

# A HILBERT $C^*$ -MODULE ADMITTING NO FRAMES

HANFENG LI

ABSTRACT. We show that every infinite-dimensional commutative unital  $C^*$ -algebra has a Hilbert  $C^*$ -module admitting no frames. In particular, this shows that Kasparov's stabilization theorem for countably generated Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules can not be extended to arbitrary Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Kasparov's celebrated stabilization theorem [4] says that for any  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  and any countably generated (right) Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$ , the direct sum  $X_A \oplus H_A$  is isomorphic to  $H_A$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules, where  $H_A$  denotes the standard Hilbert  $A$ -module  $\bigoplus_{j \in \mathbb{N}} A_A$  (see Section 3 below for definition). This theorem plays an important role in Kasparov's  $KK$ -theory.

There has been some generalization of Kasparov's stabilization theorem to a larger class of Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules [7]. It is natural to ask whether Kasparov's stabilization theorem can be generalized to arbitrary Hilbert  $A$ -modules via replacing  $H_A$  by  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  for some large set  $J$  depending on  $X_A$ . In other words, given any Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$ , is  $X_A \oplus (\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A)$  isomorphic to  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules for some set  $J$ ?

An affirmative answer to the above question would imply that  $X_A$  is a direct summand of  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$ , i.e,  $X_A \oplus Y_A$  is isomorphic to  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  for some Hilbert  $A$ -module  $Y_A$ .

In [2] Frank and Larson generalized the classical frame theory from Hilbert spaces to the setting of Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules. Given a unital  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  and a Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$ , a set  $\{x_j : j \in J\}$  of elements in  $X_A$  is called a *frame* of  $X_A$  [2, Definition 2.1] if there is a real constant  $C > 0$  such that  $\sum_{j \in J} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A$  converges in the ultraweak operator topology to some element in the universal enveloping

---

*Date:* September 29, 2009.

*2000 Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 46L08; Secondary 42C15.

Partially supported by NSF Grant DMS-0701414.

von Neumann algebra  $A^{**}$  of  $A$  [10, page 122] and

$$(1) \quad C \langle x, x \rangle_A \leq \sum_{j \in J} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A \leq C^{-1} \langle x, x \rangle_A$$

for every  $x \in X_A$ . It is called a *standard frame* of  $X_A$  if furthermore  $\sum_{j \in J} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A$  converges in norm for every  $x \in X_A$ . Frank and Larson showed that a Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$  has a standard frame if and only if  $X_A$  is a direct summand of  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  for some set  $J$  [2, Example 3.5, Theorems 5.3 and 4.1]. From Kasparov's stabilization theorem they concluded that every countably generated Hilbert  $A$ -module has a standard frame. However, the existence of standard frames for general Hilbert  $A$ -modules was left open. In fact, even the existence of frames for general Hilbert  $A$ -modules is open, as Frank and Larson asked in Problem 8.1 of [2].

The purpose of this note is to show that the answers to these questions are in general negative, even for every infinite-dimensional commutative unital  $C^*$ -algebra:

**Theorem 1.1.** *Let  $A$  be a unital commutative  $C^*$ -algebra. Then the following are equivalent:*

- (1)  $A$  is finite-dimensional,
- (2) for every Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$ ,  $X_A \oplus (\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A)$  is isomorphic to  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules for some set  $J$ ,
- (3) for every Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$ ,  $X_A \oplus Y_A$  is isomorphic to  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules for some set  $J$  and some Hilbert  $A$ -module  $Y_A$ ,
- (4) every Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$  has a standard frame,
- (5) every Hilbert  $A$ -module  $X_A$  has a frame.

In Section 2 we establish some result on continuous fields of Hilbert spaces. Theorem 1.1 is proved in Section 3.

*Acknowledgements.* I am grateful to Michael Frank, Cristian Ivanescu, David Larson, and Jingbo Xia for helpful comments.

## 2. CONTINUOUS FIELDS OF HILBERT SPACES

In this section we prove Proposition 2.4.

**Lemma 2.1.** *There exists an uncountable set  $S$  of injective maps  $\mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  such that for any distinct  $f, g \in S$ ,  $f(n) \neq g(n)$  for all but finitely many  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , and  $f(n) \neq g(m)$  for all  $n \neq m$ .*

*Proof.* Take an injective map  $T$  from  $\bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \mathbb{N}^n$  into  $\mathbb{N}$ . For each  $x : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  define  $f_x : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by  $f_x(n) = T(x(1), x(2), \dots, x(n))$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . If  $x \neq y$ , say,  $x(m) \neq y(m)$  for some  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ , then  $f_x(n) \neq f_y(n)$

for all  $n \geq m$ . Now the set  $S := \{f_x \in \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} : x \in \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}\}$  satisfies the requirement.  $\square$

We refer the reader to [1, Chapter 10] for details on continuous fields of Banach spaces. Let  $T$  be a topological space. Recall that a *continuous field of (complex) Banach spaces over  $T$*  is a family  $(H_t)_{t \in T}$  of complex Banach spaces, with a set  $\Gamma \subseteq \prod_{t \in T} H_t$  of sections such that:

- (i)  $\Gamma$  is a linear subspace of  $\prod_{t \in T} H_t$ ,
- (ii) for every  $t \in T$ , the set of  $x(t)$  for  $x \in \Gamma$  is dense in  $H_t$ ,
- (iii) for every  $x \in \Gamma$  the function  $t \mapsto \|x(t)\|$  is continuous on  $T$ ,
- (iv) for any  $x \in \prod_{t \in T} H_t$ , if for every  $t \in T$  and every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists an  $x' \in \Gamma$  with  $\|x'(s) - x(s)\| < \varepsilon$  for all  $s$  in some neighborhood of  $t$ , then  $x \in \Gamma$ .

**Lemma 2.2.** *For each  $s \in [0, 1]$  there exists a continuous field of Hilbert spaces  $((H_t)_{t \in [0, 1]}, \Gamma)$  over  $[0, 1]$  such that  $H_t$  is separable for every  $t \in [0, 1] \setminus \{s\}$  and  $H_s$  is nonseparable.*

*Proof.* We consider the case  $s = 0$ . The case  $s > 0$  can be dealt with similarly. Let  $H$  be an infinite-dimensional separable Hilbert space. Take an orthonormal basis  $\{e_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  of  $H$ . Let  $S$  be as in Lemma 2.1. For every  $f \in S$  and every  $t \in (0, 1]$  set  $v_{f,t} \in H$  by

$$v_{f,t} = \cos\left(\frac{1/n - t}{1/n - 1/(n+1)} \cdot \frac{\pi}{2}\right)e_{f(n)} + \sin\left(\frac{1/n - t}{1/n - 1/(n+1)} \cdot \frac{\pi}{2}\right)e_{f(n+1)}$$

for  $1/(n+1) \leq t \leq 1/n$ . Set  $H_t$  to be the closed linear span of  $\{v_{f,t} : f \in S\}$  in  $H$  for each  $t \in (0, 1]$ . Let  $H_0$  be a Hilbert space with an orthonormal basis  $\{e'_f\}_{f \in S}$  indexed by  $S$ . Then  $H_t$  is separable for each  $t \in (0, 1]$  while  $H_0$  is nonseparable.

For each  $f \in S$ , consider the section  $x_f \in \prod_{t \in [0, 1]} H_t$  defined by  $x_f(t) = v_{f,t}$  for  $t \in (0, 1]$ , and  $x_f(0) = e'_f$ . Then  $x_f(t)$  is a unit vector in  $H_t$  for every  $t \in [0, 1]$ , and the map  $t \mapsto x_f(t) \in H$  is continuous on  $(0, 1]$ . Denote by  $V$  the linear span of  $\{x_f : f \in S\}$  in  $\prod_{t \in [0, 1]} H_t$ .

We claim that the function  $t \mapsto \|y(t)\|$  is continuous on  $[0, 1]$  for every  $y \in V$ . Let  $y \in V$ . Say,  $y = \sum_{j=1}^m \lambda_j x_{f_j}$  for some pairwise distinct  $f_1, \dots, f_m$  in  $S$  and some  $\lambda_1, \dots, \lambda_m$  in  $\mathbb{C}$ . Then the map  $t \mapsto y(t) = \sum_{j=1}^m \lambda_j x_{f_j}(t) \in H$  is continuous on  $(0, 1]$ . Thus the function  $t \mapsto \|y(t)\|$  is continuous on  $(0, 1]$ . When  $t$  is small enough,  $x_{f_1}(t), \dots, x_{f_m}(t)$  are orthonormal and hence  $\|y(t)\| = (\sum_{j=1}^m |\lambda_j|^2)^{1/2}$ . Thus the function  $t \mapsto \|y(t)\|$  is also continuous at  $t = 0$ . This proves the claim.

Since  $V$  satisfies the conditions (i), (ii), (iii) in the definition of continuous fields of Banach spaces (with  $\Gamma$  replaced by  $V$ ), by [1, Proposition 10.2.3] one has the continuous field of Hilbert spaces  $((H_t)_{t \in [0, 1]}, \Gamma)$

over  $[0, 1]$ , where  $\Gamma$  is the set of all sections  $x \in \prod_{t \in [0,1]} H_t$  such that for every  $t \in [0, 1]$  and every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists an  $x' \in V$  with  $\|x'(t') - x(t')\| < \varepsilon$  for all  $t'$  in some neighborhood of  $t$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 2.3.** *Let  $Z$  be an infinite compact Hausdorff space. Then there exists a real-valued continuous function  $f$  on  $Z$  such that  $f(Z)$  is infinite.*

*Proof.* Suppose that every real-valued continuous function on  $Z$  has finite image. Take a non-constant real-valued continuous function  $h$  on  $Z$ . Say,  $h(Z) = B \cup D$  with both  $B$  and  $D$  being nonempty finite sets. Then at least one of  $h^{-1}(B)$  and  $h^{-1}(D)$  is infinite. Say,  $h^{-1}(D)$  is infinite. Set  $W_1 = h^{-1}(B)$ . Then  $W_1$  and  $Z \setminus W_1$  are both nonempty closed and open subsets of  $Z$ , and  $Z \setminus W_1$  is infinite.

Since every real-valued continuous function  $g$  on  $Z \setminus W_1$  extends to a real-valued continuous function on  $Z$ ,  $g$  must have finite image. Applying the above argument to  $Z \setminus W_1$  we can find  $W_2 \subseteq Z \setminus W_1$  such that both  $W_2$  and  $Z \setminus (W_1 \cup W_2)$  are nonempty closed and open subsets of  $Z \setminus W_1$ , and  $Z \setminus (W_1 \cup W_2)$  is infinite. Inductively, we find pairwise disjoint nonempty closed and open subsets  $W_1, W_2, W_3, \dots$  of  $Z$ . Now define  $f$  on  $Z$  by  $f(z) = 1/n$  if  $z \in W_n$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $f(z) = 0$  if  $z \in Z \setminus \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} W_n$ . Then  $f$  is a continuous function on  $Z$  and  $f(Z)$  is infinite, contradicting our assumption. Therefore there exists a real-valued continuous function on  $Z$  with infinite image.  $\square$

**Proposition 2.4.** *Let  $Z$  be an infinite compact Hausdorff space. Then there exist a continuous field of Hilbert spaces  $((H_z)_{z \in Z}, \Gamma)$  over  $Z$ , a countable subset  $W \subseteq Z$ , and a point  $z_\infty \in \overline{W} \setminus W$  such that  $H_z$  is separable for every  $z \in W$  while  $H_{z_\infty}$  is nonseparable.*

*Proof.* By Lemma 2.3 we can find a continuous map  $f : Z \rightarrow [0, 1]$  such that  $f(Z)$  is infinite. Note that  $f(Z)$  is a compact metrizable space. Thus we can find a convergent sequence  $\{t_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  in  $f(Z)$  such that its limit, denoted by  $t_\infty$ , is not equal to  $t_n$  for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  take  $z_n \in f^{-1}(t_n)$ . Set  $W = \{z_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ . Then  $W$  is countable and  $f(\overline{W}) = \{t_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\} \ni t_\infty$ . Take  $z_\infty \in \overline{W}$  with  $f(z_\infty) = t_\infty$ . Then  $z_\infty \notin W$ .

By Lemma 2.2 we can find a continuous field of Hilbert spaces  $((H'_t)_{t \in [0,1]}, \Gamma')$  over  $[0, 1]$  such that  $H'_t$  is separable for every  $t \in [0, 1] \setminus \{t_\infty\}$  while  $H'_{t_\infty}$  is nonseparable. Set  $H_z = H'_{f(z)}$  for each  $z \in Z$ . Then  $H_z$  is separable for every  $z \in W$  while  $H_{z_\infty}$  is nonseparable. For each  $\gamma \in \Gamma'$  set  $x_\gamma \in \prod_{z \in Z} H_z$  by  $x_\gamma(z) = \gamma(f(z)) \in H'_{f(z)} = H_z$  for all  $z \in Z$ . Then  $V := \{x_\gamma \in \prod_{z \in Z} H_z : \gamma \in \Gamma'\}$  is a linear subspace of  $\prod_{z \in Z} H_z$  satisfying the conditions (i), (ii), (iii) in the definition of continuous

fields of Banach spaces (with  $\Gamma$  replaced by  $V$ ). By [1, Proposition 10.2.3] one has the continuous field of Hilbert spaces  $((H_z)_{z \in Z}, \Gamma)$  over  $Z$ , where  $\Gamma$  is the set of all sections  $x \in \prod_{z \in Z} H_z$  such that for every  $z \in Z$  and every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists an  $x' \in V$  with  $\|x'(z') - x(z')\| < \varepsilon$  for all  $z'$  in some neighborhood of  $z$ .  $\square$

### 3. PROOF OF THEOREM 1.1

In this section we prove Theorem 1.1.

Recall that given a  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$ , a (*right*) *Hilbert  $A$ -module* is a right  $A$ -module  $X_A$  with an  $A$ -valued inner product map  $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle_A : X_A \times X_A \rightarrow A$  such that:

- (i)  $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle_A$  is  $\mathbb{C}$ -linear in the second variable,
- (ii)  $\langle x, ya \rangle_A = \langle x, y \rangle_A a$  for all  $x, y \in X_A$  and  $a \in A$ ,
- (iii)  $\langle y, x \rangle_A = (\langle x, y \rangle_A)^*$  for all  $x, y \in X_A$ ,
- (iv)  $\langle x, x \rangle_A \geq 0$  in  $A$  for every  $x \in X_A$ , and  $\langle x, x \rangle_A = 0$  only when  $x = 0$ ,
- (v)  $X_A$  is complete under the norm  $\|x\| := \|\langle x, x \rangle_A\|^{1/2}$ .

Two Hilbert  $A$ -modules are said to be *isomorphic* if there is an  $A$ -module isomorphism between them preserving the  $A$ -valued inner products. We refer the reader to [5, 6, 8, 11] for the basics of Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules.

We give a characterization of frames avoiding von Neumann algebras.

**Proposition 3.1.** *Let  $A$  be a unital  $C^*$ -algebra and let  $X_A$  be a Hilbert  $A$ -module. Let  $\{x_j : j \in J\}$  be a set of elements in  $X_A$ . Then  $\{x_j : j \in J\}$  is a frame of  $X_A$  if and only if there is a real constant  $C > 0$  such that*

$$(2) \quad C\varphi(\langle x, x \rangle_A) \leq \sum_{j \in J} \varphi(\langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A) \leq C^{-1}\varphi(\langle x, x \rangle_A)$$

for every  $x \in X_A$  and every state  $\varphi$  of  $A$ .

*Proof.* Suppose that  $\{x_j : j \in J\}$  is a frame of  $X_A$ . Let  $C$  be a constant witnessing (1). Then every state  $\varphi$  of  $A$  extends uniquely to a normal state of  $A^{**}$ , which we still denote by  $\varphi$ . Applying  $\varphi$  to (1) we obtain (2). This proves the “only if” part.

Now suppose that (2) is satisfied for every  $x \in X_A$  and every state  $\varphi$  of  $A$ . Let  $x \in X_A$ . Note that  $\langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A = (\langle x_j, x \rangle_A)^* \langle x_j, x \rangle_A \geq 0$  for every  $j \in J$ . For any finite subset  $F$  of  $J$ , from (2) we get

$$\varphi\left(\sum_{j \in F} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A\right) \leq \varphi(C^{-1} \langle x, x \rangle_A)$$

for every state  $\varphi$  of  $A$ , and hence

$$\sum_{j \in F} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A \leq C^{-1} \langle x, x \rangle_A.$$

Thus the monotone increasing net  $\{\sum_{j \in F} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A\}_F$ , for  $F$  being finite subsets of  $J$  ordered by inclusion, of self-adjoint elements in  $A^{**}$  is bounded above. Represent  $A^{**}$  faithful as a von Neumann algebra on some Hilbert space  $H$ . Then we may also represent  $A^{**}$  naturally as a von Neumann algebra on the Hilbert space  $H^\infty = \oplus_{n \in \mathbb{N}} H$ . By [3, Lemma 5.1.4] the above net converges in the weak operator topology of  $B(H^\infty)$  to some element  $a$  of  $A^{**}$ . Since the weak operator topology on  $B(H^\infty)$  restricts to the ultraweak operator topology on  $A^{**}$ , we see that the above net converges to  $a$  in the ultraweak operator topology. Then (2) tells us that

$$C\varphi(\langle x, x \rangle_A) \leq \varphi(a) \leq C^{-1}\varphi(\langle x, x \rangle_A)$$

for every normal state  $\varphi$  of  $A^{**}$ . Therefore,  $C \langle x, x \rangle_A \leq a \leq C^{-1} \langle x, x \rangle_A$  as desired. This finishes the proof of the “if” part.  $\square$

Let  $((H_z)_{z \in Z}, \Gamma)$  be a continuous field of Hilbert spaces over a compact Hausdorff space  $Z$ . We shall write the inner product on each  $H_z$  as linear in the second variable and conjugate-linear in the first variable. By [1, Proposition 10.1.9]  $\Gamma$  is right  $C(Z)$ -module under the pointwise multiplication, i.e.,

$$(xa)(z) = x(z)a(z)$$

for all  $x \in \Gamma$ ,  $a \in C(Z)$ , and  $z \in Z$ . By [1, 10.7.1] for any  $x, y \in \Gamma$ , the function  $z \mapsto \langle x(z), y(z) \rangle$  is in  $C(Z)$ . From the conditions (iii) and (iv) in the definition of continuous fields of Banach spaces in Section 2 one sees that  $\Gamma$  is a Banach space under the supremum norm  $\|x\| := \sup_{z \in Z} \|x(z)\|$ . Therefore  $\Gamma$  is a Hilbert  $C(Z)$ -module with the pointwise  $C(Z)$ -valued inner product

$$\langle x, y \rangle_{C(Z)}(z) = \langle x(z), y(z) \rangle$$

for all  $x, y \in \Gamma$ , and  $z \in Z$ . In fact, up to isomorphism every Hilbert  $C(Z)$ -module arises this way [9, Theorem 3.12], though we won't need this fact except in the case  $Z$  is finite.

**Lemma 3.2.** *Let  $((H_z)_{z \in Z}, \Gamma)$  be a continuous field of Hilbert spaces over a compact Hausdorff space  $Z$ . Suppose that there are a countable subset  $W \subseteq Z$  and a point  $z_\infty \in \overline{W} \setminus W$  such that  $H_z$  is separable for every  $z \in W$  while  $H_{z_\infty}$  is nonseparable. Then  $\Gamma$  as a Hilbert  $C(Z)$ -module has no frames.*

*Proof.* Suppose that  $\{x_j : j \in J\}$  is a frame of  $\Gamma$ . By Proposition 3.1 there is a real constant  $C > 0$  such that the inequality (2) holds for every  $x \in X_A$  and every state  $\varphi$  of  $A$ . For each  $z \in Z$  denote by  $\varphi_z$  the state of  $C(Z)$  given by evaluation at  $z$ . For any  $z \in Z$  and any vector  $w \in H_z$ , by [1, Proposition 10.1.10] we can find  $x \in \Gamma$  with  $x(z) = w$ . Taking  $\varphi = \varphi_z$  in the inequality (2), we get

$$(3) \quad C\|w\|^2 \leq \sum_{j \in J} |\langle x_j(z), w \rangle|^2 \leq C^{-1}\|w\|^2.$$

For each  $z \in Z$  let  $S_z$  be an orthonormal basis of  $H_z$ . For each  $w \in S_z$ , from (3) we see that the set  $F_w := \{j \in J : \langle x_j(z), w \rangle \neq 0\}$  is countable. Note that the set  $F_z := \{j \in J : x_j(z) \neq 0\}$  is exactly  $\cup_{w \in S_z} F_w$ . For each  $z \in W$ , since  $H_z$  is separable,  $S_z$  is countable and hence  $F_z$  is countable. Then the set  $F := \cup_{z \in W} F_z$  is countable.

Since  $H_{z_\infty}$  is nonseparable, we can find a unit vector  $w \in H_{z_\infty}$  orthogonal to  $x_j(z_\infty)$  for all  $j \in F$ . If  $j \in J \setminus F$ , then  $x_j(z) = 0$  for all  $z \in W$ , and hence by the condition (iii) in the definition of continuous fields of Banach spaces in Section 2 we conclude that  $x_j(z_\infty) = 0$ . Therefore  $\langle x_j(z_\infty), w \rangle = 0$  for all  $j \in J$ , contradicting (3). Thus  $\Gamma$  has no frames.  $\square$

For any  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$ ,  $A$  as a right  $A$ -module is a Hilbert  $A$ -module with the  $A$ -valued inner product  $\langle a, b \rangle_A = a^*b$  for all  $a, b \in A$ . Given a family  $\{X_j\}_{j \in J}$  of Hilbert  $A$ -modules, their *direct sum*, denoted by  $\oplus_{j \in J} X_j$ , consists of  $(x_j)_{j \in J}$  in  $\prod_{j \in J} X_j$  such that  $\sum_{j \in J} \langle x_j, x_j \rangle_A$  converges in norm, and has the  $A$ -valued inner product  $\langle (x_j)_{j \in J}, (y_j)_{j \in J} \rangle_A := \sum_{j \in J} \langle x_j, y_j \rangle_A$ .

We are ready to prove Theorem 1.1.

*Proof of Theorem 1.1.* (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2): Suppose that  $A$  is finite-dimensional. Then  $A = C(Z)$  for a finite discrete space  $Z$ . For each  $z \in Z$  denote by  $p_z$  the projection in  $C(Z)$  with  $p_z(z') = \delta_{z, z'}$  for all  $z' \in Z$ . Let  $X_A$  be a Hilbert  $A$ -module. For any  $z \in Z$  and any  $xp_z, yp_z \in X_{Ap_z}$ , one has  $\langle xp_z, yp_z \rangle_A \in Ap_z = \mathbb{C}p_z$ . Thus  $\langle xp_z, yp_z \rangle_A = \lambda p_z$  for some  $\lambda \in \mathbb{C}$ . Set  $\langle xp_z, yp_z \rangle = \lambda$ . Then it is easily checked that  $X_{Ap_z}$  is a Hilbert space under this inner product,  $((X_{Ap_z})_{z \in Z}, \prod_{z \in Z} X_{Ap_z})$  is a continuous field of Hilbert spaces over  $Z$ , and  $X_A$  is isomorphic to  $\prod_{z \in Z} X_{Ap_z}$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules. Take an infinite-dimensional Hilbert space  $H$  such that the Hilbert space dimension of  $H$  is no less than that of  $X_{Ap_z}$  for all  $z \in Z$ . Then  $X_{Ap_z} \oplus H$  is unitary equivalent to  $H$  as Hilbert spaces. It is readily checked that  $((H)_{z \in Z}, \prod_{z \in Z} H)$  is a continuous field of Hilbert spaces over  $Z$ , and  $(\prod_{z \in Z} X_{Ap_z}) \oplus (\prod_{z \in Z} H)$  is isomorphic to  $\prod_{z \in Z} H$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules. Let  $J$  be an orthonormal basis of  $H$ . Then

it is easy to see that  $\prod_{z \in Z} H$  and  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  are isomorphic as Hilbert  $A$ -modules. Therefore  $X_A \oplus (\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A)$  and  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  are isomorphic as Hilbert  $A$ -modules. This proves (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2).

The implications (2) $\Rightarrow$ (3) and (4) $\Rightarrow$ (5) are trivial.

The implication (3) $\Rightarrow$ (4) was proved in [2, Example 3.5]. For the convenience of the reader, we indicate the proof briefly here. Suppose that  $X_A$  and  $Y_A$  are Hilbert  $A$ -modules and  $X_A \oplus Y_A$  is isomorphic to  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  for some set  $J$  as Hilbert  $A$ -modules. We may assume that  $X_A \oplus Y_A = \bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$ . Denote by  $P$  the orthogonal projection  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A \rightarrow X_A$  sending  $x + y$  to  $x$  for all  $x \in X_A$  and  $y \in Y_A$ . For each  $s \in J$  denote by  $e_s$  the vector in  $\bigoplus_{j \in J} A_A$  with coordinate  $1_A \delta_{j,s}$  at each  $j \in J$ . Set  $x_j = P(e_j)$  for each  $j \in J$ . For any  $x \in X_A$ , say,  $x = \sum_{j \in J} e_j a_j$  with  $a_j \in A$  for each  $j \in J$ , one has

$$\begin{aligned} \langle x, x \rangle_A &= \sum_{j \in J} a_j^* a_j = \sum_{j \in J} \langle x, e_j \rangle_A \langle e_j, x \rangle_A = \sum_{j \in J} \langle Px, e_j \rangle_A \langle e_j, Px \rangle_A \\ &= \sum_{j \in J} \langle x, Pe_j \rangle_A \langle Pe_j, x \rangle_A = \sum_{j \in J} \langle x, x_j \rangle_A \langle x_j, x \rangle_A. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore  $\{x_j : j \in J\}$  is a standard frame of  $X_A$ . This proves (3) $\Rightarrow$ (4).

The implication (5) $\Rightarrow$ (1) follows from Proposition 2.4 and Lemma 3.2.  $\square$

## REFERENCES

- [1] J. Dixmier. *C\*-Algebras*. Translated from the French by Francis Jellet. North-Holland Mathematical Library, Vol. 15. North-Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam-New York-Oxford, 1977.
- [2] M. Frank and D. R. Larson. Frames in Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules and  $C^*$ -algebras. *J. Operator Theory* **48** (2002), no. 2, 273–314. arXiv:math.OA/0010189.
- [3] R. V. Kadison and J. R. Ringrose. *Fundamentals of the Theory of Operator Algebras. Vol. I. Elementary Theory*. Reprint of the 1983 original. Graduate Studies in Mathematics, 15. American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 1997.
- [4] G. G. Kasparov. Hilbert  $C^*$ -modules: theorems of Stinespring and Voiculescu. *J. Operator Theory* **4** (1980), no. 1, 133–150.
- [5] E. C. Lance. *Hilbert C\*-Modules. A Toolkit for Operator Algebraists*. London Mathematical Society Lecture Note Series, 210. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1995.
- [6] V. M. Manuilov and E. V. Troitsky. *Hilbert C\*-Modules*. Translated from the 2001 Russian original by the authors. Translations of Mathematical Monographs, 226. American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 2005.
- [7] I. Raeburn and S. J. Thompson. Countably generated Hilbert modules, the Kasparov stabilisation theorem, and frames with Hilbert modules. *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **131** (2003), no. 5, 1557–1564.



- [8] I. Raeburn and D. P. Williams. *Morita Equivalence and Continuous-Trace  $C^*$ -Algebras*. Mathematical Surveys and Monographs, 60. American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 1998.
- [9] A. Takahashi. Hilbert modules and their representation. *Rev. Colombiana Mat.* **13** (1979), no. 1, 1–38.
- [10] M. Takesaki. *Theory of Operator Algebras. I*. Reprint of the first (1979) edition. Encyclopaedia of Mathematical Sciences, 124. Operator Algebras and Non-commutative Geometry, 5. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 2002.
- [11] N. E. Wegge-Olsen.  *$K$ -theory and  $C^*$ -Algebras. A Friendly Approach*. Oxford Science Publications. The Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press, New York, 1993.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, SUNY AT BUFFALO, BUFFALO, NY 14260-2900, U.S.A.

*E-mail address:* `hfli@math.buffalo.edu`