

# Hardness of the tensored Birkhoff polytope

Shmuel Onn

January 9, 2008

## Abstract

We show that linear optimization over the tensor product of the Birkhoff polytope considered recently in connection with graph isomorphism in arXiv:0801.0398 allows to decide graph Hamiltonicity. So the separation problem over this polytope is unlikely to be polynomial time solvable.

*AMS Subject Classification:* 05A, 15A, 51M, 52A, 52B, 52C, 62H, 68Q, 68R, 68U, 68W, 90B, 90C

## 1 Introduction

Following [1] let  $\mathcal{P}_n$  be the set of  $n \times n$  permutation matrices and consider the following polytope

$$\psi_{n,n} := \text{conv}\{P \otimes Q : P, Q \in \mathcal{P}_n\} .$$

Define bilinear forms on  $\mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  and on  $\mathbb{R}^{n \times n} \otimes \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  (note the shuffled indexation on the right) by

$$\langle A, B \rangle := \sum_{i,j} A_{i,j} B_{i,j}, \quad \langle X, Y \rangle := \sum_{i,j,s,t} X_{i,s,j,t} Y_{i,j,s,t} .$$

Let  $I_n$  be the  $n \times n$  identity matrix and for a graph  $G$  let  $A_G$  be its adjacency matrix. We show:

**Theorem 1.1** *Let  $G$  and  $H$  be two graphs on  $n$  vertices and let  $H$  have  $m$  edges. Let*

$$v := \max\{\langle W, X \rangle : X \in \psi_{n,n}\} \quad \text{with} \quad W := (A_G + (n+1)I_n) \otimes (A_H + (n+1)I_n) .$$

*Then  $v \leq 2m + n(n+1)^2$  with equality if and only if  $G$  has a subgraph that is isomorphic to  $H$ .*

In particular, if  $H$  is an  $n$ -cycle then  $G$  is Hamiltonian if and only if the maximum value of the linear form  $\langle W, X \rangle$  over  $\psi_{n,n}$  is  $2n + n(n+1)^2$ . So, if  $P \neq NP$ , optimization and separation over  $\psi_{n,n}$  cannot be done in polynomial time and a compact inequality description of  $\psi_{n,n}$  cannot be determined.

We remark that the problem of deciding if  $G$  has a subgraph that is isomorphic to  $H$  can be reduced to linear optimization over a related polytope defined as the convex hull of  $\binom{n}{2} \times \binom{n}{2}$  permutation matrices of permutations of the edges of the complete graph  $K_n$  induced by permutations of its vertices. This polytope and a broader class of so-called *Young polytopes* have been studied in [2].

## 2 Proof

**Proof of Theorem 1.1.** For any graph  $H$ , each off-diagonal entry of  $A_H + (n+1)I_n$  is 0 or 1 and each diagonal entry is  $(n+1)$ . For every  $P, Q \in \mathcal{P}_n$ , the matrix  $P(A_H + (n+1)I_n)Q^\top$  is obtained by permuting the rows and columns of  $A_H + (n+1)I_n$  by  $P$  and  $Q$  respectively and hence its entries form a permutation of the entries of  $A_H + (n+1)I_n$ . In particular, every diagonal entry of  $P(A_H + (n+1)I_n)Q^\top$  is equal to  $n+1$  if and only if  $P = Q$ . It follows that for every two distinct  $P, Q \in \mathcal{P}_n$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} \langle P(A_H + (n+1)I_n)Q^\top, A_G + (n+1)I_n \rangle &< n(n+1)^2 \\ &\leq \langle P(A_H + (n+1)I_n)P^\top, A_G + (n+1)I_n \rangle \\ &\leq 2m + n(n+1)^2 \end{aligned}$$

with the last inequality holding with equality if and only if  $H$  is isomorphic via  $P$  to a subgraph of  $G$ .

The definitions of the bilinear forms imply that for simple tensors  $X = A \otimes B, Y = P \otimes Q$  we have

$$\langle X, Y \rangle = \langle A \otimes B, P \otimes Q \rangle = \sum_{i,j,s,t} A_{i,s} B_{j,t} P_{i,j} Q_{s,t} = \langle PBQ^\top, A \rangle.$$

Since the maximum of a linear form over a polytope is attained at a vertex we obtain the inequality

$$\begin{aligned} \max\{\langle W, X \rangle : X \in \psi_{n,n}\} &= \max\{\langle (A_G + (n+1)I_n) \otimes (A_H + (n+1)I_n), P \otimes Q \rangle : P, Q \in \mathcal{P}_n\} \\ &= \max\{\langle P(A_H + (n+1)I_n)Q^\top, A_G + (n+1)I_n \rangle : P, Q \in \mathcal{P}_n\} \\ &= \max\{\langle P(A_H + (n+1)I_n)P^\top, A_G + (n+1)I_n \rangle : P \in \mathcal{P}_n\} \\ &\leq 2m + n(n+1)^2 \end{aligned}$$

with the last inequality holding with equality if and only if  $G$  has a subgraph isomorphic to  $H$ . ■

## References

- [1] S. Friedland, On the graph isomorphism problem, arXiv:0801.0398 (January 2, 2008)
- [2] S. Onn, Geometry, complexity and combinatorics of permutation polytopes, *Journal of Combinatorial Theory Series A* 64:31–49 (1993)

Shmuel Onn

*Technion - Israel Institute of Technology, 32000 Haifa, Israel*

*email: onn@ie.technion.ac.il, <http://ie.technion.ac.il/~onn>*