# A Complete Lattice Technicolor Model

Simon Catterall and Aarti Veernala,

Department of Physics, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY 13244, USA

Abstract: We construct a lattice gauge theory using reduced staggered fermions and gauge fields which provides a non-perturbative realization of a complete technicolor model; one which treats both strong and weakly coupled gauge sectors on an equal footing. We show that the model is capable of developing a Higgs phase at non zero lattice spacing via the formation of fermion condensates. We further show that while the broken symmetry associated with this phase has a vector character in the lattice theory it is realized as an axial symmetry in the continuum limit in agreement with the Vafa Witten theorem. We discuss our result in the context of universality

Keywords: [Lattice gauge theory, chiral gauge theories, spontaneous symmetry breaking.](http://jhep.sissa.it/stdsearch)

# Contents



#### 1. Introduction

The idea that the Higgs mechanism can occur through the formation of fermionic condensates is an attractive one when constructing many theories of Beyond Standard Model (BSM) physics and finds application in technicolor, composite Higgs models, tumbling and grand unification schemes [[1](#page-12-0), [2](#page-12-0), [3](#page-13-0), [4\]](#page-13-0). Lattice realizations of these scenarios thus potentially give a rigorous setting for understanding how non-perturbative dynamics in models without elementary scalars can spontaneously break gauge symmetries and potentially can give us new tools to analyze such theories.

In a lattice theory Elitzur's theorem [\[5\]](#page-13-0) guarantees that any condensate which is not invariant under the gauge symmetry must necessarily have vanishing expectation value. Instead, the gauge invariant way to understand spontaneous gauge symmetry breaking and the operation of the Higgs mechanism in such theories is that it proceeds via the condensation of a *gauge invariant* four fermion operator of the form  $\phi^{\dagger} \phi$  where  $\phi$  is a fermion bilinear which carries a non-trivial representation of the gauge group. One can think of this bilinear as a composite Higgs field.

In this paper we construct a lattice realization of these ideas using a set of two massless staggered lattice fermions. Each of these fields can be *reduced* by simply restricting one field to even parity sites and the other to sites of odd parity. The key observation is that in the absence of single site mass terms the kinetic terms for each of these reduced staggered fermions may be gauged independently. We will use this observation to construct a class of lattice technicolor theories in which the gauge forces factorize into strong and weakly interacting sectors with both reduced fields coupling identically to the strong interaction but differing in their weak interactions [[6\]](#page-13-0). In the limit in which the weak gauge couplings are set to zero the strong interactions generate the usual single site condensate characteristic

<span id="page-2-0"></span>of staggered fermions. This condensate, which couples the two reduced fields, is a strong interaction singlet but will spontaneously break a subgroup of the weak symmetries. Furthermore, we show that while the broken symmetries have a vector character at non-zero lattice spacing, they are to be interpreted as axial symmetries in the continuum limit. This result is then compatible with the Vafa Witten theorem which forbids the spontaneous breaking of vector symmetries [\[7\]](#page-13-0). This is a necessary (but not sufficient) condition for this phase to survive the continuum limit.

Once the weak symmetries are gauged these bilinear condensates must remain zero in accord with Elizur's theorem but instead, a non-trivial four fermion condensate is formed. The appearance of this condensate signals that the system has entered a Higgs phase in which the would be Goldstone bosons corresponding to the broken weak symmetries disappear from the spectrum together with a discontinuous change in the free energy of a weakly charged static source.

We first describe the details of the construction and then present results showing the spontaneous breaking of the weak symmetries in the case where the weak gauge coupling is set to zero. We then describe the arguments that are needed to show that the broken symmetries are to be interpreted as axial symmetries in the continuum limit. Finally, we then switch on the weak gauge coupling and show evidence that this breaking pattern persists and that a Higgs phase forms. We end with a discussion of possible continuum limits in the model.

#### 2. Lattice model

We start with two staggered fields  $\chi$  and  $\xi$ . After restricting them to odd/even sites, we can define new fields  $\psi$  and  $\lambda$  as :

$$
\overline{\psi}_{+}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (1 + \epsilon(x)) \overline{\chi}(x), \qquad \overline{\lambda}_{-}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (1 - \epsilon(x)) \overline{\xi}(x)
$$

$$
\lambda_{+}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (1 + \epsilon(x)) \xi(x), \qquad \psi_{-}(x) = \frac{1}{2} (1 - \epsilon(x)) \chi(x) \tag{2.1}
$$

where the parity of a lattice site is given by  $\epsilon(x) = (-1)^{\sum_{\mu=1}^{4} x_{\mu}}$ . The fields  $\psi$  and  $\lambda$ are termed reduced staggered fermions since each contains half the number of degrees of freedom of the usual staggered fermion and corresponds to two rather than four Dirac fermions in the continuum limit  $[8, 9]$  $[8, 9]$  $[8, 9]$  $[8, 9]$  $[8, 9]$ . The resultant lattice action can then be written as,

$$
S = \sum_{x,\mu} \eta_{\mu}(x)\overline{\psi}_{+}(x)\left(\psi_{-}(x+\mu) - \psi_{-}(x-\mu)\right) + \sum_{x,\mu} \eta_{\mu}(x)\overline{\lambda}_{-}(x)\left(\lambda_{+}(x+\mu) - \lambda_{+}(x-\mu)\right)
$$
\n(2.2)

where the phase  $\eta_{\mu}(x)$  is the usual staggered quark phase given by

$$
\eta_{\mu}(x) = (-1)^{\sum_{i=1}^{\mu-1} x_i}.
$$
\n(2.3)

Since the fields  $\lambda$  and  $\psi$  in the action are uncoupled we can take them to transform in different representations of one or more internal symmetry groups. In this paper we

will assume a gauge symmetry of the form  $SU(N) \times SU(M) \times SU(M)$  with the reduced staggered fields  $\psi$  and  $\lambda$  transforming in the  $(\square, \square, 1)$  and  $(\square, 1, \square)$  representations (a similar construction was used in an earlier work by Banks et. al. [[10\]](#page-13-0)). We will take the  $SU(N)$  gauge coupling to be large while the two  $SU(M)$ 's are assumed weakly coupled and act on the fields in the following way:

$$
\overline{\psi}_{+} \to \overline{\psi}_{+} G^{\dagger}, \qquad \psi_{-} \to G \psi_{-}, \qquad \overline{\lambda}_{-} \to \overline{\lambda}_{-} H^{\dagger}, \qquad \lambda_{+} \to H \lambda_{+} \tag{2.4}
$$

where  $G$  and  $H$  denote the corresponding weak symmetry transformations and we have suppressed the variation of the fields under the strong symmetries. Notice that it is impossible to write down a single site mass term that preserves all the weak symmetries. The usual staggered mass term

$$
\overline{\psi}_{+}(x)\lambda_{+}(x) + \overline{\lambda}_{-}(x)\psi_{-}(x) \tag{2.5}
$$

is not invariant but instead transforms as a bifundamental under the weak groups. In the absence of such a mass term all the gauge symmetries can be made local by inserting appropriate gauge links between the  $\psi$  and  $\lambda$  fields on neighboring sites. The gauging of the lattice kinetic term is given explicitly as

$$
S_K = \sum_{x,\mu} \overline{\psi}_+(x) \left( U_\mu(x) V_\mu(x) \psi_-(x+\mu) - U_\mu^\dagger(x-\mu) V_\mu^\dagger(x-\mu) \psi_-(x-\mu) \right)
$$

$$
\sum_{x,\mu} \overline{\lambda}_-(x) \left( W_\mu(x) V_\mu(x) \lambda_+(x+\mu) - W_\mu^\dagger(x-\mu) V_\mu^\dagger(x-\mu) \lambda_+(x-\mu) \right), \tag{2.6}
$$

where  $V_\mu(x)$  is the lattice gauge field for the strong interactions and  $U_\mu(x)$  and  $W_\mu(x)$ correspond to the weak gauge groups.

While there are no single site fermion bilinears that are gauge invariant it is nonetheless possible to write down a gauge invariant lattice four fermion term:

$$
\sum_{\mu} \phi_{+}^{\dagger}(x) U_{\mu}(x) W_{\mu}^{*}(x) \phi_{-}(x), \tag{2.7}
$$

where the composite Higgs field  $\phi(x)$  (a strong interaction singlet) is given by

$$
\phi_+^{\dagger}(x) = \overline{\psi}_+(x)\lambda_+(x), \qquad \phi_-(x) = \overline{\lambda}_-(x)\psi_-(x) \tag{2.8}
$$

If a condensate of  $\phi^{\dagger} \phi$  develops it will signal the appearance of a lattice phase in which a subset of the weak interactions are Higgsed. This subset can be determined in the limit where the weak coupling is set to zero; in this case one expects the strong interaction to break the weak symmetries down to their diagonal subgroup

$$
SU_D(M) = \text{diag}\left(SU(M) \times SU(M)\right) \tag{2.9}
$$

The Higgsed gauge fields will thus correspond to the broken generators

$$
\tau_a = \tau_a^1 - \tau_a^2 \tag{2.10}
$$

with  $\tau^1$  and  $\tau^2$  the generators of the two weak groups respectively.

<span id="page-4-0"></span>In order to see such a Higgs phase, we need to add a small perturbation to the above action via an auxiliary field  $\phi$ .

$$
\delta S = g \sum_{x} \left( \phi(x) \overline{\psi}_{+}(x) \lambda_{+}(x) + \phi^{\dagger}(x) \overline{\lambda}_{-}(x) \psi_{-}(x) \right) \tag{2.11}
$$

This field  $\phi(x)$  is a local field which is needed to couple the two reduced fermions together and must transform under the gauge symmetry as a bifundamental in the weak groups in order that the perturbation is gauge invariant. To render the path integral well defined after integration over  $\phi(x)$  one must then also add a suitable action for  $\phi(x)$ . We choose an additional simple term  $\sum_x \phi^{\dagger}(x)\phi(x)$ . The effect of these Yukawa terms is to add a small gauge invariant four fermion interaction to the action that favors the conjectured symmetry breaking pattern. Spontaneous breaking of the global weak symmetries occurs iff the fermion bilinear takes a vacuum expectation value in the thermodynamic limit as the auxiliary coupling is sent to zero.

Finally to build the entire model requires the addition of Wilson plaquette terms for the three independent lattice gauge fields. In the rest of the paper will consider the case where the weak symmetry groups are  $SU(2)$  while the strong symmetry corresponds to  $SU(3)$ .

### 3. Strong dynamics and chiral symmetry breaking

Let us first examine the case where the weak gauge coupling is set to zero and the weak symmetry is purely global. Such a scenario can be realized by freezing the auxiliary scalar  $\phi$  and the gauge fields  $U_{\mu}$  and  $W_{\mu}$  to  $\phi$  to the unit matrix. The auxiliary Yukawa term described above now acts as an explicit source term for the fermion bilinear

$$
\Sigma_S = (\overline{\psi}_+(x)\lambda_-(x) + \overline{\lambda}_-(x)\psi_-(x))
$$
\n(3.1)

We will be interested in monitoring the corresponding single site condensate since a nonzero vacuum expectation value for this observable in the limit  $q \to 0$  would indicate a spontaneous breaking of  $SU(2) \times SU(2)$  down to its diagonal  $SU(2)$  subgroup. However, this is not the only fermion bilinear one can add to the action; it is also possible to construct a single link operator  $\Sigma_L$  which is given on even parity sites by the expression<sup>1</sup>

$$
\Sigma_L = \frac{1}{8} \sum_{\mu} \left( \overline{\psi}_+(x) V_{\mu}(x) \lambda(x+\mu) + V^{\dagger}(x-\mu) \lambda(x-\mu) \right) \tag{3.2}
$$

A vacuum expectation value for this quantity does not break the weak symmetries. To examine which condensate is preferred and hence whether the weak symmetries are broken we have also added an explicit source term for this single link bilinear to the lattice action with the *same* coupling g as the single site operator.

 $1$ Our action also contains the corresponding odd site bilinear which is given by a similar expression. We observe that the vacuum expectation of the odd site operator matches its even site companion as one would expect



**Figure 1:** Scan of observables with  $\beta_S$  with  $g = 0.1$  and  $L = 4$ 

To reveal the phase structure of the model we first perform a scan in the strong coupling  $\beta_{\mathcal{S}}$ . In fig. 1 we show the average plaquette, Polyakov line, string tension, single site and single link condensates versus  $\beta_S$  for fixed auxiliary coupling  $q = 0.1$  (which can be now interpreted as a mass parameter m). A single lattice volume  $V = 4<sup>4</sup>$  is shown. All the data are consistent with a transition or crossover region around  $\beta_S = 5.4$  which separates the confining and chirally broken phase expected of this  $SU(3)$  gauge theory from a deconfined regime encountered for sufficiently large  $\beta_S$  on a finite lattice volume. Furthermore, the single site condensate clearly dominates over the single link condensate. Indeed, in fig. [2](#page-6-0) we show a magnified plot of the single link condensate; not only is  $\Sigma_S/\Sigma_L > 50$  but  $\Sigma_L$ is suppressed as the system enters the chirally broken regime in contrast to  $\Sigma_S$  which is enhanced. This should not be surprising; it is precisely the single site condensate that is used as an order parameter for chiral symmetry breaking in simulations of lattice QCD using staggered fermions.

To verify that this is truly a spontaneous breaking of  $SU(2) \times SU(2)$  we have also performed a scan of the condensates at fixed  $\beta_S = 5.3$  varying the auxiliary coupling  $g \equiv m$ . The data shown in fig. [3](#page-7-0) shows that the single site condensate dominates at all g with  $\Sigma_S$  approaching a constant as g is decreased before finally turning over to rapidly approach zero for  $q = 0$ . Notice that this plateau region extends to smaller q as the volume increases consistent with a non-zero value of the condensate in the thermodynamic limit even for vanishing source  $q = 0$ . The results thus strongly support the idea that the global

<span id="page-6-0"></span>

Figure 2:  $\Sigma_L$  vs  $\beta_S$  with  $g = 0.1$  and  $L = 4$ 

 $SU(2) \times SU(2)$  symmetry is indeed spontaneously broken to its diagonal subgroup in the large volume continuum limit for non zero lattice spacing.

At first sight this is puzzling; the weak symmetries have a vector-like character in the lattice theory while the Vafa-Witten theorem would appear to prohibit the spontaneous breaking of such vector-like symmetries. In the next section we will show how to resolve this apparent contradiction.

## 4. Axial symmetries in the continuum limit

Since each reduced staggered field contributes 2 Dirac fermions in the continuum limit the theory will contain eight Dirac fields with global symmetry  $SU_V(8) \times SU_A(8)$ . As a result of strong interactions we expect that this symmetry will break according to the pattern

$$
SU_V(8) \times SU_A(8) \to SU_V(8). \tag{4.1}
$$

The  $SU(2) \times SU(2)$  weak symmetries of the staggered lattice theory constitute a subgroup of this continuum global symmetry. The precise embedding of these weak symmetries in the continuum limit can be obtained by the following argument. We start by assuming that each staggered field yields 2 Dirac fermions in the continuum eg.  $\psi_1 \to {\Psi_1^1, \Psi_1^2}$  with the upper indices reflecting this extra factor of two. We can then arrange these continuum fields into an eight component vector

$$
\left(\Psi_1^1 \Lambda_1^1 \Psi_2^1 \Lambda_2^1 \Psi_1^2 \Lambda_1^2 \Psi_2^2 \Lambda_2^2\right) \tag{4.2}
$$

<span id="page-7-0"></span>

**Figure 3:** Condensates vs m for  $L = 4$  and  $L = 6$ 

In this representation the *broken* generators  $\tau_a = \tau_a^1 - \tau_a^2$ ,  $a = 1 \dots 3$  take the explicit form

$$
\tau_1 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & \sigma_3 \\ \sigma_3 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2 \qquad \tau_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & i\sigma_3 \\ -i\sigma_3 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2 \qquad \tau_3 = \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_3 & 0 \\ 0 & -\sigma_3 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2 \qquad (4.3)
$$

where the two dimensional unit matrix  $I_2$  represents this extra factor of two degeneracy associated to the upper indices of  $\Psi$ ,  $\Lambda$ . We will neglect the  $I_2$  factor in what follows since it enters trivially in our analysis. On the lattice the usual single site fermion condensate takes the form

$$
\sum_{a=1}^{2} \overline{\psi}^a_+ \lambda^a_+ + \overline{\lambda}^a_- \psi^a_- \tag{4.4}
$$

corresponding to two independent staggered fermion condensates. This clearly breaks the lattice  $SU(2) \times SU(2)$  symmetry down to its diagonal subgroup. We then expect that this breaking pattern corresponds to a continuum condensate of the form

$$
\Sigma = \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_1 & 0 \\ 0 & \sigma_1 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2 \tag{4.5}
$$

Standard universailty arguments tell us that it should be possible to change basis for our fermion fields to force this condensate to take the canonical flavor symmetric form  $\Sigma = I_8$ . To accomplish this first diagonalize  $M \to P^{\dagger}MP$  using the unitary transformation

$$
P = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\sigma_3 + \sigma_1) & 0\\ 0 & \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\sigma_3 + \sigma_1) \end{pmatrix}
$$
 (4.6)

<span id="page-8-0"></span>This results in a condensate of the form

$$
\Sigma' = \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_3 & 0 \\ 0 & \sigma_3 \end{pmatrix} \tag{4.7}
$$

To transform this to the unit matrix we employ the non-anomalous chiral transformation  $M' \to QM'Q$  with

$$
Q = \begin{pmatrix} D & 0 \\ 0 & D^{\dagger} \end{pmatrix} \tag{4.8}
$$

where the  $2 \times 2$  matrix

$$
D = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & i\gamma_5 \end{pmatrix} \tag{4.9}
$$

To find the explicit form of the broken generators in this new basis we transform them according to the rule  $Q^{\dagger}P^{\dagger} \tau_a PQ$ . It is straightforward to show that the broken generators acquire an *axial* character in the new basis (we have reinserted the  $I_2$  at this point)

$$
\tau_1' = \gamma_5 \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -i\sigma_1 \\ i\sigma_1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2 \qquad \tau_2' = \gamma_5 \begin{pmatrix} 0 & \sigma_1 \\ \sigma_1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2 \qquad \tau_3' = \gamma_5 \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_2 & 0 \\ 0 & -\sigma_2 \end{pmatrix} \times I_2
$$
\n(4.10)

This confirms our earlier arguments that the broken generators do indeed correspond to axial symmetries in the continuum limit. We see that the staggered fermion action we use picks out a particular breaking direction corresponding to a specific embedding of the weak symmetries into the global symmetry group. The fact that the broken symmetries are axial in the continuum limit is a necessary condition, according to the Vafa-Witten theorem, for this broken phase of the lattice theory to survive the continuum  $\text{limit}^2$ .

One should contrast this with the situation in the continuum where the canonical chiral symmetry breaking pattern given in eqn. [4.1](#page-6-0) gives rise to an infinite number of degenerate vacua related by an  $SU(8)$  transformation. Depending on the vacuum that is picked any given  $SU(2)$  subgroup may be broken or left intact by the corresponding vacuum condensate.

# 5. Weakly gauging the  $SU(2) \times SU(2)$  symmetries

We now examine the situation when the weak gauge coupling is switched on  $\beta_W = 10.0$ . As a first step, we analyzed the behavior of the gauge invariant four fermion term given by

$$
\sum_{\mu} g < \overline{\psi}_{+}(x)\lambda_{+}(x) > U_{\mu}(x)W_{\mu}^{*}(x) < \overline{\lambda}_{-}(x+\mu)\psi_{-}(x+\mu) > . \tag{5.1}
$$

This four fermion condensate, while strictly not an order parameter, is expected to be enhanced in the Higgs phase and this is indeed what we see in fig. [4.](#page-9-0) Clearly for  $\beta_S > 6.0$ the condensate is small and approaches zero while for  $\beta_S < 6.0$  it grows and approaches a plateau within errors (we fix the weak coupling  $\beta_W = 10.0$  throughout the numerical

<span id="page-9-0"></span>

**Figure 4:** Absolute value of the four fermion condensate vs  $\beta_S$  for auxiliary Yukawa coupling g  $= 0.1$ 

work). Notice that the plot in fig. 4 was constructed with an auxiliary coupling  $q = 0.1$ . It is also very important to see how the condensate behaves for fixed strong coupling  $\beta_S$ as we vary g. Fig. [5](#page-10-0) shows a plot at  $\beta_S = 5.5$  as we scan in g. Clearly the value of the condensate is insensitive to the auxiliary coupling until  $q$  becomes very small. We conclude that the magnitude of the four fermion condensate is determined primarily by the value of the strong coupling constant as expected. Further evidence that the lattice is indeed in a Higgs phase can be derived by plotting the appropriate weak Polyakov line that would correspond to the free energy of a static source transforming as a bi-fundamental under the weak symmetries. Explicitly we consider

$$
P_W(x) = \frac{1}{4} \text{Tr} \prod_t U_t(x, t) \text{Tr} \prod_t W_t^*(x, t) \tag{5.2}
$$

This is shown in fig. [6](#page-11-0) as a function of the strong coupling constant (again we fix the auxiliary Yukawa coupling  $g = 0.1$  and this time fix  $\beta_W = 20.0$ ). The plot also shows for reference the usual Polyakov line corresponding to the strongly coupled  $SU(3)$  gauge field. The behavior of the latter corresponds to what is expected for a system with a confining, chirally broken phase for small  $\beta_S$  and a deconfined phase at large  $\beta_S$ . The weak Polyakov line is more interesting; for large  $\beta_S$  it is approximately constant and relatively

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>The reduced staggered theory has a sign problem for non zero lattice spacing. This allows a condensate that breaks vector symmetries to exist away from the continuum limit

<span id="page-10-0"></span>

**Figure 5:** Absolute value of the four fermion condensate vs g with  $\beta_S = 5.5$  for the case of breaking to the diagonal subgroup

large consistent with a deconfined phase as would be expected for such a large value of the bare inverse coupling  $\beta_W = 10.0$  on a small volume. However, precisely where the latter shows evidence for confinement the weak line changes dramatically falling swiftly to smaller values. We can interpret this as a change in the free energy of an isolated fermion charged under the weak gauge groups once the latter symmetries are HIggsed by virtue of the four fermion condensate.

# 6. Discussion

In this paper we have shown how a model based on reduced staggered fermions can be constructed that spontaneously breaks an exact global  $SU(2)$  symmetry as a result of strong dynamics. Remarkably, while the  $SU(2)$  enters the theory as a vector symmetry acting on the staggered lattice fields, we show that it should be interpreted in the continuum limit as an axial symmetry of Dirac fermions. According to the Vafa Witten theorem this is a necessary condition for this broken phase to survive the continuum limit. Furthermore since the continuum theory is vector-like this weak  $SU(2)$  symmetry may then be gauged without generating anomalies [\[11](#page-13-0), [12](#page-13-0)] and one would expect the broken symmetry phase to reappear as a Higgs phase. In support of these theoretical arguments we see numerical evidence of an enhancement in the four fermion condensate and a dramatic change in the weak Polyakov line once the strong sector confines and breaks chiral symmetry. We stress

<span id="page-11-0"></span>

**Figure 6:** Absolute value of the strong (squares) and weak (circles) Polyakov lines vs  $\beta_S$  with  $g = 0.1$ 

that the correct gauge invariant description of the dynamical Higgs mechanism is that it proceeds via condensation of an entirely gauge invariant four fermion operator built from strong interaction singlets<sup>3</sup>.

While we have provided strong arguments and numerical evidence in favor of a Higgs phase at non-zero lattice spacing it is less clear what happens in the continuum limit. Indeed, if one assumes universality, one should be able to replace the lattice model with a continuum theory containing only Dirac fermions. In such a vector-like theory it is always possible to write down fully gauge invariant fermion bilinear terms and in principle one might have expected the vacuum of the system to break no gauge symmetries whatsoever. In the limit in which the weak coupling is sent to zero there is no contradiction between our results and this picture; in that limit the vacuum is highly degenerate corresponding to the many ways of pairing the elementary fermions into condensates. In some of these condensates the weak symmetries are broken and in some they are not but since they are all physically equivalent this is irrelevant. However, once the weak gauge coupling is non-zero this vacuum degeneracy is broken and question of which strong interaction vacuum now yields the true lowest energy state is termed the vacuum alignment problem. We thank Maarten Golterman and Yigal Shamir for pointing this out to us and for sharing their notes [\[14](#page-13-0)]. The usual folklore is that in a vector-like continuum theory the system will adopt a vacuum in which the weak gauge interactions are left unbroken [[15,](#page-13-0) [16](#page-13-0)].

<sup>3</sup> see [\[13\]](#page-13-0) for a similar conclusion in a different model

<span id="page-12-0"></span>In our lattice model the situation is less clear; the strong interaction vacuum state is already unique at non-zero lattice spacing and corresponds to a broken weak  $SU(2)$ symmetry. We expect for non zero lattice spacing that this vacuum is not disturbed for sufficiently weak  $SU(2)$  gauge coupling and hence the lattice theory should be found in a Higgs phase. Indeed, our numerical results are consistent with this picture. The question of what happens in the continuum limit is then somewhat subtle; the weak interactions presumably favor a vacuum in which  $SU(2)$  is left unbroken but this will cost an energy arising from strong interactions - the gauge invariant single link condensate costs an energy relative to the single site condensate at non-zero lattice spacing. Presumably the correct way to obtain a continuum limit is to send both  $\beta_S \to \infty$  and  $\beta_W \to \infty$  holding  $\beta_S/\beta_W = r$ with  $r = constant \ll 1$ . We know that at  $r = 0$  the symmetry is broken and it is logically possible that this survives to small  $r$ . This limit may be explored using numerical simulation. At a minimum our results suggest that the symmetric vacuum favored by universality may not be seen until simulations reach very small lattice spacings so that the lattice theory we have described may therefore serve as a good low energy effective field theory for studying dynamical gauge symmetry breaking.

The observation that lattice vector symmetries can yield broken continuum axial symmetries in the presence of a non-perturbative condensate is intriguing and deserves further study. It can be seen in a more familiar example; staggered quark formulations of QCD. The massless staggered theory possesses a  $U(1) \times U(1)$  symmetry corresponding to independent vector  $U(1)$  rotations of the two reduced fields that make up the complete staggered field. The usual single site condensate that forms will break this to the diagonal  $U(1)$ . Following the same arguments as used in section [4](#page-6-0) one can show that this broken  $U(1)$  generator acquires a factor of  $\gamma_5$  in the continuum limit where it can be interpreted as giving rise to an axial symmetry. Indeed this broken  $U(1)$  is nothing more than the usual  $U(1)<sub>A</sub>$  of staggered fermions. In this case however the lattice fermion measure is not invariant under a *local*  $U(1)$  transformation and so this symmetry *cannot* be gauged. This is consistent with the existence of the continuum axial anomaly.

Clearly it is important to study this model further on larger lattices so that the continuum limit can be monitored more carefully. We hope to report on such a study in the future.

## Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Poul Damgaard for useful conversations and the DOE for partial support under grant DE-SC0009998. The simulations were carried out using USQCD resources at Fermilab.

### References

- [1] S. Weinberg, "Implications of dynamical symmetry breaking," Phys.Rev.D, vol. 13, p. 974, 1976.
- [2] L. Suskind, "Dynamics of spontaneous symmetry breaking in the weinberg-salam theory," Phys.Rev.D, vol. 20, p. 2619, 1979.
- <span id="page-13-0"></span>[3] S. Raby, S. Dimopoulos and L. Susskind, "Tumbling Gauge Theories," Nucl. Phys. B 169, 373 (1980).
- [4] H. Georgi and S. L. Glashow, "Unity of Elementary Particle Forces", Phys. Rev. Lett 32, 438 (1974)
- [5] S. Elitzur, "Impossibility of Spontaneously Breaking Local Symmetries," Phys. Rev. D 12, 3978 (1975).
- [6] S. Catterall and A. Veernala, "Dynamical gauge symmetry breaking in strongly coupled lattice theories", arXiv: 1306.5668, Phys. Rev. D in press.
- [7] C. Vafa and E. Witten, "Parity Conservation in QCD," Phys. Rev. Lett. 53, 535 (1984).
- [8] C. V. den Doel and J. Smit, "Dynamical symmetry breaking in two flavor  $su(n)$  and  $so(n)$ lattice gauge theories," *Nuclear Physics B*, vol. 228, no. 1, pp.  $122 - 144$ , 1983.
- [9] M. F. L. Golterman and J. Smit, "Self energy and Flavor Interpretation of Staggered Fermions," Nucl. Phys. B 245, 61 (1984).
- [10] T. Banks and A. Zaks, "Chiral Analog Gauge Theories on the Lattice," Nucl. Phys. B 206, 23 (1982).
- [11] H. Nielson and Ninomiya, " No go theorem for regularizing chiral fermions", Phys. Lett. B105, 219 (1981)
- [12] L. H. Karsten and J. Smit, "Lattice Fermions: Species Doubling, Chiral Invariance, and the Triangle Anomaly," Nucl. Phys. B 183, 103 (1981).
- [13] O. Napoly, "A Lattice Model for the dynamical Higgs mechanism", Phys. Lett. B159 (1985) 353.
- [14] Maarten Golterman and Yigal Shamir, private communication.
- [15] M. E. Peskin, "The Alignment of the Vacuum in Theories of Technicolor," Nucl. Phys. B 175, 197 (1980).
- [16] T. Banks, "CONSTRAINTS ON SU(2) x U(1) BREAKING BY VACUUM MISALIGNMENT," Nucl. Phys. B 243, 125 (1984).