

Necessary and Sufficient Condition for Stability of Generalized Expectation Value

Aziz El Kaabouchi¹ and Sumiyoshi Abe^{1,2}

¹ *Institut Supérieur des Matériaux et Mécaniques Avancés, 44 F. A. Bartholdi,*

72000 Le Mans, France

² *Department of Physical Engineering, Mie University, Mie 514-8507, Japan*

A class of generalized definitions of expectation value is often employed in nonequilibrium statistical mechanics for complex systems. Here, the necessary and sufficient condition is presented for such a class to be stable under small deformations of a given arbitrary probability distribution.

Given a probability distribution $\{p_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$, i.e., $0 \leq p_i \leq 1$ ($i = 1, 2, \dots, W$) and $\sum_{i=1}^W p_i = 1$, the ordinary expectation value of a quantity Q of a system under consideration is defined by $\sum_{i=1}^W p_i Q_i$, where W is the total number of accessible states and is enormously large in statistical mechanics, typically being $2^{10^{23}}$. In the field of generalized statistical mechanics for complex systems, on the other hand, discussions are often made about altering this definition. Among others, the so-called “escort average” is widely employed in the field of generalized statistical mechanics [1-3]. It is defined as follows:

$$\langle Q \rangle_\phi [p] = \sum_{i=1}^W P_i^{(\phi)} Q_i, \quad (1)$$

where $P_i^{(\phi)}$ stands for the escort probability distribution [4] given by

$$P_i^{(\phi)} = \frac{\phi(p_i)}{\sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p_j)}, \quad (2)$$

with a nonnegative function ϕ . In the special case when $\phi(x) = x$, $\langle Q \rangle_\phi$ is reduced to the ordinary expectation value mentioned above.

Consider measurements of a certain quantity of a system to obtain information about the probability distribution. Repeated measurements should be performed on the system, which is identically prepared each time. Suppose that two probability distributions, $\{p_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$ and $\{p'_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$, are obtained through the measurements. They may

slightly be different from each other, in general. If such measurements make sense, then the expectation values, $\langle Q \rangle[p]$ and $\langle Q \rangle[p']$, calculated from these two distributions should also be close to each other. This condition, which implies “experimental robustness”, is represented as follows.

Definition (Stability). *An expectation value $\langle Q \rangle[p]$ is said to be stable, if the following predicate holds for any pair of probability distributions, $\{p_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$ and $\{p'_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$:*

$$(\forall \varepsilon > 0)(\exists \delta > 0)(\forall W)(\|p - p'\|_1 < \delta \Rightarrow |\langle Q \rangle[p] - \langle Q \rangle[p']| < \varepsilon). \quad (3)$$

Here, $\|p - p'\|_1 = \sum_{i=1}^W |p_i - p'_i|$ is the l^1 -norm describing the distance between these two probability distributions. One might consider norms of other kinds, but what is physically relevant to discrete systems is the present l^1 -norm [5]. Equation (3) is analogous to Lesche’s stability condition on entropic functionals [5], which has recently been revisited in the literature [6-11] (note that the discussion in Ref. [8] is corrected in Ref. [9]). This concept of stability is actually equivalent to that of uniform continuity.

In recent papers [12,13], it has been shown that the generalized expectation value in equation (1) with a specific class, $\phi(x) = x^q$ ($q > 0$), (the associated expectation value being termed the q -expectation value), is not stable unless $q = 1$. This result need the q -expectation-value formalism of nonextensive statistical mechanics [1,2] be reconsidered. In addition, the result is supported by Boltzmann-like kinetic theory in an independent manner [14].

Here, it seems appropriate to make some comments on the latest situation of the problems concerning stabilities of entropic functionals and generalized expectation values. The authors of Refs. [15,16] have presented discussions which aim to rescue the q -expectation values from the difficulties of their instability pointed out in Ref. [12]. Those authors insist that the q -expectation values can be stable in both the finite- W and continuous cases. Such possibilities are however fully refuted by the work in Ref. [13] both physically and mathematically, and the controversy seems to have been terminated with that work. The case of the continuous variables was further been carefully examined in a recent paper [17], where the so-called Tsallis q -entropies [1,2] do not have the continuous limit in consistency with the physical principles such as the thermodynamic laws (see also [18,19]). These controversies have led the researchers to give up the traditional form of nonextensive statistical mechanics based on the q -entropies and q -expectation values and to examine other entropic functionals combined with the ordinary definition of expectation values [20] (see also Refs. [21,22]). Thus, it seems that nonextensive statistical mechanics has to be fully reexamined, theoretically.

In this paper, we present the necessary and sufficient condition for $\langle Q \rangle_\phi[p]$ in equation (1) to be stable. This result is of obvious importance for generalized statistical mechanics for complex systems.

Our main result is as follows.

Theorem. *Let ϕ be nonnegative and continuous on $[0,1]$, differentiable on $(0,1)$, and satisfy the condition that $\phi(x)=0 \Leftrightarrow x=0$. And, let $Q = \{Q_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$ be a*

random variable. Then, $\langle Q \rangle_\phi[p]$ in equation (1) is stable, if and only if

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x) / x \in (0, \infty).$$

Proof. First, assume that $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x) / x = a > 0$. Then, there exists $\delta_1 > 0$ such that

$$a - \frac{a}{2} < \frac{\phi(x)}{x} < a + \frac{a}{2} \quad (\forall x \in (0, \delta_1]). \quad (4)$$

$\phi(x) / x$ does not vanish because of the condition $\phi(x) = 0 \Leftrightarrow x = 0$. Therefore, there exists $b > 0$ such that

$$\frac{\phi(x)}{x} \geq b \quad (\forall x \in (\delta_1, 1]). \quad (5)$$

Putting $c = \min\{a/2, b\}$, we have

$$cx \leq \phi(x) \quad (\forall x \in [0, 1]). \quad (6)$$

Consequently, for an arbitrarily large W and an arbitrary probability distribution

$\{p_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$, we obtain

$$\frac{1}{\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p_i)} \leq c. \quad (7)$$

From the mean value theorem, it follows that

$$\left| \phi(p_i) - \phi(p'_i) \right| \leq \left| p_i - p'_i \right| \cdot \sup_{x \in (0,1)} \left| \phi'(x) \right|, \quad (8)$$

where $\phi'(x)$ is the derivative of $\phi(x)$ with respect to x . For $\varepsilon > 0$, we put

$$\delta = \inf \left(\delta_1, \frac{c \varepsilon}{2 |Q_{\max}| \cdot \left(\sup_{x \in (0,1)} |\phi'(x)| \right)} \right), \quad (9)$$

where $Q_{\max} = \max \{Q_i\}_{i=1,2,\dots,W}$. Now, for $\|p - p'\|_1 < \delta$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} & \left| \langle Q \rangle_\phi [p] - \langle Q \rangle_\phi [p'] \right| \\ &= \frac{1}{\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p_i) \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p'_j)} \left| \sum_{i=1}^W Q_i \left\{ \phi(p_i) \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p'_j) - \phi(p'_i) \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p_j) \right\} \right| \\ &\leq \frac{1}{\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p_i) \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p'_j)} \\ &\quad \times \left[\sum_{i=1}^W |Q_i| \left\{ \left| \phi(p_i) - \phi(p'_i) \right| \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p'_j) + \phi(p'_i) \left| \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p_j) - \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p'_j) \right| \right\} \right] \\ &\leq \frac{1}{\sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p_j)} \sum_{i=1}^W |Q_i| \left| \phi(p_i) - \phi(p'_i) \right| \\ &\quad + \frac{\sum_{j=1}^W \left| \phi(p_j) - \phi(p'_j) \right|}{\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p_i) \sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p'_j)} \sum_{i=1}^W |Q_i| \phi(p'_i) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&\leq \frac{2|Q_{\max}|}{\sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p_j)} \sum_{i=1}^W |\phi(p_i) - \phi(p'_i)|, \\
&\leq \frac{2|Q_{\max}|}{\sum_{j=1}^W \phi(p_j)} \|p - p'\|_1 \cdot \sup_{x \in (0,1)} |\phi'(x)| \\
&\leq \frac{2|Q_{\max}|}{c} \|p - p'\|_1 \cdot \sup_{x \in (0,1)} |\phi'(x)| \\
&< \varepsilon.
\end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

Therefore, $\langle Q \rangle_\phi [p]$ is stable.

On the other hand, suppose that $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x)/x \notin (0, \infty)$. That is, (i) $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x)/x = 0$ or (ii) $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x)/x = \infty$. Below, we shall examine these cases separately.

(i) Consider the following deformation:

$$p_i = \frac{1}{W-1} (1 - \delta_{i1}), \tag{11}$$

$$p'_i = \left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2}\right) p_i + \frac{\delta}{2} \delta_{i1}, \tag{12}$$

which are normalized and satisfy $\|p - p'\|_1 = \delta$. We have

$$\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p_i) = (W-1) \phi\left(\frac{1}{W-1}\right), \tag{13}$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p'_i) = \phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right) + (W-1)\phi\left(\frac{1}{W-1}\left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)\right). \quad (14)$$

Difference of the expectation values is calculated as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} & \langle Q \rangle_\phi [p] - \langle Q \rangle_\phi [p'] \\ &= -\frac{Q_1 \phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right)}{\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right) + (W-1)\phi\left(\frac{1}{W-1}\left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)\right)} \\ & \quad + \left(\sum_{i=2}^W Q_i\right) \left\{ \frac{1}{W-1} - \frac{\phi\left(\frac{1}{W-1}\left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)\right)}{\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right) + (W-1)\phi\left(\frac{1}{W-1}\left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)\right)} \right\} \\ &= \frac{W}{W-1} (\bar{Q} - Q_1) \frac{\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right) / \left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)}{\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right) / \left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right) + \phi\left(\frac{1}{W-1}\left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)\right) / \left[\frac{1}{W-1}\left(1-\frac{\delta}{2}\right)\right]} \\ & \xrightarrow{W \rightarrow \infty} \bar{Q} - Q_1, \end{aligned} \quad (15)$$

since $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x)/x = 0$, where \bar{Q} is the arithmetic mean, $\bar{Q} = \sum_{i=1}^W Q_i / W$. Therefore,

$\langle Q \rangle_\phi [p]$ is not stable.

(ii) Consider the following deformation:

$$p_i = \delta_{i1}, \quad (16)$$

$$p'_i = \left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2} \frac{W}{W-1}\right) p_i + \frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}, \quad (17)$$

which are also normalized and satisfy $\|p - p'\|_1 = \delta$. We have

$$\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p_i) = \phi(1), \quad (18)$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^W \phi(p'_i) = \phi\left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2}\right) + (W-1)\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right). \quad (19)$$

Difference of the expectation values is calculated as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} & \langle Q \rangle_\phi [p] - \langle Q \rangle_\phi [p'] \\ &= Q_1 \left\{ 1 - \frac{\phi\left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2}\right)}{\phi\left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2}\right) + (W-1)\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right)} \right\} \\ & \quad - \left(\sum_{i=2}^W Q_i \right) \frac{\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right)}{\phi\left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2}\right) + (W-1)\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right)} \\ &= \frac{W}{W-1} (Q_1 - \bar{Q}) \frac{\phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right) / \left[\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right]}{\phi\left(1 - \frac{\delta}{2}\right) / \left(\frac{\delta}{2}\right) + \phi\left(\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right) / \left[\frac{\delta}{2} \frac{1}{W-1}\right]} \\ & \xrightarrow{W \rightarrow \infty} Q_1 - \bar{Q}, \quad (20) \end{aligned}$$

since $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x) / x = \infty$. Therefore, $\langle Q \rangle_\phi [p]$ is not stable. □

In the above proof, we have employed the specific deformations of the probability distributions as the counterexamples, which are considered in Ref. [5]. It is pointed out in Ref. [13] that these deformed distributions may experimentally be generated.

Finally, we mention a couple of simple stable examples.

Example 1:

$$\phi(x) = e^x - 1. \tag{22}$$

Example 2:

$$\phi(x) = \ln(1 + x^\alpha), \tag{23}$$

which yields a stable generalized expectation value, if and only if $\alpha = 1$.

On the other hand, as mentioned earlier, the q -expectation value is not stable, since $\phi(x) = x^q$ ($q > 0, q \neq 1$) does not satisfy the condition $\lim_{x \rightarrow +0} \phi(x) / x \in (0, \infty)$.

In conclusion, we have considered a class of generalized definitions of expectation value that are often employed in nonequilibrium statistical mechanics for complex systems, and have presented the necessary and sufficient condition for such a class to be stable under small deformations of a given arbitrary probability distribution.

Acknowledgment

The work of S.A. was supported in part by a Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research from the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science.

References

- [1] S. Abe and Y. Okamoto (eds.), *Nonextensive Statistical Mechanics and Its Applications*, Springer, Heidelberg, 2001.
- [2] C. Tsallis, *Introduction to Nonextensive Statistical Mechanics: Approaching a Complex World*, Springer, New York, 2009.
- [3] C. Tsallis and A. M. C. Souza, Constructing a statistical mechanics for Beck-Cohen superstatistics, *Phys. Rev. E* **67** (2003), 026106.
- [4] C. Beck and F. Schlögl, *Thermodynamics of Chaotic Systems: An Introduction*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1993.
- [5] B. Lesche, Instabilities of Rényi entropies, *J. Stat. Phys.* **27** (1982), 419.
- [6] S. Abe, Stability of Tsallis entropy and instabilities of Rényi and normalized Tsallis entropies: A basis for q -exponential distributions, *Phys. Rev. E* **66** (2002), 046134.
- [7] S. Abe, G. Kaniadakis and A. M. Scarfone, Stabilities of generalized entropies, *J. Phys. A: Math. Gen.* **37** (2004), 10513.
- [8] E. M. F. Curado and F. D. Nobre, On the stability of analytic entropic forms, *Physica A* **335** (2004), 94.
- [9] A. El Kaabouchi, C. J. Ou, J. C. Chen, G. Z. Su and Q. A. Wang, A counterexample against the Lesche stability of a generic entropy functional,

- J. Math. Phys.* **52** (2011), 063302.
- [10] J. Naudts, Continuity of a class of entropies and relative entropies,
Rev. Math. Phys. **16** (2004), 809.
- [11] A.E. Rastegin, Continuity and stability of partial entropic sums, e-print
arXiv: 0910.1903.
- [12] S. Abe, Instability of q -averages in nonextensive statistical mechanics,
Europhys. Lett. **84** (2008), 60006.
- [13] S. Abe, Anomalous behavior of q -averages in nonextensive statistical
mechanics, *J. Stat. Mech.: Theor. and Exp.* P07027 (2009).
- [14] S. Abe, Generalized molecular chaos hypothesis and the H theorem: Problems of
constraints and amendment of nonextensive statistical mechanics,
Phys. Rev. E **79** (2009), 041116.
- [15] R. Hanel and S. Thurner, Stability criteria for q -expectation values,
Phys. Lett. A **373** (2009), 1415.
- [16] R. Hanel, S. Thurner and C. Tsallis, On the robustness of q -expectation values
and Rényi entropy, *Europhys. Lett.* **85** (2009), 20005.
- [17] S. Abe, Essential discreteness in generalized thermostatics with
non-logarithmic entropy, *Europhys. Lett.* **90** (2010), 50004.
- [18] B. Andresen, Comment on “Essential discreteness in generalized
thermostatics with non-logarithmic entropy” by Abe Sumiyoshi,
Europhys. Lett. **92** (2010), 40005.
- [19] S. Abe, Reply to the Comment by B. Andresen, *Europhys. Lett.* **92** (2010),

40006.

- [20] J. F. Lutsko, J. P. Boon and P. Grosfils, Is the Tsallis entropy stable?, *Europhys. Lett.* **86** (2009), 40005.
- [21] J. P. Boon and J. F. Lutsko, Nonextensive formalism and continuous Hamiltonian systems, *Phys. Lett. A* **375** (2011), 329.
- [22] J. F. Lutsko and J. P. Boon, Questioning the validity of non-extensive thermodynamics for classical Hamiltonian systems, *Europhys. Lett.* **95** (2011), 20006.