# arXiv:2208.10349v5 [cond-mat.stat-mech] 1 Jul 2024

# LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRAL

RONG QIANG WEI

ABSTRACT. There have been a lot of methods aimed at studying the limiting free energy per particle (LFEPP) for 3D Ising model in absence of an external magnetic field. These methods are elegant, but most of them are complicated and often require specialized knowledge and special skills. Here we approximate the LFEPP for Ising model from its corresponding functional integral. The resulting Ising LFEPP, which includes an integral of a special function, is exact asymptotically. For 1D and 2D Ising model, this LFEPPs in two limiting cases are consistent or formally consistent with those well-known, respectively. Based on these consistences, we infer the LFEPPs for 3D model in these special cases. Additionally, with this LFEPP, we derive a further approximate one for 3D Ising model, from which we infer the critical temperature  $z_c \approx 0.21 \sim 0.22$ . Furthermore, we suggest similar LFEPPs for 1D-3D Ising models with an external magnetic field, although they are too complicated.

### Keywords:

3D Ising model, Free energy, Functional integral, Thermodynamic limit

### Contents

1. Introduction	1
2. Functional integral and the LFEPP of Ising model	2
3. LFEPP of Ising model in some special cases	5
3.1. $z \rightarrow 0$	6
3.2. $z \to \infty$	7
3.3. $\sqrt{2}z\lambda'_n t \leq \pi$	8
4. Discussions	10
4.1. A further approximate LFEPP of Ising model	10
4.2. The LFEPP of Ising model in a non-zero external magnetic field	12
4.3. On the method here and further work	14
Appendix A. Matrix $K_{ij}$	15
Appendix B. Calculating $I_p$	18
Appendix C. On $N^{-1} \sum_{p=1}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$ when $N \to \infty$	20
Appendix D. On $\sum_{p=2}^{N} \Phi \lambda'_p$ when $N \to \infty$	24
Appendix E. $\frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]}{N}$ when $\lambda_p t \to \infty$	25
Appendix F. Further approximating $f(\lambda_p, t)$	27
Appendix G. $\sum_{i=2}^{N} \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1)(p-1)$ and $\sum_{i=2}^{N} \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1)(p-1)$ when $N \to \infty$	30
Appendix H. $\overline{Z}$ and $I_p$ for Ising model in a non-zero external magnetic field	31
References	36

### 1. INTRODUCTION

The famous Ising model looks very simple, which consists of a lattice with a binary magnetic polarity (or "spin") assigned to each point. The nearest-neighbor Ising model without an external magnetic field in *D*-dimensions (D = 1, 2, 3, ...) is defined in terms of the following Hamiltonian (eg., Huang, 1987),

(1) 
$$\mathcal{H} = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i,j=1}^{N} K_{ij} s_i s_j$$

where, *i* and *j* are the sites  $\mathbf{r_i}$  and  $\mathbf{r_j}$  of a *D*-dimensional hyper cubic lattice with *N* sites, respectively.  $s_i = \pm 1$  are the two possible states of the *z*-components of spins localized at the lattice sites.  $K_{ij}$  denotes the exchange interaction between spins localized at  $\mathbf{r_i}$  and  $\mathbf{r_j}$ ,

(2) 
$$K_{ij} = \begin{cases} z & \text{if } i \text{ and } j \text{ are the nearest neighbors} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

where  $z = \beta \epsilon = \frac{\epsilon}{kT}$ ,  $\epsilon$  the interaction energy, T the temperature, and k Boltzmann constant.

Such a simple model has played an important role in the theory of ferromagnetism, phase transitions and many other physical branches (Fang et al., 2022), and it has been found new applications in many areas of science, eg., neuroscience, sea ice and even voter models (Viswanathan et al., 2022).

Most thermodynamic functions of this model depend on the evaluation of its LFEPP. For 1D Ising model with periodic boundary condition, the exact LFEPP,  $-\frac{\psi}{kT}$ , is,

(3) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log\left(\cosh 2z - \sinh 2z \cos \omega_1\right) \mathrm{d}\omega_1$$

where we use the LFEPP in terms of integral from Berlin and Kac (1952) rather than that from Kramers and Wannier (1941) for comparison later.

For 2D Ising model imposed on periodic boundary condition, the LFEPP was evaluated by Onsager (1944) as the following,

(4) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left[\cosh^2 2z - \sinh 2z(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2)\right] d\omega_1 d\omega_2$$

where for comparison later, we also use the LFEPP in terms of integral from Berlin and Kac (1952) rather than that from Onsager (1944).

However, there is still no an accepted LFEPP for 3D Ising model, although for this purpose there have been lots of methods or approaches which are valid for 1D, 2D and/or high-dimensional (D > 3) model. The most famous ones are Mean-Field Theory (eg., Bragg and William, 1934, 1935; Williams, 1935; Landau, 1937), Transfer Matrix Method (Onsager, 1944),  $\varphi^4$  – Theory (Ginzburg and Landau, 1950), Variational Calculation (Thompson,

1965). Especially the Transfer Matrix Method and the similar ones are popular in the later studies (eg., Zhang, 2007), although their results are questionable (eg., Wu et al., 2008a; Wu et al., 2008b; Fisher and Perk, 2016; Perk, 2013). Transfer Matrix Method requires specialized and abstract knowledge of spinor algebra or operator algebra, which is unfamiliar to most non-professionals. In 2015, Kocharovsky and Kocharovsky (2015) presented a method of the recurrence equations for partial contractions for 3D model, and they said that "Towards an exact solution for the three-dimensional Ising model". However, it can also be found that their method is too complicated and specialized.

Here we study the LFEPP of Ising Model from its corresponding functional integral. To our finite knowledge, we dare not say that this method is the easiest, but we think it is simpler and more easily understood. The main part of the finial LFEPP is also an integral representation. Based on this LFEPP, we obtain a further approximate one for the 3D Ising model by the approach of economization of power series. These LFEPP representations and their further generalization show that the LFEPP of 3D Ising model with or without an external magnetic field can be mathematically solvable, although the expressions of LFEPP are complicated. It should be pointed out that we still have not completely solved this problem because there appear some new difficulties.

### 2. FUNCTIONAL INTEGRAL AND THE LFEPP OF ISING MODEL

The partition function for the Ising model (1) is (eg., Ginzburg and Landau, 1950),

(5) 
$$\mathcal{Z} = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \exp\left(\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} K_{ij} s_i s_j\right)$$

Applying the Hubbard-Stratonovich transformation (Ginzburg and Landau, 1950; Amit et al., 2005; Kopietz et al., 2010; Also in Appendix H), the partition function can be transformed into,

(6)  
$$\mathcal{Z} = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \left[ \frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N} \right]^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{k=1}^N \mathrm{d}\phi_k$$
$$\times \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j + \sum_{ij} s_i K_{ij} \phi_j\right)$$

where  $K_{ij}$  is a circulant matrix when an appropriate periodicity is used on the boundary of Ising model, and it is assumed to be positive defined when  $N \to \infty$ . Details including eigenvalues and eigenvectors of  $K_{ij}$  can be found in Appendix A (A.1-A.3,A.8).

(6) expresses the partition function of the Ising model in terms of an N-dimensional integral over variables  $\phi_i$ , and the infinite-dimensional integral obtained from it when  $N \to \infty$  is called the functional integral of the Ising model. The physical meaning of the  $\phi_i$  is the fluctuating magnetization per site, for its expectation value is simply the

magnetization per site (eg., Ginzburg and Landau, 1950; Amit et al., 2005; Kopietz et al., 2010). Functional integral of the Ising model is an exact transcription of the original model (5).

In the second row of (6), it can be found that only  $\sum_{ij} s_i K_{ij} \phi_j$  in the exponential has a dependence on the  $s_i$ . Therefore we can calculate  $L = \sum_{\{s_i=\pm 1\}} \exp\left(\sum_{ij} s_i K_{ij} \phi_j\right)$  as follows,

(7)  
$$L = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \exp\left(\sum_p s_i V_{ip} V_{pi} K_{ij} V_{jp} V_{pj} \phi_j\right)$$
$$= \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \prod_p \prod_i \exp\left[s_i \left(V_{ip} \lambda_p y_p\right)\right]$$
$$= \prod_p \prod_i \left[\frac{\exp\left(V_{ip} \lambda_p y_p\right) + \exp\left(-V_{ip} \lambda_p y_p\right)}{2}\right]$$
$$= \prod_p \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip} \lambda_p y_p\right)\right]\right\}$$

where  $V_{ij}$  are the real, orthogonal, unity eigenvectors corresponding to eigenvalues  $\lambda_p$  of  $K_{ij}$  (A.8); "2" can be understood as a normalized factor (to unity). Einstein summation convention is used in the first row of (7), for example,  $y_p = V_{pj}\phi_j = \sum_j V_{pj}\phi_j$ .

Inserting (7) into (6) and noticing the Jacobian unity, now the partition function (6) is,

$$\mathcal{Z} = \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^{N}}\right]^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{p=1}^{N} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}y_{p}^{2}\right) \\ \times \exp\left\{\sum_{i} \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip}\lambda_{p}y_{p}\right)\right]\right\} dy_{p} \\ (8) = \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^{N}}\right]^{1/2} \prod_{p=1} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}y_{p}^{2}\right) \times \exp\left\{\sum_{i} \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip}\lambda_{p}y_{p}\right)\right]\right\} dy_{p} \\ = \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^{N}}\right]^{1/2} \prod_{p=1} I_{p}$$

Expression (8) is equivalent to (6), and we call it also the functional integral of the Ising model. Once  $I_p$  is calculated, the LFEPP,  $-\frac{\psi}{kT}$ , is,

(9) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \lim_{N \to \infty} \frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N}$$

According to Appendix B,  $I_p$  in (8) can be transformed into two integrals of (10) as the following,

(10)

$$I_{p} = \begin{cases} N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t^{2} + \log\left(\cosh\left(\lambda_{1}t\right)\right)\right]\right\} dt & p = 1\\ N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t^{2} + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2}\log\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi\right)\right] d\xi\right]\right\} dt & p > 1\end{cases}$$

These integrals have been already calculated with Laplace's asymptotic method in the Appendix B. For p = 1,

(11) 
$$I_{1} \sim \begin{cases} 2 \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t_{s_{1}}^{2} + \log\left(\cosh\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s_{1}}\right)\right)\right]\right\}\sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{|-\lambda_{1}+\lambda_{1}^{2}\mathrm{sech}^{2}\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s_{1}}\right)|}} & t_{s1} \neq 0 \\ 2\sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2|-\lambda_{1}+\lambda_{1}^{2}|}} & t_{s1} = 0 \end{cases}$$

And for p > 1,

(12) 
$$I_p \sim \begin{cases} 2 \exp\left[Nf(\lambda_p, t_{sp})\right] \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\left|-\lambda_p + \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t_{sp})\right|}} & t_{sp} \neq 0\\ 2 \exp\left[Nf(\lambda_p, 0)\right] \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2\left|-\lambda_p + \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, 0)\right|}} & t_{sp} = 0 \end{cases}$$

where  $f(\lambda_p, t) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_0^{\pi/2} \log\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t\sin\xi\right)\right] d\xi = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$ , and details of  $f(\lambda_p, t), \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t), t_{s1}$  and  $t_{sp}$  are in Appendix B. Assuming that  $t_{sp} \neq 0$  and inserting  $I_p$  above into (8), we can solve the functional

Assuming that  $t_{sp} \neq 0$  and inserting  $I_p$  above into (8), we can solve the functional integral of the Ising model, or its equivalence (6). Finally, we obtain the partition function of N-sites Ising model in the following,

(13)  
$$\mathcal{Z} = \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^{N}}\right]^{1/2} I_{1} \prod_{p=2} I_{p}$$
$$\sim 2 \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t_{s1}^{2} + \log\left(\cosh\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s1}\right)\right)\right]\right\} \left|1 - \lambda_{1}\mathrm{sech}^{2}\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s1}\right)\right|^{-1/2}$$
$$\times \prod_{p=2} 2 \exp[Nf(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})] \left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}\right)}{\lambda_{p}}\right|^{-1/2}$$

where det  $\mathbf{K} = \prod_{p=1} \lambda_p$ . And,

4

$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = \frac{\log 2}{N} + \left\{ -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 t_{s1}^2 + \log\left[\cosh\left(t_{s1}\lambda_1\right)\right] \right\} - \frac{1}{2N}\log\left|1 - \lambda_1 \mathrm{sech}^2\left(\lambda_1 t_{s1}\right)\right| + \frac{(N-1)\log 2}{N} + \sum_{p=2}^N f(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) + \frac{1}{N}\sum_{p=2}^N \left[ -\frac{1}{2}\log\left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left(2\frac{\lambda_p}{2}, t_{sp}\right)}{2\frac{\lambda_p}{2}}\right| \right]$$

Now we can get easily the LFEPP from (14) when  $N \to \infty$  according to Appendix C. It should be pointed out that expression (13) and (14) are applicable to any dimensional Ising models. However, the following are only applicable to 1-3D models, because the proofs in Appendix C are only for them. According to (C.1), (C.2) and (C.3), the LFEPP of 1-3D Ising model can be expressed in terms of integral,

For 1D Ising model, (14) reads,

(15)  
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \lim_{N \to \infty} \frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = -zt_{s1}^{2} + \log\left[\cosh\left(2zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}) \\ -\frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{2\pi}\int_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left(2z\cos\omega_{1}, t_{sp}\right)}{2z\cos\omega_{1}}\right| d\omega_{1}$$

For 2D Ising model, (14) reads,

(16)  
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = -2zt_{s1}^{2} + \log\left[\cosh\left(4zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})$$
$$-\frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{(2\pi)^{2}} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left[2z\left(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2}\right), t_{sp}\right]}{2z\left(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2}\right)}\right| d\omega_{1}d\omega_{2}$$

For 3D Ising model, (14) reads,

(17)  
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = -3zt_{s1}^{2} + \log\left[\cosh\left(6zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})$$
$$-\frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{(2\pi)^{3}} \iiint_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left[2z\left(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2} + \cos\omega_{3}\right), t_{sp}\right]}{2z\left(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2} + \cos\omega_{3}\right)}\right| d\omega_{1}d\omega_{2}d\omega_{3}$$

# 3. LFEPP of Ising model in some special cases

To our limited knowledge, we infer that  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t) \ (= \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} \log \left( \cosh \left( \sqrt{2} \lambda_p t \sin \xi \right) \right) d\xi )$ is a special function, resulting in that we can not obtain easily  $t_{sp}$  and further evaluate  $f(\lambda_p, t_{sp})$  and  $\mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t_{sp})$ . In the following some approximate LFEPPs to (14)-(17) are taken into account. Since we only consider the behaviour of t near  $t_{sp}$ , t is finite. 3.1.  $z \to 0$ . In this case,  $\sqrt{2\lambda_p t} \ (= \sqrt{2}z\lambda'_p t)$  is in some sense small and since

$$\log \cosh \left( x \right) \approx \frac{x^2}{2} - \frac{x^4}{12} \qquad (x \to 0)$$

(18)  
$$f(\lambda_p, t) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$$
$$\approx -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \frac{(\lambda_p t)^2}{2} - \frac{(\lambda_p t)^4}{8}$$

and,

(19) 
$$\begin{cases} \frac{\mathrm{d}f}{\mathrm{d}t} = -\lambda_p t + \lambda_p^2 t - \frac{\lambda_p^4}{2} t^3\\ \frac{\mathrm{d}^2 f}{\mathrm{d}t^2} = -\lambda_p + \lambda_p^2 - \frac{3\lambda_p^4}{2} t^2 \end{cases}$$

From Eq. (19) we know that  $t_{sp} = 0$ . Since  $t_{sp} = 0$ ,

(20) 
$$\begin{cases} f(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) = 0\\ \frac{\mathrm{d}^2 f}{\mathrm{d}t^2}|_{t=t_{sp}} = -\lambda_p + \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) = -\lambda_p + \lambda_p^2 \ (<0) \end{cases}$$

With Laplace's method and directly from Eq. (14), we obtain (Note that  $t_{s1} = 0$ ),

(21) 
$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = \log 2 + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^{N} \left( -\frac{1}{2} \log \left| -1 + 2\frac{\lambda_p}{2} \right| \right)$$

Finally, we obtain the LFEPP of Ising model according to Appendix C. Namely, For 1D Ising model,

(22) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \lim_{N \to \infty} \frac{\log \mathcal{Z}(\lambda_p/2)}{N} = \log 2 - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log \left[1 - 2\left(z\cos\omega_1\right)\right] d\omega_1$$

For 2D Ising model,

(23) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \log 2 - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \log \left[1 - 2z \left(\cos \omega_1 + \cos \omega_2\right)\right] d\omega_1 d\omega_2$$

Using  $\cosh 2z \to 1$  and  $\sinh 2z \to 2z$  when  $z \to 0$ , we can transform Eq. (3) and Eq. (4) into the following,

(24) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log(1 - 2z \cos \omega_1) d\omega_1$$

(25) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left[1 - 2z(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2)\right] d\omega_1 d\omega_2$$

It can be found that (24) and (22) are nearly the same, except the minus sign before the integral representation and "log 2" which will be discussed later. So do (25) and (23). Therefore, we can infer the LFEPP for 3D Ising model from (21) when  $z \to 0$  as the following,

(26) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \log 2 - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \iint_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log \left[1 - 2z \left(\cos \omega_1 + \cos \omega_2 + \cos \omega_3\right)\right] \, \mathrm{d}\omega_1 \mathrm{d}\omega_2 \mathrm{d}\omega_3$$

3.2.  $z \to \infty$ . Let us assume that z is in some sense large. Although in this case that  $\lambda_p t = z \lambda'_p t \to \infty$ ,  $\frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]}{N}$  in (B.5) can also be omitted according to Appendix E.

When  $z \to \infty$ ,  $t_{s1} \to 1$ ;  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t) \to \frac{2\sqrt{2\lambda_p}}{\pi}t - \log 2$ . Thus,

(27) 
$$\begin{cases} f(\lambda_p, t) & \sim -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \frac{2\sqrt{2}\lambda_p}{\pi}t - \log 2\\ \frac{\mathrm{d}f}{\mathrm{d}t} & \sim -\lambda_p t + \frac{2\sqrt{2}\lambda_p}{\pi}\\ \frac{\mathrm{d}^2 f}{\mathrm{d}t^2} & \sim -\lambda_p \end{cases}$$

From (27) we know that  $t_{sp} \to \frac{2\sqrt{2}}{\pi}$ ,  $\mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) \to 0$  and  $f(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) \sim \frac{4}{\pi^2}\lambda_p - \log 2$ . Therefore,

(28) 
$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = \frac{\log 2}{N} + \left\{ -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 + \log\left[\cosh\left(\lambda_1\right)\right] \right\} - \frac{1}{2N}\log\left|1 - \lambda_1\operatorname{sech}^2\left(\lambda_1\right)\right| + \frac{(N-1)\log 2}{N} + \sum_{p=2}^N \left(\frac{4}{\pi^2}\lambda_p - \log 2\right)$$

Since  $\lambda_p = z \lambda'_p$  is large,

(29) 
$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} \to \frac{\lambda_1}{2} + \frac{4}{\pi^2} z \sum_{p=2}^N \lambda'_p$$

From (29) and Appendix D, we can get,

(30) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \left(1 - \frac{4}{\pi^2}\right)z$$

for 1D Ising model. For 2D Ising model,

(31) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = 2\left(1 - \frac{4}{\pi^2}\right)z$$

On the other hand, for 1D Ising model, according to  $(3)^{1}$ ,

(32)  

$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left(\cosh 2z - \sinh 2z \cos \omega_{1}\right) d\omega_{1}$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left(\frac{e^{2z}}{2} - \frac{e^{2z}}{2} \cos \omega_{1}\right) d\omega_{1}$$

$$= z \left(1 - \frac{\log 2}{z}\right)$$

$$\rightarrow z \qquad (z \rightarrow \infty)$$

According to (4) for 2D Ising model,

$$\begin{aligned} -\frac{\psi}{kT} &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log\left[\cosh^2 2z - \sinh 2z(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2)\right] d\omega_1 d\omega_2 \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log\left[\frac{e^{4z}}{4} - \frac{e^{2z}}{2}(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2)\right] d\omega_1 d\omega_2 \\ &= 2z \left(1 - \frac{\log 2}{2z}\right) \\ &\to 2z(z \to \infty) \end{aligned}$$

It can be found that (30) is not exactly but formally consistent with (32); So do (31) and (33). These show that the approximate LFEPP here needs to be improved.

Clearly, for 3D Ising model when z is large, we have,

(34) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = 3\left(1 - \frac{4}{\pi^2}\right)z$$

3.3.  $\sqrt{2}z\lambda_p't \leq \pi$ . From the previous sections, we have,

(35) 
$$\begin{cases} f\left(\lambda_{p},t\right) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t^{2} + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2}\log\left(\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi\right)\right)\mathrm{d}\xi\\ \frac{\mathrm{d}f}{\mathrm{d}t} = -\lambda_{p}t + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2}(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}\sin\xi)\,\tanh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi\right)\mathrm{d}\xi\\ \frac{\mathrm{d}^{2}f}{\mathrm{d}t^{2}} = -\lambda_{p} + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2}(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}\sin\xi)^{2}\,\operatorname{sech}^{2}\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi\right)\mathrm{d}\xi\end{cases}$$

<sup>1</sup>Note that  $\int_0^{2\pi} \log (1 - \cos \omega_1) d\omega_1 = -2\pi \log 2.$ 

# LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRAD

From df/dt = 0, we have,

(36) 
$$\lambda_p t^2 = \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} (\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t \sin\xi) \tanh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t \sin\xi\right) d\xi$$

Let  $x = \sqrt{2\lambda_p t}$ , and (36) means,

(37) 
$$\frac{x^2}{2\lambda_p} = f(x) = \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} (x\sin\xi) \tanh(x\sin\xi) d\xi$$
$$= \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} G(x\sin\xi) d\xi$$

(37) is the Schlömilch integral equation, and it has one solution when  $-\pi \leq x \leq \pi$  (Whittaker and Watson, 1958), namely,

(38) 
$$G(x) = x \tanh(x) = \frac{x^2}{\lambda_p}$$

(38) shows that  $t_{sp}$  are the roots of Curie-Weiss equation  $\tanh(x) = x/\lambda_p$ , namely,

(39) 
$$t_{sp} = \frac{\sqrt{2}}{2} + \frac{\sqrt{2}}{4\lambda_p} W\left(-4\lambda_p e^{-2\lambda_p}; e^{-2\lambda_p}\right)$$

where W(x; r) is the r-Lambert function (Mezö and Keady, 2016).

From (35), (39) and  $tanh(x) = x/\lambda_p$ , we have,

$$\begin{cases} (40) \\ \begin{cases} f(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t_{sp}^2 + \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} -\frac{1}{2}\log\left(1 - 2t_{sp}^2 \sin^2 \xi\right) \mathrm{d}\xi = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t_{sp}^2 - \log\frac{1 + \sqrt{1 - 2t_{sp}^2}}{2} \\ \frac{\mathrm{d}^2 f}{\mathrm{d}t^2}\Big|_{t=t_{sp}} = -\lambda_p + \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} \left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p \sin\xi\right)^2 \left[1 - \frac{\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t_{sp} \sin\xi\right)^2}{\lambda_p^2}\right] \mathrm{d}\xi = -\lambda_p + \lambda_p^2 \left(1 - \frac{3}{2}t_{sp}^2\right) \\ \text{Now (14) mode} \end{cases}$$

Now (14) reads,

(41) 
$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = \frac{\log 2}{N} + \left\{ -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 t_{s1}^2 + \log\left[\cosh\left(t_{s1}\lambda_1\right)\right] \right\} - \frac{1}{2N}\log\left|1 - \lambda_1\operatorname{sech}^2\left(\lambda_1 t_{s1}\right)\right| + \frac{(N-1)\log 2}{N} + \sum_{p=2}^N \left( -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t_{sp}^2 - \log\frac{1 + \sqrt{1 - 2t_{sp}^2}}{2} \right) + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^N \left[ -\frac{1}{2}\log\left|-1 + \lambda_p\left(1 - \frac{3}{2}t_{sp}^2\right)\right| \right] W(-4\lambda_1 e^{-2\lambda_1} \cdot e^{-2\lambda_1})$$

where  $t_{s1} = 1 + \frac{W(-4\lambda_1 e^{-2\lambda_1}; e^{-2\lambda_1})}{2\lambda_1}$ ,  $t_{sp}$  are from (39).

For 1D, 2D and 3D Ising model, (41) reads respectively,

(42)  

$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \lim_{N \to \infty} \frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = -zt_{s1}^{2} + \log \left[\cosh \left(2zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \log 2$$

$$+ \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} \left( -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t_{sp}^{2} - \log \frac{1 + \sqrt{1 - 2t_{sp}^{2}}}{2} \right)$$

$$- \frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \log \left| -1 + 2z \cos \omega_{1} \left[ 1 - \frac{3}{2}t_{sp}^{2} \left(2z \cos \omega_{1}\right) \right] \right| d\omega_{1}$$

$$(43) - \frac{\psi}{kT} = -2zt_{s1}^{2} + \log\left[\cosh\left(4zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} \left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t_{sp}^{2} - \log\frac{1+\sqrt{1-2t_{sp}^{2}}}{2}\right) - \frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{(2\pi)^{2}}\int_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left|-1+2z\left(\cos\omega_{1}+\cos\omega_{2}\right)\left\{1-\frac{3}{2}t_{sp}^{2}\left[2z\left(\cos\omega_{1}+\cos\omega_{2}\right)\right]\right\}\right| d\omega_{1}d\omega_{2} - \frac{\psi}{kT} = -3zt_{s1}^{2} + \log\left[\cosh\left(6zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} \left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t_{sp}^{2} - \log\frac{1+\sqrt{1-2t_{sp}^{2}}}{2}\right) (44) - \frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{(2\pi)^{3}}\int_{0}^{2\pi} \int \log\left|-1+2z\left(\cos\omega_{1}+\cos\omega_{2}+\cos\omega_{3}\right)\right| \\ \times \left\{1-\frac{3}{2}t_{sp}^{2}\left[2z\left(\cos\omega_{1}+\cos\omega_{2}+\cos\omega_{3}\right)\right]\right\} \left| d\omega_{1}d\omega_{2}d\omega_{3}\right|$$

It should be pointed out that  $t_{sp}^2[\cdot]$  in the integral of (42)-(44) is the function of  $2z \cos \omega_1$ ,  $2z(\cos \omega_1 + \cos \omega_2)$ , and  $2z(\cos \omega_1 + \cos \omega_2 + \cos \omega_3)$ , respectively.

### 4. Discussions

4.1. A further approximate LFEPP of Ising model. It can be found that even the exact LFEPPs of (42)-(44) include complicate integrals because of  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$ . In the following a further approximate to  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$  is taken into account, which result in that  $t_{sp}^2[\cdot]$  in (42)-(44) involve only algebraic calculations, albeit in a more complex form.

We start with the following expression and focus on 3D Ising model,

(45) 
$$f(\lambda_p, t) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} \log\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t\sin\xi\right)\right] d\xi$$

And we change the  $\sqrt{2\lambda_p t} \sin \xi$  and the  $\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2$  into (46) and (47), respectively.

(46)  

$$\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi = \sqrt{2}z\lambda_{dm}\frac{\lambda_{p}'}{\lambda_{dm}}t'\sin\xi$$

$$= \left(\sqrt{2}\ z\lambda_{dm}\right)\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'\sin\xi$$

$$= x_{0}\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'\sin\xi$$

(47) 
$$-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 = \left(-\frac{1}{2}z\lambda_{dm}\right)\bar{\lambda}_p t^{\prime 2}$$

where  $\lambda_{dm}$  is the maximum of  $\lambda'_p$ , and  $\lambda'_p = \lambda_p/z$ .  $\lambda_{dm}$  is 2, 4, and 6 for 1D, 2D, and 3D Ising model, respectively.  $t' \in t$  and t' < 1 here because: (1)  $t_{sp} \to 2\sqrt{2}/\pi$  when  $z \to \infty$ ; (2) our problem is an asymptotic one, in which only the behavior of t near  $t_{sp}$  is taken into account.

After this transform,  $f(\lambda_p, t) = f(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'; z, \lambda_{dm})$ . Further we can expand log  $[\cosh(x)]$  into a series in the neighborhood of  $x_0$ , and obtain approximately  $f(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'; z, \lambda_{dm})$ , then  $t'_{sp}$ , then  $f(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'_{sp}; z, \lambda_{dm})$  and then  $f''(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'_{sp}; z, \lambda_{dm})$  in turn. According to Appendix F, in which the technique of economization of power series is used, they are,

(48) 
$$f\left(\bar{\lambda}_{p}, t'; z, \lambda_{dm}\right) \approx \left[-\frac{1}{2}z\lambda_{dm}\,\bar{\lambda}_{p} + \frac{1}{2}F_{2}(x_{0})x_{0}^{2}\bar{\lambda}_{p}^{2}\right]t'^{2} + \frac{2}{\pi}\left[F_{1}(x_{0})x_{0} - 2F_{2}(x_{0})x_{0}^{2}\right]\bar{\lambda}_{p}t' + F_{2}(x_{0})x_{0}^{2} - F_{1}(x_{0})x_{0} + F_{0}(x_{0})$$

(49) 
$$t'_{sp} = \frac{\frac{2}{\pi} \left[ F_1(x_0) x_0 - 2F_2(x_0) x_0^2 \right]}{z \lambda_{dm} - F_2(x_0) x_0^2 \bar{\lambda}_p}$$

(50) 
$$f(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'_{sp}; z, \lambda_{dm}, ) \approx \frac{4}{\pi^2} z \left[F_1(x_0) - 2F_2(x_0)x_0\right]^2 \lambda'_p + F_2(x_0)x_0^2 - F_1(x_0)x_0 + F_0(x_0)$$

(51) 
$$f''\left(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'_{sp}; z, \lambda_{dm}\right) = z\lambda'_p\left(-1 + 4zF_2(x_0)\frac{\lambda'_p}{2}\right)$$

where the details of  $F_0(x_0)$ ,  $F_1(x_0)$ ,  $F_2(x_0)$  are in Appendix F.

 $I_p$  now can be derived by inserting (50)-(51) into the second row of (B.12); And  $\mathcal{Z}$  can be deduced further by the first row of (13) with this  $I_p$ . Finally we get,

(52) 
$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = \log 2 + \left\{ -\frac{1}{2} \lambda_1 t_{s1}^2 + \log \left[ \cosh \left( t_{s1} \lambda_1 \right) \right] \right\} - \frac{1}{2N} \log \left| 1 - \lambda_1 \operatorname{sech}^2 \left( \lambda_1 t_{s1} \right) \right| \\ + \sum_{p=2}^N \left\{ \Phi \lambda_p' + F_2(x_0) x_0^2 - F_1(x_0) x_0 + F_0(x_0) \right\} \\ + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^N \left[ -\frac{1}{2} \log \left| -1 + 4z F_2(x_0) \frac{\lambda_p'}{2} \right| \right]$$

where  $t_{s1} = 1 + W \left( -4\lambda_1 e^{-2\lambda_1}; e^{-2\lambda_1} \right) / 2\lambda_1; \Phi = \frac{4}{\pi^2} z \left[ F_1(x_0) - 2F_2(x_0) x_0 \right]^2$ . For 3D Ising model, (52) reads when  $N \to \infty$ ,

$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = \log 2 - 3zt_{s1}^2 + \log \left[\cosh\left(6zt_{s1}\right)\right] + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} \left\{ \Phi \lambda_p' + F_2(x_0)x_0^2 - F_1(x_0)x_0 + F_0(x_0) \right\} \\ - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \iint_0^{2\pi} \log \left|-1 + 4zF_2(x_0)\left(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2 + \cos\omega_3\right)\right| d\omega_1 d\omega_2 d\omega_3$$

(53) looks "simple" in form. From this "simple" form and Appendix F, it is easy to simplify (53) to (26), or to (34) with a 2-order Taylor series of  $\log[\cosh(x)]$  in the neighborhood of  $x_0$ . For  $z \to 0$  in 3.1,  $F_2 = \frac{1}{2}\operatorname{sech}^2(x_0) \to \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $F_1 = \tanh(x_0) \to 0$  and  $F_0 = \log[\cosh(x_0)] \to 0$ ; While  $F_2 \to 0$ ,  $F_1 \to 1$  and  $F_0 \to -\log 2$  for  $z \to \infty$  in 3.2 (Notes that the results in Appendix D will be used).

On the other hand, it can be found from (53) that a critical temperature  $z_c$  occurs when  $-1 + 12zF_2(x_0) = 0$ , ie.,  $-1 + 12zF_2(6\sqrt{2}z) = 0$ . Our calculation shows that  $z_c \approx 0.216$  when a N-order (N > 18) Taylor series of  $\log[\cosh(x)]$  is used, which is near 0.221 that from a high-resolution Monte Carlo study on a finite-size simple cubic Ising model (Xu et al., 2018). Because the exact  $z_c$  can be obtained from (53) only when both a N-order Taylor series and/or a N-order Chebyshev series ( $N \to \infty$ ) of  $\log[\cosh(x)]$  are adopted, we infer that  $z_c \approx 0.21 \sim 0.22$  for 3D Ising model.

4.2. The LFEPP of Ising model in a non-zero external magnetic field. The method here can be easily generalized to the Ising model with a non-zero external magnetic field. For this purpose, Einstein summation convention will be mainly adopted in this section and Appendix H unless otherwise specified. For this case, the nearest-neighbor Ising model in *D*-dimensions (D = 1, 2, 3, ...) is defined in terms of the following Hamiltonian (eg., Huang, 1987),

LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRAB

(54)  
$$\mathcal{H} = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i,j=1}^{N} K_{ij} s_i s_j - \sum_i s_i \tilde{h}$$
$$= -\frac{1}{2} s_i K_{ij} s_j - s_i \tilde{h_i}$$

where,  $\tilde{h} = \beta h$  and h is the Zeeman energy associated with an external magnetic field in the z-direction.  $\tilde{h}_i$  is an N-dimensional column vectors with  $[\tilde{h}]_i = \tilde{h}$ .

The corresponding partition function is,

(55) 
$$\mathcal{Z} = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \exp\left[\frac{1}{2}s_i K_{ij} s_j + s_i \tilde{h}_i\right]$$

According to Appendix H, this partition function now is approximated as,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{Z} &\sim \exp\left(-2N\alpha\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{p}\frac{\tilde{h}^{2}}{\lambda_{p}}\right) \\ &\times 2\exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t_{s1}^{2}+\tilde{h}t_{s1}+\log\left(\cosh\left(2t_{s1}\frac{\lambda_{1}}{2}\right)\right)\right]\right\}\left|1-\lambda_{1}\mathrm{sech}^{2}\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s1}\right)\right|^{-1/2} \\ &\times\prod_{p=2}\,\exp\left(\frac{\tilde{h}t_{sp}}{2}\right)-2\exp[Nf(\lambda_{p},t_{sp})]\left|-1+\frac{\mathcal{I}''\left(\lambda_{p},t_{sp}\right)}{\lambda_{p}}\right|^{-1/2} \end{aligned}$$

where details of  $\alpha$ ,  $f(\lambda_p, t)$ ,  $\mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t)$ ,  $t_{s1}$ ,  $t_{sp}$  are in Appendix H and Appendix B. It can be found that (56) has three parts which are related to the non-zero external magnetic field h, namely,  $\exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{p}\tilde{h}^{2}/\lambda_{p}\right)$ ,  $\tilde{h}t_{s1}$ , and  $\exp\left(\frac{\tilde{h}t_{sp}}{2}\right)$ , and the rest of calculation is similar to Section 2 and Appendix B. This shows that the method here can be easily generalized to the Ising model with a non-zero external magnetic field h. For brevity, we just list the corresponding results as follows,

$$\frac{\log \mathcal{Z}}{N} = -2\alpha - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=1}^{\infty} \frac{\tilde{h}^2}{\lambda_p} + \left\{ -\frac{1}{2} \lambda_1 t_{s1}^2 + \tilde{h} t_{s1} + \log \left[ \cosh \left( 2t_{s1} \frac{\lambda_1}{2} \right) \right] \right\}$$
(57)
$$- \frac{1}{2N} \log \left| 1 - \lambda_1 \operatorname{sech}^2 \left( \lambda_1 t_{s1} \right) \right| + \frac{\tilde{h}}{2} \frac{\sum_{p=2}^{N-1} t_{sp}}{N} + \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{N} f(\lambda_p, t_{sp})$$

$$+ \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^{N} \left[ -\frac{1}{2} \log \left| -1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}'' \left( 2\frac{\lambda_p}{2}, t_{sp} \right)}{2\frac{\lambda_p}{2}} \right| \right]$$

For 1D Ising model when  $N \to \infty$ , (57) reads (Notice that  $0 \le t_{sp} < 1$ ),

(58)  

$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = -2\alpha - (\alpha + z) t_{s1}^{2} + \tilde{h}t_{s1} + \log\left(\cosh\left(2t_{s1}\left(\alpha + z\right)\right)\right) \\
+ \log 2 + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}) - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \frac{\tilde{h}^{2}}{2(\alpha + z\cos\omega_{1})} d\omega_{1} \\
- \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left| -1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left[2\left(\alpha + z\cos\omega_{1}\right), t_{sp}\right]}{2\left(\alpha + z\cos\omega_{1}\right)} \right| d\omega_{1}$$

For 2D Ising model, (57) reads,

(59) 
$$-\frac{\psi}{kT} = -2\alpha - (\alpha + 2z) t_{s1}^{2} + \tilde{h}t_{s1} + \log\left[\cosh\left(2t_{s1}\left(\alpha + 2z\right)\right)\right] + \log 2 \\ + \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}) - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{2}} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \frac{\tilde{h}^{2}}{2\alpha + 2z(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2})} d\omega_{1} d\omega_{2} \\ - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{2}} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \log\left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left[2\left(\alpha + z(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2})\right)\right]}{2\left[\alpha + z(\cos\omega_{1} + \cos\omega_{2})\right]}\right| d\omega_{1} d\omega_{2}$$

For 3D Ising model, (57) reads,

$$\begin{aligned} &(60) \\ &-\frac{\psi}{kT} = -2\alpha - (\alpha + 3z) t_{s1}^2 + \tilde{h} t_{s1} + \log\left[\cosh\left(2t_{s1}\left(\alpha + 3z\right)\right)\right] + \log 2 \\ &+ \sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) - \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \int \frac{\tilde{h}^2}{2\alpha + 2z(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2 + \cos\omega_3)} d\omega_1 d\omega_2 d\omega_3 \\ &- \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \int \log \left| -1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left[2\left(\alpha + z(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2 + \cos\omega_3)\right), t_{sp}\right]}{2\left(\alpha + z(\cos\omega_1 + \cos\omega_2 + \cos\omega_3)\right)} \right| d\omega_1 d\omega_2 d\omega_3 \end{aligned}$$

4.3. On the method here and further work. By a relatively simpler method, we obtain the LFEPP of N-D Ising model without the external magnetic field. The final LFEPP depends mainly on an integral including some parameters of  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$ . If  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$  can be solved (probably using special functions), then the LFEPP can be obtained (asymptotically) exactly. This method, using only the knowledge of mathematical analysis, linear algebra and asymptotic computation, should be more easily understood than Transfer matrix method for 2D and 3D Ising model. For 1D model, however, it seems that this method is more difficult to be operated than matrix method.

LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRAD

When  $z \to 0$ , our approximate LFEPPs for 1-2D Ising model in section 3.1 are nearly the same to results from (3) and (4) in the section 1 and those in Feynman (2018), except the differences of "log 2" and the minus sign before the integral representation. "log 2" may be related to the normalization factor, or the reference point for the LFEPP; The minus sign can be converted into a plus sign by an appropriate transformation. When  $z \to \infty$ , the approximate LFEPPs for 1-2D Ising model in section 3.2, are formally consistent with the well known results above. These consistences show that our method here is reasonable, and allow us to naturally generalize these typical results to 3D Ising model.

When  $z \to 0$ , our approximate LFEPPs for 1-2D Ising model in section 3.1, are nearly the same to those from Gaussian model. Gaussian model assumes that the probability of finding a give spin  $s_i$  between  $s_i$  and  $s_i + ds_i$  is given by  $(2\pi)^{-1/2} \exp(-s_i^2/2) ds_i$  (eg., Berlin and Kac, 1952). These two consistent results show that 3D Ising model is also Gaussian with  $\langle s_i \rangle = 0$  and  $\langle s_i^2 \rangle = 1$  when z is small.

Furthermore, we generalize this method to Ising model with an external magnetic field. It can be found that only three more items, which are related to this non-zero external magnetic field, are included in the partition function additionally. Although we have to introduce a parameter  $2\alpha$  to make the  $f(\lambda_p/2)$  be regular in Appendix C, and the form of the LFEPP is more complicated, we can obtain the high dimensional (>= 2) LFEPP Ising model with an external magnetic field naturally. Expect that  $\alpha > \lambda_{p_{\text{max}}}$  (where  $\lambda_p$  is the eigenvalues of  $K_{ij}$ ), we still have no idea on what  $2\alpha$  should be, although it seems and should have no effect on the final LFEPP.

Some new difficulties arise in our method, for example, how to obtain a simple expression of  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$ , then  $t_{sp}$ , and then  $\sum_{p=2}^{\infty} f(\lambda_p, t_{sp})$ ? Although we suggest a further approximate solution (4.1), the function of  $F_2$ ,  $F_1$  and  $F_1$  in this solution are too complicated. In the summary, the  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$  traps us on the other side of the river to obtain a simple and beautiful LFEPP of 3D Ising model. How to obtain an elementary or simple  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$  (if possible) is the main work in future.

# Appendix A. Matrix $K_{ij}$

For 1D Ising model, let K = A, and A is an  $N \times N$  matrix (eg., Dixon et al., 2001). A is a circulant matrix when an appropriate periodicity is used on the boundary of the Ising model.

with the *p*-th  $(p = 1, 2, \dots)$  eigenvalue is (eg., Berlin and Kac, 1952),

(A.1) 
$$\lambda_p = 2z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( p - 1 \right)$$

For **2D** Ising model, let K = B, and B can be constructed from A like the following (eg., Dixon et al., 2001),

$$\mathbf{B} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{I} & 0 & 0 & \cdots & \cdots & \mathbf{I} \\ \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{I} & 0 & \cdots & \cdots & 0 \\ 0 & \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{I} & \cdots & \cdots & \cdots \\ 0 & 0 & \mathbf{I} & \cdots & \cdots & \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{A} \end{bmatrix}$$

Generally, 2D Ising model is on a rectangular lattice with  $n_1$  sites in a row,  $n_2$  rows, so that  $N = n_1 n_2$ . B is a circulant matrix when an appropriate periodicity is used on the boundary with the p-th  $(p = 1, 2, \cdots)$  eigenvalue is (eg., Berlin and Kac, 1952),

(A.2) 
$$\lambda_p = 2z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1}{N} (p-1)$$

For **3D** Ising model, let K = C, and C can be constructed from B like the following (eg., Dixon et al., 2001),

$$\mathbf{C} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{B} & \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{O} & \cdots & \cdots & \mathbf{I} \\ \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{B} & \mathbf{I} & & & \mathbf{O} \\ \mathbf{O} & \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{B} & & & & \\ & & & & & & \mathbf{O} \\ \mathbf{O} & & & & & & \mathbf{I} \\ \mathbf{I} & \mathbf{O} & \cdots & \cdots & \mathbf{O} & & \mathbf{B} \end{bmatrix}$$

Generally, 3D Ising model is on a lattice with  $n_1$  sites in a row,  $n_2$  rows in a plane, and  $n_3$  planes so that the total number of sites  $N = n_1 n_2 n_3$ . C is a circulant matrix when an appropriate periodicity is used on the boundary with the *p*-th ( $p = 1, 2, \cdots$ ) eigenvalue is (eg., Berlin and Kac, 1952),

(A.3) 
$$\lambda_p = 2z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1}{N} (p-1) + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1 n_2}{N} (p-1)$$

We define that  $\lambda'_p = \frac{\lambda_p}{z}$ , and,

$$\int 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}(p-1)$$
 1D

$$\lambda_{p}' = \begin{cases} 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}(p-1) & \text{1D} \\ 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}(p-1) + 2\cos\frac{2\pi n_{1}}{N}(p-1) & \text{2D} \end{cases}$$

$$2\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}(p-1) + 2\cos\frac{2\pi n_1}{N}(p-1) + 2\cos\frac{2\pi n_1 n_2}{N}(p-1) = 3D$$

Generally, we assume that **K** is positive defined (when  $N \to \infty$ ), as the previous scientists did (eg., Ginzburg and Landau, 1950; Amit and Martin-Mayor, 2005). However, from the eigenvalues of 1D-3D Ising model above, it can be found that the eigenvalues may be zero or negative when N is finite. If this happens, to make  $\mathbf{K}$  in the Hubbard-Stratonovich transformation be positive, we may write,

(A.4)  

$$\sum_{ij} K_{ij} s_i s_j = N2\alpha - N2\alpha + \sum_{ij} K_{ij} s_i s_j$$

$$= -N2\alpha + 2\alpha \sum_i s_i^2 + \sum_{ij} K_{ij} s_i s_j$$

$$= -N2\alpha + \sum_{ij} \widetilde{K}_{ij} s_i s_j$$

where  $\alpha$  is a real positive to make the eigenvalues of  $\widetilde{\mathbf{K}}$  are positive.  $\widetilde{\mathbf{K}}$  is not a circulant matrix now but a Toeplitz one, whose diagonal elements are  $2\alpha$  (The original is zero). Since N will be very large,  $\mathbf{K}$  is asymptotically equivalent to a circulant matrix according to Szeg $\ddot{o}$  theorem.  $\ddot{\mathbf{K}}$  has eigenvalues as follows,

For 1D Ising model,

(A.5) 
$$\lambda_p = 2\alpha + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left(p - 1\right)$$

For 2D Ising model,

(A.6) 
$$\lambda_p = 2\alpha + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1}{N} (p-1)$$

For **3D** Ising model,

(A.7) 
$$\lambda_p = 2\alpha + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1}{N} (p-1) + 2z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1 n_2}{N} (p-1)$$

And for any cases above, the corresponding real, orthogonal eigenvectors of  $K_{ij}$ , normalized to unity, are given by,

(A.8) 
$$V_{ij} = N^{-1/2} \left[ \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( j - 1 \right) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( j - 1 \right) \right]$$

# Appendix B. Calculating $I_p$

In this section, we focus on the following integral,

(B.1) 
$$I_p = \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p y_p^2\right) \times \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip}\lambda_p y_p\right)\right]\right\} dy_p$$

where

(B.2) 
$$V_{ip} = N^{-1/2} \left[ \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) \right]$$
$$= N^{-1/2} \overline{V}_{ip}$$

When p > 1,

$$\begin{split} I_p &= \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p y_p^2\right) \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip}\lambda_p y_p\right)\right]\right\} \mathrm{d}y_p \\ &= \frac{y_p = y N^{-1/2}}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p \frac{y^2}{N}\right) \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(\frac{\overline{V}_{ip}\lambda_p y}{N}\right)\right]\right\} \mathrm{d}\frac{y}{N^{1/2}} \\ &= \frac{y = t N}{N} N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p N t^2\right) \\ &\qquad \times \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left[\left(\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}\left(i-1\right)\left(p-1\right)+\sin\frac{2\pi}{N}\left(i-1\right)\left(p-1\right)\right)\lambda_p t\right]\right]\right\} \mathrm{d}t \end{split}$$

Next the following sum is taken into account,

(B.4) 
$$J = \sum_{i} \log \left[ \cosh \left[ \left( \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( p - 1 \right) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( p - 1 \right) \right) \lambda_p t \right] \right]$$

It can be found that,

(B.5)  
$$J = N \frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)] + \sum_{i=2} \log\left[\cosh\left[\left(\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}\left(i-1\right)\left(p-1\right) + \sin\frac{2\pi}{N}\left(i-1\right)\left(p-1\right)\right)\lambda_p t\right]\right]}{N}$$

Because  $\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]$  is finite when  $\lambda_p t < \infty$  (The case when  $\lambda_p t \to \infty$  will be taken into account in Appendix E),  $\frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]}{N} \to 0$  when  $N \to \infty$ . Thus,

(B.6) 
$$J = N \frac{\sum_{i=2} \log \left[ \cosh \left[ \left( \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( p - 1 \right) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( p - 1 \right) \right) \lambda_p t \right] \right]}{N}$$

Subdivide the interval  $0 - 2\pi$  into N equal intervals of length  $2\pi/N = \Delta\theta$ , and let  $\theta = (i-1)\Delta\theta$ . When  $\Delta\theta \to 0$ , we have,

$$(B.7) \qquad \frac{J}{N} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \sum_{\theta=\Delta\theta}^{2\pi-\Delta\theta} \log\left[\cosh\left[\lambda_p t\left(\cos\left(p-1\right)\theta + \sin\left(p-1\right)\theta\right)\right]\right] \Delta\theta \\ \rightarrow \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log\left[\cosh\left[\lambda_p t\left(\cos\left(p-1\right)\theta + \sin\left(p-1\right)\theta\right)\right]\right] d\theta \\ = \frac{(p-1)\theta = \xi}{2\pi (p-1)} \frac{1}{2\pi (p-1)} \int_0^{2(p-1)\pi} \log\left[\cosh\left[\lambda_p t\left(\cos\xi + \sin\xi\right)\right]\right] d\xi \\ = \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \log\left[\cosh\left[\lambda_p t\left(\cos\xi + \sin\xi\right)\right]\right] d\xi \\ = \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} \log\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2\lambda_p t}\sin\xi\right)\right] d\xi \\ = \frac{2\sqrt{2\lambda_p t}}{\pi} - \log 2 + \frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} \log\left(1 + e^{-2\sqrt{2\lambda_p t}\sin\xi}\right) d\xi$$

Therefore insert J into (B.3), and we obtain,

(B.8)  
$$I_p = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left\{-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p N t^2 + N\frac{2}{\pi} \int_0^{\pi/2} \log\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t \sin\xi\right)\right] d\xi\right\} dt$$
$$= N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left[Nf\left(\lambda_p, t\right)\right] dt$$

where  $f(\lambda_p, t)$  is,

(B.9) 
$$f(\lambda_p, t) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_0^{\pi/2} \log\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t\sin\xi\right)\right] d\xi = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$$

 $I_p$  can be solved by Laplace's asymptotic method. The required  ${\rm d}f/{\rm d}t$  and  ${\rm d}^2f/{\rm d}t^2$  are as follows,

(B.10) 
$$\frac{\mathrm{d}f}{\mathrm{d}t} = -\lambda_p t + \mathcal{I}'(\lambda_p, t)$$

(B.11) 
$$\frac{\mathrm{d}^2 f}{\mathrm{d}t^2} = f''(\lambda_p, t) = -\lambda_p + \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_p, t)$$

Therefore,

(B.12)  

$$I_{p} = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left[Nf\left(\lambda_{p}, t\right)\right] dt$$

$$\sim N^{1/2} 2 \exp\left[Nf(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})\right] \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{N \left|f''\left(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}\right)\right|}}$$

$$= \begin{cases} 2 \exp\left[Nf(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})\right] \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\left|-\lambda_{p} + \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})\right|}} & t_{sp} \neq 0 \\ 2 \exp\left[Nf(\lambda_{p}, 0)\right] \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2\left|-\lambda_{p} + \mathcal{I}''(\lambda_{p}, 0)\right|}} & t_{sp} = 0 \end{cases}$$

where  $t_{sp}$  is from  $\frac{\mathrm{d}f}{\mathrm{d}t} = 0$  (Eq. (B.10)), namely  $t = \mathcal{I}'(\lambda_p, t)/\lambda_p$ . When p = 1, it can be found from (B.3) that,

(B.13) 
$$I_{1} = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t^{2} + \log\left(\cosh\left(\lambda_{1}t\right)\right)\right]\right\} dt \\ \sim \begin{cases} 2\exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t_{s_{1}}^{2} + \log\left(\cosh\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s_{1}}\right)\right)\right]\right\}\sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{|-\lambda_{1}+\lambda_{1}^{2}\operatorname{sech}^{2}(\lambda_{1}t_{s_{1}})|} \\ 2\sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2|-\lambda_{1}+\lambda_{1}^{2}|}} \end{cases} \quad t_{s1} \neq 0 \\ t_{s1} = 0 \end{cases}$$

where  $I_1$  is solved by Laplace's asymptotic method.  $t_{s_1}$  is from equation of  $t = \tanh(\lambda_1 t)$ .  $t_{s_1} = 1 + W \left(-4\lambda_1 e^{-2\lambda_1}; e^{-2\lambda_1}\right)/2\lambda_1$ , where W(x;r) is the r-Lambert function (Mezö and Keady, 2016).

Appendix C. On 
$$N^{-1} \sum_{p=1}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$$
 when  $N \to \infty$ 

It should be pointed out firstly that we mainly prove S(f) for 3D Ising model. Those for 1D and 2D Ising model are from Berlin and Kac (1952) with minor modification.

The following sum is taken into account,

$$S(f) = \lim_{N \to \infty} N^{-1} \sum_{p=1}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$$

The largest eigenvalue occurs for p = 1, and we assume that f(t) is regular when  $t > \frac{\lambda_1}{2}$ . Consequently,

$$N^{-1}\sum_{p=1}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) = N^{-1} f\left(\frac{\lambda_1}{2}\right) + N^{-1}\sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$$

If  $f(\frac{\lambda_1}{2})$  is finite,

$$S(f) = \lim_{N \to \infty} N^{-1} \sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$$

For 1D Ising model, we have,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( p - 1 \right)$$

where we assume  $\alpha = 0$  for simplicity, and p = 2, 3, ...

Subdivide the interval  $0 - 2\pi$  into N equal intervals of length  $\frac{2\pi}{N} = \Delta \omega_1$ , and let  $\omega_1 = (p-1)\Delta \omega_1$ . When  $\Delta \omega \to 0$ , we have,

(C.1)  
$$N^{-1} \sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) = \frac{1}{2\pi} \sum_{\omega_1 = \Delta\omega_1}^{2\pi - \Delta\omega_1} f(z\cos\omega_1)\Delta\omega_1$$
$$S(f) = \lim_{\Delta\omega_1 \to 0} \frac{1}{2\pi} \sum_{\omega_1 = \Delta\omega_1}^{2\pi - \Delta\omega_1} f(z\cos\omega_1)\Delta\omega_1$$
$$= \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} f(z\cos\omega_1) \,\mathrm{d}\omega_1$$

For 2D Ising model,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) + z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1}{N} (p-1)$$

where  $N = n_1 n_2$ .

Let  $p - 1 = p_2 + p_1 n_2$ ,  $p_1 = 0, 1, ..., n_1 - 1$  and  $p_2 = 0, 1, 2, ..., n_2 - 1$ . Then,

$$\frac{2\pi}{N}(p-1) = \frac{2\pi}{n_1 n_2} p_2 + \frac{2\pi}{n_1} p_1$$
$$\frac{2\pi n_1}{N}(p-1) = \frac{2\pi}{n_2} p_2 + 2\pi p_1$$

And,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi}{n_1 n_2} p_2 + \frac{2\pi}{n_1} p_1\right) + z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi}{n_2} p_2\right)$$

Hence,

$$N^{-1} \sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) = N^{-1} \sum_{\substack{p_2=1\\p_1\equiv 0}}^{n_1-1} f\left(\frac{\lambda_{p_1+1}}{2}\right) + N^{-1} \sum_{p_1=1}^{n_1-1} \sum_{p_2=0}^{n_2-1} f\left(\frac{\lambda_{p_2+p_1n_2+1}}{2}\right)$$

Let  $\Delta \omega_2 = 2\pi/n_2$ ,  $\omega_2 = (2\pi/n_2) p_2$ ,

$$\frac{\lambda_{p_2+p_1n_2+1}}{2} = z\cos\left(\frac{\omega_2}{n_1} + \frac{2\pi}{n_1}p_1\right) + z\cos\omega_2$$

Since  $\omega_2$  always ranges between 0 and  $2\pi$ ,  $\omega_1/n_1$  vanishes in the limit  $n_1$ , we have, as  $n_2 \to \infty$ ,

$$\sum_{p_2=0}^{n_2-1} f\left(\frac{\lambda_{p_2+p_1n_2+1}}{2}\right) \to \frac{n_2}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} f\left[z\cos\left(\frac{2\pi}{n_1}p_1\right) + z\cos\omega_2\right] \mathrm{d}\omega_2$$

and,

$$N^{-1} \sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) \to \frac{1}{2\pi n_1} \int_0^{2\pi} d\omega_2 f\left(z + z\cos\omega_2\right) \\ + \frac{n_2}{2\pi N} \sum_{p_1=1}^{n_1-1} \int_0^{2\pi} f\left[z\cos\left(\frac{2\pi}{n_1}p_1\right) + z\cos\omega_2\right] d\omega_2$$

The summation over  $p_1$  leads to a second independent integral. Let  $\Delta \omega_1 = 2\pi/n_1$ ,  $\omega_1 = (2\pi/n_1) p_1$ , then,

(C.2) 
$$S(f) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} f(z \cos \omega_1 + z \cos \omega_2) d\omega_1 d\omega_2$$

For 3D Ising model,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( p - 1 \right) + z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1}{N} \left( p - 1 \right) + z \cos \frac{2\pi n_1 n_2}{N} \left( p - 1 \right)$$

where  $N = n_1 n_2 n_3$ .

Let  $p-1 = rn_3 + q$ ,  $r = 0, 1, \dots n_1n_2 - 1$ , and  $q = 0, 1, \dots n_3 - 1$ , then,

$$\sum_{p=2}^{N} = \sum_{r=0}^{n_1 n_2 - 1} \sum_{q=1}^{n_3 - 1}$$

and

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi r}{n_1 n_2} + \frac{2\pi q}{n_1 n_2 n_3}\right) + z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi r}{n_2} + \frac{2\pi q}{n_2 n_3}\right) + z \cos\left(2\pi r + \frac{2\pi q}{n_3}\right)$$

Let  $\Delta \omega_3 = 2\pi/n_3, \, \omega_3 = 2\pi q/n_3,$ 

Since r is an integer,  $\cos(2\pi r + 2\pi q/n_3) = \cos \omega_3$ . Also as  $n_1, n_2, n_3$  become large,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi r}{n_1 n_2}\right) + z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi r}{n_2}\right) + z \cos\omega_3$$

Furthermore,

$$\sum_{q=1}^{n_3-1} = \frac{n_3}{2\pi} \sum_{2\pi/n_3}^{2\pi-2\pi/n_3} \Delta\omega_3 \to \frac{n_3}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \mathrm{d}\omega_3$$

Hence,

$$N^{-1}\sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) \to \frac{n_3}{2\pi N} \int_0^{2\pi} \mathrm{d}\omega_3 \sum_{r=0}^{n_1 n_2 - 1} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$$

Let  $r = tn_2 + s$ ,  $t = 0, 1, \dots, n_1 - 1$ ,  $s = 0, 1, \dots, n_2 - 1$ ,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi t}{n_1} + \frac{2\pi s}{n_1 n_2}\right) + z \cos\left(2\pi t + \frac{2\pi s}{n_2}\right) + z \cos\omega_3$$

Let  $\Delta \omega_2 = 2\pi/n_2, \, \omega_2 = 2\pi s/n_2,$ 

$$\sum_{r=0}^{n_1 n_2 - 1} = \sum_{t=0}^{n_1 - 1} \sum_{s=0}^{n_2 - 1}$$
$$= \sum_{t=0}^{n_1 - 1} \frac{n_2}{2\pi} \sum_{2\pi/n_2}^{2\pi - 2\pi/n_2} \Delta \omega_2 \to \sum_{t=0}^{n_1 - 1} \frac{n_2}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \mathrm{d}\omega_2$$

Then  $\cos(2\pi t + 2\pi s/n_2) = \cos\omega_2$ , and,

$$\frac{\lambda_p}{2} = z \cos\left(\frac{2\pi t}{n_1}\right) + z \cos\omega_2 + z \cos\omega_3$$

$$N^{-1}\sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) \to \frac{n_2 n_3}{(2\pi)^2 N} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \mathrm{d}\omega_2 \mathrm{d}\omega_3 \sum_{t=0}^{n_1-1} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)$$

Now set  $\Delta \omega_1 = 2\pi/n_1$ ,  $\omega_1 = 2\pi t/n_1$ ,

$$N^{-1}\sum_{p=2}^{N} f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) \to \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \iint_{0}^{2\pi} \int f\left(\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right) \mathrm{d}\omega_1 \mathrm{d}\omega_2 \mathrm{d}\omega_3$$

And finally,

(C.3) 
$$S(f) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^3} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} f(z\cos\omega_1 + z\cos\omega_2 + z\cos\omega_3) \,\mathrm{d}\omega_1 \mathrm{d}\omega_2 \mathrm{d}\omega_3$$

# Appendix D. On $\sum_{p=2}^{N} \Phi \lambda_p'$ when $N \to \infty$

The identity (D.1) will be used in the following,

(D.1) 
$$\sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos kx = \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin(N+1)x}{\sin\frac{x}{2}} \right]$$

For 1D Ising model,

$$\sum_{p=2}^{N} \Phi \lambda_p' = \Phi \sum_{p=2}^{N} 2 \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1)$$
$$= 2\Phi \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} k$$
$$= 2\Phi \left[ \left( \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} k \right) - \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} 0 - \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} N \right]$$
$$= 2\Phi \left\{ \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin \left(N+1\right) \frac{2\pi}{N}}{\sin \frac{2\pi}{2N}} \right] - 2 \right\}$$
$$= 2\Phi \left[ \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2 \cos \frac{2\pi}{2N} \right) - 2 \right]$$
$$= 2\Phi \left[ \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2 \right) - 2 \right] \quad (N \to \infty)$$
$$= -\Phi$$

where  $\Phi$  is a constant.

For 2D Ising model  $(N = n_1 \times n_2)$ ,

$$\sum_{p=2}^{N} \Phi \lambda_{p}' = \Phi \sum_{p=2}^{N} 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{N}(p-1) + 2\cos\frac{2\pi n_{1}}{N}(p-1)$$

$$= 2\Phi \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \cos\frac{2\pi}{N}k + \cos\frac{2\pi}{n_{2}}k$$

$$= 2\Phi \left[ \left( \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos\frac{2\pi}{N}k \right) - 2 + \left( \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos\frac{2\pi}{n_{2}}k \right) - 2 \right]$$

$$= 2\Phi \left\{ \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin\left(N+1\right)\frac{2\pi}{N}}{\sin\frac{2\pi}{2N}} \right] + \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin\left(N+1\right)\frac{2\pi}{n_{2}}}{\sin\frac{2\pi}{2n_{2}}} \right] - 4 \right\}$$

$$= 2\Phi \left[ \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{2N} \right) + \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{2n_{2}} \right) - 4 \right]$$

$$= -2\Phi \left( N \to \infty \right)$$

For 3D Ising model  $(N = n_1 \times n_2 \times n_3)$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \text{(D.4)} \\ \sum_{p=2}^{N} \Phi \lambda_{p}^{\prime} &= \Phi \sum_{p=2}^{N} 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{N} \left(p-1\right) + 2\cos\frac{2\pi n_{1}}{N} \left(p-1\right) + 2\cos\frac{2\pi n_{1} n_{2}}{N} \left(p-1\right) \\ &= 2\Phi \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \cos\frac{2\pi}{N} k + \cos\frac{2\pi}{n_{2} n_{3}} k + \cos\frac{2\pi}{n_{3}} k \\ &= 2\Phi \left[ \left( \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos\frac{2\pi}{N} k \right) - 2 + \left( \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos\frac{2\pi}{n_{2} n_{3}} k \right) - 2 + \left( \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos\frac{2\pi}{n_{3}} k \right) - 2 \right] \\ &= 2\Phi \left\{ \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin\left(N+1\right)\frac{2\pi}{N}}{\sin\frac{2\pi}{2N}} \right] + \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin\left(N+1\right)\frac{2\pi}{n_{2} n_{3}}}{\sin\frac{2\pi}{2n_{2} n_{3}}} \right] + \frac{1}{2} \left[ 1 + \frac{\sin\left(N+1\right)\frac{2\pi}{n_{3}}}{\sin\frac{2\pi}{2n_{3}}} \right] - 6 \right\} \\ &= 2\Phi \left[ \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{2N} \right) + \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{2n_{2} n_{3}} \right) + \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 + 2\cos\frac{2\pi}{2n_{3}} \right) - 6 \right] \\ &= -3\Phi \left( N \to \infty \right) \end{aligned}$$

APPENDIX E.  $\frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]}{N}$  WHEN  $\lambda_p t \to \infty$ When  $\lambda_p t = z \lambda'_p t \to \infty$ , and  $\log[\cosh(z \lambda'_p t)] \to \infty$ , so  $\frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]}{N}$  in (B.5) should be discussed.

 $I_1$  now is,

(E.1) 
$$I_1 = 2 \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 t_{s1}^2 + \log\left[\cosh\left(\lambda_1 t_{s1}\right)\right]\right]\right\} \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\left|\lambda_1 - \lambda_1^2 \operatorname{sech}^2\left(\lambda_1 t_{s1}\right)\right|}}$$

where  $t_{s_1}$  is from  $t = \tanh(\lambda_1 t)$ . When  $\lambda_1(=z) \to \infty$ ,  $\tanh(\lambda_1 t) \to 1$ ,  $t_{s_1} = 1$ , and  $\operatorname{sech}^2(\lambda_1 t_{s_1}) \to 0$ . Then,

(E.2)  
$$I_1 \to 2 \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 + \log\left[\cosh\left(\lambda_1\right)\right]\right]\right\} \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\lambda_1}}$$
$$= 2 \exp\left[N\left(\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 - \log 2\right)\right] \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\lambda_1}}$$

For  $I_p$ , when  $z \to \infty$ ,

$$I_{p} = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cosh\left(\lambda_{p}t\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}Nt^{2}\right)$$

$$\times \exp\left\{N\left[\frac{2\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t}{\pi} - \log 2 + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2}\log\left(1 + e^{-2\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi}\right)d\xi\right]\right\}dt$$
(E.3)
$$\to N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cosh\left(\lambda_{p}t\right)\exp\left[N\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t^{2} + \frac{2\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t}{\pi} - \log 2\right)\right]dt$$

$$\sim N^{1/2} 2\cosh\left(2\frac{\lambda_{p}}{2}t_{sp}\right)\exp\left[Nf\left(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}\right)\right]\sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\lambda_{p}}}$$

where  $f(\lambda_p, t) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \frac{2\sqrt{2}\lambda_p t}{\pi} - \log 2$ . When  $z \to \infty$ ,  $t_{sp} \approx 2\sqrt{2}/\pi = \bar{t}_s$ . Therefore,

(E.4)  
$$\mathcal{Z} = \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N}\right]^{1/2} I_1 \prod_{p=2} I_p$$
$$\sim 2 \exp\left[N\left(\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 - \log 2\right)\right] \times \prod_{p=2} 2 \cosh\left(2\frac{\lambda_p}{2}\bar{t}_s\right) \exp\left[Nf\left(\lambda_p, \bar{t}_s\right)\right]$$

And,

(E.5) 
$$\frac{\log\left(\mathcal{Z}\right)}{N} = \frac{\lambda_1}{2} + \sum_{p=2}^{N} \left[f(\lambda_p, \bar{t}_s)\right] + \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^{N} \log\left[\cosh\left(2\bar{t}_s \frac{\lambda_p}{2}\right)\right]$$

When  $N \to \infty$  and  $\lambda_p = z\lambda'_p \to \infty$  but generally z < N,  $\frac{1}{N}\sum_{p=2}^{\infty} \log \left[ \cosh \left( 2\bar{t}_s \frac{\lambda_p}{2} \right) \right]$  in (E.5) is,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^{N} \log \left[ \cosh \left( 2\bar{t}_{s} \frac{\lambda_{p}}{2} \right) \right] \\ &= -\frac{(N-1)\log 2}{N} + (2z\bar{t}_{s}) \frac{1}{N} \sum_{p=2}^{N} \frac{\lambda_{p}'}{2} \end{aligned}$$
(E.6)
$$\begin{aligned} &= -\log 2 + \begin{cases} (2z\bar{t}_{s}) \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \cos \omega_{1} d\omega_{1}, & \text{1D Model} \\ (2z\bar{t}_{s}) \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{2}} \int_{0}^{2\pi} (\cos \omega_{1} + \cos \omega_{2}) d\omega_{1} d\omega_{2}, & \text{2D Model} \\ (2z\bar{t}_{s}) \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{3}} \int_{0}^{2\pi} \int_{0}^{2\pi} (\cos \omega_{1} + \cos \omega_{2} + \cos \omega_{3}) d\omega_{1} d\omega_{2} d\omega_{3}, & \text{3D Model} \\ &= -\log 2 \end{aligned}$$

Therefore in the case that  $\lambda_p t = z \lambda'_p t \to \infty$ ,  $\frac{\log[\cosh(\lambda_p t)]}{N}$  in (B.5) can also be omitted, because only one constant " $-\log 2$ " will be added to the final result <sup>2</sup>.

# Appendix F. Further approximating $f(\lambda_p, t)$

From Taylor expansion of log  $\left[\cosh\left(\sqrt{2\lambda_p t}\sin\xi\right)\right] \left(=\log\left[\left(\sqrt{2}z\lambda_{dm}\right)\bar{\lambda}_p t'\sin\xi\right]\right) = \log\left[x_0\bar{\lambda}_p t'\sin\xi\right]\right)$ in the neighborhood of  $x_0$ , we can approximate  $\mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)$ . That is,

(F.1)

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{I}\left(\lambda_{p},t\right) &= \frac{2}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \log\left\{\cosh\left[x_{0}\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'\sin\xi\right]\right\} \mathrm{d}\xi \\ &\approx \frac{2}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \left[A_{0}(x_{0}) + A_{1}(x_{0})\left(x_{0}\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'\sin\xi - x_{0}\right) + \ldots + A_{N}(x_{0})\left(x_{0}\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'\sin\xi - x_{0}\right)^{N}\right] \mathrm{d}\xi \end{aligned}$$

where  $A_k(x_0)$  is the k-th coefficient of Taylor series of  $\log[\cosh(x)]$ , such as  $A_0(x_0) = \log[\cosh(x_0)]$ ,  $A_1(x_0) = \tanh(x_0)$ ,  $A_2(x_0) = \frac{1}{2}\operatorname{sech}^2(x_0)$ ,  $A_3(x_0) = \frac{1}{3!}[-2\operatorname{sech}^2(x_0)\tanh(x_0)]$ ,  $A_4(x_0) = \frac{1}{4!}[-2\operatorname{sech}^4(x_0) + 4\operatorname{sech}^2(x_0)\tanh^2(x_0)]$ , and so on. Clearly, a good approximation of  $\log[\cosh(x)]$  requires a large number of terms of its Taylor series, for example, N = 20. Notes that this series is assumed to be convergent for simplicity.

However, with the technique of economization of power series, we can approximate  $\log[\cosh(x)]$  by a 2-order series instead of a 20-order one with some acceptable error. That is,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>If z and N tend to infinity at the same time (ie.,  $z/N \rightarrow 1$ ), the constants are  $-\log 2 - \bar{t}_s$ ,  $-\log 2 - 2\bar{t}_s$  and  $-\log 2 - 3\bar{t}_s$  for 1D-3D Ising model, respectively.

(F.2) 
$$\frac{2}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \log \left\{ \cosh \left[ x_0 \bar{\lambda}_p t' \sin \xi \right] \right\} d\xi \\ \approx \frac{2}{\pi} \int_{0}^{\pi/2} \left[ F_0(x_0) + F_1(x_0) \left( x_0 \bar{\lambda}_p t' \sin \xi - x_0 \right) + F_2(x_0) \left( x_0 \bar{\lambda}_p t' \sin \xi - x_0 \right)^2 \right] d\xi$$

where  $F_k(x_0)(k = 0, 1, 2)$  are calculated step by step as follows (We take N = 10 for examples),

(F.3) 
$$\begin{cases} F_2(x_0) = 8D_2(x_0) \\ F_1(x_0) = 2D_1(x_0) - 8D_2(x_0) \\ F_0(x_0) = D_0(x_0) - F_1(x_0) + F_2(x_0) \end{cases}$$

We abbreviate  $D_2(x_0)$  to  $D_2$  (The same to others) in the following,

(F.4) 
$$\begin{cases} D_2 = \frac{1}{2}C_2 + \frac{1}{2}C_4 + \frac{15}{32}C_6 + \frac{7}{16}C_8 + \frac{105}{256}C_{10} \\ D_1 = C_1 + \frac{3}{4}C_3 + \frac{5}{8}C_5 + \frac{35}{64}C_7 + \frac{63}{128}C_9 \\ D_0 = C_0 + \frac{1}{2}C_2 + \frac{3}{8}C_4 + \frac{5}{16}C_6 + \frac{35}{128}C_8 + \frac{63}{256}C_{10} \end{cases}$$

$$(F.5) \qquad \begin{cases} C_0 = B_0 + \frac{B_1}{2} + \frac{B_2}{4} + \frac{B_3}{8} + \frac{B_4}{16} + \frac{B_5}{32} + \frac{B_6}{64} + \frac{B_7}{128} + \frac{B_8}{256} + \frac{B_9}{512} + \frac{B_{10}}{1024} \\ C_1 = \frac{B_1}{2} + \frac{B_2}{2} + \frac{3B_3}{8} + \frac{B_4}{8} + \frac{5B_5}{32} + \frac{3B_6}{32} + \frac{7B_7}{128} + \frac{B_8}{32} + \frac{9B_9}{512} + \frac{5B_{10}}{512} \\ C_2 = \frac{B_2}{4} + \frac{3B_3}{8} + \frac{3B_4}{8} + \frac{5B_5}{16} + \frac{15B_6}{64} + \frac{21B_7}{128} + \frac{7B_8}{64} + \frac{9B_9}{128} + \frac{45B_{10}}{1024} \\ C_3 = \frac{B_3}{8} + \frac{B_4}{16} + \frac{5B_5}{16} + \frac{5B_6}{16} + \frac{35B_7}{128} + \frac{7B_8}{128} + \frac{21B_9}{128} + \frac{15B_{10}}{128} \\ C_4 = \frac{B_4}{16} + \frac{5B_5}{32} + \frac{15B_6}{64} + \frac{35B_7}{128} + \frac{35B_8}{128} + \frac{63B_9}{256} + \frac{105B_{10}}{512} \\ C_5 = \frac{B_5}{32} + \frac{3B_6}{32} + \frac{21B_7}{128} + \frac{7B_8}{32} + \frac{63B_9}{256} + \frac{63B_{10}}{256} \end{cases}$$

(F.5) 
$$\begin{cases} C_6 = \frac{B_6}{64} + \frac{7B_7}{128} + \frac{7B_8}{128} + \frac{21B_9}{128} + \frac{105B_{10}}{512} \\ C_7 = \frac{B_7}{128} + \frac{B_8}{32} + \frac{9B_9}{128} + \frac{15B_{10}}{128} \\ C_8 = \frac{B_8}{256} + \frac{9B_9}{512} + \frac{45B_{10}}{1024} \\ C_9 = \frac{B_9}{512} + \frac{5B_{10}}{512} \\ C_{10} = \frac{B_{10}}{1024} \end{cases}$$

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} B_0 = A_{10}x_0^{10} - A_9x_0^9 + A_8x_0^8 - A_7x_0^7 + A_6x_0^6 - A_5x_0^5 + A_4x_0^4 - A_3x_0^3 + A_2x_0^2 - A_1x_0 + A_0 \\ B_1 = -10A_{10}x_0^9 + 9A_9x_0^8 - 8A_8x_0^7 + 7A_7x_0^6 - 6A_6x_0^5 + 5A_5x_0^4 - 4A_4x_0^3 + 3A_3x_0^2 - 2A_2x_0 + A_1 \\ B_2 = 45A_{10}x_0^8 - 36A_9x_0^7 + 28A_8x_0^6 - 21A_7x_0^5 + 15A_6x_0^4 - 10A_5x_0^3 + 6A_4x_0^2 - 3A_3x_0 + A_2 \\ B_3 = -120A_{10}x_0^7 + 84A_9x_0^6 - 56A_8x_0^5 + 35A_7x_0^4 - 20A_6x_0^3 + 10A_5x_0^2 - 4A_4x_0 + A_3 \\ B_4 = 210A_{10}x_0^6 - 126A_9x_0^5 + 70A_8x_0^4 - 35A_7x_0^3 + 15A_6x_0^2 - 5A_5x_0 + A_4 \\ B_5 = -252A_{10}x_0^5 + 126A_9x_0^4 - 56A_8x_0^3 + 21A_7x_0^2 - 6A_6x_0 + A_5 \end{array} \right.$$

(F.6) 
$$\begin{cases} B_6 = 210A_{10}x_0^4 - 84A_9x_0^3 + 28A_8x_0^2 - 7A_7x_0 + A_6\\ B_7 = -120A_{10}x_0^3 + 36A_9x_0^2 - 8A_8x_0 + A_7\\ B_8 = 45A_{10}x_0^2 - 9A_9x_0 + A_8\\ B_9 = -10A_{10}x_0 + A_9\\ B_{10} = A_{10} \end{cases}$$

And now,

(F.7)

$$f(\lambda_{p},t) = -\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{p}t^{2} + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2} \log\left(\cosh\left(\sqrt{2}\lambda_{p}t\sin\xi\right)\right) d\xi$$
  

$$= f\left(\bar{\lambda}_{p},t';z,\lambda_{dm}\right)$$
  

$$= \left(-\frac{1}{2}z\lambda_{dm}\right)\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'^{2} + \frac{2}{\pi}\int_{0}^{\pi/2} \log\left\{\cosh\left[\left(\sqrt{2}z\lambda_{dm}\right)\bar{\lambda}_{p}t'\sin\xi\right]\right\} d\xi$$
  

$$\approx \left(-\frac{1}{2}z\lambda_{dm}\bar{\lambda}_{p} + \frac{1}{2}F_{2}x_{0}^{2}\bar{\lambda}_{p}^{2}\right)t'^{2} - \frac{2}{\pi}\left(2F_{2}x_{0}^{2} - F_{1}x_{0}\right)\bar{\lambda}_{p}t' + F_{2}x_{0}^{2} - F_{1}x_{0} + F_{0}$$

(F.8) 
$$\frac{\mathrm{d}f\left(\lambda_{p},t';z,\lambda_{d\mathrm{m}}\right)}{\mathrm{d}t'} = \left(-z\lambda_{d\mathrm{m}}\bar{\lambda}_{p} + F_{2}x_{0}^{2}\bar{\lambda}_{p}^{2}\right)t' - \frac{2}{\pi}\left(2F_{2}x_{0}^{2} - F_{1}x_{0}\right)\bar{\lambda}_{p}$$

From  $df(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'; z, \lambda_{dm})/dt' = 0$  we can get,

(F.9) 
$$t'_{sp} = \frac{\frac{2}{\pi} \left( F_1 x_0 - 2F_2 x_0^2 \right)}{z \lambda_{dm} - F_2 x_0^2 \bar{\lambda}_p}$$

Thus,

(F.10)  

$$f(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}) = f(\bar{\lambda}_{p}, t_{sp}'; z, \lambda_{dm})$$

$$\approx \frac{\frac{2}{\pi^{2}} (F_{1}x_{0} - 2F_{2}x_{0}^{2})^{2} \bar{\lambda}_{p}}{z\lambda_{dm} - F_{2}x_{0}^{2} \bar{\lambda}_{p}} + F_{2}x_{0}^{2} - F_{1}x_{0} + F_{0}z_{0}^{2} \bar{\lambda}_{p}$$

$$\approx \frac{\frac{2}{\pi^{2}} (F_{1}x_{0} - 2F_{2}x_{0}^{2})^{2} \bar{\lambda}_{p}}{z\lambda_{dm}} + F_{2}x_{0}^{2} - F_{1}x_{0} + F_{0}z_{0}^{2} \bar{\lambda}_{p}}$$

And,

(F.11) 
$$\sum_{p=2}^{N} f(\lambda_p, t_{sp}) = \sum_{p=2}^{N} f(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'_{sp}; z, \lambda_{dm})$$
$$= \sum_{p=2}^{N} \frac{\frac{2}{\pi^2} \left(F_1 x_0 - 2F_2 x_0^2\right)^2 \bar{\lambda}_p}{z \lambda_{dm}} + F_2 x_0^2 - F_1 x_0 + F_0$$

And,

(F.12) 
$$\frac{\mathrm{d}^2 f\left(\bar{\lambda}_p, t'; z, \lambda_{\mathrm{dm}}\right)}{\mathrm{d}t'^2} = z\lambda_{\mathrm{dm}}\bar{\lambda}_p\left(-1 + 4zF_2\frac{\lambda_{\mathrm{dm}}\bar{\lambda}_p}{2}\right) = z\lambda'_p\left(-1 + 4zF_2\frac{\lambda'_p}{2}\right)$$

APPENDIX G.  $\sum_{i=2}^{N} \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1)(p-1)$  AND  $\sum_{i=2}^{N} \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1)(p-1)$  WHEN  $N \to \infty$ The identity (D.1) and (G.1) will be used in the following,

(G.1) 
$$\sum_{k=1}^{N} \sin kx = \frac{\sin \frac{N+1}{2}x \sin \frac{N}{2}x}{\sin \frac{x}{2}}$$

(G.2)  

$$\sum_{i=2}^{N} \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) (i-1)$$

$$= \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \sin \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] k$$

$$= -\sin N \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] + \sum_{k=1}^{N} \sin \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] k$$

$$= \frac{\sin \frac{N+1}{2} \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] \sin \frac{N}{2} \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right]}{\sin \frac{1}{2} \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right]}$$

$$= \frac{\cos (p-1) \pi \sin \frac{(p-1)\pi}{N} \sin (p-1) \pi}{\sin \frac{(p-1)\pi}{N}}$$

$$= \cos (p-1) \pi \sin (p-1) \pi$$

= 0

$$\sum_{i=2}^{N} \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) (i-1)$$

$$= \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \cos \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] k$$

$$= \left\{ \sum_{k=0}^{N} \cos \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] k \right\} - \cos \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] 0 - \cos \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] N$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \left\{ 1 + \frac{\sin (N+1) \left[ \frac{2\pi}{N} (p-1) \right]}{\sin \left[ \frac{\pi}{N} (p-1) \right]} \right\} - 2$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \left\{ 1 + \frac{2 \sin \left[ \frac{\pi}{N} (p-1) \right] \cos \left[ \frac{\pi}{N} (p-1) \right]}{\sin \left[ \frac{\pi}{N} (p-1) \right]} \right\} - 2$$

$$= -\frac{1}{2} (N \to \infty)$$

Appendix H.  $\mathcal Z$  and  $I_p$  for Ising model in a non-zero external magnetic field

Using the following N-dimensional Gaussian integrals for a positive definite matrix A (namely Hubbard-Stratonovich transformation in section 2),

(H.1)  
$$\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{\mathrm{d}x_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}x_i A_{ij} x_j + x_i s_i\right) = \left[\det \mathbf{A}\right]^{-1/2} \exp\left(\frac{1}{2}s_i A_{ij}^{-1} s_j\right)$$

and writing the Ising model (55) in the following form (Let  $K_{ij} = A_{ij}^{-1}$ ), we have,

(H.2) 
$$\exp\left(\frac{1}{2}s_iK_{ij}s_j\right) = \frac{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\cdots\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\prod_{i=1}^{N}\frac{\mathrm{d}x_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}x_iK_{ij}^{-1}x_j + x_is_i\right)}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\cdots\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\prod_{i=1}^{N}\frac{\mathrm{d}x_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}x_iK_{ij}^{-1}x_j\right)}$$

Then the partition function is,

$$\begin{aligned} &(\text{H.3}) \\ \mathcal{Z} = \frac{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{dx_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}x_i K_{ij}^{-1} x_j\right) \sum_{\{s_i\}} \exp\left[s_i \left(x_i + \tilde{h}_i\right)\right]}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{dx_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}x_i K_{ij}^{-1} x_j\right) \\ &= \frac{\underline{\dot{x}}_{i} = \underline{x}_i + \tilde{h}_i}{x_i = \dot{x}_i} \frac{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{dx_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2}\left(x_i - \tilde{h}_i\right) K_{ij}^{-1}\left(x_j - \tilde{h}_j\right)\right] \sum_{\{s_i\}} \exp\left(s_i x_i\right)}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{dx_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2}\left(\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j - 2\tilde{h}_i \phi_i + h_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j\right)\right] \sum_{\{s_i\}} \exp\left(s_i K_{ij} \phi_j\right)}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{d\phi_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2}\left(\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j - 2\tilde{h}_i \phi_i + h_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j\right)\right] \\ &= \frac{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{d\phi_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j + \tilde{h}_i \phi_i\right) \sum_{\{s_i\}} \exp\left(s_i K_{ij} \phi_j\right)}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{d\phi_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j + \tilde{h}_i \phi_i\right) \\ &= \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N}\right]^{1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\tilde{h}_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j\right) \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} d\phi_i \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j + \tilde{h}_i \phi_i\right) \\ &= \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N}\right]^{1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\tilde{h}_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j\right) \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{d\phi_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j + \tilde{h}_i \phi_i\right) \right] \\ &= \left[\frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N}\right]^{1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\tilde{h}_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j\right) \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \frac{d\phi_i}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\phi_i K_{ij} \phi_j + \tilde{h}_i \phi_i\right) \right]$$

$$= \left[ \frac{1}{(2\pi)^{N}} \right] \exp \left( -\frac{1}{2} h_{i} K_{ij} h_{j} \right) \int_{-\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty} \prod_{i=1}^{N} \mathrm{d}\phi_{i} \exp \left( -\frac{1}{2} \phi_{i} K_{ij} \phi_{j} + h_{i} \phi_{i} \right) \\ \times \sum_{\{s_{i}\}} \exp \left( s_{i} K_{ij} \phi_{j} \right)$$

where  $\frac{\dot{x}_i = x_i + \tilde{h}_i}{x_i = \dot{x}_i}$  means that firstly  $\dot{x}_i = x_i + \tilde{h}_i$ , and then  $x_i = \dot{x}_i$  without causing confusion.  $\sum_{\{s_i\}} = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1}} \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1} \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \sum_$ 

$$\sum_{\{s_i\}} \exp\left(s_i K_{ij} \phi_j\right)$$

in (H.3) can be evaluated as the follows,

(H.4)  

$$\sum_{\{s_i\}} \exp(s_i K_{ij} \phi_j) = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \exp\left(\sum_p s_i V_{ip} V_{pi} K_{ij} V_{jp} V_{pj} \phi_j\right)$$

$$= \prod_p \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \prod_i \exp\left[s_i \left(V_{ip} \lambda_p y_p\right)\right]$$

$$= \prod_p \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip} \lambda_p y_p\right)\right]\right\}$$

With

$$\tilde{h}_i \phi_i = \tilde{h}_i V_{ip} V_{pi} \phi_i = \tilde{h}_i V_{ip} y_p$$

LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRASE and (H.4), we have,

$$\mathcal{Z} \propto \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{p=1}^{N} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p y_p^2 + \sum_i \tilde{h}_i V_{ip} y_p\right)$$
$$\times \exp\left\{\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip}\lambda_p y_p\right)\right]\right\} dy_p$$
$$(\text{H.5}) = \prod_{p=1} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p y_p^2 + \sum_i \tilde{h}_i V_{ip} y_p\right)$$
$$\times \left\{\exp\sum_i \log\left[\cosh\left(V_{ip}\lambda_p y_p\right)\right]\right\} dy_p$$
$$= \prod_{p=1} I_p$$

And  $I_p$  now is,

When p = 1,

(H.7) 
$$Q_{1} = \sum_{i} \tilde{h}_{i} \left[ \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) \right] t$$
$$= N \tilde{h} t \quad (\text{ie. } N \tilde{h}_{1} t)$$

(H.8) 
$$Q_{2} = \sum_{i} \log \left\{ \cosh \left\{ \left[ \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( p - 1 \right) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} \left( i - 1 \right) \left( p - 1 \right) \right] \lambda_{p} t \right\} \right\}$$
$$= N \log[\cosh(\lambda_{1} t)]$$

(H.9) 
$$I_1 = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_1 t^2 + \tilde{h}_1 t + \log[\cosh(\lambda_1 t)]\right]\right\} dt$$

When p > 1,  $Q_1$  can be obtained according to (G.2) and (G.3),

(H.10)  

$$Q_{1} = \sum_{i} \tilde{h}_{i} \left[ \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) \right] t$$

$$= \tilde{h}_{1}t + \sum_{i=2} \tilde{h}_{i} \left[ \cos \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) + \sin \frac{2\pi}{N} (i-1) (p-1) \right] t$$

$$= \frac{\tilde{h}t}{2}$$

Since  $Q_2$  is the same to (B.7),

(H.11) 
$$I_p = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(\frac{\tilde{h}t}{2}\right) \exp\left[N\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)\right)\right] dt$$

So the partition function now is,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{Z} &= \left[ \frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N} \right]^{1/2} \exp\left( -\frac{1}{2} \tilde{h}_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j \right) I_1 \prod_{p=2} I_p \\ (\mathrm{H.12}) &= \left[ \frac{\det \mathbf{K}}{(2\pi)^N} \right]^{1/2} \exp\left( -\frac{1}{2} \sum_p \frac{\tilde{h}^2}{\lambda_p} \right) I_1 \\ &\qquad \times \prod_{p=2} N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left( \frac{\tilde{h}_1 t}{2} \right) \exp\left[ N \left( -\frac{1}{2} \lambda_p t^2 + \mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t) \right) \right] \mathrm{d}t \\ &\qquad \text{where } \exp\left( -\frac{1}{2} \tilde{h}_i K_{ij}^{-1} \tilde{h}_j \right) = \exp\left( -\frac{1}{2} \sum_p \frac{\tilde{h}^2}{\lambda_p} \right). \end{aligned}$$

# LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRASE

It can be found that the  $\lambda_p$  in exp  $\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_p \tilde{h}^2/\lambda_p\right)$  above is in the denominator, which results in a non-regular  $f(\lambda_p/2)$  (See details in Appendix C). To avoid this and according to (A.4), an extra parameter  $\alpha$  should be added to the partition function (6), i.e.,

$$\mathcal{Z} = \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \exp\left(\frac{1}{2}\sum_{ij} K_{ij}s_is_j\right) \exp\left(2N\alpha\right) \exp\left(-2N\alpha\right)$$
(H.13) 
$$= \sum_{\{s_i = \pm 1\}} \exp\left(-2N\alpha\right) \left[\frac{\det \widetilde{\mathbf{K}}}{(2\pi)^N}\right]^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \prod_{k=1}^N \mathrm{d}\phi_k$$

$$\times \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{ij} \phi_i \widetilde{K}_{ij}\phi_j + \sum_{ij} s_i \widetilde{K}_{ij}\phi_j\right)$$

Finally,  $I_1$  and  $I_p$  (p > 1) now are,

(H.14) 
$$I_{1} = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t^{2} + \tilde{h}t + \log\cosh[(\lambda_{1}t)]\right]\right\} dt \\ \sim 2\exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t_{s1}^{2} + \tilde{h}t_{s1} + \log\left[\cosh\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s1}\right)\right]\right]\right\}\sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\left|\lambda_{1} - \lambda_{1}^{2}\mathrm{sech}^{2}\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s1}\right)\right|}}$$

where  $t_{s1}$  is now from  $t = \tanh(\lambda_1 t) + \tilde{h}/\lambda_1$ .

(H.15) 
$$I_p = N^{1/2} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \exp\left(\frac{\tilde{h}t}{2}\right) \exp\left[N\left(-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_p t^2 + \mathcal{I}(\lambda_p, t)\right)\right] dt$$
$$\sim \exp\left(\frac{\tilde{h}t_{sp}}{2}\right) 2 \exp\left[Nf\left(\lambda_p, t_{sp}\right)\right] \sqrt{\frac{2\pi}{\left|-\lambda_p + \mathcal{I}''\left(\lambda_p, t\right)\right|}}$$

where  $t_{sp}$  is from  $-\lambda_p t + \mathcal{I}'(\lambda_p, t) = 0$ . And the partition function  $\mathcal{Z}$  is,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{Z} &= \exp\left(-2N\alpha\right) \left[\frac{\det \tilde{\mathbf{K}}}{(2\pi)^{N}}\right]^{1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{p}\frac{\tilde{h}^{2}}{\lambda_{p}}\right) I_{1}\prod_{p=2}I_{p} \\ &= \exp\left(-2N\alpha\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{p}\frac{\tilde{h}^{2}}{\lambda_{p}}\right) \\ &\times 2\exp\left\{N\left[-\frac{1}{2}\lambda_{1}t_{s1}^{2} + \tilde{h}t_{s1} + \log\left(\cosh\left(2t_{s1}\frac{\lambda_{1}}{2}\right)\right)\right]\right\} \left|1 - \lambda_{1}\mathrm{sech}^{2}\left(\lambda_{1}t_{s1}\right)\right|^{-1/2} \\ &\times \prod_{p=2}\exp\left(\frac{\tilde{h}t_{sp}}{2}\right) - 2\exp[Nf(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp})] \left|-1 + \frac{\mathcal{I}''\left(\lambda_{p}, t_{sp}\right)}{\lambda_{p}}\right|^{-1/2} \end{aligned}$$

### References

- [1] Amit, D. J., Martin-Mayor, V., 2005. Field theory, the renormalization group, and critical phenomena: graphs to computers. World Scientific Publishing Company.
- [2] Berlin, T. H., Kac, M., 1952. The spherical model of a ferromagnet, Physical Review, 86 (6): 821-835.
- [3] Bragg, W.L., Williams, E.J., 1934. The effect of Thermal Agitation on Atomic Arrangement in Alloys. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A, 145, 699-730.
- Bragg, W.L., Williams, E. J., 1935. The effect of Thermal Agitation on Atomic Arrangement in Alloys II. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A, 151, 540-566.
- [5] Dixon, J. M., Tuszynski, J. A., Nip, M. L. A., 2001. Exact eigenvalues of the Ising Hamiltonian in one-, two- and three-dimensions in the absence of a magnetic field, Physica A, 289: 137-156.
- [6] Fang, S, Zhou, Z. Z., Deng, Y. J., 2022. Geometric Upper Critical Dimensions of the Ising Model, Chinese Phys. Lett., 39, 080502.
- [7] Feynman, R. P., 2018. Statistical mechanics: a set of lectures. CRC press.
- [8] Fisher, M. E., Perk, J. H.,2016. Comments concerning the Ising model and two letters by NH March. Physics Letters A, 380(13), 1339-1340.
- [9] Ginzburg, V. L., Landau, L. D., 1950. To the Theory of Superconductivity, Journal of Experimental and Theoretical Physics, 20, 064-1082.
- [10] Huang, K., 1987. Statistical Mechanics (2nd Edition), John Wiley & Sons, Inc..
- [11] Kocharovsky, V. V., Kocharovsky, V. V., 2015. Towards an exact solution for the three-dimensional Ising model: A method of the recurrence equations for partial contractions. Physics Letters A, 379(39): 2520-2523.
- [12] Kopietz, P., Bartosch, L., Schütz, F., 2010. Introduction to the functional renormalization group. Springer Science & Business Media.
- [13] Kramers, H. A., Wannier, G. H., 1941. Statistics of the Two-Dimensional Ferromagnet. Part I. Phys. Rev., 60: 252-262.
- [14] Landau, L. D., 1937. On the Theory of Phase Transitions, Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz. 7, 19-32.

LIMITING FREE ENERGY PER PARTICLE FOR ISING MODEL BY APPROXIMATING ITS FUNCTIONAL INTEGRAT

- [15] Mezö, I. and Keady, G., 2016. Some physical applications of generalized Lambert functions, Eur. J. Phys.,37, 065802.
- [16] Onsager, L., 1944. Crystal Statistics. I. A Two-Dimensional Model with an Order-Disorder Transition. Phys. Rev., 65(3-4): 117-149.
- [17] Perk, J. H. H., 2013. Erroneous solution of three-dimensional (3D) simple orthorhombic Ising lattices, https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.1209.0731.
- [18] Thompson, B. V., 1965. Variational Calculation for the Ising Model, Physical review, 138 (5A), 1434-1441.
- [19] Viswanathan, G.M., Portillo, M.A.G., Raposo, E.P., da Luz, M.G.E., 2022. What does it take to solve the 3D Ising model? Minimal necessary conditions for a valid solution, https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2205.12357.
- [20] Whittaker, E. T. and Watson, G. N., A Course of Modern Analysis, Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1958.
- [21] Williams, E. J., 1935. The effect of Thermal Agitation on Atomic Arrangement in Alloys III. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A, 152, 231-252.
- [22] Wu, F. Y., McCoy, B. M., Fisher, M. E., Chayes, L., 2008a. Comment on a recent conjectured solution of the three-dimensional Ising model. Philosophical Magazine, 88(26): 3093-3095.
- [23] Wu, F. Y., McCoy, B. M., Fisher, M. E., Chayes, L., 2008b. Rejoinder to the Response to 'Comment on a recent conjectured solution of the three-dimensional Ising model'. Philosophical Magazine, 88(26): 3103-3103.
- [24] Xu, J.X., Ferrenberg, A.M.,Landau, D.P., 2018. 92 Years of the Ising Model: A High Resolution Monte Carlo Study, IOP Conf. Series: Journal of Physics: Conf. Series 1012 (2018) 012002 doi:10.1088/1742-6596/1012/1/012002.
- [25] Zhang, Z. D., 2007. Conjectures on the exact solution of three-dimensional (3D) simple orthorhombic Ising lattices, Philos. Mag. 87: 5309–5419

College of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, PRC, 100049

Email address: wrq1973@ucas.edu.cn