

Comment on ‘‘Thermodynamic principle for quantum metrology’’

Shane Dooley,* Michael J. Kewming, Mark T. Mitchison, and John Goold
School of Physics, Trinity College Dublin, College Green, Dublin 2, Ireland
 (Dated: May 24, 2022)

Summary. In *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 128, 200501 (2022) [1] the authors consider the thermodynamic cost of quantum metrology. One of the main results is their Eq. 3:

$$\mathcal{S} \geq \log(2) \|\hat{h}_\lambda\|^{-2} F_Q[\psi_\lambda], \quad (1)$$

which purports to relate the Shannon entropy \mathcal{S} of an optimal measurement (i.e., in the basis of the symmetric logarithmic derivative) to the quantum Fisher information F_Q of the pure state $|\psi_\lambda\rangle$. However, we show below that in the setting considered by the authors we have $\mathcal{S} = \log(2)$ and $\|\hat{h}_\lambda\|^2 = \max_{\psi_\lambda} F_Q[\psi_\lambda]$, so that Eq. 3 reduces to the trivial inequality $\max_{\psi_\lambda} F_Q[\psi_\lambda] \geq F_Q[\psi_\lambda]$, and does not in fact relate the entropy \mathcal{S} to the quantum Fisher information. Moreover, for pure state quantum metrology, there exist optimal measurements (though not in the basis of the symmetric logarithmic derivative) for which $0 \leq \mathcal{S} \leq \log(2)$, leading to violations of Eq. 1 for some states $|\psi_\lambda\rangle$.

Background. In deriving Eq. 1, the authors restrict their analysis to pure states $|\psi_\lambda\rangle = \hat{U}_\lambda|\psi\rangle$ for some unitary \hat{U}_λ , where λ is an unknown parameter to be estimated. If we measure $|\psi_\lambda\rangle$ with the POVM $\{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}$, the estimation error is bounded by the Cramér-Rao inequality $\delta\lambda \geq 1/\sqrt{F[\psi_\lambda, \{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}]}$, where:

$$F[\psi_\lambda, \{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}] = \sum_\alpha \{\partial_\lambda \langle \psi_\lambda | \hat{\Pi}_\alpha | \psi_\lambda \rangle\}^2 / \langle \psi_\lambda | \hat{\Pi}_\alpha | \psi_\lambda \rangle, \quad (2)$$

$$= \frac{1}{4} \sum_\alpha \{\text{Tr}[\hat{L}_\lambda \hat{\Pi}_\alpha]\}^2 / \langle \psi_\lambda | \hat{\Pi}_\alpha | \psi_\lambda \rangle \quad (3)$$

is the (classical) Fisher information, and we have defined the (pure state) symmetric logarithmic derivative (SLD):

$$\hat{L}_\lambda = 2|\psi_\lambda\rangle\langle\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda| + 2|\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda\rangle\langle\psi_\lambda|. \quad (4)$$

It is known that the (classical) Fisher information can be maximised (with respect to the choice of measurement) by choosing $\{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}$ to be the projectors onto the eigenbasis of \hat{L}_λ [2]. From Eq. 4 it is clear that the support of \hat{L}_λ is a two-dimensional subspace that is spanned by the orthonormal states $|\psi_\lambda\rangle$ and $|\psi_\lambda^\perp\rangle = \mathcal{N}(\hat{\mathbb{I}} - |\psi_\lambda\rangle\langle\psi_\lambda|)|\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda\rangle$, where $\mathcal{N} = 1/\sqrt{\langle\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda|\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda\rangle - |\langle\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda|\psi_\lambda\rangle|^2}$ ensures normalisation of $|\psi_\lambda^\perp\rangle$. In this basis the SLD is:

$$\hat{L}_\lambda = \frac{2}{\mathcal{N}}(|\psi_\lambda\rangle\langle\psi_\lambda^\perp| + |\psi_\lambda^\perp\rangle\langle\psi_\lambda|), \quad (5)$$

with the eigenstates $|\pm\rangle = (|\psi_\lambda\rangle \pm |\psi_\lambda^\perp\rangle)/\sqrt{2}$ (all other eigenstates of \hat{L}_λ have zero eigenvalue, and have zero

overlap with $|\psi_\lambda\rangle$). The optimal POVM therefore includes the projectors $\hat{\Pi}_\pm = |\pm\rangle\langle\pm|$, and for such a measurement we obtain the *quantum* Fisher information (QFI):

$$F_Q[\psi_\lambda] = \max_{\{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}} F[\psi_\lambda, \{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}] \quad (6)$$

$$= 4\langle\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda|\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda\rangle - 4|\langle\partial_\lambda\psi_\lambda|\psi_\lambda\rangle|^2. \quad (7)$$

It was shown in Ref. [3] that a further optimization over the input state $|\psi\rangle$ gives the ultimate limit of pure-state quantum metrology, $\|\hat{h}_\lambda\|^2 = \max_\psi F_Q[\hat{U}_\lambda|\psi\rangle]$, where $\hat{h}_\lambda = i\hat{U}_\lambda^\dagger\partial_\lambda\hat{U}$ and $\|\bullet\|$ is the operator seminorm (the difference between the maximum and minimum eigenvalues of \bullet).

Entropy of optimal measurement. The Shannon entropy corresponding to the outcome of the POVM $\{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}$ is $\mathcal{S}[\{\hat{\Pi}_\alpha\}] = -\sum_\alpha \langle\psi_\lambda|\hat{\Pi}_\alpha|\psi_\lambda\rangle \log\langle\psi_\lambda|\hat{\Pi}_\alpha|\psi_\lambda\rangle$. For an optimal measurement in the eigenbasis $|\pm\rangle$ of the SLD, we have the measurement outcome probabilities $p_\pm = |\langle\psi_\lambda|\pm\rangle|^2 = 1/2$. For pure-state quantum metrology, the Shannon entropy of such a measurement is therefore always $\mathcal{S} = \log(2)$. This, combined with $\|\hat{h}_\lambda\|^2 = \max_\psi F_Q[\hat{U}_\lambda|\psi\rangle]$, shows that the inequality 1 reduces to the trivial inequality $\max_\psi F_Q[\psi_\lambda] \geq F_Q[\psi_\lambda]$.

Violation of the inequality. For pure-state quantum metrology, the eigenbasis of \hat{L}_λ is not the only measurement basis that maximises the (classical) Fisher information [2]. Consider a POVM with the projectors $\hat{\Pi}_q = |q\rangle\langle q|$ and $\hat{\Pi}_{\bar{q}} = |\bar{q}\rangle\langle\bar{q}|$, where $|q\rangle = \sqrt{q}|\psi_\lambda\rangle + \sqrt{1-q}|\psi_\lambda^\perp\rangle$, $|\bar{q}\rangle = \sqrt{1-q}|\psi_\lambda\rangle - \sqrt{q}|\psi_\lambda^\perp\rangle$, $0 \leq q \leq 1$. Substituting this projective measurement into Eq. 3 gives $F[\psi_\lambda, \{\hat{\Pi}_q, \hat{\Pi}_{\bar{q}}\}] = F_Q[\psi_\lambda]$, i.e., such a measurement maximises the (classical) Fisher information for any value of q . However, the Shannon entropy of this measurement is $\mathcal{S} = -q \log q - (1-q) \log(1-q)$, which can fall anywhere in the range $0 \leq \mathcal{S} \leq \log(2)$ depending on the value of q . This shows that the inequality 1 can be violated. We now present a simple example showing this violation.

Single-qubit example. Consider the λ -dependent single-qubit state $|\psi_\lambda\rangle = e^{-i\lambda\hat{\sigma}_z/2}(|0\rangle + |1\rangle)/\sqrt{2}$, where $\hat{\sigma}_z = |0\rangle\langle 0| - |1\rangle\langle 1|$. Using Eq. 7 the quantum Fisher information of this state is calculated to be $F_Q[\psi_\lambda] = 1$, and $\|\hat{h}_\lambda\|^2 = \|\hat{\sigma}_z/2\|^2 = 1$. Now consider a projective measurement of the observable $\hat{\sigma}(\phi) = \hat{\sigma}_x \cos \phi + \hat{\sigma}_y \sin \phi$ (i.e., the measurement projects onto its eigenstates $(|0\rangle \pm e^{i\phi}|1\rangle)/\sqrt{2}$), which gives the outcome probabilities $p_\pm = \frac{1}{2}[1 \pm \cos(\phi - \lambda)]$ and the Shannon entropy $\mathcal{S} = -p_+ \log p_+ - p_- \log p_-$. Using Eq. 3 it is also

straightforward to calculate the (classical) Fisher information of this measurement as $F = 1 = F_Q$, i.e., the measurement is optimal, independent of the measurement angle ϕ . However, choosing $\phi = \lambda$, for example, gives: $\mathcal{S} = 0 \not\geq \log(2) = \log(2) \|\hat{h}_\lambda\|^2 F_Q[\psi_\lambda]$, clearly violating inequality 1.

-
- [1] Yaoming Chu and Jianming Cai, “Thermodynamic principle for quantum metrology,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **128**, 200501 (2022).
 - [2] Samuel L. Braunstein and Carlton M. Caves, “Statistical distance and the geometry of quantum states,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **72**, 3439–3443 (1994).
 - [3] Sergio Boixo, Steven T Flammia, Carlton M Caves, and John M Geremia, “Generalized limits for single-parameter quantum estimation,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **98**, 090401 (2007).

* dooleysh@gmail.com