

CLIMATE CHANGE VIA CO₂ DRAWDOWN FROM ASTROPHYSICALLY INITIATED ATMOSPHERIC IONIZATION?

Adrian L. Melott¹, Brian C. Thomas², and Brian D. Fields³

Abstract: Motivated by the occurrence of a moderately nearby supernova near the beginning of the Pleistocene, we investigate whether nitrate rainout resulting from the atmospheric ionization of enhanced cosmic ray flux could have, through its fertilizer effect, initiated carbon dioxide drawdown. Such a drawdown could possibly reduce the greenhouse effect and induce the climate change that led to the Pleistocene glaciations. We estimate that the nitrogen flux enhancement onto the surface from an event at 50 pc would be of order 10%, probably too small for dramatic changes. We estimate deposition of iron (another potential fertilizer) and find it also to be too small to be significant. There are also competing effects of opposite sign, including muon irradiation and reduction in photosynthetic yield caused by UV increase from stratospheric ozone layer depletion. We conclude that the effect may be of interest from much nearer supernovae in the geological past, but more work needs to be done to clarify the magnitude of various competing effects.

Key Words: supernovae, glaciation, climate change

1. Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS
66045 USA. Email: melott@ku.edu
2. Department of Physics and Astronomy, Washburn University, Topeka, Kansas
66621 USA. Email: brian.thomas@washburn.edu
3. Department of Astronomy and Department of Physics, University of Illinois,
Urbana, IL 61801 USA. Email: bdfields@illinois.edu

Introduction

There are a variety of effects from relatively nearby supernovae beyond the traditionally considered effects of ozone depletion due to the ionization of the Earth's atmosphere. We have found that many of them are in fact competitive in intensity to ozone depletion.

In this paper we explore the idea that deposition of nitrate on the biosphere from the effects of ionizing radiation from a moderately nearby (50 pc) supernova might provide enough fertilizer effect to cause a drawdown of CO₂ and thereby cool the climate, possibly setting off the glaciations typical of the Pleistocene (as well as possibly at the end of the Ordovician). This is interesting because the Plio-Pleistocene transition to an icehouse climate is close to the time indicated by cosmogenic nuclide deposits for one or more nearby supernovae.

In recent years there has been a surge of evidence for moderately nearby supernovae within the last few My (Melott 2016, Wallner et al. 2016, Fimiani et al. 2016; Ludwig et al. 2016; and Binns et al. 2016). Recent assessments (Mamajek 2016; Fry et al. 2016) have favored distances close to the 40 pc proposed by Benítez, Maíz-Apellániz, and Canelles (1999). Recent studies of the effects upon the Earth of such an event have included enhanced solar ultraviolet-B (UVB; 280-315 nm) due to ozone depletion, visible light effects on nocturnal organisms, increased radiation from cosmic ray secondaries (primarily muons and neutrons),

and direct deposition of cosmogenic radioisotopes (Melott et al. 2017; Melott and Thomas 2018; Thomas 2018; Melott, Marinho, and Paulucci 2018).

Most biota (in the absence of humans) are nitrate-starved (Schlesinger and Bernhardt 2013) and thus it is interesting to consider the possible effects of nitrate deposition as a side effect of astrophysical radiation enhancements. Previous assessments have suggested a small effect (Melott et al. 2005; Thomas and Honeyman 2008; Neuenswander and Melott 2015), but the longer duration of the effect of cosmic rays compared with the earlier burst situations provides an opportunity for a competitive effect. Melott et al. (2017) and Thomas (2018) showed that the effect of prompt ionizing radiation from a supernova at 50 pc or more is quite small, so the focus is on the extended cosmic ray flux.

Nitrate as a possible initiator of CO₂ drawdown

Nitrate fertilization leading to CO₂ drawdown, reduced greenhouse effect, and subsequent climate cooling is not a new idea. First, terrestrial carbon uptake can easily alter atmospheric CO₂ levels (Quere et al. 2015; Keenan et al. 2016). Such carbon uptake is stimulated by deposition of additional nitrate from the atmosphere on land (Thomas et al. 2009) and in the oceans (Ganeshram et al. 1995). Nitrogen isotope changes have been documented at the Plio-Pleistocene Transition (Oesch et al. 2016) and a fertilizer-based CO₂ drawdown has been blamed for the late Ordovician glaciation (Shen et al 2018). The long duration of

cosmic ray exposure from one or more supernovae at 50 to 100 pc motivates a re-examination of this effect, particularly since the Plio-Pleistocene cooling was accompanied by a CO₂ drawdown (Bartoli et al. 2011).

Production and deposition of nitrate from supernova enhanced cosmic ray flux

Atmospheric ionization caused by cosmic rays leads to the formation of nitrogen oxides, which catalytically deplete ozone, and are removed from the atmosphere as HNO₃. This leads to the deposition of NO₃⁻ (Thomas et al., 2005). Any event that creates significant ionization of the atmosphere will cause both ozone depletion and deposition of NO₃⁻. These production and removal processes will persist as long as the enhanced cosmic ray flux is incident on the atmosphere.

Modeling of the atmospheric chemistry effects following a nearby supernova (Melott et al. 2017) include deposition of HNO₃ via rain/snow. From these results, we computed a global deposition of about 7.5 Tg N per year. This is less than 10% of the preindustrial deposition of order 85 Tg per year (Schlesinger and Bernhardt 2013, p. 453). We conclude that the effect is likely to be small, although it might be greater if an increase in lightning were caused by the increased atmospheric ionization—a possibility beyond the scope of this paper.

Iron deposition—a possible additional fertilizer effect?

Iron is also a fertilizer, and increased iron deposition has been hypothesized as a forcing agent for terrestrial climate, and also linked to the late-Ordovician cooling (Reiners and Turchyn 2018). In this context we evaluate the deposition of iron, one of the major outputs of element synthesis in supernovae. Consider a supernova exploding at distance r and isotropically ejecting a mass M_{Fe} of iron. The resulting surface density of iron on Earth will be (Ellis, Fields, and Schramm 1996)

$$\Sigma = \frac{1}{4} \frac{f_{dust} M_{Fe} / m}{4\pi r^2} = 0.03 \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} f_{dust} \left(\frac{M_{Fe}}{0.1 M_{\odot}} \right) \left(\frac{50 \text{ pc}}{r} \right)^2$$

Which corresponds to 9×10^8 g globally. Here m is the mass of an iron atom, and the factor of $\frac{1}{4}$ is the ratio of the Earth's cross section to surface area. The factor $f_{dust} \leq 1$ accounts for the fact that at the distances of interest, only the iron that is sequestered into dust particles will traverse deeply enough into the inner solar system to arrive at Earth (Athanassiaou and Fields 1999; Fry et al 2016; Benitez et al 1999). This signal is stretched over timescales of $\Delta t = 1 \text{ Myr}$ or more (Wallner et al 2016; Ludwig et al 2016), so the average flux is $3 \times 10^{-8} \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$. Clearly this is a tiny amount, and indeed, the smallness of the supernova signal motivated a focus on live radioisotopes such as ^{60}Fe in order to remove terrestrial background (Ellis et al 1996).

There are substantial uncertainties in the supernova distance, ejecta isotropy, iron yield, and dust fraction, at least factors of two and potentially an order of

magnitude each. But even allowing for enormous favorable variations in these parameters, it is clear that the infall flux on Earth is minutely small. For comparison, the total influx of iron from extraterrestrial (and mostly interplanetary) dust onto the Earth today amounts to $0.35 \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{yr}^{-1}$. We see that a supernova contributes a negligible fraction even of the extraterrestrial iron flux on Earth, let alone the other bioavailable iron sources. Thus, the supernova ejecta deposition will have no fertilizer effect.

Ozone depletion and UVB increase—a competing effect

Cosmic ray flux from a nearby supernova leads to depletion of stratospheric ozone, which results in increased penetration of solar UVB radiation to Earth's surface and into the upper part of the ocean. UVB is known to have harmful effects on most organisms, and primary producers are especially vulnerable (Llabres et al. 2013; Peng et al. 2017; Benca et al. 2018).

Atmospheric chemistry modeling of the supernova case considered here (Melott et al. 2017; Thomas 2018) show a globally averaged reduction of ozone of about 25%. Calculations of the increase in surface-level UVB and subsequent biological impacts (Thomas 2018) show a reduction in photosynthesis by marine phytoplankton ranging from a few percent to around 40%. The larger values are seen for only one biological weighting function quantifying the effects on an Antarctic phytoplankton community; two other phytoplankton inhibition weighting functions show a reduction of a few percent to around 10 percent. For a case

with ozone depletion significantly higher than that considered here, Neale and Thomas (2016) found only a few percent reduction in photosynthesis for two of the most abundant, globally distributed, marine phytoplankton species.

Therefore, while reduction in primary productivity is a likely result of a nearby supernova, and would reduce the CO₂ drawdown effect, the impact is likely to be small.

Muon irradiation—an additional competing effect

Cosmic ray primaries generate a shower of muons, which normally constitute a substantial fraction of irradiation at the surface. In Melott et al (2017) we showed that the muon dose at the surface will reach a level of about fifteen times the total irradiation from all sources within 100 years, and remain above this normal background for thousands of years. If we add in the cosmic ray trapping effect of the magnetic field in the walls of the Local Bubble, and/or multiple supernovae (Breitschwerdt et al. 2016) the duration of the effect may be greater. Muon irradiation has the additional effect of affecting life up to a kilometer below the surface of the ocean (Melott and Thomas 2018; Melott et al. 2018). Nevertheless, only a small increase in mutation and carcinogenesis is expected for phytoplankton (Melott et al 2017). We conclude that muon irradiation is a small competing effect.

Conclusions

We conclude that the fertilizer effect of nitrate deposition is likely to be small, of order 10%, for the Plio-Pleistocene supernovae at a distance of 50 to 100 pc. The additional effect of fertilization by iron-bearing dust is orders of magnitude smaller. The inhibiting effects of damaging muon irradiation and UVB from ozone depletion are likely to go in the opposite direction, inhibiting photosynthesis. Therefore, for moderately nearby supernovae such as those indicated near the Plio-Pleistocene transition, it appears that no large effect is likely. These effects will of course be enhanced for a nearby catastrophic event, at a distance of order 8-10 pc, which is likely to have happened at some time within the past 500 My. However, the complications of competing effects are too great to permit even an estimate at this time. More work is needed.

References

- Athanassiadou, T., and Fields, B. D. (2011) Penetration of nearby supernova dust in the inner solar system. *New Astronomy* 16, 229. DOI: 10.1016/j.newast.2010.09.007
- Bartoli, G et al. (2011) Atmospheric CO₂ decline during the Pliocene intensification of Northern Hemisphere glaciations. *Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology* 26, PA4213. doi:10.1029/2010PA002055
- Benca, JP et al. (2018) UV-B-induced forest sterility: Implications of ozone shield failure in Earth's largest extinction. *Science Advances* 4, e1700618.
- Benítez, N., Maíz-Apellániz J, and Canelles M (1999) Evidence for nearby supernova explosions. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 88, 08110101. DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.88.081101
- Binns, WR et al. (2016) Observation of the ⁶⁰Fe nucleosynthesis-clock isotope in galactic cosmic rays. *Science* 352, 677. DOI: 10.1126/science.aad6004
- Breitschwerdt, D et al (2016) Unveiling recent supernovae near Earth by modeling ⁶⁰Fe transport onto the deep sea crust. *Nature* 532, 73–76
- Ellis, J, Fields BD, and Schramm DN (1996). Geological isotope anomalies as signatures of nearby supernovae. *Astrophysical Journal* 470, 1227. DOI 10.1086/177945
- Fimiani, L et al (2016) Interstellar ⁶⁰Fe on the Surface of the Moon. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 116, 151104. <https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.116.151104>

Fry, BJ et al (2016) Radioactive iron rain: transporting ^{60}Fe in supernova dust to the ocean floor. *Astrophysical Journal* 828, 48. <https://doi.org/10.3847/0004-637X/827/1/48>

Ganeshram, RS et al. (1995) Large changes in ocean nutrient inventories from glacial to interglacial periods. *Nature* 376, 755.

Keenan, TF et al (2016) Recent pause in the growth rate of atmospheric CO_2 due to enhanced terrestrial carbon uptake. *Nature Communications* 7, 13428.

Llabrés, M et al. (2013) Impact of elevated UVB radiation on marine biota : a meta-analysis. *Global Ecology and Biogeography* 22, 131, doi:10.1111/j.1466-8238.2012.00784.x

Ludwig, P et al. (2016) Time-resolved 2-million-year-old supernova activity discovered in Earth's microfossil record. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA* 113, 9232. doi:10.1073/pnas.1601040113

Mamajek, E. E. (2016) A Pre-Gaia Census of Nearby Stellar Groups. in *Proc. IAU Symp. 314, Young Stars & Planets Near the Sun*, ed. J. H. Kastner, B. Stelzer, & S. A. Metchev (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press), 21
<https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743921315006250>

Melott, AL (2005) Climatic and Biogeochemical Effects of a Galactic Gamma-Ray Burst. *Geophysical Research Letters* 32, L14808. doi:10.1029/2005GL023073

Melott, AL (2016) Supernovae in the Neighbourhood. *Nature* 532, 40.
<https://doi.org/10.1038/532040a>

Melott, AL et al. (2017) A Supernova at 50 pc: Effects on the Earth's Atmosphere and Biota. *Astrophysical Journal* 840, 105. [https://doi.org/10.3847/1538-](https://doi.org/10.3847/1538-4357/aa6c57)

[4357/aa6c57](https://doi.org/10.3847/1538-4357/aa6c57)

Melott, AL, Marinho, F, and Paulucci, L (2018) Muon Radiation Dose and Marine Megafaunal Extinction at the end-Pliocene Supernova. *arXiv:1712.09367*

Melott, AL and Thomas, BC (2018) Terrestrial effects of moderately nearby supernovae. *Lethaia* 51, 325. <https://doi.org/10.1111/let.12256>

Neale, JP and Thomas, BC (2016) Solar Irradiance Changes and Phytoplankton Productivity in Earth's Ocean Following Astrophysical Ionizing Radiation Events. *Astrobiology* 16, 245. doi: 10.1089/ast.2015.1360

Neuenswander, B and Melott, AL (2015) Nitrate Deposition following an Astrophysical Ionizing Radiation Event. *Advances in Space Research* 55, 2946. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.asr.2015.03.017>

Oesch, LE (2016) Nitrogen isotope changes in the equatorial Atlantic during the Plio-Pleistocene Transition. *14th Swiss Geoscience Meeting*, Geneva.

Quere Cle et al. (2015) Global Carbon Budget, *Earth Syst. Sci. Data* 7, 349.

Peng, S et al. (2017) Effects of UVB radiation on freshwater biota : a meta-analysis. *Global Ecology and Biogeography* 26, 500, doi:10.1111/geb.12552

Reiners, PW and Turchyn, AV (2018) Extraterrestrial dust, the marine lithologic record, and global biogeochemical cycles. *Geology*

<https://doi.org/10.1130/G45040.1>

Schlesinger, WH and Bernhardt, ES (2013) *Biogeochemistry*. Academic Press, Waltham, MA USA.

- Shen, J et al. (2018) Improved efficiency of the biological pump as a trigger for the Late Ordovician glaciation. *Nature Geoscience* 11, 510.
- Thomas, RQ et al. (2009) Increased tree carbon storage in response to nitrogen deposition in the US. *Nature-geoscience* 3, 13.
- Thomas, B.C. et al. (2005) Gamma-ray bursts and the Earth: Exploration of Atmospheric, Biological, Climatic, and Biogeochemical Effects, *Astrophysical Journal* 634, 509.
- Thomas, BC and Honeyman, MD (2008) Amphibian nitrate stress as an additional terrestrial threat from astrophysical ionizing radiation events? *Astrobiology* 8, 731, doi:10.1089/ast.2007.0262
- Thomas, BC (2018) Photobiological Effects at Earth's Surface Following a 50 pc Supernova. *Astrobiology* 18, 481. DOI: 10.1089/ast.2017.1730
- Wallner, A et al. (2016) Recent near-Earth supernovae probed by global deposition of interstellar radioactive ^{60}Fe . *Nature* 532, 69.
- <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature17196>