

## ON LIMIT APERIODIC G-SETS

THANOS GENTIMIS

ABSTRACT. We prove that the property to be limit aperiodic is preserved by the standard construction with groups like extension, HNN extension and free product. We also construct a non-limit aperiodic G-space.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

If a discrete group  $G$  acts by isometries freely and cocompactly on a metric space  $X$  one can study periodic and aperiodic tilings of  $X$ . A tiling of  $X$  can be defined first as a tiling with one tile, the Voronoi cell (see [1]). Using a finite set of colors one can consider tilings of  $X$  by color. Then using the "notching" one can switch from a tiling by color to a geometric tiling. The standard example here is  $G = \mathbb{Z}^2$  and  $X = \mathbb{R}^2$ . Note that the group  $G$  in the above tilings is in bijection with the tiles. Thus, construction of a geometric tiling on  $X$  can be reduced to a coloring of the group  $G$ . In this paper we study the colorings of discrete groups  $G$  that lead to limit aperiodic tilings.

Let  $b \in G$ , a coloring  $\phi$  of a group  $G$  is  $b$ -periodic if it is invariant under translation by  $b$ , i.e., for every element  $g \in G$  the elements  $g$  and  $bg$  have the same color. A coloring  $\phi$  is aperiodic if it is not  $b$ -periodic for any  $b \in G \setminus \{e\}$ . This can be rephrased as "The stabilizer of  $\phi$  in the space of all colorings of  $G$  is trivial". For infinite groups there is a strong notion of periodicity: A coloring  $\phi$  is strongly  $G$ -periodic if  $|Orb_G(\phi)| < \infty$ . The corresponding negation called 'weakly aperiodic' means that the orbit  $Orb_G(\phi) = G/Stab_G(\phi)$  of  $\phi$  is finite. A coloring  $\phi$  is called (weakly) limit aperiodic if all colorings in the closure of the orbit  $\overline{Orb_G(\phi)}$  taken in an appropriate space of all colorings are (weakly) aperiodic.

In this paper we consider the question raised in [1]: *Which groups admit limit aperiodic colorings by finitely many colors?* This is not obvious question even for  $G = \mathbb{Z}$ . In [1] it was answered positively for torsion free hyperbolic groups, Coxeter groups, and groups comensurable to them.

This question can be stated in terms of Topological Dynamical Systems theory: *Let  $G$  be a group and  $F$  be a finite set. Does the natural action of  $G$  on the Cantor set  $F^G$  admit a  $G$ -invariant compact subset  $X \subset F^G$  such that the action of  $G$  on  $X$  is free?* The dynamical system reformulation of a corresponding question about limit weak aperiodic colorings asks about a  $G$ -invariant compact subset  $X \subset F^G$  such that the orbits  $Orb_G(x)$  are infinite for all  $x \in X$ . This was answered affirmatively by V. Uspenskii [1]. Moreover, E. Glasner proved that there is a minimal set  $X \subset F^G$  and  $x \in X$  with the trivial stabilizer  $Stab_G(x) = e$ . Despite on this progress the main question is still open. In this paper we give a group theoretic approach. We call a group 'limit aperiodic' (LA for short) if it admits a

---

*Date:* October 30, 2018.

*Key words and phrases.* limit aperiodic groups and G-sets.

limit aperiodic coloring by finitely many colors. We show that the simple group constructions like the product, the extension, the HNN extension, and the free product preserve the LA property. To prove these facts we introduce the notion of LA  $G$ -space and prove the action theorem. In the end of the paper we show that the main question has a negative answer for a specific  $G$ -set (the natural numbers) where  $G$  is a f.g. subgroup of  $\text{Aut}(\mathbb{Z})$ .

## 2. LIMIT APERIODIC GROUPS

**Definition 2.1.** Let  $G$  be a f.g. group. Also, let  $F$  be a finite set of elements which we can think of as colors. A map  $\phi$  from  $G$  to  $F$  is called a *coloring* of  $G$ .

**Definition 2.2.** Let  $G, F$  be as above. We denote by  $F^G$  the set of all colorings from  $G$  to  $F$ . If we consider  $F$  with the discrete topology,  $F^G$  with the product topology becomes a topological space homeomorphic to the Cantor set.

**Definition 2.3.** Let  $G, F$  as above. Then  $G$  acts on  $F^G$  with the left action  $\delta : G \times F^G \rightarrow F^G$  defined by the formula  $(g * f)(a) = f(g^{-1} \cdot a)$  for every  $g, a \in G$  and  $f \in F^G$ .

Since  $F^G$  is metrizable, a function  $\phi$  belongs to the closure of the orbit of  $f$ ,  $\phi \in \overline{\text{Orb}_G(f)}$ , if and only if  $\phi = \lim \phi_k$ ,  $\{\phi_k\} \subset \text{Orb}_G(f)$ . This is equivalent to the existence of a sequence  $\{h_k\} \subset G$  with  $\phi_k = h_k * f$ . The condition  $\phi = \lim(h_k * f)$  implies that for every  $g \in G$  there exists a  $k(g) \in \mathbb{N}$  with:  $\phi(g) = h_k * f(g)$  for all  $k \geq k(g)$ .

**Definition 2.4.** Let  $G, F$  as above. A map  $f : G \rightarrow F$  is called *aperiodic* if the equation  $b * f = f$  implies  $b = e$ .

If the equation  $b * f = f$  holds for some  $b \in G$  we call  $f$  *b-periodic* and  $b$  is called a *period* of  $f$ .

**Definition 2.5. (LA1)** Let  $G, F$  be as above. A map  $f : G \rightarrow F$  is called *limit aperiodic* if and only if every  $\phi \in \overline{\text{Orb}_G(f)}$  is aperiodic.

**Definition 2.6. (LA2)** Let  $G, F$  be as above. A map  $f : G \rightarrow F$  will be called *limit aperiodic* if for every  $g \in G \setminus \{e\}$  there exists a finite set  $S \subseteq G$ ,  $S = S(g)$ , such that for every  $h \in G$  there is a  $c \in S$  with  $f(hc) \neq f(hgc)$ .

**Proposition 2.7.** *These two definitions are equivalent for finitely generated groups.*

**Proof.** Suppose that  $f$  satisfies the (LA2) property but not the (LA1). Then there exists a  $\phi \in \overline{\text{Orb}_G(f)}$  such that  $\phi$  has period  $g \neq e$ . Then  $g^{-1}$  is also a period. Let  $\{h_k\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}} \in G$  such that  $\phi = \lim h_k * f$ . Choose the set  $S$  for that  $g$ . Since  $S$  is finite we also have that  $g \cdot S$  is finite. From the fact that  $\phi = \lim h_k * f$ , there exists an  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq n$  and for all  $x \in S \cup g \cdot S$  we have  $\phi(x) = h_k * f(x)$ . We apply LA2 for  $f$  with  $g$  and  $h_n^{-1}$  to obtain  $c \in S$  such that  $f(h_n^{-1}c) \neq f(h_n^{-1}gc)$ . This contradicts with the fact that  $g^{-1}$  is a period for  $\phi$ :

$$\phi(c) = (h_n * f)(c) = f(h_n^{-1}c) \neq f(h_n^{-1}gc) = (h_n * f)(gc) = \phi(gc) = (g^{-1} * \phi)(c).$$

Let's suppose now that  $f$  satisfies the (LA1) but not the (LA2). Then there exists a  $g \in G$  such that for every finite subset  $S$  of  $G$  there exists an  $h \in G$  with the property:

$$f(hc) = f(hgc)$$

for all  $c \in S$ .

Fix that  $g \in G$ . Take  $S_1 = \{c \in G : d(c, e) \leq 1\}$ . The distance mentioned is the one induced by the word metric in the Cayley graph of  $G$ . Since  $G$  is f.g.  $|S_1| < \infty$ , so, there exists an  $h_1 \in G$  with  $f(h_1c) = f(h_1gc)$  for all  $c \in S_1$ . Take  $S_2 = \{c \in G : d(c, e) \leq 2\}$ . Again  $|S_2| < \infty$ . Then there exists an  $h_2 \in G$  such that  $f(h_2c) = f(h_2gc)$  for all  $c \in S_2$ . Continue for any  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Thus we obtain a sequence  $\{h_k\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}} \in G$ . Taking a subsequence we may assume that there is a limit:

$$\phi = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} h_k^{-1} * f.$$

The claim is that  $\phi$  is periodic with period  $g$ . Consider an arbitrary  $x \in G$ . Name  $k_1 = d(x, e)$ , then  $x \in S_k$  for all  $k \geq k_1$ . Also since  $\phi$  is the limit of  $h_k^{-1} * f$  there exists a  $k_2 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_2$ :

$$\phi(x) = (h_k^{-1} * f)(x)$$

Finally since  $\phi$  is the limit of  $h_k * f$  there exists a  $k_3 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_3$ :

$$\phi(gx) = (h_k^{-1} * f)(gx)$$

Thus, for  $k \geq \max\{k_1, k_2, k_3\}$  we have:

$$\phi(x) = (h_k^{-1} * f)(x) = f(h_k x) = f(h_k gx) = (h_k^{-1} * f)(gx) = \phi(gx) = (g^{-1} * \phi)(x).$$

Since  $x$  was taken arbitrarily, we have that  $\phi$  has  $g^{-1}$  as a period. This is a contradiction since  $\phi$  belongs to the  $\overline{Orb_G(f)}$  and  $f$  has the (LA1) property.  $\square$

**Definition 2.8.** A finitely generated group  $G$  will be called *limit aperiodic* if it admits a limit aperiodic coloring  $f : G \rightarrow F$  with a finite set of colors  $F$ .

**Remark 2.9.** *The definition of limit aperiodic groups can easily be extended to any group and not only finitely generated ones. Both the property (LA1) and (LA2) apply to groups without the f.g. hypothesis. Their equivalence though depends on the fact that the group is finitely generated. For us a group (not necessarily finitely generated) will be limit aperiodic if it satisfies the (LA1) property.*

We recall the notion of uniform aperiodicity from [1]. Before we introduce that notion lets establish some notation:

**Notation.** Let  $\Gamma$  be the Cayley graph of a group  $G$  and  $d$  be the associated metric. We denote the *displacement* of  $g$  at  $h$  with:

$$d_g(h) = d(gh, h)$$

With  $B_r(h)$  we denote the ball of radius  $r$  with center  $h$ . Finally  $\|g\|$ , the norm of  $g$ , is the distance between  $g$  and  $e$  namely:

$$\|g\| = d(g, e)$$

**Definition 2.10.** Let  $G$  be a finitely generated group. A map  $f : G \rightarrow F$  where  $F$  is a finite set (of colors) will be called *uniformly aperiodic* (UA) if there exists a constant  $\lambda > 0$  such that for every element  $g \in G \setminus \{e\}$  and every  $h \in G$ , there exists  $b \in B_{\lambda d_g(h)}(h)$  with  $f(gb) \neq f(b)$ .

**Definition 2.11.** A finitely generated group is called *uniformly aperiodic* if there exists an  $F$  and a  $f$  as above, so that  $f : G \rightarrow F$  is uniformly aperiodic.

**Proposition 2.12.** *If  $f : G \rightarrow F$  is uniformly aperiodic then  $f$  is limit aperiodic.*

**Proof.** We show that  $f$  satisfies LA2. Let  $g \in G \setminus \{e\}$  and  $h \in G$  arbitrary chosen. Define  $S = B_{\lambda\|g\|}(e)$  to be the ball with center  $e$  and radius  $\lambda\|g\|$ .

Clearly since  $G$  is finitely generated,  $S$  is finite. Assume that there exists an  $h \in G$  such that for every  $c \in S$  we have  $f(hc) = f(hgc)$ .

Denote  $a = hgh^{-1}$ . We apply the UA condition for  $f$  with  $a$  and  $h$  to obtain  $b$  in  $B_{\lambda d_a(h)}(h)$  with  $f(ab) \neq f(b)$ . Since  $b \in B_{\lambda d_a(h)}(h)$  we have that:

$$d(b, h) \leq \lambda d_a(h) = \lambda d(hgh^{-1}h, h) = \lambda d(hg, h) = \lambda d(g, e) = \lambda\|g\|$$

where the third equality comes from the fact that the metric is left invariant. Notice that:

$$d(h^{-1}b, e) = d(h^{-1}b, h^{-1}h) = d(b, h)$$

Thus  $d(h^{-1}b, e) \leq \lambda\|g\|$ . This implies that  $c = h^{-1}b$  belongs to  $S$ . So

$$f(b) = f(h(h^{-1}b)) = f(hc) = f(hgc) = f(hgh^{-1}b) = f(ab)$$

which is clearly a contradiction.  $\square$

### 3. G-SETS AND LIMIT APERIODICITY

The notion of limit aperiodicity can be generalized in the case of  $G$ -Sets. Namely let  $X$  be a space and suppose that  $G$  acts on  $X$  giving it the structure of a  $G$ -set. We will use the notation  $gx = g(x)$  for  $g \in G$  and  $x \in X$ . Fix a finite set  $F$ , which we can consider again as colors.

Denote by  $F^X$  the set of all maps from  $X$  to  $F$ . Then  $F^X$  can become a  $G$ -set under the following action:

$$(g * f)(x) = f(g^{-1}x)$$

for all  $x \in X$ ,  $g \in G$  and  $f \in F^X$ .

Also denote by:  $Fix_G(X) = \{g \in G : g \cdot x = x, \forall x \in X\}$  the kernel of the action.

We naturally get the following definitions:

**Definition 3.1.** Let  $X$  be a  $G$ -set and let  $f \in F^X$ . We call  $f$  *limit aperiodic* if and only if for every  $\phi \in \overline{Orb_G(f)}$  we have that  $\phi$  is aperiodic meaning that if  $a * \phi = \phi$ , then  $a \in Fix(X)$ .

Thus we get the definition of limit aperiodic  $G$ -sets:

**Definition 3.2.** Let  $X$  be a  $G$ -set. If there exists a finite set  $F$  and a map

$$f : X \rightarrow F$$

such that  $f$  is limit aperiodic we say that  $X$  is a *limit aperiodic  $G$ -set*.

**Remark 3.3.** *If we consider a group  $G$  acting on itself with left multiplication then  $G$  is limit aperiodic as a  $G$ -set if and only if  $G$  is limit aperiodic as a group, because under that action  $Fix(G) = \{e\}$ .*

Let  $X$  be a  $G$ -set and let  $G_x = Stab_G(x) = \{g \in G \mid gx = x\}$  denote the stabilizer of  $x \in X$ .

**Theorem 3.4.** *Let  $X$  be limit aperiodic  $G$ -set and suppose that  $G$  acts transitively on  $X$ . Fix  $x \in X$  such that  $X = \text{Orb}_G(x)$ . If  $\text{Stab}_G(x)$  is a limit aperiodic group for some  $x \in X$  then  $G$  is a limit aperiodic group.*

**Proof.** Let  $\phi : X \rightarrow F_1$  be a limit aperiodic map for  $X$  and let  $\psi : G_x \rightarrow F_2$  be a limit aperiodic map for  $G_x$ . We know that there exists a bijection  $\pi$  between the set of left cosets  $G/G_x$  and the orbit  $\text{Orb}_G(x)$ . Fix a set of representatives in  $G$  namely  $\{a_i : i \in I\}$  for the quotients  $G/G_x$ . Then  $\pi(a_j G_x) = a_j x$ .

Define  $f = (f_1, f_2) : G \rightarrow F_1 \times F_2$  by  $f_1(g) = \phi(gx)$  and  $f_2(g) = \psi(a_j^{-1}g)$  where  $g \in a_j G_x$ . We will prove that this  $f$  is a limit aperiodic map. Suppose that this is false. Then there exists a map  $\bar{f} \in \overline{\text{Orb}_G(f)}$  and an element  $a \in G$  such that  $\bar{f}$  has  $a$  as a period, i.e.,  $(a * \bar{f}) = \bar{f}$  for all  $x \in X$ . Let  $\bar{f} = \lim h_k * f$  where  $h_k \in G$

Case 1) Suppose  $a \notin G_x$ . Consider the limit

$$\bar{\phi} = \lim_k h_k * \phi.$$

Note that we can always choose a subsequence of  $h_k$  such that the limit exists. For convenience we keep the same indices for the subsequence. Clearly,  $\bar{\phi} \in \overline{\text{Orb}_G(\phi)}$ . Given  $g \in G$ , there exists  $k_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_0$  we have:

$$\bar{\phi}(gx) = (h_k * \phi)(gx)$$

Also there exists a  $k_1 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_1$  we get:  $\bar{f}(g) = (h_k * f)(g)$ . Let  $k_2 = \max\{k_0, k_1\}$  then for all  $k \geq k_2$  we have  $\bar{f}(g) = f(h_k^{-1}g)$ . Therefore,

$$\bar{f}_1(g) = f_1(h_k^{-1}g) = \phi(h_k^{-1}gx) = (h_k * \phi)(gx) = \bar{\phi}(gx).$$

Following the previous proof and replacing  $g$  with  $a^{-1}g$  we find a  $k_3 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_3$  we have:

$$\bar{f}_1(a^{-1}g) = \bar{\phi}(a^{-1}gx)$$

Since  $\bar{f}_1$  has period  $a$  we have  $(a * \bar{f}_1)(g) = \bar{f}_1(g)$ . Hence,

$$(a * \bar{\phi})(gx) = \bar{\phi}(a^{-1}gx) = \bar{f}_1(a^{-1}g) = (a * \bar{f}_1)(g) = \bar{f}_1(g) = \bar{\phi}(a^{-1}gx).$$

Since  $g$  is arbitrary and  $G$  acts on  $X$  transitively we get that for every  $y \in X$ ,  $(a * \bar{\phi})(y) = \bar{\phi}(y)$ . Since  $\phi$  is limit aperiodic we have that  $a \in \text{Fix}(X)$ . But:

$$\text{Fix}(X) = \bigcap_{s \in S} \text{Stab}_G(s)$$

Thus,  $a \in \text{Fix}(X) \subseteq \text{Stab}_G(x) = G_x$  contradiction.

Case 2) Suppose that  $a \in G_x$ . Let  $\{h_k\}$  be a sequence of elements of  $G$  such that  $h_k^{-1}$  belongs to the coset  $a_k G_x$ . Thus  $\delta_k = h_k a_k$  belongs to  $G_x$ . Taking a subsequence we may assume that there are the limits

$$\bar{\psi} = \lim_k \delta_k * \psi \quad \text{and} \quad \bar{f} = \lim_k h_k * f.$$

Notice that  $\bar{\psi} \in \overline{\text{Orb}_{G_x}(\psi)}$ . Let  $h \in G_x$ . Then there exists a  $k_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_0$  we have

$$\bar{\psi}(h) = (\delta_k * \psi)(h)$$

Also there exists a  $k_1 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that for all  $k \geq k_1$  we get:

$$\bar{f}|_{G_x}(h) = (h_k * f)(h)$$

Then for all  $k \geq \max\{k_0, k_1\}$  we have:  $\bar{f}|_{G_x}(h) = f(h_k^{-1}h)$ . Hence,

$$(\bar{f}|_{G_x})_2(h) = \psi(a_k^{-1}h_k^{-1}h) = \psi((h_k a_k)^{-1}h) = ((h_k a_k) * \psi)(h) = (\delta_k * \psi)(h) = \bar{\psi}(h).$$

Notice now that:

$$a * \bar{\psi} = a * \bar{f}|_{G_x} = \bar{f}|_{G_x} = \bar{\psi}.$$

Thus  $\bar{\psi}$  is periodic. Contradiction since  $\psi$  is limit aperiodic. This concludes the proof.  $\square$

The following is obvious.

**Lemma 3.5.** *If  $X$  is a  $G$ -space and  $H$  is any group acting on  $X$  such that the action of  $H$  factors through the action of  $G$ . Then if  $X$  is a limit aperiodic  $G$ -space then it is also a limit aperiodic  $H$ -space.*

**Corollary 3.6.** *If  $G$  and  $H$  are limit aperiodic groups and*

$$1 \rightarrow G \xrightarrow{\tau} E \xrightarrow{\pi} H \rightarrow 1$$

*is a short exact sequence then  $E$  is also limit aperiodic.*

**Proof.** Obviously  $E$  acts transitively on  $E/G = H$  with left multiplication. By Lemma 3.5  $H$  is a limit aperiodic  $E$ -space. Note that  $Stab_E(e_H) = G$  is limit aperiodic. If we apply Theorem 3.4 we get the corollary.  $\square$

Obviously we obtain the following

**Corollary 3.7.** *If  $G$  is limit aperiodic and  $H$  is limit aperiodic then  $G \times H$  is limit aperiodic.*

**Corollary 3.8.** *If  $H$  is a limit aperiodic group and  $\theta : H \rightarrow H$  is a group automorphism then the HNN extension  $\star_\theta H$  is limit aperiodic.*

**Proof.** We know that if  $H = \langle S | T \rangle$  where  $S$  is a set of generators and  $T$  is a set of relations then  $G = \star_\theta H$  admits the following presentation

$$\star_\theta H = \langle S, t | T \cup \{t^{-1}xt = \theta(x), x \in S\} \rangle.$$

Note that  $G$  acts transitively on the set  $G/H$  of all left cosets of  $H$ . Note that  $G/H = \{t^i H \mid i \in \mathbb{Z}\} \cong \mathbb{Z}$ . Thus,  $G$  acts on  $\mathbb{Z}$  by translations with  $Stab_G(\{H\}) = H$  [2]. We color the  $\mathbb{Z}$  with a Morse-Thue sequence as in [1], i.e.  $\phi : X \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$  with  $\phi(t^i H) = m(|i|)$  where  $m : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$  is the Morse-Thue sequence [3],[4]. As it shown in [1] this map is limit aperiodic with respect. By Lemma 3.5 it is a limit aperiodic  $G$ -set. Theorem 3.4 completes the proof.  $\square$

In order to prove the fact that the free product of limit aperiodic groups is limit aperiodic we need the following notions. Let  $A$  and  $B$  be two groups. We will construct a set  $X$  such that the free product  $G = A \star B$  acts on  $X$  freely and transitively and  $X$  is a limit aperiodic  $G$ -space. Let  $T_0$  be the Bass-Serre tree associated with  $A \star B$ . We recall that the vertices of  $T_0$  are left cosets  $G/A \cup G/B$  and the vertices of the type  $xA$ ,  $xB$  and only them form an edge  $[xA, xB]$  in  $T_0$ . Thus the edges of  $T_0$  are in the bijection with  $G$ . Note that  $G$  acts on  $T_0$  by left multiplication. Let  $T$  be the barycentric subdivision of  $T_0$  and let  $X$  be the set of the barycenters (of edges). We will identify the tree  $T$  with the set of its vertices. Then the group  $G$  acts by isometries on  $T$  yielding three orbits on the vertices

$X = Orb_G(e)$ ,  $G/A$  and  $G/B$ . We regard  $T$  as a rooted tree with the root  $e$ . Let  $\|x\| = d_T(x, e)$  denote the distance to the root.

**Lemma 3.9.** *Let  $A, B$  be limit aperiodic groups and let  $G = A \star B$ ,  $X$ ,  $T$  defined as above. Then  $T$  is a limit aperiodic  $G$ -set.*

**Proof.** Let  $\pi : G \rightarrow A$  with  $\pi(w) = \pi(a_1 b_1 a_2 b_2 \dots a_n b_n) = a_1 a_2 \dots a_n$  and  $\theta : G \rightarrow B$  with  $\theta(w) = \theta(a_1 b_1 a_2 b_2 \dots a_n b_n) = b_1 b_2 \dots b_n$ . Clearly both  $\pi$  and  $\theta$  are group homomorphisms. Let also  $f_A : A \rightarrow F_A$  be the limit aperiodic map for the group  $A$  and  $f_B : B \rightarrow F_B$  be the limit aperiodic map for group  $B$ . Also let  $\nu : \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \{0, 1, 2\}$  be the variation of the Morse-Thue sequence which has no words  $WW$  (see for example [1]). Also fix  $e$  to be the vertex representing the identity element in  $T$ . Then consider a coloring of  $T$  as follows:

$$f : T \rightarrow \{0, 1, 2\} \times \{0, 1, 2\} \times (F_A \bigcup \{\alpha\}) \times (F_B \bigcup \{\beta\}) = F$$

where  $f := (f_0, f_1, f_2, f_3)$  with:  $f_0(x) = \nu(\|x\|)$ ,  $f_1(x) = \|x\| \bmod 3$ ,  $f_2(x) = f_A(\pi(x))$  if  $x \in X$  and  $f_2(x) = \alpha$  if  $x \in T - X$ . Finally let  $f_3(x) = f_B(\theta(x))$  if  $x \in X$  and  $f_3(x) = \beta$  if  $x \in T - X$ . The group  $G$  acts on the space of colorings  $F^T$  as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} (g * f)(x) &= ((g * f_0)(x), (g * f_1)(x), (\pi(g) * f_2)(x), (\theta(g) * f_3)(x)) \\ &= (f_0(g^{-1}x), f_1(g^{-1}x), f_2(\pi^{-1}(g)x), f_3(\theta^{-1}(g)x)). \end{aligned}$$

Suppose that  $f$  is not a limit aperiodic map. Then there exists a coloring

$$\psi = (\psi_0, \psi_1, \psi_2, \psi_3)$$

such that  $\psi \in \overline{Orb_G(f)}$  and  $\psi$  has a period  $b \in G \setminus Fix(T)$ . Let  $\psi = \lim g_k * f$ . Then  $\psi_A = \lim \pi(g_k) * f_A$  has period  $\pi(b)$ . Indeed, for every  $x \in A \subset G \cong X$  for large enough  $k$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} (\pi(g_k) * f_A)(x) &= f_A(\pi(g_k^{-1}x)) = f_2(g_k^{-1}x) = (g_k * f_2)(x) = (g_k * f_2)(bx) \\ &= f_2(g_k^{-1}bx) = f_A(\pi(g_k^{-1}bx)) = (\pi(g_k) * f_A)(\pi(b)x). \end{aligned}$$

Similarly  $\psi_B = \lim \theta(g_k) * f_B$  has a period  $\theta(b)$ . Thus,  $\pi(b) = e_A$  and  $\theta(b) = e_B$ .

Notice that  $(\psi_0, \psi_1) \in \overline{Orb_G(f_0, f_1)}$ . Denote  $\xi = (\psi_0, \psi_1)$  and  $\phi = (f_0, f_1)$ . Then  $\xi$  is a coloring of a simplicial tree  $(T)$  on which  $G$  acts by isometries. Moreover  $\xi \in \overline{Orb_G(\phi)}$ . From proposition 4, page 318 in [1] we have that  $b * \xi \neq \xi$  for all  $b \in G$  with unbounded orbit  $\{b^k x_0 | k \in \mathbb{Z}\}$ . This clearly implies that  $b * \psi \neq \psi$  for every  $b \in G$  with unbounded orbit. On the other hand  $\psi$  has period  $b$  and thus we have  $\{b^k x_0 | k \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is bounded. This implies that  $b$  fixes a point in  $T$ . Call that point  $x_1$ . Since the action of  $G$  on  $X$  is free,  $x_1 \notin X$ . Thus,  $x_1 \in G/A$  or  $x_1 \in G/B$ . Assume the later,  $x_1 = wB$  for some  $w \in G$ . Since  $b$  fixes  $wB$ ,  $b = wb'w^{-1}$  for some  $b' \in B \setminus \{e_B\}$ . Then  $\theta(b) = \theta(w)b'\theta(w)^{-1} \neq e_B$ . Contradiction.  $\square$

**Lemma 3.10.** *Let  $G = A \star B$ ,  $T$ ,  $X$ ,  $f$ ,  $F$  as above. Then  $X$  is a limit aperiodic  $G$ -set.*

**Proof.** Note that in the rooted tree  $T$  every vertex  $x \neq e$  has a unique predecessor denoted  $pred(x)$ . We define  $f' : X \rightarrow F \times F$  as  $f'(x) = (f|_X, \hat{f})$  where  $\hat{f}(x) = f(pred(x))$ . We show that  $f'$  is limit aperiodic.

Suppose that  $f'$  is not limit aperiodic. Then there exists a sequence  $\{g_k\} \in G$  s.t.

$$\psi' = \lim_k g_k * f'$$

and  $b \in \text{Fix}_G(X)$  with  $b * \psi' = \psi'$ . We may assume that there is the limit  $\psi = \lim g_k * f$ . In view of Lemma 3.9 it suffices to show that  $\psi$  is  $b$ -periodic. It is  $b$ -periodic on  $X$ , so it suffices to check that it is  $b$ -periodic on  $T \setminus X$ . Let  $z \in T \setminus X$ . We check that  $\psi(bz) = \psi(z)$ . Since the root  $e$  lies in  $X$ , we may assume that  $z \neq e$ . Let  $x_0 = \text{pred}(z)$  and let  $x_1$  be such that  $z = \text{pred}(x_1)$ . We note that  $x_1$  is not unique. So we fix one. Note that  $x_0, x_1 \in X$ . There is  $k_0$  such that for  $k \geq k_0$

$$\psi'(x_i) = (g_k * f')(x_i), \quad \psi'(bx_i) = (g_k * f')(bx_i), \quad i = 0, 1$$

and

$$\psi(z) = (g_k * f)(z), \quad \psi(bz) = (g_k * f)(bz).$$

Fix  $k \geq k_0$ . Since  $G$  acts on  $T$  by isometries the distance from  $g_k^{-1}z$  to  $g_k^{-1}x_i$ ,  $i = 0, 1$  equals 1. There are three possibilities:

$$(1) \quad g_k^{-1}x_0 < g_k^{-1}z < g_k^{-1}x_1,$$

$$(2) \quad g_k^{-1}x_1 < g_k^{-1}z < g_k^{-1}x_0,$$

and

$$(3) \quad g_k^{-1}z < g_k^{-1}x_i, \quad i = 0, 1.$$

We apply  $g_k^{-1}bg_k$ . In view of the fact that  $f_1(g_k^{-1}x_i) = f_1(g_k^{-1}bx_i)$ ,  $i = 0, 1$  we obtain

$$g_k^{-1}bx_0 < g_k^{-1}bz < g_k^{-1}bx_1$$

in the case (1) and

$$g_k^{-1}bx_1 < g_k^{-1}bz < g_k^{-1}bx_0,$$

in the case (2). Then in the case (1)

$$f'(g_k^{-1}bx_1) = (g_k * f')(bx_1) = \psi'(bx_1) = \psi'(x_1) = (g_k * f')(x_1) = f'(g_k^{-1}x_1).$$

Hence  $f_0(g_k^{-1}bx_1) = f_0(g_k^{-1}x_1)$ . Therefore

$$f(g_k^{-1}bz) = f(g_k^{-1}z).$$

Thus,

$$\psi(bz) = (g_k * f)(bz) = f(g_k^{-1}bz) = f(g_k^{-1}z) = (g_k * f)(z) = \psi(z).$$

In the case (2) we consider  $x_0$  instead of  $x_1$ .

In the case (3)  $g_k^{-1}bz$  is the predecessor of either  $g_k^{-1}bx_0$  or  $g_k^{-1}bx_1$  (or both). Assume the first. Then from the  $b$ -periodicity of  $\psi'$  it follows that  $f_0(g_k^{-1}bx_0) = f_0(g_k^{-1}x_0)$ . Since  $f_0(g_k^{-1}bx_0) = f(\text{pred}(g_k^{-1}bx_0))$  and  $f_0(g_k^{-1}x_0) = f(\text{pred}(g_k^{-1}x_0))$ , we obtain  $\psi(bz) = f(g_k^{-1}bz) = f(g_k^{-1}z) = \psi(z)$ .  $\square$



**Theorem 3.11.** *Let  $A, B$  be limit aperiodic groups. Then  $G = A \star B$  is a limit aperiodic group.*

**Proof.** By Lemma 3.10  $X$  is a limit aperiodic  $G$ -set. Note that  $G$  acts on  $X$  above transitively, and  $Stab_G(x_0) = \{e\}$  is a limit aperiodic group. By Theorem 3.4 we have that  $G$  is a limit aperiodic group.  $\square$

We finish this paper with an example of a  $G$ -set which is not limit aperiodic.

**Proposition 3.12.** *Consider the automorphism group of the integers  $Aut(\mathbb{Z})$ . Let  $s : \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$  with  $s(n) = n + 1$  and  $t : \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$  with  $t(0) = 1$ ,  $t(1) = 0$  and  $t(n) = n$  if  $n \neq 1$  and  $n \neq 0$ . Let  $S = \langle s, t \rangle$  then  $\mathbb{N}$  is not a limit aperiodic  $S$ -set.*

**Proof.** Suppose that  $\mathbb{N}$  was a limit aperiodic  $S$ -set. Then let  $F$  be a set of colors with  $|F| < \infty$  and a map  $f : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow F$  such that  $f$  is a limit aperiodic map under the action of  $S$ . Since  $|F| < \infty$  and  $|\mathbb{N}| = \infty$  there exists at least one  $a \in F$  such that infinitely many  $a_n \in \mathbb{N}$  have  $f(a_n) = a$ . Choose a strictly increasing sequence in  $\mathbb{N}$  such that  $f(a_n) = a$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Consider the following elements in  $S$ :

$$\begin{aligned} h_1 &= (1, a_1) \\ h_2 &= (1, a_1)(2, a_2) \\ &\dots \\ h_n &= (1, a_1)(2, a_2) \dots (n, a_n) \\ &\dots \end{aligned}$$

where  $(i, a_i)$  is the transposition that takes  $i$  to  $a_i$ . With  $s$  and  $t$  we can construct all the transpositions. Thus all  $a_i$  belong to  $S$ . Clearly if  $n \geq k$ ,  $n, k \in \mathbb{N}$  we have that  $h_n(k) = a_k$ . Consider now the sequence  $\{h_n^{-1} * f\}$  and take a converging subsequence. For convenience in notation let us keep the same indices for the subsequence. Thus if:

$$\psi = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} h_n^{-1} * f$$

we have that  $\psi \in \overline{Orb_{S_\infty}(f)}$ . Thus  $\psi$  has to be aperiodic. The claim is that  $\psi(k) = a$  for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  and thus  $\psi$  is clearly periodic which will lead to a contradiction. This is easy to see since let  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then for that  $k$  there exists an  $n_1$  such that for all  $n \geq n_1$  we have that  $\psi(k) = (h_n^{-1} * f)(k)$ . Thus for  $n = \max\{k, n_1\}$  we have that:

$$\psi(k) = (h_n^{-1} * f)(k) = f(h_n k) = f(a_k) = a.$$

This concludes the proof.<sup>1</sup>

## REFERENCES

- [1] A.Dranishnikov and V.Schroeder *Aperiodic Colorings And Tilings Of Coxeter Groups* Groups Geom. Dyn. 1(2007), 311-328.
- [2] J.P. Serre *Trees*, Springer-Verlag(2003), ISBN 3540442375
- [3] H.M. Morse and G.A. Hedlund *Unending chess, symbolic dynamics and a problem in semi-groups* Duke Math. J. 11 (1944), 1-7.
- [4] A. Thue *Über unendliche Zeichenreihen* Christiania Vidensk. Selsk. Skr. No 7 (1906), p. 22.

MATHEMATICS DEPARTMENT, UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA, GAINESVILLE , USA  
E-mail address: gentimis@math.ufl.edu

<sup>1</sup> When this paper was finalized we received information about a preprint on limit aperiodic colorings of groups by Gao, Jackson and Seaward found in <http://www.cas.unt.edu/~sgao/pub/pub.html>