

CAPTURING A PHYLOGENETIC TREE WHEN THE NUMBER OF CHARACTER STATES VARIES WITH THE NUMBER OF LEAVES

MIKE STEEL

ABSTRACT. We show that for any two values $\alpha, \beta \in (0, 1)$ for which $\alpha + \beta > 1$ then there exists a value N so that for all $n \geq N$, and any binary phylogenetic tree T on n leaves there exists a set of at most n^α characters that capture T , and for which each character has at most n^β states. Here ‘capture’ means that T is the only phylogenetic tree that is compatible with the characters. Our short proof of this combinatorial result is based on the probabilistic method.

Suppose that k characters on n taxa captures some phylogenetic tree T (i.e. the characters are compatible with T and no other tree; thus T is a binary unrooted tree with the n taxa as its leaves). If each of the k characters has at most r states, then a simple and known inequality states that k must be at least $(n - 3)/(r - 1)$ (Proposition 4.2 of [5]). Remarkably, this lower bound was recently shown [2] to be sharp for every value of $r \geq 2$, provided that $n \geq n_r$, where n_r is some (increasing) function of r . In this note, we consider how small k can be when r is allowed to depend on n . From [1, 3] it is known that $k = 4$ holds for a certain series r_n for which $n/r_n = O(1)$, so we focus on the setting where both r_n and n/r_n tend to infinity with increasing n . We consider what happens when r_n grows as a sub-linear function of n , by constraining r_n to be less or equal to a n^α for $\alpha \in (0, 1)$, in which case the inequality $k \geq (n - 3)/(r - 1)$ implies that k must exceed n^β for $\beta = 1 - \alpha$, for n sufficiently large. The following result is independent of the result from [2] mentioned above, in the sense that neither result directly implies the other. Our short proof involves a simple application of the probabilistic method, the Chernoff bound, and a property of the random cluster model on trees established in [4].

Theorem 1. *For any two values $\alpha, \beta \in (0, 1)$ for which $\alpha + \beta > 1$ there exists a value N so that for all $n \geq N$, and any unrooted binary phylogenetic tree T on n leaves there exists a set of at most $\lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ characters that capture T , and for which each character has at most $r_n = \lfloor n^\beta \rfloor$ states.*

Proof. Let X denote the leaf set of T . Consider the random cluster model on T in which each edge of T is independently cut with probability $p_n = r_n/4n$, or left intact with probability $1 - p_n$. This leads to a partition of X corresponding to the equivalence relation that two leaves are related if and only if they lie in the same connected component of the resulting graph. We will regard such a partition as equivalent to a character (with the number of ‘states’ of the character being the number of blocks of the partition). Notice that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} p_n = 0$. Let Y denote the random number of edges of T that are cut. Then Y has a binomial distribution $Y \sim \text{Bin}(2n - 3, p_n)$, which has mean $\mu_n = (2n - 3)p_n = (\frac{1}{2} - o(1))n^\beta$. By a multiplicative form of the ‘Chernoff bound’ in probability theory, $\mathbb{P}(Y \geq 2\mu_n) \leq \exp(-4\mu_n/3)$ and since $r_n > 2\mu_n$ we obtain:

$$(1) \quad \mathbb{P}(Y \geq r_n) \leq \exp(-4\mu_n/3).$$

The number of blocks of the partition of X induced by randomly cutting edges of T in this way is at most $Y + 1$. Thus, the probability that a character, generated by the random cluster model with p_n value as specified, has strictly more than r_n states is at most $\mathbb{P}(Y + 1 > r_n) = \mathbb{P}(Y \geq r_n) \leq \exp(-4\mu_n/3)$, by (1). Thus if we generate a set S_n of $\lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ such characters the probability that at least one of these characters has more than r_n states is, by Boole’s inequality,

at most

$$n^\alpha \exp(-4\mu_n/3) = n^\alpha \exp\left(-\frac{4}{3}\left(\frac{1}{2} - o(1)\right)n^\beta\right) \rightarrow 0$$

as $n \rightarrow \infty$ (recall $\beta > 0$). Thus, there exists some value N_1 for which, for any $n \geq N_1$, with probability at most $1/3$, at least one character in S_n has more than r_n states.

Now, suppose that k i.i.d. characters are generated under the random cluster model on T with p_n as specified above. Then, from Lemma 2.2 and Theorem 2.4 of [4], this set of characters captures T with probability at least $1 - \epsilon$ provided that $k = \lceil \frac{1}{B} \log(n^2/\epsilon) \rceil$, where $B = p_n(2 - \frac{1}{1-p_n})^4 \sim p_n$. Now,

$$\frac{1}{B} \sim \frac{1}{p_n} = \frac{4n}{r_n} \sim \frac{4n}{n^\beta} = 4n^{1-\beta},$$

and since $\alpha + \beta > 1$ it follows that for any $\epsilon > 0$:

$$\frac{1}{B} \log(n^2/\epsilon)/n^\alpha \sim 4n^{1-\beta} \log(n^2/\epsilon)/n^\alpha \rightarrow 0 \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty.$$

Consequently, taking $\epsilon = 1/3$, there is a value N_2 for which, for any $n \geq N_2$, we have $\lceil \frac{1}{B} \log(n^2/\epsilon) \rceil \leq \lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ for all $n \geq N_2$. Thus, if $k = \lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ where $n \geq N_2$, the i.i.d. characters generated under the above process fails to capture T with probability at most $1/3$.

Combining these two observations, if we set $N = \max\{N_1, N_2\}$ then for all $n \geq N$, a set S_n of $\lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ randomly-generated characters fails to satisfy one or other (or both) of the following properties:

- (i) S_n has no character with more than r_n states, and
- (ii) S_n captures T ,

with probability at most $1/3 + 1/3 = 2/3$, by Boole's inequality. Thus there is a strictly positive probability that S_n will satisfy both of (i) and (ii), and so there must exist a set of at most $\lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ characters, each having at most $\lfloor n^\beta \rfloor$ states, which captures T . This completes the proof. \square

Remark: Notice from the proof, that the condition $\alpha + \beta > 1$ can be replaced by $\alpha + \beta = 1$ if we allow $\lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor$ characters to be replaced by $\lfloor n^\alpha \rfloor(8 + c) \log(n)$, for any $c > 0$. However, Theorem 1 fails when $\alpha + \beta = 1$ without this adjustment to the number of characters, since $(n - 3)/(r_n - 1) > n^\alpha$ for all sufficiently large n , when $r_n = \lfloor n^\beta \rfloor$, and $\alpha + \beta = 1$, and yet at least $(n - 3)/(r_n - 1)$ characters are required to capture T by Proposition 4.2 of [5].

REFERENCES

- [1] Bordewich, M., Semple, C. and Steel, M. (2006). Identifying X -trees with few characters. *Electronic Journal of Combinatorics* 13 #R83.
- [2] Bordewich, M. and Semple, C. (2015). Defining a phylogenetic tree with the minimum number of r -state characters. *SIAM J. Discr. Math.* (in press).
- [3] Huber, K., Moulton, V. and Steel, M. (2005). Four characters suffice to convexly define a phylogenetic tree. *SIAM Journal on Discrete Mathematics* 18(4): 835–843.
- [4] Mossel, E. and Steel, M. (2004). A phase transition for a random cluster model on phylogenetic trees. *Mathematical Biosciences* 187: 189–203.
- [5] Semple, C. and Steel, M. (2002). Tree reconstruction from multi-state characters, *Adv. Appl. Math.* 28(2): 169–184

BIOMATHEMATICS RESEARCH CENTRE, UNIVERSITY OF CANTERBURY, CHRISTCHURCH, NZ
E-mail address: mike.steel@canterbury.ac.nz