Fake exponential Brownian motion

David Hobson

University of Warwick, Coventry CV4 7AL, UK.

October 4, 2012

Abstract

We construct a fake exponential Brownian motion, a continuous martingale different from classical exponential Brownian motion but with the same marginal distributions, thus extending results of Albin and Oleszkiewicz for fake Brownian motions. The ideas extend to other diffusions.

1 The problem

Brownian motion is a martingale with centred Gaussian marginals, and variance t. Hamza and Klebaner [9] asked, are there other real-valued martingale processes with the same univariate marginals as Brownian motion? Since Dupire [5] has shown that Brownian motion is the unique martingale diffusion with $\mathcal{N}(0,t)$ marginals, finding alternative martingales with the same marginals involves relaxing either the continuity assumption, or the Markov property.

Hamza and Klebaner [9] answered their question in the positive, but it turns out that Madan and Yor [17] had already provided a construction based on the Azéma-Yor solution of the Skorokhod embedding problem. Both the Madan and Yor [17] and Hamza and Klebaner [9] constructions are discontinuous processes. However, Albin [1] produced an ingenious solution to the problem with continuous paths, based on products of Bessel process. Subsequently, Oleszkiewicz [18] produced a simpler construction which is extremely natural and is based on mixing and the Box-Jenkins simulation of a Gaussian variable. Oleszkiewicz also introduced the evocative term *fake Brownian motion* to describe a (continuous) martingale with the same univariate marginal distributions as Brownian motion.

Now that there has been serious study of fake Brownian motion it seems reasonable to ask if there exist fake versions of other canonical martingales. In a related context, Hirsch et al [12] give several general methods of constructing processes with given marginals, but none is quite suited to the problem we consider here. In particular, in this article we provide a family of fake exponential Brownian motions: we give a martingale stochastic process with continuous paths and with lognormal marginals matching those of exponential Brownian motion, which is not exponential Brownian motion. The ideas apply to other timehomogeneous diffusions. One reason for interest in fake processes in this sense comes from mathematical finance, see Hobson [11]. In finance knowledge of a continuum of option prices of a fixed maturity (one for each possible strike) is equivalent to knowledge of the marginal distribution of the underlying financial asset under the pricing measure. This result dates back to Breeden and Litzenberger [3]. Knowledge of the prices of options for the continuum of strikes and maturities is equivalent to knowledge of all the marginals of the underlying financial asset, but implies nothing about the finite-dimensional distributions. (However, general theory tells us that the asset price, suitably discounted, must be a martingale, again under the pricing measure.) In finance we often have knowledge of option prices, but we have little reason to believe in any particular model. The canonical model in finance is the Osborne-Samuelson-Black-Scholes formula. The fact that we can provide alternative martingale models with the same marginals, and therefore which support the same option prices, shows that there is no unique model which is consistent with those prices.

Let δ_x denote the unit mass at x. Suppose $P = (P_t)_{t\geq 0}$ is exponential Brownian motion, scaled such that $P_0 = 1$, and with drift parameter chosen such that P is a martingale. Setting volatility equal to one we may assume that P solves $dP_t/P_t = dB_t$. Let $(\nu_t)_{t\geq 0}$ be the family of laws of $(P_t)_{t\geq 0}$ with lognormal densities $(p_t(\cdot))_{t>0}$ where

$$p_t(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \frac{e^{-t/8}}{t^{1/2}} \frac{e^{-(\ln x)^2/2t}}{x^{3/2}}.$$
(1)

We write $\nu_t \sim \mathcal{L}(P_t) \sim p_t(\cdot)$. Following Hamza and Klebaner we ask does there exist a continuous martingale with marginals $(\nu_t)_{t\geq 0}$, which is distinct from exponential Brownian motion? The main goal of this note is to show that the answer to this question is positive.

For the general diffusion case, let $X = (X_t)_{t\geq 0}$ be a time-homogeneous martingale diffusion so that Xsolves $dX_t = \sigma(X_t)dB_t$ subject to $X_0 = x_0$. Let $I \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ be the state space of X and let μ_t^X , with associated density $f_t(\cdot)$, be the law of X_t . Assume that the boundary points of I are not attainable so that $I = (\ell, r)$ where $-\infty \leq l < x_0 < r \leq \infty$ and that σ is positive and continuously differentiable on the interior of I. Further, we suppose that $f_t(x)$ is continuously differentiable in both x and t. This is automatically satisfied for Brownian motion and exponential Brownian motion and by results of Rogers [20] is also satisfied if σ is thrice continuously differentiable and $\int_{\ell} \frac{1}{\sigma(x)} dx = \infty = \int_{0}^{r} \frac{1}{\sigma(x)} dx$.

Our goal is to describe a fake version of X, where a fake version of the martingale X is a continuous martingale $\tilde{X} = (\tilde{X}_t)_{t\geq 0}$ such that $\mathcal{L}(\tilde{X}_t) \sim \mu_t^X$, which is distinct from X.

Using Jensen's inequality and the martingale property of X we can deduce that the family $(\mu_t^X)_{t\geq 0}$ must be increasing in convex order. Further, the results of Kellerer [14] imply that the fact that a family of measures is increasing in convex order is necessary and sufficient for there to be a martingale with those marginals. Of course, such a process need not be a diffusion. For a time-homogeneous diffusion we have the following result, which follows from Tanaka's formula (Revuz and Yor [19, Theorem 6.1.2]), the fact that $\int_0^t I_{\{X_s \geq x\}} dX_s$ is a martingale, and an application of Fubini's Theorem. **Lemma 1.1** (Carr and Jarrow [4], Klebaner [15]). Suppose $\sigma(.)$ is continuous. Then

$$\mathbb{E}[(X_T - x)^+] = (x_0 - x)^+ + \frac{\sigma(x)^2}{2} \int_0^T f_t(x) dt$$

2 Fake solutions based on Skorokhod embeddings

Given a stochastic process X on a state space E, and a probability law μ on E, the Skorokhod embedding problem [23] is to find a stopping time τ such that $X_{\tau} \sim \mu$. In the simplest Brownian case, the problem becomes, given Brownian motion null at zero and a centred, square-integrable probability measure μ on \mathbb{R} , to find a stopping time τ such that $B_{\tau} \sim \mu$ and $\mathbb{E}[\tau]$ is finite (and then necessarily $\mathbb{E}[\tau] = \int x^2 \mu(dx)$).

There are a multiplicity of solutions of the Skorokhod embedding problem for Brownian motion. Many of these solutions are based on considering the bivariate process $(B_t, A_t)_{t\geq 0}$ where A is some increasing additive functional, null at 0. Then the solution of the embedding problem is to take $\tau \equiv \tau_{\mu}^A = \inf\{t > 0 : (B_t, A_t) \in \mathcal{D}_{\mu}^A\}$ where \mathcal{D}_{μ} is some appropriate domain in $\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}_+$. In particular the solutions of {Root [21], Rost [22], Azéma-Yor [2], Vallois [24, 25]} are based on the choices A. equals {time, time, the maximum process, the local time} respectively.

These constructions are suggestive of a direct construction of a discontinuous fake martingale diffusion $\tilde{X} = (\tilde{X}_t)_{t\geq 0}$. Fix an additive functional A and let $\mathcal{D}_t \equiv \mathcal{D}_{\mu_t^X}^A$ denote the domain such that $\tau_t \equiv \tau_{\mu_t^X}^A$ is a solution of the Skorokhod embedding problem for μ_t^X in Brownian motion. Then provided the stopping times τ_t are non-decreasing in t, or equivalently provided the stopping domains \mathcal{D}_t are decreasing in t, the process \tilde{X} given by $\tilde{X}_t = B_{\tau_t}$ is a martingale with the required distributions. All that remains is to check that the regions \mathcal{D}_t are indeed decreasing in t.

In general, the fact that a family of distributions $(\mu_t^X)_{t\geq 0}$ is increasing in convex order is not sufficient to guarantee that the associated domains \mathcal{D}_t are decreasing in t, and for any specific additive functional and associated construction of the solution to the Skorokhod embedding problem this needs to be checked.

Madan and Yor [17] use this approach and the Azéma-Yor solution to describe a discontinuous fake diffusion. The condition that \mathcal{D}_t is decreasing in t is restated as the fact that the marginal distributions are increasing in residual mean life order (equivalently, the barycentre functions are increasing in t). It can be checked that this property holds for the lognormal family of distributions so that the Madan and Yor [17] construction gives a fake exponential Brownian motion. Similarly, the Root, Röst, and Vallois constructions all extend from the univariate case for a single marginal, to give fake exponential Brownian motions. However, in all cases the resulting process is discontinuous.

3 Continuous Fake exponential Brownian motion

Let $X = (X_t)_{t\geq 0}$ be the solution of an Itô stochastic differential equation, and let $\mu_t^X \sim \mathcal{L}(X_t)$. Then Gyöngy [8] showed that there is a diffusion process $Y = (Y_t)_{t\geq 0}$ such that $\mathcal{L}(Y_t) \sim \mu_t^X$. In a related result, Dupire [5] showed that if the family of distributions $(\mu_t)_{t\geq 0}$ is increasing in convex order, and if the associated call price functional $C(t, x) = \int_{\mathbb{R}} (y - x)\mu_t(dy)$ is sufficiently regular (in particular, C is $C^{1,2}$ and has certain limiting properties for large x) then there is a time-inhomogeneous martingale diffusion Y solving $dY_t = \eta(t, Y_t)dW_t$ such that $\mathcal{L}(Y_t) \sim \mu_t$. The coefficient η is given by $\eta(t, y)^2 = 2\frac{\partial C(t, y)}{\partial t} / \frac{\partial^2 C(t, y)}{\partial^2 y}$. We call the process Y associated with the family $(\mu_t)_{t\geq 0}$ the Dupire diffusion.

Given a process whose univariate marginals coincide with those of exponential Brownian motion, both Gyöngy and Dupire show how to construct a diffusion process whose marginals are lognormal. However, in both cases the resulting process is exponential Brownian motion itself. Instead, in this note we give a family of continuous martingales which are not exponential Brownian motion but which share the lognormal univariate marginal distributions of exponential Brownian motion. The process we construct is a mixture of two well-chosen martingales.

Let $X = (X_t)_{t\geq 0}$ be some time-homogeneous martingale diffusion such that $X_0 = x_0$ and for t > 0, $\mathcal{L}(X_t) \sim f_t(\cdot)$. The idea is to try to write $f_t(x) = cg_t(x) + (1-c)h_t(x)$ for a constant $c \in (0,1)$ and a pair of families $\{(g_t)_{t>0}, (h_t)_{t>0}\}$ such that for each t, g_t and h_t are the densities of random variables with mean x_0 , and such that if μ_t^G (respectively μ_t^H) is the law of a random variable with density g_t (respectively h_t), and if $\mu_0^G = \delta_{x_0} = \mu_0^H$, then the family $(\mu_t^G)_{t\geq 0}$ (respectively $(\mu_t^H)_{t\geq 0}$) is increasing in convex order. Then, if $G = (G_t)_{t\geq 0}$ (respectively $H = (H_t)_{t\geq 0}$) is the Dupire diffusion associated with the family of laws $(\mu_t^G)_{t\geq 0}$ (respectively $(\mu_t^H)_{t\geq 0}$) and if $\tilde{X} = (\tilde{X})_{t\geq 0}$ is defined by $\tilde{X}_t = G_t I_{\{Z^c=1\}} + H_t I_{\{Z^c=0\}}$ then \tilde{X} is a fake version of X. Here Z^c is a Bernoulli random variable which is independent of G and H, is known at time 0, and is such that $\mathbb{P}(Z^c = 1) = c$, where $c \in (0, 1)$.

It remains to show that we can construct the families $\{(g_t)_{t>0}, (h_t)_{t>0}\}$ and that the resulting process is not X itself. For this we need the family $(\mu_t^G)_{t\geq 0}$ to be increasing (in convex order), but not too quickly as that will mean there is no 'room' for the family $(\mu_t^H)_{t\geq 0}$ to be increasing.

The final simplifying idea is to suppose that G is a time change of X, $G_t = X_{a(t)}$. By choosing a to be an increasing, differentiable process we automatically get the existence of G. If further we require that $\dot{a} < 1$ we can hope that the family $(\mu_t^H)_{t\geq 0}$ is also increasing in convex order.

Proposition 3.1. Suppose a(t) is a strictly increasing, twice continuously differentiable function, null at 0, with $\dot{a}(t) < 1$ for t > 0, and define

$$K = \inf_{t>0} \inf_{y \in I} \frac{f_t(y)}{f_{a(t)}(y)}.$$

Suppose K > 0. Fix $c \in (0, K)$ and for t > 0 set

$$h_t(y) = \frac{1}{1-c} \left\{ f_t(y) - c f_{a(t)}(y) \right\}.$$

Then $(h_t)_{t>0}$ is a family of densities which is increasing in convex order.

Moreover, there exists a martingale diffusion H such that $\mathcal{L}(H_t) \sim h_t(\cdot)$.

Proof. From the definition of c we have that h_t is non-negative and it is immediate that $h_t(y)$ integrates to one so that h_t is the density of a continuous random variable. Further, since f_t corresponds to a mean x_0 random variable, so does h_t .

Let $(\tilde{H}_t)_{t>0}$ be a family of random variables such that $\mathcal{L}(\tilde{H}_t) \sim h_t(\cdot)$. By Lemma 1.1 and the hypotheses of the proposition,

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \mathbb{E}[(\tilde{H}_t - x)^+] = \frac{1}{1 - c} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \mathbb{E}\left[(X_t - x)^+ - c(X_{a(t)} - x)^+\right]$$

$$= \frac{1}{1 - c} \sigma(x)^2 \left(f_t(x) - c\dot{a}(t)f_{a(t)}(x)\right) > 0.$$
(2)

Hence the family $(h_t)_{t>0}$ is a family of densities which is increasing in convex order.

Define

$$\eta(t,y)^2 = \sigma(y)^2 \frac{f_t(y) - c\dot{a}(t)f_{a(t)}(y)}{f_t(y) - cf_{a(t)}(y)}.$$
(3)

and let H be a weak solution of $dH_t = \eta(t, H_t)dB_t$ subject to $H_0 = x_0$. By our assumptions the solution to this SDE is unique in law. Moreover we have

$$1 \le \frac{\eta(t,y)^2}{\sigma(y)^2} < \frac{f_t(y)}{f_t(y) - cf_{a(t)}(y)} \le L^2$$

where $L^2 = K/(K-c)$. Further, X^L given by $X_t^L = X_{L^2t}$ is a martingale and solves $dX_t^L = \sigma_L(X_t^L)dB_t$ where $\sigma_L(x) = L\sigma(x)$. Then, $\eta(t,y) \leq \sigma_L(y)$ and by Theorem 3 of Hajek [10], we can find an increasing time-change Γ with $\Gamma_t \leq t$ such that $\hat{H}_t = X_{\Gamma_t}^L$ solves $d\hat{H}_t = \eta(t, \hat{H}_t)dB_t$. Hence, by the uniqueness in law of solutions to this equation, H is a martingale.

Suppose that X is non-negative (the case where X is bounded above or below reduces to this case after a reflection and/or a shift.) Define $C_h : [0, \infty) \times [0, \infty) \mapsto \mathbb{R}$ via $C_h(0, y) = (x_0 - y)^+$ and for t > 0, $C_h(t, y) = \int (z - y)^+ h_t(z) dz$. Then, using (2) we deduce that C_h solves Dupire's equation

$$\frac{1}{2}\eta(t,y)^2 C''(t,y) = \dot{C}(t,y)$$
(4)

subject to

$$C(0,y) = (x_0 - y)^+, \ C(0,t) = x_0, \ 0 \le C \le x_0.$$
(5)

Indeed, by an argument similar to that in Ekström and Tysk [6, Step 5 of the proof of Theorem 2.2] C_h is the unique solution of (4) satisfying (5).

However, by the results of Dupire [5] and Klebaner [15] $C_H(t, y) = \mathbb{E}[(H_t - y)^+]$ also solves (4) and (5) and hence, $\mathcal{L}(H_t) \sim h_t(\cdot)$.

Now consider the case where X the range of X is the whole real line. Let η and H be as before. Fix $\overline{T} \in (0, \infty)$. Let $C_h : [0, \overline{T}] \times \mathbb{R} \mapsto \mathbb{R}$ be the solution of (4) subject to

$$C(0,y) = (x_0 - y)^+, \sup_{t \le \overline{T}} \lim_{y \uparrow \pm \infty} C_t(t,y) - (x_0 - y)^+ = 0, \ (x_0 - y)^+ \le C_h(t,y) \le (x_0 - y)^+ + J, \quad (6)$$

where $J = J(\overline{T}) = \frac{\mathbb{E}[(X_L 2\overline{T} - x_0)^+]}{1-c}$. By a small modification of the arguments of Ekström and Tysk [6] to allow for the fact that we are working with real-valued processes, it follows that the solution to this equation is unique. But $C_H(t, y) = \mathbb{E}[(H_t - y)^+]$ also solves (4) and $(x_0 - y)^+ \leq C_H(t, y) \leq \mathbb{E}[(X_L^2 t - y)^+]$ and hence $\mathcal{L}(H_t) \sim h_t$ for $t \leq \overline{T}$. Since \overline{T} is arbitrary, the result follows for all t. **Theorem 3.2.** Let G be given by $G_t = X_{a(t)}$ and let H be the Dupire diffusion associated with the family of densities $(h_t)_{t>0}$. Then

$$X_t = G_t I_{\{Z^c = 1\}} + H_t I_{\{Z^c = 0\}}$$

is a fake version of X.

Proof. If $\tilde{f}_t(x)$ denotes the time-t density of \tilde{X} we have that

$$\hat{f}_t(x) = cg_t(x) + (1-c)h_t(x) = cf_{a(t)}(x) + (1-c)h_t(x) = f_t(x).$$

and X_t has the same distribution as X.

Since G and H are martingales, so is \tilde{X} . But the quadratic variations of X and \tilde{X} are different and hence \tilde{X} is a fake version of X.

Example 3.3 (Fake Brownian motion). In this case

$$\frac{f_t(y)}{f_{a(t)}(y)} = \sqrt{\frac{a(t)}{t}} e^{y^2/2[1/a(t)-1/t]} \ge \sqrt{\frac{a(t)}{t}}.$$

Fix $c \in (0,1)$ and choose $a(t)/t > c^2$ with $\dot{a}(t) \le 1$, for example $a(t) = K^2 t$ for some $K \in (c,1)$.

Example 3.4 (Fake exponential Brownian motion). Recall the density given in (1). Then

$$\min_{x>0} \frac{f_t(x)}{f_{a(t)}(x)} = \min_{x>0} \sqrt{\frac{a(t)}{t}} e^{[a(t)-t]/8} e^{(\ln x)^2 [1/a(t)-1/t]/2} = \sqrt{\frac{a(t)}{t}} e^{[a(t)-t]/8} = \frac{\psi(a(t))}{\psi(t)}$$

where ψ is the increasing function $\psi(t) = \sqrt{t}e^{t/8}$. Fix $K \in (0,1)$ and set $a(t) = \psi^{-1}(K\psi(t))$. Then a(t) < t and $\dot{a}(t) = \phi(t)/\phi(a(t))$ where ϕ is the decreasing function $\phi(t) = \frac{t+4}{8t}$, so that $\dot{a} < 1$ for t > 0.

Remark 3.5. The argument can be extended to cover the case where the original process X is a timeinhomogeneous martingale diffusion $dX_t = \sigma(t, X_t)dB_t$ provided k > 0 where

$$k := \inf_{t>0} \inf_{y \in I} \left\{ \frac{f_t(y)}{f_{a(t)}(y)} \wedge \frac{f_t(y)\sigma(t,y)^2}{f_{a(t)}(y)\sigma(a(t),y)^2} \right\}$$

References

- Albin, J. M. P.; A continuous non-Brownian motion martingale with Brownian motion martingale distributions, Statistics and Probability Letters, 78, 6, 682–686. 2008.
- [2] Azéma, J. and Yor, M.; Une solution simple au problème de Skorokhod, Séminaire de Probabilités, XIII, Lecture Notes in Math., 721, 90–115, Springer, Berlin, 1979.
- Breeden, D.T. and Litzenberger, R.H.; Prices of state-contingent claims implicit in options prices, J. Business, 51, 621–651, 1978.

- [4] Carr, P. and Jarrow, R.A.; The stop-loss start-gain paradox and option valuation: a new decomposition into intrinsic and time-value. *Rev. Fin. Stud.* 3, 469–492, 1990.
- [5] Dupire, B.; Pricing and hedging with smiles, Risk Magazine, 18–20, 1997.
- [6] Ekström, E. And Tysk, J.; Dupire's equation for bubbles, to appear in Inter. J. Theor. Appl. Finance, 2012.
- [7] Jie Yen Fan, Hamza, K. and Klebaner, F.C.; Mimicking self-similar processes. Preprint, 2012.
- [8] Gyöngy, I.; Mimicking the one-dimensional marginal distributions of processes having an Itô differential, Prob. Th. Rel. Fields, 71, 501–516, 1986.
- Hamza, K. and Klebaner, F.C.; A family of non-Gaussian martingales with Gaussian marginals. J. Appl. Math. and Stochastic Analysis, Article Id 92723, 2007.
- [10] Hajek, B.; Mean stochastic comparison of diffusions. Z. Wahr. verw. Gebiete 68, 315–329, 1985.
- [11] Hobson, D.G.; The Skorokhod Embedding Problem and Model-Independent Bounds for Option Prices. Paris-Princeton Lectures on Mathematical Finance, 2010. 267–318. Springer, LNM 2003, 2011.
- [12] Hirsch, F., Profeta, C., Roynette, B. and Yor, M.; Peacocks and Associated martingales with explicit constructions. Springer, Milan, 2011.
- [13] Jourdain, B.; Stochastic flow approach to Dupire's formula. Finance Stoch. 11, 521-535, 2007.
- [14] Kellerer, H.G.; Markov-Komposition und eine Andwendung auf Martingale, Math. Ann. 198, 99–122, 1972.
- [15] Klebaner, F.C.; Option pricing when the stock is a semimartingale. *Elect. Comm. Probab.* 7, 79-83, 2002.
- [16] Krylov, N.V.; On the relation between differential operators of second order and the solutions of differential equations. *Steklov Seminar 1984* Ed N.V. Krylov et al, Inc. Publications Division, New York, 214–229, 1985.
- [17] Madan, D. B. and Yor, M.; Making Markov martingales meet marginals: with explicit constructions, *Bernoulli*, 8, 4, 509–536, 2002.
- [18] Oleszkiewicz, K.; On fake Brownian motions. *Statistics and Probability Letters*, **78**, 1251–1254, 2008.
- [19] Revuz, D. and Yor, M.; Continuous martingales and Brownian motion. 3rd Edition. Springer, Berlin. 1999.
- [20] Rogers, L.C.G.; Smooth transition densities for one-dimensional diffusions, Bull. London Math. Soc., 17, 157– 161, 1985.
- [21] Root, D. H., The existence of certain stopping times on Brownian motion, Ann. Math. Statist., 40, 715–718, 1969.
- [22] Rost, H., Skorokhod stopping times of minimal variance, Séminaire de Probabilités, X 194–208, 1976,
- [23] Skorokhod, A. V., Studies in the theory of random processes, Addison-Wesley, Reading, Mass., 1965,

- [24] Vallois, P., Le problème de Skorokhod sur R: une approche avec le temps local, Séminaire de Probabilités, XVII, 227–239, 1983.
- [25] Vallois, P., Quelques inégalités avec le temps local en zero du mouvement Brownien, Stochastic Process. Appl., 41, 117–155, 1992.