is positive. Indeed, as it was shown in [102] for these values of the free parameters we have $n_{\mathcal{T}} = [0.378, 0.379]$, hence it is positive and also one may verify that $\xi(\phi_*)V(\phi_*) > 0$. Therefore, with our analysis one may know beforehand which Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet model may yield a blue-tilted tensor spectral index. However, we need to note that while the examples we presented can predict a blue tensor tilt, it is not clear whether those, or other model in the class, can provide the high values of the tensor spectral index required to explain PTA data [24, 107]. This feature can be model dependent, so it is left as a question to the reader and for future work.

II. CONCLUSIONS

In this paper we focused on the issue when the tensor spectral index of the primordial tensor perturbations for GW170817-compatible Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet theories is blue-tilted or red-tilted. With our analysis we aimed to provide a definitive and simple criterion for appropriately selecting Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet models that can provide a blue-tilted inflationary phenomenology, by simply selecting appropriately the scalar potential and the scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling. The importance of a blue-tilted inflationary phenomenology is great, after the 2023 NANOGrav observation of the stochastic gravitational wave background. Using the GW170817-compatible formalism of Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet inflationary theories, we showed, by using two distinct approaches, that at leading order, the tensor spectral index takes the approximate simplified form $n_{\mathcal{T}} \simeq 2\left(-1 + \frac{1}{\lambda(\phi)}\right)\epsilon_1$ at leading order, with $\lambda(\phi)$ being a function of the scalar field which depends on the scalar field potential and the second derivative of the scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling $\xi''(\phi)$. Since in our formalism, the slow-roll index ϵ_1 is always positive, the tilt of the spectral index depends on the sign of the function $\lambda(\phi)$ at the first horizon crossing, which in turn depends on the values of the potential $V(\phi)$ and of scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling at first horizon crossing. As we showed, when $\lambda(\phi_*) \ll 1$ and when $\lambda(\phi_*) < 1$, the tensor spectral index is blue-tilted, while when $\lambda(\phi_*) \simeq 1$, and $\lambda(\phi_*) > 1$ the tilt is red, where ϕ_* the value of the scalar field at the first horizon crossing. In terms of the scalar field potential and the scalar-Gauss-Bonnet coupling, the blue-tilted tensor spectral index can occur when $\xi''(\phi_*)V(\phi_*) > 0$ at first horizon crossing. Hence our analysis provides insights in the study of Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet inflationary theories, making it possible to chose beforehand blue-tilted inflationary phenomenologies.

Acknowledgments

This research has been is funded by the Committee of Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Grant No. AP14869238).

[1] A. D. Linde, Lect. Notes Phys. **738** (2008) 1 [arXiv:0705.0164 [hep-th]].

- [2] D. S. Gorbunov and V. A. Rubakov, “Introduction to the theory of the early universe: Cosmological perturbations and inflationary theory,” Hackensack, USA: World Scientific (2011) 489 p;
- [3] A. Linde, arXiv:1402.0526 [hep-th];
- [4] D. H. Lyth and A. Riotto, Phys. Rept. **314** (1999) 1 [hep-ph/9807278].
- [5] S. D. Odintsov, V. K. Oikonomou, I. Giannakoudi, F. P. Fronimos and E. C. Lymperiadou, Symmetry **15** (2023) no.9, 1701 doi:10.3390/sym15091701 [arXiv:2307.16308 [gr-qc]].
- [6] K. N. Abazajian *et al.* [CMB-S4], [arXiv:1610.02743 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [7] M. H. Abitbol *et al.* [Simons Observatory], Bull. Am. Astron. Soc. **51** (2019), 147 [arXiv:1907.08284 [astro-ph.IM]].
- [8] S. Hild, M. Abernathy, F. Acernese, P. Amaro-Seoane, N. Andersson, K. Arun, F. Barone, B. Barr, M. Barsuglia and M. Beker, *et al.* Class. Quant. Grav. **28** (2011), 094013 doi:10.1088/0264-9381/28/9/094013 [arXiv:1012.0908 [gr-qc]].
- [9] J. Baker, J. Bellovary, P. L. Bender, E. Berti, R. Caldwell, J. Camp, J. W. Conklin, N. Cornish, C. Cutler and R. DeRosa, *et al.* [arXiv:1907.06482 [astro-ph.IM]].
- [10] T. L. Smith and R. Caldwell, Phys. Rev. D **100** (2019) no.10, 104055 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.100.104055 [arXiv:1908.00546 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [11] J. Crowder and N. J. Cornish, Phys. Rev. D **72** (2005), 083005 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.72.083005 [arXiv:gr-qc/0506015 [gr-qc]].
- [12] T. L. Smith and R. Caldwell, Phys. Rev. D **95** (2017) no.4, 044036 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.95.044036 [arXiv:1609.05901 [gr-qc]].
- [13] N. Seto, S. Kawamura and T. Nakamura, Phys. Rev. Lett. **87** (2001), 221103 doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.87.221103 [arXiv:astro-ph/0108011 [astro-ph]].
- [14] S. Kawamura, M. Ando, N. Seto, S. Sato, M. Musha, I. Kawano, J. Yokoyama, T. Tanaka, K. Ioka and T. Akutsu, *et al.* [arXiv:2006.13545 [gr-qc]].
- [15] A. Weltman, P. Bull, S. Camera, K. Kelley, H. Padmanabhan, J. Pritchard, A. Raccanelli, S. Riemer-Sørensen, L. Shao and S. Andrianomena, *et al.* Publ. Astron. Soc. Austral. **37** (2020), e002 doi:10.1017/pasa.2019.42 [arXiv:1810.02680 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [16] P. Auclair *et al.* [LISA Cosmology Working Group], Living Rev. Rel. **26** (2023) no.1, 5 doi:10.1007/s41114-023-00045-2 [arXiv:2204.05434 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [17] S. Vagnozzi and A. Loeb, Astrophys. J. Lett. **939** (2022) no.2, L22 doi:10.3847/2041-8213/ac9b0e [arXiv:2208.14088 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [18] G. Agazie *et al.* [NANOGrav], Astrophys. J. Lett. **951** (2023) no.1, L8 doi:10.3847/2041-8213/acdac6 [arXiv:2306.16213 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [19] J. Antoniadis, P. Arumugam, S. Arumugam, S. Babak, M. Bagchi, A. S. B. Nielsen, C. G. Bassa, A. Bathula, A. Berthereau and M. Bonetti, *et al.* [arXiv:2306.16214 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [20] D. J. Reardon, A. Zic, R. M. Shannon, G. B. Hobbs, M. Bailes, V. Di Marco, A. Kapur, A. F. Rogers, E. Thrane and J. Askew, *et al.* doi:10.3847/2041-8213/acdd02 [arXiv:2306.16215 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [21] H. Xu, S. Chen, Y. Guo, J. Jiang, B. Wang, J. Xu, Z. Xue, R. N. Caballero, J. Yuan and Y. Xu, *et al.* doi:10.1088/1674-4527/acdfa5 [arXiv:2306.16216 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [22] G. Agazie *et al.* [NANOGrav], [arXiv:2306.16221 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [23] L. Sampson, N. J. Cornish and S. T. McWilliams, Phys. Rev. D **91** (2015) no.8, 084055 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.91.084055 [arXiv:1503.02662 [gr-qc]].
- [24] S. Vagnozzi, JHEAp **39** (2023), 81-98 doi:10.1016/j.jheap.2023.07.001 [arXiv:2306.16912 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [25] V. K. Oikonomou, Phys. Rev. D **108** (2023) no.4, 043516 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.108.043516 [arXiv:2306.17351 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [26] Y. F. Cai, X. C. He, X. Ma, S. F. Yan and G. W. Yuan, [arXiv:2306.17822 [gr-qc]].
- [27] C. Han, K. P. Xie, J. M. Yang and M. Zhang, [arXiv:2306.16966 [hep-ph]].
- [28] S. Y. Guo, M. Khlopov, X. Liu, L. Wu, Y. Wu and B. Zhu, [arXiv:2306.17022 [hep-ph]].
- [29] J. Yang, N. Xie and F. P. Huang, [arXiv:2306.17113 [hep-ph]].
- [30] A. Addazi, Y. F. Cai, A. Marciano and L. Visinelli, [arXiv:2306.17205 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [31] S. P. Li and K. P. Xie, Phys. Rev. D **108** (2023) no.5, 055018 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.108.055018 [arXiv:2307.01086 [hep-ph]].
- [32] X. Niu and M. H. Rahat, [arXiv:2307.01192 [hep-ph]].
- [33] A. Yang, J. Ma, S. Jiang and F. P. Huang, [arXiv:2306.17827 [hep-ph]].
- [34] S. Datta, [arXiv:2307.00646 [hep-ph]].
- [35] X. K. Du, M. X. Huang, F. Wang and Y. K. Zhang, [arXiv:2307.02938 [hep-ph]].
- [36] A. Salvio, [arXiv:2307.04694 [hep-ph]].
- [37] Z. Yi, Q. Gao, Y. Gong, Y. Wang and F. Zhang, [arXiv:2307.02467 [gr-qc]].
- [38] Z. Q. You, Z. Yi and Y. Wu, [arXiv:2307.04419 [gr-qc]].
- [39] S. Wang and Z. C. Zhao, [arXiv:2307.04680 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [40] D. G. Figueroa, M. Pieroni, A. Ricciardone and P. Simakachorn, [arXiv:2307.02399 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [41] S. Choudhury, [arXiv:2307.03249 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [42] S. A. Hosseini Mansoori, F. Felegray, A. Talebian and M. Sami, [arXiv:2307.06757 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [43] S. Ge, [arXiv:2307.08185 [gr-qc]].
- [44] L. Bian, S. Ge, J. Shu, B. Wang, X. Y. Yang and J. Zong, [arXiv:2307.02376 [astro-ph.HE]].
- [45] M. Kawasaki and K. Murai, [arXiv:2308.13134 [astro-ph.CO]].

- [46] Z. Yi, Z. Q. You and Y. Wu, [arXiv:2308.05632 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [47] H. An, B. Su, H. Tai, L. T. Wang and C. Yang, [arXiv:2308.00070 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [48] Z. Zhang, C. Cai, Y. H. Su, S. Wang, Z. H. Yu and H. H. Zhang, [arXiv:2307.11495 [hep-ph]].
- [49] P. Di Bari and M. H. Rahat, [arXiv:2307.03184 [hep-ph]].
- [50] S. Jiang, A. Yang, J. Ma and F. P. Huang, [arXiv:2306.17827 [hep-ph]].
- [51] G. Bhattacharya, S. Choudhury, K. Dey, S. Ghosh, A. Karde and N. S. Mishra, [arXiv:2309.00973 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [52] S. Choudhury, A. Karde, S. Panda and M. Sami, [arXiv:2308.09273 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [53] T. Bringmann, P. F. Depta, T. Konstandin, K. Schmidt-Hoberg and C. Tasillo, [arXiv:2306.09411 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [54] S. Choudhury, S. Panda and M. Sami, JCAP **08** (2023), 078 doi:10.1088/1475-7516/2023/08/078 [arXiv:2304.04065 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [55] S. Choudhury, A. Karde, S. Panda and M. Sami, [arXiv:2306.12334 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [56] H. L. Huang, Y. Cai, J. Q. Jiang, J. Zhang and Y. S. Piao, [arXiv:2306.17577 [gr-qc]].
- [57] J. Q. Jiang, Y. Cai, G. Ye and Y. S. Piao, [arXiv:2307.15547 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [58] M. Zhu, G. Ye and Y. Cai, [arXiv:2307.16211 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [59] I. Ben-Dayan, U. Kumar, U. Thattarampilly and A. Verma, [arXiv:2307.15123 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [60] G. Franciolini, A. Iovino, Junior., V. Vaskonen and H. Veermäe, [arXiv:2306.17149 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [61] J. Ellis, M. Fairbairn, G. Franciolini, G. Hütsi, A. Iovino, M. Lewicki, M. Raidal, J. Urrutia, V. Vaskonen and H. Veermäe, [arXiv:2308.08546 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [62] L. Liu, Z. C. Chen and Q. G. Huang, [arXiv:2307.01102 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [63] L. Liu, Z. C. Chen and Q. G. Huang, [arXiv:2307.14911 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [64] E. Madge, E. Morgante, C. Puchades-Ibáñez, N. Ramberg, W. Ratzinger, S. Schenk and P. Schwaller, [arXiv:2306.14856 [hep-ph]].
- [65] M. X. Huang, F. Wang and Y. K. Zhang, [arXiv:2309.06378 [hep-ph]].
- [66] C. Fu, J. Liu, X. Y. Yang, W. W. Yu and Y. Zhang, [arXiv:2308.15329 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [67] R. Maji and W. I. Park, [arXiv:2308.11439 [hep-ph]].
- [68] M. R. Gangopadhyay, V. V. Godithi, K. Ichiki, R. Inui, T. Kajino, A. Manusankar, G. J. Mathews and Yogesh, [arXiv:2309.03101 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [69] P. Schwaller, Phys. Rev. Lett. **115** (2015) no.18, 181101 doi:10.1103/PhysRevLett.115.181101 [arXiv:1504.07263 [hep-ph]].
- [70] W. Ratzinger and P. Schwaller, SciPost Phys. **10** (2021) no.2, 047 doi:10.21468/SciPostPhys.10.2.047 [arXiv:2009.11875 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [71] A. Ashoorioon, K. Rezazadeh and A. Rostami, Phys. Lett. B **835** (2022), 137542 doi:10.1016/j.physletb.2022.137542 [arXiv:2202.01131 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [72] S. Choudhury, M. R. Gangopadhyay and M. Sami, [arXiv:2301.10000 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [73] S. Choudhury, S. Panda and M. Sami, [arXiv:2302.05655 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [74] S. Choudhury, S. Panda and M. Sami, [arXiv:2303.06066 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [75] L. Bian, S. Ge, C. Li, J. Shu and J. Zong, [arXiv:2212.07871 [hep-ph]].
- [76] C. S. Machado, W. Ratzinger, P. Schwaller and B. A. Stefanek, JHEP **01** (2019), 053 doi:10.1007/JHEP01(2019)053 [arXiv:1811.01950 [hep-ph]].
- [77] S. Vagnozzi, Mon. Not. Roy. Astron. Soc. **502** (2021) no.1, L11-L15 doi:10.1093/mnras/slaa203 [arXiv:2009.13432 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [78] S. Kuroyanagi, T. Takahashi and S. Yokoyama, JCAP **01** (2021), 071 doi:10.1088/1475-7516/2021/01/071 [arXiv:2011.03323 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [79] M. Benetti, L. L. Graef and S. Vagnozzi, Phys. Rev. D **105** (2022) no.4, 043520 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.105.043520 [arXiv:2111.04758 [astro-ph.CO]].
- [80] V. Kamali and R. Brandenberger, Phys. Rev. D **101** (2020) no.10, 103512 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.101.103512 [arXiv:2002.09771 [hep-th]].
- [81] R. H. Brandenberger, Class. Quant. Grav. **32** (2015) no.23, 234002 doi:10.1088/0264-9381/32/23/234002 [arXiv:1505.02381 [hep-th]].
- [82] R. H. Brandenberger, S. Kanno, J. Soda, D. A. Easson, J. Khoury, P. Martineau, A. Nayeri and S. P. Patil, JCAP **11** (2006), 009 doi:10.1088/1475-7516/2006/11/009 [arXiv:hep-th/0608186 [hep-th]].
- [83] A. Ashtekar and P. Singh, Class. Quant. Grav. **28** (2011), 213001 doi:10.1088/0264-9381/28/21/213001 [arXiv:1108.0893 [gr-qc]].
- [84] M. Bojowald, G. Calcagni and S. Tsujikawa, JCAP **11** (2011), 046 doi:10.1088/1475-7516/2011/11/046 [arXiv:1107.1540 [gr-qc]].
- [85] J. Mielczarek, Phys. Rev. D **79** (2009), 123520 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.79.123520 [arXiv:0902.2490 [gr-qc]].
- [86] M. Bojowald, Class. Quant. Grav. **26** (2009), 075020 doi:10.1088/0264-9381/26/7/075020 [arXiv:0811.4129 [gr-qc]].
- [87] G. Calcagni and S. Kuroyanagi, JCAP **03** (2021), 019 doi:10.1088/1475-7516/2021/03/019 [arXiv:2012.00170 [gr-qc]].
- [88] A. S. Koshelev, K. Sravan Kumar, A. Mazumdar and A. A. Starobinsky, JHEP **06** (2020), 152 doi:10.1007/JHEP06(2020)152 [arXiv:2003.00629 [hep-th]].
- [89] A. S. Koshelev, K. Sravan Kumar and A. A. Starobinsky, JHEP **03** (2018), 071 doi:10.1007/JHEP03(2018)071 [arXiv:1711.08864 [hep-th]].
- [90] M. Baumgart, J. J. Heckman and L. Thomas, JCAP **07** (2022) no.07, 034 doi:10.1088/1475-7516/2022/07/034 [arXiv:2109.08166 [hep-ph]].
- [91] J. c. Hwang and H. Noh, Phys. Rev. D **71** (2005) 063536 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.71.063536 [gr-qc/0412126].

- [92] S. Nojiri, S. D. Odintsov and M. Sami, Phys. Rev. D **74** (2006) 046004 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.74.046004 [hep-th/0605039].
- [93] G. Cognola, E. Elizalde, S. Nojiri, S. Odintsov and S. Zerbini, Phys. Rev. D **75** (2007) 086002 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.75.086002 [hep-th/0611198].
- [94] S. Nojiri, S. D. Odintsov and M. Sasaki, Phys. Rev. D **71** (2005) 123509 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.71.123509 [hep-th/0504052].
- [95] S. Nojiri and S. D. Odintsov, Phys. Lett. B **631** (2005) 1 doi:10.1016/j.physletb.2005.10.010 [hep-th/0508049].
- [96] M. Satoh, S. Kanno and J. Soda, Phys. Rev. D **77** (2008) 023526 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.77.023526 [arXiv:0706.3585 [astro-ph]].
- [97] P. Kanti, R. Gannouji and N. Dadhich, Phys. Rev. D **92** (2015) no.4, 041302 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.92.041302 [arXiv:1503.01579 [hep-th]].
- [98] P. Kanti, J. Rizos and K. Tamvakis, Phys. Rev. D **59** (1999) 083512 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.59.083512 [gr-qc/9806085].
- [99] B. Kleihaus, J. Kunz and P. Kanti, Phys. Lett. B **804** (2020), 135401 doi:10.1016/j.physletb.2020.135401 [arXiv:1910.02121 [gr-qc]].
- [100] A. Bakopoulos, P. Kanti and N. Pappas, Phys. Rev. D **101** (2020) no.4, 044026 doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.101.044026 [arXiv:1910.14637 [hep-th]].
- [101] S. D. Odintsov, V. K. Oikonomou and F. P. Fronimos, Nucl. Phys. B **958** (2020), 115135 doi:10.1016/j.nuclphysb.2020.115135 [arXiv:2003.13724 [gr-qc]].
- [102] V. K. Oikonomou, Class. Quant. Grav. **38** (2021) no.19, 195025 doi:10.1088/1361-6382/ac2168 [arXiv:2108.10460 [gr-qc]].
- [103] S. Nojiri, S. D. Odintsov and V. K. Oikonomou, Phys. Rept. **692** (2017) 1 [arXiv:1705.11098 [gr-qc]].
- [104] S. Capozziello, M. De Laurentis, Phys. Rept. **509**, 167 (2011);
V. Faraoni and S. Capozziello, Fundam. Theor. Phys. **170** (2010).
- [105] S. Nojiri, S.D. Odintsov, eConf **C0602061**, 06 (2006) [Int. J. Geom. Meth. Mod. Phys. **4**, 115 (2007)].
- [106] S. Nojiri, S.D. Odintsov, Phys. Rept. **505**, 59 (2011);
- [107] A. Afzal *et al.* [NANOGrav], Astrophys. J. Lett. **951** (2023) no.1, L11 doi:10.3847/2041-8213/acdc91 [arXiv:2306.16219 [astro-ph.HE]].