# MINIMAL SURFACES IN FINITE VOLUME HYPERBOLIC 3-MANIFOLDS $N$ AND IN $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}, M$ A FINITE AREA HYPERBOLIC SURFACE. 

P. COLLIN, L. HAUSWIRTH, AND H. ROSENBERG


#### Abstract

We consider properly immersed finite topology minimal surfaces $\Sigma$ in complete finite volume hyperbolic 3 -manifolds $N$, and in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, where $M$ is a complete hyperbolic surface of finite area. We prove $\Sigma$ has finite total curvature equal to $2 \pi$ times the Euler characteristic $\chi(\Sigma)$ of $\Sigma$, and we describe the geometry of the ends of $\Sigma$. .


## 1. Introduction

Let N denote a complete hyperbolic 3 -manifold of finite volume. An end $\mathcal{M}$ of $N$ is modeled on the quotient of a horoball of the hyperbolic 3 -space $\mathbb{H}^{3}$, by a $\mathbb{Z}^{2}$ parabolic subgroup of the isometry group of $\mathbb{H}^{3}$ leaving the horoball invariant. More precisely we consider the model of the half-space of $\mathbb{H}^{3}=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right\}$ with the metric $d s^{2}=\frac{d x^{2}+d y^{2}+d t^{2}}{y^{2}}$. Then an end of $N$ has a sub-end isometric to

$$
\mathcal{M}(-1)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq y_{0}>0\right\}
$$

modulo a $\mathbb{Z}^{2}$-parabolic subgroup of isometries of $\mathbb{H}^{3}$ leaving the planes $\{y=c\}$ invariant. The horosphere $y=$ constant quotient to tori $\mathbb{T}(y)$ in $\mathcal{M}(-1) ; \mathbb{T}(y)$ has constant mean curvature one. Let $c$ be a compact geodesic of $\mathbb{T}(1)$. Then $A(-1)=$ $\{(c, t) ; t \geq 1\}$ is a minimal annulus immersed in $\mathcal{M}(-1)$, which we will call a standard cusp-end in $\mathcal{M}(-1)$
A complete surface $M$ of constant curvature $K=-1$ and finite area has finite total curvature hence $M$ is conformally diffeomorphic to a compact surface punctured in a finite number of points. Each end of $M$ (called a cusp end), denoted $\mathcal{C}$, is an annular end isometric to the quotient of a horodisk $H$ in the hyperbolic plane $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ by a parabolic isometry $\psi$.
To describe the geometry of such ends we model $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ by the upper half plane

$$
\mathbb{H}^{2}=\left\{(x, y) \in \mathbb{R}^{2} ; y>0\right\}
$$

with the metric $d s^{2}=\frac{d x^{2}+d y^{2}}{y^{2}}$. Then a cusp end $\mathcal{C}$ of $M$ is isometric to $H /[\psi]$, where $H=\left\{(x, y) \in \mathbb{R}^{2} ; y \geq 1\right\}$ is a horodisk and $\psi(x, y)=(x+\tau, y)$, for some $\tau \neq 0$.

[^0]In $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, with the product metric, the ends become $\mathcal{M}:=\mathcal{C} \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, and are foliated by constant mean curvature tori $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{1}\right)=c\left(y_{1}\right) \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, where $c\left(y_{1}\right)=\left\{(x, y) \in \mathbb{H}^{2} ; y=\right.$ $\left.y_{1}\right\} /[\psi]$. We consider $\mathbb{S}^{1}=\mathbb{R} / T(h), T(h)$ the translation of $\mathbb{R}$ by some $h>0$ and

$$
\mathcal{M}=\cup_{y \geq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)=(H /[\psi]) \times(\mathbb{R} / T(h))=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq y_{0} \geq 1\right\} /[\psi, T(h)]
$$

Thus the ends of $N$ and those of $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ share many properties. Both are parametrized by the same half-space of $\mathbb{R}^{3}$, and foliated by constant mean curvature tori $\mathbb{T}(y)$ ( curvature one half in $\mathcal{M}$ and one in $\mathcal{M}(-1))$. $\mathcal{M}(-1)$ has constant sectional curvature -1 and the tori $\mathbb{T}(y)$ shrink exponentially when one flows by the geodesics y increasing. In $\mathcal{M}$, the horizontal cycles $c(y)$ shrink exponentially along the $y$ increasing flow and the $t$ cycles are of constant length $h$. Subsequently we will develop the geometry of surfaces in these ends.
Now let $\Sigma$ be a properly embedded minimal surface in $N$ or $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ of finite topology; so that $\Sigma$ has a finite number of annular ends $\left\{A_{j}\right\}$ for $1 \leq j \leq k$. Since $\Sigma$ is proper, each end $A_{j}$ of $\Sigma$ is in some end $\mathcal{M}$ of $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ or in some end $\mathcal{M}(-1)$ of $N$. We denote by $E$ a connected component of a lift of an end $A$ of $\Sigma, E$ in $\mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R}$ or $\mathbb{H}^{3}$.
We will now describe the model ends of minimal annuli in $\mathcal{M}$ and $\mathcal{M}(-1)$. In $\mathcal{M}(-1)$ the model end is the standard cusp end $A(-1)$ we previously defined.
In $\mathcal{M}$, there are essentially three model ends. In $\mathcal{M}$, we define $A_{(p, q)}$ to be the annular end that is the quotient of a (euclidean) half-plane $E_{(p, q)}$ orthogonal to the plane $\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y=1\right\}$ and of slope $q h / p \tau$. For $(p, q)=(1,0)$, the end

$$
E_{(1,0)}\left(t_{0}\right)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq 1, t=t_{0}\right\} \text { and } A_{(1,0)}=E_{(p, q)} /[\psi]
$$

is a cusp end of $M$ (horizontal). For $(p, q)=(0,1)$, it is the product of a horizontal geodesic ray of $M$ and $\mathbb{S}^{1}$. The end

$$
E_{(0,1)}\left(x_{0}\right)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq 1, x=x_{0}\right\} \text { and } A_{(0,1)}=E_{(0,1)} / T(h)
$$

For $(p, q) \neq\{(0,1),(1,0)\}$, we think of $A_{(p, q)}$ as a helicoid with axis at the cusp at infinity. It is the quotient of

$$
E_{(p, q)}\left(c_{0}\right)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq 1, p \tau t-q h x=c_{0}\right\} \text { and } A_{(p, q)}=E_{(p, q)} /[\psi, T(h)] .
$$

We will prove that a properly immersed annular end $A$ in $\mathcal{M}$ or in $\mathcal{M}(-1)$ has finite total curvature and is asymptotic to a standard end $A_{(p, q)}$ in $\mathcal{M}$ or a standard cusp end $A(-1)$ in $\mathcal{M}(-1)$. The main theorem of the paper is:

Theorem 1.1. Consider a complete surface $M$ with curvature $K=-1$ and finite area and $N$ a complete hyperbolic 3-manifold of finite volume. Let $\Sigma$ be a properly immersed minimal surfaces in $N$ or in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ with finite topology. Then the surface $\Sigma$ has finite total curvature and each end $A$ of $\Sigma$ is asymptotic to a standard cusp-end $A(-1)$ in $\mathcal{M}(-1)$ or to a standard end $A_{(p, q)}$ in $\mathcal{M}$ :
(i) $A_{(p, 0)}$ a horizontal cusp $\mathcal{C} \times\left\{t_{0}\right\}$
(ii) $A_{(0, q)}$ a vertical plane $\gamma \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$
(iii) $A_{(p, q)}$ a helicoidal end with axis at infinity.

Moreover

$$
\int_{\Sigma} K d A=2 \pi \chi(\Sigma)
$$

Corollaries of the theorem 1.1 Combining the formula for the total curvature of $\Sigma$ in theorem 1.1, with the Gauss equation, we obtain topological obstructions for the existence of proper minimal immersions of a finite topology surface $\Sigma$ into $N$ or $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, of a given topology.
For example, there is no such proper minimal immersion of a plane $\mathbb{R}^{2}$ into $N$ or $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$. In $N$ there is no proper minimal immersion of the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ with $n$ punctures; $n=0,1$, or 2 . A proper minimal immersion of $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ with two punctures (an annulus) in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, is necessarily $\gamma \times \mathbb{S}^{1}, \gamma$ a complete geodesic of $M$.
More generally, suppose $\Sigma$ is an orientable surface of genus $g$ with $n$ punctures, $n \geq 0$. Then $\chi(\Sigma)=2-2 g-n$, so if $\Sigma$ can be properly minimally immersed in $N$ or $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, it follows from theorem 1.1 and the Gauss equation

$$
\int_{\Sigma} K_{\Sigma}=2 \pi(2-2 g-n)=\int_{\Sigma} K_{e}+\int_{\Sigma} K_{\sigma}
$$

where $K_{e}$ and $K_{\sigma}$ are the extrinsic and sectional curvatures of $\Sigma$ respectively. Since $-1 \leq K_{\sigma} \leq 0$ in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}, K_{\sigma}=-1$ in $N$, and $K_{e} \leq 0$, we have

$$
2-2 g-n \leq 0
$$

and equality if and only if $K_{e}=K_{\sigma}=0$.
This equality cannot occur in $N$ (since $K_{\sigma}=-1$ ) and equality in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ yields $\Sigma$ is vertical and $g$ is 0 or 1 . When $g=0$, then $n=2$ and $\Sigma=\gamma \times \mathbb{S}^{1} \gamma$ a complete, non compact geodesic of $M$.
When $2<2 g+n$ then if $g=0$, one can not have $n \leq 2$. So excluding the equality case we discussed above, there is no proper minimal immersion of $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ with 0,1 , or 2 punctures, in $N$ or $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$.
In $N$, one obtains an area estimate. If $\Sigma$ is properly minimally immersed in $N$ then

$$
2 \pi(2-2 g-n)=\int_{\Sigma} K_{e}-|\Sigma|
$$

so $|\Sigma|=\int_{\Sigma} K_{e}+2 \pi(2 g+n-2) \leq 2 \pi(2 g+n-2)$ and equality precisely when $\Sigma$ is totally geodesic. Do such totally geodesic immersions exists in $N$ ?
We have $0<2 g+n-2$, so if $2 g+n-2 \leq 0$, the immersion $\Sigma$ does not exist in $N$. If $2 g>2-n$, can $\Sigma$ be properly minimally immersed in $N$ ?
The paper is organized as follows. We will begin considering surfaces in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$. First we describe some examples of properly embedded minimal surfaces of finite topology in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$. We start with $M$ a 3 -punctured sphere, then $M$ a sphere with $2 n$ punctures, and $M$ a once punctured torus. We hope to convey to the reader the wealth of interesting examples in these spaces.

In section 2, we describe some properties of the standard examples $A_{(p, q)}$ in the cusp ends $\mathcal{M}$ of $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$. We construct auxiliary minimal surfaces needed for the sequel.
In section 3 we begin the study of a lift $E \subset H \times \mathbb{R}$ of an annular end $A$ of $\Sigma \cap \mathcal{M}$. We prove that a subend of $A$ is trapped between two standard ends $A_{(p, q)}$ that are close at infinity; "close" will be defined later.
In section 4 , we study compact annuli that we will use in the proof of the theorem. In section 5 , we study the limit of a family of Scherk type graphs in $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ which are converging to 0 and we use this sequence to prove that the third coordinate of an end of type $(1,0)$ has a limit at infinity.
In section 6, we prove that a trapped subend of $A$ is a killing graph, hence has bounded curvature. Then in sections 7,8 , and 9 , we prove the main theorem.

## 2. Examples in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$

The first examples in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ that come to mind are the horizontal slices $\Sigma=M \times\{c\}$ and the vertical annuli (or totally geodesic tori), $\Sigma=\gamma \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, $\gamma$ a complete geodesic (perhaps compact) of $M$.
We describe five examples; $M$ will be a sphere with three or four punctures or a once punctured torus, and have a complete hyperbolic metric of finite area. Denote by $\operatorname{Sph}(k), k=3$ or 4 such a hyperbolic sphere and $\operatorname{Tor}(1)$ a once punctured hyperbolic torus.

Example 1. $\Sigma$ an embedded minimal surface in $\mathbb{S p h}(3) \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ with three ends; two helicoidal and the other horizontal. The domains and notation we now introduce will be used in all the examples we describe.
Let $\Gamma$ be the ideal triangle in the disk model of $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ with vertices $A=(0,1), B=$ $(0,-1), C=(-1,0)$ and sides $a, b, c$ as indicated in figure 1 .
Let $\Sigma$, be the minimal graph over the domain $D$ bounded by $\Gamma$, taking the values 0 on $b$ and $c$ and $h>0$ on $a$. Extend $\Sigma$, to an entire minimal graph $\tilde{\Sigma}$ over $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ by rotation by $\pi$ in all the sides of $\Gamma$, and the sides of the triangles thus obtained.
In figure 2, we indicate some of the reflected triangles and the values of the graph $\tilde{\Sigma}$ on their sides.
Let $D$ be the domain bounded by $\Gamma$. Let $\psi_{A}$ be the parabolic isometry with fixed point $A$ which takes the geodesic $c$ to $c_{1}$ and $a$ to $a_{1} ; \psi_{A}=R_{c_{1}} R_{a}$, where $R_{\gamma}$ denotes reflection in the geodesic $\gamma$. Let $\psi_{B}$ be the parabolic isometry of $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ leaving $B$ fixed, taking $b$ to $b_{1}$ and $a$ to $c_{2} ; \psi_{B}=R_{b_{1}} R_{a}$.
Notice that the group of isometries of $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$, generated by $T(2 h) \circ \psi_{A}$ and $T(2 h) \circ \psi_{B}$, leaves $\tilde{\Sigma}$ invariant.
Let $M$ be the 3 -punctured sphere obtained by identifying the sides of $D \cup R_{a}(D)$ by $\psi_{A}, \psi_{B}\left(c\right.$ with $c_{1}, b$ with $\left.b_{1}\right) . M$ is hyperbolic and has finite area.


Figure 1. Ideal triangle $(A B C)$ in $\mathbb{H}^{2}$


Figure 2. Value of the graph $\tilde{\Sigma}$ on geodesics
Let $\Sigma_{2}$ be the graph in $\tilde{\Sigma}$ over $D \cup R_{a}(D)$. Then the multi-graph $\cup_{k \in \mathbb{Z}} \mathbb{T}_{k 2 h}\left(\Sigma_{2}\right)$ passes to the quotient $M \times(\mathbb{R} / T(2 h))$ to give a complete embedded minimal surface $\Sigma$ with 3 -ends; two helicoidal and the other horizontal. $\Sigma$ is a 3 -punctured sphere, has total curvature $-2 \pi$ and $\Sigma$ is stable ( $\Sigma$ is transverse to the killing field $\partial / \partial t$ ).


Figure 3. $M$ is a 4 -punctured sphere

Example 2. $\Sigma$ an embedded minimal surface in $\operatorname{Sph}(4) \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$, the sphere with four ends. Let $Q$ be the ideal quadrilateral $D \cup R_{a}(D)$, and define $F=Q \cup R_{c_{1}}(Q)$. Let $M$ be the quotient of $F$ obtained by identifying the sides of $\partial F$ as follows:
(1) Identify $c$ with $R_{c_{1}}(c)$ by the parabolic isometry at $A$ taking $c$ to $R_{c_{1}}(c)$,
(2) Identify $b$ with $R_{c_{1}}(b)$ by the hyperbolic isometry taking $b$ to $R_{c_{1}}(b)$ and,
(3) Identify $b_{1}$ with $R_{c_{1}}\left(b_{1}\right)$ by the parabolic isometry at $C_{1}$ taking $b_{1}$ to $R_{c_{1}}\left(b_{1}\right)$.
$M$ is a 4-punctured sphere. A more (apparently) symmetric picture of $M$ is obtained by changing the picture by the isometry taking $A$ to $A$ and $C_{1}$ to $B$ as indicated in the figure 3 .
Then the graph of $\tilde{\Sigma}$ over $F$ yields a embedded minimal surface $\Sigma$ in $(M \times \mathbb{R}) /[T(4 h)]$. $\Sigma$ has two horizontal ends and two helicoidal ends of type $E(1,1) . \Sigma$ is also stable.

Example 3. A compact singly periodic Scherk surface; M a once punctured torus. This surface is constructed in [8]; we describe it here. Let $Q=D \cup R_{a}(D)$ and $\gamma_{1}, \gamma_{2}$ be minimizing geodesics joining opposite sides of $D$; figure 4. In $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$, we desingularize the intersection of the planes $\gamma_{1} \times \mathbb{R}$ and $\gamma_{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ in the usual manner to create a Scherk surface invariant under a vertical translation. We describe this. Let $\alpha$ and $\beta$ be the segments of $\gamma_{1}, \gamma_{2}$ in the first and fourth quadrants respectively. Form a polygon in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ by joining to $(\alpha \times\{h\}) \cup(\beta \times\{0\})$ by the two vertical segments joining $\alpha(\Gamma) \times\{0\}$ to $\alpha(\Gamma) \times\{h\}$, and joining $\beta(\Gamma) \times\{0\}$ to $\beta(\Gamma) \times\{h\}$; $\alpha(\Gamma)$ denotes the endpoint of $\alpha$ on $\Gamma$ (similarly for $\beta(\Gamma)$ ). This polygon bounds a least area minimal disk $D_{1}$; figure 5


Figure 4. $M$ is a once punctured torus


Figure 5. A least area disk $D_{1}$

Successive symmetries in all the horizonntal sides yields a "Scherk" type surface in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ bounded by 4 vertical geodesics, invariant by vertical translation by $2 h$.
We now identify opposite sides of $Q$ by the hyperbolic translations $T\left(\gamma_{1}\right), T\left(\gamma_{2}\right)$, along $\gamma_{1}$ and $\gamma_{2}$. This gives a once punctured torus $M$. The Scherk surface passes to the quotient to give a compact minimal surface $\Sigma$ with $\partial \Sigma=\emptyset$, in $M \times(\mathbb{R} / T(2 h))$.

Example 4. A singly periodic Scherk surface with 4 vertical annular ends; $M$ a once punctured torus. Now we "rotate" example 4 by $\pi / 4$. Let $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}$ be the complete geodesics joining the opposite vertices of $\partial Q ; \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}$ are the $x$ and the $y$ axis in the


Figure 6. A piece of singly periodic Scherk surface with 4 vertical annular ends
unit disc model. Again we construct Plateau disks bounded by the polygon of figure 6.

We know that when the vertical geodesic segments diverge along $\beta$, the plateau solutions converge to a complete embedded surface in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ with boundary $\{(x, 0) / x \geq$ $0\} \cup\{(y, 0) / y \geq 0\} \cup\{(x, h) / x \geq 0\} \cup\{(y, h) / y \geq 0\}$.
The symmetries of this surface along all the edges yields a singly periodic Scherk surface in $Q \times \mathbb{R}$, invariant by $T(2 h)$.
As in example 4, we identify the opposite sides of $Q$ by hyperbolic translations to obtain a torus $M$ with one puncture. This gives the Scherk surface $\Sigma$ in $M \times \mathbb{R} /[T(2 h)]$, with four vertical annular ends.
We remark that one can quotient $\partial Q$ by parabolic isometries to obtain this Scherk surface in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ where $M$ is now a 4 -punctured sphere.

Example 5. A helicoid with helicoidal ends in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}, M$ a once punctured torus. It is convenient to describe this example in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ where $M$ is the once punctured torus obtained from the ideal quadrilateral $Q_{1}$ in $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ with the 4 vertices $\left( \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \pm \frac{i}{\sqrt{2}}\right)$, by identifying opposite sides.
Let $S$ be the third quadrant of $Q_{1}: S=\left\{(x, y) \in Q_{1} ; x \leq 0, y \leq 0\right\}$. For $h>0$, let $\Sigma_{1}$ be the minimal graph over $S$ with boundary values indicated in figure 7 .
Let $\Sigma_{3}$ be the reflection of $\Sigma_{1}$ through $\beta$ (cf figure 7 ); $\Sigma_{3}$ is between heights $h$ and $2 h$ and is a graph over the second quadrant of $Q_{1}$. Then rotate $\Sigma_{1} \cup \Sigma_{3}$ by $\pi$ through the vertical axis between $(0,0)$ and $(0,2 h)$, to obtain $\Sigma_{2} \cup \Sigma_{4} ; \Sigma_{4}$ is a graph over the fourth quadrant of $Q_{1}$. $\Sigma$ is the union of the four pieces $\Sigma_{1}$, through $\Sigma_{4}$, identified along the boundaries as follows.
First we consider identifying opposite sides of $Q_{1}$ be the hyperbolic translations sending the opposite side to the other. Then we can quotient by $T(2 h)$ or by $T(4 h)$. The


Figure 7. $\Sigma_{1}$ be a minimal graph over $S$
first quotient gives an non orientable surface in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ with one helicoid type end. The second gives an orientable surface of total curvature $-8 \pi$ with two helicoidal type ends (it is a double cover of the first example). Topologically the first example is the connected sum of a once punctured torus and a projective plane. The second surface is 2 punctured orientable surface of genus two.
The reader can see the helicoidal structure of $\Sigma$ by going along a horizontal geodesic on $\Sigma$ at $h=0$, from one puncture to the other. Then spiral up $\Sigma$ along a helice going to the horizontal geodesic at height $h$. Continue along this geodesic to the other (it's the same) puncture and spiral up the helices on $\Sigma$ to height $2 h$. If we do this right, we are back where we started.

## 3. BARRIERS IN $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$

We construct barriers by solving the mean curvature equation of ruled surfaces. These barriers will be used to prove the Trapping Theorem in section 4. In the model $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right\}$, we consider surfaces

$$
X:(u, v) \rightarrow(u, \alpha(v), v+\lambda u)
$$

for a $\mathcal{C}^{2}$ real positive function of one variable $v \rightarrow \alpha(v)$ defined on some interval $I$.
Lemma 3.1. The mean curvature $H$ of the surface $X:(u, v) \rightarrow(u, \alpha(v), v+\lambda u)$ immersed in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right\}$ with the metric $d s^{2}=\frac{d x^{2}+d y^{2}}{y^{2}}+d t^{2}$ is given by

$$
2 H=\frac{-\alpha^{2}}{Z^{3}}\left(\alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)+\alpha\left(1+\lambda^{2}\left(\alpha^{\prime}\right)^{2}\right)\right)
$$

Proof. In the model of $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right\}$ with the metric $d s^{2}=$ $\frac{d x^{2}+d y^{2}}{y^{2}}+d t^{2}$, the non zero terms of the connection are given by

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nabla_{\partial / \partial x} \partial / \partial x=\frac{1}{y} \partial / \partial y \quad \nabla_{\partial / \partial y} \partial / \partial y=-\frac{1}{y} \partial / \partial y \\
\nabla_{\partial / \partial x} \partial / \partial y=\nabla_{\partial / \partial y} \partial / \partial x=-\frac{1}{y} \partial / \partial x
\end{gathered}
$$

The tangent space is generated by

$$
\begin{aligned}
d X(\partial / \partial u) & =E_{1}=\partial / \partial x+\lambda \partial / \partial t=(1,0, \lambda) \\
d X(\partial / \partial v) & =E_{2}=\alpha^{\prime}(v) \partial / \partial y+\partial / \partial t=\left(0, \alpha^{\prime}(v), 1\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

The direct unit normal vector is given by $N=V / Z$ with $V=E_{1} \wedge E_{2}$,

$$
\begin{gathered}
V=-\lambda \alpha^{\prime}(v) \alpha(v)^{2} \partial / \partial x-\alpha(v)^{2} \partial / \partial y+\alpha^{\prime}(v) \partial / \partial t=\left(-\lambda \alpha^{\prime}(v) \alpha(v)^{2},-\alpha(v)^{2}, \alpha^{\prime}(v)\right) \\
Z^{2}=|V|^{2}=\left(\alpha^{\prime}(v)\right)^{2}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha(v)^{2}\right)+\alpha(v)^{2}
\end{gathered}
$$

We compute the mean curvature by the divergence formula

$$
-2 H=\operatorname{div}(N)=\operatorname{div}\left(\frac{V}{Z}\right)=\frac{1}{Z^{3}}\left(Z^{2} \operatorname{div}(V)-\frac{1}{2} V \cdot\left(Z^{2}\right)\right)
$$

We compute the first term

$$
\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{div}(V) & =-\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\left(\lambda \alpha^{2}(v) \alpha^{\prime}(v)\right)-\lambda \alpha^{2}(v) \alpha^{\prime}(v) \operatorname{div}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right) \\
& -\frac{\partial}{\partial y}\left(\alpha^{2}(v)\right)-\alpha^{2}(v) \operatorname{div}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial y}\right)+\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\left(\alpha^{\prime}(v)\right)+\alpha^{\prime}(v) \operatorname{div}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Using $\operatorname{div}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)=\operatorname{div}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\right)=0$ and $\operatorname{div}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial y}\right)=-\frac{2}{y}$ with $\alpha(v)=y$ and $v=t-\lambda x$, a direct computation gives

$$
\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{div}(V) & =\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2} \alpha^{\prime \prime}-2 \alpha-\alpha^{2}\left(-\frac{2}{\alpha}\right)+\alpha^{\prime \prime} \\
& =\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right) \alpha^{\prime \prime}
\end{aligned}
$$

For the second term

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial}{\partial x}\left(Z^{2}\right)=-\lambda \alpha^{\prime} \alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right) \\
& \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial}{\partial y}\left(Z^{2}\right)=\alpha\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2}\right) \\
& \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial}{\partial t}\left(Z^{2}\right)=\alpha^{\prime} \alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$



Figure 8. $S^{0}$, Surfaces foliated by horizontal horocycles

Hence $\frac{1}{2} V .\left(Z^{2}\right)=\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right) \lambda^{2} \alpha^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2} \alpha^{\prime \prime}-\alpha^{3}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2}\right)+\alpha^{\prime 2} \alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)$. Finally we obtain

$$
\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{div}(N)= & \operatorname{div}(V / Z) \\
= & \frac{1}{Z^{3}}\left[\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right) \alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(\alpha^{2}+\alpha^{\prime 2}+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2}\right)\right. \\
& \left.-\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right) \lambda^{2} \alpha^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2} \alpha^{\prime \prime}+\alpha^{3}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2}\right)+\alpha^{\prime 2} \alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)\right] \\
= & \frac{\alpha^{2}}{Z^{3}}\left[\alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)+\alpha\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2}\right)\right]=-2 H
\end{aligned}
$$

We study the geometry of surfaces $X:(u, v) \rightarrow(u, \alpha(v), v+\lambda u)$ which are minimal. We notice they are ruled surfaces foliated by curves $v \rightarrow(0, \alpha(v), v)$ where $\alpha \in \mathcal{C}^{2}(I)$, $\alpha>0, \lambda \geq 0$.
The first case solves the equation when $\lambda=0$. The solution $\alpha(v)=T \sin v$ gives the family of minimal surfaces up to vertical translation

$$
S_{T}^{0}=\left\{(u, T \sin v, v) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; u \in \mathbb{R}, v \in[0, \pi]\right\}
$$

This surface is foliated by horizontal horocycles $u \rightarrow(u, \alpha(v), v)$ and is described in Hauswirth [5], then by Toubiana and Sa Earp [7], Daniel [3] and Mazet, Rodriguez, Rosenberg [8] (see figure 8). By the nature of the curve $v \rightarrow(0, T \sin v, v)$, the surfaces $S_{T}^{0}$ foliate the slab $S=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; 0<y, 0 \leq t \leq \pi\right\}$.


Figure 9. Surfaces $S_{T}^{\lambda}$ in the disk model and half-space model of $\mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R}$

The general case $\lambda \neq 0$ depends on a function $\alpha$, a solution of the equation

$$
\alpha^{\prime \prime}\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)+\alpha\left(1+\lambda^{2}\left(\alpha^{\prime}\right)^{2}\right)=0
$$

This equation has a first integral $\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{\prime 2}\right)\left(1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}\right)=T$ for some fixed constant $T>1$. Since $\alpha^{\prime \prime}<0$ the curves $v \rightarrow(0, \alpha(v), v)$ are convex. For fixed $T>1$, the function $\alpha_{T}(v)$ has its maximum value at $\sup \alpha_{T}(v)=\lambda^{-1} \sqrt{T-1}$. The function $\alpha_{T}$ is positive on a set $\left[0, v_{0}(T)\right]$. The solution $\alpha_{T}(v)$ with initial data $\alpha_{T}(0)=0$ and $\alpha^{\prime}(0)=\lambda^{-1} \sqrt{T-1}$ defines a one-parameter family of minimal surfaces

$$
S_{T}^{\lambda}=\left\{\left(u, \alpha_{T}(v), v+\lambda u\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; u \in \mathbb{R}, v \in\left[0, v_{0}(T)\right]\right\}
$$

For large values of $T$ and fixed constant $M>0$, we look for the set of values where $0 \leq \alpha_{T}(v) \leq M$. On this set we remark that

$$
\alpha^{\prime 2}=\lambda^{-2}\left(\frac{T}{1+\lambda^{2} \alpha^{2}}-1\right) \geq \lambda^{-2}\left(\frac{T}{1+\lambda^{2} M^{2}}-1\right)
$$

which implies that $\alpha_{T}^{\prime}(v) \rightarrow \infty$ when $T \rightarrow \infty$. The part of the curve $\left(0, \alpha_{T}(v), v\right)$ contained in $0<y \leq M$ converges to the half geodesic $\left\{(0, y, 0) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; 0<y \leq M\right\}$.
We summarize this discussion in the figure 9 and we will use the following lemma:


Figure 10. An annular end in $\mathcal{M}$
Lemma 3.2. a) The family of surfaces $S_{T}^{0}$, foliates the slab $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times[0, \pi]$ and when $T$ goes to infinity the surfaces $S_{T}^{0}$ converge on compact sets to the horizontal section $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times\{0\}$.
b) The one-parameter family of surfaces $S_{T}^{\lambda}$ converges on compact sets to $\{(x, y, t) \in$ $\mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0$ and $\left.t=\lambda x\right\}$.

## 4. Trapping theorem for minimal ends

We consider a minimal surface $\Sigma$ of finite topology, hence each end of $\Sigma$ is an annular end. Since $\Sigma$ is properly immersed, each end $A_{0}$ of $\Sigma$ is contained in some end $\mathcal{M}$ of $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$.

Lemma 4.1. There is $y_{0} \geq 1$ and a sub-end $A$ of $A_{0}$ such that $\partial A \subset \mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$, $A$ is transverse to $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$ and $A \subset \cup_{y \geq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$.

Proof. Since $\Sigma$ is properly immersed each end of $\Sigma$ has a subend $A_{0}$ contained in some $\mathcal{M}=\cup_{y \geq 1} \mathbb{T}(y)$. $A_{0}$ is transverse to almost every $\mathbb{T}(y)$ so let $y_{0}>1$ be such that $\partial A_{0} \subset \cup_{1 \leq y<y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$, and $A_{0}$ is transverse to $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$. Then $A_{0} \cap \mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)=C_{1} \cup \ldots \cup C_{k}$, each $C_{j}$ an immersed Jordan curve in $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$.
$A_{0}$ is proper so $A_{0} \cap \mathbb{T}(y) \neq \emptyset$ for large $y$. Hence at least one of the $C_{j}$ is not null homotopic in $A_{0}$. Observe that there is at most one such $C_{j}$. For if $C_{i}$ and $C_{j}$ are not trivial then they bound a compact domain $F$ in $A_{0}$ disjoint from $\partial A_{0} . F$ cannot be contained in $\cup_{1 \leq y \leq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$ since then $F$ would touch some $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{1}\right), y_{1}<y_{0}$, on the mean convex side of $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{1}\right)$, a contradiction. So $F \subset \cup_{y \geq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$. But then, $\partial A_{0}$ and $C_{i}$ or $C_{j}\left(C_{i}\right.$ say $)$ would bound a compact $F_{1}$ on $A_{0}, F_{1} \cap C_{j}=\emptyset . A_{0}-F_{1}$ is an annular sub-end of $A_{0}$ with boundary $C_{i}$ contained in $\partial \mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$. Since $A_{0}-F_{1}$ intersects $\mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$ also at $C_{j}$, there is a compact domain $F_{2}$ of $A_{0}-F_{1}$ contained in $\cup_{1 \leq y \leq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$ with $\partial F_{2} \subset \mathbb{T}\left(y_{0}\right)$; a contradiction; see figure 10 .
Now it is clear that if each $C_{\ell}, \ell \neq i$ bounds a disk $D$ on $A_{0}$ that is contained in $\cup_{y \geq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$. It follows that the connected component of $A$ in $\cup_{y \geq y_{0}} \mathbb{T}(y)$ that has $C_{i}$ in its boundary has no other $C_{\ell}, l \neq i$, in its boundary. This proves the lemma.


Figure 11. An annular end in $\mathcal{M}$
By a change of coordinates on $\mathcal{M}$, we can assume that the end $A$ is in $\cup_{y \geq 1} \mathbb{T}(y)$ and $\partial A \subset \mathbb{T}(1)$. Let $E$ be a connected component of the lift of $A$ to $\mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R}$. The boundary $\partial E \subset P:=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y=1\right\}$ and $E$ is transverse to $P$. There is $(p, q)$ such that the curve $\partial E$ is invariant by the isometry of $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$

$$
\psi^{p} \circ T(h)^{q}:(x, y, t) \rightarrow(x+p \tau, y, t+q h) .
$$

We say that $A$ and $E$ are of type $(p, q)$. The curve $\partial A$ is a curve of the torus $\mathbb{T}(1)$. We prove in the following lemma that $(p, q) \neq(0,0)$

Lemma 4.2. The end $E$ is topologically a half-plane and $\partial E$ is a non compact curve in $P$.

Proof. Assume the contrary, and let $E$ be a lifting of $A$ to $\mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R}, E$ an immersed annulus in $\{y \geq 1\}, \partial E \subset H=\{y=1\}$. We know the coordinate $y$ is a proper function on $E$.
Denote by $\Pi: \mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{H}=\mathbb{H} \times\{0\}$, the vertical projection. Let $\gamma_{1}, \gamma_{2}$ be disjoint geodesics of $\mathbb{H}$, disjoint from $\Pi(\partial E)$, and that separate $\Pi(\partial E)$ from the point at infinity of $\mathbb{H}$; see figure 11 (the set $\Pi(\partial E)$ is compact). Let $\Omega \subset \mathbb{H}$ be the domain of $\mathbb{H}$ bounded by $\gamma_{1} \cup \gamma_{2}$, so $\Pi(\partial E) \cap \Omega=\emptyset$.
For $a \in \mathbb{R}$, solve the Dirichlet problem on $\Omega$ to find a minimal graph over $\Omega$, with asymptotic values $+\infty$ on $\gamma_{1} \cup \gamma_{2}$, and $a$ on $\partial_{\infty}(\Omega)$ (see Collin-Rosenberg [2]).
By varying $a$ we obtain a first point of contact of the graph with $E$; a contradiction.


Figure 12. An annular end in $\mathcal{M}$
Now we prove that an end $E$ of type $(p, q),(p, q) \neq(0,0)$ is trapped between two ends of type $E_{(p, q)}$ :
Theorem 4.3. (The Trapping Theorem) Let $A \subset \Sigma$ be a properly immersed end in $\mathcal{M}$ with $\partial A \subset \mathbb{T}(1)$ and $A$ transverse to $\mathbb{T}(1)$. If $\partial A$, is a curve of type $(p, q)$ in $\mathbb{T}(1)$, then $A$ is contained in a slab on $\mathcal{M}$ bounded by two standard ends $A_{(p, q)}$.

Proof. We use the model of $\mathcal{M}=(H \times \mathbb{R}) /[\psi, T(h)]$ and a connected component $E$ of a lifting of $A$ in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$. We prove that $E$ is contained in a slab bounded by two half-planes $E_{(p, q)}$ in $H \times \mathbb{R}$ where $H=\left\{(x, y) \in \mathbb{R}^{2} ; y \geq 1\right\}$.

Case $(p, q)=(0, q)$. First we begin with the case where the curve $\partial A$ is of type $(0, q)$. This means that the boundary $\partial E$ is a periodic curve invariant by vertical translation $T(h)^{q}=T(q h)$. From this invariance of $\partial E$, we know there exists $x_{\text {Min }}$ and $x_{\text {Max }}$ such that $\partial E \subset\left\{(x, 1, t) ; x_{\text {Min }} \leq x \leq x_{\text {Max }}\right\}$.
Let $Q=\left\{(x, y) \in \mathbb{R}^{2} ; x \geq x_{\operatorname{Max}}\right.$ and $\left.y>0\right\}$. Foliate $Q$ by the geodesics $\gamma_{T}$ whose end-points at infinity are $\left(x_{M a x}, 0\right)$ and $(T, 0) ; T>x_{M a x}$. For $\left|T-x_{M a x}\right|<2$, $\gamma_{T} \cap\{y \geq 1\}=\emptyset$. Define $S_{T}=\gamma_{T} \times \mathbb{R}$; so $S_{T} \cap E=\emptyset$ for $\left|T-x_{M a x}\right|<2$.
Now let $T$ increase to $\infty$, so $S_{T}$ converges to $\left\{\left(x_{M a x}, y\right) ; y>0\right\} \times \mathbb{R}$. Since $E$ is periodic, $S_{T}$ must be disjoint from $E$ for all $T>1$; otherwise there would be a first point of contact (i.e. the two surfaces cannot have a first contact point at infinity), contradicting the maximum principle (see figure 12 )
The same argument using $x_{\text {Min }}$ shows $E$ is trapped between two standard ends of type $E_{(0,1)}$.

Case $(p, q)=(p, 0)$ Now $\partial E$ is a curve invariant by $\psi^{p}(x, y, t)=(x+p \tau, y, t)$. Let $t_{M i n}$ and $t_{M a x}$ satisfy:

$$
\partial E \subset\left\{(x, 1, t) ; t_{M i n} \leq t \leq t_{M a x}\right\}
$$

Translate the barriers of lemma 3.2, see figure 8,

$$
S_{T}^{0}(t):=\left\{(u, T \sin v, v+t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; u \in \mathbb{R}, v \in[0, \pi]\right\} \text { with } t \geq t_{\mathrm{Max}}
$$

For $|T| \leq 1$, we have $S_{T}^{0}(t) \cap(H \times \mathbb{R})=\emptyset$, and $\partial E$ is below height $t=t_{M a x}$. By lemma 3.2, the family $S_{T}^{0}\left(t_{M a x}\right)$ converges on compact sets to the horizontal section $t=t_{M a x}$. For $t>t_{M a x}, t$ large, $T_{0}$ given, we have $S_{T_{0}}^{0}(t) \cap E=\emptyset$.
If $S_{T_{0}}^{0}\left(t_{\text {Max }}\right) \cap E \neq \emptyset$, then since $E$ is periodic, there would be a first $t_{1}$ such that $S_{T_{0}}^{0}\left(t_{1}\right) \cap E \neq \emptyset$, contradicting the maximum principle. Thus $E$ is below $t=t_{\text {Max }}$. The same argument with

$$
\tilde{S}_{T}^{0}(t):=\left\{(u, T \sin v, v-\pi+t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; u \in \mathbb{R}, v \in[0, \pi]\right\} \text { with } t \leq t_{\mathrm{Min}}
$$

shows $E$ is above $t=t_{\text {Min }}$. Thus $E$ is trapped between two standard ends of type $E_{(p, 0)}$.

Case $(p, q) \neq(0, q),(p, 0)$. Now we use the family of barriers $S_{T}^{\lambda}$. $\partial E$ is invariant by the isometry $\psi^{p} \circ T(h)^{q}:(x, y, t) \rightarrow(x+p \tau, y, t+q h)$ on $y=1$. Thus there exists $c_{\text {Min }}, c_{\text {Max }}$ such that

$$
\partial E \subset\left\{(x, 1, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; c_{\operatorname{Min}} \leq p \tau t-q h x \leq c_{\operatorname{Max}}\right\}
$$

We use $S_{T}^{\lambda}$ of lemma 3.2 with $\lambda=\frac{q h}{p \tau}$; see figure 9 .

$$
S_{T}^{\lambda}(t):=\left\{\left(u, \alpha_{T}(v), v+\lambda u+t\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; u \in \mathbb{R}, v \in\left[0, v_{0}(T)\right]\right\} \text { with } t \geq c_{\mathrm{Max}} /(p \tau)
$$

For $T>1$ fixed, there is $t_{0}>c_{\text {Max }} /(p \tau)$ large so that $S_{T}^{\lambda}\left(t_{0}\right) \cap E=\emptyset$. Decreasing $t$ from $t_{0}$ to $c_{\text {Max }} /(p \tau)$ we conclude (there is no first point of contact) that $E$ is below $S_{T}^{\lambda}\left(c_{\operatorname{Max}} /(p \tau)\right.$ for any $T$. Let $T \rightarrow \infty$; the $S_{T}^{\lambda}\left(c_{\operatorname{Max}} /(p \tau)\right.$ converge to $\{(x, y, t) \in$ $\left.\mathbb{R}^{3} ; p \tau t-q h x=c_{\text {Max }}\right\}$, hence

$$
E \subset\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; p \tau t-q h x \leq c_{\operatorname{Max}}\right\}
$$

The same argument with
$\tilde{S}_{T}^{\lambda}(t):=\left\{\left(u, \alpha_{T}(v), v+\lambda u-v_{0}(T)+t\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; u \in \mathbb{R}, v \in\left[0, v_{0}(T)\right]\right\}$ with $t \leq c_{\text {Min }} /(p \tau)$
shows that

$$
E \subset\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; p \tau t-q h x \geq c_{\operatorname{Min}}\right\}
$$

which completes the proof of the theorem.

## 5. The Dragging Lemma

Dragging Lemma 5.1. Let $g: \Sigma \rightarrow N$ be a properly immersed minimal surface in a complete 3-manifold $N$. Let $A$ be a compact surface (perhaps with boundary) and $f: A \times[0,1] \rightarrow N$ a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$-map such that $f(A \times\{t\})=A(t)$ is a minimal immersion for $0 \leq t \leq 1$. If $\partial(A(t)) \cap g(\Sigma)=\emptyset$ for $0 \leq t \leq 1$ and $A(0) \cap g(\Sigma) \neq \emptyset$, then there is a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ path $\gamma(t)$ in $\Sigma$, such that $g \circ \gamma(t) \in A(t) \cap g(\Sigma)$ for $0 \leq t \leq 1$. Moreover we can prescribe any initial value $g \circ \gamma(0) \in A(0) \cap g(\Sigma)$.

Remark 5.2. To obtain a $\gamma(t)$ satisfying the Dragging lemma that is continuous (not necessarily $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ ) it suffices to read the following proof up to (and including) Claim 1.

Proof. When there is no chance of confusion we will identify in the following $\Sigma$ and its image $g(\Sigma), \gamma \subset \Sigma$ and $g \circ \gamma$ in $g(\Sigma) \subset N$. In particular when we consider embeddings of $\Sigma$ there is no confusion.
Let $\Sigma(t)=g(\Sigma) \cap A(t)$ and $\Gamma(t)=f^{-1}(\Sigma(t)), 0 \leq t \leq 1$ the pre-image in $A \times[0,1]$.
When $g: \Sigma \rightarrow N$ is an immersion, we consider $p_{0} \in g(\Sigma) \cap A(0)$, and pre-images $z_{0} \in g^{-1}\left(p_{0}\right)$ and $\left(q_{0}, 0\right) \in f^{-1}\left(p_{0}\right)$. We will obtain the arc $\gamma(t) \in \Sigma$ in a neighborhood of $z_{0}$ by a lift of an arc $\eta(t)$ in a neighborhood of $\left(q_{0}, 0\right)$ in $\Gamma([0,1])$ i.e. $g \circ \gamma(t)=f \circ \eta(t)$. We will extend the arc continuously by iterating the construction.
Since $\Gamma(t)$ represents the intersection of two compact minimal surfaces, we know $\Gamma(t)$ is a set of a finite number of compact analytic curves $\Gamma_{1}(t), \ldots, \Gamma_{k}(t)$. These curves $\Gamma_{i}(t)$ are analytic immersions of topological circles. By hypothesis, $\Gamma(t) \cap(\partial A \times[0,1])=\emptyset$ for all $t$. The maximum principle assures that the immersed curves can not contain a small loop, nor an isolated point. Since $A(t)$ is compact and has bounded curvature, a small loop in $\Gamma(t)$ would bound a small disc $D$ in $\Sigma$ with boundary in $A$. Since $A$ is locally a stable surface, we can consider a local foliation around the disc and find a contradicttion with the maximum principle. We say in the following that $\Gamma(t)$ does not contain small loops.
Claim 1: We will see that for each $t$ with $\Gamma(t) \neq \emptyset, t<1$ there is a $\delta(t)>0$ such that if $(q, t) \in \Gamma(t)$, then there is a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ arc $\eta(\tau)$ defined for $t \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(t)$ such that $\eta(t)=(q, t)$ and $\eta(\tau) \in \Gamma(\tau)$ for all $\tau$ (there may be values of $t$ where $\left.\gamma^{\prime}(t)=0\right)$.
Since $\Gamma(0) \neq \emptyset$, this will show that the set of $t$ for which $\eta(t)$ is defined is a non empty open set. This defines an arc $\gamma(\tau)$ as a lift of $f \circ \eta(\tau) \subset A(\tau)$ in a neighborhood of $\gamma(t) \in \Sigma$.
First suppose $(q, t) \in \Gamma(t)$ is a point where $A(t)=f(A \times\{t\})$ and $g(\Sigma)$ are transverse at $f(q, t)$. Let us consider the $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ immersions

$$
\begin{gathered}
F: A \times[0,1] \rightarrow N \times[0,1] \text { with } F(q, t)=(f(q, t), t) \\
G: \Sigma \times[0,1] \rightarrow N \times[0,1] \text { with } G(z, t)=(g(z), t)
\end{gathered}
$$

Let $\hat{M}=F(A \times[0,1]) \cap G(\Sigma \times[0,1])$ and $M=F^{-1}(\hat{M}) . F(A \times[0,1])$ and $G(\Sigma \times[0,1])$ are transverse at $p=F(q, t)$. Thus $\hat{M}$ is a 2-dimensional surface of $N \times[0,1]$ near $p$. We consider $X(t)$ a tangent vector field along $\Gamma(t)$ and $J X(t)$ an orthogonal


Figure 13. Neighborhood of a singular point
vector field to $X(t)$ in $T_{(q, t)} M$. If $\partial / \partial t \perp T_{p} \hat{M}$, then $T_{p} \hat{M}=T_{f(q, t)} A(t)=T_{f(q, t)} g(\Sigma)$ and $(q, t)$ would be a non transverse point of intersection of $A(t)$ and $g(\Sigma)$. Thus $<$ $J X(t), \partial / \partial t>\neq 0$ and we can find $\eta(\tau)$ a smooth path, defined for $\tau \in[t-\delta(q), t+\delta(q)]$ such that $\eta(t)=(q, t)$ and $\eta^{\prime}(t)=J X(t)$ is transverse to $\Gamma(t)$ at $(q, t)$.
By transversality and $f$ being $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ in the variable $t$, we have a $\delta(q)>0$ such that for $t-\delta(q) \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(q), A(\tau)$ intersects $f \circ \eta(\tau)$ in a unique point and this point varies continuously with $t-\delta(q) \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(q)$. With a fixed initial point in $\Sigma$, a lift of $f \circ \eta(\tau)$, defines $\gamma(\tau) \in \Sigma$.
Again by transversality, we can find a neighborhood of $(q, t)$ in $\Gamma(t)$ and a $\delta>0$ so that the above path $\gamma(\tau)$ exists for $t-\delta \leq \tau \leq t+\delta$, through each point in the neighborhood of $q$. It suffices, to look for a local immersion of a neighborhood of 0 in $T_{p} M$ into $M$, to obtain a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ diffeomorphism $\psi: B(0) \subset T_{p} M \rightarrow M$. $M$ has the structure of a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ manifold in a neighborhood of points of transversality and this structure extends to $F^{-1}(M) \subset A \times[0,1]$.
We will find a $\delta>0$ that works in a neighborhood of a singular point $(q, t) \in \Gamma(t)$, where there is a $z \in \Sigma$ such that $f(q, t)=g(z)$ and $T_{f(q, t)} A(t)=T_{g(z)} g(\Sigma)$. We consider singularities of $\Gamma(t)$ where $A(t)$ and $g(\Sigma)$ are tangent. Near a singularity $(q, t) \in \Gamma(t), \Gamma(t)$ contains $2 k$ analytic curves intersecting at $q$ at equal angles, $k \geq 1$. Let $V$ be a neighborhood of $q$ in $A$. The set $\Gamma(t) \cap V$ is $2 k$ analytic curves. Let $\alpha$ : $]-\epsilon, \epsilon[\rightarrow V \cap \Gamma(t)$ be a regular parametrization of one curve with $\alpha(0)=q$ and $\alpha( \pm \epsilon) \in$ $\partial V$. By transversality as discussed in the previous paragraph $<J X(t), \partial / \partial t>\neq 0$ at $\alpha(s)$ for $s \neq 0$ and $J X(t)$ can be integrated as a curve on $M$ for $t-\delta(s) \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(s)$. Here $\delta(s)$ is a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ function which can be chosen increasing with $\delta(0)=\delta^{\prime}(0)=0$.
There exists a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ diffeomorphism $\phi: \Omega=\left\{(s, \tau) \in \mathbb{R}^{2} ;-\epsilon \leq s \leq \epsilon, t-\delta(s) \leq\right.$ $\tau \leq t+\delta(s)\} \rightarrow M$ such that $\phi(s, t)=\alpha(s)$ for $s \in]-\epsilon, \epsilon[$ and $\phi(s, \tau) \in \Gamma(\tau)$ for


Figure 14. The curve $\eta(\tau)$ passing through several singularities.
$t-\delta(s) \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(s)$. We consider a function $\tau:]-\epsilon, \epsilon[\rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, such that $(s, \pm \tau(s)) \in \Omega$ and $\tau$ is increasing, $\tau(0)=\tau^{\prime}(0)=0$ and $\tau(\epsilon)=t+\delta(\epsilon), \tau(-\epsilon)=t+\delta(-\epsilon)$.
Now we can construct a path $\eta(\tau) \in \Gamma(\tau)$ which joins $(q, t)$ to a point in $\Gamma(t+\delta(\epsilon))$. The $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ arc $f \circ \eta(\tau), t \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(\epsilon)$ is locally parametrized by $\left.\phi(s, \tau(s)), s \in\right] 0, \epsilon[$ and continuously extends to $f(q, t)$ when $\tau \rightarrow t$. Each point $\alpha(s)$, can be connected $\mathcal{C}^{1}$, by the arc $\phi(s, \tau), t \leq \tau \leq \tau(s)$ from $\alpha(s)$ to $\phi(s, \tau(s))$, and next a subarc of $\eta(\tau)$ for $\tau(s) \leq \tau \leq t+\delta(\epsilon)$ (see figure 13). The constant $\delta(\epsilon)$ depends only on $\alpha(\epsilon)=q_{1}$, and we note $\delta\left(q_{1}\right):=\delta(\epsilon)$.
Now there are a finite number of $\operatorname{arcs} \alpha$ in $V-(q)$, with end points $q$ and a collection of $q_{1}, q_{2}, \ldots q_{2 k}$. So one has a $0<\delta$ with $\delta<\delta\left(q_{i}\right)$ that works in a neighborhood of $q$. The claim is proved.
To complete the proof of the Dragging Lemma, it suffices to prove that $\gamma(t)$ extends $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ for any value of $t \in[0,1]$. Assume that there is a point $t_{0}$ such that the arc $\gamma(t)$ is defined in a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ manner for $t<t_{0}$. By compactness of $A$, the arc accumulates at a point $\left(q, t_{0}\right) \in \Gamma\left(t_{0}\right)$. Remark that the structure of $M$ along $\Gamma\left(t_{0}\right)$ gives easily the existence of a continuous extension to $t_{0}$. To ensure a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ path through $t_{0}$, we need a more careful analysis at $\left(q, t_{0}\right)$.
Claim 2: Suppose the path $\gamma(t)$ satisfies the conditions of the Dragging lemma for $0 \leq t \leq t_{0}<1$. Then $\gamma(t)$ can be extended to $0<t<t_{0}+\delta$, to be $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ and satisfy the conditions of the Dragging lemma, for some $\delta>0$.
If $\left(q, t_{0}\right)$ is a transversal point, $M$ has a structure of a manifold and if $t_{0}-\delta\left(t_{0}\right)<$ $t_{1}<t_{0}$ and $\eta\left(t_{1}\right)=\left(q_{1}, t_{1}\right)$ is in a neighborhood of $\left(q, t_{0}\right)$, we can find a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ arc that joins $\eta\left(t_{1}\right)$ to $\left(q, t_{0}\right) \in \Gamma\left(t_{0}\right)$. Next we extend the arc for $t_{0} \leq t \leq t_{0}+\delta\left(t_{0}\right)$.


Figure 15. Left: The curve $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$-Right: The curve $\Gamma\left(t_{1}^{\prime}\right)$.

If $\left(q, t_{0}\right)$ is a singular point, we consider a neighborhood $V \subset A$ of $q$ and $\Gamma\left(t_{0}\right)$ intersects $\partial V$ in $2 k$ transversal points $q_{1}, \ldots, q_{2 k}$. We consider $V \times\left[t_{1}, t_{0}\right]$ with $t_{0}-\delta\left(t_{0}\right)<t_{1}<t_{0}$. By transversality at $\left(q_{1}, t_{0}\right), \ldots,\left(q_{2 k}, t_{0}\right)$, the analytic set $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$ intersects $\partial V$ in $2 k$ points and $V$ in $k$ analytical arcs $\alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{k}$. We suppose that $\eta\left(t_{1}\right) \in \alpha_{1} \subset V \times\left\{t_{1}\right\}$. We construct below a monotonous $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ arc from $\eta\left(t_{1}\right)$ to a point $\left(\hat{q}, t_{2}\right)$ on $\partial V \times\left\{t_{2}\right\}$ for some $t_{1}<t_{2}<t_{0}$ and by transversality an arc from $\left(\hat{q}, t_{2}\right)$ to a point $\left(q^{\prime}, t_{0}\right) \in$ $\partial V \times\left\{t_{0}\right\}$, using the fact that $t_{0}-\delta\left(t_{0}\right)<t_{2}$. Next we can extend the arc in a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ manner from $\left(q^{\prime}, t_{0}\right)$ to some point in $\Gamma\left(t_{0}+\delta\left(t_{0}\right)\right)$.
We consider $\left(\tilde{q}_{1}, t_{1}\right), \ldots,\left(\tilde{q}_{\ell}, t_{1}\right)$ singular points of $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right) \cap V \times\left\{t_{1}\right\}$ and we denote by $W_{1}, \ldots, W_{\ell}$ neighborhoods of $\tilde{q}_{1}, \ldots, \tilde{q}_{\ell}$ in $A \cap V$. The arc $\alpha_{1}$ cannot have double points in $V$ without creating small loops. Hence $\alpha_{1}$ passes through each $W_{1}, \ldots, W_{\ell}$ at most one time, before joining a point of $\partial V$ (We can restrict $V$ in such a way that there are no small loops in $V$ ).
First we assume that there is $t_{2}$ such that for any $t \in\left[t_{1}, t_{2}\right]$, the curve $\Gamma(t)$ has exactly one isolated singularity in each neighborhood $W_{i} \times\{t\}$ with the same type as $\tilde{q}_{i} \in \Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)(i=1, \ldots, \ell)$ and $t_{2}<t_{1}+\delta\left(t_{1}\right)$. If we parametrize $\alpha_{1}:\left[s_{0}, s_{2 \ell+1}\right] \rightarrow \Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$, we can find $s_{1}, \ldots, s_{2 \ell}$ such that $\alpha_{1}\left(s_{2 k-1}\right), \alpha_{1}\left(s_{2 k}\right) \in \partial W_{k}$ and $I_{k}=\left[s_{2 k-2}, s_{2 k-1}\right]$ are intervals parametrizing transversal points in $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$.
The manifold structure of $M$ gives an immersion $\psi_{j}: I_{j} \times\left[t_{1}, t_{1}+\delta\right] \rightarrow M, t_{1}+\delta<t_{2}$ and $j=1, \ldots, \ell+1$. In the construction of $\eta$ up to $t_{1}$, the singular points are isolated; then we can assume $\eta\left(t_{1}\right)$ is a regular point of $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$, hence is contained in an $\alpha_{1}\left(I_{j}\right)$. We construct the beginning of the arc $\eta(\tau)$ as the graph parametrized by $\phi_{j}(s, \tau(s))$ with $\tau$ an increasing function from $t_{1}$ to $t_{1}+\delta / n$ as $s$ varies from $\hat{s} \in I_{j}$, corresponding
to the initial point $\eta\left(t_{1}\right)=\alpha_{1}(\hat{s})$, to $s_{2 j-1}$. Next we pass through the singularity $\left(\tilde{q}_{j}, t_{1}+2 \delta / n\right)$ by constructing an arc wich joins the point $\phi_{j}\left(s_{2 j-1}, t_{1}+\delta / n\right) \in \Gamma\left(t_{1}+\right.$ $\delta / n) \cap \partial W_{j}$ to the point $\phi_{j+1}\left(s_{2 j}, t_{1}+3 \delta / n\right) \in \Gamma\left(t_{1}+3 \delta / n\right) \cap \partial W_{j}$ (see figure 14). For a suitable value of $n$ we can iterate this construction, passing through the singularities $\tilde{q}_{j}, \tilde{q}_{j+1} \ldots$, until we join a point $\left(\hat{q}, t_{2}\right)$ of $\partial V \times\left\{t_{2}\right\}$ and then we extend the arc up to $t_{0}$ by transversality outside $V$.
Now we look for this interval $\left[t_{1}, t_{2}\right]$. Let $t_{1}<t_{1}^{\prime}<t_{0}$ and $\Gamma\left(t_{1}^{\prime}\right)$ have several singularities in some neighborhood $W_{k}$, or a unique singularity of index less the one of the $\tilde{q}_{k}$. We consider in this $W_{k}$ a finite collection of neighborhoods of isolated singularities $W_{k, 1}^{\prime}, \ldots W_{k, \ell^{\prime}}^{\prime}$. We observe, by transversality that there are the same number of components of $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$ and $\Gamma\left(t_{1}^{\prime}\right)$ in $W_{k}$ (see figure 15). Hence each $W_{k, j}^{\prime}$ contains a number of components of $\Gamma\left(t_{1}^{\prime}\right)$ strictly less than the number of components of $\Gamma\left(t_{1}\right)$ in $W_{k}$. The index of the singularity is strictly decreasing along this procedure. We can iterate this analysis up to a point where each singularity can not be reduced to a simple one. This gives the interval $\left[t_{1}, t_{2}\right]$.

## 6. Compact minimal annuli

We now introduce the compact stable horizontal minimal annulus $F_{0}$ bounded by circles in vertical planes $P(c)$ and $P(-c)$ where $P(c)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right.$ and $x=$ $c\}$. We also foliate a tubular neighborhood $\operatorname{Tub}\left(F_{0}\right)$ of $F_{0}$ by compact minimal annuli $F_{s},-1 \leq s \leq 1$ and certain small balls $B_{\rho}$ containing horizontal minimal annuli $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$.
We will now construct the stable compact annulus $F_{0}$. Let $\eta$ be a circle of radius one in the vertical plane $P(c)$, centered at $(c, y, 0)$. The metric induced on $P(c)$ is euclidean so circles make sense. As $y \rightarrow \infty$, $\operatorname{dist}(\eta, P(0)) \rightarrow 0$. The disk of least area in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ bounded by $\eta$ is the disc in $P(c)$ bounded by $\eta$ (by the maximum principle). The area of this disk does not depend $y$. So for $y$ large, there is a compact annulus in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ with one boundary in $P(0)$ and the other boundary $\eta$, whose area is less that the area of the disk in $P(c)$ bounded by $\eta$. Assume $y$ is large. then by the Douglas criterium there is a least area annulus $F_{+}$having one boundary $\eta$ and the other in $P(0)$. Since $F_{+}$has least area w.r.t. this boundary condition, $\partial F_{+} \cap P(0)$ is orthogonal to $P(0)$. Hence $F_{0}$, the symmetry of $F_{+}$through $P(0)$, union $F_{+}$, is a smooth compact minimal annulus orthogonal to $P(0)$ and $F_{+} \cap P(0)$ is convex. The normal vector along this curve takes on all directions in the plane $P(0)$. Let $\sigma$ be symmetry through $P(0), \eta_{-}=\sigma(\eta), F_{-}=\sigma\left(F_{+}\right)$. Observe that $F_{0}$ has least area with boundary $\eta \cup \eta_{-}$. For if $B$ is an annulus with $\partial B=\eta \cup \eta_{-}$, write $B=B_{+} \cup B_{-}$ where $B_{+}=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right.$ and $\left.0 \leq x \leq c\right\} \cap B$, and $B_{-}=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>\right.$ 0 and $-c \leq x \leq 0\} \cap B$. We know that the Area $\left(B_{+}\right)=\left|B_{+}\right| \geq \frac{\left|F_{0}\right|}{2}$ and $\left|B_{-}\right| \geq \frac{\left|F_{0}\right|}{2}$ so $|B| \geq\left|F_{0}\right|$. Thus $F_{0}$ is a stable annulus as desired. Let $\gamma_{1}$ be the geodesic joining $(c, y, 0)$ to $(-c, y, 0)$. We assume $y$ large so that $\gamma_{1} \cap F_{0}=\emptyset$.


Figure 16.
Let $\eta(s)$ be equidistant circles of $\eta$ in $P(c)$, for $|s|$ small, $\eta(0)=\eta$. Let $\eta_{-}(s)=\sigma(\eta(s))$ be equidistant circles in $P(-c), \eta_{-}(0)=\eta_{-}$. Since $F_{0}$ is strictly stable, there is a $\delta>0$ so that for $|s| \leq \delta$, there is a foliation of a tubular neighborhood $\operatorname{Tub}\left(F_{0}\right)$, of $F_{0}$ by compact minimal annuli $F(s)$, with $\partial F(s)=\eta(s) \cup \eta_{-}(s)$. choose $\delta$ sufficiently small so that

$$
\operatorname{dist}\left(\operatorname{Tub}\left(F_{0}\right), \gamma_{1}\right)>0
$$

Let $\operatorname{Slab}(c)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right.$ and $\left.|x| \leq c\right\}$. We denote by $F_{0}^{-}$the bounded component of $\operatorname{Slab}(c)-F_{0}$, and by $F_{0}^{+}$the other component of $\operatorname{Slab}(c)-F_{0}$. The annuli $F_{s}$ are inside $F_{0}^{-}$for $s \in[-1,0]$ and inside $F_{0}^{+}$for $s \in[0,1]$.
We consider $\operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right)=\cup_{s \in[-1,0]} F_{s}$ and $\operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right)=\cup_{s \in[0,1]} F_{s}$; domains of $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$.
We consider the curves $S_{+}=P(0) \cap F_{1 / 2}$ and $S_{-}=P(0) \cap F_{-1 / 2}$. There exists a constant $\rho>0$, such that for any $q$ of $S_{+}\left(\right.$or $\left.S_{-}\right)$the geodesic ball $B_{\rho}(q)$ of geodesic radius $\rho$ centered at $q$ is contained in $\operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right)\left(\right.$ resp. $\left.\operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right)\right)$.
We can find $\ell>0$ such that any geodesic ball of radius $\rho$ centered at $q$ contains a small compact minimal annulus $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ bounded by two geodesic circles contained in $P(\ell) \cap B_{\rho}$ and $P(-\ell) \cap B_{\rho}$. We say in the following that $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ is centered at $q \in S_{+} \cup S_{-}$. We denote by $q_{1}$ the point $\gamma_{1} \cap P(0)$; see figure 17 .


Figure 17.
In summary, we fix $\rho>0$ such that
(1) $3 \rho<\operatorname{dist}\left(F_{0}, \gamma_{1}\right)$,
(2) $B_{2 \rho}\left(q_{1}\right) \cap \operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right)=\emptyset$
(3) $B_{\rho}(q) \subset \operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right)$ for any $q \in S_{-}$,
(4) $B_{\rho}(q) \subset \operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right)$ for any $q \in S_{+}$,

Now we clearly have the following:
Claim: Any continuous curve $\gamma$ in the interior of $\operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right) \cap \operatorname{Slab}(\ell)$ (or $\operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right) \cap$ $\operatorname{Slab}(\ell)$ ) joining $F_{0}$ to $F_{1}$ (or $F_{-1}$ ) intersects a compact annulus of the family $C_{\ell}(q) \subset$ $\operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right)$ (resp. $\left.\mathrm{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right)\right)$ for some point $q \in S_{+}$(reps. $q \in S_{-}$). The next proposition gives at least two components of $\Sigma$ in $F_{0}^{-}$when $F_{0}$ is tangent to $\Sigma$ at some point.


Figure 18.

Proposition 6.1. Let $\Sigma$ be a properly immersed minimal half-plane in Slab( $\ell$ ). Suppose $\Sigma$ is tangent to $F_{0}$ at $p$ and $\partial \Sigma \cap F_{0}=\emptyset$. Then there are at least two connected components of $\Sigma$ in $F_{0}^{-}$. More precisely if $\Sigma_{1}(-)$ and $\Sigma_{2}(-)$ are distinct local components of $\Sigma$ in $F_{0}^{-}$then $\Sigma_{1}(-)$ and $\Sigma_{2}(-)$ are in distinct components of $\Sigma \cap F_{0}^{-}$.

Proof. If not we can find a path $\alpha_{0}$ in $\Sigma \cap F_{0}^{-}$, joining a point $x \in \Sigma_{1}(-)$ and $y \in \Sigma_{2}(-)$. Then join $x$ to $y$ by a local path $\beta_{0}$ in $\Sigma$ going through $p$, but $\beta_{0} \subset F_{0}^{-}$ except at $p$ (see figure 18). Let $\Gamma=\alpha_{0} \cup \beta_{0} \subset F_{0}^{-}$. Since $\Sigma$ is a half-plane, $\Gamma$ bounds a disk $D$ in $\Sigma$. By construction $D$ contains points in the interior of $F_{0}^{+}$.
Hence there is a compact component of $D$ in $F_{0}^{+}$with boundary in $F_{0}$. By the maximum principle $D \cap F_{t} \neq \emptyset, 0 \leq t \leq 1$ and there is at least one point $p_{1}$ of $D \cap F_{1}$. Using compact annuli $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ inside $\operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right)$, we can find an annulus $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}(q)$ which intersects $D$ (by the claim). Now translate this catenoid in the interior $F_{0}^{+}$to a point outside the convex hull of $F_{0}$. Apply the Dragging lemma to obtain points of $D$ outside the convex hull. This contradicts the maximum principle.

## 7. A family of graph barriers

In this section we study a one parameter family of surfaces $\Sigma_{n}$ graphs on a sequence of domains $\Omega_{n}$ of $\mathbb{H}^{2}$ bounded by two geodesics. In the unit disk model of $\mathbb{H}^{2}=\{(x, y) \in$ $\left.\mathbb{R}^{2} ; x^{2}+y^{2}<1\right\}$, we consider two geodesics $\gamma_{n}$ and $\gamma_{-n}$ passing through the points $(-1+1 / n, 0)$ and $(1-1 / n, 0))$ and both orthogonal to $\{y=0\}$. We consider the domain $\Omega_{n}$ bounded by $\gamma_{n}$ and $\gamma_{-n}$ (see figure 20, Left). We solve the minimal graph equation for a function $u_{n}: \Omega_{n} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ with $u_{n}=+\infty$ on $\gamma_{n} \cup \gamma_{-n}$ and $u_{n}=0$ on $\partial_{\infty} \Omega_{n}$, the boundary at infinity of $\Omega_{n}$.
The graph $u_{n}$ has a line of curvature $\Gamma_{n}$ over the geodesic $\gamma_{0}=\left\{(x, y) \in \mathbb{H}^{2} ; x=0\right\}$. The following proposition describes the limit of the graphs $\Sigma_{n}$ when $n \rightarrow \infty$.


Figure 19. Left: Domain $\Omega_{n}$ of function $u_{n}$. Right: Domain of functions $v_{n}$.

Proposition 7.1. The sequence of solutions of the minimal graph equation in the sequence of domains $\Omega_{n}$ with boundary data $u_{n}=+\infty$ on $\gamma_{n} \cup \gamma_{-n}$ and $u_{n}=0$ on $\partial_{\infty} \Omega_{n}$, converge uniformly to the horizontal section $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times\{0\}$.

Proof. The sequence of domains $\Omega_{n}$ is an increasing sequence in $\mathbb{H}^{2} ; \Omega_{n} \subset \Omega_{n+1}$. The maximun principle assures that the sequence is decreasing with $0 \leq u_{n+1}(q) \leq u_{n}(q)$ for any $q \in \Omega_{n}$. Hence the sequence of graphs $\Sigma_{n}$ converges to an entire graph of a function $u_{0}: \mathbb{H}^{2} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$. We will prove that $u_{0} \equiv 0$.
It suffices to prove that $u_{0}=0$ on the geodesic $\gamma_{0}$. If not we can assume that $\sup _{\gamma_{0}} u_{n}=a_{n} \geq b>0$ and there is $p \in \gamma_{0}$ such that $u_{0}(p)=b$.
This point $p$ exists because $u_{0}$ takes value 0 at infinity of $\gamma_{0}$. This comes from the fact that $\left(u_{n}\right)$ is a decreasing sequence hence $u_{n}=0$ at infinity of $\Omega_{n}$ for any $n \in \mathbb{N}$.
We consider the sequence of minimal surfaces $\tilde{\Sigma}_{n}$ graphs of a function $v_{n}$ on a domain $V_{n}$ bounded by $\gamma_{n}$, with boundary data $v_{n}=+\infty$ on $\gamma_{n}$ and $v_{n}=b$ on $\partial_{\infty} V_{n}$. This family of graphs is well known and Mazet, Rodriguez and Rosenberg proved in [8] that the sequence $v_{n}$ converges uniformly to $v_{0} \equiv b$, when $n \rightarrow \infty$.
We restrict the function $v_{n}: V_{n} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ to the domain $W_{n}$ bounded by the geodesic $\gamma_{n}$ and the geodesic $\gamma_{0}$. On $W_{n}$ we claim that the maximum principle applies to show that $v_{n} \geq u_{0}$. To see this its suffices to check for the inequality on the boundary of the domain $W_{n}$. On $\gamma_{n}$, the function $v_{n}=+\infty>u_{0}$ and on $\gamma_{0}$, we have $v_{n} \geq b \geq u_{0}$. At the boundary at infinity $\partial_{\infty} V_{n}$ we have $v_{n}=b>0=u_{0}$.
Now let $n \rightarrow \infty$ to show that $v_{n} \rightarrow v_{0}=b$ and $v_{0} \geq u_{0}$. This proves by symmetry that the function $u_{0} \leq b$. The point $p$ of $\gamma_{0}$ where $u_{0}(p)=b$ is an interior maximum
point of the function, hence $u_{0}=b$. This contradicts the fact that $u_{0}$ take the value 0 at the boundary at infinity of $\mathbb{H}^{2}$.

We consider an end $E_{(1,0)}(c)$ contained in a slab $S=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq 1\right.$ and $-c_{1} \leq$ $\left.t \leq c_{1}\right\}$ and we use the proposition 7.1 to obtain $\mathcal{C}^{0}$ convergence:

Proposition 7.2. An end $A$ of type $(p, 0)$ of a properly immersed minimal surface $\Sigma$ in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ has third coordinate which has a limit at infinity i.e. that $A$ converges in the $\mathcal{C}^{0}$ norm to $A_{(p, 0)}$ at height $\left.a \in\right]-c_{1}, c_{1}[$.

Remark 7.3. We will prove in the next proposition that $A$ converges uniformly in the $\mathcal{C}^{2}$ norm to $A_{(p, 0)}$ i.e; $A$ is a graph converging uniformly to the cusp $A_{(p, 0)}$ at height $\{t=a\}$.

Proof. A covering $E$ of $A$ is contained in a slab bounded by $E_{(1,0)}\left(-c_{1}\right)$ and $E_{(1,0)}\left(c_{1}\right)$. We study the intersection of $E$ with the level section $E_{(1,0)}(c)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \geq\right.$ 1 and $t=c\}$ with $c \in]-c_{1},+c_{1}\left[\right.$. If $\Gamma$ is a compact component of $A \cap E_{(1,0)}(c)$ then $\Gamma \cap \partial A \neq \emptyset$. Otherwise $\Gamma$ bounds a disc $D$ or a subend $A_{0}$. In both cases, the maximum principle of proposition 7.1 applies and $A=A_{(p, 0)}$ i.e. $A$ is a flat standard end of height $c$.
Varying the value $c \in]-c_{1},+c_{1}[$, there is a value $a \in]-c_{1},+c_{1}[$, such that the intersection $A \cap E_{(1,0)}(c)$ has a non compact component denoted by $\Gamma$. By proposition 7.1, $\Gamma \cap \partial E \neq \emptyset$. In the lift $E$ of $A$, we consider two lifts of $\Gamma$ denoted by $\Gamma_{1}$ and $\Gamma_{2}:=\psi \circ \Gamma_{1}$. The curves $\Gamma_{1}, \Gamma_{2}$ and a compact arc $\Gamma_{3} \subset \partial E$ bound a fundamental domain, (see figure 19).
We consider a graph obtained by a translation $\sigma_{n}$ of $\Sigma_{n}$ of section 7 such that the geodesic $\gamma_{-n}$ translates to a fixed geodesic $\bar{\gamma}$ which does not intersect $\Gamma_{3} \subset \partial E$ and $\Sigma_{n}$ is above $E$ with boundary data $u_{n}=a$ at the boundary at infinity. The graph $\Sigma_{n}$ has a line of curvature which is a graph over the translation of the geodesic $\gamma_{0}$ denoted by $\sigma_{n} \circ \gamma_{0}$ and the boundary curve $\gamma_{n}$ is sent to $\sigma_{n} \circ \gamma_{n}$. We remark that $\sigma_{n} \circ \gamma_{0}$ is a distance $n$ from $\bar{\gamma}$ and $\sigma_{n} \circ \gamma_{n}$ at a distance $2 n$ from $\bar{\gamma}$.
We let $n \rightarrow \infty$ and fix the geodesic $\bar{\gamma}$, using the horizontal isometry $\sigma_{n}$. These graphs are conjugate to the graphs of the sequence $u_{n}$ of proposition 7.1. We know that the graph over $\sigma_{n} \circ \gamma_{0}$ is converging to the height $a$, hence we see that the end $A$ cannot have a point above the height $a$ at infinity. We do the same with a symmetric graph with value $-\infty$ on the geodesic $\gamma_{-n}$ and $\gamma_{+n}$. This proves that the end $A$ is trapped between two graphs which have third coordinate going to the same value $a$. Hence the end $A$ converges in the $\mathcal{C}^{2}$ norm to a cusp end $t=a$.

## 8. Proof of the theorem in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$.

The surface $\Sigma$ is properly immersed. By lemma 4.1, 4.2 and theorem 4.3, each end $A$ lifts to $E$ a half-plane trapped between two standard ends $E_{(p, q)}$. First we prove the theorem for an end of type $(0, p)$ and then we adapt the arguments to the general case.

Ends of type $(0, p)$; the vertical case. Since $E$ is trapped between two vertical planes and the distance between two vertical planes tends to zero as $y \rightarrow \infty$, we can assume $E \subset \operatorname{Slab}(\ell / 2)$ where $\operatorname{Slab}(c)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0\right.$ and $\left.|t| \leq c\right\}$, and $\partial E \subset\left\{y=y_{0}\right\}$. We will prove that when $p \in E$, and $y(p)>3+y_{0}$, then the killing field $\frac{\partial}{\partial x}$ is transverse to $E$ at $p$. Then this sub-end of $E$ is stable hence has bounded curvature. We will prove later that this gives the theorem in this case.
Suppose on the contrary that some $p$, with $y(p)>3+y_{0}$, has $\left.\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right|_{p}$ in $T_{p} E$. The annulus $F_{0}$ meets $P(0)$ orthogonally and the normal vector to this curve of intersection is in the plane $P(0)$ and takes all directions in this plane as one goes once around the curve.
Since $\left.\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right|_{p} \in T_{p} E$, the normal vector to $E$ at $p$ is in the plane $P(x=x(p))$. Thus we can translate $F_{0}$ to $p$ (call $F_{0}$ this translated $F_{0}$ ) to be tangent to $E$ at $p$. By a translation of less than $\ell / 2$ we can assume $x(p)=0$, so now $E \subset \operatorname{Slab}(\ell)$. Recall that $\gamma_{1}$ is the geodesic joining the centers of the boundary circles of $F_{0}$ and $q_{1}=\gamma_{1} \cap P(0)$. Write $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ with $y_{1}>2+y_{0}$.
The convex hull of the foliation of $\operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right) \cup \operatorname{Tub}^{+}\left(F_{0}\right) \cup F_{0}$ has $y$ coordinate at least the minimum of the $y$-coordinate of the boundary circles of $F(t)$ i.e. $y \geq y_{0}+1 / 2$ on the convex hull. Now we proved in the section 6, that this foliation contains a family of geodesic balls $B_{\rho}(q)$ of radius $\rho>0$ centered at points $q \in S_{+} \cup S_{-}$. We choose this constant $\rho$ such that

$$
3 \rho<\operatorname{dist}\left(F_{0}, \gamma_{1}\right) \text { and } 4 \rho<1 .
$$

Each such geodesic ball $B(q)$ contains a compact annulus $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}(q)$ bounded by geodesic circles of radius $\delta$ contained in $P(\ell)$ and $P(-\ell)$.

Step 1: Construction of arcs on $E$. We know by proposition 6.1, that there are at least two connected components $\Sigma_{1}, \Sigma_{2}$ of $E-F_{0}$ that have $p$ in their closure, and $\Sigma_{1}, \Sigma_{2} \subset F_{0}^{-}$. Clearly, by the maximum principle, each of $\Sigma_{1}, \Sigma_{2}$ intersects each of the catenoids in the local foliation $F_{s}$ about $F_{0}$ in $F_{0}^{-}$. In particular there is a $\tilde{q} \in S_{-}$ such that $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}(\tilde{q}) \cap \Sigma_{1} \neq \emptyset$. Now translate $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}(\tilde{q})$ along the geodesic joining $\tilde{q}$ to $q_{1}$ and apply the Dragging lemma to obtain a point $p_{1} \in \Sigma_{1} \cap \mathcal{C}_{\ell}\left(q_{1}\right) \subset B_{\rho}\left(q_{1}\right)$.
The same argument gives a point $p_{2} \in \Sigma_{2} \cap \mathcal{C}_{\ell}\left(q_{1}\right)$. Recall that $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ can not be joined by an arc in $E \cap F_{0}^{-}$(we will use this later). Now we construct a loop $\mu$ in $E$. For a value $k_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ which will be defined in step 2 , we consider $\Gamma_{+}$to be the euclidean segment joining $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $\left(0, y_{1}, k_{0} h+2 \rho\right)$, together with the segment joining $\left(0, y_{1}, k_{0} h+2 \rho\right)$ to $z=\left(0, y_{0}, k_{0} h+2 \rho\right)$. We will connect the point $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ by an arc in $E$ which stays in a tubular neighborhood of $\Gamma_{+} \cup \partial E$. We note by $\operatorname{Tub}_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{+}\right)$ the tubular neighborhood of geodesic radius $\rho$ along $\Gamma_{+}$. We parametrize the curve $\Gamma_{+}$in a piecewise $\mathcal{C}^{1}$-monotone manner by $q(\bar{t}), 0 \leq \bar{t} \leq 1$ and we move $B_{\rho}\left(q_{1}\right)$ along $q(\bar{t})$, from $q_{1}$ to $z=\left(0, y_{0}, k_{0} h+2 \rho\right)$, by $B_{\rho}(q(\bar{t}))$. Each ball $B_{\rho}(q(\bar{t})), q \in \Gamma_{+}$ contains the catenoid $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}(q(\bar{t}))$ and the Dragging lemma then gives two continuous paths $\sigma_{1}^{+}(\bar{t}), \sigma_{2}^{+}(\bar{t})$ starting at $p_{1}, p_{2}$ respectively such that $\sigma_{i}^{+}(\bar{t}) \in E$ for $0 \leq \bar{t} \leq 1$.

We apply the Dragging lemma up to the value $q(1)=z$ and $\sigma_{i}^{+}(1) \in B_{\rho}(z)$ for $i=1,2$. Since $\tilde{p}_{1}=\sigma_{1}^{+}(1)$ and $\tilde{p}_{2}=\sigma_{2}^{+}(1)$ are in $\partial E \cap B_{\rho}(z)$, we can find a path $\sigma_{12}^{+}$in $\partial E$ from $\tilde{p}_{1}$ to $\tilde{p}_{2}$. We have $t\left(\tilde{p}_{1}\right), t\left(\tilde{p}_{2}\right) \in\left[k_{0} h+\rho, k_{0} h+3 \rho\right]$. We will prove in step 2 , that we can find a path $\sigma_{12}^{+} \in \partial E$ from $\tilde{p}_{1}$ to $\tilde{p}_{2}$ such that for all $p \in \sigma_{12}^{+}$, $t(p) \in\left[\rho, k_{0} h+3 \rho\right]$.
Assuming this, we have constructed a path $\mu^{+}$in $E$ from $p_{1}$ to $p_{2}$ which is

$$
\mu^{+}=\sigma_{1}^{+} \cup \sigma_{12}^{+} \cup \sigma_{2}^{+}
$$

The arcs $\sigma_{1}^{+}(\bar{t}), \sigma_{2}^{+}(\bar{t})$ are contained in $T_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{+}\right)$. The arcs of $\sigma_{1}^{+}$and $\sigma_{2}^{+}$from $p_{1}$ to $F_{0}$ and $p_{2}$ to $F_{0}$ are disjoint (see proposition 6.1) since $\sigma_{1}^{+} \subset \Sigma_{1}$ and $\sigma_{2}^{+} \subset \Sigma_{2}$ in $\operatorname{Tub}^{-}\left(F_{0}\right)$.
Moreover the paths are quasi-monotone along the segment of $\Gamma_{+}$in $\operatorname{Tub}\left(\Gamma_{+}\right)$: once the catenoids $\mathrm{C}_{\ell}(q), q \in \Gamma_{+}$have advanced along $\Gamma_{+}$a distance $2 \rho$, the paths $\sigma_{1}^{+}$and $\sigma_{2}^{+}$do not return to the $\rho$-ball where they started.
If the $\operatorname{arcs} \sigma_{1}^{+}(\bar{t})$ and $\sigma_{2}^{+}(\bar{t})$ remain disjoint for $\bar{t} \leq 1$, we do not change $\mu^{+}$. If the arcs intersect then at the first point of intersection $p_{3}$ we replace $\mu^{+}$by the path on $\sigma_{1}^{+}$from $p_{1}$ to $p_{3}$ union the path on $\sigma_{2}^{+}$from $p_{2}$ to $p_{3}$. Such a point $p_{3}$ is necessarily outside $F_{-1 / 2}$.
Step 2: The boundary $\partial E$. Now we study the boundary of the annulus and the function $t: \partial E \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ the restriction of the third coordinate in the model of the half-plane. We parametrize the boundary curve $\partial E$ by the immersion $C: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow$ $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}, C(s)=\left(x(s), y_{0}, t(s)\right)$ with period

$$
C(s+1)=\left(x(s+1), y_{0}, t(s+1)\right) \longrightarrow\left(x(s), y_{0}, t(s)+h\right) .
$$

The diameter is defined by

$$
G:=\sup _{s_{1}, s_{2} \in[0,1]}\left|t\left(s_{1}\right)-t\left(s_{2}\right)\right|
$$

and choose $k_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $K=k_{0} h \geq G$. We consider the intersection of $\partial E$ with a transverse plane to the curve $P(\alpha):=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y=y_{0}, t=\alpha\right\}$. Since $C$ is a proper immersed curve, we have a finite number of intersection points

$$
C(s) \cap P(\alpha)=\left\{C\left(s_{1}\right), \ldots, C\left(s_{\ell}\right)\right\}
$$

We claim that $\left(s_{i}\right)_{1 \leq i \leq \ell} \in\left[s_{1}-k, s_{1}+k\right]$. To see this we remark that if $s_{1}+1+k^{\prime} \geq$ $s \geq s_{1}+k^{\prime} \geq s_{1}+k$, we have

$$
t(s)-\alpha=t(s)-t\left(s_{1}+k^{\prime}\right)+t\left(s_{1}+k^{\prime}\right)-t\left(s_{1}\right) \geq k^{\prime} \tau-G \geq k_{0} \tau-G>0
$$

Hence independently of the choice of $\alpha$, two points of $\partial E$ with the same $t$ coordinate are connected by a sub-arc $\Gamma$ of $\partial E$ with $t(\Gamma) \subset[\alpha-K, \alpha+K]$. Two points of $\partial E$ with coordinate $t_{1} \leq t_{2}$ can be connected in $\partial E$ by a sub-arc $\Gamma$ with $x(\Gamma) \in\left[t_{1}-K, t_{2}+K\right]$.

Step 3: A loop $\mu$ in $E$. In step 1, we constructed an arc $\mu^{+}=\sigma_{1}^{+} \cup \sigma_{12}^{+} \cup \sigma_{2}^{+}$which joins the points $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ and $\mu^{+} \subset \operatorname{Tub}_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{+}\right) \cup \partial E$. Now do this construction in


Figure 20. Construction of the arc $\Gamma$
the half-space $\{x \leq 0\}$ to obtain a path $\mu^{-}$joining $p_{1}$ to $p_{2}$ with similar properties. Let $\Gamma_{-}$be the segment from $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $\left(0, y_{1},-k_{0} h-2 \rho\right)$, together with the segment joining $\left(0, y_{1},-k_{0} h-2 \rho\right)$ to $z=\left(0, y_{0},-k_{0} h-2 \rho\right)$. Move $B_{\rho}\left(q_{1}\right)$ in a $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ monotone manner along $\Gamma_{-}$and we use the Dragging lemma as before to construct $\operatorname{arcs} \sigma_{1}^{-}(\bar{t}), \sigma_{2}^{-}(\bar{t})$ in $E$. We note by $\operatorname{Tub}_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{-}\right)$the tubular neighborhood of geodesic radius $\rho$ along $\Gamma_{-}$. We follow the arc $\sigma_{1}^{-}(\bar{t}), \sigma_{2}^{-}(\bar{t})$ up to points of $\partial E$. As in step 2 , we construct the arc $\sigma_{12}^{-}$, so that points $p \in \sigma_{12}^{-}$have coordinate $t(p) \subset\left[-k_{0} h-\rho,-\rho\right]$. Finally we consider; see figure 20

$$
\mu^{-}=\sigma_{1}^{-} \cup \sigma_{12}^{-} \cup \sigma_{2}^{-}
$$

and we let $\mu$ be the loop $\mu^{+} \cup \mu^{-} . \mu$ is contained in $\operatorname{Tub}_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}\right)$. If the $\operatorname{arcs} \sigma_{1}^{-}(\bar{t})$ and $\sigma_{2}^{-}(\bar{t})$ remain disjoint for $\bar{t} \leq 1$, we do not change $\mu^{-}$. If the arcs intersect then at the first point of intersection $p_{4}$ we replace $\mu^{-}$by the path on $\sigma_{1}^{-}$from $p_{1}$ to $p_{4}$ union the path on $\sigma_{2}^{-}$from $p_{2}$ to $p_{4}$. Such a point $p_{4}$ is necessarily outside $F_{-1 / 2}$.
The end $E$ is an immersed half-plane $X: \Omega=\left\{(u, v) \in \mathbb{R}^{2} ; v \geq 0\right\} \rightarrow \mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ with $X(\Omega)=E$. The loop $\mu \subset E$ is immersed and we denote by $\hat{\mu}=X^{-1}(\mu)$ the pre-image of $\mu$ in $\Omega$.

In the Dragging lemma, we constructed the arc $\mu$ locally and then extended it. The preimage $\hat{\mu}$ is locally embedded in $\Omega$. The arc $\hat{\mu}$ can have self-intersections. If $\hat{p}$ is one of them, we consider the sub-arc $\gamma$ of $\hat{\mu}$ with end points $\hat{p}$. This sub-arc $\gamma$ bounds a disk in $\Omega$. We remove these sub arcs to obtain a piecewise $\mathcal{C}^{1}$ connected curve in $\Omega$ without self-intersecting points. This defines a closed Jordan curve which bounds a disk $D$ in $\Omega$. The immersion $X(D)$ is a minimal disk in $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ with boundary an immersed connected curve contained in $\operatorname{Tub}_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}\right) \cup \partial E$. Now we analyze the geometry of the disk $X(D)$.
Consider the plane defined by $P(0)=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y \leq y_{0}\right.$ and $\left.t=0\right\}$. This plane separates $\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}$in two connected components.
We denote by $\tilde{\mu}=\partial X(D)$ the boundary of the minimal disk. Let $\tilde{\mu}_{1}=\tilde{\mu} \cap\left(\sigma_{1}^{+} \cup \sigma_{1}^{-}\right)$ and $\tilde{\mu}_{2}=\tilde{\mu} \cap\left(\sigma_{2}^{+} \cup \sigma_{2}^{-}\right)$be the connected components of the loop in $E$ containing $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ respectively. The end points of $\tilde{\mu}_{1}, \tilde{\mu}_{2}$ are in different half-spaces determined by $\{x=0\}$ (one end point has $x>\rho$ and the other $x<-\rho$ ). Thus the plane $P(0)$ intersects $\tilde{\mu}_{1}$ and $\tilde{\mu}_{2}$, each one in an odd number of points.
Now we will obtain a contradiction by proving that $P(0) \cap \tilde{\mu}_{1}$ is an even number of points. One translates horizontal catenoids $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}(q), q \in E(0) \cap P(0)$, starting far from $\mu$ to see that before $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ touches a $\rho$-tubular neighborhood of $\mu$, one does not touch the disk $X(D)$. Hence $X(D) \cap P(0)$ is contained in $F_{0}^{-} \cap \operatorname{Tub}_{\rho}\left(\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}\right)$.
In $F_{0}^{-}$the sub arc $\tilde{\mu}_{1} \subset \Sigma_{1}$ and $\tilde{\mu}_{2} \subset \Sigma_{2}$ cannot be connected. Hence a connected arc $\gamma \subset X(D) \cap P(0)$ must have end points either in $\Sigma_{1}$ or in $\Sigma_{2}$. This means that there are an even number of point of $\tilde{\mu}_{1} \cap P(0)$ on $\partial D=\mu$. This contradicts the odd intersection number of each arc with $P(0)$.
This proves that $E$ is a graph for $y \geq y_{0}+2 R$.
Ends of type $(p, q)$, tilted planes. Next we prove the theorem when $E$ is trapped between two tilted (not horizontal) planes $E(p, q)$. We can suppose $E$ is contained a tilted slab $S$ of the form, for some $c_{1}>0$ :

$$
S=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; y>0 \text { and }-c_{1} \leq p \tau t-q h x \leq c_{1}\right\}
$$

Since $S$ is converging to a vertical slab as $y \rightarrow \infty$, there is a $y_{0}>1$ so that if $p \in E, y(p) \geq y_{0}$, then the catenoid $C_{\ell}(p)$ in $B_{\rho}(p)$, has both its boundary circles outside of $S$. To see this, we use an isometry which leaves the slab $S$ invariant and takes $p \in E$ to a point $\tilde{p}=(x, y, 0)$. Observe that $S \cap\{|t| \leq 1\}$ is in a vertical slab bounded by $P\left(-c_{2}\right)$ and $P\left(c_{2}\right)$, where $c_{2}$ depends on $p \tau$ and $q h$. Then for any point $\tilde{p}=(x, y, 0)$ with $|x| \leq c_{2}, \mathcal{C}_{\ell}(\tilde{p}) \subset B_{\rho}(\tilde{p})$ has boundary circles outside of the slab bounded by $P(d)$ and $P(-d)$ for $d \geq c_{2}$, and $y$ greater than some $y_{0}$ (using that $(x, y, t) \rightarrow(\lambda x, \lambda y, t)$ is an isometry). This property is invariant by changing $\tilde{p}=(x, y, 0)$ to $p=(x+p \tau, y, t+q h)$.
We will prove that a sub-end of $E$ is transverse to $\frac{\partial}{\partial x}$ for large $y$. Suppose this is not the case. We proceed exactly as in the case $E$ is trapped between vertical planes to find $p_{1}, p_{2} \in E \cap B_{\rho}\left(q_{1}\right), q_{1}$ the center of a horizontal catenoid $F_{0}$, and $p_{1}, p_{2}$ can not
be joined by a path in $E$ that is inside $F_{0}$. The proof is modified in our choice of $\Gamma=\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}$, and a loop in $E$ passing through $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$.
We denote by $\vec{u}$ the unit vector director of the straight line $\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ; p \tau t-q h x=\right.$ 0 and $\left.y=y_{0}\right\}$. For a value $k_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ which depends on the diameter of the periodic boundary curve, we consider $\Gamma_{+}$be the euclidean segment joining $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $q_{1}+\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho\right) \vec{u}$, together with the segment joining $q_{1}+\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho\right) \vec{u}$ to $z=$ $\left(0, y_{0}, 0\right)+\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho\right) \vec{u}$. We connect the point $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ by an arc in $E$ which stays in a tubular neighborhood of $\Gamma_{+} \cup \partial E$.
Let $\Gamma_{-}$be the segment from $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)-\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho\right) \vec{u}$, together with the segment joining $\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)-\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho\right) \vec{u}$ to $z=\left(0, y_{0}, 0\right)-\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho\right) \vec{u}$. We connect the point $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ by an arc in $E$ which stays in a tubular neighborhood of $\Gamma_{-} \cup \partial E$.
Then the argument is the same to obtain a contradiction with $\Gamma=\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}$.
Ends of type $(p, 0)$, horizontal planes. Let $E$ be a half-plane end (lifting of $A \subset \mathcal{M})$ to $\mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R}$, between the planes $t= \pm d$, with $\partial E \subset\{y=1\}, \partial E$ invariant by the isometry $(x, y, t) \rightarrow(x+\tau, y, t)$. By proposition 7.2 , we can assume $t \rightarrow 0$ on $E$ as $y \rightarrow \infty$. So for $y_{0}$ large, the sub-end of $E$ given by $y \geq y_{0}$ is between planes $t= \pm c$ for any small $c>0$.
Let $\eta$ be a circle of radius one in $\{t=c\}$ and let $\eta_{-}$be $\eta$ translated vertically to a circle in $\{t=-c\}$. for $c$ small enough, $\eta \cup \eta_{-}$bounds a stable (rotational) annulus $F_{0}$. $F_{0}$ is a bigraph over $\{t=0\}$. Now we assume $y_{0}$ chosen so that $E$ is between $t= \pm c$ for $y \geq y_{0}$ and then $\partial F_{0} \subset\{t= \pm c\}$.
As in section 6 , where $E$ was trapped between two vertical planes and $F_{0}$ was a horizontal catenoid, we define $B_{\rho}(q), \mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ in the same manner, with $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ a vertical catenoid. We choose $y_{0}$ large enough so that $E$ is between $t= \pm \ell / 2$ and $\mathcal{C}_{\ell}$ has its boundary circles in $t= \pm \ell$ for $y \geq y_{0}+3$.
Suppose $p$ is in $E, y(p) \geq y(0)+3$, and $E$ has a vertical tangent plane at $p$. Then one places a vertical catenoid $F_{0}$ to be tangent to $E$ at $p$ (after a small translation) and one obtains $p_{1}, p_{2} \in E \cap B_{\rho}(q), q$ the center of $F_{0}$, such that $p_{1}, p_{2}$ can not be joined by a path in $E$ that is inside $F_{0}$.
For a value $k_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ which depends on the diameter of the periodic boundary curve, we consider $\Gamma_{+}$be the euclidean segment joining $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho, y_{1}, 0\right)$, together with the segment joining $\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $z=\left(k_{0} h+2 \rho, y_{0}, 0\right)$. We connect the points $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ by an arc in $E$ which stays in a tubular neighborhood of $\Gamma_{+} \cup \partial E$.
Let $\Gamma_{-}$be the segment from $q_{1}=\left(0, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $\left(-k_{0} h-2 \rho, y_{1}, 0\right)$, together with the segment joining $\left(-k_{0} h-2 \rho, y_{1}, 0\right)$ to $z=\left(-k_{0} h-2 \rho, y_{0}, 0\right)$. We connect the point $p_{1}$ and $p_{2}$ by an arc in $E$ which stays in a tubular neighborhood of $\Gamma_{-} \cup \partial E$. We apply now the same argument to obtain a contradiction.
Finite total curvature. We proved that a minimal annulus is trapped in Slab and is a killing multigraph outside a compact set $K_{0} \subset M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$. These graphs are stable, hence they have bounded Gaussian curvature. They are contained in a euclidean slab whose hyperbolic width tends to zero at infinity.

In the horizontal case with $A$ asymptotic to $A_{(p, 0)}$, the end $A$ has a limit for its third coordinate. Since the curvature is bounded, $A$ is a vertical graph of a function $f: A_{(p, 0)} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, with $f$ converging to 0 in a $\mathcal{C}^{2}$ manner. The end $A$ is converging to the cusp $\mathcal{C} \times\{0\}$ and the curve $\mathbb{T}(y) \cap A=\gamma(y)$ is a topological circle converging to a finite covering of a quotient $c(y) /[\psi]$. The curve $\gamma(y)$ has uniform bounded curvature and its length goes to zero. Thus $\int_{\gamma(y)} k_{g} d s \rightarrow 0$ as $y \rightarrow \infty$.
In the case of ends of type $(0, q)$ and $(p, q)$, the ends are horizontal multi-graphs on some $A(0, p)$. Since $A$ converges in a $\mathcal{C}^{2}$ manner to $A(p, 0)$, the curves $\gamma(y)=\mathbb{T}(y) \cap A$ converge to a finite covering of a quotient of a vertical geodesic by the translation $T(h)$. This implies that the curvature of $\gamma(y)$ converges uniformly to zero as $y \rightarrow \infty$. We apply the Gauss-Bonnet formula on an exhaustion of $M \times \mathcal{S}^{1}$ by a sequence of compact $K_{n}$, with boundary of $K_{n}$ the union of mean curvature one tori $\mathbb{T}_{1}(n), \ldots, \mathbb{T}_{k}(n)$, in each end $\mathcal{M} \subset M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$ and $\gamma_{k, n}=\mathbb{T}_{k}(n) \cap \Sigma$.

$$
\int_{K_{n} \cap S} K d A+\int_{\gamma(k, n)} k_{g} d s=2 \pi \chi(\Sigma) .
$$

When $n \rightarrow \infty$, the integral of the curvature on $\gamma(k, n)$ tends to zero and we obtain the finite total curvature formula

$$
\int_{S} K d A=2 \pi \chi(\Sigma)
$$

## 9. Proof of the theorem in $N$

Now we complete the proof of the Theorem 1.1 when the ambient space is $N$. The idea is the same as in $M \times \mathbb{S}^{1}$. Let $A$ be an annular end in $\mathcal{M}(-1)$, minimal and properly immersed. By Lemma 4.1 (the same proof) we can suppose $A \subset \cup_{y \geq 1} \mathbb{T}(y), \partial A$ is an immersed closed curve and $A$ is transverse to $\mathbb{T}(1)$ along $\partial A$. Let $E$ be a connected lift of $A$ to $\mathbb{H}^{3}$, so $\partial E \subset\left\{(x, 1, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3}\right\}$. Observe that $E$ is a half-plane, not an annulus. Suppose, on the contrary that $E$ is an immersed annulus, so $\partial E \subset\left\{(x, 1, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3}\right\}$ is compact. Let $D$ be the convex hull of $\left\{(x, 0, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ;(x, 1, t) \in \partial E\right\}$ in the $y=0$ plane. Let $L$ be a line of the plane $Q=\{y=0\}$, disjoint from $D$.
Let $C$ be a small circle in $Q$ in the half-space $\mathcal{H}$ of $Q-L$ disjoint from $D . \quad C$ bounds a totally geodesic hyperbolic plane in $\mathbb{H}^{3}$ (it is a hemisphere orthogonal to $Q$ along $C$ in our model). For $C$ small, this plane is disjoint from $E$. Let the circle $C$ grow in $\mathcal{H}$ and converge to $L$. By the maximum principle, there is no first contact point of the planes bounded by these circles with $E$ (the planes do not touch $\partial E$ ). Since the hyperbolic planes bounded by the circles converge to $L \times \mathbb{R}^{+}$, it follows that $E$ is on one side of $L \times \mathbb{R}^{+}$. Hence $E$ is contained in the cylinder Cyl $=\left\{(x, y, t) \in \mathbb{R}^{3} ;(x, 0, t) \in \partial D, y>0\right\}$.
For $y$ large, the diameter of Cyl tends to zero; i.e. the diameter of $\mathrm{Cyl} \cap\{y=$ const $\}$ tends to zero. So we could touch $E$ by a catenoid at an interior point of $E$; a contradiction.

Now we know $E$ is a half-plane. After an isometry of $\mathbb{H}^{3}$, we can assume $\partial E$ is invariant under the parabolic isometry: $(x, y, t) \rightarrow(x+\tau, y, t)$, and $\partial E \subset\{y=1\}$. so the $t$ coordinate is bounded on $\partial E$. The same convex hull argument as in the previous annular case, then shows the $t$ coordinate has the same bound on $E ;|t| \leq c$, for some $c>0$, (one takes $L$ to be a horizontal line in $\{y=0\}$, above height $c$, and considers circles $C$ in $\{y=0\}$ above $L$. When $C$ converges to $L$ in $\{y=0\}$, the hyperbolic planes in $\mathbb{H}^{3}$ bounded by $C$, are disjoint from $E$ and converge to $L \times \mathbb{R}^{+}$). So $E$ is trapped between two horizontal planes $t= \pm c$.
The distance between these horizontal planes tends to zero as $y \rightarrow \infty$. Now we will prove that for $y$ large, the killing field $\frac{\partial}{\partial t}$ is transverse to $E$. hence a sub-end of $E$ has bounded curvature. This will complete the proof as follows. The sub-end is a vertical graph over the plane $t=0$, that converges to zero in the $\mathcal{C}^{2}$-topology. The graph function is the distance to the plane $t=0$. Thus the geodesic curvature of the curve in $E$, given by $\mathrm{Cyl}=E \cap\{y=$ constant $\}$ is bounded. Also the length of this curve $C_{y}$ tends to zero in $C_{y}$ modulo $(x, y, t) \rightarrow(x+\tau, y, t)$. This yields the formula for the finite total curvature of $\Sigma$ in $N$ : apply Gauss-Bonnet to the compact part of $\Sigma$ bounded by the curves $C_{y}$ in the ends and let $y \rightarrow \infty$.
Thus it suffices to prove $E$ is transverse to $\frac{\partial}{\partial t}$ for $y$ large. The proof of this is the same as in section 8, for an end trapped between two horizontall planes. More precisely, for an end $E$ in $\mathcal{M}$ between two horizontal planes that are close, the distance between the planes $|t|=c$ tends to zero as $y \rightarrow \infty$, so one can put a vertical catenoid $F_{0}$, whose boundary circles are of radius one and in the horizontal planes $|t|=d>c$, when the center $q$ of $F_{0}$ has $y(q)$ larger than some $y_{0}$.
One chooses $\rho, \ell$ as in Sections 6 and 8, and using the Dragging lemma, one shows that if $E$ has a vertical tangent plane at $p, y(p)$ large, then one finds $p_{1}, p_{2} \in B_{\rho}(q) \cap E$, that can not be joined by a path in $E \cap F_{0}^{-}$. One defines $\Gamma=\Gamma_{+} \cup \Gamma_{-}$and the same proof now gives a contradiction.

## References

[1] T.H. Colding.;W.P. Minicozzi, II The space of embedded minimal surfaces of fixed genus in a 3-manifold. I. Estimates off the axis for disks. Ann. of Math. (2) 160 (2004), no. 1, 27-68.
[2] P. Collin; H. Rosenberg, Construction of harmonic diffeomorphisms and minimal graphs, Annals of Mathematics (172) (2010), Issue 3, 1879-1906.
[3] B. Daniel, Isometric immersions into $\mathbb{S}^{n} \times \mathbb{R}$ and $\mathbb{H}^{n} \times \mathbb{R}$ and applications to minimal surfaces. Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 361 (2009), no. 12, 6255-6282.
[4] R. Gulliver, Removability of singular points on surfaces of bounded mean curvature. J. Differential Geometry 11 (1976), no. 3, 345-350.
[5] L. Hauswirth, Minimal surfaces of Riemann type in three-dimensional product manifolds. Pacific J. Math. 224 (2006), no. 1, 91-117.
[6] D. Hoffman;W.H. Meeks, III ,The strong halfspace theorem for minimal surfaces. Invent. Math. 101 (1990), no. 2, 373-377.
[7] R. Sa Earp; E. Toubiana, Screw motion surfaces in $\mathbb{S}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$ and $\mathbb{H}^{2} \times \mathbb{R}$. Illinois J. Math. 49 (2005), no. 4, 1323-1362.
[8] L. Mazet, M. Rodriguez and H. Rosenberg, Periodic constant mean curvature surfaces in $\mathbb{H} \times \mathbb{R}$, preprint.
P.Collin, Institut de mathématiques de Toulouse, Université Paul Sabatier, 118, route de Narbonne, 31062 Toulouse cedex ,France
E-mail address: collin@math.ups-tlse.fr
L. Hauswirth, Université Paris-Est, LAMA (UMR 8050), UPEMLV, UPEC, CNRS, F77454, Marne-la-Vallée, France
E-mail address: hauswirth@univ-mlv.fr
H. Rosenberg, Instituto Nacional de Matematica Pura e Aplicada (IMPA) Estrada Dona Castorina 110, 22460-320, Rio de Janeiro-RJ, Brazil
E-mail address: rosen@impa.br


[^0]:    The authors were partially supported by the ANR-11-IS01-0002 grant. December 3, 2018.

