

# Comment on “Bell Experiment with Genuine Energy-Time Entanglement” by Cabello *et al.*: Why Franson’s Experiment Violates Local Realism

Luiz Carlos Ryff

*Instituto de Física, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro,  
Caixa Postal 68528, 21941-972 RJ, Brazil*

e-mail: ryff@if.ufrj.br

October 30, 2018

## Abstract

It is shown that the model introduced by Cabello *et al.* to criticize the Franson experiment suffers from the same weakness as the previous model introduced by Aerts *et al.* with the same purpose. It is also shown why we can assume with confidence that the Franson experiment does violate local realism.

In a recent article [1], Cabello *et al.* introduced a local model which violates a Bell-CHSH inequality [2] for the Franson experiment [3]. However, their model presents the same deficiency as the model proposed by Aerts *et al.* [4]. As has been pointed out [5], to see this we can consider a Franson experiment in which the long path  $L_1$  (followed by photon  $\nu_1$ ) and the long path  $L_2$  (followed by photon  $\nu_2$ ) have different lengths,  $L_1$  and  $L_2$ , respectively. Now, even though the four possible combinations of photon paths,  $S_1$ - $S_2$ ,  $S_1$ - $L_2$ ,  $L_1$ - $S_2$ , and  $L_1$ - $L_2$  are distinguishable, the two above models still predict violations of a Bell-CHSH inequality. In consequence, they are totally unsatisfactory (there seems to be no reason to perform an experiment to see this). This also makes evident that “to conceive a local realistic model for Franson’s experiment is far from being an easy task, *even* considering real inefficient detectors, since the model has to predict an interference when  $L_1 = L_2$  and no interference when  $L_1 \neq L_2$ ” [5]. As a result, a model similar to the one discussed by Clauser and Horne [6] and that could mimic the quantum mechanical predictions for the Franson experiment seems much more difficult to be devised.

Franson’s experiment can also be modified in order to make evident some of the nonlocal aspects of entangled photons (e.g., the conflict between wave-like and nonlocal properties [7], and the possibility of obtaining interaction-free which-path information [8]). For that reason, a local model also has to mimic

the quantum mechanical predictions for these experiments, that is, it has to explain why the two-photon interference is no longer observed. This makes evident the versatility of the Franson experiment. Local models should display the same versatility.

## References

- [1] A. Cabello, A. Rossi, G. Vallone, F. De Martini, and P. Mataloni, arxiv: quant-ph/ 0809.4359 (2008).
- [2] J. F. Clauser, M. A. Horne, A. Shimony, and R. A. Holt, Phys. Rev. Lett. **23**, 880 (1969).
- [3] J. D. Franson, Phys. Rev. Lett. **62**, 2205 (1989).
- [4] S. Aerts, P. G. Kwiat, J.-Å. Larsson, and M. Żukowski, Phys. Rev. Lett. **83**, 2872 (1999).
- [5] L. C. Ryff, Phys. Rev. Lett. **86**, 1908 (2001).
- [6] J. F. Clauser and M. A. Horne, Phys. Rev. D **10**, 526 (1974).
- [7] L. C. Ryff, Quantum Semiclass. Opt. **10**, 409 (1998).
- [8] L. C. Ryff, Z. Naturforsch. **56a**, 155 (2001).