

# On Hall's conjecture

Andrej Dujella

## Abstract

We show that for any even positive integer  $\delta$  there exist polynomials  $x$  and  $y$  with integer coefficients such that  $\deg(x) = 2\delta$ ,  $\deg(y) = 3\delta$  and  $\deg(x^3 - y^2) = \delta + 5$ .

Hall's conjecture asserts that for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a constant  $c(\varepsilon) > 0$  such that if  $x$  and  $y$  are positive integers satisfying  $x^3 - y^2 \neq 0$ , then  $|x^3 - y^2| > c(\varepsilon)x^{1/2-\varepsilon}$ . It is known that Hall's conjecture follows from the *abc*-conjecture. For a stronger version of Hall's conjecture which is equivalent to the *abc*-conjecture see [3, Ch. 12.5]. Originally, Hall [8] conjectured that there is  $C > 0$  such that  $|x^3 - y^2| \geq C\sqrt{x}$  for positive integers  $x, y$  with  $x^3 - y^2 \neq 0$ , but this formulation is unlikely to be true. Danilov [4] proved that  $0 < |x^3 - y^2| < 0.97\sqrt{x}$  has infinitely many solutions in positive integers  $x, y$ ; here 0.97 comes from  $54\sqrt{5}/125$ . For examples with "very small" quotients  $|x^3 - y^2|/\sqrt{x}$ , up to 0.021, see [7] and [9].

It is well known that for non-constant complex polynomials  $x$  and  $y$ , such that  $x^3 \neq y^2$ , we have  $\deg(x^3 - y^2)/\deg(x) > 1/2$ . More precisely, Davenport [6] proved that for such polynomials the inequality

$$\deg(x^3 - y^2) \geq \frac{1}{2} \deg(x) + 1 \quad (1)$$

holds. This statement also follows from Stothers-Mason's *abc* theorem for polynomials (see, e.g., [10, Ch. 4.7]). Zannier [12] proved that for any positive integer  $\delta$  there exist complex polynomials  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $\deg(x) = 2\delta$ ,  $\deg(y) = 3\delta$  and  $x, y$  satisfy the equality in Davenport's bound (1). In his previous paper [11], he related the existence of such examples with coverings of the Riemann sphere, unramified except above 0, 1 and  $\infty$ .

---

<sup>0</sup> 2000 Mathematics Subject Classification: 11C08, 11D25, 11D75.

Key words: Hall's conjecture, integer polynomials.

The author was supported by the Ministry of Science, Education and Sports, Republic of Croatia, grant 037-0372781-2821.

It is natural to ask whether examples with the equality in (1) exist for polynomials with integer (rational) coefficients. Such examples are known only for  $\delta = 1, 2, 3, 4, 5$  (see [1, 7]). The first example for  $\delta = 5$  was found by Birch, Chowla, Hall and Schinzel [2]. It is given by

$$x = \frac{t}{9}(t^9 + 6t^6 + 15t^3 + 12), \quad y = \frac{1}{54}(2t^{15} + 18t^{12} + 72t^9 + 144t^6 + 135t^3 + 27),$$

while then

$$x^3 - y^2 = -\frac{1}{108}(3t^6 + 14t^3 + 27)$$

(note that  $x, y$  are integers for  $t \equiv 3 \pmod{6}$ ). One more example for  $\delta = 5$  has been found by Elkies [7]:

$$\begin{aligned} x &= t^{10} - 2t^9 + 33t^8 - 12t^7 + 378t^6 + 336t^5 + 2862t^4 + 2652t^3 + 14397t^2 + 9922t + 18553, \\ y &= t^{15} - 3t^{14} + 51t^{13} - 67t^{12} + 969t^{11} + 33t^{10} + 10963t^9 + 9729t^8 + 96507t^7 \\ &\quad + 108631t^6 + 580785t^5 + 700503t^4 + 2102099t^3 + 1877667t^2 + 3904161t + 1164691, \\ x^3 - y^2 &= 4591650240t^6 - 5509980288t^5 + 101934635328t^4 + 58773123072t^3 \\ &\quad + 730072388160t^2 + 1151585880192t + 5029693672896. \end{aligned}$$

In these examples we have

$$\deg(x^3 - y^2) / \deg(x) = 0.6,$$

and it seems that no examples of polynomials with integer coefficients, satisfying  $x^3 - y^2 \neq 0$  and  $\deg(x^3 - y^2) / \deg(x) < 0.6$ , were published until now.

In this note we will show the following result.

**Theorem 1** *For any  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exist polynomials  $x$  and  $y$  with integer coefficients such that  $x^3 \neq y^2$  and  $\deg(x^3 - y^2) / \deg(x) < 1/2 + \varepsilon$ .*

*More precisely, for any even positive integer  $\delta$  there exist polynomials  $x$  and  $y$  with integer coefficients such that  $\deg(x) = 2\delta$ ,  $\deg(y) = 3\delta$  and  $\deg(x^3 - y^2) = \delta + 5$ .*

As an immediate corollary we obtain a nontrivial lower bound for the number of integer solutions to the inequality  $|x^3 - y^2| < x^{1/2+\varepsilon}$  with  $1 \leq x \leq N$  (heuristically, it is expected that this number is around  $N^\varepsilon$ ).

**Corollary 1** *For any  $\varepsilon > 0$  and positive integer  $N$  by  $\mathcal{S}(\varepsilon, N)$  we denote the number of integers  $x$ ,  $1 \leq x \leq N$ , for which there exists an integer  $y$  such that  $0 < |x^3 - y^2| < x^{1/2+\varepsilon}$ . Then we have*

$$\mathcal{S}(\varepsilon, N) \gg N^{\varepsilon/(5+4\varepsilon)}.$$

Indeed, take  $\delta$  to be the smallest even integer greater than  $5/(2\varepsilon)$ , so that  $5/(2\varepsilon) < \delta < 5/(2\varepsilon) + 2$ , and take  $x = x(t)$ ,  $y = y(t)$  as in Theorem 1. Then for sufficiently large  $t$  we have  $x = O(t^{2\delta})$  and  $|x^3 - y^2| = O(t^{\delta+5}) = O(x^{\frac{1}{2} + \frac{5}{2\delta}}) < x^{1/2+\varepsilon}$ . Therefore,

$$\mathcal{S}(\varepsilon, N) \gg N^{1/(2\delta)} \gg N^{\varepsilon/(5+4\varepsilon)}.$$

Here is an explicit example which improves the quotient  $\deg(x^3 - y^2)/\deg(x) = 0.6$  from the above mentioned examples by Birch, Chowla, Hall, Schinzel and Elkies, as  $\deg(x^3 - y^2)/\deg(x) = 31/52 = 0.5961\dots$  :

$$\begin{aligned} x = & 281474976710656t^{52} + 3799912185593856t^{50} + 24189255811072000t^{48} + 96537120918732800t^{46} \\ & + 270892177293312000t^{44} + 568175382432317440t^{42} + 924393098014883840t^{40} \\ & + 1194971570896896000t^{38} + 1247222961904025600t^{36} + 1062249296822272000t^{34} \\ & + 743181990714408960t^{32} + 428630517911388160t^{30} + 203971125837824000t^{28} + 100663296t^{27} \\ & + 79960271015116800t^{26} + 729808896t^{25} + 25720746147840000t^{24} + 2359296000t^{23} \\ & + 6745085391667200t^{22} + 4482662400t^{21} + 1428736897843200t^{20} + 5554176000t^{19} \\ & + 241375027200000t^{18} + 4706795520t^{17} + 31982191104000t^{16} + 2782494720t^{15} + 3250264320000t^{14} \\ & + 1148928000t^{13} + 245895686400t^{12} + 326476800t^{11} + 13292822400t^{10} + 61776000t^9 + 484380000t^8 \\ & + 7344480t^7 + 10894000t^6 + 496080t^5 + 130625t^4 + 15750t^3 + 629t^2 + 150t + 4, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} y = & 4722366482869645213696t^{78} + 95627921278110315577344t^{76} + 931486788746037518401536t^{74} \\ & + 5812273909720700361375744t^{72} + 26102714713365300532740096t^{70} + 89873242715073754863501312t^{68} \\ & + 246761827996223603178733568t^{66} + 554869751478978106456276992t^{64} \\ & + 1041377162422256031202541568t^{62} + 1654256777803799676753805312t^{60} \\ & + 2247766244734980591395536896t^{58} + 2633529391786763986554322944t^{56} \\ & + 2676840149412734907329806336t^{54} + 2533274790395904t^{53} + 2371433108159248512627769344t^{52} \\ & + 35465847065542656t^{51} + 1837294956807449113993936896t^{50} + 234486247786020864t^{49} \\ & + 1247823926411289395000770560t^{48} + 973569167884025856t^{47} + 743994544482135039635619840t^{46} \\ & + 2847272221544546304t^{45} + 389682593956278112836648960t^{44} + 6236328797675716608t^{43} \\ & + 179279686440609529032867840t^{42} + 10618254681610125312t^{41} + 72388134028773255869890560t^{40} \\ & + 14399046085119049728t^{39} + 25611943886548098204303360t^{38} + 15806610071787405312t^{37} \\ & + 7922395450159324505047040t^{36} + 14200560742834372608t^{35} + 2135839807968003238133760t^{34} \\ & + 10514148446410113024t^{33} + 499883693495498613719040t^{32} + 6441026076788391936t^{31} \\ & + 101073262762096181903360t^{30} + 3269189665642512384t^{29} + 17550157782838363029504t^{28} \\ & + 1373442845007937536t^{27} + 2598168579136061177856t^{26} + 476068223096193024t^{25} \\ & + 325093317533140516864t^{24} + 135395930768670720t^{23} + 34019036843474681856t^{22} \\ & + 31339645700014080t^{21} + 2939255644452962304t^{20} + 5838612910571520t^{19} + 206402445920944128t^{18} \\ & + 862650209710080t^{17} + 11551766627438592t^{16} + 99129281310720t^{15} + 502656091170048t^{14} \\ & + 8633278321920t^{13} + 16468534726592t^{12} + 550276346880t^{11} + 389483950128t^{10} + 24450210720t^9 \\ & + 6312333144t^8 + 705350880t^7 + 68685241t^6 + 11812545t^5 + 642429t^4 + 94050t^3 + 6591t^2 + 225t + 19, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
x^3 - y^2 = & -905969664t^{31} - 8380219392t^{29} - 35276193792t^{27} - 89379569664t^{25} - 151909171200t^{23} \\
& - 182680289280t^{21} - 159752355840t^{19} - 102786416640t^{17} - 48661447680t^{15} - 16772918400t^{13} \\
& - 4116359520t^{11} - 692649360t^9 - 75171510t^7 - 297t^6 - 4749570t^5 - 891t^4 - 144450t^3 - 891t^2 \\
& - 1350t - 297.
\end{aligned}$$

Now we describe the general construction. Let us define the binary recursive sequence by

$$a_1 = 0, \quad a_2 = t^2 + 1, \quad a_m = 2ta_{m-1} + a_{m-2}.$$

Thus, for  $m \geq 2$ ,  $a_m$  is a polynomial in variable  $t$ , of degree  $m$ . Put  $u = a_{k-1}$  and  $v = a_k$  for an odd positive integer  $k \geq 3$ . We search for examples with  $x = O(v^2)$ ,  $y = O(v^3)$  and  $x^3 - y^2 = O(v)$ . Note that

$$v^2 - 2tuv - u^2 = -(a_2^2 - 2ta_1a_2 - a_1^2) = -(t^2 + 1)^2. \quad (2)$$

Therefore, we may take

$$\begin{aligned}
x &= av^2 + buv + cu + dv + e, \\
y &= fv^3 + gv^2u + hv^2 + iuv + ju + mv + n,
\end{aligned}$$

with unknown coefficients  $a, b, c, \dots, n$ , which will be determined so that in the expression for  $x^3 - y^2$  the coefficients with  $v^6, uv^5, v^5, \dots, v^2, uv$  are equal to 0. We find the following (polynomial) solution:

$$\begin{aligned}
x &= v^2 - 2tuv + 6v - 6tu + (t^4 + 5t^2 + 4), \\
y &= -2tv^3 + (4t^2 + 1)uv^2 - 9tv^2 + (18t^2 + 9)uv + (-2t^5 - 4t^3 - 2t)v \\
&\quad + (t^4 + 20t^2 + 19)u + (-9t^5 - 18t^3 - 9t).
\end{aligned}$$

Using (2), it is easy to check that we have

$$x^3 - y^2 = -27(t^2 + 1)^2(2v - 2tu + 11t^2 + 11).$$

Therefore,  $\deg(x) = 2k - 2$  and  $\deg(x^3 - y^2) = k + 4$ . Also,

$$\deg(x^3 - y^2) / \deg(x) = (k + 4) / (2k - 2),$$

which tends to  $1/2$  when  $k$  tends to infinity. The above explicit example corresponds to  $k = 27$ .

Comparing with Davenport's bound, our polynomial  $x$  and  $y$  satisfy

$$\deg(x^3 - y^2) = \frac{1}{2} \deg(x) + 5.$$

Thus, although our examples  $(x, y)$  do not give the equality in Davenport's bound (1), they are very close to the best possible result for  $\deg(x^3 - y^2)$ , and it seems that this is the first known result of the form that  $\deg(x^3 - y^2) - \frac{1}{2} \deg(x)$  is bounded by an absolute constant, for polynomials  $x, y$  with integer coefficients and arbitrarily large degrees.

Since  $(t^2 + 1)$  divides  $a_m$  for all  $m$ , it could be noted that  $(t^2 + 1)$  divides  $x$  and  $(t^2 + 1)^2$  divides  $y$ . Hence, with  $x = (t^2 + 1)X$  and  $y = (t^2 + 1)^2Y$ , we have

$$\deg(X^3 - (t^2 + 1)Y^2) = \frac{1}{2} \deg(X).$$

This shows that the only branch points of the rational function  $x^3/y^2$  are 0, 1 and  $\infty$ , which is in agreement with the results of Zannier [11, 12].

Let us give an interpretation of our result in terms of polynomial Pell's equations. Following a suggestion by N. Elkies, we put  $v - tu = (t^2 + 1)z$ . Then the expressions of  $x$  and  $x^3 - y^2$  simplify considerably, and we get  $x = (t^2 + 1)(z^2 + 6z + 4)$ ,  $x^3 - y^2 = -27(t^2 + 1)^3(2z + 11)$  which gives  $y^2 = (t^2 + 1)^3(z^2 + 1)(z^2 + 9z + 19)^2$ . Thus, we need that  $z^2 + 1 = (t^2 + 1)w^2$ , i.e

$$z^2 - (t^2 + 1)w^2 = -1. \quad (3)$$

The fundamental solution of Pell's equation (3) is  $(z, w) = (t, 1)$ . Taking  $t = z$ , we obtain the identity

$$(z^2 + 6z + 4)^3 - (z^2 + 1)(z^2 + 9z + 19)^2 = -27(2z + 11),$$

which is equivalent to Danilov's example [4] (and by taking  $z^2 + 1 = 5w^2$  and  $2z + 11 \equiv 0 \pmod{125}$ ), we get a well-known sequence of numerical examples with  $|x^3 - y^2| < \sqrt{x}$ .

However, if we consider (3) as a polynomial Pell's equation (in variable  $t$ ), we obtain the sequence of solutions

$$z_1 = t, \quad z_2 = 4t^3 + 3t, \quad z_k = (4t^2 + 2)z_{k-1} - z_{k-2}.$$

This gives exactly the sequences of polynomials  $x$  and  $y$ , as given above.

**Remark 1** In [5], Danilov considered small values of  $|x^4 - Ay^2|$ , for integers  $A$  satisfying certain conditions. Using the formula

$$(27z + 7)^4 - (81z + 20)^2 \cdot \frac{(81z + 22)^2 + 2}{81} = 4z + 1, \quad (4)$$

he proved that if the Pellian equation  $u^2 - 81Av^2 = -2$  has a solution, then the inequality  $|x^4 - Ay^2| < \frac{4}{27}|x|$  has infinitely many integer solutions  $x, y$ . By applying a similar construction, as above, to Danilov's formula (4), we obtain the sequences  $x_k$  and  $y_k$  of polynomials in variable  $t$  with  $\deg(x_k) = 2k + 1$ ,  $\deg(y_k) = 4k$  and  $\deg(x^4 - (t^2 + 2)y^2) = \deg(x) = 2k + 1$ . For example, for  $k = 3$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} x &= 8t^7 + 28t^5 + 28t^3 + 7t - 1, \\ y &= 64t^{13} + 384t^{11} + 880t^9 + 960t^7 - 16t^6 + 504t^5 - 40t^4 + 112t^3 - 24t^2 + 7t - 2, \end{aligned}$$

and then

$$x^4 - (t^2 + 2)y^2 = 32t^7 + 112t^5 + 112t^3 + 28t - 7.$$

**Acknowledgements.** The author is grateful to Yann Bugeaud, Noam Elkies, Clemens Fuchs, Boris Širola and Umberto Zannier for their very interesting and useful comments on the previous version of this note.

## References

- [1] F. Beukers, C. L. Stewart, *Neighboring powers*, J. Number Theory **130** (2010), 660–679.
- [2] B. J. Birch, S. Chowla, M. Hall, Jr., A. Schinzel, *On the difference  $x^3 - y^2$* , Norske Vid. Selsk. Forh. (Trondheim) **38** (1965), 65–69.
- [3] E. Bombieri, W. Gubler, *Heights in Diophantine geometry*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2006.
- [4] L. V. Danilov, *The Diophantine equation  $x^3 - y^2 = k$  and Hall's conjecture*, Math. Notes Acad. Sci. USSR **32** (1982), 617–618.
- [5] L. V. Danilov, *The Diophantine equations  $x^m - Ay^n = k$* , Math. Notes Acad. Sci. USSR **46** (1989), 914–919.
- [6] H. Davenport, *On  $f^3(t) - g^2(t)$* , Norske Vid. Selsk. Forh. (Trondheim) **38** (1965), 86–87.
- [7] N. Elkies, *Rational points near curves and small nonzero  $|x^3 - y^2|$  via lattice reduction*, Lecture Notes in Computer Science **1838** (proceedings of ANTS-4, 2000; W. Bosma, ed.), 33–63.
- [8] M. Hall, Jr., *The Diophantine equation  $x^3 - y^2 = k$* , in: Computers in Number Theory, A. O. L. Atkin and B. J. Birch (eds.), Proc. Oxford 1969, Academic Press, 1971, 173–198.

- [9] I. Jiménez Calvo, J. Herranz, G. Sáez, *A new algorithm to search for small nonzero  $|x^3 - y^2|$  values*, Math. Comp. **78** (2009), 2435–2444.
- [10] S. Lang, Algebra, 3rd ed., Addison-Wesley, Reading, 1993.
- [11] U. Zannier, *Some remarks on the  $S$ -unit equation in function fields*, Acta Arith. **64** (1993), 87–98.
- [12] U. Zannier, *On Davenport's bound for the degree of  $f^3 - g^2$  and Riemann's Existence Theorem*, Acta Arith. **71** (1995), 103–137.

Department of Mathematics, University of Zagreb,  
Bijenička cesta 30, 10000 Zagreb, Croatia  
*E-mail address:* `duje@math.hr`