

The Dynamics of Line Defects and Their Sensitivity to the Lattice Structure

Shashin Pavaskar and Ira Z. Rothstein

Department of Physics, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA

In this letter we show that the dispersion relation for the dynamical modes of dislocations in solids is sensitive to the lattice symmetries. In particular, we make the sharp prediction that the transverse oscillations of dislocations obey a canonical phononic linear dispersion relation (so-called type I Goldstone bosons) for generic lattices. However, for systems with a discrete cubic symmetry, the modes obey a quadratic dispersion relation (type II Goldstone bosons). This difference will show up in various observables, including the phonon lifetime. We show that the ratio of the phonon lifetimes, at leading order in the low energy expansion, scales as $\tau_I/\tau_{II} \sim (dE_{II}/dk)/(dE_I/dk) = k/(mv)$ where v is the type I Goldstone velocity and m the mass parameter which appears in the type II dispersion relation.

I. INTRODUCTION

In this paper we explore the dynamics of dislocations in solids using an effective field theory approach. The physics of dislocations is obviously quite mature (see e.g.[1]) but it is perhaps fair to say that highly relevant pieces of the puzzle have yet to be explored. In particular, the dynamics of the excitations of the dislocation itself has only more recently begun to be investigated [2], though we believe that a first principles theoretical underpinning is still lacking, which is a hole we wish to fill herein.

The excitations of dislocations, which were termed “dislons” in [2], are Goldstone bosons for systems with spontaneously broken space-time symmetries. When space-time symmetries are broken, the Goldstone bosons will have either a linear or quadratic dispersion relations, corresponding what what are called type I and type II respectively¹. For broken internal symmetries, the number of type I and II Goldstones obeys $n_I + 2n_{II} = n_{BG}$ [3–5], where n_{BG} is the number of broken generators. However, at the moment there is no such equality known for the Goldstones arising from the breaking of space-time symmetries².

One would expect that the excitations of dislocations would correspond to canonical phonons which are type I. However, it turns out that, for embedded solids, the phonons may be of type I or type II depending on the boundary conditions. In particular, if we consider a one dimensional solid in vacuum, then if the ends are open, the tension will relax to zero, which leads to the vanishing of the quadratic spatial gradient term for the transverse modes in the action. This well known fact, can be understood from the point of view of effective field theory as an example of a generic relaxation mechanism of a Wilson coefficients when the target space is bounded [7]. What

we will show here is that the dispersion relation for the transverse modes of a one dimensional defect, will depend upon the nature of the symmetry of the underlying crystal lattice. This distinction will lead to phenomenological differences.

To study the phenomenology of dislocations we need to understand the interaction with bulk phonons³. However such interactions are non-local⁴ when the phonon is described by $\pi^I(x)$, defined as the displacement of an atom away from its equilibrium position, becomes multi-valued in the presence of a dislocation. This leads to an ambiguity as it is no longer clear which atom “belongs” to which position in the lattice. However, whichever choice is made to fix this ambiguity, the physics should remain unchanged, which is nothing more than a gauge theory description of the physics [8]. For three dimensional solids, which we focus upon, dislocations are co-dimension two objects and, as such, couple topologically to anti-symmetric two form fields. Furthermore, it is known that derivatively coupled scalars, such as ϕ^I , have a dual description in terms of an anti-symmetric two form gauge field [9], which couples locally to the dislocation. This dual description of elasticity theory in three dimensions has been explored in [10], which concentrated on the nature of the melting phase transition. Here we will only be interested in the solid phase, though excitations of the dislocations modes we study here should be expected to play a roll in the transition as well.

The goal of this paper is to develop a first principles theory for the dynamics of dislocations in solids. In particular we will write down an effective field theory of the dislocation excitations which interact with the bulk phonons. A complete analysis of the non-linearities will be left for future work.

¹ More generally type I/II correspond to odd/even powers of the momentum. Furthermore, when rotational invariance is broken one can generate dispersion relations of the form $E = \sqrt{\sum_i c_i k_i^2}$.

² For a derivation of the inequality in the context of translational symmetry breaking see [6].

³ It is also known that electron quasi-particle interactions with dislocations can play an important role in determining the superconducting temperature. This topic goes beyond the scope of this paper.

⁴ In [2] this non-locality is manifest. It is not clear to the authors how to power count in such a circumstance.

A. Conventions

We work with the mostly plus metric $(-, +, +, +)$, greek (space-time) indices run $(0 - 3)$ while Roman capital letters $I = 1 - 3$ correspond to the internal degrees of freedom (or, more precisely, the co-moving coordinate system). Euclidean spatial indices are represented by small Roman letters. Note that after symmetry breaking, we can no longer distinguish between the capital and small Roman indices. We will also reserve the index a to be in the directions transverse to the dislocation, i.e. $a = 1, 2$ while $i = 1 - 3$. We work in units where $\hbar = c = 1$.

II. THE STRING ACTION

To determine the action for the dislocation excitations we will build an effective field theory for an embedded solid. Dislocations share commonalities with fundamental strings as well as with vortices in superfluids, with the important distinctions being the space-time and, in the case of vortices, internal symmetry breaking patterns. The effective field theory of vortices and their interactions in superfluids was worked out in the elegant paper [11], upon which we have leaned. There are some crucial distinctions however, as one might expect, between such vortices and dislocations, that distinguishes our analysis from [11].

We begin by considering the action of a physical/matter string in vacuum, and then will embed the string into a solid. The two scenarios will be distinguished by their space-time symmetry breaking patterns. A physical string is distinguished from a fundamental string in that they lack reparameterization invariance (RPI) along the world sheet since we can now label the matter elements along the string. Put another way, the matter string breaks boost invariance along the directions of the string, and as such, the system includes an additional dynamical degree of freedom corresponding to a longitudinal mode. We choose to work in a covariant language, despite our eventual goal of calculating in the non-relativistic limit, for ease of notation. Thus we will retain RPI and add an additional mode to the action which is given by

$$S = \int d^2\sigma \sqrt{g} F(B) \quad (1)$$

where g is the induced metric

$$g_{\alpha\beta} = \eta_{\mu\nu} \partial_\alpha X^\mu \partial_\beta X^\nu \quad (2)$$

and

$$B = g^{\alpha\beta} \partial_\alpha \phi \partial_\beta \phi. \quad (3)$$

This action contains three physical degrees of freedom, which by appropriate choice of gauge corresponds to the transverse modes X^a and ϕ .

A dislocation is a string embedded in a solid. It is a topological defect which is characterized by a ‘‘Burgers vector’’ which is analogous to the vorticity of a line defect in a superfluid and describes the holonomy of the embedding. We will return to this point when we discuss the coupling of the dislocation to the phononic bulk modes, to which we now turn.

III. EFFECTIVE FIELD THEORY OF SOLIDS

A solid breaks space-time symmetries but simultaneously non-linearly realizes emergent internal symmetries. The details of the symmetry breaking pattern are discussed in [12, 13]. For our purposes it will suffice to recall that all of the Ward identities can be saturated with just the three Goldstone bosons π^I associated with broken translations. The action for these Goldstones can be fixed in a derivative expansion using a coset construction [14] or via a Landau-Ginsburg construction [15], which we follow here.

A solid is defined as a system for which the action is invariant under shifts of the co-moving coordinates, $\phi^I \rightarrow \phi^I + a^I$. These shifts may be taken to be continuous in the long distance limit. Invariance under $SO(3)$ rotations, which act on the capital Roman letters of these coordinates, will not however, be manifest for crystals, but only for ‘‘Jelly like’’ objects. The action is then given by some arbitrary function of the quantity $B^{IJ} = \partial_\mu \phi^I \partial^\mu \phi^J$. In the ground state we may align the comoving coordinates with the space-time coordinates, i.e. $\langle \phi^I \rangle = x^I$. Thus our power counting will be such that the first derivatives of the field ϕ^I can be of order one, and subsequent derivatives will be suppressed. This vev breaks both the space-time and internal translations but preserves the diagonal subgroup. For crystalline systems, there will be unbroken discrete rotations which will play an important role below.

With an eye on the fact that we will eventually be interested in taking the non-relativistic limit, we will follow [16] and write the action in the following form

$$S = - \int d^{D+1}x n(m + U(B^{IJ})), \quad (4)$$

where $n = \sqrt{\text{Det}(B^{IJ})}$ is the number density, m is interpreted as the mass of the atoms sitting at the lattice sights and U is the internal energy functional.

We may now consider excitations around the ground state via

$$\phi^I(\vec{x}, t) = x^I + \pi^I(\vec{x}, t) \quad (5)$$

where $\pi^I(\vec{x}, t)$ are the phonons. To obtain the action for the phonons, one can expand the function eq.(4) around the background $B^{IJ} = \delta^{IJ}$. Expanding to quadratic order leaves

$$S = \bar{n} \int d^4x \left[\frac{1}{2} m \dot{\pi}^2 - \lambda_{IJ} (2\partial^I \pi^J + \partial_\mu \pi^I \partial^\mu \pi^J) - 2C^{IJKL} (\partial^I \pi^J) (\partial^K \pi^L) \right] + \dots \quad (6)$$

We have Taylor expanded the functional $U(B^{IJ}) = U(\delta_{IJ}) + \frac{\partial U}{\partial B_{IJ}} (B^{IJ} - \langle B^{IJ} \rangle) + \dots$

$$U(B^{IJ}) = \lambda_{IJ} (2\partial^I \pi^J + \partial_\mu \pi^I \partial^\mu \pi^J) + 2C^{IJKL} (\partial^I \pi^J) (\partial^K \pi^L) + \dots \quad (7)$$

We have defined $\frac{\partial U}{\partial B_{IJ}} \equiv \lambda_{IJ}$ and the elastic moduli tensor

$$C_{IJKL} \equiv \frac{\partial^2 U}{\partial B_{IJ} \partial B_{KL}}. \quad (8)$$

The form of λ_{IJ} and C^{IJKL} depends upon the lattice symmetries. For a cubic lattice $\lambda_{IJ} \sim \delta_{IJ}$, but to achieve isotropy at rank four we need icosohedral symmetry [17], in which case we would write

$$C^{IJKL} = c_2 \delta^{IJ} \delta^{KL} + c_3 (\delta^{IK} \delta^{JL} + \delta^{IL} \delta^{JK}). \quad (9)$$

For a general crystal one would need to decompose C^{IJKL} into the proper invariant tensors for the crystal group of interest. Nonetheless one may have completely isotropic solids if they embody many crystalline domains or are glassy [18], in which case dislocations may no longer be relevant. However, no matter the crystal structure it will always be true that λ_{IJ} will be symmetric and C_{IJKL} will be symmetric in IJ and KL as well as in the interchange of the pair.

Notice that at this point the action depends upon both the symmetric as well as the anti-symmetric pieces of the phonon gradients $\partial_I \pi_J$ at quadratic order and above. For a finite sample, under the assumption that any external applied stresses are isotropic, the anti-symmetric part can be set to zero at the cost of adding boundary terms [7].

IV. THE DISLOCATION ACTION

Let us return to the action for a dislocation embedded in a solid. In this context we now have at our disposal two bulk metrics with which to form a world-sheet metric $\eta_{\mu\nu}$ and $G_{\mu\nu} = \partial_\mu \phi^I \partial_\nu \phi^J \beta_{IJ}$ which defines the distance between lattice point in a given configuration of the solid. The tensor β_{IJ} encodes the discrete lattice symmetries of the solid. In the background of dislocation the space develops a non-zero torsion [8] which depends upon the Burgers vector n^I which is defined as the holonomy

$$n^I = \oint d\phi^I \quad (10)$$

which is topological and is non-zero as long as the loop surrounds the defect.

Thus we may define an additional world-sheet metric defined as

$$h_{\alpha\beta} = G_{\mu\nu} \partial_\alpha X^\mu \partial_\beta X^\nu. \quad (11)$$

We now have many more invariants that we may write down. To be as general as possible we may then consider actions of the form⁵

$$S = \int d^2\sigma \sqrt{-g} F(g^{\alpha\beta} \partial_\alpha \phi \partial_\beta \phi, h^{\alpha\beta} \partial_\alpha \phi \partial_\beta \phi) \quad (12)$$

In principle F may depend upon contractions of g and h as well, as in the case of vortices [11], but these terms will only contribute to non-linearities which are not of interest for this paper.

To determine the dispersion relation for the transverse modes X^a , we choose the defect to lie on the z -axis and work in the gauge $X^0 = \sigma_1$, and $X^3 = \sigma_2 = z$. The solid string coordinate will then be expanded around this configuration, that is $\phi = z$. Then since, we are only interested in the dispersion relation, and since the time derivatives will always be quadratic (another distinction from the vortices where the Kalb-Ramond term, to be discussed below, gives a linear in time derivative), we may consider the action for static configuration, and given our gauge choice we may write

$$S_{stat} = \int dt dz [\sqrt{g_{zz}} F(g^{zz} (\partial_z \phi)^2, h^{zz} (\partial_z \phi)^2)]. \quad (13)$$

Expanding out to quadratic order in the fluctuations we have

$$S_{stat}^{(2)} \approx \int dt dz \left[\left(\frac{\bar{F}}{2} - \dot{\bar{F}} \right) (\partial_z X^a)^2 - \bar{F}' \frac{\bar{G}^{ab}}{\bar{G}_{zz}^2} (\partial_z X^a) (\partial_z X^b) - \frac{1}{2} \bar{F}'' \left(\frac{\bar{G}_{az}}{\bar{G}_{zz}^2} \partial_z X^a \right)^2 \right], \quad (14)$$

where dots/primes denote differentiation with respect to the first/second arguments and the bar denotes a ground state value.

It would seem that this is the end of the story in the sense that these modes will be of type I. However, for a physical, finite solid, we must choose a set of boundary conditions. In particular, we must specify whether not the sample is stressed. For an unstressed sample we may take the boundary conditions to be open such that in the ground state $\langle \mathcal{T}_{zz} \rangle = 0$, which imposes conditions on the Wilson coefficients in (14) via the relation

$$\mathcal{T}_{zz} = 2\dot{\bar{F}} + \frac{2}{\bar{G}_{zz}} \bar{F}' - \bar{F} = 0 \quad (15)$$

⁵ We have assumed that the volume element is controlled by the space-time metric. From the point of view of the EFT, we should also include a term with $\sqrt{-g}$ replaced by $\sqrt{-h}$. Doing so however, does not effect the results for the scaling derivatives.

One can see that when the metric $G_{\mu\nu}$ is isotropic, the vanishing of the stress tensor implies that the quadratic gradient term for the transverse perturbations also vanishes. Hence the leading gradient energy term for the transverse excitation must start at quartic order, which will only arise once we allow for higher derivative corrections to the action (12). The ground state metric will be isotropic for crystals with cubic symmetry, where the only invariant rank two tensor is the identity.

V. COUPLING OF THE DISLOCATION TO BULK PHONONS

It is interesting to contemplate the phenomenological distinctions between the type I and type II realizations. In addition to changing the thermodynamics, interactions between bulk phonons and dislocations will affect the phonon lifetime in the solid since the phonon will scatter off of the dislocation and will be dissipated into dislocation excitations.

Until now we have discussed the effective field theory for solids in terms of the co-moving coordinates $\phi^I(\vec{x}, t)$ of the individual particles. However, as previously mentioned, the coupling of $\phi^I(\vec{x}, t)$ to these defects is non-local in this canonical description. Something similar happens in the case of superfluids, where it was shown that the non-locality can be eliminated by going to a dual (gauged) description [9, 11]. In 3+1 solids, one may introduce an anti-symmetric two-form fields $b_{\mu\nu}^I$ with $I = 1, 2, 3$ to describe the low energy dynamics [10] in such a way as to leave local couplings to the dislocation.

The idea [9] is that when the theory is derivatively coupled we may change variables from $\partial_\mu \phi^I$ to F_μ^I via a Legendre transformation. Given a lagrangian $\mathcal{F}(B^{IJ})$ we may write

$$F_\mu^I = \frac{\delta \mathcal{F}(B^{IJ})}{\delta \partial^\mu \phi^I}, \quad (16)$$

The equations of motion for ϕ^I leads to the condition $\partial_\mu F^{\mu I} = 0$, which can be solved by defining

$$F_\mu^I = \epsilon_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} \partial^\nu b^{\rho\sigma I} \quad (17)$$

where $b^{\rho\sigma I}$ is the anti-symmetric vector valued two form field. F_μ^I is invariant under the gauge transformation

$$b_{\mu\nu}^I \rightarrow b_{\mu\nu}^I + \partial_\mu \xi_\nu^I - \partial_\nu \xi_\mu^I. \quad (18)$$

Now using our action in (4), we find that at leading order, the dual fields are given by ⁶

$$\begin{aligned} F^{IJ} &= -4\bar{n} \mathcal{C}^{IJKL} \partial^K \pi^L \\ F^{0I} &= m\bar{n} \dot{\pi}^I \end{aligned} \quad (19)$$

⁶ Here we have utilized the boundary terms to set the ‘‘rotation’’ $\partial_i \pi_j \epsilon_{ijk}$ to zero. This also leads to a vanishing vev for the dual fields.

We can decompose the two form in terms of two vector fields A_i^a and B_i^a via [11]

$$b_{jk}^I = \epsilon_{ijk} B_i^I, \quad b_{0k}^I = A_k^I. \quad (20)$$

We then find

$$F_A^I = -\dot{B}_A^I + (\vec{\nabla} \times \vec{A})_A^I, \quad F_0^I = \vec{\nabla} \cdot \vec{B}^I \quad (21)$$

Using (19) and (21), one obtains a non-local relation between the scalar and the dual fields, which can be used to derive the dual lagrangian [10].

As we have emphasized the central point of using the dual description is to construct a local effective action which captures the coupling of the phonons to the dislocation fields, which is encoded in the Kalb-Ramond action. The Kalb-Ramond action describes the leading coupling between the dislocation and the phonon gauge fields. The current associated with a p -dimensional defect is a $p + 1$ form and hence a dislocation current in 3+1 dimensions is a two-form given by

$$J_I^{\mu\nu}(x) = n_I \int d\rho d\tau \partial_\tau X^{[\mu} \partial_\rho X^{\nu]} \delta^{(4)}(x - X(\tau, \rho)) \quad (22)$$

where $v^\mu = \partial_\tau X^\mu$ is the velocity of the dislocation line.

As was shown in [19] the form of this current along with the particle number conservation leads to the glide constraint, which states the the dislocation is limited to motion in the direction parallel to the Burgers vector. The Kalb-Ramond action takes the form

$$S_{KR} = n^I \int d\tau d\rho \partial_\rho X^\mu \partial_\tau X^\nu b_{\mu\nu}^I \quad (23)$$

which is manifestly gauge invariant and unique. One can notice that this term has no derivatives acting on the two-form $b_{\mu\nu}^I$ which leads to a long range field. This should be contrasted with the scalar field theory for phonons where ϕ^I always comes with a derivative acting on it, and the long range field can then only arise if the couplings are non-local as previously mentioned.

VI. THE PHONON LIFETIME

A. Phonon absorption into a dislon

As an application of the effective theory, we will study the process in which a phonon decays into two transverse dislons on the dislocation worldsheet. For a static dislocation, the leading order interaction between the dislons and the phonon is obtained from the Kalb-Ramond term in the action by expanding the dynamical field $\vec{X}(t, \sigma)$ about its background value.

$$S = n^I \int dt dz \epsilon_{ab} B_3^I \partial_t X^a \partial_z X^b \quad (24)$$

For simplicity we will assume that $G_{\mu\nu}$, while anisotropic, is nonetheless diagonal. Otherwise the transverse and longitudinal dislons will mix which, while not an obstruction to the calculation, would serve only to complicate matters and introduce model dependence. Given that the interaction Lagrangian is identical, at leading order, for both cases the ratio of the lifetimes will only deviate from unity due to the difference in the available phase space as well as the normalization of the fields. Assuming that the difference in the norms contributes a small change in the ratio of lifetimes, the ratio of phase space factor will then give

$$\tau_I/\tau_{II} \sim (dE_{II}/dk)/(dE_I/dk) = k/(mv) \quad (25)$$

where $E_I = vk$ and $E_{II} = k^2/m$, where m is the analog of the effective mass in a ferro-magnet. Given a particular model, one could calculate the norm of the individual life-times. Also notice that the velocities of the dislons can differ in the anisotropic case but for the sake of simplicity, we have taken them to be identical. This difference in lifetimes will lead to differences in transport properties between materials with and without discrete cubic symmetries. Of course, this effect will only become prominent given a sufficiently large dislocation densities.

VII. CONCLUSION

In this paper, we have presented an effective field theory of dislocations in solids. We have emphasized the

interesting fact that the dispersion relation for the excitations of dislocations, called “dislons”, depends upon the UV physics through the discrete symmetries of the lattice. For lattices with at least cubic symmetry the energy is quadratic while less symmetric lattices lead to a linear dispersion relation. The boundary conditions play a crucial roll in leading to this effect, which disappears when the solid is stressed. The distinction between these two cases will show up, among other experiments, in the phonon lifetime. From a formal point of view we see that that the number of type I (n_I) versus type II (n_{II}) Goldstones, when space-time symmetries are broken, is sensitive to the discrete symmetries of the lattice. This is as opposed to the case of internal symmetries where $n_I + 2n_{II}$ is fixed by number of broken generators of continuous symmetries.

VIII. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank Riccardo Penco for many discussions on [11]. We also benefited from discussions with Amit Acharya and Alberto Nicolis. IZR is supported by DOE grants DE-FG02-04ER41338 and FG02-06ER41449.

-
- [1] J. P. Hirth and J. Lothe, *Theory of dislocations*, (1982).
 - [2] M. L. et. al., Theory of electron–phonon–dislon interacting system—toward a quantized theory of dislocations, *New Journal of Physics* **20** (2018).
 - [3] H. B. Nielsen and S. Chadha, On How to Count Goldstone Bosons, *Nucl. Phys. B* **105**, 445 (1976).
 - [4] T. Schäfer, D. T. Son, M. A. Stephanov, D. Toublan, and J. J. M. Verbaarschot, Kaon condensation and Goldstone’s theorem, *Phys. Lett. B* **522**, 67 (2001), [arXiv:hep-ph/0108210](#).
 - [5] H. Watanabe and H. Murayama, Unified Description of Nambu-Goldstone Bosons without Lorentz Invariance, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **108**, 251602 (2012), [arXiv:1203.0609 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [6] H. Watanabe and T. Brauner, Spontaneous breaking of continuous translational invariance, *Phys. Rev. D* **85**, 085010 (2012), [arXiv:1112.3890 \[cond-mat.stat-mech\]](#).
 - [7] A. Nicolis and I. Z. Rothstein, Apparent Fine Tunings for Field Theories with Broken Space-Time Symmetries, (2022), [arXiv:2212.08976 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [8] H. Kleinert, *Multivalued fields in Condensed Matter, Electromagnetism, and Gravitation* (2008).
 - [9] D. Z. Freedman and P. K. Townsend, Antisymmetric Tensor Gauge Theories and Nonlinear Sigma Models, *Nucl. Phys. B* **177**, 282 (1981).
 - [10] A. J. Beekman, J. Nissinen, K. Wu, and J. Zaanen, Dual gauge field theory of quantum liquid crystals in three dimensions, *Phys. Rev. B* **96**, 165115 (2017).
 - [11] B. Horn, A. Nicolis, and R. Penco, Effective string theory for vortex lines in fluids and superfluids, *JHEP* **10**, 153, [arXiv:1507.05635 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [12] A. Nicolis, R. Penco, F. Piazza, and R. Rattazzi, Zoology of condensed matter: Framids, ordinary stuff, extraordinary stuff, *JHEP* **06**, 155, [arXiv:1501.03845 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [13] A. Nicolis, R. Penco, and R. A. Rosen, Relativistic Fluids, Superfluids, Solids and Supersolids from a Coset Construction, *Phys. Rev. D* **89**, 045002 (2014), [arXiv:1307.0517 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [14] S. Pavaskar, R. Penco, and I. Z. Rothstein, An effective field theory of magnetoelasticity, *SciPost Phys.* **12**, 155 (2022), [arXiv:2112.13873 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [15] S. Dubovsky, T. Grégoire, A. Nicolis, and R. Rattazzi, Null energy condition and superluminal propagation, *Journal of High Energy Physics* **2006**, 025 (2006).
 - [16] D. E. Soper, *Classical Field Theory* (1976).
 - [17] J. Kang and A. Nicolis, Anisotropic tensor modes from icosahedral inflation, (2018), [arXiv:1807.03924 \[hep-th\]](#).
 - [18] P. Chaikin and T. Lubensky, Principles of condensed matter physics, in *Principles of Condensed Matter Physics* (Cambridge University Press, 2000).

- [19] A. J. Beekman, J. Nissinen, K. Wu, K. Liu, R.-J. Slager, Z. Nussinov, V. Cvetkovic, and J. Zaanen, Dual gauge field theory of quantum liquid crystals in two dimensions, *Physics Reports* **683**, 1 (2017).