Collective chemosensing in defective multicellular networks

Garrett D. Potter,¹ Tommy A. Byrd,² Andrew Mugler,² and Bo Sun^{1,*}

¹Department of Physics, Oregon State University, Corvallis OR, USA

²Department of Physics, Purdue University, West Lafayette IN, USA

Collective sensing by many interacting cells is observed in a variety of biological systems, and yet a quantitative understanding of how sensory information is encoded by many cells is still lacking. In this study, we characterize the calcium dynamics of cocultured monolayers of fibroblast cells and breast cancer cells in response to external ATP stimuli. We find that gap junctional communication is suppressed by the presence of cancer cells, similar in effect to reducing cell density. The ATPinduced calcium dynamics of nearest neighbor cells are correlated, and the cross-correlation functions depend on both ATP concentration and the architecture of the multicellular network. Combining experiments and stochastic modeling, we find that networks with sparse or defective connectivity have a reduced propensity for calcium oscillations and exhibit a broader distribution of oscillation frequencies. We find that cell-to-cell variability makes the conventional model of frequency encoding ineffective for a large population of communicating cells. Instead, our results suggest that multicellular networks are organized near a dynamical critical point which allows cell-to-cell communications to significantly modulate the collective cellular dynamics.

I. SIGNIFICANCE STATEMENT

Cells routinely sense and respond to their environment, and they also communicate with each other. Communication is therefore thought to play a crucial role in sensing, but exactly how this occurs remains poorly understood. We study a population of fibroblast cells that responds to a stimulus (ATP) and communicates by molecule exchange. We control communication in two ways: by varying the cell density, and by introducing cancer cells, which act as "defective nodes" in the communication network. Combining experiments and mathematical modeling, we find that communication promotes a locally correlated, oscillatory sensory response, despite significant cell-to-cell variability. This allows single-cell responses to reflect not just the stimulus level, but also the degree of communication within the population.

II. INTRODUCTION

Decoding the cellular response to environmental perturbations, such as chemosensing, photosensing, and mechanosensing has been of central importance in our understanding of living systems. Up to date, most studies of cellular sensation and response have focused on single isolated cells or population averages. An emerging picture from these studies is the set of designing principles governing cellular signaling pathways: these pathways are organized into an intertwined, often redundant network, and the network architecture is closely related with the robustness of cellular information processing [1, 2]. On the other hand, many examples suggest that collective sensing by many interacting cells may provide another dimension for the cells to process environmental cues [3]. Quorum sensing in bacterial colonies [4] and cyclic adenosine monophosphate (cAMP) signaling in Dictyostelium discoideum populations [5] generate dramatic group behaviors in response to environmental stimuli. Various types of collective sensing has also been observed for higher level multicellular organisms, such as in the olfaction of insects [6] and mammals [7], and in the visual processing of animal retinal ganglion cells [8, 9]. These examples suggest a fundamental need to revisit cellular information processing in the context of multicellular sensation and responses, since even weak cell-to-cell interaction may have strong impacts on the states of multicellular network dynamics [8]. In particular, we would like to examine the robustness of collective sensing in the presence of less-responsive or less-interacting cells, which can be thought of as defective nodes in a multicellular network.

Previously, we have described the spatial-temporal dynamics of collective chemosensing of a mammalian cell model system [10, 11]. In this model system, high density mouse fibroblast cells (NIH 3T3) form a monolaver that allows nearest-neighbor communications through gap junctions [12]. When extracellular ATP is delivered to the cell monolayer, P2 receptors on the cell membrane trigger release of the second messenger IP3 (Inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate)[13]. IP3 molecules, when binding to their receptors at the membrane of endoplasmic reticulum (ER), open ion channels to allow influx of Ca^{2+} from the ER to the cytoplasm. The fast increase in cytosolic calcium concentration is followed by slow decrease when Ca^{2+} are pumped back to the ER [14]. This simple picture, however, is complicated by the nonlinear feedback between Ca^{2+} and ion channel opening probability, which leads to rich dynamic behaviors such as cytosolic calcium oscillations [15]. In the situation of collective ATP sensing, we have found that gap junction communications dominate intercellular interactions [10]. Furthermore, these short-range interactions propagate and

^{*}Electronic address: sunb@onid.orst.edu

turn the cell monolayer into a percolating network [11]. These characteristics make the system ideal for studying multicellular dynamics of collective chemosensing.

In order to examine how network architecture, such as connectivity and defective nodes affect collective chemosensing, we introduce cancer cells (MDA-MB-231) into the fibroblast cell monolayer. As we show later, MDA-MB-231 cells can be treated as defects in the multicellular network. They have distinct calcium dynamics when compared with NIH 3T3 cells, presumably due to reduced gap junction communication [16–18]. We have studied the collective ATP sensing of cocultured fibroblast-cancer monolayers. We find that the nearest neighbor correlations, as well as the characteristics of calcium oscillations systematically depend on the architecture of the multicellular network. In particular, we find that networks with sparse or defective connectivity have a reduced propensity for calcium oscillations and exhibit a broader distribution of oscillation frequencies. Combining the experimental and theoretical results, we conclude that network architecture, together with cell-to-cell variablility determine the multicellular dynamics of collective chemosensing. Furthermore, our results provide evidence that cellular systems are organized critically, which allows cell-to-cell communications to have a large impact on the collective cellular dynamics.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In order to study the collective chemosensing of a multicellular network, we use single channel microfluidic devices and deliver ATP solutions to cocultured monolayers of fibroblast (NIH 3T3) and breast cancer (MDA-MB-231) cells in the flow channel (see Appendix A). The stimuli solutions of ATP concentrations varying from 10 μM to 100 μM are pumped though the channel at rate of 50 μ l/min, ensuring minimal flow perturbation to the cells and fast delivery of ATP across the field of view. During this time we record the calcium dynamics of each individual cell loaded with fluorescent calcium indicator (Fluo-4, Life Technologies) at 4 frames/sec (Hamamatsu Flash 2.8, Hamamatsu). Our analysis uses 400 seconds of data from each recording selected such that ATP arrival is at approximately 50 seconds. To distinguish the two cell types, MDA-MB-231 cells are pre-labeled with red fluorescent dye (Cell Tracker Red CMTPX, Life Technologies).

Fig. 1A shows the composite image of a high density cell monolayer with co-cultured fibroblast and cancer cells. In this example, MDA-MB-231 cells make up 15% of the total population which has a combined cell density of 2500 cells/mm². At this density, each cell has an average of 6 nearest neighbors from which extensive gap junction communication is expected. By adjusting the cell density ρ_T and cancer cell fraction F_C over a wide range, we are able to control the architecture of the resulting multicellular network. After identifying



FIG. 1: Calcium dynamics of cocultured cancer-fibroblast cell monolayer in response to extracellular ATP. (A) Composite image showing the multicellular network. Red: breast cancer cells (MDA-MB-231). Green: fluorescent calcium signal for all cells (MDA-MB-231 and NIH 3T3). (B) Typical fluorescent intensity profiles showing the calcium dynamics on the single cell level, where basal level intensity has been subtracted. For each cell, basal level intensity is estimated by averaging 100 seconds of its fluorescent intensity before ATP arrival. Data taken from an experiment where a cell monolayer is excited by 50 μ M ATP. (C) Normalized intensity profiles of one typical experiment for each ATP concentration tested. Blue: randomly selected single cell calcium responses. Red: average intensity profiles of all cells in each experiment. All time series begin approximately 50 seconds before arrival of ATP stimuli. Intensity profiles of individual cells have been rescaled to [-1, 1]. (D) Fluorescent recovery after photo bleaching (FRAP) experiments confirm that MDA-MB-231 cells have weaker gap junction communication compared with NIH 3T3 cells (p < 0.001, student's t-test). See Appendix A for more details.

cell centers from the composite image (see Appendix A), we compute the time-dependent average fluorescent intensity near the center of each cell which represents the instantaneous intracellular calcium concentration at the single cell level.

Single cell calcium dynamics reveal the inherent differences in the ATP sensing of the two cell types. Fig. 1B highlights these differences by showing the intensity profiles of selected fibroblast and breast cancer cells of a typical experiment (ATP concentration = 20 uM, ρ_T = 2400 cells/mm², $F_C = 12\%$). Both cell types exhibit immediate increases in cytosolic calcium levels at the arrival of ATP after which cancer cells typically show long relaxation times while fibroblast cells tend to demonstrate oscillations after stimulation. These qualitative features are maintained across all ATP concentrations and, as detailed below, can be tuned by adjusting the network architecture. As shown in Fig. 1C, on average, higher concentrations of ATP trigger larger increases in calcium levels; however, cell-to-cell variations are significant. Response times as well as subsequent calcium dynamics of individual cells vary dramatically amongst cells in the same multicellular network. Despite these variations, fluorescent recovery after photobleaching (FRAP)[19] confirms that gap junction communications between MDA-MB-231 cells are significantly weaker when compared with NIH 3T3 cells (Fig. 1D), consistent with previous reports [16–18]. It is therefore evident that MDA-MB-231 cells can be treated as defects in the co-cultured multicellular network.

We have previously demonstrated the effectiveness of using nearest neighbor cross-correlation functions (C_{NN}) to characterize the calcium dynamics of collective chemosensing [10]. As a result, we first study how network architecture may affect the spectrum of C_{NN} . For any cell *i*, we represent its calcium dynamics (fluorescent intensity profile) as $R_i(t)$, and define C_{NN} as:

$$\dot{R}_{i}(t) = \frac{dR_{i}}{dt}(t) - \left\langle \frac{dR_{i}}{dt}(t) \right\rangle$$

$$C(\tau)_{ij} = \frac{1}{\sigma_{i}\sigma_{j}} \left\langle \dot{R}_{i}(t)\dot{R}_{j}(t+\tau) \right\rangle$$

$$C_{NN_{i,j}} = C(\tau=0)_{ij}|_{D_{ij}=1}$$
(1)

To evaluate $\frac{dR_i}{dt}$, we numerically differentiate the response curve $R_i(t)$ using the five-point stencil method; $\langle \frac{dR_i}{dt} \rangle$ is the time average. Note that σ_i^2 is the variance of $\dot{R}_i(t)$, which normalizes $C(\tau)_{ij}$ to be dimensionless. Based on Delauney triangulation of the multicellular network, topological distance D can be defined for each cell pair where D = 1 for nearest neighbors. The mean nearest neighbor cross-correlation function \bar{C}_{NN} is obtained by averaging $C_{NN_{i,j}}$ over all nearest neighbor pairs ij.

We have quantified the calcium dynamics of more than 172,000 nearest neighbor cell pairs at various conditions in order to investigate how network architecture affects the characteristics of collective ATP sensing. At fixed cell density ($\rho_T \sim 1200 \text{ cells/mm}^2$) and cancer fraction ($F_C \sim 15\%$), nearest neighbor cross-correlation increases with increasing ATP concentrations (Fig 2A), consistent with the fact that higher concentration of ATP suppress the noise in chemoreception [20]. Meanwhile, the average nearest neighbor cross-correlation \bar{C}_{NN} is only weakly dependent on the network architecture as shown in Fig. 2B.

However, we find the spectrum of $C_{NN_{ij}}$, unlike its average, systematically depends on the network architecture. This is best demonstrated through differential entropy, a scalar value that characterizes the randomness of a set of observables. The differential entropy is defined as $H = -\int \rho(x)\rho(x)dx$, where $\rho(x)$ is the probability density of a continuous variable x. Higher values of differential entropy are associated with broader distributions; this allows us to directly compare the spectrum of nearest neighbor cross-correlations. To avoid biasing



FIG. 2: Nearest neighbor cross-correlation analysis of calcium dynamics at varying ATP concentrations and multicellular network architectures. (A) Nearest neighbor cross-correlation C_{NN} at fixed density (1200±200 cells/mm²) and cancer fraction (15% \pm 4%) at varying ATP concentrations. Red: C_{NN} for all cell pairs. Blue: C_{NN} of only fibroblast cell pairs. For each box in the box plot, the upper and lower bounds, upper and lower whiskers and the dark line inside the box represent the 25%, 75%, 95%, 5% and mean of the corresponding $C_{NN_{ij}}$ respectively. Each box represents at least 1000 pair correlations. (B) \bar{C}_{NN} as a function of cancer fraction and cell density at fixed ATP concentration of 50 μ M. The 2D map $\bar{C}_{NN}(F_c, \rho_T)$ has been generated by interpolating with a Gaussian kernel (see Appendix B for details). (C) Differential entropy of nearest neighbor cross-correlations (H_{cnn}) as function of cell density at fixed fraction of cancer cells $(15\%\pm4\%)$. (D) H_{cnn} as a function of cancer cell fraction at fixed cell density (1200 \pm 200 cells/mm²). Error bars of H_{cnn} in (C-D) are standard deviations of 1000 bootstrap iterations (see Appendix B for details.)

the entropy calculation due to binning of data, the differential entropy is determined by using the k-nearest neighbor algorithm [21, 22].

We have calculated H_{cnn} , the differential entropy of $C_{NN_{ij}}$ as a function of network architecture. As shown in Fig. 2C, increasing cell density decreases the differential entropy of $C_{NN_{ij}}$, suggesting that higher levels of network connectivity will suppress the fluctuations in the nearest neighbor cross-correlations. On the other hand, Fig. 2D shows that increasing the fraction of cancer cells also causes a reduction in the differential entropy H_{cnn} . While higher F_C is associated with weaker cell-cell communications, the apparent contradiction between Fig. 2C and Fig. 2D may be attributed to the qualitative differences in the calcium responses between fibroblast cells and cancer cells as demonstrated in Fig. 1B. Because MDA-MB-231 cells demonstrate rather quiet calcium dynamics following the initial ATP excitation, their presence suppress the fluctuations in the cross-correlations $C_{NN_{ij}}$. As a result, at fixed cell density, more cancer cells lead to a narrower distribution of nearest neighbor cross-correlations. This explanation is also supported by examining H_{cnn} of the time series truncated to only the initial response (0 to 75 seconds) and subsequent dynamics (75 to 400 seconds), as detailed in the Appendix B.

After excitation by ATP, many cells exhibit transient oscillations. The inter-spike interval (ISI), which characterizes the period of the oscillation, has been proposed to dynamically encode information of the stimuli. To investigate the characteristics of ISI for collective chemosensing, we systematically studied the statistics of ISI from 30,000 cells at varying ATP concentrations and network architectures. Fig. 3A shows the average ISI at fixed cell density and cancer fraction. Similar to the $C_{NN_{ii}}$, large fluctuations are observed due to cell-to-cell variations. However, the average ISI does not systematically shift as a function of ATP concentration, in contrast with the C_{NN} (Fig. 2A). Noticing that the average ISI does not appear to be an effective coding channel of extracellular ATP, we seek to further elucidate the spectrum of ISI in a defective multicellular network. Fig. 3B-C demonstrate the result of a typical experiment, where the co-cultured cell monolayer ($\rho_T = 1400 \text{ mm}^{-2}$, $F_c = 20\%$) is excited by 50μ M ATP. Fig. 3B shows the histogram (event counts) of ISI normalized by the cell numbers of cancer and fibroblast cells respectively. While both species have a broad distribution of ISI, it is evident that oscillatory events are less likely to occur for the MDA-MB-231 cells.

3C further shows the spatial distribution of Fig. ISI (mean ISI for each cell) in this experiment. Nonoscillating cells (labeled black) are more likely to be cancer cells (labeled by circles), which is consistent with the fact that more oscillatory events are observed for fibroblast cells (see Appendix C for more examples). To investigate the spatial fluctuations of ISI, we have calculated $C_{ISI}(d)$, the cross-correlation of ISI as a function of topological distance d. In particular, for each experiment, we first identify all oscillatory cells and the average ISI T_i for each cell *i*. We then define $\delta T_i = T_i - \langle T_i \rangle$, and $C_{ISI}(d) = \frac{1}{\langle \delta T_i^2 \rangle} \langle \delta T_i \delta T_j \rangle_{D_{ij}=d}$. Five experiments done in the same conditions have been used to estimate the uncertainty of $C_{ISI}(d)$. As shown in Fig. 3D, the correlation decays immediately when $d \geq 1$, suggesting that the frequencies of calcium oscillations are randomly distributed amongst cells in the monolayer.

To test if non-oscillating cells tend to emerge as clusters, we have compared the cluster size distribution of non-oscillating cells with simulation of a random network based on the same geometry of Fig. 3C. In particular, we calculate P(n) as the probability of a non-oscillating cell to belong to a non-oscillating cluster of size bigger than n. A non-oscillating cluster is defined as a group of non-oscillating cells which can be connected mutually via nearest neighbor links [23]. The size of a cluster is



FIG. 3: Calcium oscillations of cocultured cancer-fibroblast cell monolayer. (A) Average inter-spike interval (ISI) at varying ATP concentrations, fixed cell density (1200 ± 200 cells/mm²) and cancer fraction ($15\%\pm4\%$). (B-D) ISI characteristics of a typical experiment. (B) ISI event counts normalized by number of cells. Blue: statistics of only NIH 3T3 cells, Red: statistics of only MDA-MB-231 cells. (C) Spatial map of average ISI of each individual cell. Black: non-oscillating cell. Circle: MDA-MB-231 cell. (D) ISI cross-correlation as a function of topological distance. Data from experiments with 50 μ M ATP, at fixed cell density (1400 ± 400 cells/mm²) and cancer fraction ($20\%\pm5\%$). Error bars showing standard deviation of $C_{ISI}(d)$ from five experiments. Inset: Size distribution of non-oscillating cell clusters. Red: experiment. Blue: simulation of 500 realizations of random network.

defined as the number of cells in the cluster. In each realization of the random network, we keep the same node positions and total number of non-oscillating cells as in the experiment, while randomly assigning nodes to be non-oscillating cells. The result shown in Fig. 3D inset suggests that non-oscillating cells are randomly distributed within the multicellular network. Notice that these results are in contrast with $C_{NN_{ij}}$, where strongly correlated cell pairs tend to form larger clusters [11].

Further study reveals that the fraction of nonoscillating cells (F_N) is critically modulated by the network architecture. As shown in Fig. 4A, at fixed cell density (~1200 cells/mm²), increasing the fraction of cancer cells increases the fraction of non-oscillating cells in the monolayer (see Appendix C for pairwise statistical comparison). Note that at the same time more fibroblast cells become non-oscillatory, as a result of reduced cellcell communication in the multicellular network. Similarly, when holding the fraction of cancer cells fixed (~15%), increasing cell density reduces the fraction of



FIG. 4: Fraction of non-oscillating cells and the spectrum of ISI in a defective multicellular network are regulated by network architecture. (A) Non-oscillating fraction of cells (F_N) increases with increased cancer fraction (F_C) at fixed cell densities $(1200\pm200 \text{ cells/ mm}^2)$. Blue: fraction of nonoscillating NIH 3T3 cells. Red: fraction of non-oscillating cells including both cell types (B) Non-oscillating fraction of cells (F_N) decreases with increased cell density (ρ_T) at fixed cancer cell fractions ($15\% \pm 4\%$). (C) F_N is positively correlated with the differential entropy of inter-spike intervals (H_{ISI}) . Error bars represent standard deviation of 1000 bootstrap resampled results, see Appendix B for more details. (D) The spectrum of inter-spike intervals (ISI) as characterized by H_{ISI} is regulated by the microenvironment of cells. For fixed ATP concentration (50 μ M), calcium dynamics and the associated ISI of individual fibroblast cells are grouped based on the microenvironment of the cells. The microenvironment is characterized by the number of nearest neighbors (N_{nn}) , among which a fraction of F_{nnc} are cancer cells. The color map represents H_{ISI} (in bits) at varying N_{nn} and F_{nnc} , obtained by interpolating scattered data points with a Gaussian kernel.

non-oscillating cells and promotes a larger portion of fibroblast cells into transient oscillation (Fig. 4B, see SI section S3 for pairwise statistical comparison). Therefore, we conclude that the calcium dynamics of individual cells are highly regulated by the level of gap junction communication inside the cell monolayer.

Interestingly, the network architecture also regulates the spectrum of ISI. As shown in Fig. 4C, differential entropy of ISI (H_{ISI} , ISI's from the same cell are considered as independent sample data) has strong positive correlation with F_N . It is therefore evident that increasing the degree of cell-cell communication narrows the distribution of ISI. The same effect can also be demonstrated from the perspective of each individual cell's microenvironment. To this end, we have grouped NIH 3T3 cells based on their number of nearest neighbors (N_{nn}) , as well as the fraction of cancer cells in their N_{nn} neighbors. For each group at a fixed ATP concentration (50 μ M), we have computed the differential entropy of interspike intervals H_{ISI} . As shown in Fig. 4D, H_{ISI} is higher for cells that are surrounded by a large number of cancer cells, and lower for cells with pure fibroblast neighbors. In the latter case, H_{ISI} also increases as the number of nearest neighbors decreases. Together, these results show that the spectrum of ISI is regulated by cell-cell communications both locally in the immediate microenvironment of a cell and globally throughout the whole defective multicellular network.

To more quantitatively understand how the collective dynamics depend on network architecture, we developed a theoretical model of collective calcium signaling. The model is based on the work of Tang and Othmer [24, 25] and captures the ATP-induced release of IP3, the IP3triggered opening of calcium channels in the ER, and the nonlinear dependence of the opening probability on the calcium concentration (see Fig. 5A and Appendix D). The model predicts that at a critical IP3 concentration, the calcium dynamics transition from non-oscillatory to oscillatory. The model neglects more complex features of calcium signaling observed in some cell types, such as upstream IP3 oscillations [26, 27] and spatial correlations among channels [28, 29], because we sought the simplest model that reproduces some of our central experimental observations. The model was previously analyzed deterministically for a single cell [24, 25], and therefore we extend it to include intrinsic noise and cell-to-cell communication via calcium exchange. We have also explicitly taken into account of the dynamics of IP3, which has a constant degradation rate and a variable production rate α . Based on the signaling mechanism, α is a monotonic increasing function of ATP. We simulate the dynamics using the Gillespie algorithm [30] (with implicit tau-leaping to exploit timescale separation [31-34]), and we vary the density ρ_T of cells on a 3-by-3 grid, which modulates the degree of communication (Fig. 5A).

We find that noise broadens the critical boundary between non-oscillatory and oscillatory regimes and shifts the boundary to lower α values or ATP concentrations (Appendix D). Similar shifts have been observed in ecological models [35] and bacterial protein dynamics [36], and are attributed to the ability of white noise to repeatedly excite a system at its resonant frequency [35]. We find that communication further shifts the boundary (Appendix D). Importantly, as shown in Fig. 5B (red bars), this means that the fraction of non-oscillating cells (F_N) decreases as cell density increases. This finding offers a mechanistic explanation for the experimental observation in Fig. 4B, which we term "density encoding": as the cell density increases, increased cell-to-cell communication promotes the entry of individual cells into their oscillatory regime, increasing the fraction of cells that oscillate. This finding also implies that the experimental



FIG. 5: Theoretical model of collective calcium signaling. (A) Schematic of the model. Cell density is varied on a 3-by-3 grid where nearest neighbors exchange calcium ions Ca²⁺. In each cell, ATP stimulates IP3 release, and IP3 acts jointly with Ca^{2+} to open calcium channels (positive feedback), while further Ca^{2+} binding closes channels (negative feedback). (B) Non-oscillating fraction of cells (F_N) decreases with increased cell density (ρ_T) , both with (blue) and without cell-to-cell variability (red). (C) Without cell-to-cell variability, the inter-spike interval (ISI) decreases with $\bar{\alpha}$ (red), which monotonically increase with ATP level (see Appendix D). However, the decrease is severely weakened by cell-to-cell variability (blue). (D) ISI cross-correlation as a function of topological distance, with (blue) and without cell-to-cell variability (red). To extend to a distance of d=4 cells, we use a 7-by-7 cell grid. We have checked various grid sizes to ensure that edge effects are small. (E) Entropy of ISI distribution (H_{ISI}) increases with F_N (with cell-to-cell variability). Line shows linear fit to both data sets. Model parameters are given in Appendix D.

system operates near the critical boundary between nonoscillating and oscillating dynamical regimes. Otherwise, cell density would not modulate F_N .

A well-known property of both theoretical [15, 24, 27] and experimental [37, 38] studies of calcium oscillations, termed frequency encoding, is that the oscillation frequency (or ISI) depends on the magnitude of the stimulus (ATP). As shown in Fig. 5C (red box plots), our



FIG. 6: Phase space of the model near the critical boundary between non-oscillating and oscillating cells. (A, B) Phase plot showing the non-oscillating fraction of cells (F_N) vs. cell density (ρ_T) and ATP level (which governs α), both without (A) and with cell-to-cell variability (B). The critical boundary (where F_N changes from 0 to 1) is significantly broadened by cell-to-cell variability. F_N is linearly interpolated from regularly spaced simulation data. See Appendix D for a zoom-in of the boundary in A. In B, from left to right, the solid curves denote where $F_N = 0.25$, 0.50, and 0.75, respectively. (C, D) Cross-sections of the phase plot in B corresponding to the left rectangle, where F_N is largely independent of density (C) and to the right rectangle, where F_N decreases with density (D). Parameters are given in Appendix D.

model exhibits frequency encoding, yet this property is at odds with the experimental observation that ISI is not dependent on ATP level (Fig. 3A). Motivated by the high degree of cell-to-cell variation evident in Figs. 1C and 3B, we hypothesize that cell-to-cell variability is responsible for the loss of frequency encoding at the population level. Lacking information about the susceptibility of particular parameters to variation, we allow all model parameters to vary from cell to cell. Specifically, parameters are varied uniform randomly in log space, with the magnitude of variability set by comparing the resulting ISI distribution with that measured in experiments, Fig. 3B (see Appendix D). As shown in Fig. 5C (right), we find that variability indeed significantly reduces the extent of frequency encoding, consistent with the experimental observations (Fig. 3A). Notice that while each cell individually exhibits frequency encoding in our model, cell-to-cell variability introduces extrinsic noise which removes the trend on a population level. For the same reason, cellto-cell variability also results in a reduction in the correlation of ISI between neighboring cells (Fig. 5D), which explains the low correlation seen in the experiments (Fig. 3D). Strikingly, as seen in Fig. 5B (blue bars) variability

does not remove the decrease of F_N with ρ_T , which remains consistent with the experimental observation (Fig. 4B). Furthermore, as shown in Fig. 5E, the entropy of the ISI distribution increases with F_N as in the experiments (Fig. 4C), indicating that as communication decreases the non-oscillating fraction, it also narrows the distribution of ISI values, which decreases the entropy. Both findings suggest that density encoding is more robust to cell-to-cell variability than frequency encoding, and that density encoding may be a generic way in which information about a stimulus is collectively stored.

Variability significantly broadens the critical regime separating non-oscillatory and oscillatory dynamics. This effect is demonstrated within our model by the phase plots in Figs. 6A and 6B, which show how F_N depends on the key parameters of the system, ATP level and cell density, both without (A) and with variability (B). In addition to broadening the phase boundary, we also see that variability affects the shape of the boundary (defined by $F_N = 0.5$), such that far away from the phase boundary F_N is not density-dependent (Fig. 6C), and close to the phase boundary F_N is strongly densitydependent (Fig. 6D). This is consistent with other recent suggestions that biological systems are poised near critical points in their parameter space [39, 40], although the connection between dynamical criticality, as in our model, and criticality in many-body statistical systems, remains to be fully explored.

IV. CONCLUSION

We have characterized the collective calcium dynamics of defective multicellular networks when they respond to various concentrations of extracellular ATP. These networks consist of cocultured fibroblast (NIH 3T3) and cancer (MDA-MB-231) cells, whose distinct calcium dynamics may originate from their difference in terms of gap junctional communications. We find that the overall magnitude of cross-correlations between nearest neighbor cells' calcium dynamics (C_{NN}) is sensitive to ATP concentration and the spectrum of C_{NN} relies on the network architectures. Notice that C_{NN} is not only a statistical characterization of the collective cellular dynamics, but also may provide robust channel for cellular information encoding [8, 41, 42]. Here we show how intercellular communication regulates the distribution of cross-correlations. Since gap junctional communications exist among many types of cells, our result may have far reaching implications for other biological models such as neuronal networks or cardiovascular systems.

Many previous studies have proposed that the frequency of calcium oscillations for individual cells may encode information about the external stimuli [15, 24, 27, 37, 38]. In the case of collective chemosensing of extracellular ATP, however, the inter-spike intervals no longer significantly depend on the ATP concentration. Our measurements of single-cell dynamics and populationlevel ISI distributions suggested that the loss of frequency encoding is due to large cell-to-cell variability, a hypothesis that was confirmed quantitatively by our theoretical model. The model predicts that while frequency encoding is retained at the single-cell level, cell-to-cell variability obscures it at the population level. A recent study of NF- κ B oscillations in fibroblast populations also found a large degree of cell-to-cell variability and demonstrated that this variability allows entrainment of the population to a wider range of inputs [43].

Despite the loss of frequency encoding, we found that the architecture of the multicellular network has dramatic effects on the fraction of non-oscillating cells. Elevated intercellular communication, either by increasing cell density or reducing fraction of defects (cancer cells) will promote more cells to enter oscillatory regime, a phenomenon that we broadly term density encoding. Importantly, we found both experimentally and theoretically that the fraction of non-oscillating cells shows robust positive correlation with the differential entropy in the interspike intervals, which implies that as more cells oscillate, they do so with a narrower range of frequencies. Taken together, our results suggest that cell-cell communication sharpens response distributions and allows the responses of single cells to encode information about population density, despite large cell-to-cell variability.

V. MATERIALS AND METHODS

A. Fabrication of Microfluidic Device

See Appendix A for detailed device fabrication and characteristics.

B. Cell Culture and Sample Preparation

NIH 3T3 and MDA-MB-231 cells were cultured in standard growth mediums (Dulbeccos modified Eagle medium (DMEM) supplemented with 10% bovine calf serum and 1% penicillin and DMEM supplemented with 10% fetal bovine serum, 1% penicillin, and 1% nonessential amino acids respectively). To prepare samples, cells were detached from culture dishes using TrypLE Select (Life Technologies) and suspended in growth mediums before pipetted into the microfluidics devices and allowed to form monolayers. If MDA-MB-231 cells were the dominant species (a fraction greater than 50% of all cells), they were first allowed to attach the glass bottom of the microfluidics devices. Red fluorescent tag (Cell-Tracker, Life Technologies) was then applied and subsequently washed with growth medium. Finally, NIH 3T3 cells were injected into the device so that the desired cell density ($\sim 1000 \text{ cells/mm}^2$) was reached. If NIH 3T3 cells were the dominant species, they were allowed to attach the glass bottom of the microfluidics devices first. MDA-MB-231 cells already loaded with CellTracker were then

injected into the devices to reach the desired cell density. After incubating the microfluidics devices containing cell monolayers overnight, fluorescent calcium indicator was applied (Fluo4, Life Technologies) making the samples ready for imaging.

C. Fluorescence Imaging and Image Analysis

Fluorescence was detected using a inverted microscope (Leica DMI 6000B) coupled with a Hamamatsu Flash 2.8 camera. Movies were taken at a frame rate of 4 frame/sec with a 20x oil immersion objective. Image analysis and data processing were performed in MATLAB. (Details in SI).

D. Stochastic model of collective calcium dynamics

We extend the model in [24, 25] to include intrinsic noise and cell-to-cell communication. We simulate the ensuing calcium dynamics of cells of various densities on a 3-by-3 grid (and 7-by-7 grid for Fig. 5D) using the Gillespie algorithm [30] with tau-leaping [31–34]). We include cell-to-cell variability by sampling all model parameters from distributions that are uniform in log space, which varies fold-change up to a maximal value. For further details, see SI section 4.

Acknowledgments

Discussions with Prof. D. Roundy and Prof. G. Schneider are gratefully acknowledged. The project is supported by NSF Grant PHY-1400968. This work is also supported by a grant from the Simons Foundation (#376198 to A.M.)

Appendix A: Additional information of experimental setup

1. Fabrication and characteristics of microfluidic device

The organic elastomer polydimethylsiloxane (PDMS, Sylgard 184, Dow-Corning) used to create the microfluidic devices is comprised of a two part mixture - a base and curing agent - that is mixed in a 10:1 ratio, degassed, and poured over a stainless steel mold before curing at 65°C overnight. Once cured, the microfluidic devices are cut from the mold, inlet/outlet holes are punched, and the device is affixed to a No. 1.5 coverslip via corona treatment. Figures 7A-C provide schematics of the design of the device as well as inner dimensions of the flow chamber.

To characterize the stimuli profile in the flow chamber, we use fluorescein (Sigma Aldrich) to replace ATP



FIG. 7: Design of the microfluidic device and stimuli arrival time (A) Top-view of microfluidic device showing glass slide, PDMS device, inlet/outlet, and connecting microfluidic chamber. (B) Side-view of microfluidic device indicating flow direction in red. (C) Cross-sectional view of device providing dimensions of flow layer and attached fibroblast (Green) and breast cancer (Red) cell monolayer. (D) Temporal profiles of chemical stimuli in the flow chamber evaluated using fluorescein. Two devices are tested (red and blue). Vertical lines correspond to arrival time and the times when half-maximum intensity reached.

as our probe and record the fluorescent intensity in the same flow condition as in the ATP sensing experiments. Figure 7D shows the normalized fluorescent intensity as a function of time from two devices. We estimate the time it takes to fill the field of view with chemical stimuli is about 1 second.

2. Obtaining individual cell calcium dynamics

Application of CellTracker Red CMTPX (LifeTechnologies) to breast cancer cells and the calcium binding dye Alexa Fluo4 (LifeTechnologies) to both breast cancer cells and fibroblast cells within the microfluidic device allows for the differentiation of the two cell types. To do so, successive images are taken of the two fluorophores and first analyzed in ImageJ (imagej.nih.gov). Overlaying the two images generates a composite image that determines the network architecture, as is shown in Figure 1A of the main text. The centroids for each individual cell are manually determined and a dot is placed at the center of each cell as shown in Fig. 8. Using the dotted image as a mask, intensity is averaged over the ≈ 40 pixels comprising the dot for each cell and for all acquired frames in the experiment.



FIG. 8: Determination of single cell centroids. (A) Composite image showing all cells (NIH 3T3 and MDA-MB-231, green), MDA-MB-231 (red), and manually determined centroids of NIH 3T3 cells (blue). (B) Composite image showing all cells (NIH 3T3 and MDA-MB-231, green), MDA-MB-231 (red), and manually determined centroids of all cells (NIH 3T3 and MDA-MB-231, blue).

3. Quantifying gap junctional intercellular communication

In order to quantify the gap junction communications for the two cell types we have used (NIH 3T3 and MDA-MB-231), we perform FRAP (fluorescent recovery after photobleaching) experiments to measure the effective diffusion coefficients in a cell monolayer for each cell type. To do so, each cell type was individually grown to full confluency on glass bottom dishes, dyed with CellTracker Red CMTPX (LifeTechnologies), and imaged using a 20x oil objective on a Leica TCS SPE. Bleaching of the desired region (I_i in Figure 9B) was done at 98% laser power for 15 minutes at approximately 2 seconds per frame. Recovery from bleaching was completed at 20% laser power for 1 hour at 30 seconds per frame. As shown in Fig. 9B, at each time point t, we represent the average concentration of fluorescent dye in the bleached area as $C_i(t)$ and non-bleached area as $C_o(t)$. The concentration of the dye is proportional to the recorded intensity as $C(t) = \alpha I(t)$, where α is a constant. We approximate the time evolution of $C_o(t)$ and $C_i(t)$ based on the following assumptions: (a) there is an overall bleaching rate β while imaging, affecting both $C_o(t)$ and $C_i(t)$. (b) $C_i(t)$ receives an influx due to a concentration gradient approximately proportional to $D_{eff} \frac{C_o(t) - C_i(t)}{l_2}$, where D_{eff} is the effective diffusion coefficient. (c) the cell monolayer has a uniform



FIG. 9: Estimation of the effective diffusion coefficients mediated by gap junctional communication in a cell monolayer. (A) Cell monolayer loaded with fluorescent dye (CellTracker Red CMTPX, LifeTechnologies) has been partially bleached. (B) The FRAP experiments can be quantified by the average intensity of the bleached area (I_i) and non-bleached area (I_o). (C) Normalized intensity profiles of a typical experiment. I_{pb} is the intensity of the bleached area while being bleached. I_i and I_o are intensity profiles during recovery. (D) Histogram (normalized to probability) of the diffusion coefficients for NIH-3T3 cells and MDA-MB-231 cells.

thickness of h. We have

$$\Delta C_o(t) = C_o(t + \Delta t) - C_o(t) \approx -\beta C_o(t) \Delta t \quad (A1)$$

$$\Delta C_i(t) = C_i(t + \Delta t) - C_i(t)$$

$$\approx \frac{4lh}{hl^2} D_{eff} [C_o(t + \frac{\Delta t}{2}) - C_i(t + \frac{\Delta t}{2})] \frac{1}{\frac{1}{2}} \Delta t - \beta C_i(t) \Delta t \quad (A2)$$

The above equations can be simplified to yield

$$D_{eff} = \frac{l^2}{8\Delta t} \frac{\Delta I_i(t) - \Delta I_o(t) \frac{I_i(t)}{I_o(t)}}{I_o(t + \frac{\Delta t}{2}) - I_i(t + \frac{\Delta t}{2})}$$
(A3)

In our experiment images are taken every 30 seconds setting Δ_t in eq. (3) to be 1 minute. The recorded time series, $I_o(t)$,from all experiments are plugged into the above equation to obtain a distribution of the effective diffusion coefficient D_{eff} as shown in Fig. 9D.

TABLE I: Statistics of nearest neighbor (NN) pairs

	[ATP]	$10 \ \mu M$	$20~\mu{\rm M}$	$50 \ \mu M$	100 $\mu {\rm M}$	Total
	# of cells	7,055	4,245	13,078	5,062	30,000
#	∉ of NN pairs	40,596	24,462	75,092	32,222	172,372

Appendix B: Additional information of nearest neighbor cross-correlation analysis

1. Statistics of nearest neighbor pairs

By using Delauney triangulation coupled with the manually determined cell centers (see Fig. 8 for example), we are able to determine the connectedness of the monolayer network. In particular, we focus on the communication between nearest neighbor cells to reflect proper intercellular communication which corresponds to a topological distance of D = 1 in the triangulation. The total number of nearest neighbor pairs and cells analyzed for each ATP concentration are given in table I.

2. Cross-correlation of nearest neighbor cell pairs

In order to analyze the importance of spatial correlation in information encoding within defective cell monolayers, we calculate the cross-correlation amongst nearest neighbor cell pairs as outlined in the main text. Probability distributions of cross-correlation values for two typical experiments at 20μ M and 50μ M ATP are provided in Figure 10. As we can see, the distribution of cross-correlation values for a typical experiment agrees with the results in Figure 2A of the main text. The center of these distributions shifts toward slightly higher values with increasing concentration of ATP with cancer cell pairs typically exhibiting higher cross-correlation than fibroblast pairs.

3. generating 2D map of $\bar{C}_{NN}(F_c, \rho_T)$

In order to generate the 2D continuous map of $\bar{C}_{NN}(F_c, \rho_T)$ (main text Fig. 2B) from individual experiments sampled at discrete values $\{F_{c,i}\}, \{\rho_{T,i}\}$, we first define

$$x_{i} = \frac{F_{c,i} - \operatorname{Min}[F_{c,i}]}{\operatorname{Max}[F_{c,i}] - \operatorname{Min}[F_{c,i}]}, \quad (B1)$$

$$y_i = \frac{\rho_{T,i} - \operatorname{Min}[\rho_{T,i}]}{\operatorname{Max}[\rho_{T,i}] - \operatorname{Min}[\rho_{T,i}]}$$
(B2)

We then define the Gaussian interpolated function f(x, y) as

$$f(x,y) = \frac{\sum_{i} \bar{C}_{NN,i} e^{\frac{1}{\alpha} [-(x-x_{i})^{2} - (y-y_{i})^{2}]}}{\sum_{i} e^{\frac{1}{\alpha} [-(x-x_{i})^{2} - (y-y_{i})^{2}]}} \\ \alpha = 0.01, \ 0 \le x, y \le 1$$
(B3)



FIG. 10: Distribution of $C_{NN_{i,j}}$ values for typical experiments. (A) $C_{NN_{i,j}}$ distribution for a single experiment with ATP concentration of 20μ M. Different types of cell-cell pair are labeled with different colors. (B) Similar to (A) but with ATP concentration of 50μ M.

Finally the desired 2D map is obtained from

$$C_{NN}(F_{c}, \rho_{T}) = f(\frac{F_{c} - \operatorname{Min}[F_{c,i}]}{\operatorname{Max}[F_{c,i}] - \operatorname{Min}[F_{c,i}]}, \frac{\rho_{T} - \operatorname{Min}[\rho_{T,i}]}{\operatorname{Max}[\rho_{T,i}] - \operatorname{Min}[\rho_{T,i}]})$$
(B4)

4. Evaluations of differential entropies

In order to characterize the spectrum of nearest neighbor cross-correlations and inter spike intervals of the collective calcium dynamics, we have implemented a k-nearest neighbor method to calculate the differential entropy of a set of random variables [21]. We first make benchmark tests using random variables drawn from Gaussian distributions. Since most experimental datasets contain more than 1500 elements, we compare the differential entropy calculated from 1500 Gaussian random variables with respect to the analytic results. As shown in Fig. 11A, numerical calculations agree with exact values very well. The performance of k-nearest neighbor method depends on the sample size. To evaluate the dependence, we employ k-nearest neighbor method on random variables drawn from a standard normal distribution with varying sample sizes. As shown in Fig. 11B, the relative error is around 7% for a sample size equal to 100 and quickly decays to less than 1% when the sample size is greater than 500.

In calculating the differential entropy H_{diff} using knearest neighbor method, every element in a dataset con-



FIG. 11: Evaluation of differential entropy using the k-nearest neighbor method. (A) Differential entropy H_{diff} for normal distributions of varying standard deviations σ and zero mean. For each σ , 1500 random variables are drawn and the k-nearest neighbor method is used to calculate the corresponding differential entropy. 100 realizations (redraw of the random variables) are evaluated for each σ to calculate the mean and standard deviation of H_{diff} given by the error bars. Dashed line is the analytic result. (B) Relative errors of differential entropy H_{diff} calculated with varying sample sizes. For each data set of sample size n, n random variables are drawn from a Gaussian distribution with zero mean and standard deviation equal to 1. 100 realizations are made for each sample size to calculate the relative error of H_{diff} . Relative error is defined as $\frac{\sqrt{\langle (H_i-H)^2 \rangle}}{H_o}$, where H_i is the differential entropy calculated with the k-nearest neighbor method at realization *i*, and $H_o = Ln(2\pi e)log_2 e$. (C) Histogram of H_{cnn} from bootstraping a randomly selected experimental data set. H_{cnn} of 1000 bootstrap realizations are calculated and the corresponding histogram is normalized to probability. Dashed line indicates the mean value.

tributes to the final result. In order to estimate how much H_{diff} fluctuates as a result of resampling, we would like to calculate H_{diff} from many datasets each of which contains distinct elements drawn from the same probability distribution. However, the distribution of experiment observables are unknown. In order to perform resampling, we employ a statistical bootstrap [44]. As a particular example, we took a randomly selected set of nearest neighbor cross-correlations and calculated the differential entropy of 1000 bootstrap resamplings. Fig. 11C shows the probability distribution of the results. As can be seen, the fluctuation is small and is typically less than 2%.

5. H_{cnn} of truncated collective calcium dynamics

The calcium dynamics of collective ATP sensing can be divided into two consecutive phases: the initial ATP excited responses ($0 \le t \le 75$ sec) and the subsequent calcium fluctuations (oscillations for $0 \le t \le 400$ sec, for example). We have calculated the differential entropy of nearest neighbor cross-correlations at varying network architectures as shown in the main text Fig. 2C-D. We now further compute H_{cnn} for the calcium dynamics truncated to the two temporal phases separately. Fig. 12 shows H_{cnn} at fixed ATP concentration (50 μ M) and varying architectures of the multicellular network. In Fig. 12A and Fig. 12C, H_{cnn} is calculated using the first 75 seconds of the recorded calcium dynamics. In



FIG. 12: Differential entropy of nearest neighbor crosscorrelations (H_{cnn}) of truncated collective calcium dynamics stimulated by 50 μ M ATP. (A,C) H_{cnn} calculated using the recorded calcium dynamics truncated to 0-75 seconds. (B,D) H_{cnn} calculated using the recorded calcium dynamics truncated to 75-400 seconds. A-B: H_{cnn} as function of cell density at fixed fraction of cancer cells ($15\%\pm4\%$). (C-D) H_{cnn} as function of cancer cell fraction at fixed cell density (1200 ± 200 cells/mm²). Error bars of H_{cnn} are standard deviations of 1000 bootstrap iterations. Dashed lines in A and D are linear fittings as a guide to the eyes.

Fig. 12B and Fig. 12D, H_{cnn} is calculated using the 75 seconds to 400 seconds portion of the recorded calcium dynamics. Fig. 12A and Fig. 12B show H_{cnn} as function of cell density at fixed fraction of cancer cells $(15\% \pm 4\%)$. It is clear that only the first phase of calcium dynamics (initial ATP excited responses) shows a reduced entropy H_{cnn} when cell density is increased, as a result of increased cell-to-cell communication. In the second phase of calcium dynamics (subsequent calcium fluctuations), cell-to-cell variations remove the trend. Fig. 12C and Fig. 12D show H_{cnn} as function of cancer cell fraction at fixed cell density $(1200\pm200 \text{ cells/mm}^2)$. It is clear that only the second phase of calcium dynamics shows a reduced entropy H_{cnn} when cancer cell fraction is increased. A plausible explanation is that MDA-MB-231 cells are less active compared with NIH 3T3 cells in the second phase, therefore suppressing the fluctuations of cross-correlations.





FIG. 13: Intensity peak determination for single NIH 3T3 and MDA-MB-231 cell profiles. (A) Labeled peaks for a NIH 3T3 cell. Sensitivity parameter set to $\frac{1}{4}$ of the standard deviation of the time series. (B) Labeled peaks for a MDA-MB-231 cell. Sensitivity parameter set to $\frac{1}{4}$ of the standard deviation of the time series. (C) and (D) Same MDA-MB-231 intensity profile in (B) but with sensitivity parameter set to be the standard deviation and $\frac{1}{8}$ of the standard deviation of the time series respectively.

Appendix C: Additional information of Inter-Spike Interval (ISI) analysis

1. Determining the ISI's

As calcium spike trains are unsuitable for Fourier analvsis due to their varying amplitudes and irregular periods, the inter-spike interval (ISI) has been used as a suitable substitute for determining how the period of calcium oscillation affects information encoding within and amongst cells in the network. To determine the ISI's from a single cell's calcium dynamics R(t), we first smooth the time series R(t) to remove outlying data points [45] to obtain $R_s(t)$. We then find all local peaks $\{t_i\}$ in $R_s(t)$ using the following criteria: a local peak must be higher than its neighboring valleys (local minimums) in both directions by a certain value, which we refer to as the sensitivity parameter; the first and last frames are excluded as peaks or valleys. Next, we obtain ISI's $\{\delta t_i\}$ from the distances of peaks $\{\delta t_i = |t_{i+1} - t_i|\}$. Finally, to obtain the true ISI's corresponding to calcium oscillations, we only keep the $\{\delta t_i\}$ that fall between 5 seconds and 150 seconds. This final step excludes about 5% of ISI's.

Figure 13A and 13B provide two examples showing performance of the above peak finding algorithm to de-

FIG. 14: Spatial map of cell-average ISI of randomly selected experiment with (A) 20μ M ATP. (B) 50μ M ATP.

termine peak locations for a fibroblast cell calcium dynamics (A) and cancer cell calcium dynamics (B). The sensitivity parameter used for all experiments and in Figure 13A and 13B is $\frac{1}{4}$ the standard deviation of the normalized intensity σ_I as determined empirically. Figure 13C and 13D show the algorithms diminished ability to determine peaks and to detect spurious peaks when the sensitivity parameter is set to σ_I and $\frac{\sigma_I}{2}$ respectively.

2. Spatial map of ISI in multicellular network

We have shown a spatial map of ISI in Fig. 3C of the main text. To generate such a map, we first calculate the ISI's corresponding to each individual cell as shown in the above section. We then calculate the average ISI of each cell. Fig. 14 shows two more examples of the ISI spatial map. Figure 14A corresponds to a map from an experiment with a 20μ M ATP concentration and Fig. 14B corresponds to a 50μ M ATP concentration. Black regions within the maps indicate cells that did not oscillate in the given experiment and a red circle indicates the location of a cancer cell. It is apparent from the figure that cancer cells are more likely to be non-oscillatory than fibroblast cells.

3. Statistics of F_N , the fraction of non-oscillating cells

As shown in Fig. 4A-B, the fraction of non-oscillating cells F_N systematically depends on the network architectures. Fig. 15 show pairwise statistical comparison



FIG. 15: Statistical analysis of F_N with varying cancer fractions (A) and cell densities (B). For both cases, the middle two groups do not show statistically significant differences. Therefore we have treated the middle two groups as a single group and performed ANOVA analysis. Notice that the blue bars, which represent non-oscillating fibroblast cells are not analyzed for p values.

of the results. The results are obtained by ANOVA followed with Fisher's least significant difference procedure, implemented in MATLAB.

Appendix D: Theoretical model

1. Deterministic description

We model the dynamics of calcium release following Tang and Othmer [24]. Their model is deterministic and valid for a single cell. First we describe the behavior of their model. Then we generalize it to include stochastic effects. Next, we generalize it further to include cell-cell communication. Finally, we add cell-to-cell variability. This procedure allows us to systematically explore the effects of stochasticity, communication, and variability on the calcium dynamics.

ATP triggers the production of IP₃ within a cell. IP₃ binds to receptors on the endoplasmic reticulum (ER). The ER is an internal store for calcium ions. When the receptors are active, they act as channels that allow passage of calcium between the ER and the cytoplasm of the cell. Receptor activation requires binding of both IP₃ and cytoplasmic calcium, such that calcium triggers its own release. However, an excess of calcium deactivates receptors, closing the channels. These positive and negative feedbacks, respectively, lead to oscillations and other rich dynamics.

The model of Tang and Othmer is based upon the following reactions,

$$C_{s} \xrightarrow{g_{0}} C, \quad C_{s} + R_{4} \xrightarrow{\gamma_{1}} C + R_{4}, \quad C \xrightarrow{\nu f(c)} C_{s}, \quad (D1)$$

$$R_{2} \xrightarrow{k_{1}I}_{k_{-1}} R_{3}, \quad R_{3} + C \xrightarrow{\lambda_{2}}_{k_{-2}} R_{4}, \quad R_{4} + C \xrightarrow{\lambda_{3}}_{k_{-3}} R_{5}, \quad (D2)$$

Eqn. D1 contains the reactions describing calcium transport between the ER and the cytoplasm, while Eqn.

D2 contains the reactions describing the sequential (un)binding of molecules to receptors. In Eqn. D1, the first reaction describes leakage between the calcium in the ER (C_s) and calcium in the cytoplasm (C); ν is the ratio of the ER volume V_s to the cytoplasm volume V. The second reaction describes transport of calcium through the receptor channels: receptors with both IP3 and calcium bound (R_4) are active channels. The last reaction describes the pumping of calcium from the cytoplasm to the ER; f denotes the nonlinear pumping propensity. In Eqn. D2, the first reaction describes the binding of IP3 to bare receptors (R_2) , creating the complex R_3 ; I is the concentration of IP3, which is treated as a parameter in their model (we later generalize this feature, making I a dynamic variable and its production rate α the control parameter, since this is more consistent with the experimental setup). The second reaction describes the subsequent binding of cytoplasmic calcium to the complex, which activates the complex (R_4) . The last reaction describes the further binding of cytoplasmic calcium to another site on the complex, which deactivates the complex (R_5) . Only receptors in the R_4 state serve as active channels.

The deterministic model describes the dynamics of the mean numbers of molecules. The dynamics follow directly from Eqns. D1 and D2. Introducing n and n_s as the numbers of calcium molecules in the cytoplasm and ER, respectively, and m_i as the numbers of receptors in state $i \in \{2, 3, 4, 5\}$, the means (denoted with an overbar) obey

$$\frac{d\bar{n}}{dt} = g_0\bar{n}_s - \nu g_0\bar{n} - \nu \pi_1 \frac{\bar{n}^2}{\bar{n}^2 + \pi_2^2} + \gamma_1\bar{n}_s\bar{m}_4 - \nu\gamma_1\bar{n}\bar{m}_4$$

$$-\lambda_2 \bar{m}_3 \bar{n} + k_{-2} \bar{m}_4 - \lambda_3 \bar{m}_4 \bar{n} + k_{-3} \bar{m}_5, \qquad (D3)$$

$$\frac{dn_s}{dt} = -g_0\bar{n}_s + \nu g_0\bar{n} + \nu \pi_1 \frac{n^2}{\bar{n}^2 + \pi_2^2} - \gamma_1\bar{n}_s\bar{m}_4 + \nu \gamma_1\bar{n}\bar{m}_4,$$
(D4)

$$\frac{dm_2}{dt} = -k_1 I \bar{m}_2 + k_{-1} \bar{m}_3, \tag{D5}$$

$$\frac{d\bar{m}_3}{dt} = k_1 I \bar{m}_2 - k_{-1} \bar{m}_3 - \lambda_2 \bar{m}_3 \bar{n} + k_{-2} \bar{m}_4, \tag{D6}$$

$$\frac{im_4}{dt} = \lambda_2 \bar{m}_3 \bar{n} - k_{-2} \bar{m}_4 - \lambda_3 \bar{m}_4 \bar{n} + k_{-3} \bar{m}_5, \qquad (D7)$$

$$\frac{dm_5}{dt} = \lambda_3 \bar{m}_4 \bar{n} - k_{-3} \bar{m}_5. \tag{D8}$$

The pumping propensity is a Hill function with coefficient 2 and parameters π_1 and π_2 .

Two quantities are conserved in the model: the total number of calcium molecules n_0 and the total number of receptors m_0 ,

$$n_0 = n + n_s + m_4 + 2m_5, \tag{D9}$$

$$m_0 = m_2 + m_3 + m_4 + m_5.$$
 (D10)

The conservation relations reduce the number of dynamical equations from six to four. Specifically, we elimi-

1	4
-	-

Deterministic parameters	Stochastic parameters		
	$V = 200 \ \mu \mathrm{m}^3$		
	$m_0 = 200$		
$\nu = 0.185$	$\nu = 0.185$		
$c_0 = 1.56 \ \mu M$	$n_0 = (1+\nu)c_0 V = 2.2 \times 10^5$		
$g_0 = 0.025 \text{ s}^{-1}$	$g_0 = 0.025 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
$g_1 = 36 \text{ s}^{-1}$	$\gamma_1 = g_1/m_0 = 0.18 \ \mathrm{s}^{-1}$		
$p_1 = 54 \ \mu \mathrm{M \cdot s}^{-1}$	$\pi_1 = p_1 V = 6.5 \times 10^6 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
$p_2 = 0.03 \ \mu \mathrm{M}$	$\pi_2 = p_2 V = 3600$		
$k_1 = 120 \ \mu \mathrm{M}^{-1} \cdot \mathrm{s}^{-1}$	$\lambda_1 = k_1/V = 0.001 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
$k_2 = 150 \ \mu \mathrm{M}^{-1} \cdot \mathrm{s}^{-1}$	$\lambda_2 = k_2/V = 0.0013 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
$k_3 = 0.18 \ \mu \mathrm{M}^{-1} \cdot \mathrm{s}^{-1}$	$\lambda_3 = k_3/V = 1.5 \times 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$		
$k_{-1} = 96 \text{ s}^{-1}$	$k_{-1} = 96 \ \mathrm{s}^{-1}$		
$k_{-2} = 18 \text{ s}^{-1}$	$k_{-2} = 18 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
$k_{-3} = 0.018 \text{ s}^{-1}$	$k_{-3} = 0.018 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
	$\alpha \text{ (varied)}$		
	$\mu = 0.058 \text{ s}^{-1}$		
	$h = 0.025 \text{ s}^{-1}$		

TABLE II: Parameters and their values. Deterministic values are taken from Tang and Othmer [24]. Stochastic values follow from the deterministic values, given additional choices for the cytoplasmic volume V and the total number of receptors m_0 . These two parameters, as well as the additional parameters α , μ , and h, are estimated as described in the text.

nate n_s and m_4 . Furthermore, we assume that the number of calcium molecules is much larger than the number of receptors, $n_0 \gg m_0$. In this limit, introducing $c = (\bar{n} + \bar{m}_4 + 2\bar{m}_5)/V$ as the concentration of calcium in the cytoplasm (both unbound and bound to receptors) and $x_i = m_i/m_0$ as the fraction of receptors in each state, Eqns. D3-D8 become

$$\frac{dc}{dt} = (1+\nu)(g_0 + g_1 x_4)(c_0 - c) - \nu p_1 \frac{c^2}{c^2 + p_2^2}, (D11)$$

$$\frac{dx_2}{dt} = -k_1 I x_2 + k_{-1} x_3, \tag{D12}$$

$$\frac{dx_3}{dt} = k_1 I x_2 - k_{-1} x_3 - k_2 x_3 c + k_{-2} x_4, \tag{D13}$$

$$\frac{dx_5}{dt} = k_3 x_4 c - k_{-3} x_5, \tag{D14}$$

where $x_4 = 1 - x_2 - x_3 - x_5$, $g_1 \equiv \gamma_1 m_0$, $p_1 \equiv \pi_1/V$, $p_2 \equiv \pi_2/V$, $k_2 \equiv \lambda_2 V$, $k_3 \equiv \lambda_3 V$, and $c_0 = n_0/(V+V_s)$ is the average calcium concentration in both the cytoplasm and the ER. Eqns. D11-D14 reproduce Eqn. 4 in [24]. The parameter values used in [24], which we also use here, are given in Table II.

Tang and Othmer recognize that the (un)binding of calcium to the deactivating site is slow compared to the other (un)binding reactions, $k_3 \ll \{k_1, k_2\}$ and $k_{-3} \ll \{k_{-1}, k_{-2}\}$. This permits the quasi-steady-state approximations $dx_2/dt \approx 0$ and $dx_3/dt \approx 0$, which reduce Eqns. D11-D14 to two equations. In dimensionless form they

read

$$\epsilon \frac{dx}{d\tau} = \alpha_1 (1-x) + \alpha_2 (1-x) \frac{x(1-y)}{x+\beta_1 [1+\beta_0(I)]} - \frac{x^2}{x^2+\alpha_2^2},$$
 (D15)

$$\frac{dy}{d\tau} = -y + \frac{\beta_2 x^2 (1-y)}{x + \beta_1 [1 + \beta_0(I)]},$$
(D16)

where $x \equiv c/c_0, y \equiv x_5, \tau \equiv k_{-3}t, \epsilon \equiv k_{-3}c_0/\nu p_1, \alpha_1 \equiv (1+\nu)c_0g_0/\nu p_1, \alpha_2 \equiv (1+\nu)c_0g_1/\nu p_1, \alpha_3 \equiv p_2/c_0, \beta_0(I) \equiv k_{-1}/k_1I, \beta_1 \equiv k_{-2}/k_2c_0, \text{ and } \beta_2 \equiv k_{-3}/k_3c_0.$

Eqns. D15 and D16 exhibit four dynamic regimes. As shown in Fig. 16, the system can be (A) monostable, with low cytoplasmic calcium, (B) excitable, (C) oscillatory, or (D) monostable, with high cytoplasmic calcium. In the last regime (D), near the boundary, oscillations can also be supported for certain initial conditions. All four regimes are accessible by tuning the IP₃ concentration I (Fig. 16E). Transitions between regimes occur at the critical concentrations I_1^* , I_2^* , and I_3^* . Of particular interest is the transition from the excitable to the oscillatory regime (I_2^*), since these are the dynamics exhibited by cells in the experiments: transient pulsing or sustained oscillations.

2. Stochastic description

Stochastic dynamics are simulated using an adaptive tau-leaping method [31–34], which is a computationallyefficient approximation of the Gillespie algorithm [30]. The simulation accounts for the facts that molecule numbers are integer-valued and that reactions fire at random, exponentially-distributed times. The reaction propensities follow directly from Eqns. D1-D2, and have the same forms as the individual terms in Eqns. D3-D8 (without the overbars). The stochastic model parameters are related to the deterministic model parameters by the cytoplasmic volume V and the total number of receptors m_0 : see Table II. Together these factors determine the noise in the system via the molecule numbers $n_0 = (1+\nu)c_0V$ and m_0 . Since relative fluctuations decrease with molecule number, large n_0 corresponds to low noise, while small n_0 corresponds to high noise. Typical trajectories are shown in Fig. 17.

We estimate the cell volume from the experiments. An upper bound is obtained from the measurements of the cell density ρ , since the cell area cannot be larger than $1/\rho$. The maximal density $\rho = 2500 \text{ mm}^{-2}$ gives the sharpest upper bound, for an area of $400 \ \mu\text{m}^2$, or a length scale of 20 μm . Since this is an upper bound, we assume a length scale range of $10-20 \ \mu\text{m}$. For computational efficiency, we perform simulations assuming $10 \ \mu\text{m}$, and taking a monolayer width of $\sim 2 \ \mu\text{m}$, this leads to a cell volume of $V = 200 \ \mu\text{m}^3$. Absent an experimental estimate for the number of receptors m_0 , we take $m_0 = 200$.



FIG. 16: The deterministic model (Eqns. D15 and D16) exhibits four dynamic regimes: (A) monostable, with low cytoplasmic calcium, (B) excitable, (C) oscillatory, or (D) monostable, with high cytoplasmic calcium. In the last regime (D), near the boundary, oscillations can also be supported for certain initial conditions. (E) These regimes are accessible by tuning the IP₃ concentration *I*. The letters A-D in panel E correspond to the dynamics seen in panels A-D. The critical values I_1^* , I_2^* , and I_3^* separating the regimes (dashed lines) are determined by changes in the number or stability of fixed points, which follow from a standard linear stability analysis. Parameters are listed in Table II.

In the stochastic model, we no longer treat I (the concentration of IP3) as a parameter; instead, we treat the number of IP3 molecules as a stochastic variable. The control parameter is then the production rate of IP3, α , which is assumed to be proportional to the ATP concentration in the experiments. IP3 is degraded at a rate μ , meaning that the stochastic reactions simulated are Eqns. D1-D2, with the first reaction of Eqn. D2 replaced with

$$I \stackrel{\mu}{\underset{\alpha}{\longleftarrow}} \varnothing, \qquad R_2 + I \stackrel{\lambda_1}{\underset{k_{-1}}{\longleftarrow}} R_3.$$
 (D17)

The degradation rate of IP3 has been measured to be $\mu = 0.058 \text{ s}^{-1}$ [46], and we vary α in the range $\sim 10^3 - 10^4 \text{ s}^{-1}$ such that the mean IP3 level is $\alpha/\mu \sim 10^4 - 10^5$ molecules per cell, or $0.1-1 \mu \text{M}$.

3. Cell-to-cell communication

We introduce communication into the system by allowing calcium molecules to diffuse between neighboring cells, simulating communication via gap junctions in the experiments. Doing so introduces new reactions into our model:

$$C_{i,j} \stackrel{h}{\underset{h}{\leftarrow}} C_{i+1,j}, \qquad C_{i,j} \stackrel{h}{\underset{h}{\leftarrow}} C_{i,j+1}, \qquad (D18)$$

where i, j index cell lattice sites, and h is the hopping rate of calcium ions from cell to cell. We estimate h from the experimentally measured diffusion coefficient $D \sim 1$ $\mu m^2/s$ (see Fig. 1D of the main text). Since in our model, ions are hopping between cells on a two-dimensional lattice, h^{-1} corresponds to the expected time $\ell^2/4D$ to diffuse a cell-to-cell distance ℓ . Using $\ell \sim 10-20 \ \mu\text{m}$ as above, we find $h \sim 0.01-0.04 \ \text{s}^{-1}$, and therefore we use $h = 0.025 \ \text{s}^{-1}$.

Our calculations are done on a square lattice, where each lattice site is either empty or contains one cell, and therefore each cell can have up to four neighbors with which to communicate. Density is varied by changing the number of empty lattice sites. For each chosen density, we sample over individual realizations, in which cell locations are assigned randomly. Thus, the statistics encompass many possible spatial distributions of cells for each density.

4. Effects of noise and communication

Once we add noise, we can no longer distinguish the dynamic regimes (monostable, excitable, oscillatory) using the deterministic criterion, namely the number and stability of the fixed points (Fig. 16E). Instead, we define a criterion based on the trajectories themselves, similar to the procedure for the experimental trajectories. We simulate the system for a given time T, where T = 400 s as in the experiments. The criterion is then:

- If the calcium level spikes zero times in T, the dynamics are monostable (non-oscillatory),
- If the calcium level spikes one time in T, the dynamics are excitable (non-oscillatory), and



FIG. 17: Noise expands the oscillatory regime. (A) Color-coded bar graph showing the dynamical regimes as a function of *I* determined by the reduced deterministic model (Eqns. D3-D8, top), the deterministic model (Eqns. D15 and D16) for a chosen set of initial conditions (middle), and the stochastic model using the same initial conditions (bottom). (B-D) Typical dynamics (top) and scaled power spectra (bottom) for the deterministic model (red) and stochastic model (black) are shown for the *I*-values denoted by the dashed lines labeled B-D in A.

• If the calcium level spikes two or more times in T, the dynamics are oscillatory.

When analyzing trajectories to determine ISI values, excitations separated by less than t = 5 s are excluded, as are excitations separated by more than t = 200 s, just as in the experimental analysis. We validate the above criterion using a complementary approach: we also compute the power spectrum of the trajectories. For periodic trajectories, the power spectrum exhibits a peak at the oscillation frequency. As shown in Fig. 17B-D, trajectories that are periodic, and thus pass the above criterion, indeed have peaked power spectra as expected.

We find that noise broadens the boundaries between dynamical regimes. An example of this effect is shown in Fig. 18, which plots the fraction of non-oscillating cells F_N in the regime of α near the boundary between nonoscillatory (excitable) and oscillatory dynamics (this is a zoom-in of Fig. 6A of the main text). We see that even without communication (lowest ρ values), F_N transitions continuously from 1 to 0 as a function of α . In a purely deterministic system, this transition, as determined by the linear stability analysis, would be infinitely sharp.

Additionally, as shown in Fig. 17A, we find that noise shifts the boundaries between regimes (compare the bars in the middle and bottom rows). In particular, the oscillatory regime is expanded at both ends. At low values of the control parameter, noise promotes oscillations where the deterministic dynamics are excitable. At high values of the control parameter, noise promotes oscillations where the deterministic dynamics are mono-stable. Both effects have been observed in stochastic models of similar excitable systems, and are likely due to the ability of noise to cause repeated excitations and prevent damping of oscillations, respectively [36]. We focus on the former effect since, as discussed in the main text, the evidence suggests that the experimental system lies near



FIG. 18: Increased communication causes more cells to oscillate. F_N (color) is shown for the portion of the phase plane representing the transition region between non-oscillatory and oscillatory dynamical behavior. This plot is a zoom of the middle stripe of Fig. 6A in the main text. F_N is linearly interpolated from regularly spaced simulation data. As density increases, F_N decreases, showing that communication among cells increases their tendency to oscillate.

this boundary, between non-oscillatory (excitable) and oscillatory regimes.

As shown in Fig. 18, communication further shifts the boundary between the non-oscillatory and the oscillatory regime. We see that the boundary, defined by $F_N = 0.5$, has a clear density-dependence, meaning that at a fixed input α , increasing the density would decrease the fraction of non-oscillating cells. This is demonstrated in Fig. 5B in the main text (red bars), which is a cross-section of Fig. 18, and is consistent with the experimental observations (Fig. 4B in the main text). This implies that cellto-cell communication, which increases with increasing density, promotes the entry of cells into their oscillatory regimes when otherwise they would be non-oscillating.

5. Cell-to-cell variability

The stochastic model thus far discussed predicts density-dependent F_N , which is consistent with experimental results. However, this model predicts frequency encoding, but experimental measurements show no trend in ISI values as a function of ATP concentration. We thus introduce cell-to-cell variability into the model as a possible explanation for the lack of observed frequency encoding.

Variability introduced model isinto our allowing parameters for each by cell to be drawn from a distribution. All parameters $\{m_0, n_0, \nu, g_0, g_1, \pi_1, \pi_2, \lambda_1, \lambda_2, \lambda_3, k_{-1}, k_{-2}, k_{-3}, \alpha, \mu, h\}$ are allowed to vary from their baseline vallisted in Table II. Parameters are sampled ues



FIG. 19: The effect of changing the strength of variability parameter, F. Top: Histogram of mean ISI values for F =1 (no variability) and F = 2 (high variability). The highvariability case is much more consistent with the experimental histogram (Fig. 3B in the main text). Bottom: The ratio of the standard deviation to the mean of the ISI, as a function of F. The ratio saturates above $F \approx 2$. The range of values for experiments with similar density is shown at right.

from uniform distributions in log space such that $\log_{10}(x) \in [\log_{10}(\bar{x}/F), \log_{10}(\bar{x}F)]$, where \bar{x} is the mean value for the parameter x, and F is a parameter that changes the strength of variability.

Varying F changes the extent of variability in the system. Fig. 19 (top) shows mean ISI values for F = 1 (no variability) and F = 2 (high variability). The distribution of F = 1 mean ISI values is Gaussian with narrow width. The F = 2 case shows a much broader range of mean ISI values, with an increased tendency for smaller ISI values. The general shape of the F = 2 case approximates experimental ISI values (Fig. 3B in the main text) reasonably well. Here, we use mean ISI values (one per cell) rather than all distinct ISI events (multiple per cell) as in Fig. 3B in the main text because our model predicts persistent oscillations throughout the entire T = 400 s,

while experimentally, oscillations tend to occur within a small range of T.

Fig. 19 (bottom) shows the ratio of the standard deviation in mean ISI values over their mean as a function of F. As F is increased, this ratio increases until saturation occurs at $F \approx 2$. Also shown is box plot of the experimen-

- Lauffenburger, DA (2000) Cell signaling pathways as control modules: Complexity for simplicity? *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 97:5031–5033.
- [2] Lodish, H et al. (2000) Molecular Cell Biology, 4th edition (W. H. Freeman, New York, United States).
- [3] Barritt, G (1994) Communications Within Animal Cells (Oxford Science Publications, Oxford, UK).
- [4] Miller, MB, Bassler, BL (2001) Quorum sensing in bacteria. Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 55:165–199.
- [5] Gregor, T, Fujimoto, K, Masaki, N, Sawai, S (2010) The onset of collective behavior in social amoebae. *Science* 328:1021–1025.
- [6] Jones, WD, Cayirlioglu, P, Kadow, IG, Vosshall, LB (2007) Two chemosensory receptors together mediate carbon dioxide detection in drosophila. *Nature* 445:86– 90.
- [7] Smear, M, Shusterman, R, O'Connor, R, Bozza, T, Rinberg, D (2011) Perception of sniff phase in mouse olfaction. *Nature* 479:397–400.
- [8] Schneidman, E, II, MJB, Segev, R, Bialek, W (2006) Weak pairwise correlations imply strongly correlated network states in a neural population. *Nature* 440:1007– 1012.
- [9] Greschner, M et al. (2011) Correlated firing among major ganglion cell types in primate retina. J. Physiol. 589:75– 86.
- [10] Sun, B, Lembong, J, Normand, V, Rogers, M, Stone, HA (2012) The spatial-temporal dynamics of collective chemosensing. *Proc. Nat. Aca. Sci* 109:7759–7764.
- [11] Sun, B, Doclos, G, Stone, HA (2013) Network characterization of collective chemosensing. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 110:158103.
- [12] Kumar, NM, Gilula, NB (1996) The gap junction communication channel. Cell 84:381–388.
- [13] Berridge, MJ, Irvine, RF (1989) Inositol phosphates and cell signalling. *Nature* 341:197–205.
- [14] CD, CDF, Huganir, HR, Snyderc, SH (1990) Calcium flux mediated by purified inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate receptor in reconstituted lipid vesicles is allosterically regulated by adenine nucleotides. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 87:2147–2151.
- [15] Dupont, G, Combettes, L, Bird, GS, Putney, JW (2011) Calcium oscillations. Cold Spring Harb Perspect Biol. 3:a004226.
- [16] Loewenstein, WR, Kanno, Y (1966) Intercellular communication and the control of tissue growth: lack of communication between cancer cells. *Nature* 209:1248–1249.
- [17] McLachlan, E, Shao, Q, Wang, HL, Langlois, S, Laird, DW (2006) Connexins act as tumor suppressors in threedimensional mammary cell organoids by regulating differentiation and angiogenesis. *Cancer Res.* 66:9886–9894.
- [18] Zhou, JZ, Jiang, JX (2014) Gap junction and hemichannel-independent actions of connexins on cell

tal values of this ratio, which was obtained from twelve experiments with similar density. By the saturating value F = 2, the theoretical values lie within the experimental range; therefore we use the value F = 2 to obtain the results that include variability in the main text.

and tissue functions: An update. *FEBS Lett.* 588:1186–1192.

- [19] Abbaci, M, Barberi-Heyob, M, Blondel, W, Guillemin, F, Didelon, J (2008) Advantages and limitations of commonly used methods to assay the molecular permeability of gap junctional intercellular communication. *BioTechniques* 45:33–62.
- [20] Berg, HC, Purcell, EM (1977) Physics of chemoreception. Biophys J. 20:193–219.
- [21] Loftsgaarden, DO, Quesenberry, CP (1965) A nonparametric estimate of a multivariate density function. Ann. Math. Statist 36:1049–1051.
- [22] Selimkhanov, J et al. (19652014) Accurate information transmission through dynamic biochemical signaling networks. *Science* 346:1370–1373.
- [23] Barrat, A, Barthélemy, M, Vespignani, A (2008) Dynamical Processes on Complex Networks (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, England).
- [24] Tang, Y, Othmer, HG (1995) Frequency encoding in excitable systems with applications to calcium oscillations. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 92:7869–7873.
- [25] Othmer, HG, Tang, Y (1993) in Experimental and theoretical advances in biological pattern formation, eds Othmer, HG, Maini, PK, Murray, JD (Springer US).
- [26] Meyer, T, Stryer, L (1988) Molecular model for receptorstimulated calcium spiking. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 85:5051–5055.
- [27] Politi, A, Gaspers, LD, Thomas, AP, Höfer, T (2006) Models of ip3 and ca2+ oscillations: Frequency encoding and identification of underlying feedbacks. *Biophys. J.* 90:3120–3133.
- [28] Swillens, S, Dupont, G, Combettes, L, Champeil, P (1999) From calcium blips to calcium puffs: Theoretical analysis of the requirements for interchannel communication. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 96:13750–13755.
- [29] Falcke, M (2004) Reading the patterns in living cells the physics of ca2 signaling. Adv. Physics 53:255–440.
- [30] Gillespie, DT (1977) Exact stochastic simulation of coupled chemical reactions. The journal of physical chemistry 81:2340–2361.
- [31] Gillespie, DT (2001) Approximate accelerated stochastic simulation of chemically reacting systems. *The Journal* of Chemical Physics 115:1716–1733.
- [32] Rathinam, M, Petzold, LR, Cao, Y, Gillespie, DT (2003) Stiffness in stochastic chemically reacting systems: The implicit tau-leaping method. *The Journal of Chemical Physics* 119:12784–12794.
- [33] Cao, Y, Gillespie, DT, Petzold, LR (2006) Efficient step size selection for the tau-leaping simulation method. *The Journal of chemical physics* 124:044109.
- [34] Cao, Y, Gillespie, DT, Petzold, LR (2007) Adaptive explicit-implicit tau-leaping method with automatic tau

selection. The Journal of chemical physics 126:224101.

- [35] Black, AJ, McKane, AJ (2012) Stochastic formulation of ecological models and their applications. *Trends in* ecology & evolution 27:337–345.
- [36] Mugler, A et al. (submitted) Noise expands the response range of the bacillus subtilis competence circuit.
- [37] Woods, N, Cuthbertson, K, Cobbold, P (1985) Repetitive transient rises in cytoplasmic free calcium in hormone-stimulated hepatocytes. *Nature* 319:600–602.
- [38] Meyer, T, Stryer, L (1991) Calcium spiking. Annual review of biophysics and biophysical chemistry 20:153– 174.
- [39] Mora, T, Bialek, W (2011) Are biological systems poised at criticality? *Journal of Statistical Physics* 144:268–302.
- [40] Krotov, D, Dubuis, JO, Gregor, T, Bialek, W (2014) Morphogenesis at criticality. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 111:3683–3688.

- [41] Meister, M (1996) Multineuronal codes in retinal signaling. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 93:609–614.
- [42] Schnizer, MJ, Meister, M (2003) Multineuronal firing patterns in the signal from eye to brain. *Neuron* 37:499– 511.
- [43] Kellogg, RA, Tay, S (2015) Noise facilitates transcriptional control under dynamic inputs. *Cell* 160:381–392.
- [44] Mooney, CZ, Duval, RD, Duval, R (1993) Bootstrapping: A nonparametric approach to statistical inference (Sage) No. 94-95.
- [45] Garcia, D (2010) Robust smoothing of gridded data in one and higher dimensions with missing values. Computational statistics & data analysis 54:1167–1178.
- [46] Wang, S, Alousi, AA, Thompson, SH (1995) The lifetime of inositol 1, 4, 5-trisphosphate in single cells. *The Journal of general physiology* 105:149–171.