

Comments, suggestions, corrections, and further references are most welcomed!

SUBGROUPS OF CAPABLE GROUPS OF CLASS TWO AND PRIME EXPONENT

ARTURO MAGIDIN

ABSTRACT. We show that if G is any p -group of class at most two and exponent p , then there exist groups G_1 and G_2 of class two and exponent p that contain G , neither of which can be expressed as a central product, and with G_1 capable and G_2 not capable. We provide upper bounds for $\text{rank}(G_i^{\text{ab}})$ in terms of $\text{rank}(G^{\text{ab}})$ in each case.

1. INTRODUCTION.

A group is called *capable* if it is a central factor group. Capability plays an important role in P. Hall's scheme of classifying p -groups up to isoclinism (see [5]), and has interesting connections to other branches of group theory. The finitely generated capable abelian groups were classified by Baer [1]; currently available techniques seem insufficient, however, to give a similar classification for p -groups of class two, though determining whether a given finitely generated group of class two is capable or not can be done by finding its *epicenter* $Z^*(G)$, the smallest subgroup of G such that $G/Z^*(G)$ is capable; computing $Z^*(G)$ reduces to (relatively) straightforward computations with finitely generated abelian groups in this situation. See for example [3, Theorems 4 and 7].

A full classification for the p -groups of class two and prime exponent seems a modest and possibly attainable goal; some purely numerical necessary conditions [6, Thm. 1] and sufficient ones [8, Thm. 5.26] are known, and a number of results allow us to reduce the problem to a restricted subclass. If we let G be a group that is of class at most two and odd prime exponent p , it is not hard to show (for example, using [2, Prop. 6.2]) that if G is a nontrivial direct product, then G is capable if and only if each direct factor is either capable or nontrivial cyclic. We can write G as $G = K \times C_p^n$ where K is a group that satisfies $Z(K) = K'$, and so G is capable if and only if K is capable. If G can be decomposed as a nontrivial central product, $G = AB$ with $[B, A] = 1$ and $\{e\} \neq [A, A] \cap [B, B]$, then G is not capable [6, Prop. 1]. Ellis proved that if $\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ is a transversal for $G/Z(G)$, and the nontrivial commutators $[x_j, x_i]$, $1 \leq i < j \leq n$ form a basis for $[G, G]$, then G is capable. We are then reduced to considering groups in a restricted class; we give it a name for future reference:

Definition 1.1. We will denote by \mathcal{R}_p the class of all p -group G of odd prime exponent p such that $Z(G) = G'$, G cannot be decomposed into a nontrivial central product, and if $\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ is a transversal for $G/Z(G)$, then there is a nontrivial relation among the nontrivial commutators of the form $[x_j, x_i]$, $1 \leq i < j \leq n$.

2000 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 20D15.

The author was supported by a grant from the Louisiana Board of Regents Support Fund.

Unfortunately, the situation appears to be far from straightforward once we reach this point. In particular, as the two main results in this paper show, to determine whether such a G is capable we need a “holistic” examination of G : there are no forbidden-subgroup criteria for the capability or non-capability of G . Explicitly, we show that if G is any group of class at most two and odd prime exponent p , then G is contained in groups G_1 and G_2 , both in \mathcal{R}_p , and with G_1 capable and G_2 not capable.

In Section 2 we prove some properties of the 2-nilpotent product with amalgamation, which is our main construction tool. Section 3 contains our main results.

2. THE 2-NILPOTENT PRODUCT WITH AMALGAMATION.

Definition 2.1. Let A and B be nilpotent groups of class at most 2. The *2-nilpotent product of A and B* is defined to be the group $F/[[F, F], F]$, where $F = A * B$ is the free product of A and B . We denote the 2-nilpotent product of A and B by $A \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$.

The 2-nilpotent product was introduced by Golovin [4], with a more general definition that applies to any two groups A and B . When A and B are nilpotent of class at most two, then their 2-nilpotent product is their coproduct (in the sense of Category Theory) within the variety of all groups of class at most two, hence our choice of notation. The elements of $A \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$ can be written uniquely as $\alpha\beta\gamma$, with $\alpha \in A$, $\beta \in B$, and $\gamma \in [B, A]$; multiplication in $A \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$ is then given by:

$$(\alpha_1\beta_1\gamma_1)(\alpha_2\beta_2\gamma_2) = (\alpha_1\alpha_2)(\beta_1\beta_2)(\gamma_1\gamma_2[\beta_1, \alpha_2]).$$

A theorem of T. MacHenry [7] shows that $[B, A] \cong B^{\text{ab}} \otimes A^{\text{ab}}$ via $[b, a] \mapsto \bar{b} \otimes \bar{a}$ (where \bar{x} denotes the image of x in the abelianization, and this is the usual tensor product of abelian groups). Note that $A \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$ contains isomorphic copies of A and B and is generated by these copies, so if A and B are both of odd exponent n , then so is $A \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$.

Definition 2.2. Let A and B be nilpotent groups of class at most 2, $H < [A, A]$, $K < [B, B]$, and let $\varphi: H \rightarrow K$ be an isomorphism. The *amalgamated coproduct of A and B along φ* is defined to be the group

$$A \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B = \frac{A \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B}{\{h\varphi(h)^{-1} \mid h \in H\}}.$$

It is again easy to verify that $A \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$ contains isomorphic copies of A and B whose intersection is exactly the image of H identified with the image of K as indicated by φ .

Recall that a group G is said to be a *central product* of subgroups C and D if and only if $G = CD$ and $[C, D] = 1$. The direct product is thus a special case of the central product. If in addition we have that $C \cap D = Z(G)$ then we say that G is the *full central product* of C and D . The central product is said to be trivial if $C \subseteq D$ or $D \subseteq C$. We prove that if A and B are both nontrivial, then $A \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$ cannot be decomposed as a nontrivial central product.

Theorem 2.3. *Let A and B be nontrivial groups of class at most 2 and odd prime exponent p , let $H < [A, A]$, $K < [B, B]$, and let $\varphi: H \rightarrow K$ be an isomorphism. If $G = A \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{N}_2} B$, then $Z(G) = [G, G]$ and G cannot be expressed as a nontrivial central product.*

Proof. Identify A and B with their images in G . Let $\{a_1, \dots, a_m\}$ be a transversal for $A/[A, A]$, and $\{b_1, \dots, b_n\}$ a transversal for $B/[B, B]$. Since A is of exponent p , every element of A can be written uniquely in the form $a_1^{r_1} \cdots a_m^{r_m} a'$ with $0 \leq r_i < p$ and $a' \in [A, A]$, and similarly for every element of B . From the construction of the amalgamated coproduct it follows that $\{a_1, \dots, a_m, b_1, \dots, b_n\}$ is a transversal for $G/[G, G]$, and that $[G, G] \cong [A, A][B, B] \times [B, A]$. In particular, the commutators $[b_j, a_i]$, $1 \leq i \leq m$, $1 \leq j \leq n$ form a linearly independent subset of $[G, G]$ (viewing the latter as an \mathbb{F}_p -vector space).

Let $g \in G$; then we may write $g = a_1^{r_1} \cdots a_m^{r_m} b_1^{s_1} \cdots b_n^{s_n} g'$, with $0 \leq r_i, s_j < p$ and $g' \in [G, G]$. We first assert that $g \in Z(G)$ if and only if $r_i = s_j = 0$ for all i and j . Indeed, we have:

$$[g, a_i] = \prod_{j=1}^m [a_j, a_i]^{r_j} \cdot \prod_{j=1}^m [b_j, a_i]^{s_j}.$$

For this to be trivial, we must have $s_j = 0$ for each j . Symmetrically, computing $[g, b_j]$ we obtain that $r_i = 0$ for each i . Thus, $Z(G) = [G, G]$, as claimed.

Now suppose that G is decomposed as a central product, $G = CD$. We can express $a_1 = c_1 d_1$ for some $c_1 \in C$, $d_1 \in D$. Let

$$\begin{aligned} c_1 &= a_1^{r_1} \cdots a_m^{r_m} b_1^{s_1} \cdots b_n^{s_n} c', \\ d_1 &= a_1^{\rho_1} \cdots a_m^{\rho_m} b_1^{\sigma_1} \cdots b_n^{\sigma_n} d', \end{aligned}$$

with $c', d' \in [G, G]$; since $c_1 d_1 = a_1$, we have $r_1 + \rho_1 \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$, and $r_i + \rho_i \equiv s_j + \sigma_j \equiv 0 \pmod{p}$ for $2 \leq i \leq m$, $1 \leq j \leq n$. Since $[d_1, c_1] = e$, and

$$[d_1, c_1] = a'' b'' \prod_{i=1}^m \prod_{j=1}^n [b_j, a_i]^{\sigma_j r_i - s_j \rho_i}, \quad a'' \in [A, A], \quad d'' \in [B, B],$$

we have $0 \equiv \sigma_j r_1 - s_j \rho_1 \equiv \sigma_j r_1 + \sigma_j(1 - r_1) \equiv \sigma_j \equiv -s_j \pmod{p}$. That is, $c_1, d_1 \in A[G, G]$. Since $a_1 \notin Z(G)$, either $c_1 \notin Z(G)$ or $d_1 \notin Z(G)$. If both hold, then we have $C \subseteq C_G(d_1) \subseteq A[G, G]$ and $D \subseteq C_G(c_1) \subseteq A[G, G]$, hence $CD \subseteq A[G, G]$, which is impossible. Thus, exactly one of c_1 and d_1 is noncentral. Without loss of generality say $c_1 \notin Z(G)$ and $d_1 \in Z(G)$, so $a_1 = c_1 d_1 \in CZ(G)$.

Since none of b_1, \dots, b_n commutes with a_1 , and $a_1 \in CZ(G)$, we must have $b_1, \dots, b_n \in CZ(G)$ as well. That is, $B[G, G] \subseteq C[G, G]$. And since $b_1 \in C[G, G]$ and none of a_1, \dots, a_m commute with b_1 , we must also have $a_1, \dots, a_m \in C[G, G]$. Thus, $G = C[G, G]$, and so $[G, G] = [C, C]$ and $D \subseteq C$. Hence the central product decomposition $G = CD$ is trivial, as claimed. \square

We finish this section by describing the epicenter of an amalgamated coproduct.

Theorem 2.4. *Let A and B be nontrivial groups of class at most 2 and odd prime exponent p , let $H < [A, A]$, $K < [B, B]$, and let $\varphi: H \rightarrow K$ be an isomorphism. If $G = A \Pi_{\varphi}^{n_1, 2} B$, then $Z^*(G) = \{h \in H \mid h \in Z^*(A) \text{ and } \varphi(h) \in Z^*(B)\}$; that is, if we identify A and B with their images in G , then $Z^*(G) = Z^*(A) \cap Z^*(B)$.*

Proof. Let a_1, \dots, a_m be a transversal for $A/[A, A]$, and b_1, \dots, b_n a transversal for $B/[B, B]$. Following Ellis, for $x, y, z \in \{a_i, b_j \mid 1 \leq i \leq m, 1 \leq j \leq n\}$ let

$$J(x, y, z) = [x, y] \otimes \bar{z} + [y, z] \otimes \bar{x} + [z, x] \otimes \bar{y}$$

and let S be the subgroup of $G' \otimes G^{\text{ab}}$ generated by all such $J(x, y, z)$. By [3, Theorem 7], an element $g \in Z(G) = [G, G]$ lies in $Z^*(G)$ if and only if $g \otimes w \in S$

for all $w \in \{a_i, b_j\}$. Since $G' \cong [A, A][B, B] \times (B^{\text{ab}} \otimes A^{\text{ab}})$, $G^{\text{ab}} \cong A^{\text{ab}} \times B^{\text{ab}}$, and all terms are elementary abelian p -groups, we have that $G' \otimes G^{\text{ab}}$ is isomorphic to

$$(C \otimes (A^{\text{ab}} \times B^{\text{ab}})) \oplus \left(\bigoplus_{i,k=1}^m \bigoplus_{j=1}^n \langle [b_j, a_i] \otimes \overline{a_k} \rangle \right) \oplus \left(\bigoplus_{j,k=1}^n \bigoplus_{i=1}^m \langle [b_j, a_i] \otimes \overline{b_k} \rangle \right),$$

where C is the central product of $[A, A]$ and $[B, B]$ obtained by identifying H with K along φ . An easy computation shows that none of the elements $J(x, y, z)$ has a nontrivial $[b_j, a_i] \otimes \overline{b_j}$ component. Thus, if $g \in G'$ has a nontrivial $[B, A]$ component, say $[b_j, a_i]$, then it follows that $g \otimes \overline{b_j}$ does not lie in S , so g is not in $Z^*(G)$. Thus, $Z^*(G) \subseteq C = [A, A][B, B]$.

Consider the elements $J(x, y, z)$ in which at least one of x, y, z is equal to b_1 . Unless the other two lie in B , such generators include nontrivial $[B, A] \otimes (B^{\text{ab}} \times A^{\text{ab}})$ components that do not occur in any other generator. Thus, if $g \in G'$ lies in $Z^*(G)$, then since $g \otimes \overline{b_1}$ must lie in S , we must have that g can be expressed in terms of commutators of b_1, \dots, b_m ; that is, $g \in [B, B]$. By a symmetric argument considering a_1 instead, we obtain that if $g \in Z^*(G)$ then $g \in [A, A]$. Thus, $Z^*(G)$ is contained in $[A, A] \cap [B, B] = H$.

If $g \in H$ lies in $Z^*(G)$, then $g \otimes \overline{a_i} \in S$ for each i , and this readily yields that $g \otimes \overline{a}$ lies in the subgroup of $[A, A] \otimes A^{\text{ab}}$ generated by all $J(a_i, a_j, a_k)$; thus $g \in Z^*(A)$; symmetrically, since $g \otimes \overline{b_j} \in S$ we obtain that g (considered now as an element of K) lies in $Z^*(B)$, so $Z^*(G) \subseteq Z^*(A) \cap Z^*(B)$. Conversely, if $h \in H \cap Z^*(A)$ is such that $\varphi(h) \in Z^*(B)$, then $h \otimes \overline{a_i} \in \langle J(a_r, a_s, a_t) \rangle$ for all i and $\varphi(h) \otimes \overline{b_j} \in \langle J(b_r, b_s, b_t) \rangle$ for all j , hence $h = \varphi(h) \in Z^*(G)$, giving the desired equality. \square

3. MAIN RESULTS.

We now give the promised results.

Theorem 3.1. *Let G be any nontrivial group of class at most 2 and odd prime exponent p . Then there exists a capable group $G_1 \in \mathcal{R}_p$ that contains G . Moreover, we may choose G_1 such that $\text{rank}(G_1^{\text{ab}}) \leq \text{rank}(G^{\text{ab}}) + 3$.*

Proof. We construct G_1 in two steps. If G is nonabelian and capable, set $G_0 = G$; otherwise, let $G_0 = G \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} C_p$. To obtain G_1 , let $H = C_p \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} C_p$, and let φ be an isomorphism between $[H, H]$ and a nontrivial cyclic subgroup of $[G_0, G_0]$. Finally, let $G_1 = G_0 \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{N}_2} H$. Since G_0 is capable, G_1 is capable; by Theorem 2.3 G_1 is not a nontrivial central product. The identification of the generator of $[H, H]$ with a nontrivial element of $[G_0, G_0]$ guarantees the existence of a nontrivial relation among commutators of any transversal, hence $G_1 \in \mathcal{R}_p$, as desired. The rank inequality is immediate. \square

Theorem 3.2. *Let G be any nontrivial group of class at most 2 and exponent p . Then there exists a non-capable group $G_2 \in \mathcal{R}_p$ that contains G . If G is nonabelian, then we may choose G_2 such that $\text{rank}(G_2^{\text{ab}}) \leq \text{rank}(G^{\text{ab}}) + 6$. If G is abelian, then we may choose G_2 with $\text{rank}(G_2^{\text{ab}}) \leq \text{rank}(G^{\text{ab}}) + 7$.*

Proof. If G is nonabelian, let $H_1 = C_p \Pi^{\mathfrak{N}_2} C_p$, let $g \in [G, G]$ be nontrivial, and let H be the central product obtained by taking the direct product of G and H_1 and identifying g with a generator of $[H_1, H_1]$. Since this is a nontrivial central product with $[G, G] \cap [H_1, H_1] \neq \{e\}$, it is not capable and $g \in Z^*(H)$ by [6, Prop. 1]. Now

let $G_2 = H \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{M}_2} E$, where E is an extraspecial group of order p^5 and exponent p , and φ identifies g with a generator of $[E, E]$ (which is in $Z^*(E)$); since this is an amalgamated coproduct that identifies elements of the epicenters, Theorems 2.3 and 2.4 yield that G is not capable and lies in \mathcal{R}_p .

If G is abelian, then let H be the central product of $G \Pi^{\mathfrak{M}_2} C_p$ with $C_p \Pi^{\mathfrak{M}_2} C_p$ identifying a generator of $C_p \Pi^{\mathfrak{M}_2} C_p$ with a nontrivial commutator in $G \Pi^{\mathfrak{M}_2} C_p$; this is a noncapable group. We now let $G_2 = H \Pi_{\varphi}^{\mathfrak{M}_2} E$ where E is again the extraspecial group of order p^5 and exponent p , and φ identifies elements of the epicenters. Again, G_2 is not capable and lies in \mathcal{R}_p .

The rank inequalities are immediate. □

REFERENCES

- [1] Reinhold Baer, *Groups with preassigned central and central quotient group*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **44** (1938), 387–412.
- [2] F. Rudolf Beyl, Ulrich Felgner, and Peter Schmid, *On groups occurring as central factor groups*, J. Algebra **61** (1979), 161–177. MR **81i**:20034
- [3] Graham Ellis, *On the capability of groups*, Proc. Edinburgh Math. Soc. (2) **41** (1998), no. 3, 487–495. MR **2000e**:20053
- [4] O. N. Golovin, *Metabelian products of groups*, Amer. Math. Soc. Transl. Ser. 2 **2** (1956), 117–131. MR **17**:824b
- [5] P. Hall, *Verbal and marginal subgroups*, J. Reine Angew. Math. **182** (1940), 156–157. MR **2**,125i
- [6] Hermann Heineken and Daniela Nikolova, *Class two nilpotent capable groups*, Bull. Austral. Math. Soc. **54** (1996), no. 2, 347–352. MR **97m**:20043
- [7] T. MacHenry, *The tensor product and the 2nd nilpotent product of groups*, Math. Z. **73** (1960), 134–145. MR **22**:11027a
- [8] Arturo Magidin, *On the capability of finite groups of class two and prime exponent*, available at [arXiv:0708.2391](https://arxiv.org/abs/0708.2391)(math.GR).

MATHEMATICS DEPT. UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA–LAFAYETTE, 217 MAXIM DOUCET HALL,
P.O. BOX 41010, LAFAYETTE LA 70504-1010
E-mail address: magidin@member.ams.org