Upper bound on the energies of the emitted Hawking quanta

Shahar Hod

The Ruppin Academic Center, Emeq Hefer 40250, Israel

The Hadassah Institute, Jerusalem 91010, Israel (Dated: October 23, 2018)

Abstract

Using Thorne's hoop conjecture, it is argued that the energies of the Hawking quanta emitted from canonical Schwarzschild black holes are bounded from above by the simple quantum relation $\mathcal{E} < \mathcal{E}_{\text{max}} = \hbar^{2/3}/M^{1/3}$. In particular, it is shown that, due to non-linear (self-gravity) effects of the tunneling quanta, higher energy field modes are re-absorbed (rather than escape to infinity) by the black hole.

I. INTRODUCTION

Using a semi-classical analysis, in which quantized fields are linearly coupled to a classical black-hole spacetime, Hawking [1] has revealed the physically important fact that, instead of being black, black holes are intriguingly characterized by filtered black-body emission spectra with well defined temperatures [1, 2].

In particular, for a spherically symmetric Schwarzschild black hole of mass M (and a corresponding horizon radius $r_{\rm H}=2M$), the semi-classical Hawking emission power per one degree of freedom is given by the integral relation [3, 4]

$$P = \frac{\hbar}{2\pi} \sum_{l,m} \int_0^\infty \frac{\Gamma\omega}{e^{\hbar\omega/T_{\rm BH}} \pm 1} d\omega , \qquad (1)$$

where the -/+ signs refer respectively to bosonic/femionic field modes and the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of the black-hole is given by the functional relation [1, 2, 5]

$$T_{\rm BH} = \frac{\hbar}{4\pi r_{\rm H}} \ . \tag{2}$$

The frequency-dependent factors $\Gamma = \Gamma_{lm}(\omega)$, which in most cases of physical interest should be computed numerically [3], quantify the linearized interaction of the emitted field modes with the effective scattering potential of the curved black-hole spacetime. Since these dimensionless greybody factors, which characterize the composed black-hole-field system, scale as $\Gamma(M\omega \ll 1) \propto (M\omega)^n$ with n > 0 in the small-frequency $M\omega \ll 1$ limit and as $\Gamma(M\omega \gg 1) \to 1$ in the large-frequency $M\omega \gg 1$ limit [3], the black-hole emission spectrum has a characteristic peak at $M\omega^{\text{peak}} = O(1)$ [see Eqs. (1) and (2)]. This implies that the average energy of the emitted Hawking quanta is characterized by the simple relation [6, 7]

$$\bar{\mathcal{E}} \sim \frac{\hbar}{M} \ .$$
 (3)

Formally, the Hawking integral relation (1) implies that the black hole can, in principle (though with exponentially small probabilities), emit field modes with arbitrarily large frequencies (energies). However, energy conservation considerations enforce the trivial upper bound

$$\mathcal{E} \le M \tag{4}$$

on the energies of the emitted Hawking quanta.

The main goal of the present compact paper is to point out that a *stronger* (and physically non-trivial) upper bound, which seems to have gone unnoticed in previous analyzes of the black-hole evaporation process, exists on the energies of the emitted Hawking quanta. In particular, using Thorne's hoop conjecture [8], we shall explicitly demonstrate below that there exists a critical energy scale above which the emitted quanta are re-absorbed (rather than escape to infinity) by the black hole.

II. HAWKING EVAPORATION AS A TUNNELING PROCESS, THORNE'S HOOP CONJECTURE, AND AN UPPER BOUND ON THE ENERGIES OF THE EMITTED BLACK-HOLE QUANTA

Following the remarkably elegant analysis presented in [9], we shall consider a physical scenario in which an Hawking quantum of energy \mathcal{E} tunnels out of a Schwarzschild black hole of mass M. However, unlike the interesting analysis presented in [9], which treats the Hawking quanta as point-like particles, in the present analysis we shall take into account the finite spatial extension of the tunneling quanta. In particular, an Hawking field mode of proper energy \mathcal{E} is characterized by the *finite* proper wavelength (Compton length)

$$\lambda = 2\pi\hbar/\mathcal{E} \ . \tag{5}$$

Immediately after the completion of the tunneling process of the Hawking quantum through the black-hole horizon [9], one has a physical system which is composed of an Hawking field mode of proper energy $\mathcal{E} = 2\pi\hbar/\lambda$ which is gravitationally coupled to a black hole of reduced mass $M - \mathcal{E}(\lambda)$ and a corresponding horizon radius of $r_{\rm H}^{\rm new} = 2[M - \mathcal{E}(\lambda)]$.

In particular, following [9], we assume that the tunneling Hawking quantum of energy \mathcal{E} materializes at $r_{\rm H}^{\rm new}=2(M-\mathcal{E})$, just outside the final position of the black-hole horizon. According to Thorne's hoop conjecture [8], the composed black-hole-Hawking-quantum configuration will form an engulfing horizon (which would prevent the Hawking quantum from escaping to infinity) if its circumference radius $r_{\rm c}$ is equal to (or smaller than) the corresponding Schwarzschild (hoop) radius $r_{\rm hoop}=2M$ of the composed system [whose total energy (energy-at-infinity) is still given, due to energy conservation considerations, by $(M-\mathcal{E})+\mathcal{E}=M$].

The proper distance l_{hoop} of the critical point $r_{\text{hoop}} = 2M$ above the new (and smaller)

black-hole horizon $r_{\rm H}^{\rm new}=2(M-\mathcal{E})$ is given by the integral relation [2]

$$l_{\text{hoop}}(\mathcal{E}) = \int_{r_{\text{H}}^{\text{new}} = 2(M - \mathcal{E})}^{r_{\text{hoop}} = 2M} \frac{dr}{\sqrt{1 - 2M/r}} , \qquad (6)$$

which yields

$$l_{\text{hoop}}(\mathcal{E}) = 4\sqrt{M\mathcal{E}} \cdot [1 + O(\mathcal{E}/M)] . \tag{7}$$

According to the Thorne hoop conjecture [8], a necessary condition for an Hawking field mode of proper wavelength $\lambda(\mathcal{E})$ to be able to escape to infinity is provided by the requirement [6]

$$\lambda(\mathcal{E}) \gtrsim l_{\text{hoop}}(\mathcal{E})$$
 (8)

The inequality (8) reflects the physical fact that, in order *not* to be engulfed by an horizon, the emitted Hawking quantum should avoid the situation of being entirely contained within the critical hoop radius $r_{\text{hoop}} = 2M$ [8]. Taking cognizance of Eqs. (5), (7), and (8), one immediately obtains the upper bound

$$\mathcal{E} \lesssim \mathcal{E}_{\text{max}} \equiv \frac{\hbar^{2/3}}{M^{1/3}} \tag{9}$$

on the energies of the emitted Hawking quanta which are allowed to escape the black hole to infinity.

III. SUMMARY AND DISCUSSION

In the present compact paper we have analyzed the semi-classical Hawking evaporation process of canonical Schwarzschild black holes. Taking into account the non-linear nature of the interaction between the Hawking quanta and the curved black-hole spacetime, it has been shown that the proper frequencies of the emitted Hawking field modes are bounded from above by the simple quantum relation [see Eq. (9)]

$$\omega \lesssim \omega_{\text{max}} = (\hbar M)^{-1/3} \ . \tag{10}$$

In particular, we have emphasized the fact that, due to self-gravity effects of the tunneling quanta, which manifest themselves through the Thorne hoop conjecture [8], higher energy Hawking quanta are re-absorbed (rather than escape to infinity) by the black hole.

Interestingly, the newly derived upper bound (9) on the allowed energies of the emitted Hawking quanta is stronger than the trivial bound (4), which follows from simple energy conservation considerations, by the large dimensionless factor $M^{4/3}/\hbar^{2/3} \gg 1$ [7]. In addition, it is important to emphasize the fact that the maximally allowed energy (9) of the emitted Hawking quanta is related to the characteristic (average) energy (3) of the corresponding black-hole emission spectrum by the large dimensionless ratio

$$\frac{\mathcal{E}_{\text{max}}}{\bar{\mathcal{E}}} \sim \frac{M^{2/3}}{\hbar^{1/3}} \gg 1 \ . \tag{11}$$

This relation implies that the non-linear self-gravity effect of the tunneling quanta, which manifests itself through the Thorne hoop conjecture [see Eq. (8)], blocks only the large frequency tail of the semi-classical Hawking emission spectrum.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research is supported by the Carmel Science Foundation. I would like to thank Yael Oren, Arbel M. Ongo, Ayelet B. Lata, and Alona B. Tea for stimulating discussions.

- [1] S. W. Hawking, Commun. Math. Phys. 43, 199 (1975).
- [2] J. D. Bekenstein, Phys. Rev. D 7, 2333 (1973).
- [3] D. N. Page, Phys. Rev. D 13, 198 (1976); W. H. Zurek, Phys. Rev. Lett. 49, 1683 (1982); J. D. Bekenstein, Phys. Rev. Lett. 70, 3680 (1993).
- [4] The dimensionless parameters $\{l, m\}$ in the Hawking expression (1) are the angular harmonic indices of the radiated field modes.
- [5] We shall use natural units in which $G = c = k_{\rm B} = 1$.
- [6] We use the \sim symbol to denote an order-of-magnitude estimate.
- [7] We consider macroscopic black holes in the dimensionless $M^2/\hbar \gg 1$ regime.
- [8] K. S. Thorne, in *Magic without Magic: John Archibald Wheeler*, edited by J. Klauder (Freeman, San Francisco, 1972).
- [9] M. K. Parikh and F. Wilczek, Phys. Rev. Lett. 85, 5042 (2000).