

A note on the Nielsen realization problem for connected sums of $S^2 \times S^1$

Bruno P. Zimmermann
 Università degli Studi di Trieste
 Dipartimento di Matematica e Geoscienze
 34127 Trieste, Italy

Abstract. We consider finite group-actions on 3-manifolds \mathcal{H}_g obtained as the connected sum of g copies of $S^2 \times S^1$, with free fundamental group F_g of rank g . We prove that, for $g > 1$, a finite group of diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g inducing a trivial action on homology is cyclic and embeds into an S^1 -action on \mathcal{H}_g . As a consequence, no non-trivial element of the twist subgroup of the mapping class group of \mathcal{H}_g (generated by Dehn twists along embedded 2-spheres) can be realized by a periodic diffeomorphism of \mathcal{H}_g (in the sense of the Nielsen realization problem). We also discuss when a finite subgroup of the outer automorphism group $\text{Out}(F_g)$ of the fundamental group of \mathcal{H}_g can be realized by a group of diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g .

2010 Mathematics Subject Classification: 57M60, 57M27, 57S25

Key words and phrases: 3-manifold; connected sums of $S^2 \times S^1$; finite group action; mapping class group; outer automorphism group of the fundamental group; Nielsen realization problem

1. Introduction

All finite group-actions in the present paper will be faithful, smooth and orientation-preserving, all manifolds orientable. We are interested in finite group-actions on connected sums $\mathcal{H}_g = \#_g(S^2 \times S^1)$ of g copies of $S^2 \times S^1$; we will call \mathcal{H}_g a *closed handle of genus g* in the following. The fundamental group of \mathcal{H}_g is the free group F_g of rank g . Considering induced actions on the fundamental group and on the first homology $H_1(\mathcal{H}_g) \cong \mathbb{Z}^g$, there are canonical maps

$$\text{Diff}(\mathcal{H}_g) \rightarrow \text{Out}(F_g) \rightarrow \text{GL}(g, \mathbb{Z})$$

where $\text{Diff}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ denotes the orientation-preserving diffeomorphism group of \mathcal{H}_g and $\text{Out}(F_g) = \text{Aut}(F_g)/\text{Inn}(F_g)$ the outer automorphism group of its fundamental group.

Theorem 1. *Let G be a finite group acting on a closed handle \mathcal{H}_g of genus $g > 1$ such that the induced action on the first homology of \mathcal{H}_g is trivial. Then G is cyclic and a subgroup of an S^1 -action on \mathcal{H}_g ; in particular, all elements of G are isotopic to the identity.*

For a description and classification of circle-actions on 3-manifolds and closed handles, see [14].

Denoting by $\text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ the *mapping class group* of isotopy classes of orientation-preserving diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g , there are induced maps

$$\text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g) \rightarrow \text{Out}(F_g) \rightarrow \text{GL}(g, \mathbb{Z}).$$

Let $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ denote the subgroup of $\text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ generated by all Dehn twists along embedded 2-spheres in \mathcal{H}_g (i.e., by cutting along a 2-sphere and regluing after twisting by one full turn around an axis; since such a twist represents a generator of $\pi_1(SO(3)) \cong \mathbb{Z}_2$, its square is isotopic to the identity). By classical results of Laudenbach [6],[7] there is a short exact sequence

$$1 \rightarrow \text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g) \hookrightarrow \text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g) \rightarrow \text{Out}(F_g) \rightarrow 1;$$

moreover $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g) \cong (\mathbb{Z}_2)^g$ is generated by the sphere twists around the core spheres $S^2 \times *$ of the g different $S^2 \times S^1$ summands of \mathcal{H}_g (twists around separating 2-spheres instead are isotopic to the identity). It is proved in [1] that $\text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ is isomorphic to a semidirect product $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g) \rtimes \text{Out}(F_g)$. Theorem 1 has the following consequence (in the sense of the *Nielsen realization problem*).

Corollary 1. *No nontrivial element of the twist group $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ can be realized (represented) by a periodic diffeomorphism of \mathcal{H}_g .*

For $g > 1$ this follows from Theorem 1 but the methods apply also to the case $g = 1$ of $\mathcal{H}_1 = S^2 \times S^1$, using the fact that $S^2 \times S^1$ is a geometric 3-manifold belonging to the $(S^2 \times \mathbb{R})$ -geometry (one of Thurston's eight 3-dimensional geometries, see [15]), and that finite group-actions on $S^2 \times S^1$ are geometric ([10, Theorem 8.4]).

For a solution of the Nielsen realization problem for aspherical and Haken 3-manifolds, see [21] (here finite groups of mapping classes can always be realized, except for a purely algebraic obstruction in the case of Seifert fiber spaces where, however, a finite inflation of the group can always be realized).

By [6], homotopic diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g are isotopic but this does not remain true for arbitrary connected sums of 3-manifolds. By [4], twists around separating 2-spheres in a 3-manifold may or may not be homotopic to the identity, moreover by [3] there are sphere-twists which are homotopic but not isotopic to the identity (see also the discussion in the introduction of [1]). As an example, considering a connected sum $M = M_1 \sharp M_2$ of two closed hyperbolic 3-manifolds M_1 and M_2 , the sphere-twist around the connecting 2-sphere is not homotopic to the identity; also, it cannot be realized by a periodic map (e.g., if M_1 or M_2 does not admit a nontrivial periodic map then also the connected sum $M = M_1 \sharp M_2$ has no periodic maps).

There arises naturally the question of which finite subgroups of $\text{Out}(F_g)$ can be realized by a finite group of diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g . Finite groups G of diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g which act faithfully on the fundamental group (i.e., inject into $\text{Out}(F_g)$) are considered in [17] where, for $g \geq 15$, the quadratic upper bound $|G| \leq 24g(g-1)$ for their orders is obtained. Since $\text{Out}(F_g)$ has finite subgroups of larger orders, these subgroups cannot be realized by finite groups of diffeomorphisms (by [16] the maximal order of a finite subgroup of $\text{Out}(F_g)$ is $2^g g!$, for $g > 2$). A precise result is as follows (we refer to [17, section 2] for definitions and the proof).

Theorem 2. *Let G be a finite subgroup of $\text{Out}(F_g)$ and $1 \rightarrow F_g \rightarrow E \rightarrow G \rightarrow 1$ the corresponding group extension associated to G . Then G can be realized by an isomorphic group of diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g if and only if E is isomorphic to the fundamental group $\pi_1(\Gamma, \mathcal{G})$ of a finite graph of finite groups (Γ, \mathcal{G}) in normal form associated to a closed handle-orbifold (in particular, the vertex groups (Γ, \mathcal{G}) have to be isomorphic to finite subgroups of $SO(4)$ and the edge groups to finite subgroups of $SO(3)$).*

We note that, for a finite group G acting on a closed handle \mathcal{H}_g , the quotient \mathcal{H}_g/G has the structure of a closed handle-orbifold (see [17]). Analogous results on finite group-actions on 3-dimensional handlebodies are obtained in [8] and [12] (and in [9] for finite group-actions on handlebodies in arbitrary dimensions).

The case $g = 2$ is special. By well-known results,

$$\text{Out}(F_2) \cong \text{Aut}(\mathbb{Z}^2) \cong \text{GL}(2, \mathbb{Z}) \cong \mathbb{D}_6 *_{\mathbb{D}_2} \mathbb{D}_4,$$

so up to conjugation the maximal finite subgroups of $\text{Out}(F_2)$ are the dihedral groups \mathbb{D}_6 and \mathbb{D}_4 of orders 12 and 8, and both can be realized by diffeomorphisms of the torus with one boundary component (hence, if the realizations of the amalgamated subgroups \mathbb{D}_2 coincide, one obtains a realization of the whole group $\text{Out}(F_2) \cong \mathbb{D}_6 *_{\mathbb{D}_2} \mathbb{D}_4$). Considering the product with a closed interval, one obtains realizations on the handlebody V_2 of genus 2 and also on its double \mathcal{H}_2 along the boundary.

Concerning the case $g = 3$, by [18] there are exactly five maximal finite subgroups of $\text{Out}(F_3)$ up to conjugation; by an easy application of Theorem 2, all of these maximal finite subgroups can be realized by diffeomorphisms of the closed handle \mathcal{H}_3 of genus 3 (but not of a handlebody V_3 of genus 3).

2. Proof of Theorem 1

Let G be a finite group acting faithfully and orientation-preservingly on a closed handle $\mathcal{H}_g = \sharp_g(S^2 \times S^1)$ of genus g . By the equivariant sphere theorem (see [10] for an approach by minimal surface techniques, [2] and [5] for topological-combinatorial proofs), there exists an embedded, homotopically nontrivial 2-sphere S^2 in \mathcal{H}_g such that $x(S^2) = S^2$

or $x(S^2) \cap S^2 = \emptyset$ for all $x \in G$. We cut \mathcal{H}_g along the system of disjoint 2-spheres $G(S^2)$, by removing the interiors of G -equivariant regular neighbourhoods $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$ of these 2-spheres, and call each of these regular neighbourhoods $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$ a 1-handle. The result is a collection of 3-manifolds with 2-sphere boundaries, with an induced action of G . We close each of the 2-sphere boundaries by a 3-ball and extend the action of G by taking the cone over the center of each of these 3-balls, so G permutes these 3-balls and their centers. The result is a finite collection of closed handles of lower genus on which G acts (cf. [17]). Applying inductively the procedure of cutting along 2-spheres, we finally end up with a finite collection of 3-spheres or 0-handles (closed handles of genus 0). Note that the construction gives a finite graph Γ on which G acts whose vertices correspond to the 0-handles and whose edges to the 1-handles. Note that Γ has no *free edges*, i.e. edges with one vertex of valence 1.

On each 3-sphere (0-handle) there are finitely many points which are the centers of the attached 3-balls (their boundaries are the 2-spheres along which the 1-handles are attached). For each of these 3-spheres, let G_v denote its stabilizer in G (by the geometrization of finite group-actions on 3-manifolds, one may assume that the action of a stabilizer G_v on the corresponding 3-sphere is orthogonal but this is not needed for the following). Denoting by G_e the stabilizer in G of a 1-handle $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$, we can assume that each stabilizer G_e preserves the product structure of $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$ of the corresponding 1-handle (by choosing small equivariant regular neighbourhoods of the 2-spheres). If some element of a stabilizer G_e acts as a reflection on $[-1, 1]$, we split the 1-handle into two 1-handles by introducing a new 0-handle obtained from a small regular neighbourhood $S^2 \times [-\epsilon, \epsilon]$ of $S^2 \times \{0\}$ by closing up with two 3-balls. Hence we can assume that each stabilizer G_e of a 1-handle $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$ does not interchange its two boundary 2-spheres; that is, G acts *without inversions* on the graph Γ .

Suppose now that $g > 1$ and that the induced action of G on the first homology of \mathcal{H}_g and hence also of Γ is trivial. As before, G acts without inversions on Γ and Γ has no free edges. We will prove in next Proposition that under these hypotheses the action of G on Γ is trivial, that is each element of G acts as the identity on Γ . Hence G fixes each vertex and each edge of Γ .

Since G fixes each 1-handle $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$, it maps each 2-sphere $S^2 \times \{0\}$ to itself. By construction, G does not interchange the two sides of such a 2-sphere and acts faithfully on it (otherwise some element of G would act trivially on an invariant regular neighbourhood of such a 2-sphere and then act trivially also on all of \mathcal{H}_g (well-known in particular for smooth actions)). It follows that G is isomorphic to a finite subgroup of the orthogonal group $\text{SO}(3)$, i.e. cyclic \mathbb{Z}_n , dihedral \mathbb{D}_{2n} , tetrahedral \mathbb{A}_4 , octahedral \mathbb{S}_4 or dodecahedral \mathbb{A}_5 . It is easy to see that an orientation-preserving action of \mathbb{D}_{2n} , \mathbb{A}_4 , \mathbb{S}_4 or \mathbb{A}_5 on S^3 has at most two global fixed points around which a 1-handle can be attached; but then the graph Γ would be a segment or a circle, that is $g \leq 1$. Since $g > 1$, G is a cyclic group which acts by rotations around an axis S^1 in each 0-handle

S^3 . By the positive solution of the Smith-conjecture [13], each of these axes is a trivial knot in S^3 , and hence the action of the cyclic group G embeds into an S^1 -action on each 0-handle. Since these S^1 -actions on the 0-handles extend to the connecting 1-handles $S^2 \times [-1, 1]$, the cyclic G -action on \mathcal{H}_g embeds into an S^1 -action.

To complete the proof of Theorem 1, it remains to prove the following Proposition (which may be considered as an analogue of Theorem 1 for finite graphs).

Proposition. *Let G be a finite group acting faithfully on a finite connected graph Γ without free edges and of genus $g > 1$ (or cycle rank, or rank of its free fundamental group). Then also the induced action of G on the first homology $H_1(\Gamma) \cong \mathbb{Z}^g$ of Γ is faithful.*

Proof. By subdividing edges, we can assume that G acts without inversion of edges on Γ . Suppose that an element $x \in G$ acts trivially on the first homology of Γ . Then its Lefschetz number is $1 - g$ which, by the Hopf trace formula, is equal to the Euler characteristic of the fixed point set of x which is a subgraph Γ' of Γ (since G acts without inversions of edges). The graph Γ of genus g has Euler characteristic $1 - g$; passing from Γ' to Γ by adding successively the missing edges, the Euler characteristic remains unchanged (when adding a free edge) or decreases. Since Γ has no free edges, this implies $\Gamma' = \Gamma$, and hence x acts trivially on Γ . This completes the proof of the Proposition.

By [19, proof of Satz 3.1], each finite subgroup of $\text{Out}(F_g)$ can be realized by an action of the group on a finite graph Γ without free edges (this is a version of the *Nielsen realization problem for finite graphs* which several years later was "rediscovered" by various authors); the Proposition implies then the following well-known result.

Corollary 2. *The canonical projection $\text{Out}(F_g) \rightarrow \text{GL}(g, \mathbb{Z})$ is injective on finite subgroups of $\text{Out}(F_g)$.*

We note that not all finite subgroups of $\text{GL}(g, \mathbb{Z})$ are induced in this way by finite subgroups of $\text{Out}(F_g)$; in fact, for $g = 2, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9$ and 10 there are finite subgroups of $\text{GL}(g, \mathbb{Z})$ of orders larger than $2^g g!$ (which, by [16], is the maximal order of a finite subgroup of $\text{Out}(F_g)$). On the other hand, there are also small cyclic subgroups of $\text{GL}(g, \mathbb{Z})$ which cannot be realized in this way, see the discussion in [20, section 5].

References

- [1] T. Brendle, N. Broaddus, A. Putman, *The mapping class group of connected sums of $S^2 \times S^1$* , arXiv 2012:01529
- [2] M.J. Dunwoody, *An equivariant sphere theorem*, Bull. London Math. Soc. 17 (1985), 437-448
- [3] J.L. Friedman, D.M. Witt, *Homotopy is not isotopy for homeomorphisms of 3-manifolds*, Topology 25 (1986), 35-44
- [4] H. Hendriks, *Applications de la théorie d'obstruction en dimension 3*, Bull. Soc. Math. France Mém. 53 (1977), 81-196
- [5] W. Jaco, J.H. Rubinstein, *PL equivariant surgery and invariant decompositions of 3-manifolds*, Adv. in Math. 73 (1989), 149-191
- [6] F. Laudenbach, *Sur le 2-sphères d'une variété de diemson 3*, Ann. Math. 97 (1973), 57-81
- [7] F. Laudenbach, *Topologie de la dimension trois: homotopie et isotopie*, Société Mathématique de France, Paris 1974
- [8] D. McCullough, A. Miller, B. Zimmermann, *Group actions on handlebodies*, Proc. London Math. Soc. 59 (1989), 373-415
- [9] M. Mecchia, B. Zimmermann, *On finite groups of isometries of handlebodies in arbitrary dimensions and finite extensions of Schottky groups*, Fund. Math. 230 (2015), 237-249
- [10] W.H. Meeks, P. Scott, *Finite group actions on 3-manifolds*, Invent. math. 86 (1986) , 287-346
- [11] W.H. Meeks, L. Simon, S.T. Yau, *Embedded minimal surfaces, exotic spheres, and manifolds with positive Ricci curvature*, Ann. of Math. 116 (1982) , 621-659
- [12] A. Miller, B. Zimmermann, *Large groups of symmetries of handlebodies*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 106 (1989), 829-838
- [13] J.W. Morgan, H. Bass, *The Smith Conjecture*, Academic Press 1984
- [14] F. Raymond, *Classification of actions of the circle on 3-manifolds*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 131 (1968), 51-78
- [15] P. Scott, *The geometries of 3-manifolds*, Bull. London Math. Soc. 15 (1983), 401-487
- [16] S. Wang, B. Zimmermann, *The maximum order finite groups of outer automorphisms of free groups*, Math. Z. 216 (1994), 83-87
- [17] B. Zimmermann, *On finite groups acting on a connected sum of 3-manifolds $S^2 \times S^1$* , Fund. Math. 226 (2014), 131-142
- [18] B. Zimmermann, *Finite groups of outer automorphism groups of free groups*, Glasgow Math. J. 38 (1996), 275-282

- [19] B. Zimmermann, *Über Homöomorphismen n -dimensionaler Henkelkörper und endliche Erweiterungen von Schottky-Gruppen*, Comm. Math. Helv. 56 (1981), 474-486
- [20] B. Zimmermann, *Lifting finite groups of outer automorphisms of free groups, surface groups and their abelianizations*, Rend. Istit. Mat. Univ. Trieste 37 (2005), 273-282 (electronic version under <http://rendiconti.dmi.units.it>)
- [21] B. Zimmermann, *Das Nielsensche Realisierungsproblem für hinreichend grosse 3-Mannigfaltigkeiten*, Math. Z. 180 (1982), 349-359

Erratum to:**A note on the Nielsen realization problem for connected sums of $S^2 \times S^1$**

Bruno P. Zimmermann

Department of Mathematics, University of Trieste, Italy

In the recent paper [1], we considered the Nielsen realization problem for finite subgroups of the mapping class groups $\text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ of the 3-manifolds $\mathcal{H}_g = \sharp_g(S^2 \times S^1)$ obtained as the connected sums of g copies of $S^2 \times S^1$ (called *closed handles of genus g* in [1]). Denoting by $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ the subgroup of $\text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ generated by all Dehn twists along embedded 2-spheres in \mathcal{H}_g , there is a short exact sequence

$$1 \rightarrow \text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g) \hookrightarrow \text{Mod}(\mathcal{H}_g) \rightarrow \text{Out}(\pi_1(\mathcal{H}_g)) \rightarrow 1,$$

and $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g) \cong (\mathbb{Z}_2)^g$ is generated by the twists around non-separating 2-spheres in \mathcal{H}_g . As a consequence of the main theorem, it is claimed in [1] that no non-trivial element of the twist group $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ can be realized (represented) by a periodic diffeomorphism of \mathcal{H}_g (in the sense of the Nielsen realization problem); the proof of the main theorem in [1] is incomplete and the theorem has to be modified as follows.

Theorem. *Let G be a finite group of orientation-preserving diffeomorphisms of a closed handle \mathcal{H}_g of genus $g > 1$. If G induces the trivial action on the first homology of \mathcal{H}_g then G is a cyclic group.*

It is further claimed in [1] that G is a subgroup of an S^1 -action on \mathcal{H}_g but the proof is incomplete since, in general, the various S^1 -actions on the building blocks (0-handles) of \mathcal{H}_g don't fit together along the 1-handles to define an S^1 -action on all of \mathcal{H}_g .

Corollary. *A non-cyclic subgroup of the twist group $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ cannot be realized by diffeomorphisms of \mathcal{H}_g .*

It is a consequence of the main theorem in a recent preprint by Lei Chen and Bena Tshishiku [2] that cyclic subgroups of $\text{Twist}(\mathcal{H}_g)$ can be realized by diffeomorphisms; more generally, the authors show that, for every closed oriented 3-manifold M which is a connected sum, a subgroup G of the twist group can be realized if and only if G is cyclic and M is a connected sum of lens spaces (including $S^2 \times S^1$).

References

- [1] Bruno Zimmermann, *A note on the Nielsen realization problem for connected sums of $S^2 \times S^1$* , Rend. Istit. Mat. Univ. Trieste 53, 2021
(electronic versions in: rendiconti.dmi.units.it, arXiv:2105.04901)
- [2] Lei Chen, Bena Tshishiku, *Nielsen realization for twists on 3-manifolds*, preprint 2022
(arXiv:2204.04820)