On rationality of generating function for the number of spanning trees in circulant graphs

A. D. Mednykh,¹ I. A. Mednykh,²

Abstract

Let $F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n$ be the generating function for the number $\tau(n)$ of spanning trees in the circulant graphs $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$. We show that F(x) is a rational function with integer coefficients satisfying the property F(x) = F(1/x). A similar result is also true for the circulant graphs of odd valency $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$. We illustrate the obtained results by a series of examples.

Key Words: spanning tree, circulant graph, Chebyshev polynomial, generating function AMS classification: 05C30, 39A10

1 Introduction

The complexity of a finite connected graph G, denoted by $\tau(G)$, is the number of spanning trees of G. One of the first results on the complexity was obtained by Cayley [5] who proved that the number of spanning trees in the complete graph K_n on n vertices is n^{n-2} .

The famous Kirchhoff's Matrix Tree Theorem [9] states that $\tau(G)$ can be expressed as the product of nonzero Laplacian eigenvalues of G divided by the number of its vertices. Since then, a lot of papers devoted to the complexity of various classes of graphs were published. In particular, explicit formulae were obtained for complete multipartite graphs [5, 2], almost complete graphs [25], wheels [3], fans [8], prisms [4], ladders [19], Möbius ladders [20], lattices [26, 21, 11], anti-prisms [24], complete prisms [18] and for many other families.

Starting with Boesch and Prodinger [3] the idea to study the complexity of graphs by making use of Chebyshev polynomials was implemented. This idea provided a way to find complexity for different families of circulant graphs and their natural generalisations [10, 16, 27, 28, 29, 31, 32, 11].

The asymptotic behavior of complexity for some families of graphs can be investigated from the point of view of so called Malher measure [7], [22], [23]. Mahler measure of a polynomial P(z), with complex coefficients, is the product of the roots of P(z) whose modulus is greater than 1 multiplied by the leading coefficient.

In the recent papers by the authors [14] and [15], explicit formulas for the number of spanning trees $\tau(n)$ in circulant graphs $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ and $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$ were

¹Sobolev Institute of Mathematics, Novosibirsk State University, smedn@mail.ru

²Sobolev Institute of Mathematics, Novosibirsk State University, ilyamednykh@mail.ru

obtained. It was shown that in both cases the number of spanning trees can be represented in the form $\tau(n) = p n a(n)^2$, where a(n) is an integer sequence and p is a prescribed natural number depending on the parity of n. Also, asymptotic formulas for $\tau(n)$ are given through k

the Mahler measure of the associated Laurent polynomial $L(z) = 2k - \sum_{i=1}^{k} (z^{s_k} + z^{-s_k}).$

The main results of present paper are the following. Let $F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n$ be the generating function for the number of spanning trees $\tau(n)$ for the family of circulant graphs $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ or $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$. We show (see Theorem 3 and Theorem 6 respectively) that F(x) is a rational function with integer coefficients satisfying the property F(x) = F(1/x). The obtained results are illustrated by a series of examples.

The idea to write this paper was born during the discussion with professor Sergei Lando on the International Conference and PhD-Master Summer School on Graphs and Groups, Spectra and Symmetries (G2S2) held on August 15 - 28, 2018, in Novosibirsk, Akademgorodok, Russia.

2 Basic definitions and preliminary facts

Let s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k be integers such that $1 \leq s_1 < s_2 < \ldots < s_k \leq \frac{n}{2}$. The graph $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ with n vertices $0, 1, 2, \ldots, n-1$ is called *circulant graph* if the vertex $i, 0 \leq i \leq n-1$ is adjacent to the vertices $i \pm s_1, i \pm s_2, \ldots, i \pm s_k \pmod{n}$. When $s_k < \frac{n}{2}$ all vertices of a graph have even degree 2k. If n is even and $s_k = \frac{n}{2}$, then all vertices have odd degree 2k - 1. It is well known that the circulant $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ is connected if and only if $gcd(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n) = 1$. More generally, the number of connected components of $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ is $d = gcd(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$, with each of the vertices $0, 1, \ldots, d-1$ lying in different components, and with each component being isomorphic to $C_{n/d}(s_1/d, s_2/d, \ldots, s_k/d)$. So, for d > 1 graph is disconnected and has no spanning trees. In what follows, all graphs are supposed to be connected.

Two circulant graphs $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ and $C_n(\tilde{s}_1, \tilde{s}_2, \ldots, \tilde{s}_k)$ of the same order are said to be conjugate by multiplier if there exists an integer r coprime to n such that $\{\tilde{s}_1, \tilde{s}_2, \ldots, \tilde{s}_k\} = \{rs_1, rs_2, \ldots, rs_k\}$ as subsets of \mathbb{Z}_n . In this case, the graphs are isomorphic, with multiplication by the unit $r \pmod{n}$ giving an isomorphism.

In 1967, A. Adám conjectured that two circulant graphs are isomorphic if and only if they are conjugate by a multiplier [1]. The following example shows that the Ádám Conjecture is not true. The graphs $C_{16}(1,2,7)$ and $C_{16}(2,3,5)$ are isomorphic, but they are not conjugate by a multiplier [6]. A complete solution of the isomorphism problem for circulant graphs was obtained by M. Muzychuk [17].

During the paper, we will use the basic properties of Chebyshev polynomials. Let $T_n(z) = \cos(n \arccos z)$ and $U_{n-1}(z) = \sin(n \arccos z)/\sin(\arccos z)$ be the Chebyshev polynomials of the first and second kind respectively.

Then $T'_n(z) = n U_{n-1}(z), T_n(1) = 1, U_{n-1}(1) = n$. For $z \neq 0$ we have $T_n(\frac{1}{2}(z+z^{-1})) = \frac{1}{2}(z^n+z^{-n})$.

See monograph [12] for more advanced properties.

3 Complexity of circulant graphs of even valency

The aim of this section is to find a new formula for the numbers of spanning trees of circulant graph $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$. It will be based on our earlier results [14, 15], where the numbers of spanning trees was given in terms of the Chebyshev polynomials.

By Theorem 1, formula (4) from [15], we have the following result.

Theorem 1. The number of spanning trees $\tau(n)$ in the circulant graph $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$, $1 \leq s_1 < s_2 < \ldots < s_k < \frac{n}{2}$, is given by the formula

$$\tau(n) = \frac{(-1)^{n(s_k-1)}n}{q} \prod_{p=1}^{s_k-1} (2T_n(w_p) - 2),$$
(1)

where $q = s_1^2 + s_2^2 + \ldots + s_k^2$, w_p , $p = 1, 2, \ldots, s_k - 1$ are all the roots of the algebraic equation P(w) = 0, where

$$P(w) = \sum_{j=1}^{k} \frac{T_{s_j}(w) - 1}{w - 1}$$

and $T_k(w)$ is the Chebyshev polynomial of the first kind.

We use the following elementary lemma.

Lemma 1. Let $T_n(w)$ be the Chebyshev polynomial of the first kind and $w = \frac{1}{2}(z + \frac{1}{z})$. Then

$$T_n(w) = \frac{1}{2}(z^n + \frac{1}{z^n}).$$

By making use of substitutions $w = \frac{1}{2}(z + \frac{1}{z})$ and $w_p = \frac{1}{2}(z_p + \frac{1}{z_p})$, by Lemma 1 deduce that $2T_n(w_p) - 2 = -(z_p^n - 1)(z_p^{-n} - 1)$ and $P(w) = \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{(z^{s_j} - 1)(z^{-s_j} - 1)}{(z - 1)(z^{-1} - 1)}$. We set $Q(z) = \sum_{j=1}^k (z^{s_j} - 1)(z^{-s_j} - 1)$ and note that Q(1) = Q'(1) = 0 and $Q''(1) = -2(s_1^2 + s_2^2 + \ldots + s_k^2) = -2q < 0$. Hence, P(w) = 0 if and only if $w = \frac{1}{2}(z + \frac{1}{z})$, where z is different from 1 root of the equation Q(z) = 0.

Now, Theorem 1 can be restated in the following way.

Theorem 2. The number of spanning trees $\tau(n)$ in the circulant graph $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$, $1 \leq s_1 < s_2 < \ldots < s_k < \frac{n}{2}$ is given by the formula

$$\tau(n) = \frac{(-1)^{(n+1)(s_k-1)}n}{q} \prod_{p=1}^{s_k-1} (z_p^n - 1)(z_p^{-n} - 1),$$
(2)

where z_p , z_p^{-1} , $p = 1, 2, ..., s_k - 1$ are all the roots different from 1 of the equation Q(z) = 0, and

$$Q(z) = \sum_{j=1}^{k} (z^{s_j} - 1)(z^{-s_j} - 1).$$

4 Generating function for the circulant graphs of even valency.

The main result of this section is the following theorem.

Theorem 3. Let $\tau(n)$ be the number of spanning trees in the circulant graph $C_n(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ of even valency. Then

$$F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n) x^n$$

is a rational function with integer coefficients. Moreover, F(x) = F(1/x).

The proof of the theorem is based on Theorem 2 and the following proposition.

Proposition 1. Let R(z) be a degree 2s polynomial with integer coefficients. Suppose that all the roots of the polynomial R(z) are $\xi_1, \xi_2, \ldots, \xi_{2s-1}, \xi_{2s}$. Then

$$F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} n \prod_{j=1}^{2s} (\xi_j^n - 1) x^n$$

is a rational function with integer coefficients.

Moreover, if $\xi_{j+s} = \xi_j^{-1}$, j = 1, 2, ..., s, then F(x) = F(1/x).

Proof: First of all, we note that $F(x) = x \frac{dG(x)}{dx}$, where

$$G(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \prod_{j=1}^{2s} (\xi_j^n - 1) x^n.$$

Denote by $\sigma_k = \sigma_k(x_1, x_2, \ldots, x_{2s})$ the k-th basic symmetric polynomial in variables x_1, x_2, \ldots, x_{2s} . Namely,

 $\sigma_0 = 1, \, \sigma_1 = x_1 + x_2 + \ldots + x_{2s}, \, \sigma_2 = x_1 x_2 + x_1 x_3 + \ldots + x_{2s-1} x_{2s}, \ldots, \sigma_{2s} = x_1 x_2 \ldots x_{2s}.$

Then

$$G(x) = G_{2s}(x) - G_{2s-1}(x) + \ldots - G_1(x) + G_0(x),$$

where

$$G_k(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \sigma_k(\xi_1^n, \xi_2^n, \dots, \xi_{2s}^n) x^n, \ k = 0, 1, \dots, 2s.$$

We have $\sigma_k(\xi_1^n, \xi_2^n, \dots, \xi_{2s}^n) = \sum_{1 \le j_1 < j_2 < \dots < j_k \le 2s} \xi_{j_1}^n \xi_{j_2}^n \dots \xi_{j_k}^n$. Hence, $G_k(x) = \sum_{1 \le j_1 < j_2 < \dots < j_k \le 2s} \frac{\xi_{j_1} \xi_{j_2} \dots \xi_{j_k}}{1 - \xi_{j_1} \xi_{j_2} \dots \xi_{j_k} x}$ and

$$F_k(x) = x \frac{dG_k(x)}{dx} = \sum_{1 \le j_1 < j_2 < \dots < j_k \le 2s} \frac{\xi_{j_1} \xi_{j_2} \dots \xi_{j_k} x}{(1 - \xi_{j_1} \xi_{j_2} \dots \xi_{j_k} x)^2}.$$
(3)

We note that $F_k(x)$ is a symmetric function in the roots $\xi_1, \xi_2, \ldots, \xi_{2s}$ of the integer polynomial R(x). By the Vieta theorem, $F_k(x)$ is a rational function with integer coefficients. Since

$$F(x) = F_{2s}(x) - F_{2s-1}(x) + \ldots - F_1(x) + F_0(x),$$
(4)

the same is true for F(x).

To prove the second statement of the proposition, consider the product $\xi = \xi_{j_1}\xi_{j_2}\ldots\xi_{j_k}$. Since $\xi_{j+s} = \xi_j^{-1}$, the term $\frac{\xi x}{(1-\xi x)^2}$ comes into the sum (3) together with $\frac{\xi^{-1}x}{(1-\xi^{-1}x)^2}$. One can check that the function $\varphi(x) = \frac{\xi x}{(1-\xi x)^2} + \frac{\xi^{-1}x}{(1-\xi^{-1}x)^2}$ satisfy the condition $\varphi(x) = \varphi(1/x)$. Hence, for any $k = 0, 1, \ldots, 2s$ we have $F_k(x) = F_k(1/x)$. By (4), we finally obtain F(x) = F(1/x).

Proof of Theorem 3. We employ Proposition 1 to prove the theorem. To do this, we consider the polynomial $R(z) = z^{2s_k}Q(z)/(z-1)^2$. Note that R(z) is an integer polynomial of order $2s = 2s_k - 2$. Recall that Q(1) = Q'(1) = 0 and Q''(1) = -2q < 0. Hence, all the roots of the polynomial R(z) are the roots of Q(z) different from 1. Because of an evident property $R(z) = R(\frac{1}{z})$, the polynomial R(z) satisfies the conditions of Proposition 1. By Theorem 2, the generating function $F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n$ can be represented in the form

$$F(x) = \frac{(-1)^{s_k-1}}{q} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} n \prod_{p=1}^{s_k-1} (z_p^n - 1)(z_p^{-n} - 1)((-1)^{s_k-1}x)^n,$$

where $z_p, z_p^{-1}, p = 1, 2, ..., s_k - 1$ are all the roots of the polynomial R(z). By Proposition 1, F(x) is a rational function with integer coefficients satisfying $F(x) = F(\frac{1}{x})$.

5 Complexity of circulant graphs of odd valency

The aim of this section is establish the rationality of generating function for the numbers of spanning trees in the circulant graph $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$ of odd valency. The following result was obtained in ([15], Theorem 2).

Theorem 4. Let $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$, $1 \leq s_1 < s_2 < \ldots < s_k < n$, be a circulant graph of odd valency. Then the number $\tau(n)$ of spanning trees in the graph $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$ is given by the formula

$$\tau(n) = \frac{n \, 4^{s_k - 1}}{q} \prod_{p=1}^{s_k - 1} (T_n(u_p) - 1) \prod_{p=1}^{s_k} (T_n(v_p) + 1),$$

where $q = s_1^2 + s_2^2 + \ldots + s_k^2$, the numbers u_p , $p = 1, 2, \ldots, s_k - 1$ and v_p , $p = 1, 2, \ldots, s_k$ are respectively the roots of the algebraic equations P(u) - 1 = 0, $u \neq 1$ and P(v) + 1 = 0, where $P(w) = 2k + 1 - 2\sum_{i=1}^{k} T_{s_i}(w)$ and $T_k(w)$ is the Chebyshev polynomial of the first kind.

Taking into account the identity $T_n(z + \frac{1}{z}) = \frac{1}{2}(z^n + \frac{1}{z^n})$, we rewrite Theorem 4 in the following way.

Theorem 5. The number of spanning trees $\tau(n)$ in the circulant graph $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n), 1 \le s_1 < s_2 < \ldots < s_k < n$ of odd valency, is given by the formula

$$\tau(n) = \frac{(-1)^{s_k - 1}n}{2q} \prod_{p=1}^{s_k - 1} (z_p^n - 1)(z_p^{-n} - 1) \prod_{p=1}^{s_k} (\zeta_p^n + 1)(\zeta_p^{-n} + 1),$$
(5)

where z_p , z_p^{-1} , $p = 1, 2, ..., s_k - 1$ are all the roots different from 1 of the equation Q(z) = 0, ζ_p , ζ_p^{-1} , $p = 1, 2, ..., s_k$ are all the roots of the equation Q(z) + 2 = 0, and

$$Q(z) = \sum_{j=1}^{k} (z^{s_j} - 1)(z^{-s_j} - 1).$$

Using this result and repeating the arguments from the proofs of Proposition 1 and Theorem 3, we obtain the following theorem.

Theorem 6. Let $\tau(n)$ be the number of spanning trees in the circulant graph $C_{2n}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k, n)$ of odd valency. Then

$$F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n) x^n$$

is a rational function with integer coefficients. Moreover, F(x) = F(1/x).

6 Examples

Everywhere in the section below we use the following notation $w = \frac{1}{2}(x + \frac{1}{x})$. Since the generating function $F(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n$ satisfies F(x) = F(1/x), it is also a rational function in w.

1. Graph $C_n(1,2)$. By [3] and [15] we have $\tau(n) = nF_n^2$, where F_n is the *n*-th Fibonacci number. Hence,

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n = \frac{1 - 2w + 2w^2}{(1+w)(-3+2w)^2}$$

2. Graph $C_n(1,3)$. By [15], Example 2, we have

$$\tau(n) = \frac{2n}{5} \left(T_n \left(-\frac{1}{2} - \frac{i}{2} \right) - 1 \right) \left(T_n \left(-\frac{1}{2} + \frac{i}{2} \right) - 1 \right).$$

Hence,

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n = \frac{(1+w)(1-w-2w^2+11w^3+8w^4-16w^5+4w^7)}{2(-1+w)(-1-3w-3w^2+2w^4)^2}.$$

3. Graph $C_n(2,3)$. In this case, by [15], Example 3, $\tau(n) = \frac{4n}{13}(T_n(\theta_1) - 1)(T_n(\theta_2) - 1)$, where $\theta_{1,2} = \frac{1}{4}(-3 \pm i\sqrt{3})$. Now

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n)x^n = \frac{2(15+27w-17w^2-28w^3+216w^4+64w^5-224w^6+64w^8)}{(-1+w)(-3-24w-28w^2+16w^4)^2}.$$

4. Graph Möbius ladder $C_{2n}(1,n)$. In this case, by [3] and Theorem 4 we have $\tau(n) = n(T_n(2) + 1)$ and

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n) x^n = \frac{5 - 7w + 3w^2}{2(-2 + w)^2(-1 + w)}.$$

5. Graph $C_{2n}(1,2,n)$. By Theorem 4 we obtain

$$\tau(n) = \frac{4n}{5}(-1 + T_n(-3/2))(1 + T_n(\theta_1))(1 + T_n(\theta_2)),$$

where $\theta_{1,2} = \frac{1}{4}(-1 \pm \sqrt{33})$. As a result,

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \tau(n) x^n = \frac{G(w)}{H(w)},$$

where

$$\begin{array}{lll} G(w) &=& -422137930752 + 83760842880w + 3098738380752w^2 \\ && -883496472336w^3 - 9652661216757w^4 + 3106365668883w^5 \\ && +17117057275452w^6 - 5625024610977w^7 - 19349031968433w^8 \\ && +6096193861050w^9 + 14674263153534w^{10} - 4191031652328w^{11} \\ && -7620826953696w^{12} + 1847068052640w^{13} + 2715353668608w^{14} \\ && -509714698368w^{15} - 654968016896w^{16} + 82874686976w^{17} \\ && +103379897344w^{18} - 6793590784w^{19} - 9988546560w^{20} \\ && +70311936w^{21} + 531562496w^{22} + 34570240w^{23} \\ && -14614528w^{24} - 2097152w^{25} + 393216w^{26} \end{array}$$

and

$$H(w) = (-1+w)((3+2w)(-4+w+2w^2)(13+16w+4w^2))$$

(96-216w+165w^2-48w^3+4w^4)(87+9w-90w^2-12w^3+8w^4))².

The results of this work were partially supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research, (grants 18-01-00420 and 18-501-51021).

References

- [1] A. Adám, Research problems 2 10, J. Combin. Theory 2 (1967) 393.
- T. L. Austin, The enumeration of point labelled chromatic graphs and trees, Canad. J. Math. 12 (1960) 535-545.
- [3] F. T. Boesch, H. Prodinger, Spanning tree formulas and Chebyshev polynomials, Graphs and Combinatorics 2(1) (1986) 191–200.
- [4] F. T. Boesch and Z. R. Bogdanowicz, The number of spanning tress in a prism, Internat. J. Comput. Math. 21 (1987) 229–243.
- [5] A. Cayley, A theorem on trees, *Quart. J. Pure Appl. Math.* **23** (1889) 376–378.
- [6] M. Conder, R. Grande, On embeddings of circulant graphs, *Electronic Journal of Combinatorics* 22(2) (2015), #P2.28.
- [7] A. J. Guttmann, M. D. Rogers, Spanning tree generating functions and Mahler measures. Journal of Physics A: Mathematical and Theoretical, 45(49) (2012) 494001. arXiv:1207.2815v2 [math-ph] 26 Aug 2012.
- [8] A. J. W. Hilton, Spanning trees and Fibonacci and Lucas numbers, *Fibonacci Q.* 12 (1974) 259–262.
- [9] G. Kirchhoff, Uber die Auflösung der Gleichungen, auf welche man bei der Untersuchung der linearen Verteilung galvanischer Ströme geführt wird, Ann. Phys. Chem. 72 (1847) 497–508.
- [10] Y. S. Kwon, A. D. Mednykh, I. A. Mednykh, On Jacobian group and complexity of the generalized Petersen graph GP(n,k) through Chebyshev polynomials, *Linear Algebra and its Applications* **529** (2017) 355–373.
- [11] J. Louis, Asymptotics for the Number of Spanning Trees in Circulant Graphs and Degenerating d-Dimensional Discrete Tori, Annals of Combinatorics 19(3) (2015) 513-543.
- [12] J. C. Mason, D. C. Handscomb, *Chebyshev Polynomials*, Taylor & Francis (2002), 360 pp. .
- [13] A. D. Mednykh, I. A. Mednykh, On the Structure of the Jacobian Group for Circulant Graphs, *Doklady Mathematics* 94(1) (2016) 445–449.
- [14] A. D. Mednykh, I. A. Mednykh, Asymptotics and Arithmetical Properties of Complexity for Circulant Graphs, *Doklady Mathematics* 97(2) (2018) 1–5.
- [15] A. D. Mednykh, I. A. Mednykh, The number of spanning trees in circulant graphs, its arithmetic properties and asymptotic, *Discrete Math.* (2018) (in press) arXiv:1711.00175v2 [math.CO] 15 Dec 2017.

- [16] I. A. Mednykh, On Jacobian group and complexity of *I*-graph I(n, k, l) through Chebyshev polynomials, Preprint, 2017, arXiv: 1703.07058v1 [math.CO] 21 Mar 2017.
- [17] M. Muzychuk, A solution of the isomorphism problem for circulant graphs, Proc. London Math. Soc. (3) 88 (2004) 1–41.
- [18] A. Schwenk, Computing the characteristic polynomial of a graph, in: Graphs and Combinatorics, Lecture Notes in Mathematics 406, Berlin-Heidelberg-New York: Springer-Verlag 1974, 153–172.
- [19] J. Sedlácěk, On the spanning trees of finite graphs, Cas. Pěstování Mat. 94 (1969) 217–221.
- [20] J. Sedlácěk, On the skeletons of a graph or digraph, in: Combinatorial Structures and their Applications, edited by R. Guy, M. Hanani, N. Saver, J. Schonheim, New York: Gordon and Breach, 1970, 387–391.
- [21] R. Shrock and F.Y. Wu, Spanning trees on graphs and lattices in d-dimensions J. Phys. A 33 (2000) 3881–3902.
- [22] D. S. Silver, S. G. Williams, Graph complexity and Mahler Measure, Preprint, 2016, arXiv: 1602.02797v1 [math.CO] 8 Feb 2016.
- [23] D. S. Silver, S. G. Williams, Spanning Trees and Mahler Measure, Preprint, 2017, arXiv: 1701.06097v1 [math.CO] 21 Jan 2017.
- [24] W. Sun, S. Wang and J. Zhang, Counting spanning trees in prism and anti-prism graphs, J. Appl. Anal. Comput. 6 (2016) 65–75.
- [25] L. Weinberg, Number of trees in graph, Proc. IRE 46 (1958) 1954–1955.
- [26] F. Y. Wu, Number of spanning trees on a lattice, J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 10 (1977) L113–115.
- [27] Chen Xiebin, The numbers of spanning trees in undirected circulant graphs, J. Zhangzhou Teachers College 13(4) (2000) 1–6.
- [28] Chen Xiebin, Qiuying Lin, Fuji Zhang, The number of spanning trees in odd valent circulant graphs, *Discrete Math.* 282(1) (2004) 69–79.
- [29] X. Yong, Talip and Acenjian, The number of spanning trees of the cubic cycle C_n^3 and the quadruple cycle C_n^4 , Discrete Math. 169 (1997) 293–298.
- [30] F. Zhang and X. Yong, Asymptotic enumeration theorems for the number of spanning trees and Eulerian trails in circulant digraphs and graphs, *Science China-mathematics* 42(3) (1999) 264–271.
- [31] Zhang Yuanping, Yong Xuerong, M. J. Golin, The number of spanning trees in circulant graphs, *Discrete. Math.* 223(1) (2000) 337–350.

[32] Zhang Yuanping, Xuerong Yong, M. J. Golin, Chebyshev polynomials and spanning tree formulas for circulant and related graphs, *Discrete Math.* **298**(1) (2005) 334–364.