## Quantum Noise in the Coherent Matter-Wave Displacement Reaction $A+B_2 \rightarrow AB+B$

H. Jing<sup>1,3</sup>, J. Cheng<sup>2</sup>, and P. Meystre<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>B2 Institute and Department of Physics, The University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona 85721, USA

of Technology, Guangzhou 510640, People's Republic of China

<sup>3</sup>Department of Physics, Henan Normal University, Xinxiang 453007, People's Republic of China

(Dated: March 15, 2019)

We demonstrate theoretically that the displacement reaction  $A+B_2 \rightarrow AB+B$  reaction can be realized efficiently with ultracold bosonic or fermionic matter waves by using a generalized dark-state technique. We show that this reaction is fundamentally different from the more familiar coherent atom-molecule conversion (combination/decomposition reaction) in that quantum fluctuations are critical in triggering its initial stages, with the appearance of non-classical correlations of the atomic and molecular fields as a result. This study opens up a promising new research regime of ultracold matter-wave superchemistry.

PACS numbers: 42.50.-p, 03.75.Pp, 03.70.+k

The making and probing of ultracold molecular gases has attracted much attention in recent years [1]. These studies open up novel applications well past the narrow confines of atomic, molecular, and optical physics, in directions ranging from condensed matter physics to quantum information science [2]. Starting from an atomic Bose-Einstein condensate (BEC), magnetic Feshbach resonances (FR) and/or optical photoassociation (PA) [3] can be exploited to create not only diatomic molecules but also more complex molecules, such as evidenced by the recent generation of trimers  $Cs_3$  [4] or tetramers  $Cs_4$  [5]. In another development of relevance for the present study, atom-dimer dark states were also produced through coherent two-color PA [6], a process sometimes called (non-Arrhenius) superchemistry [7].

So far, superchemistry has concentrated on the coherent association or dissociation reactions [8] between atoms and homonuclear or heteronuclear [9] molecules. In this Letter we extend these ideas to another type of elementary chemical reaction, the coherent displacement reaction  $A+B_2 \rightarrow AB+B$ . This reaction is an important benchmark system in chemical physics. Its dynamics has attracted much interest in recent studies of reactive resonance or low-energy non-Born-Oppenheimer reactivity through a cross-beam scattering method [10]. One main result of this note is to demonstrate that this bimolecular reaction can be realized and controlled efficiently in ultracold matter waves by exploiting a generalized atommolecule dark state. We also show that there is a fundamental difference between this and the extensively studied single-molecule assembly in that the present reaction is triggered by quantum noise, leading to large shot-toshot fluctuations that dominate its initial stage. From a technical point of view, this also implies that the meanfield Gross-Pitaevskii (GP) equation is not appropriate to describe the early stages of the reaction, and can be used only once the product reactant populations become macroscopic. This is in contrast with single-molecular

combination reactions such as the atom-dimer [3, 7] or atom-trimer conversion [11], and is reminiscent of quantum or atom optics situation such as e.g. the laser, superradiance and matter-wave superradiance, see for instance Refs. [12, 13, 14].

The basic idea in realizing the ultracold A+  $B_2 \rightarrow AB + B$  reaction is to first create highly excited trimers AB<sub>2</sub> via an entrance-channel atom-dimer Feshbach resonance, and to dissociate them into a closedchannel bound dimer and an atom via photodissociation. One important consideration is that the use of a scheme involving an intermediate trimer-state scheme permits one to exploit the existence of a coherent population trapping state (CPT) that prevents the trimer population from becoming significant throughout the conversion process. Such a generalized atom-molecule dark state does not exist in other schemes that involve e.g. an intermediate two-species atomic state. We believe that this is the first proposal for the coherent quantum control of matter-wave displacement reactions, and as such it represents a promising new paradigm for the field of ultracold matter-wave superchemistry [5, 7].

Our model system is illustrated by Fig. 1. Denoting the strength of the A+B<sub>2</sub> $\rightarrow$ AB<sub>2</sub> coupling with detuning  $\delta$  by  $\lambda'_1$ , the Rabi frequency of the dissociating laser by  $\Omega'_1$  and its detuning by  $\Delta$ , the dynamics of the system is described at the simplest level by the model Hamiltonian

$$\mathcal{H} = -\int dr \Big\{ \sum_{i,j} \chi'_{i,j} \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{i}(r) \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{j}(r) \hat{\psi}_{j}(r) \hat{\psi}_{i}(r) + \delta \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{t}(r) \hat{\psi}_{t}(r) + \lambda' \Big[ \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{t}(r) \hat{\psi}_{a}(r) \hat{\psi}_{b_{2}}(r) + \text{h.c.} \Big] + (\Delta + \delta) \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{ab}(r) \hat{\psi}_{ab}(r) - \Omega' \Big[ \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{ab}(r) \hat{\psi}^{\dagger}_{b}(r) \hat{\psi}_{t}(r) + \text{h.c.} \Big] \Big\}.$$
(1)

We consider first the case of a bosonic system, in which case the annihilation operators  $\hat{\psi}_i$ , where the indices  $i, j = a, b, b_2, ab, t$  stand for atoms (A and B), dimers (B<sub>2</sub> and AB) and trimers, satisfy standard bosonic com-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>School of Physical Science and Technology, South China University



FIG. 1: (Color online) Schematic illustration of the displacement reaction  $A+B_2 \rightarrow AB+B$  with coherent matter waves. Here both the atoms A and B can be bosonic or fermionic.

mutation relations. The terms proportional to  $\chi'_{i,j}$  describe *s*-wave collisions between these species. The trimer formation via atom-dimer resonance [15, 16] is actively studied in ongoing experiments. The nonlinear photodissociation of the trimers, typically induced by a narrow-frequency, continuous-wave laser, and the manipulation of the dissociation channels were also studied extensively [8, 17]. The Franck-Condon factor for this transition can be calculated, at least in principle, by the diatomics-in-molecules (DIM) description or other simulations of potential energy surfaces [18].

In the framework of a standard mean-field approach (MFA) where  $\hat{\psi}_i \to \sqrt{n}\psi_i$  we find readily

$$\begin{split} \dot{\psi}_{a} &= 2i \sum_{j} \chi_{a,j} |\psi_{j}|^{2} \psi_{a} + i\lambda \psi_{b_{2}}^{*} \psi_{t}; \\ \dot{\psi}_{b} &= 2i \sum_{j} \chi_{b,j} |\psi_{j}|^{2} \psi_{b} - i\Omega \psi_{ab}^{*} \psi_{t}; \\ \dot{\psi}_{b_{2}} &= 2i \sum_{j} \chi_{b_{2},j} |\psi_{j}|^{2} \psi_{b_{2}} + i\lambda \psi_{a}^{*} \psi_{t}; \\ \dot{\psi}_{ab} &= 2i \sum_{j} \chi_{ab,j} |\psi_{j}|^{2} \psi_{ab} - i\Omega \psi_{b}^{*} \psi_{t} + i(\Delta + \delta) \psi_{ab}, \\ \dot{\psi}_{t} &= 2i \sum_{j} \chi_{t,j} |\psi_{j}|^{2} \psi_{t} + (i\delta - \gamma) \psi_{t} + i\lambda \psi_{a} \psi_{b_{2}} \\ -i\Omega \psi_{b} \psi_{ab}, \end{split}$$

$$(2)$$

with  $\chi_{i,j} = n\chi'_{i,j}$ ,  $\lambda = \lambda'\sqrt{n}$  and  $\Omega = \Omega'\sqrt{n}$ , and the phenomenological decay rate  $\gamma$  accounts for the loss of intermediate trimers. For  $\psi_b(0) = \psi_{ab}(0) = 0$ , Eqs. (2) imply that there is no growth in the populations of the atoms B and of the dimers AB. This indicates that the mean-field GP equations, which are adequate to describe the short-time behaviors of the familiar coherent atomdimer or atom-trimer conversion processes [7, 11], break down completely in studying the onset of this type of reaction. A similar situation has been previously encountered in a broad range of systems in quantum optics, but also in ultracold atomic and molecular systems. Examples include matter-wave superradiance in Bose-condensed atoms and molecular matter-wave amplifiers [12, 13, 14]. Following a strategy developed in the study of these systems, we decompose the problem into an initial stage dominated by quantum fluctuations followed by a classical stage that arises once the various atomic and molecular components have acquired a macroscopic population. The initial quantum stage is treated in a linearized approach whose main purpose is to establish the statistical properties of the (classical) initial fields required for the classical stage [14].

To simplify the description of the initial stages we note that in the collisionless limit an effective secondquantized Hamiltonian can be obtained by adiabatically eliminating the intermediate trimer state,

$$\hat{\mathcal{H}}_{\text{eff}} = -(G\hat{c}_{ab}^{\dagger}\hat{c}_{b}^{\dagger}\hat{c}_{a}\hat{c}_{b_{2}} + h.c.) + \hat{c}_{0}, \qquad (3)$$

where  $\hat{c}_0 = \omega_1 \hat{c}_a^{\dagger} \hat{c}_a \hat{c}_{b_2}^{\dagger} \hat{c}_{b_2} + \omega_2 \hat{c}_{ab}^{\dagger} \hat{c}_{ab} \hat{c}_b^{\dagger} \hat{c}_b$ ,

$$G = (\lambda'\Omega'/\delta) \int dr \phi_{ab}^*(r)(r) \phi_b^*(r) \phi_a \phi_{b_2}(r),$$
  

$$\omega_1 = (\lambda'^2/\delta) \int dr \phi_a^*(r) \phi_a(r) \phi_{b_2}^*(r) \phi_{b_2}(r),$$
  

$$\omega_2 = (\Omega'^2/\delta) \int dr \phi_{ab}^*(r) \phi_{ab}(r) \phi_b^*(r) \phi_b(r),$$

and  $\hat{\psi}_i(r,t) = \phi_i(r)\hat{c}_i(t)$ . Equation (3) is reminiscent of the Hamiltonian describing spin-exchange scattering processes in a two-species two-pseudospin-state BEC [19].

For short enough interaction times, the populations of the products remain small compared to the total particle numbers  $N_0$ . In this regime, we can treat the fields  $\hat{\psi}_a$ and  $\hat{\psi}_{b_2}$  classically,  $\hat{c}_{a,b_2} \rightarrow \sqrt{N_{a,b_2}}$ , and then neglect the term in Eq. (3) describing only the interactions of the modes  $\hat{c}_{a,b_2}$ . This amounts to linearizing the dynamics of the fields  $\hat{c}_{ab}$  and  $\hat{c}_b$ , whose source is then the noise operators

$$\hat{f}_{j}^{\dagger}(t) = i\mathcal{G}\hat{c}_{j} \tag{4}$$

with

$$\langle \hat{f}_i^{\dagger}(t)\hat{f}_j(t')\rangle = 0, \quad \langle \hat{f}_i(t)\hat{f}_j^{\dagger}(t')\rangle = \mathcal{G}^2\delta_{ij}\delta(t-t').$$

where  $\mathcal{G} = G_{\sqrt{N_a N_{b_2}}}$  and i, j = ab or b here and in the following. It is those noise operators that trigger the initial evolution of the system from initial vacuum fluctuations. Mathematically, Eq. (4) is an atom-molecule analog of non-degenerate parametric amplifier of quantum optics [12].

The quantum noise-induced populations of the  $\hat{c}_{\rm g_2,b}$  mode and their fluctuations correlation are

$$N_{j} \equiv \langle \hat{c}_{j}^{\dagger} \hat{c}_{j} \rangle = \sinh^{2}(\mathcal{G}t) \approx N_{j}G^{2}t^{2};$$
$$\mathcal{C}_{ab} = \mathcal{C}_{b} \equiv \frac{\langle \Delta \hat{N}_{ab} \Delta \hat{N}_{b} \rangle}{\sqrt{N_{ab}N_{b}}} = 1 + \sinh^{2}(\mathcal{G}t) > 1, \quad (5)$$

where  $\Delta \hat{N}_j \equiv \hat{N}_j - \langle \hat{N}_j \rangle$ . Equation (5) can also be derived by solving Eq. (3) to second order in time with  $N_a = N_0 - N_{ab}$  and  $N_{b_2} = N_0 - N_b$ . Although the second factorial moment of the modes  $\hat{c}_j$  is typical of chaotic fields,  $g_j^{(2)} = 2$ , they are entangled, with

$$\left[g_{ab,b}^{(2)}\right]^2 - g_{ab}^{(2)}g_b^{(2)} = \sinh^{-2}(\mathcal{G}t) + 4\sinh^{-1}(\mathcal{G}t) > 0, \ (6)$$

indicative of a violation of the classical Cauchy-Schwartz inequality (CSI).

For comparison we comment briefly on the case where atoms A are bosonic and atoms B fermionic. We obtain similar equations of motion in that case, except that the noise operators  $(\hat{f}_{b_2}^{\dagger}, -\hat{f}_b^{\dagger})$  are now different. These equations can be solved via a Bogoliubov transformation, and we find that as a result of the Fermi statistics the vacuumnoise-triggered population is now  $N_j = \sin^2(\mathcal{G}t) < 1$ (for the zero-momentum mode [20]), with the dimer-atom pairs correlation becoming  $\mathcal{C}_{ab} = \mathcal{C}_b = 1 - \sin^2(\mathcal{G}t) < 1$ . The Mandel Q parameters [12] are

$$Q_j = \frac{\langle \hat{N}_j^2 \rangle - N_j^2}{N_j} = \begin{cases} (a) \ \cosh^2(\mathcal{G}t) > 1, \\ (b) \ \cos^2(\mathcal{G}t) < 1, \end{cases}$$
(7)

where (a) is for creating bosonic and (b) for fermionic matter-wave fields, which exhibit therefore super-Poisson or sub-Poisson statistics, respectively.

We conclude the discussion of the short-time dynamics by mentioning that the long-time quantum statistics of the AB and B populations, which are significantly influenced by the initial vacuum fluctuations, can be calculated by a positive-P representation technique [21] and other methods [19]. This is however beyond the scope of this note and will be investigated in subsequent work. Rather than adopting such a full quantum treatment, we proceed in the following by combining the mean-field description of Eqs. (2) with stochastic classical seed amplitudes with statistics consistent with the results of the short-time linearized quantum theory [14].

Now we turn to the long-time reaction dynamics. We proceed by numerically computing a large number  $n_T$ of trajectories (typically about 300) from initial classical seeds that satisfy the short-time statistics of Eq. (5). For each trajectory n, we use Eqs. (2) to calculate the particles populations  $N_{i,n}(t)$  where i = A, B<sub>2</sub>, AB, and B.

Figure 2 shows the standard derivation  $\Delta N_i(t)$  of the particle populations i=A, B, AB and B<sub>2</sub> for  $\delta = \pm 3$ , and the insert shows a range  $\pm \Delta N_i$  range about their mean,  $\bar{N}_i(t) \pm \Delta N_i(t)$  for  $\delta = 3$  and in the case of bosonic atoms. As expected, the small product seeds triggered by the initial quantum fluctuations are significantly amplified before reaching a stationary value for  $\delta = 3$ .

An important feature of the displacement reaction is that it can be controlled and optimized by exploiting the existence of a generalized atom-molecule dark state



FIG. 2: (Color online) Standard derivations of the atom and dimer populations  $(\Delta N_j(t) = \langle \Delta \hat{N}_j^2 \rangle^{1/2})$  for  $\delta = 3$  or  $\delta = -3$ . Time is in units of  $\lambda^{-1}$ , and  $\gamma = 1$ . The other parameters are given in the text. The trimer number remains zero at all times due to the CPT condition. Inset: fluctuating range of the populations  $\bar{N}_i(t) \pm \Delta N_i(t)$  for  $\delta = 3$ .

[6, 11]. Under a generalized two-photon resonance condition, Eqs. (2) admit a steady-state CPT solution such that a trimer state remains unpopulated at all times [22]

$$N_{ab,b}^{s} = \frac{2\mathcal{R}}{\left(1+\mathcal{R}\right)\left[1+2\mathcal{R}+\sqrt{(1-2\mathcal{R})^{2}+8\mathcal{R}\Omega^{2}/\lambda^{2}}\right]},$$
(8)

where we have applied the steady-state ansatz [11]  $\psi_i^s = |\psi_i^s|e^{i\theta_i}e^{i\mu_i t}$ ,  $(\theta,\mu)_{b_2,ab} = 2(\theta,\mu)_b$ ,  $(\theta,\mu)_a = (\theta,\mu)_b$  and  $\mathcal{R} \equiv N_a(0)/2N_{b_2}(0)$  is introduced to define the initial ratio of the particles numbers.

From atom number conservation we find  $N_a^s = [1 + 1/\mathcal{R}]^{-1} - N_{ab}^s$  and  $N_{b_2}^s = [2(1+\mathcal{R})]^{-1} - N_b^s$ . Using  $\partial N_{ab}^s / \partial \mathcal{R} = 0$ , we then find the maximum conversion rate  $N_{ab}^s |_{\max} = 1/3$  for  $\mathcal{R} = 1/2$ 

Figure 3(a) shows the mean particle populations obtained by averaging over  $n_T = 300$  trajectories. In this specific example atom A is <sup>87</sup>Rb and atom B is <sup>41</sup>K, two atoms for which good scattering parameters are available [23],  $\lambda = 4.718 \times 10^4 \text{s}^{-1}$  and  $\Omega(t) = \Omega_0 \operatorname{sech}(t/\tau)$ with  $\Omega_0/\lambda = 20, \ \lambda \tau = 20$ . The other parameters, in units of  $\lambda/n$ , the parameters, are  $\chi_{aa} = 0.5303$ ,  $\chi_{bb} = 0.3214$ , and  $\chi_{ab} = 0.8731$ . the other collision parameter values are taken as 0.0938 [23]. The scattering lengths of collisions involving molecular trimers, which depend on the details of the interatomic potential, are not known at this time. However it is straightforward to use different sets of parameters or even a Rb-Na atomic BECs [24] in our simulations. We find results similar to Fig. 2 in that case, with stable conversion always possible by appropriate values of  $\delta$ .

The departure of the product populations from the ideal CPT value is due to the fact that only an ap-



FIG. 3: (Color online) Populations of dimers and atoms for  $\delta = 3$  or  $\delta = -3$  by averaging 300 trajectories. Time is in units of  $\lambda^{-1}$ , and  $\gamma = 1$ . The trimer number remains zero at all times. The line labelled "CPT" shows the ideal population of products (dimers AB and atoms B).

proximate adiabatic condition exists for the CPT state. Here, the adiabaticity parameter of nonlinear system introduced by Pu *et al.* [7] can be derived as [25]:  $\gamma_{nl}(t) \approx \frac{|\dot{\eta}|}{1+\eta} \frac{1}{4\lambda} \ll 1$ , with  $\eta = \lambda/\Omega$ . This is different from the situation in linear systems, where the term  $\eta$  at the denominator is replaced by  $\eta^2$ . This implies that the adiabaticity condition  $\eta \gg 1$  becomes increasingly difficult to satisfy in the last stages of the reaction.

Finally we remark that by using  $^{87}$ Rb for the bosonic atoms A and  $^{40}$ K for the fermionic atoms B we can realize the conversion of molecular to fermionic molecules. This process is likewise described by Eqs. (2) with the substitution [26]

$$\chi_{j,j} |\psi_j|^2 \to A_j |\psi_j|^{4/3},$$
 (9)

where  $A_j = (6\pi^2)^{2/3}/4M_j$  and j = ab, b (*M* denotes the particle mass), provided that we ignore the *s*-wave collisions of fermionic particles and only consider their kinetic energy. In contrast to the purely bosonic case, molecule formation is now found to be stable for both positive and negative detunings, see Fig. 3(b).

In conclusion, we have shown that in the displacement reaction,  $A+B_2 \rightarrow AB + B$  the initial quantum fluctuations lead to strongly correlated creation of dimeratom pairs [19]. In addition, a generalized atom-molecule dark state existing in this system can enhance the creation of boson-boson or fermi-fermi dimeratom pairs.

Future work will concentrate of a full quantum description of the system and contrast the role of the quantum noise in creating boson-boson or fermion-fermion dimeratom pairs [13, 27, 28, 29]. While experiments along the lines of this analysis promise to be challenging, recent progress in ultracold chemistry [1, 3] and in the manipulation of atom-molecule system [4, 5, 6, 9, 15, 16, 17] indicates that achieving this goal with ultracold matter waves will become possible in the not too distant future.

This research is supported by the US Office of Naval Research, by the US National Science Foundation, by the US Army Research Office, and by the NSFC (10774047).

- K. Bongs and K. Sengstock, Rep. Prog. Phys. 67, 907 (2004); R. Krems, Int. Rev. Phys. Chem. 24, 99 (2005).
- [2] P. Meystre, Atom Optics (Springer-Verlag, 2001).
- [3] T. Köhler, K. Góral, and P. S. Julienne, Rev. Mod. Phys. 78, 1311 (2006); K. M. Jones, et al., ibid. 78, 483 (2006).
- [4] T. Kraemer, et al., Nature (London) 440, 315 (2006).
- [5] C. Chin, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 123201 (2005).
- [6] K. Winkler, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 063202 (2005).
- [7] D. J. Heinzen *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **84**, 5029 (2000);
   H. Pu, *et al.*, *ibid.* **98**, 050406 (2007).
- [8] V. Zhaunerchyk, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 98, 223201 (2007).
- [9] C. Ospelkaus, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 97, 120402 (2006).
- [10] E. Bodo *et al.*, J. Phys. B **37**, 3641 (2004); L. Che, *et al.*, Science **317**, 1061 (2007), and references therein.
- [11] H. Jing, J. Cheng and P. Meystre, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 133002 (2007).
- [12] P. Meystre and M. Sargent III, *Elements of Quantum Optics* (4th Edition, Springer-Verlag, 2007).
- [13] M. G. Moore and P. Meystre, Phys. Rev. Lett. 83, 5202 (1999); H. Pu and P. Meystre, *ibid.* 85, 3987 (2000); H. Uys and P. Meystre, Phys. Rev. A 75, 033805 (2007).
- [14] C. P. Search and P. Meystre, Phys. Rev. Lett. 93, 140405 (2004).
- [15] E. Nielsen, et al., Phys. Rev. A 66, 012705 (2002); M. Mackie, et al., Eur. Phys. J. D 31, 273 (2004).
- [16] P. Staanum, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 96, 023201 (2006);
   S. B. Papp and C. E. Wieman, *ibid.* 97, 180404 (2006).
- [17] S. Jung, et al., J. Phys. B **39**, S1085 (2006).
- [18] B. L. Grigorenko, A. V. Nemukhin and V. A. Apkarian, Chem. Phys. 219, 161 (1997), and references therein.
- [19] Y. Shi and Q. Niu, Phys. Rev. Lett. 96, 140401 (2006).
- [20] K. V. Kheruntsyan, M. K. Olsen, and P. D. Drummond, et al., (2005).
- [21] J. Hope and M. Olsen, Phys. Rev. Lett. 86, 3220 (2001);
   H. Jing and J. Cheng, Phys. Rev. A 74, 063607 (2006).
- [22] Details of the derivations will be published elsewhere.
- [23] G. Modugno, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 89, 190404 (2002).
- [24] We take the Rb-Na scattering length as half the critical value for a stable coexistence of Rb-Na BECs, i.e.,  $\chi_{ab}=0.0832$ . The other nonzero collisions:  $\chi_{b,b_2} = -1.4583$ ,  $\chi_{a,b_2} = -2.7502$ ,  $\chi_{a,ab} = \chi_{b,ab} = -1.0417$ .
- [25] Note that we have used:  $\Omega \psi_{ab,s} \dot{\psi}_{b_2,s} + \lambda_{b_2,s} \dot{\psi}_{ab,s} = \frac{\lambda \Omega \lambda \dot{\Omega}}{6} \left[ \frac{\sqrt{\lambda \Omega^3}}{\Omega(\lambda + \Omega)^2} (-1) + \frac{\sqrt{\Omega \lambda^3}}{\lambda(\lambda + \Omega)^2} \right] = 0.$
- [26] L.-H. Lu and Y.-Q. Li, Phys. Rev. A 76, 053608 (2007).
- [27] M. G. Moore and P. Meystre, Phys. Rev. Lett. 86, 4199 (2001); A. Robertson, et al., ibid. 99, 250404 (2007).
- [28] A. Nunnenkamp, D. Meiser and P. Meystre, New J. Phys. 8, 88 (2006).
- [29] M. Taglieber, et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 100, 010401 (2008).