

# A NOTE ON NONABELIAN FREIMAN-RUZSA

SEAN EBERHARD

ABSTRACT. Recently Breuillard and Tointon [BT] showed that one reasonable formulation of the polynomial Freiman-Ruzsa conjecture fails for nonabelian groups. We improve and simplify their construction.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

A subset  $A$  of some ambient group  $G$  is called a  $K$ -approximate group if  $A^2 \subset XA$  for some set  $X$  of size at most  $K$ . A Freiman-type structure theorem for approximate groups was proved by Breuillard, Green, and Tao [BGT12].

**Theorem 1.1** (Breuillard-Green-Tao [BGT12]). *Let  $A$  be a  $K$ -approximate group. Then there is a coset nilprogression  $P \subset A^{100}$  of rank and step  $O_K(1)$  such that  $A$  is covered by  $O_K(1)$  translates of  $P$ .*

The former  $O_K(1)$  is benign: it can be taken to be  $O(K^2 \log K)$ , or even  $O(\log K)$  at the expense of replacing  $A^{100}$  in the theorem by  $A^{O_K(1)}$ . No earthly bounds are known for the latter  $O_K(1)$ , however, nor for the  $O_K(1)$  in the following weaker statement.

**Corollary 1.2.** *Every  $K$ -approximate group  $A$  is contained in  $O_K(1)$  cosets of a group  $\Gamma$  having a normal subgroup  $H \subset A^{100}$  such that  $\Gamma/H$  is nilpotent.*

Recently Breuillard and Tointon [BT] gave an example which shows that the  $O_K(1)$  here cannot be taken to be polynomial in  $K$ , even if we were to replace “nilpotent” with “solvable” and  $A^{100}$  with, say,  $A^{\exp \exp \exp K}$ .

**Theorem 1.3** (Breuillard-Tointon [BT]). *Let  $f : \mathbf{N} \rightarrow \mathbf{N}$  be arbitrary. Then for arbitrarily large  $K$  there are finite  $K$ -approximate groups  $A$  not covered by  $K^{\frac{1}{200} \log \log \log \log K}$  cosets of any group  $\Gamma$  having a finite normal subgroup  $H \subset A^{f(K)}$  such that  $\Gamma/H$  is solvable.*

Here we improve and simplify their construction.

**Theorem 1.4.** *For arbitrarily large  $K$  there are finite  $K$ -approximate groups  $A$  not covered by  $K^{\log \log K}$  cosets of any group  $\Gamma$  having a finite normal subgroup  $H$  such that  $\Gamma/H$  is solvable.*

## 2. FINITE-BY-SOLVABLE GROUPS

If  $\mathcal{P}$  and  $\mathcal{Q}$  are adjectives pertaining to groups (e.g., finite, nilpotent, or solvable), then a group  $G$  is called  $\mathcal{P}$ -by- $\mathcal{Q}$  if it fits into an exact sequence

$$1 \rightarrow P \rightarrow G \rightarrow Q \rightarrow 1$$

in which  $P$  is a  $\mathcal{P}$  group and  $Q$  is a  $\mathcal{Q}$  group. (Some authors would call such a group  $\mathcal{Q}$ -by- $\mathcal{P}$ . Perhaps they have the logical right of it, but we'll stick to the more common convention.)

Thus a group  $\Gamma$  as in Theorem 1.4 having a finite normal subgroup  $H$  such that  $\Gamma/H$  is solvable is called finite-by-solvable. Every finite-by-solvable group is solvable-by-finite, but the converse does not hold. For example consider the group  $G = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$ , where  $\mathcal{S}_n$  acts on  $\mathbf{Z}^n$  by permuting coordinates.  $G$  is obviously solvable-by-finite, even abelian-by-finite, but the following lemma shows that  $G$  is not finite-by-solvable.

**Lemma 2.1.** *If  $G \leq \mathcal{S}_n$  is not solvable then  $G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$  is not finite-by-solvable.*

*Proof.* Let  $H$  be a normal subgroup of  $G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$  such that  $(G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n)/H$  is solvable. Since  $G/(H \cap G) \cong (GH)/H \leq (G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n)/H$  we must have  $G/(H \cap G)$  solvable, and in particular  $H \cap G \neq 1$ . Moreover since  $H$  is normal we must have  $H \supset [H \cap G, \mathbf{Z}^n]$ . But since  $H \cap G \neq 1$  and the action of  $\mathcal{S}_n$  on  $\mathbf{Z}^n$  is faithful the subgroup  $[H \cap G, \mathbf{Z}^n]$  of  $\mathbf{Z}^n$  is nontrivial and therefore infinite, so  $H$  must be infinite.  $\square$

We can now briefly sketch the proof of Theorem 1.4. We will take  $G = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$  and  $A = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes [-R, R]^n$ , where  $R \approx \infty$ . Then  $A$  is a  $2^n$ -approximate group. We will show that any  $\Gamma \leq G$  which covers  $A$  with only  $2^{n \log n}$  cosets must cover so much of  $\mathcal{S}_n$  that  $\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n$  is not solvable.  $\Gamma$  will also have to cover a finite-index subgroup of  $\mathbf{Z}^n$ , so from Lemma 2.1 it will follow that  $\Gamma$  is not finite-by-solvable.

## 3. SOLVABLE SUBGROUPS OF THE SYMMETRIC GROUP

The following theorem about solvable subgroups of symmetric group was proved by Dixon [Dix67].

**Theorem 3.1.** *If  $G \leq \mathcal{S}_n$  is solvable then  $|G| \leq (2 \cdot 3^{1/3})^{n-1}$ .*

For comparison, Dixon also proved that if  $G \leq \mathcal{S}_n$  is abelian then  $|G| \leq (3^{1/3})^n$ , while if  $G \leq \mathcal{S}_n$  is nilpotent then  $|G| \leq 2^{n-1}$ : see Dixon [Dix67, Dix71]. Each of these theorems is sharp up to a small multiplicative factor.

We reproduce the proof of Theorem 3.1 here just to keep this note reasonably self-contained.

*Proof.* Let  $a = 2 \cdot 3^{1/3}$ . We will prove  $|G| \leq a^{n-1}$  by induction on  $n$ .

If  $G$  is intransitive, say with orbit sizes  $n_1, \dots, n_m$  for some  $m > 1$ , then  $G \leq G_1 \times \dots \times G_m$ , where  $G_i \leq \mathcal{S}_{n_i}$  is the restriction of  $G$  to the  $i$ th orbit. Since each restriction  $G_i$  is solvable, by induction

$$|G| \leq a^{n_1-1} \dots a^{n_m-1} \leq a^{n-1}.$$

Similarly if  $G$  is transitive but imprimitive, say preserving a system of  $r$  blocks with  $1 < r < n$ , then the subgroup  $H \leq G$  fixing each block is a solvable subgroup of  $\mathcal{S}_{n/r}^r$ , and  $G/H$  is a solvable subgroup of  $\mathcal{S}_r$ , so by induction

$$|G| = |G/H| |H| \leq a^{r-1} (a^{n/r-1})^r = a^{n-1}.$$

Hence we may assume  $G$  is primitive. Let  $A \leq G$  be a minimal normal subgroup. Then  $A$  is characteristically simple (has no proper nontrivial characteristic subgroups), and any characteristically simple finite group is a direct product of isomorphic simple groups. Since  $G$  is solvable this implies that  $A \cong \mathbf{F}_p^k$  for some prime  $p$  and some  $k \geq 1$ . Let  $G_1$  be the stabilizer of a point in  $G$ . Since  $G$  is primitive  $G_1$  is maximal. Since  $G$  is transitive  $G_1$  contains no nontrivial normal subgroup of  $G$ , so  $G = G_1 A$ . The centralizer  $C(A)$  of  $A$  in  $G$  is normal in  $G$ , so  $C(A) \cap G_1$  is normalised by both  $A$  and  $G_1$ , hence by  $G$ . Thus  $C(A) \cap G_1 = 1$ . Thus  $C(A) = A$  and  $n = [G : G_1] = |A| = p^k$ . It now follows that  $G_1 \cong G/C(A)$ , which is isomorphic to a subgroup of  $\text{Aut}(A) \cong \text{GL}_k(\mathbf{F}_p)$ , so

$$|G| \leq p^k |\text{GL}_k(\mathbf{F}_p)| = p^k (p^k - 1)(p^k - p) \cdots (p^k - p^{k-1}).$$

Now check this is at most  $a^{p^k-1}$  for all  $p, k$ . □

#### 4. MAIN ARGUMENT

Let  $n \geq 100$ , and let  $G = \mathcal{S}_n \times \mathbf{Z}^n$ , where  $\mathcal{S}_n$  acts on  $\mathbf{Z}^n$  by permuting coordinates. For  $r \geq 0$  let  $A_r$  be the ball

$$A_r = \mathcal{S}_n \times [-r, r]^n.$$

Since  $A_r^2 \subset A_{2r}$ ,  $A_r$  is a  $2^n$ -approximate group for every  $r$ . Fix  $R > 2^{n \log n}$  and let  $A = A_R$ .

Suppose  $A$  is contained in  $2^{n \log n}$  cosets of  $\Gamma \leq G$ , i.e.,  $|A\Gamma/\Gamma| \leq 2^{n \log n}$ . Then since  $2^{n \log n} < R$  there is some integer  $r \leq R$  such that  $|A_{r+1}\Gamma/\Gamma| = |A_r\Gamma/\Gamma|$ . Since  $A_{s+1} = A_1 A_s$  for all  $s \geq 0$  this implies that  $A_s \Gamma = A_r \Gamma$  for all  $s \geq r$ , and hence  $A_r \Gamma = G$  and  $A\Gamma = G$ . Thus  $\Gamma$  has index at most  $2^{n \log n}$  in  $G$ .

In particular  $\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n$  has index at most  $2^{n \log n}$  in  $\mathcal{S}_n$ , so by Theorem 3.1 and the calculation

$$2^{n \log n} (2 \cdot 3^{1/3})^n < n!$$

we know that  $\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n$  is not solvable. Also  $\Gamma \cap \mathbf{Z}^n$  is a finite-index subgroup of  $\mathbf{Z}^n$ , so  $\Gamma \cap \mathbf{Z}^n \geq d\mathbf{Z}^n$  for some integer  $d > 0$ . Thus  $\Gamma$  contains

$$(\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n) \times d\mathbf{Z}^n \cong (\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n) \times \mathbf{Z}^n,$$

so by Lemma 2.1 the group  $\Gamma$  cannot be finite-by-solvable.

## REFERENCES

- [BGT12] Emmanuel Breuillard, Ben Green, and Terence Tao. The structure of approximate groups. *Publ. Math. Inst. Hautes Études Sci.*, 116:115–221, 2012.
- [BT] Emmanuel Breuillard and Matthew C. H. Tointon. Nilprogressions and groups with moderate growth. preprint.
- [Dix67] John D. Dixon. The Fitting subgroup of a linear solvable group. *J. Austral. Math. Soc.*, 7:417–424, 1967.
- [Dix71] John D. Dixon. Maximal abelian subgroups of the symmetric groups. *Canad. J. Math.*, 23:426–438, 1971.

MATHEMATICAL INSTITUTE, UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD, UK

*E-mail address:* eberhard@maths.ox.ac.uk