

The Schrödinger Equation: Derivation from Classical Mechanics Resulting in the Wave-Particle Duality and Other Principal Corollaries.

A.Granik*

June 21, 2024

Abstract

According to the widely accepted notion, the Schrödinger equation is not derivable in principle. In the present paper - in defiance of this pessimistic notion - this equation is derived for the first time. The derivation is surprisingly straightforward. It follows directly from the relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi equation in view of the discrete transfer of energy at micro-scales. The derivation results in a series of principal corollaries which were originally postulated by the architects of quantum mechanics. These corollaries include, in particular, the wave-particle duality and the critical relation between the classical action and the wave function (describing the particle dynamics at respectively macro- and micro-scales).

*Department of Physics, University of the Pacific, Stockton, CA.95211

”... with regard to the origin of the presented recipe (the Schrödinger equation) we have to unequivocally say: there is no derivation and there cannot be any. To derive means to obtain it logically from other laws. The Schrödinger equation has been guessed.”¹

1 Introduction

Thirty years after the above categorical statement by Mandelshtam, R. Feynman wrote [1]: ”For a particle moving freely in space with no forces, no disturbances, the correct law of physics is

$$\int H(x, x')\psi(x')dx' = -\frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \frac{d^2}{dx^2}\psi \quad (1)$$

Where did we get that from? Nowhere. It is not possible to derive from anything you know. It came out of the mind of Schrödinger, invented in his struggle to find an understanding of the experimental observation of the real world”².

In turn, the ”inventor” himself, E. Schrödinger, admitted in the second of his seminal papers [2]: ”So far we have only briefly described this correspondence³ on its external analytical side by the transformation [3]

$$S = \frac{\hbar}{i} L\psi \quad (2)$$

which is in itself unintelligible, and by equally incomprehensible transition from equating to zero a certain expression to the postulation that the space integral of the said expression shall be stationary”.

In the last 40 years after Feynman’s statement and 80 years after Schrödinger’s admissions, there have been many attempts to derive (1) from something ”we know.” A characteristic feature of these attempts is that they all have been based on either far reaching analogies or some *ad hoc* assumptions, such, for

¹L.I. Mandelshtam, *Lectures on Optics, Relativity, and Quantum Mechanics*, Nauka Publ.House, 1934 (translated from Russian by the author)

²in Eq. (1) $\psi(x)$ is the wave function and $H(x', x)$ is the Hamiltonian of the particle

³namely, between the Hamilton-Jacobi differential equation of a mechanical problem and the ”allied” wave equation. In Eq. (II) and in what follows, S is the classical action of the particle

example as the essentially probabilistic nature of quantum phenomena. As to the "unintelligible transformation" (2), it has never been derived at all. It was used later by R. Feynman as an underlying postulate in his groundbreaking path integral formulation of quantum mechanics.

In this paper we break with the deeply rooted belief of impossibility to "obtain (1) and (2) logically from other laws," as opined by L. Mandelstam. We show that both these fundamentals of quantum mechanics - the Schrödinger equation (1) and the critical relation (2) - are derivable in a regular (algorithmic) way using only two well-established and well-known rudiments of physics:

- 1) the classical relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi equation which follows directly from Newton's second law of motion (see Appendix A⁴),
- and
- 2) the experimental fact of energy transfer on micro-scales in discrete quanta.

2 MASSLESS PARTICLE

Let us begin from the relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi equation for a massless "particle" [see Appendix A, Eq.(A13)]

$$\left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial t}\right)^2 - c^2(\nabla S)^2 = 0 \tag{3}$$

This equation admits two solutions: the particle-like and the wave-like. As shown below, these two solutions are not independent but related on a micro-scale via the discrete character of energy transfer. This turns out to be the "key" which enables us to derive the Schrödinger equation from the above-mentioned rudiments.

2.1 Particle-Like Solution

⁴The numbers of equations in Appendix A have an extra letter A; for instance, Eq. (A11).

For simplicity sake, we consider the $1 - D$ case. A particle-like solution of (1) can be obtained by separating the variables:

$$S_p(x, t) = -Et + f(x) \quad (4)$$

where $E = \text{constant}$ is the energy of the massless "particle." Upon substitution of (4) in (3) and solving it with respect to x , we have

$$f = \frac{E}{c}x + \text{constant} \quad (5)$$

Without any loss of generality, we can set the above constant = 0. According to the definition of the action S , $df/dx = \partial S/\partial x = p_x \equiv p$. On the other hand, from the energy-momentum relation for a massless particle, it follows

$$\frac{\partial S}{\partial t} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t^2} - c^2 \frac{\partial S}{\partial x} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t \partial x} = 0 \quad (6)$$

Therefore a particle-like solution of (3) is

$$\frac{\partial S}{\partial t} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t \partial x} - c^2 \frac{\partial S}{\partial x} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial x^2} = 0 \quad (7)$$

2.2 Wave-Like Solution

The wave-like solution of (3) can be arrived at by transforming this relation into the wave equation. To this end, we differentiate (3) with respect to t

$$\frac{\partial S}{\partial t} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t^2} - c^2 \frac{\partial S}{\partial x} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t \partial x} = 0 \quad (8)$$

and then differentiate (3) with respect to x

$$\frac{\partial S}{\partial t} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t \partial x} - c^2 \frac{\partial S}{\partial x} \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial x^2} = 0 \quad (9)$$

Upon substitution of (9) in (8) we get

$$\frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial t^2} - c^4 \frac{\partial^2 S}{\partial x^2} \left(\frac{\partial S/\partial x}{\partial S/\partial t} \right)^2 = 0 \quad (10)$$

According to (3), we have $(\partial S/\partial x)^2/(\partial S/\partial t)^2 = 1/c^2$ which on substitution in (8) yields the wave equation

$$\frac{\partial^2 S_w}{\partial t^2} - c^2 \frac{\partial^2 S_w}{\partial x^2} = 0 \quad (11)$$

For a monochromatic wave, a general solution to (11) is a traveling wave of the frequency ω and the wave number k :

$$S_w = ae^{i(kx-\omega t)}, \quad a = \text{constant} \quad (12)$$

Thus, by considering one classical equation (3), we have obtained two solutions - relations (4) and (12) - which describe respectively two patterns of behavior of a massless particle:

- the particle-like behavior,
- and
- the wave-like behavior.

As a result, we can say that a massless particle exhibits the so-called wave-particle duality feature: on the one hand it behaves like a massive particle and on the other hand it behaves like a wave.

2.3 Derivation of the Schrödinger Relation, Eq.(2)

Now we are going to show that the two patterns of behavior of a massless particle are not independent. To find the relation between the particle-like, Eq. (4), and the wave-like, Eq. (12), solutions we differentiate the latter with respect to t and obtain

$$\frac{\partial S_w}{S_w \partial t} \equiv \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left(\frac{Ln S_w}{i} \right) = -\omega \quad (13)$$

On the other hand,

$$\frac{\partial S_p}{\partial t} \equiv -E \quad (14)$$

To relate (14) and (13), we use Planck's hypothesis and its subsequent development by Einstein who has found that the electro-magnetic energy on a micro-scale is emitted and received in discrete quanta, that is,

$$E = \hbar\omega \quad (15)$$

Thus at micro-scales the energy of a massless particle given by Eq. (14) is equal to its expression given by (15). Therefore by substituting (15) in (14), and using (13) we get

$$\frac{\partial S_p}{\partial t} \equiv -\hbar\omega = \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left(\frac{\hbar}{i} \text{Ln} S_w \right) \quad (16)$$

From (16) follows

$$S_p = \frac{\hbar}{i} \text{Ln} \psi \quad (17)$$

where

$$\psi = AS_w, \quad (18)$$

A is an arbitrary constant, and we call ψ the wave function.

Thus we have derived relation (17) directly from classical mechanics (that is from "what we know") modified by the existence of the lower bound on the amount of energy transfer at micro-scales. This equation is the very same "unintelligible" transformation (2) "invented" by Schrödinger, and which was presumed impossible to derive "from anything we know".

2.4 Derivation of the Schrödinger Equation, Eq. (1)

By the definition, the particle's momentum $p_x = \partial S / \partial x$. Upon substitution in this definition relations (17), (18), and the wave solution (12) we obtain the relation between the particle's momentum p and the wave number k

$$\frac{\partial S_p}{\partial x} = p = \frac{\hbar}{i} \frac{1}{\psi} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x} = \hbar k \quad (19)$$

This is the famous de Broglie relation for a massless particle, which he obtained with the help of rather contrived notions of internal and external oscillatory processes. If we identically rewrite Eq. (19), we obtain the relation between the particle's momentum and the wave function in the following form

$$\frac{\hbar}{i} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x} = p\psi \quad (20)$$

Quite similarly, we get from (14), (17), (18) and (12)

$$-E = \frac{\partial S_p}{\partial t} = \frac{1}{\psi} \frac{\hbar}{i} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial t} \rightarrow i\hbar \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial t} = E\psi \quad (21)$$

Thus for a massless particle its momentum and energy emerge as the eigenvalues of the operators $(\hbar/i)\partial/\partial x$ and $(i\hbar)\partial/\partial t$ acting on the wave function ψ .

As the next step, we differentiate (20) with respect to x and (21) with respect to t and obtain respectively

$$\left(\frac{\hbar}{i}\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)\left(\frac{\hbar}{i}\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\right)\psi = p\frac{\hbar}{i}\frac{\partial\psi}{\partial x} = p^2\psi \quad \text{or} \quad -\hbar^2\frac{\partial^2\psi}{\partial x^2} = p^2\psi \quad (22)$$

$$\left(\hbar i\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\right)\left(\hbar i\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\right)\psi = E\left(\hbar i\frac{\partial\psi}{\partial t}\right) = E^2\psi \quad \text{or} \quad -\hbar^2\frac{\partial^2\psi}{\partial t^2} = E^2\psi \quad (23)$$

We rewrite (22) and (23) one more time

$$\begin{aligned} -\hbar^2\frac{1}{\psi}\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2}\psi &= p^2 \\ -\hbar^2\frac{1}{\psi}\frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2}\psi &= E^2 \end{aligned} \quad (24)$$

On the other hand,

$$\begin{aligned} p^2 &= \left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial x}\right)^2 \\ E^2 &= \left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial t}\right)^2 \end{aligned} \quad (25)$$

At the first glance, it seems that two different representations of p^2 and E^2 in Eqs. (24) and (25) are not consistent. However, this is not the case. In fact by using (17) we have

$$\begin{aligned} -\hbar^2\frac{1}{\psi}\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2}\psi &= \left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial x}\right)^2 = -\hbar^2\frac{1}{\psi^2}\left(\frac{\partial\psi}{\partial x}\right)^2, \\ -\hbar^2\frac{1}{\psi}\frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2}\psi &= \left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial t}\right)^2 = -\hbar^2\frac{1}{\psi^2}\left(\frac{\partial\psi}{\partial t}\right)^2 \end{aligned}$$

Rearranging these equations we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\psi \partial^2 \psi / \partial x^2 - (\partial \psi / \partial x)^2}{\psi^2} &\equiv \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \left(\frac{\partial \psi / \partial x}{\psi} \right) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} (Ln\psi) = 0, \\ \frac{\partial^2 \psi / \partial t^2 - (\dot{\psi})^2}{\psi^2} &= \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} (Ln\psi) = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (26)$$

The solution of (26)

$$Ln\psi = i(kx - \omega t) \quad (27)$$

gives us the solution (12) for the wave function of a free massless relativistic particle.

The derived relations (22) and (23) allow us to obtain the Schrödinger equation for a massless relativistic "particle", if we use relation $E = cp$, Eq.(6), which follows from the relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi equation (3):

$$\begin{aligned} -\hbar^2 \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \psi &= E^2 \psi = c^2 p^2 \psi = -c^2 \hbar^2 \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} \psi \quad or \\ \hbar^2 \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \psi - c^2 \hbar^2 \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} \psi &= 0 \end{aligned} \quad (28)$$

The last equation of (28) is the Schrödinger equation [identical to the wave equation (10), multiplied by \hbar] for a massless particle.

3 MASSIVE PARTICLE

3.1 The Derivation of the 3-D Schrödinger Equation for a Massive Particle.

Let us consider a free relativistic particle of the rest mass m_0 . The relativistic Hamilton -Jacobi equation for a free massive particle is [see Appendix A, Eq.(A11)]

$$\left(\frac{\partial S_p}{\partial t} \right)^2 - c^2 (grad S_p)^2 = m_0^2 c^4 \quad (29)$$

A solution of (29) is obtained by the separation of variables

$$S_p = -Et + \vec{p} \cdot \vec{r} \quad (30)$$

Inserting (30) in (29) we get the special-relativistic energy-momentum formula

$$E^2 = p^2 c^2 + m_0 c^4 \quad (31)$$

According to the Lemma 1 in Appendix B [Equation (B3)], the substitution [identical to Eq.(17) for a massless particle]

$$S_p = ALn\psi \quad (32)$$

transforms equation (29) into the homogeneous second order nonlinear PDF

$$A^2 \left(\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial t} \right)^2 - c^2 A^2 (\text{grad } \psi)^2 = m_0^2 c^4 \psi^2 \quad (33)$$

where constant A to be determined. Furthermore, according to corollary to Lemma 2 [Equation (B21) in Appendix B] equation (33) is equivalent to the following wave equation:

$$A^2 \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial t^2} - A^2 c^2 \left(\frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial y^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial z^2} \right) - m_0^2 c^4 \psi = 0 \quad (34)$$

whose general solution is a traveling monochromatic wave

$$\psi = \text{const} \exp(i\vec{k} \cdot \vec{r} - i\omega t), \quad \vec{k}(k_x, k_y, k_z), \quad \vec{r}(x, y, z) \quad (35)$$

The respective dispersion relation $\omega = \omega(k)$ is given by Eq.(B15) in Appendix B:

$$\omega = \sqrt{c^2 k^2 - (m_0 c^2 / A)^2} \quad (36)$$

Thus, even a massive particle exhibits the wave-particle duality, formally expressed by the existence of two solutions: particle-like (30) corresponding to the Hamilton-Jacobi equation (29) and wave-like (35) corresponding to the wave equation (34).

To find the value of constant A we substitute (32) in the definition of the particle's energy (14), use the solution (35), and add the postulate that at micro-scales a massive particle's energy is transferred in "chunks" according to Eq.(15), that is

$$-E = -\hbar\omega = \frac{\partial S_p}{\partial t} = A \frac{1}{\psi} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial t} = -Ai\omega \quad (37)$$

As a result we obtain

$$A = \frac{\hbar}{i} \quad (38)$$

which upon substitution in (32) yields for a free massive particle exactly the same transformation ("invented" by Schrödinger) as we obtained in section 2, Eq.(17), for a massless particle.

Finally, by using (38) in the wave equation (34) we obtain the Schrödinger equation for a free relativistic particle

$$\hbar^2 \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial t^2} - \hbar^2 c^2 \left(\frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial y^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial z^2} \right) + m_0^2 c^4 \psi = 0 \quad (39)$$

From (38) and (32) also follows that relations (24) derived for a free massless particle hold true for a free massive particle.

3.2 Derivation of the De Broglie Relation for a Massive Particle.

Now we will derive the de Broglie relation, Eq.(19), for a massive particle. By (30) and (32) we have

$$\nabla S_p = \mathbf{p} = \frac{\hbar \text{grad} \psi}{\psi} \quad (40)$$

Upon substitution of (35) in (40) we obtain the de Broglie relation

$$\mathbf{p} = \hbar \mathbf{k} \quad (41)$$

for a massive relativistic particle, this time rigorously derived from classical mechanics supplemented by the requirement of the discrete character of energy transfer. This is in contradistinction to the method used by de Broglie who employed rather artificial concepts of the internal and external oscillations associated with a particle.

Let us return to the dispersion relation (B15). By inserting (36) in (35) we get

$$\omega = \sqrt{c^2 k^2 + \left(\frac{m_0 c^2}{\hbar} \right)^2} \quad (42)$$

From (42) we find the phase and group velocities corresponding to the wave properties of a relativistic "particle" at micro-scales

$$\begin{aligned}
v_{ph} &= \frac{\omega}{k} = c\sqrt{1 + \left(\frac{m_0c}{\hbar k}\right)^2} > c, \\
\mathbf{v}_{gr} &= \frac{d\omega}{d\mathbf{k}} = \frac{c^2\mathbf{k}}{\sqrt{c^2k^2 + \left(\frac{m_0c^2}{\hbar}\right)^2}} \equiv \frac{\hbar\mathbf{k}/m_0}{\sqrt{1 + \left(\frac{\hbar k}{m_0c}\right)^2}}, \\
|\mathbf{v}_{gr}| &= c\frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + \left(\frac{m_0c}{\hbar k}\right)^2}} < c
\end{aligned} \tag{43}$$

On the other hand, the velocity of a relativistic particle is

$$\mathbf{v} = \frac{\mathbf{p}/m_0}{\sqrt{1 + (p/m_0c)^2}} = \frac{\hbar\mathbf{k}/m_0}{\sqrt{1 + (\hbar k/m_0c)^2}}$$

where we use (41). Thus in this case the group velocity of the wave coincides with the particle velocity of the wave-particle complex.

3.3 The Non-Relativistic Schrödinger Equation for a Massive Particle

To obtain the Schrödinger equation for a free non-relativistic particle we eliminate the rest-energy from (39) by representing ψ as follows

$$\psi = \psi_0(x, y, z)e^{-im_0c^2t/\hbar} \tag{44}$$

Upon substitution of (44) in (39) we get

$$\hbar^2 \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \psi_0 - 2i\hbar m_0 c^2 \frac{\partial \psi_0}{\partial t} - c^2 \hbar^2 \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial y^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial z^2} \right) \psi_0 = 0 \tag{45}$$

We divide both sides of (45) by c^2 and take the non-relativistic limit $c \rightarrow \infty$:

$$\begin{aligned}
\lim_{c \rightarrow \infty} \left[\frac{\hbar^2}{c^2} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \psi_0 - 2i\hbar m_0 c^2 \frac{\partial \psi_0}{\partial t} - \hbar^2 \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial y^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial z^2} \right) \psi_0 \right] &= \\
= -2i\hbar m_0 \frac{\partial \psi_0}{\partial t} - \hbar^2 \left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial y^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial z^2} \right) \psi_0 &= 0
\end{aligned} \tag{46}$$

which results in

$$i\hbar\frac{\partial\psi_0}{\partial t} + \frac{\hbar^2}{2m_0}\left(\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2}\right)\psi_0 = 0 \quad (47)$$

Equation (47) is the non-relativistic Schrödinger equation for a free particle of mass .

4 CONCLUSION.

For the first time we have systematically and in a surprisingly elementary fashion derived (not "invented" as was done by Schrödinger [2],[3]) the Schrödinger equation for a free particle directly from the classical relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi equation and the fact that at micro-scales the energy is transferred in discrete portions.

One of the corollaries of our derivation is the crucial transformation (17), lying at the heart of both the Schrödinger approach and Feynman's path integral method [5]. We write it as follows:

$$\psi = const \exp(iS_p/h) \quad (48)$$

Our derivation of (48) establishes a solid physical foundations for *ad hoc* introduction of this transformation (without any physical justification) by all the major architects of quantum mechanics: Schrödinger [1], Dirac [4], and Feynman [5]. In our paper this crucial relation emerges as a natural consequence of the wave-particle duality. This means that at micro-scales the action variable for a particle S_p is replaced by the wave function ψ incorporating the dual character of phenomena at such scales. Another natural corollary of our derivation is that the representations of particle's momentum and energy as the eigenvalues of the partial differential operators are the side products of the dual character of the phenomena at micro-scales

Acknowledgments. The author would like to thank Prof.V.Granik for the illuminating discussions and the help in the preparation of the manuscript.

References

- [1] R.P. Feynman, R.B. Leighton, and M. Sands (1965). The Feynman Lectures on Physics. Vol. III. Addison-Wesley, Reading.
- [2] E. Schrödinger (1926). Quantizierung als Eigenwertproblem (Zweite Mitteilung)[Quantization as an Eigenvalue Problem (Part II)]. Annalen der Physik. Vol. 79, 489-527.
- [3] E. Schrödinger (1926). Quantizierung als Eigenwertproblem (Erste Mitteilung)[Quantization as an Eigenvalue Problem (Part I)]. Annalen der Physik. Vol. 79, 361-376.
- [4] P.A.M. Dirac, "The Lagrangian in Quantum Mechanics", Physicalische Zeitschrift der Sowietunion, Band 3, Heft 1, pp. 64-72,1933
- [5] R.Feynman, A.Hibbs, "Quantum Mechanics and Path Integrals", McGraw Hill, 1965

5 APPENDIX A

5.1 Derivation of the relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi Equation from the Second Law of Newton

Let us consider the second law of Newton for a relativistic particle in the potential field $\Phi(\mathbf{r})$, $\mathbf{r}(x, y, z)$

$$\frac{d\mathbf{p}}{dt} = -\frac{\partial\Phi}{\partial\mathbf{r}} \quad (\text{A1})$$

Here the relativistic momentum \mathbf{p} of the particle is

$$\mathbf{p} = \frac{m_0\mathbf{v}}{\sqrt{1 - v^2/c^2}}. \quad v^2 = \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v} \quad (\text{A2})$$

For the following we express the particle's velocity \mathbf{v} in terms of its momentum \mathbf{p} . We obtain from (A2):

$$\mathbf{v} = \frac{\mathbf{p}/m_0}{\sqrt{1 + p^2/m_0^2c^2}}, \quad p^2 = \mathbf{p} \cdot \mathbf{p} \quad (\text{A3})$$

Now we consider the momentum \mathbf{p} as a function of time t and spatial coordinates x, y, z . This means replacement of the Lagrange description of motion by the Euler description. In the latter instead of moving with the particle, as in the former, a fixed observer watches the different path, which the particle can follow at different moments of time. As a result we rewrite (A1) as follows

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\mathbf{p}}{dt} &= \frac{\partial\mathbf{p}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{v} \cdot \text{grad})\mathbf{p} = \frac{\partial\mathbf{p}}{\partial t} + \frac{1}{m_0\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2}}(\mathbf{p} \cdot \text{grad})\mathbf{p} \equiv \\ &\frac{\partial\mathbf{p}}{\partial t} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{m_0\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2}}[\text{grad}(p^2) - \mathbf{p} \times \text{curl}\mathbf{p}] = -\text{grad}\Phi\end{aligned}\quad (\text{A4})$$

where we use the vector identity

$$(\mathbf{p} \cdot \text{grad})\mathbf{p} \equiv \frac{1}{2}[\text{grad}(p^2) - \mathbf{p} \times \text{curl}\mathbf{p}]$$

Since

$$\text{grad}(\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2}) = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\text{grad}(p^2)}{m_0^2c^2\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2}} \quad (\text{A5})$$

equation (A4) becomes

$$\frac{\partial\mathbf{p}}{\partial t} + m_0c^2\text{grad}\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2} - \frac{1}{2m_0} \frac{\mathbf{p} \times \text{curl}\mathbf{p}}{\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2}} = -\text{grad}\Phi \quad (\text{A6})$$

If we apply operation curl to both sides of (A6) we get

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}(\text{curl}\mathbf{p}) - \frac{1}{2m_0}\text{curl}\left(\frac{\mathbf{p} \times \text{curl}\mathbf{p}}{\sqrt{1+p^2/m_0^2c^2}}\right) = 0 \quad (\text{A7})$$

Equation (A7) is identically satisfied, if

$$\text{curl}\mathbf{p} = 0$$

This means that

$$\mathbf{p} = \text{grad}F \quad (\text{A8})$$

where $F(r, t)$ is a scalar function. As the next step we substitute (A8) in equation (A4) and obtain the following equation

$$\text{grad}\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t}F + m_0c^2\sqrt{1+(gradF)^2/m_0^2c^2} + \Phi\right) = 0 \quad (\text{A9})$$

Its solution is

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}F + m_0c^2\sqrt{1 + (\text{grad}F)^2/m_0^2c^2} + \Phi = f(t) \quad (\text{A10})$$

where $f(t)$ is an arbitrary function of t .

We introduce a new function

$$S = F(\mathbf{r}, t) - \int f(t)dt \quad (\text{A11})$$

Upon substitution of (A11) in (A10) we obtain the relativistic Hamilton-Jacobi equation for a free particle of mass m_0

$$\left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial t} + \Phi\right)^2 - c^2(\text{grad}S)^2 - m_0^2c^4 = 0 \quad (\text{A12})$$

For a free massless particle $m_0 = 0$, and equation (A12) yields

$$\left(\frac{\partial S}{\partial t}\right)^2 - c^2(\text{grad}S)^2 = 0 \quad (\text{A13})$$

6 APPENDIX B

6.1 Auxiliary Mathematical Lemmas.

LEMMA 1

A nonlinear partial differential equation of the m -th order with n arguments x_j , $j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$

$$\sum_{k=1}^n a_k \frac{\partial y}{\partial x_k} + \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk} \frac{\partial y}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial y}{\partial x_k} + \dots + \sum_{j,k,\dots,s=1}^n a_{jk\dots s} \overbrace{\frac{\partial y}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial y}{\partial x_k} \dots \frac{\partial y}{\partial x_s}}^m + b = 0 \quad (\text{B1})$$

is transformed into the homogeneous nonlinear equation of the same order

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{k=1}^n a_k A \psi^{m-1} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk} A^2 \psi^{m-2} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \dots \\ & + \sum_{j,k,\dots,s=1}^n a_{jk\dots s} A^m \overbrace{\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} \dots \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_s}}^m + b \psi^m = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B2})$$

by the following transformation of the function y :

$$y = ALn\psi \quad (\text{B3})$$

where A is a constant and the new function $\psi = \psi(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$

PROOF

Let us introduce a transformation

$$y = y(\psi) \quad (\text{B4})$$

Function $y(\psi)$ should be such that upon substitution of (B4) in (B1) it would convert it into equation (B2). Substitution of (B4) in (B1) yields

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{k=1}^n a_k \frac{dy}{d\psi} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk} \left(\frac{dy}{d\psi}\right)^2 \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \dots \\ & + \sum_{j,k,\dots,s=1} a_{jk\dots s} \left(\frac{dy}{d\psi}\right)^m \overbrace{\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} \dots \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_s}}^m + b = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B5})$$

Assuming that $dy/d\psi \neq 0$ we divide both sides of (B5) by $(dy/d\psi)^m$

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{k=1}^n a_k \frac{1}{(dy/d\psi)^{m-1}} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk} \frac{1}{(dy/d\psi)^{m-2}} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \dots \\ & + \sum_{j,k,\dots,s=1} a_{jk\dots s} \overbrace{\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} \dots \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_s}}^m + \frac{b}{(dy/d\psi)^m} = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B6})$$

Equation (B6) is transformed into equation (B2) if

$$\frac{1}{dy/d\psi} = \frac{\psi}{A} \quad (\text{B7})$$

or equivalently

$$\frac{dy}{d\psi} = \frac{A}{\psi} \quad (\text{B8})$$

where A is a constant.

Solving the differential equation (B8) we obtained

$$y = ALn\psi \quad (\text{B9})$$

The constant of integration has been included into the new function ψ .

Conversely, upon substitution of (B9) in (B1) we obtain equation (B2).

LEMMA 2

A homogeneous nonlinear partial differential equation of the $m - th$ order ($m = 2, 3, \dots$) with n arguments $x_j (j = 1, 2, \dots, n)$

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{k=1}^n a_k A \psi^{m-1} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk} A^2 \psi^{m-2} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + \dots \\ & + \sum_{j,k,\dots,s=1}^n a_{jk\dots s} A^m \overbrace{\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} \dots \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_s}}^m + b \psi^m = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (\text{B10})$$

with constants coefficients $b, a_j, a_{jk}, \dots, a_{jk\dots s} (j, k, \dots = 1, 2, \dots, n)$

has the oscillatory solution $\exp(i \sum_{j=1}^n \alpha_j x_j)$, $i \equiv \sqrt{-1}$ [with the dispersion relation $f(\alpha_j, a_j, a_{jk}, \dots, b) = 0$]

PROOF

We restrict our proof to a case important in physical applications, when the order of homogeneity is $m = 2$ and the number of arguments $n = 4$, with 3 spatial arguments x_1, x_2, x_3 , and the temporal argument $x_4 = t$. In this case Eq.(B10) written in the Cartesian coordinates is

$$a_{jk} A^2 \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + b \psi^2 = 0 \quad (\text{B11})$$

where the coefficients a_{jk}, b are real-valued and we use the summation over the repeated indices.

Upon substitution of

$$\psi = \text{const} \exp(i\alpha_l x_l), \quad l = 1, 2, 3, 4 \quad (\text{B12})$$

in equation (B11) we obtain the solution yielding the equation $f(\alpha_j) = 0$ with α_4 having the physical meaning of a wave frequency

$$(\text{B13})$$

Expanding (B13) we get

$$\begin{aligned}
& A^2 a_{44} \omega^2 + \omega A^2 [k_x(a_{14} + a_{41}) + k_y(a_{24} + a_{42}) + k_z(a_{34} + a_{43})] + \\
& + A^2 [(a_{12} + a_{21})k_x k_y + (a_{13} + a_{31})k_x k_z + (a_{23} + a_{32})k_y k_z] + \\
& + A^2 (a_{11} k_x^2 + a_{22} k_y^2 + a_{33} k_z^2) - b = 0
\end{aligned}$$

Solution of this equation gives us the dispersion relation $\omega = f(k)$ for the monochromatic wave described by solution (B12) of the equation (B11).

For the particular case corresponding to the Hamilton-Jacobi equation for a free particle $b = -m_0^2 c^4$ (c is the speed of light) and

$$a_{jk} = \begin{cases} -c^2, & j = k \neq 4, \\ 1, & j = 4, \\ 0, & j \neq k \end{cases} \quad (\text{B14})$$

The respective solution of (B13) is then

$$\omega = \sqrt{c^2 k^2 - (m_0 c^2 / A)^2} \quad (\text{B15})$$

Conversely, given function (B12) and the dispersion relation (B13) we obtain

$$\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} = \alpha_j \alpha_k \psi^2 \quad (\text{B16})$$

As the next step, we multiply (B16) by $A^2 a_{jk}$, sum the result over all the values of j and k (in our particular case $j, k = 1, 2, 3, 4$) and add the term $b\psi^2$:

$$A^2 a_{jk} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + b\psi^2 \equiv (A^2 a_{jk} \alpha_j \alpha_k + b)\psi^2 \quad (\text{B17})$$

Since by (B13) the expression in parentheses of (B17) is equal to zero, this proves that function (B3) is the solution of the original differential equation (B11).

COROLLARY.

Equation (B11) is equivalent to the following second order linear partial differential equation

$$A^2 a_{jk} \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} + b\psi = 0 \quad (\text{B18})$$

with the same constant coefficients as in (B11).

PROOF.

We identically rewrite (B18) as follows

$$\begin{aligned}
A^2 a_{jk} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} + b\psi^2 &\equiv \psi (A^2 a_{jk} \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} + b\psi) + \\
&+ A^2 \psi^2 a_{jk} \left[\frac{1}{\psi^2} \left(\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} - \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} \right) \right] = 0
\end{aligned} \tag{B19}$$

The expression in the last brackets is

$$\frac{1}{\psi^2} \left(\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_j} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial x_k} - \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} \right) \equiv \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \ln \psi \right) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} \ln \psi \tag{B20}$$

On the other hand, the original equation (B11) has a solution (B12), that is $\psi = \text{const} \exp(i\alpha_l x_l)$. Using this solution in (B20) we find that

$$\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x_j \partial x_k} \ln \psi = 0$$

Inserting this back in (B19) we obtain the wave equation (B18). For the special case given by (B14) equation (B11) is equivalent to the following equation

$$A^2 \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial t^2} - A^2 c^2 \left(\frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial x^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial y^2} + \frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial z^2} \right) - m_0^2 c^4 \psi = 0 \tag{B21}$$